Livelihood Impacts of Challenges in Accessing Pension Benefits:
A Case of Civil Service Teacher Retirees in Kapiri-Mposhi District Zambia

A Research Paper presented by:

Milazi Kabamba Museya
(Zambia)

in partial fulfilment of the requirements for obtaining the degree of
MASTER OF ARTS IN DEVELOPMENT STUDIES
Social Policy for Development
(SPD)

Members of Examining Board:
Supervisor: Mahmoud Messkoub
Reader: Lee Pegler

The Hague, The Netherlands
December 2014
Disclaimer:
This document represents part of the author’s study programme while at the Institute of Social Studies. The views stated therein are those of the author and not necessarily those of the Institute.

Inquiries:
Postal address:
Institute of Social Studies
P.O. Box 29776
2502 LT The Hague
The Netherlands

Location:
Kortenaerkade 12
2518 AX The Hague
The Netherlands

Telephone: +31 70 426 0460
Fax: +31 70 426 0799
# Table of Contents

*Acknowledgment*  
List of Figures vi  
List of Tables vii  
List of Appendices vii  
List of Acronyms vii  
Abstract viii  
Relevance to Development Studies viii  
Keywords viii

## Chapter 1: Social Security Pensions in Zambia: Then and Now
1.1 Contextual Background 1  
1.2 Statement of the Problem 4  
1.3 Study Objectives 5  
1.4 Research Question 5

## Chapter 2: Research Strategies
2.1 Justification of the Study 7  
2.2 Research Methodology 8  
2.2.1 Sampling Techniques 8  
2.2.2 Data Collection Methods 8  
2.2.3 Method of Data Analysis 9  
2.2.4 Study Limitations 9  
2.3 Study Background: Kapiri-Mposhi Civil Service Teacher Retirees under the PSPF 9

## Chapter 3: Framing-Conceptualization and Theories
3.1 Social Welfare and Social Security 11  
3.2 Pension System Reforms 13  
3.3 Globalization 14  
3.4 Social Exclusion 16  
3.5 The Sustainable livelihood Approach 18  
3.5.1 Vulnerability, Shocks and Coping 19  
3.6 Contextualizing the Concepts: Examples from Developing countries 22

## Chapter 4: Retirement as Experienced In Kapiri- Mposhi
4.1 Challenges in and Impacts of Retirement Pension Access 24
4.1.1 Past Challenges of Civil Service Retirees 24
4.1.2 Present Challenges 25
4.2 Impact of these Challenges on Retirees 26
4.3 How Retirees Manage the Risk that Challenges represent 28
4.4 “Capital” Resources of Retirees 28
4.5 Retirees’ Context of Vulnerability 30
4.6 Social Exclusionary Impacts on Retirees 33

Chapter 5: Using the Past and Present to Look Ahead 34
5.1 What Went Wrong? 34
5.2 Approaches towards better Retirement Experience in Zambia 35
  5.2.1 Civil Action for Improvements 35
  5.2.2 Incorporating Traditional values in Modern Systems 36
5.3 Summary and Conclusions 37

References 39

Appendices 43
Acknowledgment

For the gift of life that provides a context for experiences of adventures at pre-determined phases, I am grateful to God my Creator.

For bearing the cost of my existence, academic choices, and all else in-between, I am most grateful to my parents.
For the patience to deal with my momentary indecisions, confusion and lack of understanding in this academic life phase am grateful for family, friends (seasonal and permanent) and colleagues as the ISS experience would be incomplete without you.

To all who were subjected to help me make this paper possible and representable (respondents, data providers, proofreaders), particularly my supervisor and reader, I thank you so much for sparing your time.
A big thank you to the ISS for the opportunity of my being here to experience quality education in a context of much diversity reflected by the myriad of nationalities represented here by both students and staff.
List of Figures

Figure 1: Challenges in Pension benefit access .............................. 25
Figure 2: Impact of challenges in Pension Benefit Access ................ 27
Figure 3: Coping Mechanisms .................................................... 28

List of Tables

Table 1: Public Service Pensions Fund (PSPF) Contributors and Retiree Membership ................................................................. 31

List of Appendices

Appendix 1: Questionnaire for Teacher Retirees ......................... 43
Appendix 2: Administered Interview Guides ............................... 45
List of Acronyms

CSO- Central Statistics Office
ILO - International Labour Organization
MOE- Ministry of Education Science Vocational Training and Early Education
NAPSA- National Pension Scheme Authority
PSPF- Public Service Pensions Fund
WB- World Bank
ZANUT: Zambia National Union for Teachers
Abstract

The negative outcome of the Zambian Social Security Pension System which, impacts the livelihoods of retirees, has been shaped by shifting state approaches guided by manifestations of a transition from one phase of Globalization (i.e. Colonialism) to another (i.e. Modern trade and aid ). Employing the Sustainable Livelihood approach as tool of analysis, a case of retired civil service teachers in the Zambian Kapiri-Mposhi district was used to illustrate these challenges, their impacts and employed coping strategies in the risky pension system context. Resultant Pension system inefficiencies translated into challenges faced by all study participant retirees in accessing pension benefits. It was discovered that these challenges, especially delayed payments of pension benefits, yielded social exclusionary impacts on the retirees and their families as their livelihoods are disrupted by inability to provide for some basic needs. Risk management strategies employed by the retirees were coping strategies rather than mitigation or reduction hence proving them unsustainable. In concluding, emphasis is made on the incorporation of more contextually relevant micro (e.g. reciprocity centered) and meso level (e.g. civil action) approaches that ought to survive under and influence shifts in macro policy reforms towards being more comprehensive.

Relevance to Development Studies

The relevance of this study to development studies is that it offers a view on how externally influence policies can yield a negative impact on members of societies in the internal context of a state. The Zambian pension system is used as the focus to zoom into the danger of how macro level interaction of actors in policy making can easily distort the intrinsic values held at the micro level, such as reciprocity, that would contribute to the success of a reform or intervention. Highlighted in this paper is the need for contextually relevant interventions that embrace and not destroy traditional social support networks and systems that work. Such is a minute detail whose relevance is easily missed or lost in the big picture.

Keywords

Social Security, Pensions, Globalization, Retirement, Coping, Risk, Vulnerability, Social Exclusion
Chapter 1: Social Security Pensions in Zambia: Then and Now

1.1 Contextual Background

I have a lingering memory from approximately eight to nine years ago where I remember spotting a group of people having made a settlement on an empty piece of land, in the town centre, located right opposite the city’s rail station and main bus station in Lusaka (Zambia’s Capital city). It so happened that these were pensioners from different parts of the country following up their benefits in the capital city where the head Pensions office was located. They had not accessed their pension benefits hence their decision to camp at this site as some had no transport money to travel back to their homes. What happened to their families and how were they all to access their basic needs of food, shelter, clothing and education for dependents? This stayed with me over the years because I thought how unfortunate their circumstances were that led them to such a situation even after having worked to secure their future against poverty. So then, I wondered, what went wrong with the social security system regarding pensions? I hope that by focusing on the challenges retired civil service teachers face in accessing pension benefits I will be able to answer my own questions.

Social Security is an important aspect of social policy due to social policy’s concern with the analysis of resource distribution and delivery in response to social need (Bochel et.al 2009: 7). It basically enables for access to services that fulfil basic needs including food, water and shelter for individuals in society. It is through the discipline social policy that the study on ways that society provides for its members social needs through the structures and systems of distribution, redistribution, regulation and empowerment provision are established (ibid). For retirees, Pension systems are a major source of Social Security.

Zambia is no exception from the many other developing countries that struggle with the pressures that are exerted upon a pension system in a context characterized by a growing population and externally influenced policies. Pension reforms have seen to the change in Pension system operations which overtime have been influenced by political ideology and economic performance. Shifting trends in Social Security and Social welfare policies have been influenced by debates on whether the state, the market or the family should be the main providers. The debate has in turn
determined by political ideology with regard to economic and social policies.

The development of Social Security in Zambia is better understood by viewing it in three contexts these being pre, during and post colonisation. In a brief summary, pre-colonisation times were purely traditional characterized by a mutual aid system where each one was his brother’s keeper (Mhone in Mkandawire 2004: 314-315). This covers the period before 1911 where no unitary state was in existence for the region known as the country of Zambia (Nooyo 2000:1). Society served as the social security/social protection where the family was the main provider (Nooyo 2000: 3). There was no such thing as retirement pensions as formal employment, with which it is associated, emerged as a modern concept accompanied with the industrialization that the country was to later encounter.

The Colonialism period, beginning 1911 till 1964, brought with it a shift as industrialization and modernization ideas sipped into the traditional system. Pivotal in this period was the beginning of the Copper mining industry on which Zambia’s economic development was centred (Nooyo 2000: 8). During this period, the British colonizers ensured that social policy for the indigenous citizens was paternalistic and prescriptive mainly meant to cater to the labourers of the mining industry and not the rural population (Mhone in Mkandawire 2004: 314-315). This period saw to the emergence of the establishment of the earliest coverage in social security in the country which provided for work injury benefits which is presently administered by the Workers Compensation Fund Control Board (WCFCB) (Cheta 2005: 2). The Local Authorities Superannuation Fund (LASF) was established later in 1954 to provide pensions for employees in the local authorities (ibid). The mutual aid system still existed but it was slowly diminishing. There was mix of the family and the state (Colonial) role in social security provisioning.

Post colonialism began after independence was obtained in October, 1964. This brought about the government recognition for social and economic policy that would cover the whole country. Under the political ideology of Humanism, Universalistic principals of state provided social services characterized the countries path to development in order for the creation of more just and equitable Zambia (Nooyo 2000: 36). Not only did the country inherit a strong mining based economy (Ministry of Finance and National Planning 2002:18), but administrative structures on which public affairs were run. The earliest of civil service pension coverage following independence was as result of what the colonial masters left behind (Cheta
2005: 1). The pressure to extend coverage saw to the creation of the Civil Service Pensions Fund (CSPF) four years after independence which was later reformed and renamed the Public Service Pensions fund (PSPF) (ibid). In this system of inheritance of retirement schemes, the Provident fund system that was common former British colonies was what Zambia adopted. No longer were livelihoods sustained by the informal traditional social support system of mutual aid but a formal income centred social security system.

Like in many developing countries, within Africa and in other parts of the world, there has been efforts overtime to improve the pension system through national development plans and strategies. There is much left to be desired in these systems as the country faces increasing population and poverty rates in relatively unstable economic context. The traditional social support networks of extended family and communities have long diminished. It is in this context that the social security system is embedded.

From 1991 when the second republic began, a shift of political ideology ushered in principles of liberalization and privatization of industries hence impacting the social security system as the government was no longer the only formal actor. Currently, the Zambian Social security system is predominantly that of the Social insurance model. It includes three statutory pension schemes, some private and occupational pension schemes set up by employers. These three statutory schemes include the National Pension Scheme Authority (NAPSA), Local Authorities Superannuation Fund (LASF) and the Public service Pension Fund (PSPF). These three are defined benefit schemes which run on a defined formula (Kakoma et.al 2010:2). The private pensions schemes are defined contributions in which there is a specified contribution rate and the interest accrued on these accumulated contributions determine the benefits (ibid). However, the focus of the paper is mainly PSPF and briefly NAPSA as they are the schemes that currently handle civil servants pensions.

Supervision of the existing social security schemes is carried out by various government ministries and agencies established for this purpose through Acts of Parliament. In 2013, the Government announced an increase in retirement age from 55 to 65 (Public Affairs Office 2013: 2). As is common to many other developing countries, the Pension system is unequal and exclusionary in such a way that it only caters to the formal sector and not the informal sector (Kakoma et.al 2010:4).

Given the intergenerational resource distribution role that social security systems ought to enable, a brief description of a country’s demographic
characteristics is necessary. Zambia’s population is approximately 14.8 million with the life expectancy at birth at 57 (World Bank (WB) 2014). This is an increase from the 13,092,666 population record obtained in the last population and housing census of 2010 where the annual rate of population growth was recorded at 2.8 (Central Statistical Office (CSO) 2013). Based on the same census report findings, it was discovered that Zambia was one of the most highly urbanized developing countries with an urban population percentage increase from 34.7 percent in 2000 to 39.5 percent in 2010 (CSO 2013). This urbanization however does not translate into poverty reduction in the country as unemployment and poverty rate still remains high.

Proof that the country’s recorded population and urbanization increase is not coupled with increase formal employment participation is obtainable from the household surveys undertaken by CSO which reflect approximately 90 percent of the population as being in informal employment (CSO 2013). According to the 2005 and 2008 labour force survey, only about 12 percent of the employed population was in the formal employment to which the civil service is a part of (ibid). By 2012, the comprehensive coverage of all statutory schemes was such that approximately only 511,338 people ,which represented only eleven percent (11%) of the employed people in the country, were covered whereas the remaining 4 095 508 people were estimated to be in informal employment (PSPF 2014: 2). Given a total dependency ratio of 97 % by 2013, the youth dependency ratio was 91.8 % whereas the elderly dependency ratio was 5.2 % (Central Intelligence Agency (CIA) 2014). In the midst of all this are the retirees and their families.

1.2 Statement of the Problem

Zambia’s status as a developing country embraces a political economy that allows for the implementation of progressive populist social policies in the backing of regressive solutions thereby yielding negative outcomes during or of social service delivery. The Zambian pension system, even though having undergone some transformation since its establishment in the 1960s, has been ridiculed for its operations.

In a report presented by the committee on economic affairs and labour, it was acknowledged that the Zambian pension system is one of unfavourable performance despite the government efforts to improve it (Kakoma et.al 2010:2). Untimely payments and insufficiency of benefits received by retirees featured as elements of this unfavourable performance. Also highlighted in this report was the lack of a Social
security policy in Zambia (Kakoma et.al 2010:4). This fact allows for one to wonder what has served as a guide to the Social Security system in which the Pension system falls under. The transition in the social security system as represented by the pension system is one that has “insecured” rather than secured the livelihoods of those that depend on it.

With retirement comes a sense of loss of the security offered by privileges that accompanied employment hence the retirees’ reliance on the pension fund they invested in. Even though pension benefits may not serve as the only source of income, it becomes a major source for the retired and their families. The retired civil service teachers place such confidence in the PSPF. However, the placement of confidence in a fund whose weaknesses include both administrative and financial challenges is bound to serve as a problem. The external and internal factors that influence the operations of the Zambian social security system with regards to pension systems leads to a situation such that the retired teachers that rely on it are at risk of facing challenges that may compromise their ability to be socially secure in society and lead to social insecurities thereof.

1.3 Study Objectives

The main objective is: To establish the livelihood impacting-social exclusionary outcome enhanced within Zambian social security pension system by identifying the challenges that civil service teacher retirees face in accessing pension benefits.

Sub objectives include:

- To establish the main causes of the challenges that are faced by the retired civil servant retirees in accessing pension benefits
- To bring out the impact of these challenges not only on the individual retiree but the family as well.
- To discover the coping strategies employed by these retirees

1.4 Research Question

The main question being addressed in this paper is: How are civil service teacher retiree livelihoods affected by the challenges that they face in accessing pension benefits in Kapiri-Mposhi, Zambia?

Sub questions

- What are the challenges, and causes thereof, faced by the civil service teacher retirees in accessing pension benefits?
➢ How do these challenges impact the retired civil service teacher and their families?
➢ What is done in order to deal with these challenges?
Chapter 2: Research Strategies

2.1 Justification of the Study

Much as there has been much written on various countries (both developed and developing) pension system formation and transformation in terms of reforms, there is minimal literature on Zambia’s Social security pension system available. My search for Zambian literature relating to this topic serves as proof of the need to contribute to it. I doubt that this has to do with lack of interesting aspects from which topics can be drawn as I have found an angle to assess the system that I hope will provide for a valuable contribution to the information gap that is currently in existence.

I acknowledge that focusing on retired civil service teachers does not mean that they are the most disadvantaged group in society, but I would like to stress that their labour intensive career constitutes a significant proportion in the composition of the Zambian formal labour force. The low or lack of comprehensive social security coverage that is characteristic in most developing countries (Hall and Midgley 2004:145), including Zambia, is not the focus of this paper. Despite the inherent exclusion of the Zambian pension system towards large informal sector and the minimal coverage of the formal sector of the labour force, my interest in teacher retirees is vested upon their possible outcome of social exclusion due do their reliance on the system.

By situating teachers as an ideally middle class group at risk of experiencing poverty (relative and not absolute), I felt the exploration and unveiling of the social insecurities that arise after subscription to the social security promised by the pension system provides for an interesting aspect. This was done with the use of discourses pertaining to the state-society relationship in social policy processes characterized by retrogressive solutions (eternally influenced pension policies) in a progressive context (social changes) where ironic results of social insecurities in social security systems are yielded. In this respect, this study promised for an interesting insight on livelihoods of retirees in relation to pension systems.
2.2 **Research Methodology**

2.2.1 **Sampling Techniques**

Sampling techniques included purposive and random Sampling. The interview respondents were purposively selected as they are key stakeholders in the Pension system. Random sampling of retired teachers was done for the survey respondents. This was in order to capture a wide variety of respondents in order to enrich the analysis. Of course this was at the risk of obtaining respondents of similar characteristics but given the limited research period, it seemed an appropriate choice. As a result I ended up with more male (16) than female (4) respondents for the survey and only male respondents (2) for the interviews. The sample population was composed of teachers who retired ranging from 2004 till 2014 hence making it a reasonably representative sample that would help show shifting trends in the pension benefit access, if any.

2.2.2 **Data Collection Methods**

Data collection was one between July 25\textsuperscript{th} and August 15\textsuperscript{th} 2014 for a period of three weeks. The study employed a technique of qualitative data collection. Primary data was collected by conducting a survey of 20 civil service teacher retirees. The respondents were obtained by going to the Ministry of Education, Science Vocational training and Early Education (MOE) District office in Kapiri-Mposhi. With the cooperation of the district Human Resource officer and the district Education planner, I was able to identify, and distribute my questioners to, the retirees that would occasionally pass through the MOE office. When possible I would interact with the respondents and we would have informal conversations from which some of the observations made I will draw upon in the data presentation stage.

The questioner was structured in a way that it captured basic information on the background, brief pre and post retirement data and experience as a benefactor of the pension system. It contained open ended questions of qualitative nature. Two semi structured interviews were conducted with the Key stakeholders as the Acting Chief executive officer of the Public Service Pension Fund and the Human Resource officer at the District Ministry of Education, Science Vocational Training offices in Kapiri-Mposhi. These were done as a follow up to the responses that were given obtained from the conducted survey. This gave a sample size total of twenty-two (22) respondents.
Secondary data was obtained by reviewing relevant government publications and documentation such as reports, written legislative documents and published strategic plans.

2.2.3 Method of Data Analysis

No software was used in the analysis of data. The structure of the questionnaire was such that it had been set up in parts, consisting of respondents’ basic background, pre-retirement phase and post retirement phase. This made the analysis easier as thematic areas of analysis were identified without a problem as including causes and impacts of challenges and responses to these challenges faced by the retirees. The livelihoods framework was employed as a tool of data analysis.

2.2.4 Study Limitations

A couple of limitations were faced in the data collection process. One was that there were plans for me to interview some of the survey respondents but that was not feasible due to limited time and the impatience of respondents to spend time on an issue that was already frustrating to them. Some retirees declined to be respondents as they viewed it as a waste of time on their part because they held the view that taking part in a research would change nothing for them and their current situation. An attempt to interview the Committee of Retired Teachers failed due to a bereavement of one of the community members whose funeral the members had to attend on the agreed date hence they had to reschedule to a later date.

One other limitation is the limited sources of data on Zambia’s Pension system. This was acknowledged by the ministry of Labor and Social Security Personnel that I talked to when I went in search of background information on the system. This compromises the quality of the research results in some way.

2.3 Study Background: Kapiri-Mposhi Civil Service Teacher Retirees under the PSPF

Of the ten provinces into which Zambia is divided, Kapiri-Mposhi District is situated in the Central Province whose provincial capital is Kabwe. There are approximately one hundred and ninety primary/community schools (190) and eleven secondary schools (11) that are record so far (MOE 2014).
Besides those who joined the civil service post February 2000, all teachers, are obliged to be members of the PSPF which is guided by the Public Service Pensions Act 260. The PSPF is funded by pension contributions, government grants and investment earnings. As a result of the contributions, the act states, the retiree is entitled to monthly payments until the lump-sum is paid. In Kapiri-Mposhi, the study confirmed that an approximate average of twelve 12 people retire every year for the past ten years. They are subjected to a commutation ratio that translates into a case where as a result of overall contributions, two thirds (67%) is given as lump sum whereas one third (33%) is left as monthly pension.

With an annual average population growth rate of the province being at 2.6 and population density recorded at 13.8 per square kilometer (CSO 2013:2), in 2012 the population of Kapiri Mposhi was 37, 942 (Mongabay.com 2012) out of Zambia’s population of 13 million plus people by that time.

With regards to Labour force, there was a reduction of unemployment rate from 16% in 2005 to 7.8% 2012 (CSO 2013:2) in the whole country. The majority of the labour force remains informal hence having an impact on the pension system with regards to resource base. This impact is one of a negative nature in that with the resource base of Pension funds is lesser than it would be had the informal sector been included.

With regards to the economic context under which the pension fund operates, there have been overall recorded raises in GDP per capita from K3.896 to K9.926 in 2013 (CSO 2013:44). The economic growth rate remained constant at 6.7% in the last couple of years of 2012 and 2013. Trends in international copper prices were such that the prices decreased from average of 347.66 US to 331.39 US cents/lb 2013 (CSO 2013:47). These economic trends impact the Fund as part of the financing is done by government whose revenue is dependent on economic performance with the mining sector as it is one of the major economic activities of the country.
Chapter 3: Framing-Conceptualization and Theories

Introduction

This chapter is concerned with the concepts and theories I view as relevant for the contextualization and analysis of the problem experienced in the Zambian pension system. From discussion on Social security, which describes its determination by the state through political ideology, Globalization is brought in to show how state decisions are influenced by external environment. This is topped with a discussion on the concept of social exclusion as resultant from negative impacts of the pension system. All this is wrapped into the Livelihood Approach by describing what exactly poses as a risk of vulnerability in the system and how the risks are managed at a micro, meso and macro level. Basically it is a chapter on how top down social security pension policy making affects the people it is purported to save.

3.1 Social Welfare and Social Security

Social Security is a term that has been used to refer to the provision of social services but may be narrowed down to be defined as government programs that are aimed as provision of income benefits (cash payments) to a defined group of people (Hall and Midgley 2004:234). This definition then focuses it on income maintenance and support. These are split into income maintenance and income support where income maintenance benefits are in most cases higher than those of income support but no sufficient enough for one to sustain a proper standard of living hence their need to be backed by other income sources (Hall and Midgley 2004:236).

Retirement Pensions fall under the income maintenance mode of social security as it is a contingency that is as a result of job seizure.

Resultant from a 2001 ILO convention was an acknowledgement that Social security is very important for the well-being of workers, their families and the entire community (ILO 2010: 159). Not only is Social security a basic human right, it is also an important means for the creation of social cohesion, thereby helping to ensure social peace and social inclusion (ibid). Social security is a core irremovable element of Government social policy and an essential tool for poverty prevention and alleviation. In a well-managed social security system, health care, income security and social service productivity are enhanced (ibid). They noted the
increasing necessity for social security in the light of globalization and structural adjustment policies.

For developing countries, the incorporated statutory social security programs have not been as comprehensive as that of developed nations (Hall and Midgley 2004:234). Social insurance, provident funds and Social Assistance are ways through which old people pension benefits are channeled. Whereas for social insurance, the revenues that are obtained by contributions that are pooled in a trust fund administered by the appropriate government agency, provident funds do not pool benefits as each worker gets their own account into which contributions and from which benefits are paid (ibid 237). Many countries have made a transition from provident funds to social insurance.

It is important to note that the social security interventions in which pension systems fall under incorporate the aspect of Social Welfare discourses. This refers to the provisioning of goods and services so as to ensure for peoples wellbeing and livelihood. Esping-Andersen in his 1990 publication “Three Worlds of Welfare Capitalism” discusses how welfare provisioning has been classified into three Welfare-state regimes namely Corporatist, Liberal and Social Democratic. This was so as to describe how the state provides for welfare where the Corporatist regime was more state oriented, the Liberal more market oriented and the Social democratic a mix of both market and state. “States are now institutions predominantly preoccupied with the production and distribution of social well-being” (Esping-Andersen 1990:1). The inequality that is as a result of the Social stratification is inherent in welfare states and ought to be addressed by Social policy but this is not the case (Esping-Andersen 1990:3). Much as this paper does not delve much into the discourses of a welfare state, my incorporation of the regimes are to show the how welfare provisioning via social security pensions may be affected by the political will and interests pertaining to social and economic policy formulation and implementation.

Also relevant to this paper is the concept of Welfare regime which is defined as “a more generic term, referring to the entire set of institutional arrangements, policies and practices affecting welfare outcomes and stratification effects in diverse social and cultural contexts”(Gough and Wood 2004:26). This differs from the above introduced Welfare-state regime categorization in that it draws away from just state provisioning In relation to retirement, this brings in the aspect of intergenerational welfare provisioning where the main actors of provisioning are not just the state
but the society through informal means where family and friends are actors.

### 3.2 Pension System Reforms

Because the majority of the world’s nation-states now have some form of statutory social security, it seems that social security has become globally institutionalized (Hall and Midgley 2004:242). One of the dominant issues when it comes to Pension Systems in developing countries, such as Zambia, is the discourse on pension reforms in the view of improving the pension system efficiency. Holzmann and Hinz (2005: 162) note how pension policy reform is a recent phenomenon in Sub-Saharan Africa in a context where colonial legacy of defined-benefit schemes and provident funds shaped the pension system of most countries thereby leading to a situation where few countries have occupational private pension funds.

National provident funds as compulsory savings schemes required for covered employees and their employers to pay contributions to a government controlled fund with the aim of the balance obtained accruing interest which would later be paid in lump sum upon retirement (Dixon 1993:197). This was attractive to most governments then as it was a means of social security provision that omitted risk pooling and ensured no transfer of income among individuals (ibid). However, this was not as comprehensive a method of social security coverage as it was perceived to be. This led to ideas on transformation of the National Provident Funds to Social insurance Systems (ibid).

The observation overtime has been that of a dominant trend where most countries in the developing countries region have insufficient funds in the pension schemes that have resulted from poor investment and unrealistic parameters which have translated into in increase in contribution rates over time (Holzmann and Hinz 2005: 162). The poor performance of the inherent pension systems are attributed to problems in two main areas, these being, administration and investment of reserves (ibid).

Under administration, it was noted that the costs of administration are too high that they sometimes consumed one third of the contribution revenues due to limited coverage and overstaffing in systems characterized inefficient service delivery. Under the area of investment, low returns have been frequently documented in some countries including Zambia and this has led to a situation by which retirees attain very low balances at retirement (Holzmann and Hinz 2005: 163). It is the fiscal pressures of civil
service pensions that have increased the need for pension reforms not only in Africa but on a global scale. The pension policy reformation is aimed at replacing the current problematic system into one in which all workers, both formal and informal, participate in order to enable labour mobility and address inequalities that occur in the pension system (ibid). The fact that Zambia has undergone certain pension policy reforms overtime displays the efforts of governments to establish an effective system. In light of this we can then ask, what are the costs of these reforms to the civil service retirees with regards to their livelihoods?

There has been more advocacy towards a Multi-pillar system as the best approach towards a comprehensive pension system. With Argentina and Chile as models for this approach, the assumption is that it will work favorably for all.

### 3.3 Globalization

Worth noting concerning the globalization process is the detail on its existence in different phases in Zambia and many other developing countries. Of the many definitions of Globalization the commonality they hold is the reference to the integration of a country’s society into a broader context of international political, economic and social relationships. In this process the scale of human social origin is transformed by the linkage of distant communities and the expansion of the scope of power relations across the world’s major regions and continents thereby creating a situation of interdependence where the actions of social agents in one locale significantly affect the distant others (Held and McGrew 2004: 3).


Giddens establishes the existence of two distinct bodies of Globalization literature as International Relations and Immanuel Wallerstiens World Systems Theory (ibid). The focus of the first set of literature is the view of the nation-state system as originating from Europe over to a world wide spread and how these nation states (as the main actors) interact with each other in the international arena as they progressively lose their sovereignty. The danger with this view is the possibility of ignoring social relations that are not outside or between the state and that the increase of state sovereignty is usually done in conjunction with others (ibid). The second set of literature focuses on the view of globalization as networks of geographically extensive economic connections with emphasis on world
economies as having existed overtime (Held and McGrew 2003:62). This covers the rise of the world capitalist economy as one that stresses more on Economics rather than political power (ibid). It is criticized for its insistence on putting capitalism as the core institution for modern transformations. Another critic is that the use of classifications based on economic criteria shadows political concentrations of power which does not exactly fit into economic differentiation (ibid).

The very processes of social security is said to have necessitated from modernization which happens to be interrelated with Globalization. In describing the Zimbabwean social security experience, Midgley and Kaseke (1996:104) mention how based on the replication of Western country experience, where the assumption was modernization processes would shape Social security in such a way that structural transformation was meant to be that of stimulated economic growth translating into increase in wage employment which would lead to coverage of the whole population. This was not the case in reality as it has come to be proved over time.

Surpassing its underlying ideas and the its unveiling, Globalizations’ reality of meaning is felt as it touches the lives, livelihoods and life chances of many ordinary people in Africa (Aina et.al 2004:1). However, “it is at the point of this touch on people’s lives where minimal examination is done” (ibid). Pivotal areas with respect to the Globalizations impact on the African social policy issues include Aid and Economic trade. With respect to aid, Akanda et.al (2004) describe Africa as the poorest relative in the “extended family” of nations, headed by the World Bank(WB), International Monetary Fund (IMF) and Northern Non-Governmental Organizations(NGOs), whom everybody else looks out for and incorporates in their annual budget (Prah and Ahmed 2004:1). This is blamed on the continents lack of non-evolving, indigenous accommodative management and organization styles that allows for these “extended family members” consistency in seeking to make the African management environment more receptive to western management thought and practice via programs of Economic Stabilization and Structural Adjustment (ibid). The conditions that come with borrowing from these international organizations have led to reduction in state resources hence making it financially weaker and dependent when it comes to policy making thereby provision of local goods, services and infrastructure (Ghosh and Halil 2006:5). A raise in poverty levels represents the resilience and resistance of African host cultures in the event of such macro-economic reforms (Prah and Ahmed 2004:1).
With respect to trade, Makuke (2004) emphasizes how the IMF and the WBs’ suggested for African countries to participate in highly competitive free markets of the global economy as the way towards progress (in Prah and Ahmed 2004: 105). An inherent contradiction accompanying the globalization process in developing countries is that nations have experienced significant rates of growth of Gross Domestic Product (GDP) owing to the privatization of state owned enterprises but a decrease in tax revenues, incomplete reforms and accumulated huge debts (sometimes due to corruption and inappropriate accounting practices) (Ghosh and Halil 2006:4). Among the impacts of globalization includes deregulation of the labour market, lower social protection and weaker labour unions which has ultimately led to loss of social cohesion and increased individualization of the human community (Ghosh and Halil 2006:7). A globalized national Political Economy is part of the setting of the stage on which Social Security pensions are set. Dwelling on the Latin American evidence, the relationship between social security reform and political economic liberalization is such that, there is a positive relationship between the degree of economic liberalization and level of privatization in social reform whereas, political liberalization is inversely related to social security privatization (Meso-Lago 1997:503).

### 3.4 Social Exclusion

Already acknowledged in the paper is the social exclusionary trend in Developing countries’ Social security pension systems due to their inclination to cater to only formal working employees. Within the socially included however, there are is a manner in which Pension systems may be socially exclusionary, both in developed and developing countries, which is reflected as a negative impact on retirees’ livelihoods. In assessing the response and prevention in the British Welfare state, Agulnik, et.al (2002: 155) note how social policies are designed to deal with social exclusion through various strategies which are either preventative or responsive and how social exclusion may be as a result of incomplete or inconsistent implementation of these strategies . Three potential areas of social exclusion are analyzed these being, unemployment, disability during working life and the loss of income in retirement (Agulnik, et.al 2002: 155). Of much relevance in this paper is the view on the aspect of how retirement is a potential area for social exclusion.

In describing the current situation of labour and social security issues, it is noted that the male and females participation in the labour force translates into them having closely aligned risks in which the main problem
is loss of earned income (Agulnik et.al in Hills et.al 2002: 155). It is also noted that the fall of employment rates among older workers makes certain, rather than contingent, that they will experience a period where they would have no work (loss of job) at the end of life (Agulnik et.al in Hills et.al 2002: 170). The argument therefore is not that retirement is a risk but that,“ retirement brings with it a number of associated risks which require the state to be involved in this part of the life cycle” (ibid).

Two risks are identified in this life-cycle model of pension provision as being the investment risk and the information risk (Agulnik et.al in Hills et.al 2002: 171). The investment risk is the risk by which the assets acquired during ones working life would either appreciate in value below the owners’ expectation or depreciate in value overtime. This risk serves as reason for government involvement in regulation of private pensions and state provisioning of retirement saving mechanisms. The information risk refers to the fact that the individual would not save enough for old age through ignorance or misfortune However, there are some people that earn so little that even if they saved during their working days, their retirement income would still remain lower than acceptable levels. Also, the drop in value of retirement income earned overtime would push the elderly into situations of poverty. Both of these reasons justify the fact that the retired face a poverty risk which would ultimately lead to social exclusion.

Studies have shown that overtime, the risk of poverty in retirement has worsened since 1979 despite the sometimes successful efforts by the British government to manage the risks (Agulnik et.al in Hills et.al 2002: 174). Studies showed that there was significant increase from the seventies to the nineties of single and couple pensioners when assessed using the half mean household income as the poverty standard (ibid). Also, it must be noted that the increase in poverty was coupled with widening inequalities among pensioners. Overall, the attention of pension policy is focused on “longevity and investment risk to the detriment of addressing the risk of poverty at old age” (Agulnik et.al in Hills et.al 2002: 176).

Pension system experiences from Latin America may be used to demonstrate ways in which this unintended outcome of the pension system has manifested itself overtime. This being the case in a developed country context represented by Britain, it would be interesting to see how the dynamics of pension policies interact and influence other factors that may lead to a situation of social exclusion in the developing country context of Zambia.
3.5 The Sustainable livelihood Approach

The concept of sustainable livelihoods offers a depiction of the complex life and survival in poor communities (Brocklesby and Fisher 2003: 187). Carney (1998:4) views the sustainability of a livelihood as that which is dependent on its ability to cope with and recover from stresses and shocks and attain present and future maintenance or enhancement of capabilities and assets without disrupting the natural resource base (as sited in Rakodi and Llyod-Jones 2002:1). The sustainable livelihoods approach is a people centered view on the approach to development that has been promoted and implemented by a number of organizations with varying points of emphasis towards the same concerns (Brocklesby and Fisher 2003: 185). In their publication, Rakodi and Llyod-Jones (2002) explore how these concerns range from CARE internationals livelihood focus at household level with emphasis on secure rather than sustainable livelihoods, Oxfam’s stress sustainable livelihood as being a right, United Nations Development programs (UNDP) prioritization on adaptive strategies to technological interventions to the Department for International Developments’ (DIFD) focus on asset support and accessibility by the poor. This paper takes an approach leaning more on the approach with concerns similar to that of DIFD.

The increased incorporation of the livelihood aspect into developing countries research and policy stems from the realization that some households, both rural and urban, rely on one income generating activity to support themselves (Rakodi and Lloyd-Jones 2002:3). The inability for households or individuals to consume sufficient goods and services in order to achieve a minimum level of welfare qualifies it to be considered as poor (Rakodi and Lloyd-Jones 2002:4). This has been the case so far when retiree livelihoods are assessed in developing countries.

Brocklesby and Fisher (2003:187) outline the four main components of a sustainable livelihoods framework as being, first the view of people as living within a vulnerability context where through sudden shocks or trends overtime, they are exposed to risks. Second is the view that people own capital assets that include, Physical (transport, water, shelter, energy and communication), social/political (networks and relationships of trust), Financial (savings, income and credit) and Natural (natural resources) capital. These are the viewed as the assets that a household, community or societies comprise of (Rakodi and Llyod-Jones 2002:10). Third is that peoples’ livelihood strategies (choices and activities adopted in view of positive livelihood outcomes) are what pull these assets. Last is that the
vulnerability context in which people live, their access to these capitals plus livelihood activities are shaped by policies, institutions and processes.

Brocklesby and Fisher (2003:184) recognize how the technocratic development drive that is embraced by the sustainable livelihood approaches hinder their ability to be incorporated into other development practices such as community development projects as they clash with the principles and values that underpin community development work. However, this does not hinder its ability to be used as an analytical tool for this paper.

3.5.1 Vulnerability, Shocks and Coping

The three concepts have already been established as being of importance in the Sustainable livelihoods approaches. The state of Vulnerability is common to all including well paid civil servants as they are susceptible loss of jobs (WB 2000: 139). The concept of poverty is static unlike those of insecurity and vulnerability which are dynamic as they reflect the altering manner in which overtime changes are responded to and thereby are used as measures of resilience. Whereas Insecurity is exposure to risk, vulnerability is the resulting possibility of decline in wellbeing (ibid). A shock is an event that triggers reduction in wellbeing of an individual, community or nation. Whereas Risks refer to uncertain events that destroy wellbeing, Risk exposure refers the likelihood of risk occurrence (ibid). The multidimensionality of vulnerability and the broad range of risks faced by poor households, leads to differences in sources of income and patterns of consumption (WB 2000: 140). In this sense it could be argued that economic vulnerability of individuals in households leads to exposure of many risks to ones wellbeing and their family. In this the individuals at risk of exposure are the retirees.

Low income translates into the inability for one to save and accumulate assets and thereby the inability to deal with crisis whereas a raise in income would provide for better ability for one’s risk management (WB 2000:135). The availability of mechanisms to reduce, mitigate and cope with risks lessens vulnerability of the poor (ibid). The varied coping mechanisms that the poor have developed, though effective in their own way, are incapable of getting rid of vulnerability (ibid). The WB recognize seven important tools to include in a risk management approach as health insurance, cash transfers, micro financing social funds work-fare programs, social assistance, unemployment insurance, pensions and old age assistance (ibid). This, it is argued, would provide for a comprehensive approach as it would be multifaceted tackling not just one aspect of
vulnerability. This would require for proper resource management by the state.

The main sources of risk are said to be natural, health, social economic, political and environmental (WB 2000:136). Risks may be classified as either micro, meso or macro where micro refers to individuals in the household, meso refers to households spreading over to the community and macro refers to national and international level (ibid). The meso and micro risks impact the micro but the micro may not necessary affect the other two significantly even though they are usually a manifestation of the higher levels of risks.

The source of shocks ought to be known for better prevention. Many external events may have similar effects on household income but the transmission of a shock to a household is largely affected by the institutions of the country which is determined by how well the government functions (WB 2000: 138). In this case question would then be posed concerning preparedness of the government institutions (ministries and pension funds) to handle or prevent shocks that could possibly be transmitted to civil service retirees.

Households and communities responses to risk may be classified into formal and informal arrangements. The type and use of informal strategies which are more of a private nature are highly influenced by formal arrangements which are of a public nature (WB 2000: 140). Formal arrangements comprise of market based activities and publicly provided mechanisms (ibid). There three major ways in which risk management can be done. These are, Risk reduction, where there is lessened likelihood for the occurrence of a shock, Mitigation measures that require reduction of the shock impact and Coping that focus on reliving occurrence of a shock (WB 2000: 142). Both formal and informal arrangements may employ these ways of risk reduction but there is only so much an individual can do when formal public systems are not well established. Withdrawing from savings, selling of assets, borrowing and calling on support networks are some of the usually employed coping measures. It is from this stage that most developing countries ought to sift focus onto the first two strategies. Coping measures ideally ought to be residual backup should risk reduction and mitigation strategies fail.

The WB in their 1990 World Development Report covered a macro-economic view on responses to shocks the poor experience in the light of the 1980’s debt crisis and international recession which had led to structural weakness in developing countries (WB 1990:103). They state
how structural adjustment programs which they financed was not so focused of the effects on the poor as it led to decrease in incomes and cutbacks in social services. The macro-economic disequilibrium frequently linked to high inflation and slow economic growth that causes external and internal unusual symptoms of unsustainable current account deficit, internal financial problems is deemed to be the starting point for adjustment (ibid). The objectives of this adjustment are said to be increase of economic stability and restructuring of the economy to reach a higher growth via influencing exchange rate and fiscal policy by for example, implementing changes in public spending. Noting how public spending on services can affect both current welfare and Human capital of the poor, they link a shift in a poor economy to a shift in households, especially of the poor, as the shifts impact markets and cost of consumption of public services (WB 1990:103-104).

Their suggested best approach for adaption is a combination of swift action on core policies designed to provide a context for future growth with the incorporation of macro-economic policies that can moderate reductions in private consumption in a transition period (WB 1990:104). Examples given include countries such as Indonesia and Malaysia where reduction in oil prices that led to permanent shocks employed the effective adjustment of economic stabilization, restructuring, fiscal policy adjustment, currency depreciation, liberalization of trade and deregulation of industry (WB 1990: 107). This would call for political will and participation hence favoring authoritarian regime over democratic regime where implementation of such policies are dependent on how well the countries leaders convince their people that the adjustment policies are progressive . Political uncertainties may result into resistance to adjustment, as was the case in Zambia, because there is high risk of loss in political support when the common view is that the economic difficulties and adjustment policies are of external orientation and imposition (WB 1990: 115). To prevent the risk of temporal relief as opposed to long term, sound economic polices ought to be encouraged as there would be no substitute for domestic action to protect the poor otherwise (WB 1990: 120). It is hard to overlook how economic solutions are used to solve social problems. In a globalized context where the stage has already been set as described above, one can only wonder what alternatives are there regarding social security pension policy formulation, implementation and impact in developing countries.
3.6 Contextualizing the Concepts: Examples from Developing countries

In order for better application of the concepts presented, examples of two developing country regions that have experienced similar trends in pension system formation and transformation are used. These regions are Latin America and Sub-Saharan Africa.

The resultant social security system incapable of dealing with pressures due structural adjustment programs lead by the WB is an issue common to Latin American countries hence the need to reform the systems and the laws (Mesa-Lago 1997: 497). Social security became a context that made people vulnerable as they were unable to face the shocks that led their inability to afford the rise in social costs hence the risk of falling into poverty. The 1980s depression was a major macro level economic shock that caused a social security crisis which saw to privatization and liberalization hence incurring social costs such as a fall in GDP/capita real wages and public sector expenditures and a raise in inflation unemployment and poverty (ibid). Such may be reflected as a context of vulnerability for society in which risk management mechanisms became that of coping rather reduction or mitigation. The whole situation can be said to be symbolic of the negative impacts that change in regime type from Corporatist systems to Liberal or Social-democratic by the state due to external pressures, proves risky to the people. It was noted that the older the social security system was, the more financial imbalance was experienced in the Latin American countries (ibid).

Similar progression of the Latin American experience can be reflected from the Sub-Saharan region. With reference to Sub-Saharan Africa, one argument presented is that the WB and the ILO have been battling their agendas in the global policy arena so as to push their ideas on the pension system as was done in Latin America (Kpessa and Beland 2012: 298). Demographic and institutional realities have been said to determine most Sub Saharan counties decision to follow the ILO approach (ibid). Also noted is that shortcomings of the post-colonially associated provident funds in the Anglo-Saxon sub Saharan African countries attributed to the welcoming of the alternative ILO social insurance models (ibid). This goes to show how the global influence has been and continues to be present in determining the pension system environment via social security making influence translating into social insecurity. The opportunity to extract the context of vulnerability, shocks and risk management strategies with regard to social security pension systems is offered by analysis of the data.
collected from the representative narrowed down context of retired civil service teachers in Kapiri-Mposhi Zambia.
Chapter 4: Retirement as Experienced In Kapiri- Mposhi

Introduction
In this chapter, the application of a framework resultant from a sustainable livelihood approach is used to analyze the collected data in order to answer the research questions. The Sustainable livelihood framework seemed to be the most relevant analytical tool for my analysis due to its ability to provide a broad systematic view of poverty causing factors and their existent relationships if any (Krantz 2001: 19). Based on this framework, thematic areas of analysis include Context of Vulnerability, Access to Capital and Employed Livelihood Survival strategies as influenced by existent policies and institutions. With this as the main analytical tool, micro, meso and macro level risks causes and mechanisms are identified in the pension system as experienced by the retired teachers.

4.1 Challenges in and Impacts of Retirement Pension Access

4.1.1 Past Challenges of Civil Service Retirees
In attempt to see whether there ever was a time that the pension system was without complaint, I looked at a 1983 Social Security report that was obtained from the Ministry of Labour and Social services office in Lusaka based on an inquiry of social security schemes at the time. In this report it was found that part of the existent schemes at the time was the Ministry of Health which provided for free health services from 1964 till then. The now PSPF was then called the Civil Service Pensions fund, under the Civil Service Pensions Act Cap.410 of 1961, which came as a result of world-wide influence towards establishing schemes where employers were required to contribute. It therefore had emerged as replacement from the previous non-contributory Pension Scheme of the African civil service where government bore all costs and all benefits were from the revenue.

The challenges faced by retirees stemmed from the Civil Service Pension Schemes inherent structures of operation and impacts of these structures on service delivery thereof. They included discriminatory patterns of contribution where the women’s contribution rate (6% of the salary) less than what the men contributed (7%) which translated into differences in the attained pension benefits. There also used to be differences on
retirement age for males (60 years) and females (55 years) at that time when life expectancy was 45 years. This further amplified the discriminatory patterns in the pension system at the time. Also mentioned was how the calculation of benefits was such that it was too complicated for the beneficiaries to understand. Complaints also included insufficient amount of pension received. The lump-sum payment of gratuity was viewed as inappropriate as it attracted extended family hence making appropriate personal planning a problem for retirees.

The delay in processing and payments of terminal benefits sometimes for a period of two years, also featured as a complaint. This lead to debt accumulation and the offering of bribes to enhance the processing of the benefits hence leading to the reduction of pension income as it would already have to be used to pay that which was owed or promised. Some retirees would end up living in the shanty compounds/slums due to inability to afford a better quality of life as a result of reduced income. Transport costs were stated as a burden associated with the then centralized system that required for people to travel to the capital city of Lusaka where the civil service pension office was located. The lack of publicity on the schemes operations was identified as cause for lack of access to information on retirement processes and procedures.

A look into these challenges provided a view of the picture from which the pension system has revolved into at present.

4.1.2 Present Challenges

Current data that was obtained from the 20 retired civil service teachers who served as respondents to the questioners used for the research provided information on the current challenges that the retired teachers face. Figure 1 shows a summary display of these challenges in order of their frequency in being mentioned. Delayed payments came as the most mentioned challenge. The delay duration period ranged from one year for some to four years for others. Some mentioned that the delay was associated with the “decentralized payments” of benefits meant to be obtained from the provincial and district MOE offices. For others however, this delay was in relation to obtaining the lump-sum, whereas a few
experienced the delay in relation to both monthly and lump-sum payments. Allowances, such as terminal benefits and repatriation benefits, owed to all these teacher retirees from pre-retirement times were still owed to them hence the reason for their presence at the MOE offices during the duration of my research.

The other challenges that were recorded were feeding into the main challenges and they included insufficient benefits provided. Underpayments of payments were another stated challenge. One indicated he was being underpaid due to luck of salary adjustment while still in employment. Two others indicated that wrong titles on the retirement letters led to their benefits being calculated for a wrong salary scale hence getting less than was owed to them. This therefore ushers in the challenge of mishandling of documentation before and during retirement which may also be cause of delayed payments. This highlighted an administrative problem in the pension system.

Transport costs as a result of following up these above mentioned issues came as mentioned challenge experience by the majority of the respondents as they lived far from the district MOE offices. In cases where lump-sum issues were involved, they would be required to follow up with the provincial MOE offices in a different town of Kabwe or the PSPF headquarters in Lusaka which would cost them more than travelling to the local offices.

There was unanimous agreement on the insufficient information on retirement process and changes in the system by all retirees. Highlighted here is the issue of communication breakdown between the actors on the system

4.2 Impact of these Challenges on Retirees

One respondent wrote as a response: “My Retirement letter was sent to my 2nd last post (Chibombo) whereas I was taken off the payroll in the last post (Kapiri). From July 2012 till now July 2014, I have not received a single ngwee. My children have stopped going to school …help me so that I can help my school going children, grandchildren and orphans (extended family).”

Inherent in retirement centered problems is income related impacts. Money matters. The fact that these retirees access to the supposed general source of income has erroneous aspects in the system affects their livelihoods and those of their families. “It is very difficult to manage oneself
when the salary stops coming. I suggest that people should continue getting their pensions in form of salaries as the money could be taken from the main package”. This was expressed by one of the respondents as a way to curb the impacts or reduce the risks presented by the challenges.

As depicted in figure 2, the main impact was that of inability to access basic social services. For example, difficulty in education access for their children and other young dependents was mentioned by at least eleven of the twenty (20) survey respondents. The inability to afford access to quality health/medical services for themselves and their family members was mentioned by six respondents.

Access to water and electricity services is impossible for some as they are unable to pay bills that would enable provisioning of such services. As a result some people mentioned their engagement into debt accumulation as the have to find ways in which to survive.

In expression frustrations, a female respondent indicated the following statement as a response: “Being a single woman of ill health, I have suffered as if I did not work for my government. My family is suffering and my grand-children are not going to school and colleges and even if I have monthly pension payments, it is not enough. It is not good after working like this”.

Figure 2
4.3 How Retirees Manage the Risk that Challenges represent

Stated earlier, under the sustainable livelihood approach, in the paper were the three approaches to risk management mechanisms. As depicted in figure 3, there are a number of ways that the retirees chose to respond to these challenges that they face. The most frequently mentioned strategy was that of their engagement into subsistence/small scale farming in order to grow food enough for the household and for sale should any surplus remain. However even the inputs to enable for efficient farming were said to be a challenge to obtain due to insufficient income yielding from the weak pension system.

The type of small businesses, which were run as a form of coping, included mechanic activity (fixing bicycles and other smaller machines) based on generally, obtained knowledge by one male respondent and selling on the market by one female respondent.

Borrowing was mentioned as one form of coping hence the impact of debt accumulation. The constant pursuit of information as a way of tracking the response to complaints and following benefits was a common response. A couple of people mentioned that they just wait for the process to straighten out hopefully in their favor.

Going by the earlier established risk management approaches, these all represent the coping aspect as opposed to risk reduction or risk mitigation options. This thereby renders them unsustainable in the long run.

4.4 “Capital” Resources of Retirees

As already established earlier in the paper, the sustainable livelihoods approach accounts for the availability of capital assets. From the data collected, the retirees can be said to have capital in relation to their previous occupation and current location. Financial Capital during pre-retirement was mainly obtained from their salaries as government teachers. The responses to questions pertaining to salaries showed despite the differences in the amount of money obtained by virtue of being either
a head teacher, primary or secondary school teacher, saving was not possible in readiness for retirement. The main source of post retirement financial capital ought to be the pension benefits but the problem in the system makes it difficult for the retirees to obtain.

Human Capital, as the skills and knowledge that they possess in order to contribute to and benefit from the country’s economy, includes the fact that they were teachers. The value they possess is not lost in them when they retire. For the younger members of the retiree house hold, Human capital development is affected by the inability for the retired guardians to afford high school and college level education. Primary school education is freely accessed due to the pursuit by the government to attain universal primary education in line with the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs).

Social Capital that they possess can be traced back to the union (ZNUT) that they were a part of during employment and on to the retirees association that they joined post retirement. According to the response obtained from all the respondents, the union was not active as it did not assist in relieving these faced challenges. This weakness was confirmed by the fact that when I asked where the ZNUT offices were in an informal conversation, the respondents present at that time did not know. This weakness could be one exclusive to Kapiri-Mposhi as the PSPF board contains a representative from ZNUT headquarters hence showing collective action of teachers being considered as relevant. The retirees association seemed to be more active as they had meetings to discuss their plights and try to advocate a way forward but not much impact was obtained from it. The mentioned households contain families that contribute to networks that these retired individuals have. Despite the shift to modern lifestyle, it can only be assumed that due to the traditional culture, family ties extend beyond the household to the neighbors and friends in the community whose strength in ties cannot exactly be determined by the study that was carried out. However this is affected by the shift in family structure that accompanies a modernizing globalized context where family units are smaller than pre-modern times.

Physical Capital refers to the infrastructure around the retirees. Seeing as Kapiri is an urban settlement, social service infrastructure is accessible for most of the retirees that were located near schools in the center of the town. However, those that travel from the rural parts of the district that fall under Kapiri MOE have relatively less access to good roads and infrastructure hence hindering the access to good public transport systems.
No complaint was made about housing hence my conclusion that inclusive in this type of capital is access to shelter.

The Natural capital that most of the retirees have includes land that is used to grow commonly crops such as maize and vegetables on a subsistence level as indicated earlier.

4.5 Retirees’ Context of Vulnerability

With regards to pension systems, this context of vulnerability in which these teacher retirees are situated is highly characterized by the institutional context that the retirees are placed. It has been established that the capital that they obtain is compromised as it is highly dependent on public policy provisioning.

“Getting a job was an issue, getting paid while in one was a challenge and now accessing our money after working for it is a challenge also; when shall things be well with us?” This was what one of the male respondents uttered while I was waiting for the questioners to be filled in outside the district MOE building where they waited to be addressed on when they would be given the terminal benefits that where owed to them. This says a lot about the context in which civil servants operate, in this case, the retired teachers of Kapiri Mposhi.

Addressing the second sub-question on the causes of these challenges the context in which the challenges are experienced I used data obtained from the interviews with the two key stake holders. The institutions and actors in the pension system are the ones that form the context within where the answer to the question of causes of challenges lies.

Gathered from the interview with the District Human Resource Officer at MOE, the main reason for the challenge of delayed payments of the leave, terminal and repatriation benefits was delayed/ insufficient funding from the government. The second reason was that there was that in some cases, the teachers would purposefully delay handing certain required documentation in order to be kept on the pay roll longer hence the delay in the reception of retirement benefits. This translated into a gap in the system between MOE and PSPF where the records in one institution did not correspond with records in the other. It also translated into the unpreparedness of the retirees to retire maybe due to the lack of sufficient information or the inability to save during the working years.
The interview with PSPF acting CEO confirmed the fund was aware of these challenges and that they were not exclusive to teacher retirees as applied to all under the fund. The delay of access pension benefits, mainly the lump-sum, was attributed as an outcome at service delivery level due to delayed reception of complete documentation from the ministries probably attributed to the lengthy channel through which file flow. Inadequacy in funds was also stated as a cause for these challenges. It was acknowledged that there has been improvement over the years through reformation (1986 and 1996) of the system especially in terms of administration as they had established decentralized offices since around 2008 hence seeing to the better processing of documentation. The most significant reform was the 1996 reformation saw to the formation of the NAPSA where the National Provident Fund was turned into an insurance scheme.

On the challenges that PSPF was facing in service provisioning, the response was that obtaining complete information on the retirees was a major one. Another was the inflexibility of the legal framework in that the laws that govern or define perimeters of the Zambian pension system are rigid in a context where social factors, such as demographic structure, change. But this was said to be an issue that was being addressed as there were in the process of discussing new pension reforms and reviewing these laws. Also as a measure to improve service provisioning of the PSPF was the implementation of a new strategic plan.

The main challenges addressed so far with regards to PSPF have been on the administrative side whereas funding remains the main issue. The Fund has a narrowing resource base resulting from the formation of NAPSA where all new contributions have been going since February 2001. As a result, there are no new members contributing to the PSPF (See Table 1).

Table 1: PSPF Contributors and Retiree Membership
(Source: PSFP 2014:20)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>ACTIVE MEMBERS</th>
<th>PENSIONERS AND BENEFICIARIES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>114,229</td>
<td>36,171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>112,193</td>
<td>39,791</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>108,922</td>
<td>58,223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>105,805</td>
<td>60,954</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>101,970</td>
<td>62,755</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>100,823</td>
<td>45,830</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>96,182</td>
<td>51,716</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>95,915</td>
<td>54,829</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>95,419</td>
<td>57,062</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The PSPF Strategic plan document (2014) states reasons why the PSPF faces financial challenges. Featuring is how the labour force downsizing that was carried out by government in earlier years of Structural Adjustment, largely resulted in the Fiscal challenges that PSPF is facing. This was because it led to the addition of early retirees on pension rolls causing pressure on the fund. Also included is the fact that the fund has faced more financial challenges in the last ten years. The growth of the Funds investment portfolio from one hundred and thirty six million Kwacha (K136) in 2003 to one thousand and twelve million kwacha (K1, 012) in 2013, is minimal in relation to pension liabilities as in 2012 only 6% of total revenue was attained (PSPF 2014: 16).

The implementation of a financing gap budget line that was meant to make up for the constant shortfall has been characteristic erratic government payments hence financial sources continue to be strained leading to the resultant non assured untimely receipt of payments by pensioners (PSPF 2014: 17). Depreciating pension value was another stated challenge as this referred to the funds inability to maintain the real value of benefits with respect to inflation adjustment as the average statutory retirement lump sum pension benefits were to increase by 55.28% between 2013 and 2014 (PSPF 2014: 20). The situation of the fund remains that it has declining resource base, widening financing gap and potential candidate for yet more externally influenced interventions with uncertain results. Quoted was the 2014 Parliamentary Address by the Minister of Finance as having said:

“...Over the medium long term Government will implement wider reforms that will make it achieve principles of affordability, sustainability, portability, wide coverage and adequacy... currently the PSPF has huge deficits... [that] will have to be funded from tax payers money... I am convinced these reforms will translate into positive results” (PSPF 2014: 21)

This context represents a society wrapped in an economy that even though is slowly progressing, cannot keep up with the growing pressures of an increasing population. The annual average growth over the period of 2006-2010 was recorded at below the targeted 7.0 % (Ministry of Finance and National Planning 2011:2). This outcome was partly due to the weak performance of key sectors such as agriculture, manufacturing and tourism, as well as the effects of the external factors that included high
crude oil prices and unfavorable weather conditions. 11% inflation was recorded over this period partly as a result of the global economic recession of 2008/2009 (ibid). Established from this is the country’s economic performance as being influenced by international forces in trade via reliance on outside market. This context of vulnerability provides a bigger picture in which to situate the micro level impact explored in the paper.

4.6 Social Exclusionary Impacts on Retirees

As seen from the presented findings the decrease of income during the period of waiting for the pension benefits leads the retirees experiencing social exclusion in terms of the inhibited or denied access to basic needs as social services come at a cost that they cannot meet. The seizure of earned income ushers the retiree teachers into a vulnerability context packed with risks of falling into relative poverty where attainment of certain basic needs is inhibited. This pushes them into a category of social exclusion determined by the two categories stated earlier in the paper. These are unemployment and loss of income due to the fact that by virtue of being retired, none of the respondents indicated engagement in formal employment where income would be earned. Loss of income is enhanced by lack of access to pension benefits over a certain period of time in the absence of saving and wages. The resultant informal activities were a mode of risk management via coping strategies. This social exclusion is experienced by the not only the retirees but the members of the household in which these retirees are the breadwinners. It thereby becomes characteristic in their livelihoods.
Chapter 5: Using the Past and Present to Look Ahead

5.1 What Went Wrong?

I highly doubt that the negative outcomes of the Zambian Pension system were intended by the government as the popularity of leaders is only as strong as their ability to deliver services to enhance access to basic needs. Scott (1998: 1-7) uses an analogy of how the honeycomb in a beehive has been modified overtime for the convenience of the honey harvester at the expense of the bees natural way of functioning to describe state attempt to modify societal systems in a manner that is viewed as most conducive at the expense of inherent customs and practices that constitute contextual relevance. In my view, this is what happened to the Zambian Pension system as represented in this paper. So far, established in this paper are micro level impacts for macro level decisions. Global issues impact formation of the context in which risks are established as state decisions are influence by them.

Scott (1998: 345) states how Taking small steps, Favoring Reversibility, Planning on surprises and planning on human inventiveness are the four suggested rules of thumb that would lessen the event of development planning turning into a disaster with adverse impacts as displayed in the previous chapter. Taking small steps would be based on the uncertainty of interventions as they represent an experimental approach to social change. Zambia seems to have leaped into a public pension system that has yielded seemingly worsening challenges both to the institutions and the people concerned. Favoring Reversibility refers to the preference to the kind of interventions simple enough to undo should they turn out to be mistakes because: "irreversible interventions have irreversible consequences" (Scott 1998: 345). There is no way to reverse the path of progression that the developing countries have embarked on with regards to social security pension system. It has already been established that globalization in its early form through colonialisation and in its latter form through neoliberal trade and aid has had adverse negative impact on social policy making. Interventions in form of reforms continue to be the solution. Something is missing that was perhaps lost in early planning and implementation of the pension systems.

Planning on surprises encompasses the selection of interventions that accommodate broad unforeseen circumstances (Scott 1998: 345). The
Zambian pension system with regards to PSFP clearly did not apply such steps in social security system development as the challenges by the pensioners and beneficiaries have been in existence from the 1980s and seem to be getting worse now. Planning on human inventiveness is the incorporation of the assumption that the stakeholders of a project would eventually improve the design based on acquired experience and developed insight. The reforms have shown this element but the problem is that the ideas towards Zambian pension reformation are clearly not Zambian contextually relevant as they were externally influenced via WB or/and ILO.

5.2 Approaches towards better Retirement Experience in Zambia

The Zambian situation therefore is such that what should ideally be a middle class group is facing the risk of falling into relative poverty because of pension system and policy inefficiency and ineffectiveness. The struggle to keep the PSPF functioning is characterized by reforms that manifest as top down policies that are unclear to the information deprived population of retirees on whom impact is intended. Macro level approaches cannot be dismissed and will continue to exist as the country cannot pull away from the global community. Perhaps the way forward would be a micro-level or meso level approach that would survive in or co-exist with the macro policy environment in striving for a development of social security system that follows a path encompassing the four previously mentioned guidelines.

5.2.1 Civil Action for Improvements

A Zambian traditional proverb goes: “unlike one stick, a bunch of sticks are hard to break”. Cooperation for a common cause always yields better results than when people try to venture on their own in seek of a better solution. The introductory section of this paper gives an example of the manner in which such civil action was demonstrated by the retiree campers in the city center when they could not return to their towns in anticipation of their pension benefits.

The need for social cohesion is seen through the group activity that the retirees are a part of from the membership in the ZANUT to the Teacher Retirees Association in the town of Kapiri. Here lies the potential for civil action where social cohesion principles can be embraced in fighting for the rights to access social security and social services overall. The passive nature of these groups as established from the study if addressed would lead to attention for yielding desired results. Hirst (2013:21) states how
civil society is an organizational orientation that ought to be made public despite its state or non-state inclination. Stressed is how such organizations ought to be accepted as governing powers over which citizens with significant affected interests should have a say proportionate to their involvement and the risk to their interest (ibid). In this regard, ZNUT and District Teachers Association may organize themselves into a civil society with common interests of influencing policies conserving pension systems. Given the democratic system of rule in the country, freedom of expression on issues concerning the pension system ideally ought not to be a problem.

This collective action would be for the purpose of a shift in Zambian Social security system to one that would ensure for the mitigation and reduction of the risks currently associated with retirement rather than call for livelihood coping strategies by beneficiaries. An example of such a system is one like that of South Africa where social assistance grants co-exist with occupational social insurance and private savings (Triegaardt 2005:4). The social assistance grants are non-contributory means tested government provisions that act as a social safety net for those that need it (ibid). In the event that the occupational pension system yields negative impacts as those discussed in the paper, this would be a good macro level intervention to incorporate.

5.2.2 Incorporating Traditional values in Modern Systems

It could be possible that the missing piece in the pension system puzzle is the principle of reciprocity that lay behind the now “old fashioned” mutual aid system. Social cohesion and reciprocity being its core principles may qualify it to be classified as a grassroots level approach to development. This is what worked for society before so therefore there could be a way in which it may be incorporated into the modern social security pension system. Perhaps the creation groups within professions, in which the main activity is saving, may be one way to tackle the risk of falling into a level of poverty via lack of retirement pension benefit access in the systems seeing as individual saving is was found to be impossible.

Savings and Credit focused groups may be used by professionals in their time of employment as motivation for savings. Members of small groups of between five to ten people would be formed where an agreed sum of money would be contributed and a rotation cycle approach would be taken in accessing the agreed upon amount, from accumulated contributions, after period of time as agreed by the members. Informal social security schemes such as these already practiced by mostly the rural and urban
poor in Zambia called “Chilimba” (Mukuka et.al 2002: 97). These began as a substitute for mutual-aid among poor male labour miners during the colonial period to cover contingencies such as personal items, funeral, education transport and medical expenses (ibid). Such an approach may be like that of Self Help Groups (SHGs), associated with micro-financing schemes, largely promoted in rural India. Advantages of SHGs included increase in the members living standards, household income, asset ownership, borrowing capacities income generating activities and savings for the poor who were members (Varman 2005:1705).

This practice was not mentioned as a coping mechanism by the retired teachers hence it may be concluded that those fall under the middle income categories may not see the necessity to get involved in such an informal scheme. The promotion and adoption of this approach in social security may lessen the risk of falling into poverty during retirement as the increase in acquired assets would be shock absorber for should the impact of challenges faced in benefit access hit. With such an approach, rather than waiting on the state to act via some sort of government interventions, potential and existing retirees would take action by using available resources in view of maintaining sustainable livelihoods. This would make for a good micro level approach towards risk mitigation and reduction which may also serve as a coping strategy in livelihood sustainability of a retiree.

5.3 Summary and Conclusions

In conclusion, this study did provide answers to the questions presented in the introduction. In answering the research question of how civil service teacher retiree livelihoods are affected by the challenges that they face in accessing pension benefits in Kapiri-Mposhi, Zambia, the paper begins by placing the Zambian Social Security Pension system in periodic transformations as influenced by an alteration in state regime types and their interaction with Globalization processes. The process of Globalization is said to have shaped the pension system as it was manifested via the phases of colonialisat—

5.3 Summary and Conclusions

In conclusion, this study did provide answers to the questions presented in

the introduction. In answering the research question of how civil service
teacher retiree livelihoods are affected by the challenges that they face in
accessing pension benefits in Kapiri-Mposhi, Zambia, the paper begins by
placing the Zambian Social Security Pension system in periodic
transformations as influenced by an alteration in state regime types and
their interaction with Globalization processes. The process of Globalization
is said to have shaped the pension system as it was manifested via the
phases of colonialisat—

5.3 Summary and Conclusions

In conclusion, this study did provide answers to the questions presented in

the introduction. In answering the research question of how civil service
teacher retiree livelihoods are affected by the challenges that they face in
accessing pension benefits in Kapiri-Mposhi, Zambia, the paper begins by
placing the Zambian Social Security Pension system in periodic
transformations as influenced by an alteration in state regime types and
their interaction with Globalization processes. The process of Globalization
is said to have shaped the pension system as it was manifested via the
phases of coloniaisat—
in such a way that people are at risk of falling into relative poverty after they retire. The findings are analyzed using the sustainable livelihoods approach which encompasses these concepts in relation to possession or access to human, social, financial, physical and natural capital in assessing the livelihoods of individuals and their households. Findings showed that much as they have some level of access to all these capitals, which enable for employing certain coping mechanisms, the institutional instability composed of the externally influenced economic performance and political will in relation to the PSPF, continues to provide a vulnerable context which amplifies the risk of falling into poverty and being subjected to social exclusion thereof.

The reason for these unintended negative consequences are blamed on the early and continuous implementation of pension policies and reform that lacked four elements in development planning. These elements were stated as being the ability to take small steps, the possibility of reversibility, the ability to plan on surprises and the incorporation of human inventiveness. Failure to incorporate them early stage continues to yield negative outcomes as displayed in the paper where the PSPF is barely surviving as the resource base narrows in an economy where benefits of the minimal economic growth are not experienced by the majority population.

Possible approaches to a better Zambian Social Security system are suggested to be micro and meso level interventions that influence macro policy environments. Example of the South African targeted under universal Social Security system is used as an area common interest that civil society via ZNUT and Retiree association ought to advocate for. The involvement in savings and credit centered groups is encouraged for teachers (during and after employment) as a micro level approach. With the incorporation of the four developmental guidelines, such approaches would insure for livelihood protection and sustainability as the social security system would yield results of actual security and not insecurity.
References


Midgley, J. and E. Kaseke (1996) 'Challenges to Social Security in Developing Countries: Coverage and Poverty in Zimbabwe', *Midgley, James & Tracy, Martin B. Challenges to Social Security: An International*


Pearlin, L.I. and C. Schooler (1978) 'The Structure of Coping', Journal of health and social behavior 19(1): 2-21 Accessed 16 October 2014 http://eur.summon.serialssolutions.com/2.0.0/link/0/eLvHCXMwXV1LCkixDCyudSMoLr1ApV_atxYfHuBdYgqky7d698dUBNEDZJdkZiCZM5aGm7N_O2G aAJKKomosD1OwrMWeOQi5Lwg_hnz7776aj2Yn68ks82O5P-0nH8DSyAeygFQXyyc5SsxDip-1MC1q2rw1B1SLqKgLfDu3xqoqMnAL1iCotUzybA8YZ-bq93834Yq4u5-KWUByQaoeJRrS5HRbB8rFTXvzwOTM


Appendices

Appendix 1: Questionnaire for Teacher Retirees

Please tick necessary option where needed.

1) Sex ………………..(a)Male ☐ (b)Female ☐

2) Age

(a) Below 55 ☐ (b) Between 55-65 ☐ (c) Above 65 ☐

3) What was your last position?
   (a) Head-teacher ☐
   (b) Secondary School Teacher ☐
   (c) Primary School teacher ☐
   (d) Other (Please Specify) ☐

4) Where was your last station?

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

5) When did you retire?

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

6) Did you retire due to:
   (a) Early retirement ☐ (b) attainment of retirement age ☐
   (c) Other (Please Specify) ☐

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

7) What pension scheme/fund are you under?
   (a) National Pension Scheme Authority (NAPSA) ☐
   (b) Public Service Pension Fund (PSPF) ☐
   (d) Other (Please Specify) ☐
8) What is your monthly pension benefit pay?
(a) Below K500
(b) Between K500- K1000
(c) Between K1001- K1500
(d) Between K1501- K2000

9) What was your salary scale?

10) Was your salary during employment sufficient for you to save in preparation for retirement?
(a) Yes  
(b) No

11) Was there sufficient information provided on your pension/fund to enable you adequately prepare for your retirement?
(a) Yes  
(b) No

12)  a. Have you faced challenges in accessing your pension benefits?
(a) Yes  
(b) No  

   b. If yes for question 13 (a) please state the challenges

13) How have these challenges affected you and your family?

14) What do you do in order to cushion the impacts of the challenge?

15) (a) Were you affiliated with a union?
Yes  
No  

(b) If yes, what union?

(c) Was being part of this union helpful in accessing your pension benefits?
Appendix 2: Interview Guides administered at:

**A. Public Service Pensions Fund**
1. Are you aware of the challenges that are faced by Civil Service Retirees in accessing pension benefits?
   b. Do these challenges apply to all pensioners under the fund?
   1. What would you attribute these challenges to?
   2. What are the challenges that the Fund is facing in service provisioning?
   3. What has been done so far in order to improve this situation?
   4. Reading a report from the 1980s proved the challenges being faced in service delivery and access today are similar to the ones faced then. Do you really think there has been significant change in terms of improvement?

**B. Ministry of Education, Science, Technical Vocational training and Early Education Kapiri-Mposhi District Offices**
1. How many schools are registered in Kapiri Mposhi?
2. How many teachers are in Kapiri Mposhi?
3. How many teachers have been recorded to have retired the past few years on average?
4. What role does this office play with regards to retirement of teachers and their access to benefits?
5. There have been challenges faced by the teachers in the accessing of these benefits such as delayed payments and lack of information. Are you aware of this and what can you attribute this to?