



Marginal Identity:

Narratives of Transgender People in Accessing Identification and Welfare Schemes in Bangalore

A Research Paper presented by:

SUDHIR RANGAPPA NARAYANA

India

in partial fulfillment of the requirements for obtaining the degree of

MASTER OF ARTS IN DEVELOPMENT STUDIES

Major:

Governance, Policy and Public Economy

(GPPE)

Members of the Examining Committee:

Dr Silke Heumann

Dr Wendy Harcourt

The Hague, The Netherlands

November 2015

Disclaimer

This document represents part of the author's study programme while at the International Institute of Social Studies (ISS). The views stated therein are those of the author and not necessarily those of the Institute.

Inquiries

Postal Address:

Institute of Social Studies,
P.O. Box 29776
2502 LT The Hague
The Netherlands

Location:

Kortenaerkade 12
2518 AX The Hague
The Netherlands

Telephone: +31 70 426 0460

Fax: +31 70 426 0799

Contents

| | |
|---|----|
| Acknowledgments | 4 |
| List of Appendices | 5 |
| List of Abbreviations and Acronyms | 6 |
| Abstract | 7 |
| Chapter 1 Introduction | 8 |
| Chapter 2 Research Context and Research Question | 11 |
| Chapter 3 Literature Review | 15 |
| Chapter 4 Theoretical Framework | 18 |
| Chapter 5 Research Methodology | 22 |
| Chapter 6 Findings and Conclusions | 25 |
| References | 36 |

Acknowledgments

The journey of writing this research paper has been a huge learning experience. Starting from the time of choosing the topic for the paper to the submission now, every step has seen help coming to me from various quarters.

Dr Silke Huemann, my supervisor, has been the biggest support I have had in this exercise. She has been a great source of encouragement, always finding nice things to say even when I was failing to do things right and being involved with this throughout. Her comments and criticism were invariably incisive and yet positive. This paper would not have been completed without her. Dr. Wendy Harcourt, my second reader, has been superlative too, and was instrumental in me making sense out of the process of writing the research design and bringing focus to the subject. Prof (Dr) Joop de Wit and Dr Georgina Gomez from my Major (GPPE) have been awesome sources of help. Dr Gomez helped me zero in on the topic and find my Supervisors too.

I also should be ever grateful to Dr. Ashok Dalwai, IAS, and my boss then at the UIDAI Technology Centre, Bangalore (and presently, Additional Secretary, Ministry of Agriculture, GOI). His help at crucial junctures was instrumental in me successfully attending and completing the course.

Anna Dinglasan, my fellow course mate at the ISS and a great friend was my biggest source of help at every moment of panic both while in The Hague and after. Anna, Sarah, Shraddha, Pablo and Victoria have all provided valuable inputs in making this paper. Back home, I would like to be ever grateful to Archana, Bassy, Kade, Sanju and Sirish for being there for me always. A lot many transgender, LGBT activists and people helped me at every stage of this study. I hope to have imbibed at least an iota of their belief, commitment and positivity.

I express my gratitude and heartfelt thanks to each of them and all others who have not been named here. And, whatever failings and inadequacies of this report may have are all due to me.

19. 11. 2015
Narayana
Hyderabad

Sudhir Rangappa

Appendix

1. Details of enrolment of transgender in Aadhaar
 - Table 1: State-wise Details
 - Table

Abbreviations and Acronyms

APCOM: Asia Pacific Coalition on Male Sexual Health

DMK: Dravida Munnetra Kazhagam, a regional political party in Tamil Nadu, India

IPC: Indian Penal Code

LGBT: Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender

MLA: Member of Legislative Assembly

MP: Member of Parliament

NALSA: National Legal Services Authority

NCT: National Capital Territory

NGO: Non-Governmental Organisation

PDS: Public Distribution System

PUCL: People's Union for Civil Liberties

SCI: Supreme Court of India

SRS: Sex Reassignment Surgery

UIDAI: Unique Identification Authority of India

UNDP: United Nations Development Project

Research Paper

Abstract

Existence of transgender people in India has been acknowledged even in ancient texts. From having coexisted – even though not essentially as equal citizens always – and accepted largely by the society, the transgender people became reviled and pushed to the fringes of the society over time. Most notably from the time of the British Rule. The plight and the problems of the transgender people were largely neglected until recently. And, the society in general lacks the understanding of who a transgender is. In the recent years, several organisations have sprung up that work for the betterment of the status of the transgender people. Owing to the work of these organisations, many times led by transgender persons themselves, the awareness about the people and their problems has grown. As a consequence, transgender people have gained access to voting, contest in elections and even have beauty pageants. Also, there have been sporadic policies and welfare schemes that have been started by several state governments, most notably, Tamil Nadu and West Bengal. The Central Government's ambitious identity scheme, 'Aadhaar' launched in 2010 was the first to provide for a person to declare oneself as 'transgender'. The Supreme Court in 2014 delivered a landmark judgment directing that appropriate steps be taken by the Government to protect the rights of the transgender people, including the option of according reservation in education and employment. A Private Member's Bill was passed in the Upper House (Rajya Sabha) of the Parliament with similar intent in April 2015. Some of the results of the activism are noteworthy. A transgender person has become the Principal of an educational institution in Kolkata. There is a TV anchor in Tamil Nadu conducting her own show. A radio channel exclusively run by transgender people has started in Bangalore. And, the latest is, a transgender person in Tamil Nadu has become a police Sub Inspector. Yet, there is still violence against the transgender – largely by the police. Also, their sexuality continues to be troubled with the Supreme Court upholding the validity of Sec. 377 of the Indian Penal Code which criminalises 'unnatural sex'.

This study has been carried out to understand the lives and difficulties of the transgender people living in Bangalore, in the backdrop of the introduction of 'Aadhaar' which provides for a person to identify one's gender as 'transgender', a first in the country, and the pension scheme 'Mythri' launched by the Government of Karnataka, for the transgender people. This paper looks at the experiences of the transgender people in accessing the identity and welfare schemes launched by the governments and their adequacy, along with ascertaining their knowledge of the developments taking place in the spheres of governance. The study used interviews to elicit information from the transgender people, apart from relying on secondary sources of information to set the context.

Chapter 1

Introduction

1.1 Introduction

One of the common sights in metropolitan cities in India – particularly at the traffic signals – is a group of transgender women, *hijras*, attired in Indian traditional sarees, aggressively begging from those in cars – asking for more when given just coins, blessing those who give them money, cursing those who do not. Many give them some cash to avert being touched or cursed by them – their touch pollutes and their curses come true, according to the beliefs. You may encounter them on the trains too. Most people see the transgender from just the perspective of their aggression in begging and nothing else. Little attention is paid to their dismal lives.

Transgender communities comprise of some of the most marginalised people in the country owing to social, political and legal bias. Even though there are several organisations working for the rights of the transgender, the fight is far from over. The Supreme Court in its judgment in the case of *NALSA vs Union of India* in April 2014 has directed the Government to recognize the transgender as the third gender and accord reservations to the communities in education and employment (SCI, 2014). A private member's bill has also been passed in the Upper House (Rajya Sabha) of the Parliament on similar lines (IE 2015). However, these would take time to fruition. In the meantime, the Government has filed a rejoinder to the judgment seeking clarifications regarding the meaning of certain provisions in the judgment delivered in April 2014 (TOI 2014). The Honourable Court is yet to provide response.

Also, the law that criminalised homosexual activity (Sec. 377 of IPC) was read down by the High Court of Delhi in 2009, in the case of *Naz Vs Government of NCT Delhi*. In its judgment, the High Court said that this law violates the principles of fundamental rights; homosexuality was suddenly no more an 'unnatural' offense. What many in India to this day fail to recognise is that this section of the law affected not just homosexual people but also heterosexuals and the transgender (as both oral and anal sex are considered 'against the order of the nature' by the law). This judgment was challenged in the Supreme Court (*Kaushal Vs Naz*). After four and a half years, the Supreme Court, reinstated the Sec. 377 and decreed that it was legal. Homosexuality was re-criminalized. With this any sexual activity a transgender person would indulge in also became a crime.

There exists a dichotomy in the developments that are taking place in the sphere of governance and government with respect to the rights of the transgender people in India. On the one side, both the judiciary and the parliament have vocally come in support of the need to enact special policies and legislation to bring about a change in the lot of the transgender. But, these pronouncements are silent on (or ignoring) the sexual rights of the transgender people, as they largely focus on their right to education, employment and socio-economic development.

1.2 Background

Gender and sexual minorities have had a troubled existence in the Indian subcontinent. The genderqueer identities of gay, lesbian, bisexual and transgender communities are discriminated against because of the provisions that exist in law. Section 377 of Indian Penal Code ensures that any sexual activity by homosexuals and the transgender is ‘against the order of the nature’ and hence punishable under law¹. Criminalisation of the gender minorities began with the advent of the British and colonialization of India. Section 377 was enacted during the 19th Century. The over 150-year old law (the law was passed in 1861) has ensured persecution of gender and sexual minorities (Joseph 1996). Particularly harsh was the treatment meted out to the transgender communities that could not hide their sexual/gender identity. They were included in the list of Criminal Tribes and their very existence was criminalised in 1871. Persecution were in the form of criminalisation of the entire community and harassment by the state (PUCL 2004).

The situation for the sexual/gender minorities was not always this harsh. The existence of the transgender community has been acknowledged even in the ancient epics of the Hindu religion dating back to at least the 3rd millennium BC. The Mahabharata has several references to the transgender in the form of the characters ‘Brihannala’, the form of Arjuna during the ‘Ajnatavasa’ or the period of exile that the Pandavas (Arjuna being one of them) have to undergo when they have to live incognito for an entire year, and ‘Shikhandi’, a woman who is ‘reborn’ as a man. These two characters are central to the rendition of the Mahabharata² (Rajagopalachari 1958). Some of the transgender communities trace their origins to the Mahabharata. The Aravanis of Tamil Nadu look to Ahiravan or Iravan, a character in the epic as their progenitor (Narain, 2003). The beginning of discrimination that transgender communities face today could be discerned from the reading of the epics too but they were still part of the society and were not marginalised or relegated to the fringes.

1.3 Defining Transgender

Unlike in the Western Countries which firmly believed in the binaries of gender and sex, India from the ancient times has had a more inclusive view towards the fluidity of genders. As mentioned above, many Indian texts talk about the existence of the transgender people. Even gods have been presented in transgender forms. ‘Mohini’ is the female form of Vishnu, one of the Triumvirate of the Hindu pantheon (Danielou 1991: 186). Siva, another of the triumvirate is presented as ‘Ardhanareeswara’ meaning ‘half-woman-man’, symbolising the union of the male and the female attributes, ‘the lord who is half woman’ (Gopal 1990 :69). This form of Siva is found on the walls of many temples and is also commonly worshipped by the Hindu believers.

There are several kinds who are termed ‘transgender’ in India. It is a broad, inclusive term that brings together different identities across the large nation. It includes ‘Hijras’ from the North –

¹ Section 377 of Indian Penal Code (IPC) reads “Whoever voluntarily has carnal intercourse against the order of nature with any man, woman or animal, shall be punished with imprisonment for life, or with imprisonment of either description for a term which may extend to ten years, and shall also be liable to fine’.

² Mahabharata, written by Vyasa, tells the story of the Pandava princes and their victory over their cousins, Kauravas; it is the classical tale of the triumph of the good over evil and is considered the largest epic ever written. There are many different versions of this epic in various Indian languages and English. It is also known by the names, ‘Bharata’ and ‘Jaya’.

the most visible transgender community as they are known to live in communities and who believe in the rites of passage of emasculation to be included into the community. The kothis of Andhra Pradesh – phonetically similar to the kathoi of Thailand – are biological men who dress as women. Aravani is the Tamil name for Hijra. Jogappas of Karnataka (Jogtas in Maharashtra) and Shivasakti in Andhra and Maharashtra are biological men who dress and behave like women and declare that they are ‘possessed’ by a God/Goddess and hence dedicate themselves in His/Her service. Jogappas dedicate themselves to the Goddess Yellamma, for example. The small class of intersex people also are part of the transgender umbrella in India (GOI 2013). All these transgender identities refer to the male-to-female transgendered. There are female-to-male transgender people and identities too but are less talked about. They are known as Sadhin in the North, Magarayudu in Andhra, Thirunambi in Tamil Nadu and Gandabasaka (Gandubasakka) in Karnataka. The focus of most discussions so far have been the male-to-female transgender persons and communities (Suleiman 2011).

The criminal laws passed by the British have had a particularly severe impact on the transgender communities across India – known by different names like hijras, kothis, jogtas, jogappas, aravanis, kinnars etc. Their status today is possibly the worst among all the communities that exist in India – gender, sexual, religious or otherwise. Continued neglect and discrimination by the state have resulted in the entire communities living either as beggars or sex workers, with few opportunities for employment (PUCL 2004).

With activism that started in the last few decades, the status of the transgender communities has begun to be acknowledged among the state establishments including the lawmakers and the judiciary.

The Supreme Court through its judgment of April 2014 identifies the transvestites and the transsexuals as part of the transgender community thus making the term broader and also more complete. Even the intersex people (those born with both male and female genitals) are included under the same category as of now (SCI 2014).

Chapter 2

Research Context and Research Question

2.1 The Context

The recognition of the need and the fight for rights of/by the transgender people began in the last decade of the 20th Century. The efforts of activists and transgender organisations over the past few decades have borne some results. Humsafar Trust started by Ashok Rao Kawi in Mumbai and Naz Foundation started by Shivananda Khan in Delhi were the first organisations to start working in the sphere of LGBT and they both started functioning in 1991. Over 100 organisations are actively working today regarding transgender rights and welfare in the country, as found by the study commissioned by APCOM (and carried out by Saathi). Sangama and Samana are two organisations in Bangalore that have been active in working for the rights of LGBT. (APCOM 2008). Revathi, Kalki Subramaniam in the South India (Tamil Nadu and Karnataka) and Laxmi Narayan Tripathi are prominent transgender activists³. The In the landmark judgment of 2014, the Supreme Court of India has ruled that the transgender communities may be treated on par with the Other Backward Classes and provided reservations in education and employment, among other things. The Rajya Sabha (the Upper House of the Parliament of India) passed a Private Member Bill moved by MP Trichy Siva, unanimously in April 2015 to devise and implement a comprehensive policy for protection and uplift of the transgender communities.

Previously some of the state governments have introduced schemes for the benefit of transgender communities. Tamil Nadu has been at the forefront with the state having a transgender welfare board and even offering free sex reassignment surgeries to the transgender people (UNDP 2012). Karnataka has launched a social security scheme called 'Mythri' (meaning, friendship) to wean the communities away from sex work and begging (Hindu 2013). The Central Government's ambitious 'Aadhaar', (meaning, foundation or cornerstone) under the Unique Identification Authority of India is the first government organisation to provide for the option of the third gender in any identification programme. Following this, many transgender persons have obtained the ID with their preferred gender as 'Transgender' (HT 2013).

Despite these measures, the harassment and marginalisation of the transgender communities have not reduced. There have been many cases of police brutalities against them in the recent past. In November 2014, over 150 transgender people were arrested in Bangalore, Karnataka by the police without warning under the guise of 'anti-begging laws'. Even though transgender people have confessed to their activist friends and organisations of rapes by the police and of other violence, they have no channel to fight these atrocities. Rarely such stories are covered by

³ These names of the activists have been sourced from media stories and the online directories of various organisations that list them as part. No references hence provided for individuals.

mainstream media. Many times, no reports are filed even by the transgender persons for the fear of further harassment and violence in the face of lack of social and/or political support. There is little or no public involvement or empathy to the issues of the transgender communities and their poverty, marginalisation and sexual/gender identity issues (HRW 2015).

One can “notice that even though historically, Hijras/transgender persons had played a prominent role, with the onset of colonial rule 12 from the 18th century onwards, the situation had changed drastically” (SCI 2014: 12). It is thus understood on studying the history of transgender that the laws brought in by the British was the beginning of the process of alienation of transgender communities and other sexual identities in the country. The Abrahamic dichotomy of the West, of man and woman being the only genders/sexes (and genders equating sexes) has been imposed and largely accepted/assimilated in the society. This too results in public apathy and indiscriminate violence against the LGBT communities and particularly, the transgendered.

Even though the Supreme Court has ruled in favour of the transgender people being identified as the third gender and providing for reservations and a bill has been passed in the Rajya Sabha, these measures may take ages to actually become relevant laws; and further delays would be noticed in them percolating across the hierarchies and divisions and them being abided by everyone. These are my personal observations from both having worked in the government and also having observed the functioning of the legislature and the executive over a period of time.

The Unique Identification Authority of India (UIDAI) established under the aegis of the Planning Commission was the first government organisation to provide for the option of the third gender in identification. The UIDAI established with the avowed objective of providing an independent and unique identification through a unique number to every resident/citizen of the country allowed the transgender to declare their gender as transgender. The UIDAI program though has not been supported (or even aggressively protested against) by some of the Civil Society activists who work with transgender organisations resulting in it not being completely favoured. The reasons for this are centred on the collection of biometric data to issue the identity numbers. The opposing activists believe that the data thus collected can be put to misuse – including breach of privacy, for surveillance, sharing with other organisations (including external nations) and sale for commercial purposes (Chakravarty 2014).

Even though the judgment of the SC of India is positive, it still completely does not vindicate the transgender communities and their practices. One, many (male to female) transgender persons are known to prefer male partners and perform anal intercourse which continues to be criminal under the provisions of Section 377 of the IPC. Two, a large number of transgender people are known to be involved in sex work for their livelihood. They have oral and/or anal intercourse with their customers, which again is criminal as per the Sec. 377. The re-criminalisation of homosexuality in India due to the judgment of the Supreme Court in 2013 thus not only affects homosexuals but also transgender people (unless they have undergone sex reassignment surgery and changed their gender along with that; but then again SRS is available free of cost in few places in the country and only to male-to-female transgender). Though the Criminal Tribes laws have been abolished, one provision from the law pertaining to the transgender communities continues to be retained in the IPC – the law against emasculation. And, the law (or the

government) is not clear on what gender would the transgender persons who have preferred to undergo sex reassignment surgery (SRS) be treated as. Nor has the government of India come out so far with any policy regarding the transgender communities in light of the SC judgment. It hence becomes imperative to look at the narratives of the transgender people regarding their fight for rights, identity and inclusion.

2.2 Research Problem

As brought above, the transgender people experience marginalisation and disregard in all spheres – socio-economic, political and sexual. The challenges they face in their lives are immense. The main problem that this paper intends to look at pertains to the changes that are taking place in the sphere of governance with respect to the transgender people and their rights. There are changes at the national level – through the inclusion of transgender as the third gender in identity cards and judgments by the Supreme Court of India, and a Private Member's Bill that was passed by the Rajya Sabha (the Upper House of the Parliament) that are urging the government to pass special laws to protect the transgender people. The State Governments too have brought in their own schemes to help the transgender. Karnataka has a pension scheme for transgender people, called 'Mythri'. I intend to understand through the narratives and experiences of the transgender people, the adequacy of these measures, their aspirations and wants, the inadequacies that still exist in the system and how – in their views – these could be bridged.

2.3 Research Question

2.3.1 The focus:

Transgender people belong to the most marginalized section and live on the fringes of the society in India. Even though in the last one year, there have been positive developments pertaining to the position of the transgender people in the form of the Supreme Court judgment and passing of a private member bill in the Rajya Sabha, things at the ground level have stayed the same. Also, their sexuality continues to be criminalized as Sec. 377 has been upheld by the Supreme Court of India – a reversal of the judgment of the High Court of Delhi in 2009.

The daily lives of the transgender people in Bangalore – their means of livelihood, their quest for recognition, the problems and challenges they face in general (access to basic needs and wants) and from the state institutions and the support that does not reach them.

2.3.2 The Questions

The main question of the research thus would be:

What are the narratives and experiences of the transgender people in Bangalore in accessing identification and welfare schemes like the Aadhaar (of the UIDAI) and Mythri (of the State Government)?

Sub Questions:

- What has been the experience of the transgender persons in obtaining any government identification?

- The ‘Aadhaar’ experience – obtaining an identity that declares one as ‘transgender’
- Experiences of obtaining other identifications, like the Passport, Ration Card, etc.
- What has been the experience of the transgender people in accessing and availing benefits from a scheme like Mythri?
- What is the level of awareness among transgender people of the changes that are taking place in the views of the government and judiciary, including options for sex reassignment surgery? What are the views?
- How is reinstatement (and upholding) of the Sodomy Law (Sec.377) by the SCI affecting the lives of transgender people?

2.4 Geographical Context: Bangalore (Bengaluru), Karnataka

I have carried out my study in Bangalore for the following reasons:

1. I am based out of Bangalore in India and I know the place well. I speak the language that is spoken by a large section of the population – Kannada. I also understand other languages that are prominently spoken in the city – Telugu and Tamil.
2. Bangalore has been the hub of migration within the country. This I believe is true in the case of transgender persons too. The possibility of finding transgender people who identify by different names and labels here are high, as compared to other towns, thereby enhancing the possibility of a more inclusive study.

2.5 Policies: Specific policies initiated by the state and central governments and addressed at sexual/gender minorities including transgender communities for the purposes of identification, social inclusion, economic emancipation, etc. The policies I have particularly looked at are the Aadhaar scheme launched by the Government of India through the Unique Identification Authority of India which for the first time provided an opportunity to the transgender to identify as the third gender. And, also the policy of the Government of Karnataka, ‘Mythri’ which provides monthly remuneration to the transgender people. These would be looked at with specific focus on Bangalore.

2.6 Time Period: From 2009 to 2015. In the year 2009, in a landmark judgment in the case of Naz Foundation Vs the Government of NCT of Delhi, a two-member bench read down the Sec. 377 of the IPC as a violation of fundamental rights guaranteed under the Articles 14, 15 and 21 of the Constitution of India (HCD, 2009). This was the first ever victory claimed by the LGBT communities in India. However, the victory was short lived. The judgment was appealed against in the Supreme Court of India and the same was overturned by the hon’ble court in its judgment delivered in December 2013 even though the Government of India had supported the judgment of the Delhi High Court in its response to the court.

Chapter 3

Literature Review

Writing on the issues of transgender and other sexual minorities is a recent phenomenon. Yet, globally in a short period it has attracted immense quality writing and scholarship. The writings have also resulted in influencing rights movements, policy-making, expansion of understanding, and mainstreaming of the issues of sexual and gender minorities. My understanding from the reading of literature is that queer studies and theories have emanated from the research and publications in women and feminist studies.

The history of gender studies is the dissection of the history of patriarchy and heteronormativity. Patriarchy assumes the superiority of the male while heteronormativity looks at gender and sex from a binary perspective. Gender is a socially assigned role to a person based on the sexual characteristics of the anatomy (Hausman 2001)

Literature defines transgender in many ways. The coining of the word is attributed to Virginia Price who first used it to describe people like herself who fall somewhere in between the spectrum of 'transvestite' and 'transsexual'. The current meaning was ascribed by Leslie Feinberg, in a short influential piece, 'Transgender Liberation: A Movement Whose Time has come' (Stryker 2004: 04). "Transgenders typically express gender identities outside traditional heteronormative definitions, but may have little or no intention of having sex-reassignment surgeries or hormone treatments" (Nagoshi & Brzuzy 2010: 432).

The term 'transgender' is ascribed two sets of meaning by Stryker in her work; the first meaning is termed as the original meaning and includes people who go beyond the genders without recourse to sex reassignment. The second set assumes an all-encompassing tone "that refers to all identities or practices that cross over, cut across, move between or otherwise queer socially constructed sex/gender boundaries" (Stryker 1994: 251).

In India, the term transgender is understood to cover the traditional sexual minorities of 'hijras' and 'kothis'. There are other transgender not very different from these two divisions in the form of 'Jogta/Jogapa' and 'Shivashakti'. All these refer to the male-to-female transgender. The major difference among these transgender lies in the following of the emasculation ritual by the 'Hijra' community (which is called 'Aravani' in Tamil Nadu) which is not the case among other groups (GOI 2013).

The discrimination and marginalisation faced by the transgender people is not limited to India alone but is universal. Though the earlier societies in Asia and America were tolerant of the diversity, these changed rapidly with colonisation. "This discrimination is rooted in the same stereotypes that have fueled unequal treatment of women, lesbian, gay, bisexual people and

people with disabilities-i.e., stereotypes about how men and women are "supposed" to behave and about how male and female bodies are "supposed" to appear. For the most part, in other words, anti-transgender discrimination is not a new or unique form of bias, but rather falls squarely within the parameters of discrimination based on sex, sexual orientation, and/or disability" (Currah & Minter 2000: 38).

The research and study into the transgender lives in India is nascent, but growing. There are some rich sources to learn about the different groups of transgender – especially the Hijras. Serena Nanda's, 'Neither Man nor Woman' is a seminal work in this aspect which brings to light the many facets of their existence. "Although their role requires hijras to dress like women, few make any real attempt to imitate or to 'pass' as women. Their female dress and mannerisms are exaggerated to the point of caricature, expressing sexual overtones that would be considered inappropriate for ordinary women in their roles as daughters, wives and mothers" (Nanda 1985: 37). Her articles and book trace the origins, rituals and culture of the Hijra community. Nanda also brings out the role of the hijras as homosexual prostitutes thereby underlining their sexuality (Nanda 1999).

The literature pertaining to other recognised transgender groups/communities in India are scant; and when present, these communities – kothis, Jogappa/jogtas, etc. – are spoken in relation to the hijras. There are two important differences between hijras and other transgender people in India. One, hijras go through the ritual of emasculation. Two, they live in groups/communities with the guru-chela bond and even establishing fictitious kinship with other hijras, including 'adoption' of younger hijras as daughters. However, it is common both among the general public and even researchers to club all transgender people under the common title of 'hijras'. To quote one such example: "Reddy's ethnographic fieldwork in Hyderabad found that in Hyderabad Hijras fall under the umbrella term Kothis referring to a multitude of identities within the spectrum of male sexuality" (Dey 2013: 53). And, there are others who identify kothis as men who have sex with men (Chakrapani 2007). It is quite well-documented though that the kothis (and other similar transgender people) face more violence as they are vulnerable – as they do not have the peer support like the hijras and also because they are still considered men for not being emasculated/castrated. Nor do they get respect from other hijras (Cohen 2005).

There is this fear regarding the transgender folk that has refused to go away. And the fear finds expression in the form of violence, harassment and shaming of the transgender by mobs. Those who indulge in such acts do not have a clear reason on why they target the gender/sexual minorities. "The depathologizing of transgenderism, however, does not remove the problem of transgender individuals having to deal with the pervasive and pernicious transphobia that exists in society" (Nagoshi & Brzuzy 2010: 438).

I did not find specific studies that have been carried out regarding the 'Aadhaar' and the enrolment of transgender in it. Nor were there any research articles published pertaining to the pension scheme, 'Mythri'. Hence, in the absence of literature to review pertaining to the topic I have chosen, I have looked at the literature that broaches the context of this study.

There are some reports and documents that have been prepared at the behest of the governments that I have read during this process. I understood the operation of social pension schemes and

the measures that are needed to make them a success through the report submitted by a Committee to the Government of Karnataka. This was done to understand the efficacy of the scheme 'Mythri', the pension for transgender scheme. The said report brings out the flaws and drawbacks of the social pension schemes apart from praising the Government's efforts to reach out to the marginalised sections (Rajasekhar 2009). The reports of the National Expert Committee on Issues of Transgender Persons and APCOM helped me understand the differences between the various groups of transgender people that exist in India. The reports also aided me in understanding the inadequacy of the measures that are being proposed. For example, the Expert Committee Report talks about the necessity to take steps to end discrimination; but these steps are neither complete nor elaborated. And, the focus is on how to help change the transgender than how to create a non-discriminating environment, which is the fundamental necessity (ibid).

To conclude, it may be stated that "many subjects, not only transsexual subjects, do not feel at home in their bodies" and that "there are a variety of gender-deviant bodies under the sign of non-normative masculinities and femininities, and the task at hand is not to decide which represents the place of most resistance but to begin the work of documenting their distinctive features" (Halberstam 1998: 148).

Chapter 4

Theoretical Approach/Framework

The study proposes to use certain theories to examine the research problem/question. One of the theoretical framework it hinges upon is the theory of sexuality – queer and transgender theories. This part of the framework is essentially influenced by the ground-breaking work of Judith Butler. Along with the theories, I also would like to use Web of poverty's disadvantages (model developed by Robert Chambers and used effectively in the case of sexuality by several authors and researchers including Rubin, Jolly and others). Of particular relevance would be the triangle of places of the poor, institutions and access and ascribed and legal inferiority.

In the process of establishing heteronormativity as the dominant or the sole idea of humans' social existence, we have seen many societies shun and reject (or ignore) the existence of sexes and genders beyond the binary of male/female and masculine/feminine. Whatever exists beyond this binary is hence considered unnatural. The same applies to sexual expression beyond heterosexuality. Since the transgender people fall beyond these binaries and heteronormativity, they are considered abnormal and unnatural.

The basis for discrimination against transgender people in India lies in their sexuality. That they do not subscribe to the binary gender/sex of male/female or masculine/feminine is the crux. Intolerance, ostracising and marginalisation have set in since 1800s as against the earlier periods of measured tolerance. Most people in India do not have any knowledge about what a transgender person is; nor is any effort made by the general population to understand. The image of a hijra is used for ridicule. Any behaviour noticed outside the accepted norm in men is immediately labelled as effeminate and they are labelled as 'hijra' or 'chakka' (eunuch, in English); the word transgender is thus used as a word of abuse. Neither do the communities nor their sexuality find mention in any of the books that students of social courses peruse as part of their study. Their shunning is akin to untouchability practised by the upper caste Hindus⁴. It may also be important to mention here that a large number of transgender people come from backward castes and communities (including Islam). No efforts are made either to understand

⁴ Even though untouchability has been declared a crime it continues to be practiced by caste Hindus in many parts of the country. This practice means that those from low castes (like those that work as manual scavengers, cremators, tanners, etc.) have to live on the outskirts of a village/town and are not to come in contact with the upper castes; if they do, the upper castes have to take a bath to purify themselves. As a consequence, the untouchable person may also be punished. Also, these people are not allowed to draw water from common sources or possess land; their children may even have to sit separately from others in a school. The discriminatory practices are many and there can be ugly caste riots too.

the differences or develop an empathy for variations that exist in gender and sexuality. All these over time have driven the transgender people to the periphery of social existence in India and made them the poorest in terms of socio-political and economic development. Hence, I would like to use the theory of sexuality to bring in the nuances.

The web of poverty is useful to understand the effect of marginalisation. Transgender people are a small minority. They do not have social, economic or political clout. Because of poverty and lack of economic opportunities, they rely on beggary or sex work for survival (apart from the fast dwindling opportunities to make money from rituals and ceremonies). Hijras in particular are reviled because of their aggressive behaviour during begging. The lack of clout results in the transgender people being easy targets of law enforcement agencies that routinely pick them up and arrest them on charges of trafficking, petty thefts, etc. Lack of education ensures they are harassed and have little scope to avail legal counselling or bail. Since the laws and policies are blurred in many areas regarding their rights, the transgender people have little or no access to medical services. All these add up to make them the poorest and the most marginalised class of people.

4.1 Theories of Sexuality

The beginnings of understanding the queer and transgender identities lie in the feminist theories. Just the way feminist theories emanated from the need to empower women, the gender and queer theories evolved from the rights movements. “Feminist theory offers a perspective for understanding human behavior in the social environment by centering women and issues that women face in contemporary society” (Lay & Daley 2007: 49-50).

The drawback however was that everything was yet looked at from the lens of the gender binary. “The institutionalisation of a compulsory and naturalized heterosexuality requires and regulates gender as a binary relation in which the masculine term is differentiated from a feminine term, and this differentiation is accomplished through the practice of heterosexual desire. The act of differentiating the two oppositional movements of the binary results in a consolidation of each term, the respective internal coherence of sex, gender and desire” (Butler 1990: 22-23).

The gender and sexual binary is something that is internalised by us all thanks to the upbringing. Regardless of our own identity, we all fight to accept that there can be more genders or sexes beyond the male and female. And, even when we do see and remark, it would be from the perspective of labelling someone as a man behaving unmanly or being effeminate or vice versa. “In spite of queer theory’s advances in understanding sexual identity and oppression and in providing a voice for political challenge, many transgenders express dissatisfaction with the purely social constructivist assumptions about gender identity that are inherent in queer theory” (Nagoshi & Brzuzy 2010: 435)

Butler also brought in the concept of gender performativity into the study of gender. By performativity, we understand the power of the speech and communication to not just convey the meaning but also to convey and reinforce images and roles of an identity. “In the first instance, performativity must be understood not as a singular or deliberate “act” but, rather as the

reiterative and citational practice by which discourse produces the effects that it names” (Butler 1993: xii).

Essentially, from these texts I have understood that gender is created and reinforced through speech. And, this results in actions and accts consistent with what is repeatedly and repetitively reinforced thereby creating ‘roles’ that a specific gender is supposed to play and the behaviours one is expected to display as part of the role. What I also gather is that these roles and expectations are steeped into the patriarchal institutions and cause trouble not just to the genderqueer but also to those who largely perform according to the roles too. And, hence the taunts that tend to restrain behaviour take the form of “Don’t behave like a woman/man”.

When looked from the prism of performativity, the behaviour of the transgender does not fit into the preconceived formats. Hence, their marginalisation begins and they are ostracised. In India, the behaviour of the dominant Hijras is antithetical to the woman’s garb they are found in. Clad in saree (or salwar kameez, another traditional Indian wear which has both male and female versions), they display behaviours with overt sexual tones, are aggressive. The Kothis, another transgender group, are known to display another extreme – of being ultra-feminine in their action. Hence, “it is vital to theorise queer so that it is more relevant and open to people for whom gender/sexuality identities come second to racial identities, and to theorise queer so that it is open to cross-cultural interpretations of the relationship between sexed embodiment and lived gender” (Roen 2001: 259)

The world over, there is a dress code too for the genders/sexes. While it is mostly fine for a cis-woman to dress like a cis-man (because it is moving up the ladder; male being superior as per the patriarchal notions), a cis-man dressing up in female attire is either looked down upon, condemned or subjected to derision and ridicule. Hence, drag becomes comedy. It also instils fear, as in the case of Hijras in India. And, all this emanates from the idea of heteronormativity. “Heterosexuality requires a binary sex system, as it is predicated on the seemingly natural attraction between two types of bodies defined as opposites. The taken-for-granted expectation that heterosexuality and gender identity follow from genitalia produces heteronormativity—even though in most social interactions genitals are not actually visible” (Schilt & Westbrook 2009: 443).

Regardless the set of behaviours they choose, the transgender are subjected to many forms of violations. All because they do not fit into the binary definition of gender and the unitary definition of sexuality. They are different, queer. And, their identity can be defined as, “the open mesh of possibilities, gaps, overlaps, dissonances and resonances, lapses and excesses of meaning when the constituent elements of anyone’s gender, of anyone’s sexuality aren’t made (or can’t be made) to signify monolithically” (Sedgwick 1998: 208).

My quest into the topic is best reflected in this passage. “The field of transgender studies has taken shape over the past decade in the shadow of queer theory. Sometimes it has claimed its place in the queer family and offered an in-house critique, and sometimes it has angrily spurned its lineage and set out to make a home of its own. Either way, transgender studies is following its own trajectory and has the potential to address emerging problems in the critical study of gender

and sexuality, identity, embodiment, and desire in ways that gay, lesbian, and queer studies have not always successfully managed” (Stryker 2004: 214).

4.2 Web of Poverty

The web of poverty was conceived and developed by Robert Chambers in the 1980s to put the poor and the marginalised firmly at the centre of development programmes and policies. His work has been adapted to depict the marginalisation and poverty of sexual/gender minorities by various researchers, most notably Jolly.

Rubin in her seminal paper, ‘Thinking Sex’, succinctly brings out the sex hierarchy and the place of the transgender at the bottom of the rung in it through her essay. This placement having its roots in patriarchy, heteronormativity and religion. She also constructs a continuum of sex from good to bad – where the heterosexual, married couple are at the top of the continuum while transgender are the outliers (Rubin 1984). This forms the basis for using the web of poverty to show the marginalisation of the sexual minorities in the work of Correa, Cornwall and Jolly. They say, “...sexuality is about a lot more than having sex. It is also about the social rules, economic structures, political battles and religious ideologies that surround physical expressions of sexuality. It has as much to do with being able to move freely outside the home and walk the streets without fear of sexual harassment or abuse as it has to do with who people have sex with (Cornwall 2008: 5-6)”.

Chambers’ Web of Poverty had twelve attributes which interact with one another to ensure poor remain poor; the same can be adopted and adapted to depict the plight of the transgender too. I have chosen only three attributes in this work owing to paucity of time – the places of the poor, institutions and access, and ascribed and legal inferiority.

Transgender people live with little access to regular housing and shelter, thereby having to live in slums and even as homeless. In rural areas of India, they may live in temples. Owing to poverty, they are unable to rent or acquire houses. Their sexuality also ensures that they may not get housing even if they have the money to afford. Many institutions that are available for the support of the general public may be inaccessible to the transgender. Because of sexuality again. The ridicule and abuse at schools make the transgender children to give up education; harassment and violence from the police ensures they do not have protection of the law. And, employment in many cases is beyond the reach. Similarly, the transgender are perceived inferior to other sets of people – importantly, the majority heterosexual – because they are different. Their sexuality stands in the way of legal equality.

Chapter 5

Research Methodology

Selecting the right research methodology to conduct the research is vital to answering the research question correctly, especially since there is a whole gamut of methods available and selecting one over another is not always easy. Since my research question wanted to look at the experiences of people, the methodology had to be qualitative. As I needed responses and involve the respondents in sharing their experiences, anecdotes, I chose to employ interviews as my method for research. More specifically, I opted to conducted semi-structured interviews of the participants.

5.1 Interviews

Structured interviews are those that involve pre-determined questions and pattern. All the respondents in the sample would go through the same questions and in the same order. Unstructured interviews however, happen totally unplanned. Neither the questions nor their order stay the same. They depend on the progress of the interview. The structured interviews are easier to conduct and provide a basis for comparison of responses while unstructured are more difficult and can pose challenges in assessment; they can even cause legal wrangles (Campion 1997).

The decision to use semi-structured interviews was arrived at based on the following reasons:

- Flexibility
- Same questions to all respondents would not do justice to the topic of discussion
- Responses during interviews could lead to further questions which may be relevant
- Importance of the comfort of the interviewee

Interviews tend to become cumbersome as the interviewer has to record responses in one way or the other. The available options include – recording the entire interview (can pose challenges, including resistance from the interviewees), taking down notes during interview (can be unwieldy, cause delays, take away the focus and irritate the interviewee), and memorising the responses (impossible to remember all the responses, inaccuracies creep in and biases may be reflected). However, there are advantages too. The researcher is able to face the participants live, observe their reactions beyond the words that are said and elicit far more information than

one could expect from other research methods like either questionnaires or observation (Bell 2005: 157)

5.2 Sources of Data

Secondary Data: Policies promulgated by the State and Central Governments aimed at the transgender communities – Mythri by Government of Karnataka and Aadhaar by the Government of India. Research papers and scholarly works published regarding the transgender communities in India (and particularly, Bangalore, Karnataka). Data from the UIDAI was sought to know how many people have enrolled into the identification programme as transgender across India, Karnataka and Bangalore in light of the news that about 1000 million Indians have enrolled for Aadhaar. Data sought from the Government of Karnataka included the number of people who are currently enlisted under the scheme vis-à-vis the estimated number of transgender population in Karnataka, the process to enrol for the scheme to avail the benefits and the process to avail the benefit on a regular basis. .

Primary Data: Semi-structured interviews of various stakeholders pertaining to the research question were conducted. Members of the transgender communities, activists, representatives of the state (bureaucrats) were included in the interview process. A total sample size of 16 from across the stakeholders was used to conduct the study.

5.3 Sampling and Data Collection

No specific method of sampling was used in this exercise owing to the size of the sample and also the availability of the sample. All respondents were contacted through personal connections of friends and activists known in the field. Based on the requirements of the study, however, various types of respondents were chosen to participate in the interviews.

The sample distribution is as follows:

Transgender people (non-activist): 10

The questions posed to them were largely related to seeking their narration of experiences in accessing the services and in their dealing with the state agencies. Further questions on their awareness of new developments and what their opinions and desires are, followed, based on the responses.

Transgender activists (both transgender and non-transgender): 04

Two of the activists interviewed were from the transgender community and two from other sexual minorities (one gay and one lesbian).

What has been the trend of reporting of incidents of harassment in light of the new developments? What is the level of engagement with the state agencies by the activists and their impact on the state's designing of policies and programmes aimed at the transgender people? Can there be a bigger focus on the FTM transgender?

Bureaucrats/Officers/Legal Experts

04

The bureaucrats who were interviewed were functionaries who were associated presently or formerly with the schemes 'Aadhaar' and 'Mythri'. Two officers who had worked with the 'Mythri' scheme were interviewed, while one officer had worked with the project, 'Aadhaar'. One was a legal expert who had worked on the cases of Sec. 377 and also had thoroughly followed the cases that were filed against the 'Aadhaar' by the Civil Society Organisations.

How are policies and programmes designed? What kind of consultations are held with the transgender while making decisions? What inputs have been obtained and addressed through the policies and programmes? What programmes are initiated to sensitise government departments towards sexual and gender minorities?

Period of data collection in the field: September 2015.

5.4 Risks

- a) Lack of secondary data – especially regarding policies. In the absence of access to policy documents, I had to rely on what was published on the websites (of the government) or in the media.
- b) Lack of data on population of transgender communities. The first census that included the counting of transgender people was in 2011. Some data has been made available in 2014. With no past data to make a comparison, it is possible that this data is incomplete and inaccurate.
- c) Bureaucrats I interviewed were not comfortable with questions pertaining to the transgender people and their sexuality. They did not want to be quoted in the study and preferred to remain anonymous.
- d) Bias in data collection as I have relied on references for identifying the people for interviews; it is hence possible that the narratives could be skewed and I might have missed out on other perspectives.
- e) Non-representative data – the sample size is small to be universally representative. Also, the sample has not been drawn to represent all the different divisions within the transgender collective.

5.5 Ethical Challenges

Transgender communities live on the fringe of the society and it is possible during the research that their sensitivities could easily have been hurt. I needed to keep in mind their sensibilities while conducting interviews, understanding their responses and posing questions. One of the first things I said to the people I interviewed was that I was still in the process of learning all the nuances regarding the transgender people, their lives and that it was possible that I could use terms they would find offensive or rude; I asked them to correct me wherever they thought I was treading on their sensibilities. Even as I wrote this paper, I received critical advice from my supervisors regarding the terms I had used in the paper and their impact. It is an ethical issue too on what data could be revealed and what identities could be written about. Especially in an atmosphere where the communities are sceptical of the state and there is fear and lack of security even though these communities have shown immense courage and have provided their complete

support to the LGBT movement in India more visibly than the other sexual minorities of lesbians, gays and bisexuals. I have tried my best to exercise extra caution in these regards.

Chapter 6

Findings and Conclusions

Meeting the transgender people and conducting interviews was a task that was accomplished over a relatively long period of time. While they were all willing to meet and interact, some of them were hesitant to be interviewed. “I do not want to revisit my earlier days of pain and struggle; those moments of harassment” was what one of them said. Even those who were easy to talk to, weren’t as open when the word interview was mentioned. So, I had to establish a rapport with them, spend a lot of time just being with them, attend events where issues on transgender people and communities were discussed, allow them to warm up to me and then interview them. Once this happened, the first set of transgender people introduced me to their friends and insisted I interview them too!

Most of the transgender persons I interviewed were male-to-female; there was only one female-to-male transgender I was able to interview. However, I was able to interview *hijras* and *kothis* among the male-to-female transgender. I didn’t meet any transgender who identified as *Jogappa*. I even had the opportunity to meet a person who identified as transgender but did not believe in dressing up to depict the chosen gender (In India, the male-to-female transgender dress up in sarees and rely on make-up and cosmetics to look feminine; one of the transgender people was exception to this. She continues to dress in men’s clothing and questions the notion of clothing defining the gender).

6.1 Findings

6.1.1 Experience of the transgender people in getting Aadhaar

From the data I have obtained from the UIDAI, only 433 people had enrolled themselves as transgender and obtained Aadhaar identity in Bangalore. Across the country, nearly 40,000 people had enrolled and obtained Aadhaar identity as transgender. Across Karnataka (of which Bangalore is part) around 2500 people had enrolled as transgender (Appendix I).

It is estimated that there are about 5,000-6,000 transgender people living in Bangalore (there are no exact numbers available as no surveys have been made regarding this; the data comes from my interaction with the NGOs and other organisations that work with the transgender communities). The Census reflects that the total population of the transgender people in the country is about 490,000 and about 20,000 of them live in Karnataka. It was the first time that the census ever included the category of transgender in the counting of the population (TOI 2014). However, transgender activists opined that the numbers could be much larger than what the census has shown; the fear to declare oneself might have caused many to conceal their true identity. Even if these numbers are accepted, less than 10% of them have enrolled as transgender people to obtain Aadhaar identity. And, the percentage of enrolment for Aadhaar to the total transgender population is more or less the same for the country, state and the place. It means, either most transgender people have not enrolled themselves and obtained Aadhaar identity or have not enrolled as transgender but as male/female. So far, around 934 million (75% of the country's population) have enrolled for Aadhaar and obtained the identification (UIDAI 2015).

Of the 10 transgender people (non-activist) that I interviewed, only 4 had identified themselves as transgender in the Aadhaar ID, while 3 had not obtained Aadhaar and the other 3 had identified with the gender ascribed to them with birth. The activists I spoke did not want to reveal if they had obtained an Aadhaar identification. They however, had no issues in talking about the other identifications obtained.

This finding throws up a whole lot of different perspective into the issue of identity of a transgender person. It shows that not all transgender people want to identify themselves as some still have fear in declaring their transgender identity while others would like to identify themselves with the gender of their choice and not as transgender.

Those that have obtained Aadhaar identification by declaring themselves as transgender said that they did not face any issues during enrolment. Nor did they recount any harassment at the enrolment centres at the hands of the operators that enrol or the supervisors present to oversee the enrolment process. The gender was captured as declared by them and no proof of document was asked by operators who captured the data for this purpose.

There is still wariness among the transgender people to obtain identifications that expressly declare their gender as 'transgender'. There are fears of profiling, being targeted by state law agencies, and other kind. There is also fear that they may lose right to property of their parents (or ancestral) if their identity reflects them as transgender as relatives could drag them to court over the discrepancy. Of course, there are many transgender people whose identity are not yet known among the folks and families they live in. They do not want to disclose for fear of being ostracized and targeted for violence. Where the identity is known within the family, there is pressure not to declare.

6.1.1.1 Plausible reasons for low Aadhaar enrolment among Transgender

There is a strong civil society movement against the Aadhaar in the country. Some of the cases filed against Aadhaar in the courts have emanated from Bangalore, including one filed by retired justice KN Puttaswamy and two other cases by retired military officers, Col. Mathew Thomas

and Gen. Vombatkere, which are currently being heard by the Supreme Court of India. Several of the activists that work with the transgender people have distinct anti-Aadhaar sentiments, including those I interviewed. I attended a meet that was organised in Bangalore to debate the merits and demerits of Aadhaar with respect to transgender people. Barring one speaker, everyone was anti-Aadhaar, prompting the transgender speakers to take the same line. There is little debate that presents both sides of Aadhaar, resulting in the transgender not opting for it.

6.1.2 Experience of Obtaining other Documents – Public Distribution System (PDS/Ration) Cards, Passport, etc.

Every transgender I interviewed had access to different (and multiple) documents that provided various services. Almost all of them – 10 out of 12 – had PDS/Ration cards. Three of them even had passports and driving licenses too. However, they had undergone difficulties in getting them. For those who are not into activism, obtaining even a PDS/ration card had been a challenge. They narrated incidents of having to pay bribes, endure taunts and harassment. “Nothing happens without paying money. Even if you want to wait and are in no hurry to obtain the card, you will not get.” Importantly, many of these transgender people had struggled to find a place to stay – rent a house. Most of them had faced difficulties as house-owners weren’t willing to let their houses out to transgender people in most areas.

The most difficult IDs to obtain – from the narratives of the people interviewed – was the passport. Despite the directives in this regard existing and despite all the paperwork being complete, a transgender person revealed that the authorities weren’t willing to issue the passport to her as ‘female’ (The Indian passport mentioned only two genders – male and female – until recently). She was invited to participate in a gender and sexuality conference in Canada and she needed to obtain the passport to apply for the visa and travel. The passport authorities were unwilling to issue her a passport without a medical certificate that declared her as transgender/woman. And, even armed with a medical certificate, she was still denied because of difficulties in police verification. After many trips to the passport authorities, requests to many government officials and help from activist organisations, she was able to obtain her passport in 2012. Owing to the delay and the red tape, she had to miss out on the opportunity to travel to Canada to attend a conference on sexuality rights.

The harassments that the transgender people had to endure to get identities issued with ‘female’ as their preferred gender includes being subject to medical examination. This – as I learnt during the interviews – continues to happen even now despite the strictures against such tests by the Court of Law. Most people – including doctors – do not yet understand the difference between gender and sex. And, when someone identifies oneself as transgender, the first reaction is, ‘What are the genitals that you have?’ There is no understanding that a transgender need not be intersex or need not have undergone gender mutilation (castration in the case of men).

The activists opined that with the recent changes emanating from judiciary and the legislature, there could be changes in the lot of the transgender over time. “I am aware things will not change overnight. It is not us who should become aware of the change of laws or of judgments; common people who harass us need to be sensitised and made aware”.

6.1.2.1 Acceptance of the Identity

The discussions with the transgender interviewees went beyond just the paper based identity and identification. During the process of interviews it became evident that the transgender wants acceptance as they are. One of them asked, “We do not question why you are a male or a female. Why do you question and ridicule us?” Another said, “It is not that a piece of paper that declares me as transgender that I want the most. I want to be just myself and it is the most difficult thing to get. Everyday all my life I have to face questions of my identity. Who will change that?”

The current efforts to include the third gender into identification schemes and other documents are not enough. The transgender also spoke of the trauma they endured during their childhood; the years when they did not realise what was happening with them and why they were being bullied, harassed, abused and silenced. This brings about the necessity to reach out to parents of transgender children, schools and colleges (and the staff therein) and importantly, the police too. There are no institutionalised mechanisms that can provide support to the parents who cannot understand why their child behaves ‘differently’. Nor are there sensitisation programmes – as expressed by the bureaucrats – for the schools. Even though some of the state governments want to provide reservation in education for transgender children (IBN 2014) transgender people are sceptical of this move. The refrain was, “We ran away from schools and the environment we lived in because of harassment and ridicule. How will you prevent it just with compulsory education?”

6.1.3 The experience of “Mythri”

The Government of Karnataka launched ‘Mythri’ as a pension scheme for the transgender people who are above 40 years of age, with the purpose of weaning them away from their traditional occupation of begging and sex work. There was a confusion though, regarding this as the Deputy Commissioner had published a notification that announced the age of eligibility as between 18 and 64 years. The government pays a sum of Rupees five hundred (Rs.500; about \$10 when launched and now it would be worth even less – about \$8 - owing to rupee’s fall in value) per month to all the eligible transgender people. On the day of the launch of the scheme, over 100 people from Bangalore got successfully enrolled to avail pension. However, the numbers have not progressed satisfactorily thereafter. The government claims to have reached out to a large number of transgender people in Bangalore but the statistics do not support it. Sangama, the Bangalore-based organisation that works with the transgender community stated that it is still waiting for the approval of the government on about 250 applications that were submitted through it (Hindu 2015).

There are several criticisms regarding the ‘Mythri’ scheme. For one, the amount paid as pension is meagre. It would not help anyone’s cause. It is more on the lines of projecting the image of a ‘socially conscious’ government. And, the money is not directly credited into the bank accounts of the beneficiaries. However, it is also true that many transgender people do not have bank accounts. The transgender people identified to receive the benefits are expected to visit the concerned government office each month to get the money. This entails expenses on transport (“Most transgender people do not use general public transport but depend on autos; the amount

paid would be enough to go to the government office and come back”, said one activist; autos are three-wheeler transport) and a long wait at the office; taunts and heckling are par for the course too.

While on the day of the launch, transgender people were registered for the scheme at venue without a hitch, anyone who wanted to avail the pension later had to go through the bureaucratic procedures of proving one’s credentials as a transgender. There are also differences of opinion on who could certify a person as transgender and how. It requires a surgeon at a government hospital to declare and certify a person as transgender. In the absence of the doctor’s certificate, a person could get a notary to declare and certify her/him as transgender – but the notaries are not sure how they could confirm this. The government also is looked at with further suspicion now as on the one hand there was the launch of scheme for the welfare of the transgender while on the other hand, the police used draconian anti-beggary laws to arrest transgender people from their homes and put behind bars.

The Mythri scheme also is supported with vocational training workshops for transgender people. The number of transgender people that had registered for these training schemes has decreased over the last three years (ibid). There are two reasons for this. One, the vocational training schemes are not designed keeping the current job market conditions in focus. Two, no support is provided by the government departments to the transgender people who enrol for these workshops to get any jobs nor are repeat workshops held to ensure the skills learnt are not forgotten for lack of job opportunities. Naturally, there is no interest among the transgender people to attend such training schemes.

6.1.3.1 Mythri Vs Other Pension Schemes

The State Government of Karnataka administers nine pension schemes apart from Mythri. The oldest pension scheme run by the Government is the Old Age Pension Scheme, active since 1964. This now stands merged as part of the National Old Age Pension Scheme (1995). Other pension schemes include pensions for widows, disability pension for various kinds of disabilities (visually challenged, leprosy, mentally differently abled, etc.). As of 2007-08, 1.94 million people were drawing benefits from these pension schemes in Karnataka. The administering and delivery of pension service by the government has drawn praise from the UNDP (Rajasekhar et al 2009). It is however important to note here that the pension monies paid under these schemes are meagre too, like under Mythri. And, the criterion is that the person eligible must be from a poor background with annual income less than Rs. 6000. A bureaucrat friend of mine opined from her experience that many of these pensioners are retained in their houses by their kin (old age and disability pensions) thanks mainly due to these pensions; else they may be rendered homeless. It possibly would be true in the case of many older transgender people who rely upon their younger chela or family for eking out an existence, as the opportunities of begging and sex work dry up.

6.1.3.2 Differences within

The launch of the scheme and nominating of certain organisations by the government to identify the beneficiaries also brought out the divisions among the transgender people into the open.

Newspapers reported a free-for-all fight that ensued among the transgender people belonging to different organisations at the venue of the scheme launch, after the departure of the politicians. Sangama and Karnataka Sexual Minorities Forum were specifically assigned to identify the people who were eligible to avail the benefit of the pension scheme. “What is the necessity of specifically naming NGOs to identify transgender beneficiaries when we have district-level offices working for empowerment”, contended one of the activists. ‘Sangama’ is the first organisation to work exclusively for and with the transgender communities. There are many new communities that have been formed by members who originally were working with Sangama. Some of them are ‘Jeeva’, ‘Vividha’ and ‘Ondede’.

The transgender community has divisions based on the rituals followed. The hijras (or aravanis, as they are called in Tamil Nadu) are the most dominant (and prominent) transgender group. A hijra is characterized by the ceremonial emasculation practice. Hijras live in groups and have a ‘guru-chela’ system (master-follower). This is not observed among other transgender groups. The hijras are also known to taunt others as inferior because they haven’t undergone emasculation/castration. One of the transgender persons I interviewed narrated a horrifying incident of self-emasculation that happened following a tussle between two transgender persons while they both were carrying out sex work. These two – one hijra and another kothi – had arguments over the bodily differences; the hijra taunted the kothi on how she is not truly transgender because she still possessed a penis. The argument grew serious and the kothi left the scene, went home, took a knife and chopped off the genitals, and returned to the scene to show the hijra that she now was truly a transgender. In the bargain, she had lost a lot of blood and needed prolonged hospitalisation to recover. At the hospital, the doctors and nurses would not touch this transgender person; the people who had accompanied her were made to clean her and even apply the sutures and medicine to the wounds and dress them. Because hijras are more vocal, move in groups and live together, they also are accused to have appropriated all spaces available to the transgender community at large, at the expense of other groups.

It is also true that the most discourses on transgender people in India generally talk about the hijras in particular; and about other male-to-female transgender in general. The female-to-male transgender people are rarely discussed, if ever. One would not find any literature about them. “The biases that exist against women in the society make many of us not to come out and identify ourselves; we would prefer not to be out there in the limelight”, said the lone female-to-male transgender who I was able to interview. Similar sentiments were expressed by male-to-female transgender persons.

6.1.4 Awareness of the Changes

Largely, transgender people have little or no formal education. Many drop out of schools owing to the harassment they face. Unfortunately there are no organised statistics available regarding the drop-out rates or the education levels among the transgender. The first census only provides basic numbers. And, only a few manage to overcome the hurdles of the patriarchal society and educate themselves. This lack of education means that many of the transgender people could remain ignorant of the changes in laws and launch of schemes to support transgender people, especially in rural and semi-urban areas. While those who are activists among the transgender

communities are aware of the winds of change blowing across the judiciary and the legislature, others are not particularly clued in. Also, the coverage of news pertaining to the sexual minorities in the local language media is much less compared to the English media. Among the non-activist transgender people I interviewed, there was only one who could fluently speak English and was clued in about the new developments and changes. The rest had heard about them through the transgender activists they were in contact with but were not knowing the details nor certain of the impact.

6.1.5 Changes in Law and Legislation

The judgment delivered by the Supreme Court in the NALSA case in April 2014 is one of the most widely discussed and known in the recent times, especially since it came soon after another judgment by the Supreme Court which re-criminalised homosexuality by striking down the orders of the Delhi High Court, which had read down Sec. 377 of the Indian Penal Code (which deals with ‘unnatural sex’). It was a judgment that was hailed as progressive in all quarters, including the activists and the politicians. The judgment directed the Central Government to devise special provisions for the empowerment of the transgender people and provide them reservations in education and employment. Soon after, a private member’s bill was also passed unanimously by the Rajya Sabha, the Upper House of the Indian Parliament, which further spoke of the steps that the government could take to impact the lives of the transgender people positively.

The transgender community at large is aware that it is in the news even though they may not be aware fully of the developments happening in the judicial and legislative spheres. There is awareness among the activists and the mood is not celebratory. They are aware of the queries further posed by the government to the Supreme Court, with respect to definitions and meanings. There are also queries raised by the government with respect to extending the provisions of reservation to the transgender. They fear that the government is not keen on implementing the judgment (WSJ 2014). The reservation policy dictates that the provisions can only be extended to the lower caste Hindus that have faced oppression over the centuries at the hands of the upper caste people (and those that have converted to religions from the subcontinent, including Buddhism and Sikhism). If a transgender happens to belong to a non-backward caste or the scheduled caste/tribe s/he may not be entitled to reservation; nor if s/he is a Christian or Muslim. Instead of addressing them through executive decisions and orders, the government has been buying time to think its steps further.

The community does not have much understanding of the impact of the bills that have been passed or are in the offing. Some of the activists though are fully in the know and a few have also been liaising actively with the governments for larger participatory role for the transgender people in committees and other advisory bodies. Some of them have even taken the role of spreading the word and educating their fellow-transgender folk about the legal and legislative provisions. Many do not yet comprehend these fully; and even when they understand, there is scepticism. They are hardened and deeply embittered by the discrimination and harassment they have faced and continue to face.

6.1.6 Sex Reassignment Surgery

Many transgender people experience a deep loathing towards the sexual organs they are born with. Either they do not acknowledge the existence of their sexual organs or they try to 'rid' of them through surgery. In India, the most common manifestation of this is the castration or emasculation followed by the 'hijras'. However, the knowledge on the advances made in sex reassignment among the transgender people in Bangalore was surprisingly limited. The understanding of all the transgender (male to female) people I met of sex reassignment surgery stops at the breast implants; vaginal reconstruction is almost unknown. Several of the transgender people I interviewed have had undergone emasculation and also got themselves breast implants, along with regular hormonal therapies. Not one of them had had a genital reconstruction surgery (vaginal or penile).

The transgender people I conversed with expressed their lack of knowledge of the genital reconstruction surgeries even as they spoke of the breast implants they had gone for. The activists also spoke of the earlier apathy of the doctors who would refuse to touch a transgender person who would have gone to the hospital for emasculation procedure. "When my friend underwent the procedure, the doctor or the nurse would not touch her; we had to perform all the activities and care that they were expected to give. We would be told how to dress the wound, what medicine to apply and we would crudely follow that". The deep-seated resentment of the gender assigned would manifest in the transgender to get rid of the sexual organs one was born with, but with little thought of wanting a different sexual organ in its place. However, breast implants and hormonal therapies are popular and many of the transgender people have spent almost their life's savings in getting them! Some even have taken loans at exorbitant rates of interest. "I worked very hard and saved as much money as possible from all the sex work I did to get these", said one of the transgender people proudly of her new breasts. The gurus among the hijras usually get to keep a large share of the money earned by their chelas – which they promise to return for their welfare, including for breast implants, but which they may renege upon. Then the chela has to resort to a loan (which again is possibly arranged by the guru).

In the case of Tamil Nadu, the state provides for sex reassignment surgeries (only male-to-female). Other states too have supposedly following suit – Delhi, Telengana and West Bengal. It is yet to be the case in Karnataka. The surgery costs a lot of money – anywhere between 200,000 to 800,000 Rupees – and most transgender people find it difficult to afford. And, this results in them to seek cheaper options – and opting for partial surgery. I also learnt that there are now government hospitals in Bangalore and Karnataka that perform emasculation procedures for the transgender women who prefer them. I also heard of the many sex reassignment surgeries that had gone wrong – leaking implants, infections, post-surgical complications – because of the negligent and unscrupulous doctors and unsuspecting, gullible transgender people.

6.1.7 Re-instatement of the Sodomy Law

From the British colonial times India has had an anti-sodomy law in Sec. 377. This law had largely stayed unchallenged in the courts, even after the country attained its independence. With increased awareness about homosexuality and establishing of the NGOs that worked with sexual minorities, soon there was a petition in the Delhi High Court against this. After a protracted legal battle – which included the case being thrown out without hearing and an appeal against

this action in the Supreme Court of India by the litigants – the Delhi High Court read down the Section quoting the Fundamental Rights enshrined in the Constitution of India, in 2009.

In April 2014, the Supreme Court gave a path breaking judgment in the NALSA case pertaining to the status of the transgender communities in India. This happens to be one of the most publicly discussed judgments in the recent times. A year since then, a private member's bill moved by the MP (Member of Parliament) from the DMK party, Tiruchi Shiva, was unanimously passed in the Rajya Sabha, the Upper House of the Parliament. However, these two momentous events have not transformed into any executive decisions. Instead, the government has approached the Supreme Court with clarifications regarding the reservations that the judgment recommended for the transgender people. The crux according to the LGBT activists would be this: if the transgender people are accorded rights, would it be possible to deny the same to the other sexual minorities of gay, lesbian and bisexual people? It would mean that the government has to introduce a Bill to decriminalise homosexuality – which is not its position.

Transgender people owing to discrimination, lack of education and employment opportunities, resort to begging and sex work for their livelihood. Everyone I interviewed has resorted to sex work. Many are still dependent on it. Each of them says the same thing. “We are asked to perform oral sex. Many even demand anal sex. Some also ask if they can ejaculate between our thighs”. Their clients include men from all walks of life – across the different social strata.

According to the prevailing law, only penile-vaginal sex is legal and natural. Any other sexual activity is against the order of nature. This translates to mean even oral and anal sex between consenting adult heterosexual people too becomes criminal and punishable under Sec. 377 of the IPC. Since these are largely the ways transgender (and homosexual) people have sex, their acts are invariably termed criminal. This also means they become soft targets of the police and miscreants during their sex work. Transgender sex worker faces the risk of violence, detention and extortion on a regular basis, as understood from the interviews. Transgender sex workers pay a weekly bribe (called ‘hafta’) to the police to escape violence and being incarcerated without reason. The arrests by the police do not many times result in any FIRs being filed and transgender people put behind bars for days without any case lodged against them.

Most transgender people understand that it is not just the law that is against them; it is their very identity of them being different from the heteronormative narrative that causes them the hardships they face. The discrimination faced by them is aided by the law and not caused by it alone.

The judgment of the Supreme Court and the Private Member's Bill passed by the Upper House of the Parliament are silent on the sex lives of the transgender people. During an interview, Tiruchi Siva, the MP behind the Bill said that he had limited the Bill to the educational, employment and health aspects of the transgender communities. Another MP who plans to take up the Bill in the Lower House (Lok Sabha), Premachandran, stated “There is no question of (Section) 377 in our Bill. I have very different views on unnatural sex”, exhibiting the complete lack of empathy and understanding. It was no different with the bureaucrats I interviewed. One, they are not informed about who a transgender person is. Two, they do not seem to be making

an effort to learn. Yet, they are there to steer and/or implement policies regarding these communities.

Not taking cognisance of the sexual orientation and practices of the transgender people would only ensure that the efforts to bring them rights would be incomplete. And, there is also an attempt to take the transgender away from the other sexual minorities (gay, lesbian and bisexuals) by the political class – on the premise that while the transgender people are ‘born that way and have no choice’ the others choose their orientation. It suggests a misconception that the transgender are born with indeterminate sexual organs and hence need help – along with another equally strong notion that they are sexless.

The transgender (M-to-F) that I interviewed had all desired to have breasts. All that mattered to them was to be rid of their male genitalia; they had not thought of having a vagina in its place. One quipped during the interview, “What would I do with one? Will I become a mother? I may not want to even if it were possible”. In their personal relationship too the transgender women prefer to have anal sex; penile-vaginal sex is not what they think of or aspire for. The lone F-to-M transgender avoided questions on intimacy.

6.2 Conclusions

It is laudable that there are progressive developments taking place in the country when it comes to the rights of the transgender. In the last two decades, huge strides have been made to recognise and accept transgender persons in various domains – importantly, political. The Election Commission has started issuing voter ID cards to the transgender people as transgender; there have been even elected representatives from the transgender diaspora. Shabnam Mausi was the first transgender to be elected as Member of Legislative Assembly (MLA), the governing body of the state, in Madhya Pradesh (ITV 2014).

The victories of the transgender are yet few and hence make special news. The real progress though is a long distance away. The marginalisation and discrimination are still the norm; the fight for equal rights goes on.

6.2.1 Identity and Access

The transgender people face trouble to obtain the plethora of identifications that are made available to the citizens in the country. Way too many stumbling blocks abound in a transgender’s effort to obtain a valid ID, which is her/his right, just like any other person. The exception to this is the Aadhaar ID provided by the UIDAI. However, it is not a popular identification with the transgender people.

The major obstacle in the case of the Aadhaar is that the National Identification Bill which can provide a truly legal status to the identity scheme, is yet to be passed by the Parliament. The UIDAI still operates based on an executive order and has no sanctity of a parliamentary sanction. This also is one of the major reasons for the mistrust among the activists Usha Ramanathan and others that are protesting against the Aadhaar. The Supreme Court too has decreed that Aadhaar shall not be made mandatory to avail any service, and has given only partial approval to the government to use Aadhaar for delivery of certain services on a voluntary basis (HT 2015). If

the Aadhaar gets legal sanctity through the approval of the Parliament, most of the transgender people would enrol for the ID. Obtaining Aadhaar would simplify access to services as it has been approved as a valid document for both Proof of Identity (PoI) and Proof of Address (PoA) by various organs of the government, including the Reserve Bank of India (RBI). This would enable a transgender person to even open bank accounts and thus gain access to financial services (Mint 2012). I have carefully avoided the discussion on the merits and demerits of the Aadhaar identification, as I believe that it is beyond the scope of this paper.

Access to the other identification schemes like the PAN, Passport or Driving License continue to trouble the transgender, as expressed by them, even though the governments – both at the state and at the central level – have clearly issued notifications regarding the eligibility of the transgender people to obtain the identity. This leads to the conclusion that the people who run the establishments need both training and education and sensitisation. Unless these rulings are prominently displayed, along with non-discrimination declarations at the offices, things may not change for the better soon.

6.2.2 Welfare Schemes

The necessity of the welfare schemes can barely be overemphasised. Welfare schemes would be needed until discrimination and marginalisation are no more the forces that operate in the society. However, the schemes that presently exist in the state of Karnataka are inadequate. On the one hand there is only one scheme that provides a meagre pension and on the other, the vocational training workshops are not based in the reality of the employment market. The Governments need to redraw the schemes that provide social security pensions to reflect the reality of cost of living. The state uses a baseline income of Rs 6000/annum and below for anyone to qualify for the scheme, which seems unrealistic. There has been a lot of criticism on the calculation of the poverty lines by the now-defunct Planning Commission of India through the Rangarajan Committee too, which pegged them at Rs. 972 and Rs.1407 per month for rural and urban population respectively (Kapoor 2015).

Most transgender people leave their homes because of non-acceptance and trauma; they come to big cities in the hope of finding acceptance, shelter and livelihood. And, they find none most times, at least of the kind they desire. Finding a place to live is almost impossible, as I found out from speaking to them; intervention from the government may be necessary here too. Housing scheme could be promoted by the government where transgender people could live through their lives, even paying nominal rents; non-ownership of the property by individuals can ensure misuse too. Engaging the transgender people in the formulation and implementation of policies directly impacting them is necessary.

The biggest challenge in the provision of services is the reticence of the doctors to treat the transgender people, as expressed by everyone who I interviewed. This reflects the deep biases and prejudices that people hold against the marginalised, despite scientific education. The apathy in the health sector towards the marginalised is also reflected in the HIV rates. The transgender people have the highest incidence of HIV as said by UNAIDS in its reports (UNAIDS 2012). These figures were informally confirmed by the participants in the study too.

6.2.3 Awareness

If there was one sub-question in the study that made me think very hard as I conducted my interviews, it was pertaining to the levels of awareness among the transgender people regarding the changes that are taking place. I realised that I was asking the question to the wrong set of people; it should ideally be answered by people who provide services and the general public. Changes will occur and take root only when the public at large becomes aware and not just small groups. Most of the recommendations that I see for the betterment of the transgender people do not focus on the general public or the government's service providers – doctors or bureaucrats. The awareness of the diversity of sexes and genders is unfortunately lacking at all levels; this needs to change. And, the change could possibly even start with imparting such knowledge as part of educational curriculum. Programmes for sensitising the different arms of the government to the issues of transgender people too is non-existent.

The stigma that one ascribes to the transgendered works the other way too. If anyone is found to be sympathetic to their cause, s/he is ridiculed and stigmatised too. “Doctors also shy away from being associated with transgender people for fear of resulting stigma” (Soumya 2014).

6.2.4 Law and Legislation

The struggle of the sexual and minorities to attain even basic rights has been a long and arduous one. Though there are many individual success stories – of Akkai Padmashali or Madhu Kumar – victories for the entire community have been few. Though the Supreme Court judgment of 2014 has decreed a change, it is yet unknown when the orders would become a reality. Some states of course are taking proactive steps – Kerala, Tamil Nadu and Delhi, to name a few. Specific policies are being drafted for the welfare of the transgender. Kerala's policy which already has seen approval, is modelled on the SCI judgment. All these are yet to concretely help the transgender.

What though is needed is a national policy regarding sexual and gender minorities and bringing them at par with the rest of the citizens and ensuring the rights conferred by the Constitution are available to everyone.

6.2.5 Gender, Sex and Sexuality

The heteronormative discourse and patriarchy are deep-rooted in any society and India is no exception. The interviews clearly bring out the prejudices that the transgender people face. They receive little support from their families – most are essentially thrown out or run away from oppression. The ridicule for not belonging to the binary classification of gender lasts the entire lifetime.

The sexual needs and hence the sexuality of the transgender is neither understood nor paid attention to in popular discourses, even as the conversation has moved to the point of mainstreaming the transgender and their rights in the country. Importantly, the stance regarding sex work in the larger society and the government circles need to be revisited. Because the transgender rely on sex work for survival (and for want of better employment, which is denied because of their sexuality), they are reviled and abused. And, even within the sex workers, they

are at the lowest rung as they have anal sex. Even when a transgender is living with one's partner (largely, male-to-female transgender living with their male partners), they are subjected to abuse routinely by the law enforcement agencies, as brought out in the report of the PUCL quoted before.

Transgender people are not yet certain of their feelings towards complete SRS. This possibly also is because of their limited knowledge of the process and the results, as I evidenced from the interviews. The activists though felt that SRS – involving reconstruction of the genitalia - reinforces the patriarchal and heteronormative versions of gender and sexuality; SRS aims at 'normalising' the transgender.

6.3 New Developments

6.3.1 In Karnataka:

There is a lot more engagement of the general population by the transgender activists and supporters of rights in the form of workshops and meetings. In the process of conducting the interviews of the transgender people, I also ended up attending several workshops that were organised – at colleges, in religious institutions, etc. There is also a dedicated FM radio run by transgender people, supported by the Jain Educational Institutions. The channel, called 'Radio Active' runs from the Jain College campus. Priyanka, a transgender radio jockey was featured in media (Pradhan 2011).

The government also has formed a committee to examine the issues of the sex workers and transgender people, which also includes some transgender people. This is a positive development. The government also conferred the 'Rajyotsava Award' (an award commemorating the Formation Day of the State) on Akkai Padmashali, transgender and activist for sexual minorities, recognising her contributions to the empowerment of the transgender people, a first. This is the second highest honour conferred by the state of Karnataka and "entails a prize of 1 lakh rupees, a 20 gram gold medal and a citation" (India Today 2015). A draft policy on transgender people was made in 2014 and is still under discussions for adoption. The movie, 'Nanu Avanalla Avalu' (I am not he, but she), based on transgender activist Living Smile Vidya's life story fetched national award for best actor for Sanchari Vijay for essaying the role of the transgender person (NIE 2015). The movie has seen a successful run, gaining appreciation from both critics and audiences, a rare phenomenon for an arthouse feature.

6.3.2 Elsewhere in the Country:

Several milestones have been achieved by transgender people recently. Kerala became the first state in the country to adopt a policy for ensuring the constitutional rights of the transgender people. The policy goes beyond the traditional M-to-F transgender and encompasses F-to-M and intersex too (IE 2015). Other governments too are following suit. Dr Manabi Bhattacharya became the first transgender principal of an educational institution when she assumed charge at the Krishnagar Women's College in Nadia district in June this year (NDTV 2015).

In a first, a transgender person was elected the Mayor of Raigarh. Madhu Kumar is the transgender that created this history (Advocate 2015). Thanks to the support from the Chennai

High Court, Prithika Yashini is all set to become the first transgender Sub Inspector of Police in the country. Her candidature had been rejected by the Selection Board after Prithika had failed to qualify in the field test like running (DNA 2015).

References:

Advocate (2015) 'First Transgender Mayor Elected in India'
<http://www.advocate.com/politics/politicians/2015/01/04/india-elects-first-transgender-mayor>
(Last accessed 12 November, 2015)

Asia Pacific Coalition on Male Sexuality Research (APCOM) (2008) 'Mapping Transgender Groups, Organisations and Networks in South Asia' Report
http://www.apcom.org/sites/default/files/apcom_report_2_tg_mapping_south_asia_0.pdf
(accessed on 02 July, 2015)

Bell, Judith (2005) 'Doing Your Research Project: A guide for first-time researchers in education, health and social science' Open University Press

Butler, Judith (1990), 'Gender Trouble: Feminism and Subversion of Identity' Routledge, New York

Butler, Judith (1993), 'Bodies that Matter' Routledge

Campion, M.A., Palmer, D. & Campion, J.E. (1997), "A review of structure in the selection interviews," *Personnel Psychology*, 50, 655-702.

Chakrapani V, Newman PA, Shanmugam M, McLuckie A, and Melwin F, 'Structural Violence Against Kothi-Identified Men Who Have Sex With Men In Chennai, India: A Qualitative Investigation' *AIDS Education and Prevention Vol 19 (4) 2007* pp346-364

Chakravarty, P 'Aadhaar and the rhetoric of fear' in *Indian Express* (June 2014) <http://indianexpress.com/article/opinion/columns/aadhaar-and-the-rhetoric-of-fear/2/> (accessed on 04 July, 2015)

Cohen, Lawrence (2005), 'The Kothi Wars: AIDS Cosmopolitanism and the Morality of Classification' in 'Sex in Development: Science, Sexuality and Morality in Global Perspective' Ed. By Adams and Pigg (2005) Duke University Press pp269-303

Cornwall, Andrea, Correa, Sonia and Jolly, Susie (2008) *Development with a body: sexuality, human rights and development*, London: Zed Books

Currah, P. & Minter, S. Paisley (2000) 'Unprincipled Exclusions: The Struggle to Achieve Judicial and Legislative Equality for Transgender People', *William & Mary Journal of Women and the Law*, Vol 7 (1) 2000 pp37-66

Dey, Soumi (2013) 'Being a Kothi: An Ethnographic Interrogation With A Male Transgender in Kolkata, India', *IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science Vol. 11 (6) 2013* pp51-62

Gopal, Madan 'India: Through the Ages' (1990) Publications Division, Government of India

Government of India, Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment 'National Expert Committee on Issues of Transgender Persons' Appendix 2 (2013) pp102-103

Halberstam, J. (1998). 'Female masculinity'. Durham, NC: Duke University Press

Hausman, B. L. (2001). Recent transgender theory. *Feminist Studies*, 27, 465-490.

High Court of Delhi,(2009) 'Naz Foundation Vs Government of NCT Delhi' Judgment, July 2009. Accessed online on 21 May, 2015 <http://lobis.nic.in/dhc/APS/judgement/02-07-2009/APS02072009CW74552001.pdf>

Hindu, The 'Transgenders Welcome 'Mythri'' (2013) <http://www.thehindu.com/news/national/karnataka/transgenders-welcome-mythri/article4909399.ece> (accessed on 03 July, 2015)

Hindustan Times, 'In a first, Aadhar recognises 1,600 transgender persons' (27 August, 2013) <http://www.hindustantimes.com/newdelhi/in-a-first-aadhar-recognises-1-600-transgender-persons/article1-1113480.aspx> (accessed 03 July, 2015)

Hindustan Times (2015) 'SC allows Aadhaar use for MNREGA, Jan Dhan, pension and PF' <http://www.hindustantimes.com/india/sc-allows-aadhaar-use-for-mnrega-jan-dhan-pension-and-pf/story-2AMjpEB0z0ahIpkW3FUBFI.html> (accessed 12 November, 2015)

Human Rights Watch (HRW) 'India: Enforce Ruling Protecting Transgender People' (5, February 2015) <https://www.hrw.org/news/2015/02/05/india-enforce-ruling-protecting-transgender-people> (accessed on 03 July, 2015)

IBN (2014), 'Free education for transgender kids in Delhi schools' <http://www.ibnlive.com/news/india/free-education-for-transgender-kids-in-delhi-schools-720400.html>

India TV News, 'Shabnam Mausi – India's First Eunuch to Become MLA' (October 2014) <http://www.indiatvnews.com/politics/national/shabnam-mausi-india-first-eunuch-hijra-politician-mla-inequality-18963.html> (accessed 12 November, 2015)

Indian Express, 'Rajya Sabha passes historic private Bill to promote transgender rights' (25 April, 2015) <http://indianexpress.com/article/india/india-others/rajya-sabha-passes-private-bill-to-protect-the-rights-of-transgenders/#sthash.hA7PB7Cl.dpuf> (accessed 04 July, 2015)

Joseph, Sherry 'Gay and Lesbian Movement in India' (1996) in Economic and Political Weekly, Vol. 31, No. 33, pp.2228-2233.

Kapoor, Radhicka, 'Trouble with revising poverty lines' (2014) in Live Mint <http://www.livemint.com/Opinion/BXUobGMR6mL30dg57NaxfK/Trouble-with-revising-poverty-lines.html> (accessed 07 November, 2015).

Lay, Kathy and Daley, James G., 'A Critique of Feminist Theory' (2007) in Advances in Social Work Vol. 8 (1) 2007 pp49-61

Mint live (2012) 'RBI widens KYC norms for account opening' <http://www.livemint.com/Money/nugX8cLoLGEDOrjAm9o5yH/RBI-widens-KYC-norms-for-account-opening.html> (accessed 10 November, 2015)

Nagoshi, JL & Brzuzy, S (2010), (Quoting Bornstein) "Transgender Theory: Embodying Research and Practice" in Affila: Journal of Women and Social Work, 25 (4) pp431-443 (2010) Sage Publications

Nanda, Serena (1985) 'The Hijras of India: Cultural and Individual Dimensions of an Institutionalised Third Gender Role', Journal of Homosexuality Vol 11 (3/4) 1985 pp33-54

Nanda, Serena (1999) 'Neither Man nor Woman: The Hijras of India' 2nd Edition, Wadsworth.

Narrain S, 'Being a Eunuch' (2003), in Frontline, October 2003. Accessed online on 22 May, 2015 <http://www.countercurrents.org/gen-narrain141003.htm>

Rajasekhar D., Sreedhar G., Narasimha Reddy NL., Biradaar RR. & Manjula R., 'Delivery of Social Security and Pension Benefits in Karnataka' (2009), Directorate of Social Security and Pensions, Department of Revenue, Government of Karnataka

PUCL (2004) 'Human Rights Violations against the Transgender Community: A PUCL Report' online <http://www.pucl.org/Topics/Gender/2004/transgender.htm> (accessed on 02 July 2015)

Roen, Katrina (2001) 'Transgender Theory and Embodiment: the risk of racial marginalisation' in Journal of Gender Studies Vol. 10 (3) 2001 pp253-263

Rajagopalachari C., (1958) 'Mahabharata' Bharatiya Vidya Bhavan

Rubin, Gayle S. (1984) 'Thinking Sex: Notes for a radical theory of the politics of sex' in From Gender to Sexuality. Routledge pp143-178 (accessed online) <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.462.7005&rep=rep1&type=pdf>

Schilt, Kristen and Westbrook, Laurel (2009), 'Doing Gender, Doing Heteronormativity: "Gender Normals", Transgender People, and the Social Maintenance of Heterosexuality' in Gender and Sexuality Vol. 23 (4) 2009 pp440-464

Sedgwick, E. (1998) 'What's queer?' In Gender inequality: Feminist theories and politics, Ed by J. Lorber (pp. 205-209). Los Angeles, CA: Roxbury

Soumya, Elizabeth (2014) 'Indian transgender healthcare challenges' in Al Jazeera <http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/features/2014/06/healthcare-distant-india-transgenders-201461882414495902.html> (accessed on 10 November, 2015)

Stryker, S. (1994) 'My words to Victor Frankenstein above the village of Chamounix: performing transgender rage', in GLQ: A Journal of Gay and Lesbian Studies, 1, pp. 237–254.

Stryker, S. (2004) '(De)Subjugated Knowledges – An Introduction to Transgender Studies' in 'The Transgender Studies Reader', ed. By Stryker, Susan and Whittle, Stephen (2004) Routledge

Stryker, S. (2004) 'Transgender Studies: Queer Theory's Evil Twin' in GLQ: A Journal of Lesbian and Gay Studies Vol. 10 (2) 2004 pp212-215

Supreme Court of India (2014), 'NALSA Vs Union of India' Judgment delivered in April, 2014. <http://supremecourtindia.nic.in/outtoday/wc40012.pdf> (accessed on 21 May, 2015).

Suleiman, G A, 'Non-'Hijra' Transgenders struggle for identity' in DNA (September 18, 2011) <http://www.dnaindia.com/lifestyle/report-non-hijra-transgenders-struggle-for-identity-1588421> (accessed on 02, July 2015)

Times of India, 'Govt questions transgender definition in SC verdict' (12 September, 2014) <http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/Govt-questions-transgender-definition-in-SC-verdict/articleshow/42320291.cms> (accessed on 04 July, 2015)

UNAIDS (2012) 'HIV programmes for MSM and transgendered people gradually being scaled up in India' <http://www.unaids.org/en/resources/presscentre/featurestories/2012/may/20120517msmindia> (accessed on 6 November, 2015)

United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) 'The Case of TAMIL NADU TRANSGENDER WELFARE BOARD: Insights for Developing Practical Models of Social Protection Programmes for Transgender People in India' (2012)

http://www.undp.org/content/dam/india/docs/HIV_and_development/the-case-of-tamil-nadu-transgender-welfare-board--insights-for-d.pdf (accessed 03 July, 2015)

Wall Street Journal blogs (2014), 'Indian Government Objects to Supreme Court Ruling on Transgender Rights' <http://blogs.wsj.com/indiarealtime/2014/09/12/indian-government-objects-to-supreme-court-ruling-on-transgender-rights/> (accessed 02 November, 2015)

References

UIDAI Portal 2015 <https://portal.uidai.gov.in/uidwebportal/dashboard.do>

(accessed on 13 November 2015)

Times of India, May 2014. <http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/First-count-of-third-gender-in-census-4-9-lakh/articleshow/35741613.cms> (accessed 12 November, 2015)

The Hindu, April 2015 <http://www.thehindu.com/news/cities/bangalore/schemes-for-transgenders-benefit-too-few/article7120497.ece> (accessed 12 November, 2015)

NDTV, June 2015 <http://www.ndtv.com/india-news/indias-first-transgender-college-principal-starts-work-770261> (accessed 13 November, 2015)

DNA, November 2015 <http://www.dnaindia.com/india/report-tamil-nadu-set-to-get-its-first-transgender-police-sub-inspector-2142557> (accessed 13 November, 2015)

India Today, October 2015 <http://indiatoday.intoday.in/story/first-transgender-to-receive-karnataka-governments-prestigious-rajyotsava-award/1/511499.html> (accessed 14 November 2015)

New Indian Express, September 2015 <http://www.newindianexpress.com/entertainment/kannada/Naanu-Avanalla-Avalu-Movie-Review-Towards-Greatness/2015/09/26/article3047415.ece> (accessed 14 November 2015)

Indian Express, November 2015 <http://indianexpress.com/article/india/india-news-india/kerala-becomes-first-state-to-unveil-transgender-policy/> (accessed 14 November 2015)

Pradhan, Anjana July 2011 'Transgender Turns RJ, works for community upliftment', in Sunday Guardian <http://www.sunday-guardian.com/young-restless/transgender-turns-rj-works-for-community-upliftment> (accessed 10 November, 2015)

Appendix I: Details of Enrolment of Transgender in Aadhaar

Table 1: State-wise Details

| State Code | State Name | 0-18 Years | 19-35 Years | 35-60 Years | > 60 Years | Grand Total |
|------------|-------------------|------------|-------------|-------------|------------|-------------|
| 01 | Jammu and Kashmir | 1 | 12 | 7 | 1 | 21 |
| 02 | Himachal Pradesh | 43 | 56 | 92 | 24 | 215 |
| 03 | Punjab | 169 | 304 | 383 | 112 | 968 |
| 04 | Chandigarh | 10 | 18 | 15 | 4 | 47 |
| 05 | Uttarakhand | 10 | 44 | 63 | 16 | 133 |

| | | | | | | |
|----|------------------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| 06 | Haryana | 96 | 127 | 156 | 43 | 422 |
| 07 | Delhi | 183 | 550 | 670 | 143 | 1,546 |
| 08 | Rajasthan | 141 | 404 | 430 | 108 | 1,083 |
| 09 | Uttar Pradesh | 154 | 889 | 987 | 195 | 2,225 |
| 10 | Bihar | 70 | 199 | 181 | 29 | 479 |
| 11 | Sikkim | 3 | 7 | 11 | 2 | 23 |
| 12 | Arunachal Pradesh | - | 2 | - | - | 2 |
| 13 | Nagaland | 27 | 28 | 27 | 9 | 91 |
| 14 | Manipur | 36 | 64 | 64 | 28 | 192 |
| 15 | Mizoram | - | 1 | 1 | - | 2 |
| 16 | Tripura | 90 | 96 | 98 | 32 | 316 |
| 18 | Assam | - | - | 2 | - | 2 |
| 19 | West Bengal | 681 | 1,747 | 1,868 | 500 | 4,796 |
| 20 | Jharkhand | 149 | 310 | 337 | 95 | 891 |
| 21 | Odisha | 436 | 854 | 981 | 301 | 2,572 |
| 22 | Chhattisgarh | 22 | 123 | 62 | 23 | 230 |
| 23 | Madhya Pradesh | 313 | 588 | 613 | 224 | 1,738 |
| 24 | Gujarat | 47 | 304 | 442 | 103 | 896 |
| 25 | Daman and Diu | 2 | 6 | - | 1 | 9 |
| 26 | Dadra and Nagar Haveli | 4 | 7 | 8 | - | 19 |
| 27 | Maharashtra | 409 | 1,374 | 1,483 | 496 | 3,762 |
| 28 | Andhra Pradesh | 1,919 | 2,863 | 2,705 | 1,104 | 8,591 |
| 29 | Karnataka | 362 | 1,073 | 900 | 332 | 2,667 |
| 30 | Goa | | | | | |

| | | | | | | |
|-------------|-----------------------------|-------|--------|--------|-------|--------|
| | | 21 | 31 | 73 | 26 | 151 |
| 32 | Kerala | 486 | 705 | 1,086 | 576 | 2,853 |
| 33 | Tamil Nadu | 477 | 910 | 1,115 | 409 | 2,911 |
| 34 | Puducherry | 13 | 35 | 31 | 18 | 97 |
| 35 | Andaman and Nicobar Islands | - | 3 | 2 | - | 5 |
| 36 | Telangana | 2 | 21 | 7 | 1 | 31 |
| Grand Total | | 6,376 | 13,755 | 14,900 | 4,955 | 39,986 |

Table 2: District-wise Details for Karnataka

| State Name | 0-18 Years | 19-35 Years | 35-60 Years | > 60 Years | Grand Total |
|-----------------|------------|-------------|-------------|------------|-------------|
| Bagalkot | 4 | 13 | 11 | 1 | 29 |
| Bagalkot * | 1 | 6 | 2 | - | 9 |
| Bangalore | 27 | 258 | 123 | 25 | 433 |
| Bangalore Rural | 7 | 18 | 19 | 7 | 51 |
| Belgaum | 25 | 57 | 60 | 22 | 164 |
| Bellary | 3 | 56 | 38 | 3 | 100 |
| Bengaluru | - | - | 1 | - | 1 |
| Bidar | 25 | 29 | 22 | 9 | 85 |
| Bijapur | 27 | 61 | 37 | 25 | 150 |
| Chamarajanagar | 1 | 5 | 2 | 1 | 9 |
| Chamrajanagar | - | 3 | 2 | - | 5 |
| Chamrajnagar | - | - | 2 | - | 2 |
| Chickmagalur | - | - | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Chikkaballapur | 21 | 24 | 27 | 10 | 82 |

| | | | | | |
|---------------------|----|----|----|----|-----|
| Chikmagalur | - | 7 | 2 | 1 | 10 |
| Chitradurga | 4 | 36 | 31 | 11 | 82 |
| Dakshina Kannada | - | 8 | 6 | 2 | 16 |
| Davanagere | 36 | 60 | 78 | 27 | 201 |
| Davangere | - | 3 | 5 | 1 | 9 |
| Dharwad | 26 | 43 | 50 | 27 | 146 |
| Gadag | 5 | 13 | 17 | 7 | 42 |
| Gadag * | 6 | 1 | 3 | - | 10 |
| Gulbarga | 9 | 37 | 39 | 14 | 99 |
| Hasan | - | 1 | 1 | 2 | 4 |
| Hassan | 1 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 8 |
| Haveri | 23 | 47 | 51 | 21 | 142 |
| Haveri * | 3 | 5 | 5 | - | 13 |
| Kodagu | 1 | 11 | 12 | 3 | 27 |
| Kolar | 5 | 35 | 21 | 7 | 68 |
| Koppal | 2 | 17 | 15 | 5 | 39 |
| Mandya | 6 | 9 | 6 | 5 | 26 |
| Mysore | 27 | 69 | 64 | 28 | 188 |
| Mysuru | - | - | 1 | - | 1 |
| Raichur | 7 | 20 | 18 | 4 | 49 |
| Ramanagar | - | 2 | 1 | 2 | 5 |
| Shimoga | 2 | 9 | 3 | 6 | 20 |
| Tumkur | 15 | 31 | 36 | 10 | 92 |
| Udupi | | | | | |

| | | | | | |
|----------------|-----|-------|-----|-----|-------|
| | 13 | 30 | 46 | 24 | 113 |
| Uttara Kannada | 25 | 31 | 27 | 14 | 97 |
| yadgir | 5 | 15 | 13 | 5 | 38 |
| Grand Total | 362 | 1,073 | 900 | 332 | 2,667 |