

**International
Institute of
Social Studies**

Erasmus

**Killings of Persons With Albinism (PWAs) in Tanzania:
Deconstructing Dominant Cause Narratives (2007-2015)**

A Research Paper presented by:

Florence Honest Chaki

(Tanzania)

in partial fulfillment of the requirements for obtaining the degree of
MASTER OF ARTS IN DEVELOPMENT STUDIES

Major:

Social Justice Perspective

SJP

Specialization:

Conflict and Peace Studies

Members of the Examining Committee:

Helen Hintjens

Sike Heuman

The Hague, The Netherlands
December 2013

Disclaimer:

This document represents part of the author's study programme while at the Institute of Social Studies. The views stated therein are those of the author and not necessarily those of the Institute.

Inquiries:

Postal address:

Institute of Social Studies
P.O. Box 29776
2502 LT The Hague
The Netherlands

Location:

Kortenaerkade 12
2518 AX The Hague
The Netherlands

Telephone: +31 70 426 0460

Fax: +31 70 426 0799

Dedication

I am humble down to earth to dedicate this work to Almighty God giving thanks to him for protecting and guiding me throughout my studies period to this day of accomplishment.

Acknowledgement

I would like to admit that; it was not easy, but with God help, I come out strongly in my faith in God Almighty that I finally made it. Secondly, I would like to acknowledge my family especially my mother Bintuni, my sisters Sara, Neema, Lulu and Faith for their lovely support and encouragement times for being there and showing me love that gave me strength to proceed. Further, I would like to acknowledge my Supervisor Ass.Prof Helen Hintjens her constant help and time she gave to make this work accomplished; it was an excellent moment to work with you, and I cherish your support and lovely encouragement that gave me strength to pursue and make my dream comes true. Also, I must not conclude without a shoutout to my amiable Second Reader Dr Sike Heuman; I appreciate all your input toward the success of this thesis, I will always remain grateful for your help. On a final note, I appreciate the Netherland Fellowship Program for the scholarship that made it possible for me to study in ISS

Contents

<i>Abstract</i>	9
Chapter 1 Explaining Killings of People with Albinism in Tanzania	10
The research problem	10
Albinism: A History of Persecution in Tanzania	11
Identifying Causal Narratives around Albino Killings	12
The Dominant Narrative: Witchcraft and Witchdoctors	12
Academic Narratives: Poverty and Vulnerability	12
An Alternative Narrative: a Hybrid Approach to the Religious Economy	13
Research Objectives	13
Research Questions	13
Sub Questions	13
Structure of the Thesis	14
Chapter 2 Methodology and Theoretical Framework	15
Introduction	15
Theoretical Framework	15
Emile Durkheim Social Fact, Religion and Belief Theories	15
Methodological Tools	16
Data collection procedure	16
Subjectivity	18
Conclusion	20
Chapter 3 Review of Dominant Causal Narratives: Witchdoctors, Witches and Witchcraft	21
Introduction	21
Media: Giving a Dog a Bad Name	21
Political Elites Views on the Killings of PWAs	22
Traditional Cause Narratives: Academia	24
Witchcraft, Witchdoctors and Traditional Healers	25
Witchcraft	26
Witchdoctors	27
Traditional Healers	28
Backlash of Witchcraft and Witchdoctors Narratives	28
Women and Elderly Become More Vulnerable to Attacks	28
Abuse of Fundamental Human Rights	29
Conclusion	30

Chapter 4 Academic Narratives: Poverty and Vulnerability	31
Introduction	31
Economy and Poverty Narratives	31
Legal narratives: the need for more Deterrence	32
Socio-Cultural	33
Conclusion	34
Chapter 5 Alternative Causal Narratives to inform Policy	35
Introduction	35
The Religious Economy: a Hybrid Causal Narrative	35
Religious Beliefs: Demand and Supply	36
Customer Competition and Religious Scams	38
Relevance to Policy Formulation	39
Conclusion	41
Chapter 6 Conclusion	42
References 43	
Appendices	50
Appendix A: Screen Shots of some of the Media Narratives	50

List of Tables

Table 1: Sample selection of media articles

Table 2: Analytical Framework for Identifying Causal Narratives

Table 3: UN Action on Albinism in Africa Consultative Forum Outcome Report Extract

List of Appendices

Appendix A Screen Shots of some of the Media Narratives

List of Acronyms

AIDS	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
CAT	Convention Against Torture
CEDAW	The Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women.
CERD	The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
CRPD	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
CESR	The Committee of European Securities Regulators
HIV	Human Immune Virus
HRC	Human Rights Council
LHRC	Legal and Human Rights
NGOs	Non-Governmental Organizations
NBS	National Bureau of Statistics
OHCHR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights ...
PWAs	Persons with Albinism
TM	Traditional Medicine
UN	United Nations
UTSS	Under the Same Sun

Abstract

This study seeks to identify dominant narratives around the causes of killings of people with albinism (PWAs) in Tanzania. The main causal narratives found were around witchcraft and cultural prejudices as causes. These included the more academic ‘Occult Economy’ approach, not to be confused with ‘religious economy’, explored later in the study. A second set of dominant narratives, associated with government and NGOs, sees failures to implement the law as the main problem. Finally a third set of narratives centres on economic factors, especially poverty, as the main cause behind the killings. These are associated mainly with academic studies. Besides media, government, NGO and academic narratives, the study sought an alternative narrative to explain the phenomenon of killings of PWAs in Tanzania in a more multi-causal way. This was found to be what is called the religious economy approach, associated with the demand and supply narrative of religious goods. This theory is reviewed at the end of this study. Overall the study aims to unpack some dominant and less dominant public (media and NGO) and academic narratives. In this way, we go beyond the common understanding that witchcraft and poverty alone are responsible for killings of PWAs in Tanzania. The study finds that demand and supply for supernatural support, even among the educated and wealthy, implies that killings of PWAs have become what Durkheim calls part of social reality. The study concludes that the problem of killings of PWAs requires addressing the uncertainties of people through modern day scientific solution to their problem in order to demystify decades of supernatural beliefs as well as partnerships between those with different causal narratives, in government, media, civil society including religious organisations, academia and PWAs themselves.

Relevance to Development Studies

The proclivity of the government, non-governmental organizations and the general public to link workable mitigating solutions of the problem to traditional cause narratives calls for a more in-depth understanding of the cause narratives from the social, political and economic arena. By so doing, the mitigating solutions can be hypothesized and customized to the underlying cause narratives, thereby expending tremendous effort towards a long-lasting mitigation of the problem.

Keywords

Albino, PWAs, Narratives, Religion, Killings, Witchdoctors, Witchcraft, Beliefs, Economy, Media, Academic,

Chapter 1 Explaining Killings of People with Albinism in Tanzania

The research problem

The past few decades have seen an increase in reports by the local and international media of escalating violence against persons with Albinism (PWA) in Africa and particularly in Tanzania (Geleta & Keita, 2009:23). From 2007 to present, there have been 74 documented ritualistic murders, 58 attacks under which the survivors were severely mutilated as well as 18 documented grave robberies involving people with albinism as victims (Trudell, 2015; Wesangula, 2015). This study aims to provide an in-depth analysis of socio-cultural, political and economic cause narratives around the killings of people with albinism in Tanzania (focusing on the period 2007-2015). The choice of narrowing the discussion on the killing of albinos between the year 2007 and 2015 is because 2007 was the first time that albino killing was associated with witchcrafts and witchdoctors

Most recently, the atrocities committed against PWA's have received widespread media attention due to crimes involved therein. These include infanticide, kidnapping, amputations, and decapitations committed for purposes of supplying highly valued body parts used for amulets that are then marketed in underground witchcraft markets (Dave-Odigie, 2010: 69). These carnages are frequently said to be driven by traditional witch doctors, but often found by police to be carried out by contract killers. The concentration of killings in certain specific regions, especially near the Northern Lake regions of Tanzania, suggests that economic motives with the aim of meeting demands in the market for albino body parts. This kind of market is believed to bring fortune and wealth to a few (Gettleman, 2008:1).

Unfortunately, the plethora of studies that have examined the narratives behind the causes of the escalation in ritualistic murders of PWA in Tanzania have all proposed similar narratives (Semkwiji, 2009; Red Cross, 2009; Masanja, 2015). The problem with these narratives is that they are presented as a single story, and the problem with single story is not that they are untrue, but they are incomplete. They make one story become the only story (Adichie, 2009). These narratives have been insufficient to allow the development and implementation of effective and long lasting solutions to the problem at hand. An in-depth and extensive research on other underlying narratives have yielded some studies that associate the escalation to economic factors in the predominant mining and fishing tribes located in the northern parts of the country (Bryceson et al., 2010; Ackley, 2010; Burke, 2013). Moreover, a number of other studies have linked the escalation to the elections periods in the country (Wesangula, 2015; Martel, 2015; Lugongo, 2015). Further, they can be attributed to social factors associated with attitudes towards PWAs and the human rights violations therein (Wan, 2003; Masanja, 2015). This study seeks to rectify a tendency to blame witch-doctors more or less exclusively for killings of people with albinism (PWAs).

Albinism: A History of Persecution in Tanzania

According to Ackley (2010:2), albinism is delineated as a genetic condition under which an individual lacks the melanin-producing gene. For that matter, PWA (Persons with Albinism) may often lack pigmentation in their hair, eyes and skin (Alum et al., 2009:32). Exact albinism prevalence in the human race is unclear (Burke, 2013:57). Nevertheless, available estimates evidence a ratio of about 1 in every 17,000 individuals (Burke et al., 2014: 118). From an African perspective the ratio stands between 1 in 5,000 and 1 in 15,000 (Cruz-Inigo et al., 2011:79). Statistically, Africa is deemed to possess the highest albinism prevalence in the world. This is seemingly experienced at the highest degree in Sub Saharan Africa, with Tanzania being identified as the country with the highest prevalence of Albino representing 1 in every 1429 births Dave-Odigie, 2010: 69). The official documented PWA's population according to the National Bureau of Statistics (NBS) and Office of Chief Government Statistician (2014:29) report is of around 16,477.

The history and killing of albino in Tanzania and Africa as a whole is difficult to pin point a particular year even for anthropologists and researchers conducting studies on Africa cultural and traditional practices. This is as a result of different factors, to say the least, the diversity in ethnicities and cultural practices in the region in addition to the chronic dearth of ample records (Under the Same Sun, 2013:2). Nevertheless, what can be established is that killing of albino babies in the past reflected the view that they were considered sub-human, abnormal or a curse to the family the moment they are born. Not all communities had these beliefs, which were concentrated among Masai in Tanzanian and Kenya, and Digo people of north-eastern Tanzania (Alum et al., 2009; Under the Same Sun, 2013). Also, "this practice existed and may still be practiced among the Sukuma tribe of north western Tanzania where a father was obligated to kill their abnormal child as a form of mercy killing to save that child from the hardship that awaits him or her in their agrarian culture" (Under the Same Sun, 2013:5).

Further, it is believed that a person with albinism do not die but simply disappears. As a result, this has led to a practice of families secretly burying their albino children or relatives and hiding the graves from robbers, to prevent them exhuming the deceased's body. Thus, burial events for albino were conducted differently from the rest of the human beings in the community. Similar to wealth, there has been an ongoing belief that sexual intercourse with the person with an albinism one can be healed especially from HIV/AIDS (Mutungi, 2013: 41). As a result of the unique conditions and distinctive appearance, misconceptions and myths that negatively impact the lives of PWAs. Ikuomola (2015:38) suggests that PWAs are particularly stigmatized as they often also suffer from disabilities such as blindness and a tendency to contract skins cancers. For people with white skins in a predominantly black society, in Tanzania, myths and cultural beliefs attribute magical powers to the persons with Albinism (Ackley, 2010; Cruz-Inigo et al., 2011; Burke, 2013).

The above beliefs are not new in all communities. Some of the common myths that have been spread by witchdoctors include giving birth to an albino child evidences bewitchment, PWAs are born as a form of punishment, PWAs are immortals and in fact spirits as well as giving birth to PWAs amounts to a curse (Tanner, 2010: 230). In other communities, their unique

characteristics are often believed to be a source of luck, wealth, prestige and a wining capacity (Simon, 2016:3). Often spread by witchdoctors, this myth has been the main mainstay for propagating the spate of ritualistic murders that put Tanzania on the local and international media limelight in 2007 (Schühle, 2013; Semkwiji, 2009).

What is new is that an unspecified number of PWAs, particularly children, but also adults, have started to be subjected to a series of murders and vicious attacks, including attacks for their limbs and other body parts. This is claimed to be done in the name of witchcraft, of superstition, and with a view to making those who buy potions or parts of the body successful, whether in wealth creation or in political life in Tanzania (BBC News., 2009; Bryceson et al, 2010; Burke et al, 2014; Cowell, 2015).

Similar to other individuals living with disabilities, PWAs often face segregation and discrimination and are frequently shunned by their families and communities (Wiete, 2011:1). Suffice to say, social attitudes towards PWAs are characterized by fear, prejudice and lack of understanding which all increase their vulnerability to physical attacks and mutilation (Wan, 2003:2). The propagation of myths around albinism has also been found to be detrimental for the safety and well-being of even survival of PWAs in other African countries such as Mali, Malawi and Burundi (Thuku, 2011:6).

Identifying Causal Narratives around Albino Killings

The Dominant Narrative: Witchcraft and Witchdoctors

A saying in Tanzania expresses the view that ‘an Albino is gold’, which means that an albino can bring wealth and prosperity (Makulilo, 2010; Ikuomola, 2015). A review of media and political speeches shows that witchdoctors are usually blamed for promoting supernatural and divine intervention solution to unexplainable problems in people’s lives. This includes supplying albino body parts. As an East-African country characterized by minimal conflict and seemingly slow but steady economic progress, Tanzania hardly made it to the international medial limelight at the beginning of the 21st century. The 2007 spate of ritualistic murders of people with albinism in Lake Regions Northern west Tanzania catapulted the country into the global limelight (Malone, 2009; Cruz-Inigo et al., 2011). The prevalence in these murders was to be later associated with rumours about the necessity of the PWA (Persons with Albinism) as a crucial ingredient in wealth and status/power-generating magic potions (Alum et al., 2009: 43). This brought about international press and public arguments on Tanzania’s renewal of ‘black magic’ and traditional myths. Nevertheless, the news coverage on the ritualistic murders seldom carried out an in-depth investigation of the underlying narratives that were involved in discussing and debating, and prosecuting this drawback to violent sacrifice and dismemberment (Burke, 2013; Schühle, 2013). In addition, the scarcity of medical or sociological literature on albinism in Africa and especially in Tanzania deemed it difficult to ascertain the major causes as they emerge in narratives associated with debates and reports around ritualistic albino killings (Schühle, 2013; Simon, 2016).

Academic Narratives: Poverty and Vulnerability

Several arguments have emerged highlighting the best approach for government to adopt in the face of such murders. The government has taken a

strong stand to introduce punitive measures intended to mitigate the problem. In line with this stand and the focus on disciplinary measures, the Tanzania government initiated a nationwide exercise urging the public to identify those behind the ritualistic murders and even went further to ban the practices of witchdoctors and witchcraft as a way to protect PWAs from ritual murders. These solutions yielded little or no results. This may be because, the reasons given to explain killings of PWA was from a narrow cultural perspective and ignored economic aspects of the market in albino body parts (Masanja, 2015:238).

An Alternative Narrative: a Hybrid Approach to the Religious Economy

The government approach may have failed to deal with the killings of Albinos because it ignored other ways of seeing this problem, especially that it may be connected with income shocks, as the Occult Economy argument suggests. Therefore, this thesis will therefore attempt to carefully deconstruct the existing but narrow-minded narratives on the causes of PWAs ritualistic murders in Tanzania by identifying the underlying socio-cultural, economic and political narratives that go beyond cultural explanations alone, and the belief in witchcraft by deconstructing the existing narratives. Stark and Finke (2002:2000) posits that religious economies offer niches that suit the consumer demand for religious goods or products. This theory helps to explain why the witchdoctors were successful in propagating the myth about the potency of albino parts in creating wealth or treating incurable diseases. The theory speaks to the demand and supply narrative as the untapped root causes for albino killing in Tanzania. The study will attempt to identify a more complex alternative explanation to the surge in the attacks on PWAs that could help in the understanding of how to approach the problem at hand in future.

Research Objectives

- 1).To determine the dominant Socio, political and economic cause narratives that underlie the occult economy and cultural prejudiced on the killing of albinos in Tanzania.
- 2).To investigate the roles the media and the political elite have played in spreading these dominant cause narratives from a Tanzanian perspective.
- 3).To examine the other local, regional and international cause narratives ignored by various factors that could have helped in deconstructing the dominant narratives of occult economy and cultural prejudice.

Research Questions

What are the dominant and alternative explanatory narratives around the killing of albinos in Tanzania? Could the introduction of hybrid, more complex explanatory narratives help with better understanding of the causes of albino killings?

Sub Questions

- 1). How have dominant narratives been expressed in the period 2007-2014 in the media, by political elites and in academia?
- 2). What alternative or counter-narratives can be found and where are these coming from?

In addition, the study ends by asking how a deeper understanding of these causal narratives can inform more realistic policy options more visible in future.

Structure of the Thesis

This study is divided into six chapters. The first chapter set the foundation for this thesis; I already discussed the importance of looking beyond the current narratives that explain the rise in the killings and persecution on PWAs in Tanzania. To ascertain the origin of the current narratives, I briefly discussed the historical antecedent of persecution of PWAs and what it means to be an albino. The second chapter focus is on the methodological approach and the analytical framework adopted in the process of gathering and analysing the data for this study. Selection of secondary data sources, biases and dealing with subjectivity is discussed in details. In chapter three, I reviewed the dominant narratives and their inefficiency as it serves as a basis for government formulation a long lasting solution to the escalation of attacks on PWAs in Tanzania. This helped in addressing the central research question of this research that seeks to understand the dominant narratives that explains the root cause of the killings of PWAs. In chapter four, the focus is to examine other less dominant narratives around academics, and those based on legal provision, especially government and advocacy NGOs' causal narratives.

In Chapter five, the second sub-questions is reviewed, through the lens of the religious economy approach. This also forms the basis for the concluding proposal that more collaborative policy options need to be explored between NGOs, government, media and academics. Ending the killings of PWAs will require cooperation and a longer-term perspective. The main focus throughout the study is the period 2007-2015, whether in the media, in statements and policies of political elites or in NGO and academic research. Overall, an aim is to understand both dominant and alternative narratives to be found in various sources, with a view to making more realistic policy options visible. The last chapter is the conclusion of the thesis.

Chapter 2 Methodology and Theoretical Framework

Introduction

This chapter is divided into four sections with a focus on the theoretical framework, methodological tool, subjectivity and limitation to the study and conclusion. In first part discuss extensively on the Emile Durkheim Social Fact, Religion and Belief theories and Comaroff and Comaroff Occult Economy theory. In the second part, I present methodological approach, the analytical process that was involved in the data collection and analysis. While the third section speaks to my subjectivity, how it affects the outcome of the research and how I dealt with the subjectivity to ensure that the thesis maintains the status of a credible academic paper devoid of biases. The following section discusses the theoretical framework that is embedded in Emile Durkheim and Comaroff and Comaroff postulation

Theoretical Framework

Emile Durkheim Social Fact, Religion and Belief Theories

Social Fact is a concept used by Emile Durkheim to stress the objective reality of the process of social structure. In general, facts are sovereign of individual understanding of actions: they are available to everyone and thus empirically substantiated (Allan, 2005:115). “The moral force you feel doesn’t originate inside you: it is not a psychological entity it’s a social fact that impacts everybody in our society” (Allan, 2005:115). Social facts exist within a system that is much greater than the individual that comprise it. This system operates according to its law and thus constitutes a separate reality (ibid: 117). The theory helps us to understand if the religious beliefs and cultural practice narratives are a plausible explanation for the rise in albino killing in Tanzania. Religion, according to Emile Durkheim: “...is a unified system of beliefs and practices relative to sacred things, that is to say, things set apart and surrounded by prohibitions – beliefs and practices that unite its adherents in a single moral community called a church” (Durkheim, 2001 cited in Marcus, 2015:4).

This can be related to the kind of situation defined as ‘Occult Economy;’ by Comaroff and Comaroff (1999). This approach is returned to briefly in Chapter 5, and involves: “the deployment of magical means for material ends or, more expansively, the conjuring of wealth by resort to inherently mysterious techniques, whose principles of operation are neither transparent nor explicable in conventional terms”(Comaroff and Comaroff, 1999:297). Therefore, religious beliefs, concern certain norms, ideas, and truths that are shared within a community for the purpose of maintaining community solidarity. These societal norms and ideas are viewed as consecrated, which in turn become an entity of particular rites and procedures that sustain the beliefs as an integral component of the individuals in the community.

From the time immemorial to the present days, African societies have endeavoured to acclimatise to difficulties of living under severe natural and environmental constraint. Centuries of living under substantial, tenacious, and unbearable circumstances have enhanced African beliefs about nature and undeniably the universe, as inexcusable, mysterious, and powerful. These condi-

tions are the basis of Africa beliefs in the supernatural in addition to occult practices (Mbogoni, 2013:9). For example, the outbreak of diseases epidemic or drought that caused massive damage to both animal and human population has been construed as signs of fury and anger of ancestors, gods, and other entities in the mystical realm. Consequently, both human and animals sacrifice are made to mollify the discontentment of the gods (ibid:10). It is worthy of note, to emphasise that beliefs in fortune and misfortune are not peculiar to African traditions, the Romans also believed in the goddess of fortune, “Fortuna”, the daughter of Jupiter. It was thought to be responsible for good or bad luck, fate, and protector of grain supplies in the Roman religion (Mbogoni, 2013).

Methodological Tools

In a period of time under which vast data amounts are collected and archived by on a particular area of research by researchers all over the world, the expediency of applying existing data for primary research is becoming more prevalent (Creswell, 2009; Doolan & Froelicher, 2009; Heaton, 2008; Smith, 2008). Secondary data analysis is outlined as the analysis of data initially collected for another primary purpose. Often, the application of existing data affords a viable option for researchers with limited time and resources (Creswell, 2009:56). Given this understanding, secondary data collection and analysis will be applied as the preferred methodology for the study. The two months available for the data collection would be insufficient for me to travel to Tanzania for primary data collection. Mostly, any travel plans that I made would have been constrained by limited available resources. Secondary data was deemed sufficient for the analytical exercise of identifying dominant and alternative causal narratives. The study, therefore, uses the same basic research principles as those applied in primary data analysis, the results and findings arrived at in this study will, therefore, be hoped to be both valid and credible, since causal narratives can be identified in textual sources and do not necessarily require interviews (Doolan & Froelicher, 2009:206).

Data collection procedure

A systematic process of inquiry was applied during this process to mitigate bias and assure additional credibility (Heaton, 2008:15). The secondary data analysis rely upon published and non-published materials originating from official reports by government and non-governmental organisations, journal articles, magazines, newspapers, the Constitution of Tanzania and books covering the escalation of ritualistic murders of PWAs in Tanzania. Major capitalization is upon journal articles and newspaper articles. To narrow down the search, directed content analysis will be applied. The first step in this type of analysis is the identification of the initial coding categories. For the purpose of the study, the key coding categories that were applied include keywords such as albino, albinism, PWA (persons with Albinism), witchcraft, witchdoctors, mining and albinism, fishing and albinism, Ngozi (skin), Politics and albinism, economic advantages of albinism, Ulemavu (disability, albinism and human rights, and attitudes towards albinism. These categories are sufficient enough to narrow down all data collected on the social, political and economic factors related to Albinism.

All secondary data regarding government position and media content selected are from the year 2007 to 2015 from both international and local media. These media outlets include the online version of the different print newspaper from two major media companies, The Daily News and Mwananchi Communications for local news, IBTimes, CNN, BBC, and Aljazeera for the international perspective. The choice of the two local News outlets was informed by the fact that The Daily News is an English language government control newspaper which was founded in 1972. The paper is produced both in print and online format with the latter first publication in 2011. The Citizen is the English version of Mwananchi (Swahili), and the leading independent news source in Tanzania which was founded in 2004 and is produced by Mwananchi Communications Ltd. The choice of IBTimes CNN, BBC, and Aljazeera was because they are a dominant foreign news source for the majority of Tanzanian. Moreover, the first story about the killing of PWAs for their body parts was first reported by BBC. Be that as it may, the media outlets selected have a substantial number of documentaries on the subject of research that one can use

A sample of 15 English and Swahili articles were analysed from The Daily News, Mwananchi Communications, articles from The Citizen (English) and Mwananchi (Swahili) were accessed from their websites. For the international media, I selected three articles and one video documentary each from CNN, BBC, and IBTimes to have an international perspective on the subject of research. The overall articles of news media that were used in this study are twenty-six. Also, I accessed YouTube videos of Interviews and documentaries that involved activists and politician's debate in town halls meetings and the parliament. This is important because most TV stations in Tanzania are also on YouTube Channels. Below is the table that shows how the media articles were selected. This research depends solely on secondary data that are publicly available. Table 1: Sample selection of media articles

Media Outlet	Location	Key words for Selection	Hit	Relevance	Selected	Language	Year
The Daily News	Tanzania	Albino, Witchdoctor,	300	45	7	English	2011-2015
The Citizen/Mwananchi	Tanzania	Witchdoctor, Albino, Wagang wa kinyeji,	38,835	315	8	English, Swahili	2007-2015
CNN	USA/America	Albino Tanzania, Witch doctor	8	12	3	English	2007-2015
BBC	UK/Europe	Albino, Witchdoctor, Tanzania	2	36	3	English	2007-2015
IBTimes	UK	Albino Witchdoctor, Tanzania	8	11	3	English	2007-2015

Sources: Author, 2016

Looking at articles from these news media enables me to have a critical understanding on how the problem is presented in the both international and local media. To facilitate analysis, the research sort selected articles into categories. The study did not include any articles that do not touch on the social, political or economic cause narratives. There follows the critical analysis, meant to address the research questions selected for this study. To address the second research question, the study also draws on other articles as needed from. However, in analysing and juxtaposing the data with the research questions the data collected from the secondary data, I adopted the framework of Bacchi (2009)

“What’s the Problem Represented to be” (WPR). Although, Bacchi designed this framework purposely to analyse policy as a discourse, however, I find it also very relevant in the deconstruction of various narratives that media, academia, politicians and others have presented around the reasons for albino killings in Tanzania. Since my main source of data is text which are “selected because they represent a ‘moment of crisis’ or are considered typical or representative of a particular practice” (Godwin, 2011:172). The WPR approach offers a number of steps and checklist that can be used in conducting an effective research that will answer my research questions and objectives. In particular, the WPR approach offer a set of six (6) relevant questions that can be adopted to investigate how a particular ‘problem(s)’ are represented in policies, media (local and international), community, academics (emphasis are mine). Moreover, the approach enables me to acquire knowledge that is significantly different from the “existing system of meaning” as suggested by (Godwin, 2011:172). Below is the modification of WPR framework six questions used to answer the research questions in the text selected.

Table 2: Analytical Framework for Identifying Causal Narratives

Bacchi's Question	Goals	Research questions
What's the 'problem' represented to be in media, politicians, community (emphasis are mine)	Identifying the implied problem representation.	What are the dominant and alternative explanatory narratives around the killing of albinos in Tanzania? Could the introduction of hybrid, more complex explanatory narratives help with better understanding of the causes of albino killings?
What presuppositions or assumptions underpin this representation of the 'problem'?	To discover the logic or theoretical grounds that strengthen a particular problem representations	How have dominant narratives been expressed in the period 2007-2015 in the media, by political elites and in academia?
How has this representation of the 'problem' come about	To bring to light the circumstances that permits a specific problem representation to develop and assume dominance.	
What is left unproblematic in this problem representation? Where are the silences? Can the 'problem' be thought about differently	Bringing to the fore perspectives and issues that have received lesser attention or silenced while the problem is represented.	What alternative or counter-narratives can be found and where are these coming from?
What effects are produced by this representation of the 'problem'?	To establish the lived, subjectification and discursive effect of the problem representation.	Could this lead in future to more realistic policy option visible.

Sources: Adopted from Bacchi (2012) and modified by the Author

Subjectivity

I would be most unusual, as a Tanzanian, if I did not believe at all in supernatural powers. Like most other Tanzanians I have in my own life seen some phenomena that were hard to explain in other ways, like healing and cursing. However I also acknowledge that my own beliefs were challenged in doing this study. It was surprising to see that what is often taken for granted,

as good, i.e. organised religion, can have many qualities associated with 'witchcraft', especially the supply and demand for magic solutions to problems. However, as someone who has doubted the use of witchdoctors to solve unexplainable problems, and as a Christian, I decided this study would require me to look at my own society through another set of lenses. I would rather pray and go to church for divine help, but I would be dishonest if I did not admit to struggling with my personal biases of faith during the process of this research. In fact, it has been very challenging indeed.

There was even a time when I had almost decided to drop this topic because it took me in directions that I had not expected. Indeed I was worried that by taking an academic and critical position, I might start for some to sound like an unbeliever or even an atheist. Fortunately, the friends I shared these findings with helped to sort out my thought processes, although they were also sacred of what I had become. However sometimes I wonder if this kind of challenge is a stage that research passes through, in order to shed fresh light on policy options. The findings of this study are clearly distinct from my faith, which remains strong, and many of my Christian brothers have shown concern about the spiritual implications of even suggesting that Christian or Muslim religion might resemble in some ways other magical beliefs, which they see as "forces of darkness" (i.e. witchdoctors). I hope they will consider that this has been the best way I could find to involve more of the Tanzanian public in debates about the best way to address the menace facing PWAs in future in a more holistic way. I would like to give my readers the insights I can into my own background so that they can better understand how hard it was to embark on such a topic, and how very challenging this research has proven for me.

I was born into a family with a Muslim background; in fact, my mother still practices Islam. But I was so fortunate to encounter our Lord Jesus Christ in 1997 during a crusade that was organized in Dar es Salaam. Initially it was difficult for me to practice my new founded faith in Jesus as a result serious beating from my mother that insisted that I go to Madrassa to study Quran. When I refused, I was sent back to our village in Kilimonjaro, where the nearest living church is 10km walk. Nevertheless, I continued walking to Bible studies and kept going for the baptism sermons and then in 1997 I was officially baptised and given a new name Florence from Catholic church. I finished my primary education in 1998 and in 1999 I joined Catholic seminary school for secondary education with the intention of continuing nurturing my faith.

At the school I was appointed by sisters and priests who were our teachers as a leader especially with title of Mistress of Education where I exercised the role of English Speaking in the school. I did not know why I was selected to lead 250 students at that young age, but I believe God had a purpose and a plan for me. I led students who were older than I was and yet the wisdom of God was upon me. It was the place where I lived a life of prayers from morning to evening as special times were set daily for prayers. My thirst for God developed more and more and even after I finished school I later joined University for a degree in Social Work. I still feel I have these strong ties with God until today, and this in spite or even because my faith has been challenged by this study. I am now a born again and I worshiped in Siloam International Ministry in Dar es Salaam for a long time and I am still active as a leader in prayers and fellowship group. More than a year ago, when I arrived in

Netherlands to continue my studies and my service to God, I joined a living church of God, and am an active member of the evangelism and prayer intersection group of Redeem Christian Church of God (RCCG) Tabernacle of David in The Hague. I spend my leisure time listening to worship songs and messages online and believe in the power of Jesus Christ as the saviour for all human kind. So, as you can see from this narrative of mine, it has been very difficult for me to produce a scholarship that is in many ways working against the beliefs and experiences I cherish, on the one hand. On the other hand, it was difficult for me to ignore opinions backed up with empirical evidence and academic research, no matter how contradictory these opinions might be to my own spiritual beliefs and my Christian faith. As a scholar it was my responsibility to present the opinions of others, first, in the best and most fair way possible, before passing judgement. I allow the readers to make their own decisions about what to accept or to disagree with in the findings. However I have tried to base myself on empirical evidence and reasoned argument throughout. After all, to think clearly and argue fairly are skills I learned through my own Christian education.

First I took a step backward and approached the research from outside the box, something that eventually helped me to deal with my own subjectivity. The outcome of this study did not in any way rubberstamp or criminalized witchcraft, witchdoctors or traditional healers as forces of darkness or good. Rather, it critically engaged with reality of Tanzanians and how they relate with them and the social position they occupied. I am convinced that, I tried all my possible best to separate my bias from the research process which eventually produced an outcome that I believe is acceptable academically as well as spiritually. My advice to the reader is not to approach this study with any form of spiritual lens but to consider it as strictly academic, and based also on the spiritual conviction that being fair to different views is vital for personal and community dialogue and mutual respect.

Conclusion

In this chapter, I have been able to discuss the importance of the social fact in constructing the beliefs of individuals on any particular subject matter while outlining the impact of religion or religious beliefs in the society. The theoretical framework helps in identifying the entry point of the research problem and establish clear path on how the research problem of this study can be tackle. While the framework helps in making the findings of this study generalizable, meaningful, establish methodical connections between observation and facts. The methodological tool for this study provides the reader an in-depth overview of how the data was gathered and analysed to produce the outcome of this study. The discussion of subjectivity and how it was dealt with is highly imperative to prepared the mind of the reader for unexpected outcomes or position taking on a specific argument or narratives

Chapter 3 Review of Dominant Causal Narratives: Witchdoctors, Witches and Witchcraft

Introduction

Having been conspicuously missing in international news Media, Tanzania was catapulted to global limelight by the 2007 spate of ritualistic murders of PWAs in the North-western part of the country (Malone, 2009; Cruz-Inigo et al., 2011). Since then, the country has experienced an apogee in these ritualistic murders with current statistics documenting 74 murders, 58 attacks under which the survivors were severely mutilated and 18 grave robberies (Trudell, 2015; Wesangula, 2015). This chapter focuses on the understanding of how have dominant narratives been expressed in the period 2007-2015 in the media, by political elites and in academia. What presuppositions or assumptions underpin this representation of the 'problem' and to discover the logic grounds that strengthen the PWAs problem images in Tanzania and across the region. I presented my argument in four different sections; in the first part, I discuss how the media representation of the problem as witchcraft related problem and how such misrepresentation has misled the government in their response. The second section focus is on the political elites views on the killing of PWAs by reviewing outcome of a UN forum that comprises of creme del la creme in advocacy, human rights, academia, government, UN in the brainstorming of finding a lasting solution to Killings of Albino in Tanzania, Kenya and the region as a whole. In the third section, I presented the views of the academia, and in the fourth part argued that the media, political elites, and academia failure to distinguish between the witchcraft, witchdoctors and traditional healers are a stain in their narratives. Therefore I discuss the difference in the three terms. In chapter five, I argued that the lack of differentiation of these conditions has further created crisis for vulnerable groups such as women and children accused of witchcraft and the criminalised innocent people that are just going on peacefully with their business in traditional medicine

Media: Giving a Dog a Bad Name

It is true that the chain of media coverage, both national and international on the killings of PWAs in Tanzania have helped bring to the fore of human rights discourse the predicament of PWAs in Tanzania and within the region. Besides, the media coverage helps in mounting pressure on the government to prioritise the safety of PWAs by the international community. However, what is reported and how it was reported to have a great impact on how the community, government, academics, UN agencies, and non-state actors respond to the problem. It forms the starting point of their approach in resolving the problem. Moreover, the majority of academics conducting research rely more on media reports for primary data collection which in most cases serve as the nucleus of government policy. According to Robison, "media text does not just replicate reality but can be constructed so as to produce a particular understanding or perception of a problem" (Robinson, 2001:532). Although, when a government have clear policy path to tackle a problem, the media representation have little or no impact on the outcome of the govern-

ment decision. But in a situation where no clear policy have been thought through, the government don't have a choice other than to do something to satisfy public opinion that has been saturated by media representation of the problem (Robinson, 2001:533). Therefore, media representation of issues plays a vital role in weather policy designed for the purpose of tackling the problem will work or not. Unfortunately, the media image of the root causes of albino killing in Tanzania and the region as a whole is nothing but misleading. The media, both local and foreign have represented Witchcraft as the reason for the killing of PWAs which is contrary to the findings of this study.

The framing of albino killings as witchcraft related problem is most prevalent in the international media news headlines, whereas local media outlets especially the government-controlled The Daily News splashes headlines to promote the government efforts to tackle the problem. "Police pledge greater protection of albinos", "Albino Killers punished heavily" are examples of familiar headlines of The Daily News. Although references to witchcraft were common in the news text, one will have to read the whole text to see where witchcraft was referenced. News headline caption such as "Tanzanian albino children mutilated for witchcraft receive treatment in the US", "Albinism in Tanzania: Witchcraft-fuelled persecution leads to mutilation and murder", "Albino baby hacked to death in Tanzania's latest witchcraft related Death" are common in international media such as International Business Times (IBTimes) and CNN. In fact, IBTimes go beyond witchcraft to cannibalism in one its news headline "It's Fatal to Be an Albino in Tanzania Due To Cannibalism". Nevertheless, the local media did not fair better, just because they don't sensationalise their news headline with witchcraft as the cause of albino killing doesn't suggest that they contribute to the knowledge of witchcraft as the cause of the menace against PWAs.

The findings of this study resonate with the views of the United Nations Independent experts on Albinism, Ikponwosa Ero on the need to look beyond the dominant media representation of the root causes in albino killing to Witchcraft. According to Ero while addressing a press conference early this year, she questions the veracity of witchcraft as the cause of the rising trend of albino killing. Being an albino herself with years of working experience in human rights arena, she argued that there is a need "to move past vague references to African witchcraft -- which suit media headlines -- but which do not fully explain the gruesome trend" (Daily Mail the UK, 2015).

Political Elites Views on the Killings of PWAs

This section discusses how the political elites have been using the narratives around the killing of PWAs in Tanzania. The political elites have reinforced the media representation of witchcraft and which doctors as the causative factor responsible for the escalation of the murders. A typical example is a situation where more than 150 representatives of National Human Rights Institutions, civil societies, academics, regional and international governmental organizations from 26 countries in the region that gathered at the Dar es Salaam June 2016 forum which was tagged "Action on Albinism in Africa Consultative Forum". The Forum was hosted by the Prime Minister's Office of the Government of Tanzania, UN Independent Expert on the enjoyment of human rights by persons with albinism. Also the host includes the Tanzania Commission on Human Rights and Good Governance (CHRAGG), the Unit-

ed Nations Country Team in Tanzania, the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, the World Bank, Under The Same Sun, Standing Voice, Canadian High Commission in Tanzania, the Embassies of the USA, Ireland, and Norway in Tanzania. The section IV (A: i) of the preventive measures outcomes of the forum as demonstrated below speak to the root causes of the attacks against PWAs

Table 3 UN Action on Albinism in Africa Consultative Forum Outcome Report Extract

Actors Responsible	Measures
Government, NGO, Academia,Media	<p><u>Short term:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Research in situation, involving local, traditional and religious leaders on albinism; as well as training with them on root causes • Continuous research on the root causes of attacks at all levels, including academic • Continuous advocacy and sensitization on the scientific aspects of albinism • Combat witchcraft practice; a root cause of attacks: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Legislation should not validate or give legal character to the phenomena of witchcraft ○ Laws banning witchcraft accusations should be upheld in this intent ○ Criminal Law should expand provisions of murder, abduction, kidnapping, grave robberies and other relevant crimes to include built-in aggravating factors such as the intent to use a victim's body parts for witchcraft purposes where the facts support such intent ○ Traditional medicine should be delineated and regulated under separate legislative instrument. Practitioners should be registered and oversight by government activated through monitoring mechanisms such as revocable licenses, periodic inspection of work and self-regulation boards accountable to national law. ○ Thorough and sustained awareness raising on the social harm caused by witchcraft should be undertaken ○ Research on the use of body parts of persons with albinism should be conducted, including understanding of the underlying myths or reasons, the regions where such myths are widespread, and the origin and spreading pattern of such myths. ○ Undertake investigative research to find root causes of attacks, locate markets for body parts including cross-border trade as well as perpetrators and end-users of body parts of persons with albinism • Address poverty by ensuring access to services for communities at local level.
	<p><u>Medium term:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continuous advocacy and sensitization; • Sensitization of traditional and religious leaders on the impact of certain beliefs and practices • Legal support for persons with albinism • Address poverty using the principles of the UN sustainable development goals (SDGs) which aims to “end poverty in all its forms everywhere” by the year 2030.
Government	<p><u>Long term:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Insert information on albinism in the school curricula from the very early stages e.g. primary school • Address poverty by ensuring access to services for communities at local level.

Sources.<http://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/Albinism/Pages/AlbinismInAfrica.aspx>

The conference outcome is crucial to this study because it represents the typical perspective shared by political elites on the root causes narratives of the attacks on PWAs in Tanzania and Africa as a whole. The specific measures that were proposed in the document, as shown above, are based on general recommendations made by the United Nations and the African Union from the past to date. This includes the recommendation from the Organisation In-

ternationale de la Francophonie (Expert Meeting in 2014, unpublished), Advisory Committee of the UN Human Rights Council (A/HRC/28/75), and OHCHR (A/HRC/24/57). Others are the Human Rights Council (A/HRC/RES/23/13), the African Commission on Human Peoples' Rights (Resolution 263), Human Rights Treaty Bodies (Including HRC, CRPD, CEDAW, CERD, CRC, CESR, CAT,) and the Universal Periodical Review Mechanism.

In the 24 pages document that was released after the forum, several measures were identified such as the root causes and preventive measures, accountability measures, protective measures, and discrimination. The participants come up with concrete steps under each of the identified categories in line with the expert experience they felt will work in the African contexts. However, I decided to focus on the preventive measures in the document because out of all the categories of actions identified in the forum report, the preventive measures that speak to the cause of the problem is the most important aspect of the documents. It serves as the starting point in the long process of finding a lasting solution to the problem. It is the foundation of the intervention program, and if the foundation of a house is faulty, the house stands the chance of collapsing creating havoc to the unsuspecting occupants. At the forum, they made no attempt whatsoever to differentiate between witchcraft, witchdoctors, and Traditional healers in the process of coming up with the action plan. The primary objective of the Forum was to identify unambiguous, tangible and practicable short, medium and long-term plan of actions to tackle the rise in Albino killing in Africa (UN, 2016:3). Their conclusion produced the same old narratives of witchcraft and the misrepresentation of "all" witchdoctors and traditional healers as the cause. Although, the forum was successful in providing reasonable and doable action plan that will go a long way in solving the problem at hand. However, it will be difficult to achieve any realistic way forward if the identified root causes are not deconstructed. As the extract of the forum outcome demonstrate that academics are also part of the meeting, the next section looks at what some scholars are saying about the root causes of the attacks on PWAs

Traditional Cause Narratives: Academia

Of striking importance in relation to the current wave of PWA murders in Tanzania is the fact that researchers have not significantly cited the precedents to the traditional practices and beliefs that target PWAs (Bryceson et al., 2010:367). Historically, no particular symbolism or traditional practices suggested the implication of PWAs in such rituals. Regardless, a hushed practice of mercy killing of Albinos has always been rumoured in East Africa given the higher incidence of PWAs in the region as compared to other regions in the world (Ackley, 2010: 3). A variety of Albino infants has been rumoured to be killed by their families based on their perceived inability to engage in local farming efforts (Alum et al., 2009:23). Burke & Nkonyani (2004:45) assert that in some agro-pastoralist communities, Albino Births were often reported as stillbirths by families and midwives. Suffice to say, the births of Albino children are often deemed a source of household tension (Semkwiji, 2009; Red Cross, 2009; Masanja, 2015). The application of ritualistic murders of PWAs is associated with the Albino fetish and cultural myths sold by witchdoctors to different individuals (Liao, 2010:2). These are mostly related to deep-rooted belief in the power of witchcraft, curse and bad omen. As thus, PWAs are as-

sociated with evil, bad omen and bewitching of the family in question (Ackley, 2010; Cruz-Inigo et al., 2011). Therefore, in this logic, PWAs should be murdered to rid the society of any possible curse or bad luck.

This fetish incorporates the mental construct that necessitates the abduction, killing and dismembering of PWAs for their body parts (Tanner, 2010: 230). Though carried out by male gangs of assailants, such kidnappings and murders are carried out with the knowledge of family members that lure the victims into secluded areas (Thuku, 2011:6). Frequently, the bones are utilised for making amulets for increased luck or protection (Nyabwari & Kagema, 2014; Miguel, 2005; Mesaki, 2008; Martel, 2015; Malone, 2009). The perceived vulnerability and physical appearance of the PWAs deem them and accessible and enigmatic target for those that believe in the power of human sacrifice for the aggrandizement of power and wealth (Makulilo, 2010; Ikuomola, 2015; Gulati, 2011; Dave-Odigie, 2010). Paradoxically, PWAs are often revaluated and vested with wealth bestowing powers akin to those of a deity (Geleta & Keita, 2009:34). By implication, the PWA fetish is deemed the most expensive charm given that its perceived powers are highly rated about those afforded by plant and animal charms (Gettleman, 2008: 2).

Notably, albinos are especially persecuted in Shinyanga and Mwanza, regions in which the witch doctors have promoted the belief in the potential magical and superstitious properties of albino's body parts (Cruz-Inigo et al., 2011; Geleta & Keita, 2009). Various scholars believe that witchcraft in the Sukuma land (Mwanza and Shinyanga) is part and parcel of their ways of life, being embedded within their socio- cultural life, In other words, this is regarded as a source of knowledge and morality. Witchcraft is practised to determine the causes of disaster or bad luck, and it is believed to bring healing and material wealth to those who try to find it even if it can cost one's life (Magobe, 2008). Witchcraft practices in Sukumaland regions are prevalent and remain active (Brehony et al., 2008; Mesaki, 2008; Magobe, 2008; Masanja, 2015). Witchdoctors are still considered to be problem solvers in the society and constructed it as tradition and incorporated witchcraft in their daily life (Hinkkanen, 2009). Mwanza is said to be the place with the higher number of witchdoctors about 3000 with registered licence making the region ranking with a high profile of witch doctors in the country (Dave-Odigie, 2010; Mushi, 2009). Perhaps this could be given to explain the escalation of the prevalence ritual killings and violence against albino predominant in this region (UNHCR, 2009). Any premature deaths or natural deaths below the age of fifty years are not acceptable (Mfumbusa, 1999).

Witchcraft, Witchdoctors and Traditional Healers

Because the three terms (Witchcraft, Witchdoctor, and Traditional Healers) which are different in all ramifications are consistently used to represent the same thing by the political elites, academics, and both local and international media outlets. It explains why the participants of the forum insisted in the banning of witchcraft, witchdoctors and traditional healers. Rather than solving the problem of Albino killings in Tanzania, the propagation of witchcraft as the cause of the killings is a nightmare for women, most especially in

Tanzania. In fact, “the concepts of “witchcraft” and “witchdoctor”, when applied to Africa, vastly distort the indigenous meaning, roles, and their related ideas and customary practices. Indeed, the term has been hijacked and totally misused and abused as applied to African epistemology” (Tembo, 1993: no page). Before I discuss the flaws in the cause narratives epitomised by the media, politicians and international and local state and non-state actors to combat the murder of albinos. It important to understand what this terms means and their importance in the Tanzania society, rather than a blanket statement to paint the key aspect of the community fabric as bad and evil

Witchcraft

Witchcraft also known as witchery is broadly used to describe the practice and belief in magical abilities and skills that can be exercised by individuals and particular social group (Russell, 1972). According to Russell, a precise definition is difficult. Therefore there is a need to apply caution when associating meaning and significance to the term. The dilemma of defining witchcraft is made more complicated because different cultures do not share a clear pattern of witchcraft beliefs, which frequently intermingle with other concepts such as diabolism, technology, folklore, and religion (Russell, 1972; 12 Days of Magic, 2002). Some cultures consider a witch as a person with inbuilt supernatural powers, while others (most especially in the West) believed that it is a free choice of an individual to learn and practice magic, though with the help of supernatural (Henderson, 2016). Nevertheless, Witchcraft is exemplified by its use of magic depending on the morals of the community; in this sense, witchcraft may be considered with a different degree of suspicion or respect, or with ambivalence, being neither inherently good nor evil (12 Days of Magic, 2002). However, it is common for members of some religion to adopt derogatory meaning for the term witchcraft to encompass all ritual or magical practice that are alien to their doctrines. Such religions believe that the rituals practices that took place within their religion are not in any way magical, but rather a mere variation of prayer (ibid).

Therefore, others form of rituals not by their doctrine are prohibited or classed as superstitions. In line with the above argument about witchcraft, it makes sense to argue that a spell is a form of prayer (inviting Spirit, casting the circle, calling the supernatural quarters, etc.) in the practices of Witchcraft. For example, the Wiccans pray (even though spell is more involve) just like any other faith. “Spells are to the Pagan what prayers are to the Christian – a way of voicing ... There is no significant distinction between spells and prayer since they ultimately serve the same function of projection one’s will out into the world, and both rely on the belief, or faith of the individual” (Wilson, 2012:49).

There are also those that strongly identify with the typology of witchcraft, the good one and the bad one. The good or white witchcraft and witches are benevolent, engage in the craft of healing and profess ethical codes where malicious magic are forbidden (Ezzy, 2006; Wilson, 2012; Mukherjee, 2015). Regardless, of the source and how witches exercise their powers, white or dark, they are regularly credited with all sort of diseases and disaster. In many parts of Africa, a host of minor calamities are habitually laid at their door.

“If blight seizes the groundnut crop it is witchcraft; if the bush is vainly scoured for game it is witchcraft; if women laboriously bale water out of a pool and are rewarded by but a few small fish it is witchcraft; if termites do not rise

when their swarming is due and a cold useless night is spent in waiting for their flight it is witchcraft; if a wife is sulky and unresponsive to her husband it is witchcraft; if a prince is cold and distant with his subject it is witchcraft; if a magical rite fails to achieve its purpose it is witchcraft; if, in fact, any failure or misfortune falls upon anyone at any time, and in relation to any of the manifold activities of his life it may be due to witchcraft” (Evans-Pritchard, 2010:19).

Therefore, we can conceptualise belief in witchcraft as an effort by people to rationalise the hardship and troubles that they encounter in their life; it shapes their opinions and offers an answer to the question of ‘why me?’ when tragedy strike (Schnoebelen, 2009:2). To be precise, it provides a justification for what appears to be unexplainable (Foxcroft, 2009). Undeniably, witchcraft is a highly controversial matter in Tanzania and elsewhere in Africa. However, witchcraft is a reality that is culturally constructed embedded in a system that is woven into the fabric of vast majority of Tanzanians ways of life. In spite of efforts to deny or eliminate it, it exists, and people act accordingly (Mesaki, 1993:5).

Witchdoctors

In the third world region, the term witch doctor has been misinterpreted to connote "a healer that is using witchcraft in the practice of traditional medicine as an alternative to modern day medicine in the contemporary society rather than its original connotation as someone one who identify and alleviate problems caused by witches (Blakemore and Jennett, 2001; Lugira, 2009). Witchdoctors in Africa and Tanzania in particular, have been portrayed by the media as a sinister and barbaric force against human development. On the positive extreme, witchdoctors help cures ill-stricken citizens and act as a positive force or antidote against the otherwise debilitating fears of witchcraft (Evans-Pritchard, 1976). Many anthropologists and other scholars have consistently emphasised the positive side in the belief in witchcraft and the role that the witchdoctor plays in the African society. Parrinder (1963: 181) argued that it is misleading to refer or to classify witchdoctors with words such as soothsayer, juju-man, wizard, a priest with little or no care for an accurate definition. Parrinder maintained that "no name has suffered more from distortion and misunderstanding than that of the witch-doctor is the chief witch, the devil of the magical art.”(ibid)

According to Blakemore and Jennett (2001), this representation of witch-doctors is tantamount to a gross misrepresentation of the authentic situation where they are very much appreciated in Africa as they worked towards the general welfare of their customers. Decades before the first recorded case of albino killing for the charm of good luck, witchdoctors or witch-experts are regularly patronised by football clubs for powerful medicine and ritual act to wade off witchcraft attacks on their players to win. “Many parents take measures in protecting their children by having them wear "loads" of talismans and fetishes to ward off witchcraft” (Mesaki, 1993:5). Even members of the educated elite are not inimical to occult practices (Aljazeera, July 2015). There were instances where government sanctioned the use of witchdoctors to deal with witchcraft related issues at the request of the community. One of such cases occurred in the month of April 1992. The Regional authorities in Kili-manjaro were left with no other option than to allow a traditional mganga ("doctor") to venture into a forest close to Moshi town on a rescue mission to bring back young victims who were supposedly under the captivity of a "witch"

as zombies on government expense (Mesaki, 1993:19-20). Eventually, neither the so-called victims were found, nor did the suspected Witch was prosecuted by the state due to lack of substantial evidence. Although the government official that took the decision to allow the witch doctor to do his work maintained that he did not believe in witchcraft, he, however, not rule out the possibility of the matter as the truth (ibid)

Traditional Healers

As I discussed earlier, African doctors or Traditional healers have been misrepresented without a proper label. According to Beck (1979), several scholars have made an attempt to simplify the constant confusion in the terminology of *mganga* in Tanzania by categorising the names given to healers among various ethnic groups in the country. For example, some categories include witchcraft, wisdom, and sorcery; some classified them as native doctors or traditional doctors. Others adopted the terms traditional practitioners for those that used herbs and witchdoctors for those that offer the service of countermagic against sorcery (Beck, 1979:2). “Within the Traditional Medicine (TM) system, people have the opportunity to consult traditional medical practitioners, including traditional healers (*waganga wa jadi*), herbalists (*waganga wa miti shamba*), traditional birth attendants and midwives (*wakunga wa jadi*), circumcisers (*ngariba*), bone setters (*waganga wa jadi wa mifupa*), fortune tellers and predictors (*wabashiri & watabiri*), and soothsayers (*wapiga ramli*)” (Chirangi, 2013: 120). In Swahili, healers are referred to *mganga*, this includes some categories of a traditional connoisseur, for example, the herb specialist that offer herbal medicine, and those that make use of magic and religious forces to heal their patients. The people that take advantage of the services of this *manga* might find it logically objectionable to categorise all these activities under one label, which are not in the least bit always exercised by just one type of healer. However, as I stated earlier that a wrong or inaccurate diagnosis of the root causes of the killings of PWAs might have greater unintended consequences on another group of people in the society, this are the elders and women in particular. The next section looks at the implication of overrepresentation of witchcrafts practice as cause of the escalation of the PWAs under attack

Backlash of Witchcraft and Witchdoctors Narratives

Women and Elderly Become More Vulnerable to Attacks

Before the emergence of albino killings in 2007, women and elders have been subjected to vicious attacks on a baseless accusation of witchcraft practice. Between 2005 and 2011, Tanzanians lynched an average of 500 people, particularly women, per year on suspicion of witchcraft. According to the Legal and Human Rights Centre (LHRC) report (2014: 80), for six months, a total of 320 were killed for the allegations of witchcraft. As a result of this, the government passed into law. Although none of these attacks was associated with the killings of albinos, rather they are linked to misfortune, sudden death, or in some cases fight properties and rivalries between families (Mesaki, 1993; Miguel, 2005; Kibuga et al., 2006; Uromi, 2014). However, the peddling of witchcrafts and witchdoctors narratives as a driving force to the killings of albinos by the media and political elites has exacerbated the vulnerable condition of women that are habitually accused of witchcraft anytime negative events occurred in the society. Women now fear for their lives more than before as

killing of women now includes the allegation of albino death in the country. The highest percentage of these killings occurred in rural areas of the north-western parts of the country where PWA ritual murders are rampant (Huffington Post, 2012). According to Masanja (2015:233), the recent escalation of killings of albinos has “make witch related albino killings a daily event in Tanzania especially in Lake Zone Region (Shinyanga, Simiyu, Geita and Mwanza Regions)”. For example, last year a woman was hacked with sharp weapons and burned alive to death by more than 200 villagers in Tabora in front of her husband watching helplessly. What was the crime of this woman? She was practising witchcraft and killing albinos (Onyulo, 2015). The villagers accused the government of relying too much on the court to ascertain whether women were practising witchcraft “They have killed many albinos to help them gain magical powers. We'll kill them ourselves to get justice” (cited in Onyulo, 2015). The Tanzania enacted Witchcraft Act [R.E 2002] has brought controversy in the sense that the law is challenging with some grey areas that make implementation difficult. It is. Therefore, self-explanatory saying that the escalation of women alleged to be connected to PWAs murders in Tanzania is due to the lack of comprehensive response that is based on critical research on the root causes of the killings that might help to contain the murderers of albino.

Abuse of Fundamental Human Rights

The Tanzania government is committed to the protection of PWAs fundamental human rights. However, the response of the government in doing so is nothing else but infringing on others people rights. The Ban and the arrest of more than 200 witchdoctors in Tanzania as part of the nation response crackdown on witchdoctors and traditional medicine practitioner linked to a wave of deadly attacks on PWAs (BBC, 2015; Aljazeera, 2015). Apart from the fact that the arrest of the over 200 witchdoctors is a contravention to Articles 1(1) of the 1981 United Nations General Assembly “Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief”. The available evidence from all the media reports did not suggest any linkage of the arrested witchdoctors to the killings of PWAs. Then the fundamental question remains why were they arrested and detained if no albino parts were not found in their possession, what are the charges that against them in the court, if they were to be prosecuted, are they going to jail them because they were witch doctors and with what evidence in particular.

According to reports, among those arrested, there are those in possession of items such as bird claws, lion skin, mule tails, warthog teeth, monkey tail, lizard skin, and ostrich eggs (BBC, 2015). I am baffled, and find it hard to comprehend how all the items found with the witchdoctors looks like albino body parts. Even though, if they were arrested because they were not licensed soothsayer's healers as suggested by the reports. Leo Igwe, a former representative of the International Humanist and the Ethical Union and also working on superstitious beliefs and witchcraft in Africa questioned the rationality behind such moves.

“Is the government saying that 'unlicensed healers' are responsible for albino murders and if the country gets rid of them then the killings would stop? What does it mean to be a 'licensed soothsayer' in Tanzania? Do the so called licensed soothsayers or healers not use some of the materials found in possession of arrested witchdoctors? If the licensed witch doctors do not use these materials for their work, what do they use?” (Igwe, 2015)

The banning and arrest of witchdoctors are an abuse of human rights that protect the freedom of religion and practice. If people feel like they want to use lizard skin or rat head to communicate with their gods and ask for healing, it is their choice and should not be coerced not to do so through discrimination and persecution. As I will discuss in chapter five of this study, the killing of PWAs in the country is deeply embedded Tanzanians supernatural belief, and am not sure if the persecution and arrest of witchdoctors will make people abandon such belief.

Conclusion

The overrepresentation of witchcraft as the cause of killings of PWAs has cost innocent people their lives or makes them end up in jail just like that due to silly and baseless accusations with no grounds to court proof. Women have been targeted, killed and molested on the accusation of witchcraft while hundreds of witchdoctors that has nothing to do with the attacks have been subjected to arrest and detention. Both political elites and the media reinforced each other narratives and made no attempt to differentiate on the concept of witchcraft, witchdoctors, traditional healers and other related concepts such as sorcery, magic, and juju. The amalgamation of all these terms has hindered the formulation of any workable response to rising in the attacks on PWAs. Nevertheless, in the next chapter, I bring to the fore, less dominant but germane cause narratives explanation to why the killings of PWAs has been in a continuum state

Chapter 4 Academic Narratives: Poverty and Vulnerability

Introduction

This chapter discusses the findings of the second research question of this study that attempts to identify other narratives that could still help to deconstruct dominant narratives that have been propagated in the media, political elites, and NGOs actors saddled with responsibilities of tackling the rise in the killings of PWAs in Tanzania. The chapter is divided into four sections; the first section discusses the economy narrative that speaks to poverty as a driving force that pushes people into the act of seeking albino body parts for money magic. The central argument of the second section is the lack of deterrence regarding law enforcement; the narratives speak to the fact that the killers of PWAs are going scot free with punishment; therefore, it gives others the confidence that that also commit the crime. The third section focus is on the socio-cultural narratives that comprise of various elements such as illiteracy, politician involvement, sports winnings and gambling among others. The last section is the conclusion

Economy and Poverty Narratives

The insufficiencies associated with the traditional cause narratives are currently being mitigated through a deconstruction that recommends a shift of focus to the social, political and economic cause narratives (Ikuomola, 2015: 40). There are studies suggesting a link between the escalating ritualistic murders of PWAs and economic reasons (Geleta & Keita, 2009; Gettleman, 2008; Semkwiji, 2009). To them, most ritualistic murders occur in rural areas characterised by poverty and illiteracy. Such individuals are easily lured in weird practices aimed at alleviating poverty. Bryceson et al., (2010:367) have proposed the apogee in the murders among the mining communities. Often encouraged by witch doctors, the mining communities have come to attribute prosperity in this industry with charms and amulets made from Albino bones (Nyabwari & Kagema, 2014; Miguel, 2005; Mesaki, 2008; Martel, 2015; Malone, 2009). Mostly, they believe in the protective power of such amulets against loss of lives in the mines. Equally important are studies that have related the escalation to the economic benefits accrued by the fishing Sukuma communities (Makulilo, 2010; Ikuomola, 2015; Gulati, 2011; Dave-Odigie, 2010). Such communities believe in the luck associated with weaving fishnets with Albino hairs for enhanced fish collections. Essentially, most fishing communities are turning to witchdoctors for charms aimed at increasing the dwindling fish resources due to overfishing and climate change (Dave-Odigie, 2010:73).

The state of the above narratives and their critical implications are insufficient to formulate a lasting solution to the sorry status of PWAs in Tanzania. Considering the high price at which Albino body parts are marketed, it is imperative for a deeper understanding of how people interpreted their economic conditions and what this reveals about the structural problems they face on a daily basis, to be created (Bryceson et al., 2010: 356). Going by the international standard of poverty measurement, a poor man would not be in a position to afford \$5,000 to \$10,000 for albino body parts (Cowell, 2015:2). The

controversy is about who may be making money from these criminal activities. When for example, up to \$75,000 may be offered for a set of arms, legs, ears, and genitals from an individual with albinism, it is clear that profit motives could be involved (Red Cross, 2009; Laing, 2015). Some had suggested that the rich people in the society are the one that is behind the black-market trade of albino body parts when one considered it fetch thousands of dollars (Gilgof, 2013). Considerably, the argument of the cost of albino body parts difficult for those in poverty to afford did not invalidate the fact that poor people can also engage in the selling rather than buying. There is evidence that suggest that there are families that sell albino family members to witchdoctors or connived with contract killers that have paid them a huge sum of money considered to be enough to take them out of poverty (Ebhomele, 2015; The Independents, 2010). This clearly shows that the poverty and the economic narrative is as important as the traditional and witchcrafts that have occupied the mainstream even though is still did not explained why other poor people did not engage in the business because poverty is widespread in the country.

Legal narratives: the need for more Deterrence

Notably, the tragedy of PWAs predicament in Tanzania has been met by the outrage of the victim's families in some cases as well as a concerned international and national public. Having witnessed the lack of judicial response to the escalating number of ritualistic PWA murders for the past few years, the public is deeming this a national and international problem that should be addressed from alternative cause narratives (Ikuomola, 2015:40). With little or insufficient cause narratives to base upon when hypothesising a lasting solution, the Tanzanian government was slow to prosecute the perceived perpetrators (Laing, 2015; Malone, 2009). Following the successful conviction of offenders in neighbouring Burundi, the government announced its proceedings with murder trials in zonal courts located in Shinyanga and Mwanza (Liao, 2010; Masanja, 2015). One such trial took place in 2009 that saw to the sentencing of the death of 3 perpetrators that hacked to death a 13-year-old PWA (Makulilo, 2010; Schühle, 2013; Semkwiji, 2009). Most local newspapers have been of the view that witchdoctors that perpetrate the ritualistic murders are frequently protected by government officials (Simon, 2016; Tanner, 2010; Wiete, 2011). In 2009, the government released a directive aimed at encouraging the public to identify witch doctors involved in the ritualistic murders (Trudell, 2015; Lac-cino, 2015; Red Cross, 2009). This was met with the identification of innocent individuals. In the same year, the prime minister directed the on-spot killing of those caught murdering PWAs. This instigated a spate of suspected witch killings in the country (Huffington post, 2012).

In spite of its central importance, and the very high expectation we have that legal punishment and criminal justice policies can inhibit crime, there has been a serious debate on the effectiveness of strict punishment serving as deterrence to the crime (Robinson & Darley, 2004; Paternoster, 2010). "Law enforcement exists both to apprehend wrongdoers and to convince would-be wrongdoers that there is a risk of apprehension and punishment if they commit a crime" (Paternoster, 2010: 766). Although various scholars (Van den Haag and Conrad, 2013; Doob and Webster, 2003) have argued that it's hard to stop habitual offenders from offending as there is already a strict law for criminals and a tougher law is not an answer to restrict them. The Albino society and the vast majority of Tanzanians have called for the implementation of

the death penalty or heavy punitive measures as the best way to curb the attacks on PWA as a short-term solution (Buchana, 2015; The Citizen, 2016). On the other hand, available evidence from the literature suggests that the strictness of the law has little to do with whether or not people will commit the crime. For example, some states, capital offences are punishable by death, and I'm not sure we can get much stricter than that. People still commit murder in those countries, even in Indonesia and Singapore that trafficking of drugs is punishable by death people still travel to engage in trafficking of narcotics. What tends to be the aggravating factor is the fact that people can get away with its crime so easily in Tanzania, which is not so that often in the examples I stated above. It's a known fact that most criminals do not get caught, and this can be related to the albino killings in Tanzania as the killers remain invisible.

Robinson & Darley (2004:175) argued that knowledge of the law, ability to factor such knowledge into decision making, and does the perceived cost of non-compliance outweigh the benefit of the criminal actions are key elements in determining whether a stringent law will work in deterring illegal activities or not. There are three key major factors that one should consider before concluding that strict punishment will not deter crime which is relevant to the issue of albino killing in Tanzania. According to Robinson and Darley, one has to consider the probability of being punished or convicted of the crime committed, the heaviness of the punishment as appropriate to the offence committed, and the delay in getting punished (Robinson and Darley, 2004:183-193). In the context of Tanzania, I will argue that stronger law backed with adequate enforcement can deter an individual from committing any unlawful activities but at the same time can't stop it suddenly to very large extent. In another way, the habit of a person is hard to reform but at the same time; it is very much possible to change an offender to a large extent by a different process for example counselling, education, and indoctrinating moral and social value. It may take time and effort to condition them, and it is possible.

Socio-Cultural

Other studies ascertain that the peak in the killings is always felt during the election period (Wesangula, 2015; Martel, 2015; Lugongo, 2015). Politicians approach witchdoctors for Albino charms that would enhance their winning potentials. It is only since 2015 that it has been openly recognised that even many politicians are open to purchasing 'good luck charms' that may include Albino body parts, to boost their chances of winning elections and getting into office (Wesangula, 2015; Martel, 2015; Lugongo, 2015). Additionally, this cause narrative is associated with sports in Tanzania especially football. Executive committees often use a lot of money on charms aimed at bringing in victory for their clubs (Wiete, 2011; Mesaki, 2009).

Another school of thought leans towards the illiterate narrative. According to their beliefs, the killings can be associated with the high illiteracy levels, especially in rural Tanzania. By implication, the main driving forces underlying these profiling crimes are ignorance, illiteracy, myths, and superstitions (Cruz-Inigo et al., 2011:79). Others have suggested that educating the general public and creating awareness on the right of PWAs should be the government's priority (Laccino, 2015:6). To them, most ritualistic murders occur in rural areas characterised by poverty and illiteracy. Such individuals are easily lured in weird practices aimed at alleviating poverty. Moreover, the ignorance

argument can be negated through statistical evidence. Arguably, available statistics indicate that more than 68% of Tanzanians from age 15 and above can comprehend, read and coin a short but simple statement on their daily life (UNESCO, 2013:36).

Furthermore, the political elites, the main patronises that can afford to pay for the body parts, are educated. Though the predominant and commonly quoted narratives on the causes of the ritualistic murders of PWA have been in existence since Tanzania was catapulted into local and international media limelight in 2008, they are insufficient to propose the most efficient solutions. About the social cause narrative, the social constructs of the Tanzania communities call for the extinction of the unknown. In most cases, they deem Albinism as the unknown thus should be exterminated from the society (Ackley, 2010:5; Cruz-Inigo et al., 2011).

Conclusion

The discussion in this chapter centres on the less dominant narratives but equally important to the understanding of the root causes of the attacks and murder of PWAs. First, I presented the economic cause narrative with emphasis on the economic situation the areas that the killings of PWAs are prevalent. The rural areas in the Northern Lake region are in poverty and this serve as motivation for poor fishermen and miners to seek for an alternative way of boosting their business with charms and amulet. It is the same poverty that makes family members sell albino family members. Although the price of albino body parts raise doubt how concrete is the poverty narratives, nevertheless, it helps in getting another perspective from the traditional narrative. I also discuss the lack of enforcement that seems to have given the killers a free pass. While stiff penalties can serve as deterrence, the findings show that it is not always the case as we have seen in many countries where even capital punishment did not stop people committing a crime. The last one is social cultural that speak to different layers of the society from politicians seeking winning of election to sport clubs chasing charms to win matches. Nevertheless, in the next chapter, I bring to the fore, the hybrid and more complex explanation to discuss why the killings of PWAs have been in a continuum state. Therefore, could be relevant in the formulation of a robust intervention program on a short-term as well as long-term

Chapter 5 Alternative Causal Narratives to inform Policy

Introduction

Against the backdrop of the critical analysis of the dominant narratives that political elites, academics, media have used to explain both root causes and solution to the Killings of albinos in Tanzania and Africa as a whole in the last two chapters. This chapter focuses on the alternative casual narratives that might help to inform policy that will address the problem on a short and long term. To do this, I introduced a hybrid of cultural and economic narrative which is embedded in the theory of religion economy, a mixture of Durkheim theory of social facts and beliefs and Camaroff and Camaroff theory of Occult economy. I discuss the influence of this hybrid narrative and how it cut across other narratives. The chapter is, however, divided into four parts. This chapter in the first section briefly discusses the idea of the hybrid casual narrative while the second section explores the key elements of the Religion Economy which is tangled around the demand and supply of religious beliefs as the driver of the killings of PWA. Consequently, there was a surge in the supply side to meet the high demand of religious beliefs which led to massive completion and scam which I will discuss in detail in the third section. The fourth section is where I unpacked the Hybrid to show the possibility of having a workable policy; I supported my argument with Durkheim and Camaroff and Camaroff theories that produced the Hybrid narrative of Religion Economy

The Religious Economy: a Hybrid Causal Narrative

The concept of religious economy depicts religion as a product and those who identify or practice any specific religion as a consumer (Worthman, 2004; Bruce, 1999). The theory helps to unpack the dominant narratives that imply that the witch doctors spread rumours on the magical power linked to PWA bodies. "Theories of religion as a dependent variable break down into demand-side and supply-side models, though economists instinctively combine the two" (McCleary, & Barro, 2006: 49). According to Bankston (2002), religions and religious groups can be described as "competing firms [that vie for] customers who make rational choices among available products "(Bankston, 2002: 311). Adopting the framework of liberal economics for his analysis, Bankston argued that the popularity and acceptance of religions and religious groups' are subject to the laws of demand and supply. Bankston maintained that, just as it is obtainable in a marketplace; the religious consumers are subject to brand recognition, marketing, availability of product, among others. The only difference with other commodities, for example, a computer, is that it addresses individual's beliefs. Although, Bankston argued that, belief or faith deals with ideology and it extend further than what one would typically describe as a market good by stating that: "belief is produced and resides in communicated thoughts, (and) the consumers of goods of faith can only become customers by becoming producers, by participating in interactions of belief" (Bankston, 2002:322).

Religious markets are social creation as the exchange that took place and regulated by the social factor just like any other market. The fundamentals

of social exchanges and interaction such as ethics and norms influence the individual preferences and the religious consumer choices. As a result, rudiments of social interactions influence both the nature of religious goods available in the marketplace to the consumers and the alteration in the consumer demands over the duration of time (Young, 1997). This implies that the more people (consumers) demand a supernatural solution to their problem such as health, poverty, and good luck, the more the witchdoctors (suppliers) will have to devise business strategy for keeping their customers. Therefore, feeding the population thirst for supernatural powers be it magical or prayers which are socially constructed from generations to generations based on myths and cultural beliefs.

Religious Beliefs: Demand and Supply

Africa is the most religious continent in the world with more than 8 out of 10 people indicating that they are religious (M&G Africa, 2015). In Tanzania, 93% of the population maintained that religion is very significant and central in their lives (PEW, 2010:3). Consequently, they look up to those (pastors, imams, witchdoctors and traditional priests) that can offer them spiritual food that will quench their thirst for spiritual needs, which explains the plethora of churches, mosque and traditional shrines in the country. As a result of the Arab and Western Influence of the postcolonial era, the Tanzanian people are left with various personality stemming from diverse cultures, although, a significant fraction of the population is still strongly attached to the indigenous ways of life and beliefs (Andersen et al., 2015:9). In fact, religious beliefs in Tanzania are relatively divided equally into three religions in Tanzania with the indigenous tradition beliefs occupying 35%, Muslims at 35% and the Christians faith held the remaining 30% (Cia.gov, 2015 cited by Andersen et al., 2015:9). However, one should be careful in handling religious statistics in Tanzania because more than half of the Muslim and Christian population combined elements of African traditional religions into their day to day activities. For instance, they hold the belief that their ancestors can offer them protection from harm (PEW, 2010:4).

The Tanzania governments and other actors trying to figure out how to put an end to the PWAs killing deliberately ignore the fact that the demand for “religion” generates a supply of religious goods and services which have created competition among various religious institutions. The Tanzanian government emphasis on witchdoctors as the marketer of good luck charms to solve people problems is misleading. The Christian and Muslim faith have indirectly reinforced the Witchcraft belief that if you encounter difficulties and things don’t work well for you; it must be something supernatural as both religion preach success can only be achieved if the divine being blesses your hand work (Mbogoni, 2013:16). Even PWAs in Tanzania themselves belief that it was a supernatural being (God) that created them with Albinism (Brocco, 2016:10) and not a medical condition. The argument here is not to question whether God or supernatural power exist or not on the one hand. On the other hand, promoting the narratives that witchdoctors are the sole producer of divine healing or fortune telling is tantamount to intellectual suicide. While it has been established and backed with video documentary evidence from BBC and Aljazeera that some witchdoctors promote the use of albino body parts as ingredients of good luck charms and to cure of some other diseases; We should not ignore the factors responsible for these charms or juju to become a prestig-

ious supernatural product that people now crave to possess at all cost. After all, the witch doctors did not seek followership like a pastor that gathered his congregation together for worship, yet people flocked their shrine. He only gives the people what they want, hope and answers that are inconsonant with their thought and thinking.

The demand for the supernatural can be regarded as a practical response to inevitable scarcity, selfish desires, and uncontrollable hope (Kaufmann, 2008: 7). Witchdoctors cannot exist without the support of the people that patronised them. According to (Iannaccone & Berman, 2006), it takes the collective actions of religious consumers and that of religious producers to establish a religious market just as it occurs in other markets. This is because as in other markets, consumers do have the freedom to choose the type of goods or shops they patronise, this freedom of choice constrains the producers of religion. For example, “a “seller” (whether of automobiles or absolution) cannot survive without the steady support of “buyers” (whether money-paying customers, due paying members, contributors and co-workers, or governmental subsidisers)” (Iannaccone & Berman, 2006:5).

For instance, I choose to place my faith in Christianity, my mother’s family background is Muslims and still believe in worshiping ancestors and as devoted Muslims, any misfortune happen to her is directly linked to the anger of ancestors. The implication of my choice to go for the other religion implies one fewer customers on their religious market “witchdoctors and traditional healers”. As far as the social fact is concern, the mysteries existing within folklore are re-created by man, and therefore not something to blame the ancestors for because they are not of primitive origin (Durkheim, 1959). Figuratively, one can argue that the religious trend that considered albinos as supernatural being are debris of past religion which has been resurrected somehow in the contemporary Tanzania. The power to believe what the witch doctors say is embedded in the history of faith that has created a social pressure towards accepting the ideas promoted by the magician (Durkheim, 1959). Without the belief, whatever the witchdoctor presents will be nothing but nonsense to the non-believers of the Traditional religion.

My argument is that if people continue to believe in fortune telling, or that miracle of divine intervention can come to their rescue to secure a job, promotion, win elections, secure contract or finding a good husband or wife when they lack essential qualification for the job or character. All the actions that government put in place to tackle the menace of albino killing will be an effort in futility. The flouting of the government ban of fortune tellers and soothsayers popularly known as Lambalamba by the Traditional Healers and Witchdoctors should be expected when Tanzanians themselves vowed not to stop using their services because o it's their money that they pay for the witchdoctors and not government money (The Citizen, April 28th, 2015). This is a complicated situation; how can the government now deal with a community that insisted their survival is dependent on the use of witch doctors. They maintain a strong stance against the government not to interfere in their personal life. In a village meeting of Chimedili in Bahi District of Dodoma, the spokesman while addressing the press articulated that “we have for years been using witch doctors to solve our problems, our lives depend on their services and therefore we will keep on seeking their services” (The Citizen, April 28th, 2015). This type of reaction was shared across the Nation when the govern-

ment announced the ban, especially in the region where Traditional beliefs occupied the dominant space of religious practices. One could now start to show concern what else do the government have to do.

Customer Competition and Religious Scams

Religious groups compete for believers' same way that businesses compete for customers, and people will have to search for the one that suits their belief in the same manner that they shop for other goods and services (Chiswick, 2010: 9). This explained why a significant number of people in the country, practice more than one religion. The Pew Research Center survey of Christianity and Islam in 23 Sub-Saharan Africa revealed that 60% of Tanzanians believe in the protective power of juju (charms or amulets), keep sacred objects such as animal skins and skulls in their homes and participate in ceremonies to honour their ancestors and visit traditional religious healers in a situation their family fall sick (PEW, 2010:4). A recent study conducted in Mwanza by Signe Hawley on health and education among the young people is a critical example of why the business of witchdoctor is a lucrative one. According to Signe Hawley (2014:50), people make use of churches and the witchdoctors to address their problems apart from making use of the hospital. They visit the witchdoctors for medicine to alleviate poverty, disease of love incurable disease, being bewitched, mental disturbances, demons and possessed by ancestors. While they visit churches for advice, cast out demons, deal with life hardship, the secure remedy for incurable and chronic disease, acquire spiritual knowledge among others. This finding is an eye opener to the competition among religious institution in Tanzania; they offer similar services to the population.

Apparently, the witch doctors are not only in competition with fellow witch doctors; they are in competition with the Christianity institution that offers the same type of services they claimed to provide for the masses. Success in the business now depends on how you can improvise and convince the customers seeking for a solution that your products is the best. The consumer (Tanzanians) preferences, therefore, determine the content (the type of services) the religious institutions (Christianity, Islam, traditional) offer them. Normally, in a highly competitive environment, religions have little choice but to abandon inefficient modes of production and unpopular products in favour of more attractive and profitable alternatives (Iannaccone & Berman, 2006:5). Unfortunately, the religious market in Tanzania did not offer different products, the most valuable products is fortune telling, supernatural healing.

The implication of this for a country where 93% of her population believe in supernatural (Oestigaard, 2015:182) is that it creates a platform where fraudsters and conmen take advantage of the desperate needs of people for an explanation of their problems. With this kind of drive for supernatural healing, it is not a surprise that there are over 80,000 registered Traditional healers (75,000 in Mainland and 5,000 in Zanzibar) in Tanzania (Mtambalike, 2014). Unfortunately, people cannot differentiate from genuine alternative treatment and sorcerers that claim to be traditional healers or witchdoctors in the same manner they cannot differentiate real from fake pastors. We have seen pastors that instructed their congregation to eat grass (Riley, 2014), live snakes, and drink petrol (Thornhill, 2014) for supernatural healing and to be closer to God. Or those that claimed their legs must not be on the ground when preaching;

therefore standing on congregation members back while they kneel down is the only way his congregation can receive their miracles. It will be equal to intellectual laziness to generalise that all pastors are fetish, fake, scammers for the sake of few frauds that bring shame and disrepute to the Christian faith.

Just like thousands of people believed in these false pastors, is the same way we have thousands that believed in these fake witchdoctors and traditional healers. I am aware many critics will want to associate this fact with ignorance and lack of education, I will advise them to visit these churches or witchdoctors, and they will realise that doctors and lawyers are members of the congregation as well as frequent customers of the witchdoctors. A typical example is that of retired Lutheran pastor from Samunge village in Loliondo district Arusha Tanzania who used the name of God to propagate miracle healing, and some people lost their lives as they ignored their previous medication.

Relevance to Policy Formulation

The various recommendations proposed by different actors both International and domestic have proven to be insufficient in dealing with the problem that PWAs are facing in Tanzania about their safety. Some of the recommendation includes banning of witchdoctors and witchcrafts, more focus on education, heavy punitive measures such as death penalty for offenders among others. Nonetheless, it will take more than stiff sentencing, banning of witchdoctors, and massive campaign awareness to put an end to superstitious beliefs (Dave-Odigie, 2010: 73) in a country where 93% believe in the supernatural myth that influences good luck and ill fortune regardless of the tribe or religion. It is, therefore, easy for Tanzanians to accept the rumours that speak to their beliefs hook line and sinker without questioning, therefore allowing rumours to become a social fact. After all, there is a popular quote attributed to Vladimir Lenin that suggests that “A lie told often enough becomes the truth”. According to Masquelier (2000:90), rumours can be described as dynamic stories “[...] and spin off each other like many-headed hydras to simultaneously inform and confound listeners and to become more entangled as they spread and multiply” (Masquelier 2000: 90). Rumours are persistently reinvented and reinterpreted, catering to domestic needs that offer an explanation of the seemingly difficult situation, thus giving people the inkling to (re)gain control over perceived obscured circumstances (Dilger, 2005 cited in Schühle, 2013:5). The moment the rumour about the potency of albino body parts become a social fact, from Durkheim argument, even when an individual leaves the society it doesn't change because social fact existence is independent of an individual (Allan, 2005:105). The only plausible way to counter such social facts is to produce other facts that will replace them.

In the context of Mwanza region and its provinces, the negative beliefs about the potency of albino in their quest for supernatural breakthrough can be best demystified if programs of intervention are designed to debunk the widespread negative beliefs of albino that was created by rumours. The policy should focus on comprehensive development programs that can be used to address the unexplainable circumstances that make people believe that supernatural power is responsible for their success or misfortune. For example, the local miners and fishermen have been said to be the major group of people that seek albino portion to boost their yield or gold return from the mining. It is not enough to organised sensitization program on why albino portion will

not offer them success in the fishing and mining business they are doing; it will not replace whatever they have in their mind. “Only by addressing the uncertainties faced by people working in the fishing and mining industries will it be possible to prevent such murders in the future” (Schühle, 2013:3). To address these uncertainties, the government can offer modern day technological mining equipment to the local miners as an experiment. The result of using sophisticated mining equipment is enough to convince those that beliefs in supernatural as a panacea to success. Taking into consideration the Occult Economy scenario postulated by Comaroff and Comaroff (1999:297), an escalation in the ritualistic murders of PWAs is associated with income, economic and social-cultural factors. From Comaroff and Comaroff point of view, the effect of income shock highlights the economic motivations as the basis for the ritualistic killings. As such, negative income shocks experienced in some communities increase the rate of the murders. This allows the killers to justify their actions both to themselves and the communities.

Be that as it may, it is important to stress that no evidence shows such superstitious beliefs promoting the use of albino body parts for good luck charms or fortune exist in the history of Sukuma Land and the Northern region as a whole (Schühle, 2013:3). The beliefs associated to the usefulness of albino parts were imported through rumours. Nevertheless, superstitious beliefs in supernatural power spread by rumours is nothing new; it is a common trend in nearly all society in the world. However, technological advancement and scientific facts have demystified such beliefs in most developed countries especially the in the West. According to Barber (2011:319), if religion offers psychological succour to uncertainty for a lot of people, then “religious belief would be expected to decline in modern societies that enjoy greater existential security due to increased ability to prevail over the hostile forces of nature (e.g., predators, hunger, inclement weather, diseases)” (Barber, 2011:319). This explains why the citizens of the developed countries are less religious because life is much easier with better science and therefore make a demand for religion as goods less attractive.

Therefore, it is highly imperative for the government to focus more on developing the region with modern day infrastructure such as hospitals, materials that will increase agricultural (Tractors, fertilisers, for example) produces, modern boats and fishing nets among others. Although, critiques might argue that technological advancement and education does not guarantee that people will abandon their beliefs in supernatural. After all, the Government of Iceland a developed country have to appease the Elves before a road construction was successful (France-Presse, 2016), and the District Commissioner in Tanzania have to offer sacrifice before an Electrification project was successful Chema, Dodoma (Mwananchi, 2014). Nevertheless, the argument of a highly educated individual holding superstitious beliefs did not negate the fact that science has been tested and proven to be responsible for a broad range of beliefs in supernatural. The beauty of religion economy narratives is that it helps to reconcile the traditional/cultural and economic narratives together in one basket. For example, poor fishermen and miners that don't believe in supernatural power will not seek supernatural intervention, so it helps in understanding that despite the fact that they reinforced each other, one come first, which is the beliefs. The implication of this is that policy programs have to attack the problem from the source. Apart from using science to demystify the beliefs, the witch-

doctors and religious leader are in a better position to in demystifying the murderous ideas of PWAs for their body parts. Without the help of witchdoctors, the government stands no chance of winning the battle against criminals that are engaged in the trade of body parts (Igwe, 2015). On the contrary, the government, the political elites and the media see and treat traditional healers and witchdoctors as adversaries in the campaign against albino killing and other superstition-based atrocities in the country. They were stigmatised as forces of darkness; I just don't understand how over 100,000 registered witchdoctors and traditional healers can be packed inside the same box of few criminals. Igwe maintained that rather than criminalising and persecuting witchdoctors and traditional healers, the government ought to tap into the invaluable resources and potentials of Traditional healers in the campaign because nobody else is in the better position to the irrational and absurd nature of the belief in the magical power of albino skin.

Conclusion

The nitty-gritty of this chapter is on the emergence of complex alternative narrative that opens the discussion around the demand and supply of religious goods. The discussion in this chapter shows that poverty and economic factor might push people to seek alternative solution to address their economic predicament, it is however based on the fact that such people more first belief in supernatural solution before consulting a witch doctor for remedy. However, supernatural and superstitious beliefs are embedded in consistent rumours that eventually take the form of social fact passed from generations to generations; the only way to counter such beliefs is through comprehensive development programs of intervention that will address people uncertainties and inexplicable problem that modern science already have answers too. The example of making of supporting local miners with sophisticated mining machinery to prove to them that it is only technology that can boost their business and not in any form of juju and amulet to get gold.

Chapter 6 Conclusion

The fact that most studies have capitalized on the arrest of witchdoctors and education of the public on albinism, they have created a knowledge gap on the need to customize solutions to the underlying social, political, and economic cause narratives. This study aims to bridge that gap by deconstructing the existing cause narratives through an in-depth analysis of social, political and economic cause narratives. Customized solutions are however, beyond the scope of this study. The study only aims at providing the foundation upon which the solutions will be hypothesized. To deconstruct the dominant narratives, we must first identified them first, therefore a research question that seek to identify the dominant narratives around the root causes of in the killings of PWAs in Tanzania between 2007 and 2015 was asked. The findings revealed that witchcraft and cultural prejudice remain the primary causal narrative as well as the failures to implement the law that can will serve as deterrence to the to those that are appears to be unhindered in committing this heinous crime. Also, poverty which is embedded in the economic factor is considered as the main cause behind the killings.

However, the findings of this study did not only identify dominant narratives but also come up with a hybrid that is all encompassing with elements of in terms of all the narratives so far. Theory of Religion Economy comprises of elements from the dominant and less dominants narratives, the cultural/religion and the economic explanation in the rise in killings of PWAs. It also examines how introduction the new discovered narrative and others different narratives, more complex ones which are multi-causal might help tackle the problem in practice by making more realistic policy options visible. I argued that without the demand for supernatural power for wealth, the witch doctors are not going to be in Business, It is expected that the more people (consumers) demand supernatural solution to their problem such as health, poverty, and good luck, the more the witchdoctors (suppliers) will have to device business strategy for keeping their customers. Beliefs, however, are not something that just occurs in an instance, most of it starts as a rumour which is continuous, reinvented, and reinterpreted until it occupies a status of social fact. And the moment a rumour hold such status; it doesn't change unless it is countered with another fact. The only fact that can demystify supernatural beliefs is science and technology advancement as evidence in the developed country. I proposed that government should endeavour to design programs that will challenge the beliefs of the miners and fishermen alleged to be the primary patrons of witchdoctors and users of magical portion made of albino parts, and this can be best achieved if they offer are offer or supported with modern day equipment that can make life better for them. I also argued that the best option is for the governments to see the witchdoctors as partners as this study as revealed that those that perpetrate the evil machinations against the PWAs are fake, scammers and criminals. Rather than criminalising witchdoctors and painting them with the same brush of backwardness and evil, the government stand a better chance of communicating to the citizens .through a channel that they revered as supreme based on power relations.

References

- Ackley, C., 2010. The Fetishization of Albinos in Tanzania. [Online] (Updated 1 Dec. 2010) Available at <http://www.underthesamesun.com/sites/default/files/The%20Fetishization%20of%20Albinos%20in%20Tanzania.pdf> > [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Adichie, C. (2009). The danger of a single story. *TED Ideas worth spreading*. http://b.3cdn.net/ascend/2029fab7aa68da3f31_jqm6bn6lz.pdf
- Allan, K. (2005). *Explorations in classical sociological theory: Seeing the social world*. Pine Forge Press
- Alum, A., Gomez, M. and Ruiz, E., (2009). *Hocus Pocus, witchcraft, and murder: The plight of Tanzanian Albinos*. Chicago: Northwestern University of Law.
- Andersen, M.G, Wendt, M.B, Autrup, K, Ndigaye, R.F (2015). The White African Burden: A Case Study of Social Stigma and Its Consequences for Albinos in Tanzania. <http://rudar.ruc.dk/bitstream/1800/26828/1/Group%20%232%20-%20White%20African's%20Burden%20-%20122.121%20characters.pdf>
- Bacchi, C. (2012). Introducing the “What’s the Problem Represented to be?” Approach. *Engaging with Carol Bacchi: Strategic interventions and exchanges*, 21-24.
- Barber, N. (2011). A cross-national test of the uncertainty hypothesis of religious belief. *Cross-Cultural Research*, 45(3), 318-333.
- Bankston III, C. L. (2002). Rationality, choice and the religious economy: the problem of belief. *Review of Religious Research*, 311-325.
- BBC News., (2008). Man tried to sell albino wife. [Online] (Updated 13 Nov. 2008) Available at <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/africa/7726743.stm>> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- BBC News., (2009). Tanzanians to name albino killers. [Online] (Updated 2 March 2009) Available at: <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/africa/7918960.stm>> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- BBC(2015). Tanzania albino murders: 'More than 200 witchdoctors' arrested <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-africa-31849531>
- Beck, A. (1979). The traditional healer in Tanzania. Issue: *A Journal of Opinion*, 9(3), 2-5
- Blakemore, C and Jennett, S (2001). "Witch doctor." *The Oxford Companion to the Body*. Retrieved August 27, 2016 from Encyclopedia.com: <http://www.encyclopedia.com/doc/1O128-witchdoctor.html>
- Bryceson, D., Jonsson, J. and Sherrington, R., (2010). ‘Miners’ magic: artisanal mining, the albino fetish and murder in Tanzania. *Journal of Modern African Studies*, 48(3): pp. 353-382
- Brehony, E., Mesaki, S., Moshia, R., & Sakafu, O. (2008). Tackling beliefs to achieve development: the case of witchcraft in rural Tanzania. *Eastern Africa Journal of Development Studies*, 1(2), 105-114.
- Bruce, S. (1999). *Choice and religion: A critique of rational choice theory*. Oxford University Press on Demand.
- Brocco, G. (2016). Albinism, stigma, subjectivity and global-local discourses in Tanzania. *Anthropology & Medicine*, 1-15.

- Bryceson, D. F., Jönsson, J. B., & Sherrington, R., (2010). Miners' magic: artisanal mining, the albino fetish and murder in Tanzania. *The Journal of Modern African Studies*, 48(3): pp. 353-382.
- Buchana, E (2015) Tanzania death penalty for suspects in albino murder to 'serve as an example' <http://www.ibtimes.co.uk/tanzania-death-penalty-suspects-albino-murder-serve-example-1490828>
- Burke, J., (2013). Media framing of violence against Tanzanians with albinism in the Great Lakes region: A matter of culture, crime, poverty and human rights. *Australasian Review of African Studies*, 34(2): pp.57-77
- Burke, J., Kaijage, T. J., & John-Langba, J. (2014). Media Analysis of Albino Killings in Tanzania: A Social Work and Human Rights Perspective. *Ethics and Social Welfare*, 8(2): pp. 117-134
- Burke, J., & Ngonyani, B. (2004). A Social Work Vision for Tanzania. *International Social Work*, 47 (1): pp.39– 52.
- Chirangi, M. M. (2013). *Afya Jumuishi: towards interprofessional collaboration between traditional and modern medical practitioners in the Mara Region of Tanzania*. LEAD Programme-the National Herbarium of the Netherlands of Leiden University, Faculty of Science, Leiden University
- Chiswick, C. U. (2010). Economics and religion. <http://ftp.iza.org/dp4868.pdf>
- Comaroff, J., & Comaroff, J. L., (1999). Occult economies and the violence of abstraction: Notes from the South African postcolony. *American ethnologist*, 26(2): pp.279-303.
- Cowell, A., (2015). Fears Persist That Violence against Albinos in Tanzania Will Grow. *New York Times*. [Online] (Updated 20 Feb. 2015). Available at: http://www.nytimes.com/2015/02/21/world/africa/fears-persist-that-violence-against-albinos-in-tanzania-will-grow.html?_r=0 [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Creswell, J. W., (2009). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approach (3rd ed.)*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage
- Cruz-Inigo, A. E., Ladizinski, B., & Sethi, A., (2011). Albinism in Africa: stigma, slaughter and awareness campaigns. *Dermatologic clinics*, 29(1): pp.79-87.
- Dave-Odigie, C. P., (2010). Albino Killings in Tanzania: Implications for Security. *Peace Studies Journal*, 3(1): pp. 68-75
- Doob, A. N., & Webster, C. M. (2003). Sentence severity and crime: Accepting the null hypothesis. *Crime and justice*, 143-195
- Doolan, D. M., & Froelicher, E. S., (2009). Using an existing data set to answer new research questions: A methodological review. *Research and Theory for Nursing Practice: An International Journal*, 23(3): pp. 203-215
- Durkheim, E. (1959). *The Elementary Forms of the Religious Life [1912]*. na.
- Essien, A. M & Ben, V. E., (2010). New paradigm in witchcraft issues: A strategic procedure for sustainable development in Nigeria. *American Journal of Social and Management Sciences*, 2(1): pp. 47 – 55
- Ebhomele (2015) Families Sell Albinos to Ritualist. Premium Times <http://www.premiumtimesnews.com/2015/01/28/families-sell-albinos-to-ritualists/>
- Evans-Pritchard, E. E. (2010). The notion of witchcraft explains unfortunate events. *Good, Byron J. et al. (Hg.): A Reader in Medical Anthropology. Theoretical Trajectories, Emergent Realities*. Malden: Wiley-Blackwell, 18-25
- Ezzy, D. (2006). White witches and black magic: Ethics and consumerism in contemporary witchcraft. *Journal of Contemporary Religion*, 21(1), 15-31.

- France-Press (2016). Iceland unearths rock to appease angry elves. The Telegraph, UK. <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2016/08/30/iceland-uncarths-rock-to-appease-angry-elves/>
- Foxcroft, G. (2009). Witchcraft Accusations: A Protection Concern for UNHCR and the Wider Humanitarian Community?. *Stepping Stones Nigeria*. <http://www.experts.com>
- Geleta, G. & Keita, S., (2009). Advocacy Report: Through Albino Eyes – The Plight of Albino People in Africa's Great Lakes Region and a Red Cross Response. *International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies*. [Online] (Updated 2009). Available at: <http://www.ifrc.org/Global/Publications/general/177800-Albinos-Report-EN.pdf> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Gettleman, J., (2008). Albinos, Long Shunned, Face Threat in Tanzania. *The New York Times*. [Online] (Updated 13 March 2015). Available at: <http://www.nytimes.com/2008/06/08/world/africa/08albino.html?_r=0> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Gilgof, D (2013)As Tanzania's Albino Killings Continue, Unanswered Questions Raise Fears. National Geographic. <http://news.nationalgeographic.com/news/2013/10/131011-albino-killings-witch-doctors-tanzania-superstition/>
- Goodwin, S. (2011). policy as discourse policy analysis discourse analysis Analysing Policy policy as Discourse: Methodological Advances in Policy Analysis analysis policy as discourse discourse policy as. In *Methodological choice and design* (pp. 167-180). Springer Netherlands
- Gulati, G. J., (2011). News Frames and Story Triggers in the Media's Coverage of Human Trafficking. *Human Rights Review*, 12 (3): 363 –379
- Heaton, J., (2008). Secondary analysis of qualitative data: An overview. *Historical Social Research*, 33(3): pp. 33-45
- Henderson, L. (2016). Darkness Visible. In *Witchcraft and Folk Belief in the Age of Enlightenment* (pp. 126-149). Palgrave Macmillan UK
- Hong, E., Zeeb H., & Repacholi, M. (2006). Albinism in Africa as a public health issue. *BMC Public Health* 6: pp. 210–16
- Huffington Post., (2012). 3,000 Lynched In Tanzania For 'Witchcraft' In Past Six Years. [Online] (Updated 29 May 2012). Available at: <http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2012/05/29/tanzania-witchcraft-3000-lynchings-witches_n_1553448.html> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Ikuomola, A.D., (2015). 'We thought we will be safe here': Narratives of Tanzanian Albinos in Kenya and South-Africa. *African Research Review*, 9(4): pp. 37-54
- Iannaccone, L. R., & Berman, E. (2006). Religious extremism: The good, the bad, and the deadly. *Public Choice*, 128(1-2), 109-129.
- Iannaccone, L. R. (1995). Voodoo economics? Reviewing the rational choice approach to religion. *Journal for the scientific study of religion*, 76-88
- Iannaccone, L. R., Finke, R., & Stark, R. (1997). Deregulating religion: The economics of church and state. *Economic Inquiry*, 35(2), 350-364.
- IBTimes (2015a). Albinism in Tanzania: Witchcraft-fuelled persecution leads to mutilation and murder. International Business Times <http://www.ibtimes.co.uk/albino-tanzania-witchcraft-fuelled-persecution-leads-mutilation-murder>
- IBTimes (2015b). Tanzanian albino children mutilated for witchcraft receive treatment in the US [Photo report]. International Business Times.

- <http://www.ibtimes.co.uk/tanzanian-albino-children-mutilated-witchcraft-receive-treatment-us-photo-report-1521959#>
- Igwe, L. (2012). Ritual killing and human sacrifice in Africa. *International Humanist and Ethical Union*
- Igwe, L. (2015) Will Arresting 'Witchdoctors' Stop Albino Killings in Tanzania? <http://web.randi.org/swift/will-arresting-witchdoctors-stop-albino-killings-in-tanzania>
- Jangu, M. H. (2012). *Healing environmental harms: Social change and Sukuma traditional medicine on Tanzania's extractive frontier* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Michigan).
- Kalan, J. (2012). On The Road to See Tanzania's Miracle Healer <http://matadornetwork.com/notebook/in-search-of-tanzanias-miracle-healer/>
- Kaufmann, E. (2008). Human development and the demography of secularization in global perspective. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Research on Religion*, 4
- Kibuga, K. F., & Dianga, A. (2006). Victimization and killing of older women: witchcraft in Magu district, Tanzania. *Southern African Journal of Gerontology*, 9(2), 29-32.
- Laccino, L., (2015). UN condemns 'vicious' killings of albinos in Tanzania and Malawi. *International Business Time*. [Online] (Updated 13 March 2015). Available at: <<http://www.ibtimes.co.uk/un-condemns-vicious-killings-albinos-tanzania-malawi-1491728>> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Laing, A., (2015). Tanzania bans witchdoctors after albino murders. *The Telegraph*. [Online] (Updated 14 Jan. 2015). Available at: <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/africaandindianocean/tanzania/11346273/Tanzania-banswitchdoctors-after-albino-murders.html> Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Liao, Y., (2010). The "walking dead": Tanzania's trade in the body parts of albino people. *Upstream Journal*. [Online] (Updated May 2010). Available at: <<http://www.upstreamjournal.org/2010/05/tanzanias-albino-people/>> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Lugira, A. M. (2009). African traditional religion. Infobase Publishing
- Lugongo, B., (2015). Politicians Killing Albinos. *The Citizen*. [Online] (Updated 28 May 2016). Available at: <<http://www.thecitizen.co.tz/News/-Politicians-killing-albinos-/-/1840340/2732014/-/5hww9jz/-/index.html>> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Marcus, L. (2015). Interaction rituals and co-presence: Linking humans to humans in space syntax theory. In *Proceedings of the Tenth International Space Syntax Symposium*. London: UCL Space Syntax Laboratory
- Magobe, T. R., (2008). Superstitious albino killings in Tanzania must stop. *Ground Report*. [Online] (Updated 12 May 2008). Available at: <<http://www.groundreport.com/Opinion/Superstitious-Albino-Killings-in-Tanzania-MustSto/2860945>> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Makulilo, E. B., (2010). Albino killings in Tanzania: Witchcraft and Racism? [Online] (Updated 25 Sep. 2010). Available at: <http://www.academia.edu/Documents/in/Albino_killings_and_media_coverage> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Malone, A., (2009). The albino tribe butchered to feed a gruesome trade in 'magical' body parts. *Daily Mail Online*. [Online] (Updated 25 Sep. 2009). Available at: <<http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-1215949/The>

- albino-tribe-butchered-feed-gruesome-trade-magical-body-parts.html>
[Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Manala, M. J., (2004). Witchcraft and its impact on black African Christians: A lacuna in the ministry of the Hervormde Kerk in Suidelike Afrika. *HTS Theological Studies*, 60(4): pp. 1491 –1511
- Martel, A., (2015). Tanzania Warns Politicians: Witchcraft Using Albino Body Parts Will Not Win You Elections. *Breitbart*. [Online] (Updated 3 June 2015). Available at: <<http://www.breitbart.com/national-security/2015/06/03/tanzanian-warns-politicians-albino-body-part-witchcraft-will-not-win-you-elections/>> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Masanja, M. M., (2015). Albinos' Plight: Will Legal Methods be Powerful Enough To Eradicate Albinos' Scourge? *International Journal of Education and Research*, 3 (5): pp. 231-243
- Masquelier, A. (2000). Of headhunters and cannibals: migrancy, labor, and consumption in the Mawri imagination. *Cultural Anthropology*, 15(1), 84-126.
- McCleary, R. M., & Barro, R. J. (2006). Religion and economy. *The Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 20(2), 49-72
- Mesaki, S., (2008). Albinism: Rejection, stigmatization and poverty. [Online] (Updated 14 Jan. 2008). Available at: <<http://216.69.164.44/ipp/observer/2008/04/20/112771.html>> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Mesaki, S. (1993). Witchcraft and Witch-Killings in Tanzania Paradox and Dilemma (Doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota).
- Mesaki, S., (2009). Witchcraft and the law in Tanzania. *International Journal of Sociology and Anthropology*, 1(8): pp.132 – 138
- Miguel, E., (2005). Poverty and Witch Killing. *Review of Economic Studies*, 72: pp.1153–1172
- Mfumbusa, F. B. (1999). Witch killings: Tanzania's silent holocaust. Africa News. http://web.peacelink.it/afrinews/39_issue/p7.html
- Mtambalike, K. (2014) Regulating traditions <http://www.dandc.eu/en/article/kilasa-mtambalike-traditional-healers-are-popular-tanzania-supposed-register-practicing>
- M&G Africa (13th April, 2015) No surprises here—Africa is the most religious continent; but new friend China isn't. <http://mgafrica.com/article/2015-04-13-no-surprises-here-africa-is-the-most-religious-continent-but-who-isnt-is>
- MWANANCHI (2010). Ushirikina wa nini katika biashara? <http://www.mwananchi.co.tz/habari/1597578-1598866-hojt5x/index.html>
- MWANANCHI (2014a). TAMBIKO: DC atoa kafara kuokoa miradi ya umeme, maji <http://www.mwananchi.co.tz/habari/TAMBIKO--DC-atoa-kafara-kuokoa-miradi-ya-umeme--maji/1597578-2394036-12yu9dq/index.html>.
- MWANANCHI (2014b). Albino auawa, wauaji watoweka na viungo <http://www.mwananchi.co.tz/habari/Albino-auawa--wauaji-watoweka-na-viungo/1597578-2313830-4ytlw2z/index.html>.
- National Bureau of Statistics (NBS) and Office of Chief Government Statistician (OCGS), Zanzibar (2014). *The 2012 Population and Housing Census: Basic Demographic and Socio- Economic Profile; Key Findings*. Dar es Salaam, Tanzania: NBS and OCGS. Available at

http://nbs.go.tz/nbs/takwimu/census2012/Basic_Demographic_and_Socio-Economic_Profile_PopularVersion-KeyFindings_2012_PHC_EnglishVersion.pdf, (Accessed on 14th May, 2016)

- Ng'wanakilala, F., (2015). Group killing albinos for witch craft in Tanzania arrested. *Las Vegas Review Journal*. [Online] (Updated 6 March 2015). Available at: <<http://www.reviewjournal.com/news/nation-and-world/group-killing-albinos-witch-craft-tanzania-arrested>> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Nyabwari, B. G. & Kagema, D. N., (2014). The Impact of Magic and Witchcraft in the Social, Economic, Political and Spiritual Life of African Communities. *International Journal of Humanities Social Sciences and Education*, 1(5): pp.9-18
- Oestigaard, T. (2015). Witchcraft, witch killings and Christianity: The works of religion and parallel cosmologies in Tanzania. *Looking back, looking ahead*, 182.
- Onyulo, T (2015). Witch hunts increase in Tanzania as albino deaths jump. USA Today
<http://www.usatoday.com/story/news/world/2015/02/26/tanzania-witchcraft/23929143/>
- Parrinder, E. G. (1963). *Witchcraft: European and African*. Faber and Faber
- Paternoster, R. (2010). How much do we really know about criminal deterrence?. *The Journal of Criminal Law and Criminology*, 765-824
- PEW Research Center (2010) Tolerance and Tension: Islam and Christianity in Sub-Saharan Africa.
<http://www.pewforum.org/2010/04/15/executive-summary-islam-and-christianity-in-sub-saharan-africa/>
- Red Cross (2009). Through Albino Eyes: the plight of albino people in Africa's Great Lakes Region and a Red Cross response. *Geneva: International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies*.
- Riley, J (2014). Lawn again Christians: South African preacher makes congregation eat GRASS to 'be closer to God'. Daily Mail Uk.
<http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-2537053/Lawn-Christians-South-African-preacher-makes-congregation-eat-GRASS-closer-God.html>
- Robinson, P. (2001). Theorizing the influence of media on world politics models of media influence on foreign policy. *European Journal of Communication*, 16(4), 523-544.
- Robinson, P. H., & Darley, J. M. (2004). Does criminal law deter? A behavioural science investigation. *oxford Journal of Legal studies*, 24(2), 173-205.
- Russell, J. B. (1972). *Witchcraft in the middle ages*. Cornell University Press.
- Robinson, P. H., & Darley, J. M. (2004). Does criminal law deter? A behavioural science investigation. *oxford Journal of Legal studies*, 24(2), 173-205.
- Schnoebelen, J. (2009). *Witchcraft allegations, refugee protection and human rights: A review of the evidence*. UNHCR, Policy Development and Evaluation Service.
- Schühle, J., (2013). Medicine murder of people with albinism in Tanzania—how casino capitalism creates rumorscapes and occult economies. *CAS Working Paper Series No. 2/2013*.
- Semkwiji, D., (2009). The plight of Albino in Tanzania: What should be done? *The Economic and Social Research Foundation*. [Online] (Updated 2009).

- Available at: <[http://esrf.or.tz/docs/ALBINO_POLICYBRIEF_04-2009%20\(2\).PDF](http://esrf.or.tz/docs/ALBINO_POLICYBRIEF_04-2009%20(2).PDF)> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Signe Hawley, K (2014). Hospitals, Witch Doctors and Churches Urban young people's perspectives on health education and services in Mwanza, Tanzania. Universite Van Amsterdam, Master Thesis. <https://educationanddevelopment.files.wordpress.com/2013/11/signe-hawley-thesis2-compressed.pdf>
- Simon, B., (2016). UN expert questions 'witchcraft' as cause of rising albino violence. *Digital Journal*. [Online] (Updated 8 March 2016). Available at: <http://www.digitaljournal.com/news/world/un-expert-questions-witchcraft-as-cause-of-rising-albino-violence/article/459594>> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Smith, E. (2008). *Using secondary data in educational and social research*. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill Education
- Smith, D (2015). Tanzania bans witchdoctors in attempt to end albino killings. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/jan/14/tanzania-bans-witchdoctors-attempt-end-albino-killings>
- Tanner, R., (2010). Ideology and the killing of albinos in Tanzania: A study in cultural relativities. *Anthropologist*, 12(4): pp.229-236.
- Tembo, M. (1993). *The witchdoctors are not wrong: The future role and impact of African psychology on individual well-being*. publisher not identified. <http://people.bridgewater.edu/~mtembo/menu/articles/WitchcraftPaper.pdf>
- The Citizen (April, 2015). Villagers vow to use witchdoctors <http://www.thecitizen.co.tz/News/Villagers-vow-to-use-witchdoctors/-/1840340/2699524/-/vw6ms2/-/index.html>
- The Citizen (2016) Penalize Albino Killers <http://www.thecitizen.co.tz/News/1840340-3270800-knre1ez/index.html>
- The Independents (2010). Kenyan jailed for trying to sell albino in Tanzania. <http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/africa/kenyan-jailed-for-trying-to-sell-albino-in-tanzania-2057770.html>
- Thornhill, T. (2014). First he had his congregation eating grass to make them 'close to God', now controversial South African preacher makes his flock drink PETROL <http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-2794275/first-congregation-eating-grass-make-close-god-controversial-south-african-preacher-makes-flock-drink-petrol.html>
- Thuku, M., (2011). Myths, discrimination, and the call for special rights for persons with albinism in sub-Saharan Africa. *Amnesty International editorial review on Special Programme on Africa*.
- Trudell, K., (2015). Tanzania Bans Witch Doctors in Effort to Stop Gristly Albino Mutilations. *Inquisitr*. [Online] (Updated 14 Jan. 2015). Available at: <<http://www.inquisitr.com/1755223/tanzania-bans-witch-doctors-in-effort-to-stop-gristlyalbino-mutilations/>> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- UNESCO., (2013). Adult and Youth Literacy: National, regional and global trends, 1985-2015. *UIS Information Paper*. [Online] (Updated June 2015). Available at: <<http://www.uis.unesco.org/Education/Documents/literacy-statistics-trends-1985-2015.pdf>> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- UN (2016). Action on Albinism in Africa Consultative Forum, Outcome Report.

<http://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/Albinism/Pages/AlbinismInAfrica.aspx>

- Under The Same Sun (2013). *History of Attacks against Persons with Albinism* (PWA) July 15. <http://www.underthesamesun.com/sites/default/files/History%20of%20Attacks%20against%20PWA.pdf>
- Uromi, S. M. (2014). Violence against persons with albinism and older women: Tackling witchcraft accusations in Tanzania. *Cell*, 782, 503638.
- Van den Haag, E., & Conrad, J. P. (2013). *The death penalty: A debate*. Springer Science & Business Media
- Wan, N., (2003). Orange in a World of Apples: The Voices of Albinism. *Disability & Society*, 18 (3): 277 – 296
- Wesangula, D., (2015). Albinos in Tanzania fear death as polls near. *Mail & Guardian*. [Online] (Updated 15 May 2015). Available at: <<http://mg.co.za/article/2015-05-14-albinos-in-tanzania-fear-death-as-polls-near/>> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Wiete, W., (2011). Life of albinos in East Africa threatened: A most bizarre and dramatic consequence of having a skin color disease. *Color Foundation*. [Online] (Updated 15 May 2011). Available at: <<https://colorfoundation.wordpress.com/2008/12/04/life-of-albinos-in-east-africa-threatened-a-most-bizarre-and-dramatic-consequence-of-having-a-skin-color-disease/>> [Accessed 10 April 2016]
- Wortham, R. A. (2004). Religious Choices and Preferences: North Carolina's Baskin Robbins Effect?. *Sociation Today*, 2(1).

Appendices

Appendix A: Screen Shots of some of the Media Narratives

Appendix B: Action on Albinism in Africa Consultative Forum

Actors Responsible	Measures
Government, NGO, Academia,Media	<p><u>Short term:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Research in situation, involving local, traditional and religious leaders on albinism; as well as training with them on root causes • Continuous research on the root causes of attacks at all levels, including academic • Continuous advocacy and sensitization on the scientific aspects of albinism • Combat witchcraft practice; a root cause of attacks: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Legislation should not validate or give legal character to the phenomena of witchcraft ○ Laws banning witchcraft accusations should be upheld in this intent ○ Criminal Law should expand provisions of murder, abduction, kidnapping, grave robberies and other relevant crimes to include built-in aggravating factors such as the intent to use a victim's body parts for witchcraft purposes where the facts support such intent ○ Traditional medicine should be delineated and regulated under separate legislative instrument. Practitioners should be registered and oversight by government activated through monitoring mechanisms such as revocable licenses, periodic inspection of work and self-regulation boards accountable to national law. ○ Thorough and sustained awareness raising on the social harm caused by witchcraft should be undertaken ○ Research on the use of body parts of persons with albinism should be conducted, including understanding of the underlying myths or reasons, the regions where such myths are widespread, and the origin and spreading pattern of such myths. ○ Undertake investigative research to find root causes of attacks, locate markets for body parts including cross-border trade as well as perpetrators and end-users of body parts of persons with albinism • Address poverty by ensuring access to services for communities at local level.
	<p><u>Medium term:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continuous advocacy and sensitization; • Sensitization of traditional and religious leaders on the impact of certain beliefs and practices • Legal support for persons with albinism • Address poverty using the principles of the UN sustainable development goals (SDGs) which aims to “end poverty in all its forms everywhere” by the year 2030.
Government	<p><u>Long term:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Insert information on albinism in the school curricula from the very early stages e.g. primary school • Address poverty by ensuring access to services for communities at local level.

See full report@

<http://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/Albinism/Pages/AlbinismInAfrica.aspx>

Appendix C: Selection of Media Material

Media Outlet	Location	Key words for Selection	No of hit	Relevance	Selected	Language	Year
The Daily News	Tanzania	Albino, Witchdoctor,	300	45	7	English	2011-2015
The Citizen/Mwananchi	Tanzania	Witchdoctor, Albino, Wagang wa kinyeji,	38,835	315	8	English, Swahili	2007-2015
CNN	USA/America	Albino Tanzania, Witch doctor	38	12	3	English	2007-2015
BBC	UK/Europe	Albino, Witchdoctor, Tanzania	82	36	3	English	2007-2015
IBTimes	UK	Albino Witchdoctor, Tanzania	28	11	3	English	2007-2015