Erasmus University Rotterdam

Erasmus School of History, Culture and Communication
Master of Arts in Cultural Economics and Entrepreneurship

What is the role of institutional logics in the creation and success in the arts in Hong Kong?

By Chan Kwan Ngai 428954

Academic year 2016-2017

Master Thesis

Supervisor: Dr. Sofie Jacobs

Second reader: Prof. Arjo Klamer

Abstract

This thesis attempts to explore the institutional logics in the Hong Kong art world and the way that the identified institutional logics relate to the success of the Hong Kong artist. The existing literature seldom explores the Hong Kong contemporary art world and the concept of institutional logics is never analyzed in this context. The concept of institutional logics is to explain the behavior that the Hong Kong artist follows during their creation process, which is the first step of the research. The value-based approach is also covered in this study as I find out that some of the elements are similar to the institutional logics. The second step of this research is to explore how the artist defines success and analyze the relation between the identified logics and their defined success. The institutional logics vary from industries so this thesis is to explore what logics exist in the Hong Kong art world. A method to identify the institutional logics in the Hong Kong art world is through semi-structured in-depth interviews. 13 artists have been interviewed and they have talked about their creation ideas, how the artistic, sociological and market perspectives influence their creation ideas. The way of the existence of the Hong Kong art world was discussed, as well as their opinion on being a successful artist. The research result is that the three logics are identified in the Hong Kong art world. They are the artistic logic, the social logic and the market logic. It does not mean that each of the interviewed artist follows one logic exclusively. Instead, the phenomenon of following two or all the logics are discovered and the situation of the combined logics also exists. The artistic logic is contradictory with the market logic in nature but in the Hong Kong art world, actors like the art manager or the gallery owner tolerate the existence of the two logics at the

same time. The artistic and the social logics are also co-existed. About the findings on success, the definition of success is discussed in two aspects, and they are internal success and external success. The internal success goes beyond our conventional way of understanding success because it focuses on the development of the artistic career of the artist themselves and their career in a life-long process rather than being recognized and the commercial success. The research result also shows that following the artistic logic is highly relevant to the internal success. This thesis also discovers that the Hong Kong artist is more favourable to the internal success rather than the external success, which is being recognized and recorded in the history of the arts. This thesis explains that the Hong Kong artists follows mainly the artistic logic and the importance of the market logic is the least.

Key words: institutional logics; the contemporary art world; Hong Kong visual artist; value; success

Content

Ch	apt	er 1 Introduction	6
Ch	apt	er 2 Theoretical Framework	8
	A.	The definition of institutional logics	8
	В.	The creation of the arts from the value-based perspective	11
	C.	The creation of the arts from a sociological perspective	11
	D.	The creation of the arts from the artistic perspective	15
	E.	The creation of the arts from the market perspective	18
	F.	The theory of success	20
(G.	The Hong Kong contemporary art world	22
Ch	apt	er 3 Methodology	24
	Sele	ection of Cases	24
	✓		25
	Res	earch strategy	25
	Data	a Collection	25
	Ana	lysis of the data	28
	Qua	ılity	28
	V	alidity	28
	R	eliability	29
Ch	apt	er 4 Research Results	30
	Res	earch Findings	30
	A.	The social logic	30
	In	fluence of the art schools	31
	N	etworking	32
	TI	he shared logic	33
	В.	The artistic logic	34
	In	trinsic motivation	34
	In	spirations from daily life and personal experience	35
	A	esthetics	36

C.	The market logic	36
	✓	39
D.	How the logics are co-existed?	39
	When the market logic meets the artistic logic in the gallery	39
	When the artistic logic meets the social logic	41
Ε	Success	43
	✓	49
Cha	pter 5 Discussion	50
Tł	ne theory of the sociological perspective	51
Tł	ne artistic perspective	52
Sı	Jccess	54
Di	scussion on the research question	55
Cha	pter 6 Conclusion	57
Tł	ne limitation of this thesis	57
Refe	erence	59
App	endix A – Interview Guide	63
App	endix B Coding Table	67
Ar	tist A	67
Ar	tist B	68
Ar	tist C	71
Ar	tist D	76
Ar	tist E	79
Ar	tist F	81
Ar	tist G	84
Ar	tist H	90
Ar	tist I	93
Ar	tist J	96
Ar	tist K	99

Artist L	102
Artist M	104

Chapter 1 Introduction

This thesis aims at studying the institutional logics in creation in the Hong Kong art world and the way the institutional logics contribute to the success of the Hong Kong artist. The institutional logics explain the behavior of individuals, organizations and society in the industry. It helps us to understand the conflicts and contradictions among different actors within the industry. Studying the topic, it is necessary to study the process of creation of the arts. It is believed that the artist is not the only actor in the process of creation but also other actors. Therefore, in the chapter of literature review, not only the theory of the institutional logics is discussed but also the theories related to the production of the arts. The value approach will also be discussed because it is related to the production of the arts. The first aspect to explore the production of the arts is the sociological perspective. It explains the role of society in the production of the arts. From the sociological perspective, art is collectively produced because it involves actors like the art curator and the gallery owner. They are regarded as the gatekeeper in the art market because they decide whether the artist can participate in the exhibition or not. The second aspect is the artistic perspective. The production of the arts is primarily driven by the artist themselves, who wants to express their messages to the audience and work on aesthetics. The third aspect is the market perspective. In the art world, commercial activities occur in the gallery. Selling the artwork is a motivation of the artist because they need to earn for their living. From the market perspective, the demand theory is studied to discover how the preference of the consumer on cultural products is different from non-cultural products. The theory of the art machine is discussed to explore how the artist can achieve

better market success in the art market. The last part of the theoretical framework is to study the theory of success. It explores the way that scholars define success. Based on the study of institutional logics in the Hong Kong art world, the research question of the thesis is: What is the role of institutional logics in the creation and success in the arts in Hong Kong? The two core things to study are creation and success. Therefore, the sub-questions are formulated as: 1. Which institutional logics can be identified in the Hong Kong art world? 2. How does the Hong Kong artist define success? 3. How do institutional logics relate to the success of the Hong Kong artist? A qualitative research method is conducted in the thesis. Doing in-depth interviews is the way to collect data. The advantage of conducting in-depth interviews is that we can have a thorough understanding on the samples which help to draw an objectified understanding on the topic.

Chapter 2 Theoretical Framework

A. The definition of institutional logics

 Institutional logics is the core theory in this research because they dominate the behavior of the people in an industry.

The content of institutional logics varies. It is a concept with heterogenous explanations because the situation is different in every industries. The concept of institutional logics is advocated by Friedland and Alford (1991), who aim at exploring the relationships between individuals, organizations and society. They define institutional logics as "The institutional logic of capitalism is accumulation and the commodification of human activity" and "these institutional logics are symbolically grounded, organizationally structured, politically defended and technically and materially constrained and hence have specific historical limits" (Friend and Alford, 1991, p.248-249) Friedland and Alford (1991) discover that in the capitalist world, practices of individuals might go beyond the social norms. They believe that exploring institutional logics helps to explain the behavior of social actors. The behavior of an individual is different from the behavior of an organization because their interests are different (Friedland and Alford, 1991). The theory of Friedland and Alford (1991) first applied the institutional logics in the political context. and Thornton and Ocasio (2008) enriched the meaning of institutional logics and its effectiveness.

According to Thornton and Ocasio (2008), institutional logics are defined as "the socially constructed, historical patterns of material practices, assumptions, values, beliefs, and rules by which individuals produce and reproduce their material subsistence, organize time and space, and provide meaning to their social entity". (Thornton and Ocasio, 2008, p.102) The definition shows that institutional logics occur in every aspect of the society and it is necessary to understand the construction of the society where different parties have their cultural characteristics. Thornton and Ocasio (2008) argue that individuals and organizations follow the norms and conventions during the decision-making process. Institutional logics are useful in showing those norms and conventions. Staying within the same institutional logics, actors behave what they find appropriate.

Another term to explain "finding appropriateness" is to gain legitimacy.

Thornton and Ocasio (2008) argue in institutional theory that legitimacy is more important than economic rationality. It means that the economic aspect is not the only element to dominate institutional logics. Friedland and Alford (1991) also argue that conflicts usually occur within a logic, because some actors want to carry out changes within the industry but the others want to remain the status quo because of their vested interest.

In other words, when a logic exists in the industry for a certain period of time, it becomes dominant because actors see it as the norm or the rule to follow. Conflicts occur when the new entrant wants to carry innovation for the industry, and thus work against the dominant logic in the industry. Jones (2005) explains an example of the French film industry that dominant actors in that industry therefore cannot examine the value of new resources and introduce new strategies. Bettis and Prahalad (1995) also argue that the existence of a

dominant logic limits the development of an organization because the behavior of the actors is restricted within a single dominant logic. The concept of dominant logic is accordingly useful in studying how the artist is restricted in terms of their creation ideas. It is necessary to identify the institutional logics because they are developed based on a ground of consensus.

The conflicting logics exist when actors want to be innovative and work against the dominant logic. Thornton and Ocasio (2008) argue that conflicting logics occur in different situations. The first situation is due to the change of the social phenomenon and it is necessary to introduce a new social identity to the industry. A study conducted by Rao (2003) et al explains the tradition of the French cuisine is replaced by the new one because of the social movement. Another situation is that when new comers gain power, conflicting logics occur because the new actors want to gain control of the industry.

In the thesis, the concept of institutional logics is useful in explaining the creation ideas of the artist, because it provides the norms and conventions that the artist follows. Also, the concept of institutional logics contributes to explain conflicts between the artist and other actors in the art world (DiMaggio, 1997). As mentioned above, conflicts occur among the actors in the industry because different actors represent different beliefs and values, leading to a pursue of different interests. One side of the actors needs to conform or make compromises through a process of negotiations. Friedland & Alford (1991) argue that individuals and organizations who are not positioned in the highest hierarchy always compete and seek for changes because their desire is restricted.

B. The creation of the arts from the value-based perspective

In addition to the concept of the institutional logics, the value theory helps us understand the motivations of the artist to create art and the function of the arts. The value theory shows that the cultural and symbolic values are important in both the commercial and non-commercial art world (Throsby, 2000). The similarity between institutional logics and values is that both concepts have influence on human behavior. Unlike institutional logics, the value-based perspective does not involve the influence of organizations on human behavior. However, the theory of value is applicable to this thesis because value appears in the artistic, social and market perspective which will be discussed in the theoretical framework. Values also determine the price and the level of popularity of a cultural good. The argument of Klamer (2016) extends the theory of Throsby by arguing that cultural goods can be regarded as a shared good. These theories help us to understand not only the function of the arts but also how values contribute to the formation of arts.

C. The creation of the arts from a sociological perspective

This section aims at analyzing the theories on art creation from a sociological perspective. Sociological scholars argue that the production of the arts does not only include the artist but also other social actors. The creation process includes the opinion from art managers and even the audience.

From a sociological point of view, it is believed that under the construction of the societal system, the artwork is not produced exclusively by an artist but it requires a cooperation with the curator or the gallery owner. Becker (1974) argues that artists have to conform in a certain extent because there are conventional ways of doing things in the art world. In the context of the contemporary art world, artists are required to produce the artwork with a limited size. The way that the artwork is installed is decided by the gallery manager or the curator. Becker (1974) also believes that artists and the personnel that they work with organize exhibitions or sell the artwork that their audience wants. The gallery manager or the museum curator is regarded as the co-producer of the artwork. Becker (1974) argues that because the audience has expectations on what kinds of artwork that they want to see, the art manager has a strict limitation on what is displayed and exhibited. Becker (1974) therefore argues that in modern society, artwork is collectively created but solely by an individual artist. It is therefore argued that art is socially constructed.

The theory of DiMaggio depicts the formulation of the social relations in the art world. His arguments justify Becker's argument that art is collectively created due to the existence of art classification. According to DiMaggio (1987)

Baumann (2007) argues that resources are useful in constructing the legitimacy of the art. He distinguishes resources into tangible and intangible. Examples of intangible resources are the prestige or popularity of an organization. They contribute to the symbolic value of the artwork. The symbolic value means that individuals have different perspective to an artwork when it contains meanings related to its prestige and recognition. (Bourdieu, 1984) Tangible resources include labour and money and they are also favorable to contribute to the legitimacy of an artwork.

The argument of Becker (1974) is also supported by Baumann (2007). However, he demonstrates the structure of art worlds in a more detailed and complete scale than Becker. Similar with the argument of Becker, Baumann (2007) argues that in order to gain a higher level of acceptance and recognition on artistic production, consensus has to be concluded among the audience and the gatekeeper. It is not necessary and not possible to pursue a complete consensus between the artist and the audience and the gatekeeper. Baumann (2007) uses the term "legitimacy" to refer if the artistic production is accepted or not. Through the theory of Baumann (2007), it is revealed that when artists have to gain a recognition or an acceptance in the art world, they have to gain a legitimacy from the audience and the gatekeeper.

Meanwhile, Baumann (2007) and Becker (1974) agree that artists also produce the works that the audience and the gatekeeper do not accept or appreciate. Conflicts occur between the artist and the gatekeeper in the aesthetic aspect. At last they believe that conflicts can be settled by making compromises. It is believed that artists are more likely to make compromises because the gatekeeper is on the side with power. Baumann (2007) explains tactics that artists can develop to gain legitimacy. The reason for developing such tactics is to convince the gatekeeper and the targeted audience that the cultural value of those artistic products is worth to be justified. Baumann (2007) introduces the concept of framing, which is the first step. In the context of the art world, framing is to provoke a discussion about an artwork, for example the creation idea and its relationship with the society. Baumann (2007) also argues that framing contributes to a formation of discourse. The concept of discourse

requires a series of conversations and vocabulary for discussion. It is regarded as a means to gain legitimacy when a number of communications are formed and a set vocabulary is developed.

Joy (2000) argues that establishing artists might take a long time to be recognized. She also supports the argument that artworks, especially innovative ones have to be legitimized, which requires a long process of education to views, cultivating their taste. Joy (2000) provides an explanation on why art has to be legitimized. The reason is that she perceives artworks as a co-produced thing. It requires a mutual agreement between the viewer and the artist before becoming a "real" art.

The shared value can also be seen a component of the sociological perspective. Klamer (2016) enriches the theory of values in the art world. He suggests that what makes art more meaningful is to share it with the others. It does not mean to share in a physical way but to share the idea. He argues that the value is shared with the actors in the society. Klamer (2016) emphasizes that sharing is a social practice because a mutual conversation is formed. In the context of creating arts, the situation is that the artist wants to communicate with their audience by using the artwork. The art is regarded as a medium and there is a conversation behind. That requires a contribution of the audience to interpret or see an artwork otherwise an effort by the artist themselves is not adequate to create art as a shared good. The shared value contains an expectation from the artist that there will be a mutual conversation between the artist and the audience. They expect the audience to understand their works. It is the meaning of art with shared value and it is believed that art

is created with the shared value.

D. The creation of the arts from the artistic perspective

In the previous section I have explained that art is socially and collectively constructed and is strongly connected to hierarchy. However, the artistic perspective ought to be considered in the art creation process. It is believed that the artistic perspective is of prime importance for the artist. Creating art is driven by the intrinsic motivations of the artist. Stohs (1992) argues that one of the components of intrinsic motivations of the artist is to obtain self-satisfaction. The artist feels self-satisfied when he creates art. The motivation is solely driven by themselves but not by external factors. Zolberg (1990) explains the artistic approach with the theory of Freud. Freud suggests that the creation of the artwork is related to the personal experience of the artist (Zolberg, 1990). The artist recalls his memory from childhood and regards it as the subject of the artwork. Thus, the previous experience of the artist is highly related to their current artistic production. The artistic perspective is considered as reaching aesthetical quality as the primary goal, while the artist is not concerned with the market value.

Laermans (1992) argues that dilemma exists in the art world. The dilemma is that artists have to sacrifice their artistic autonomy when they ask for economic success. They are required to make compromises to cater the market need. Laermans (1992) argues that when artists do not defend their artistic freedom, they will be criticized for not being a genuine artist. The society expects an artist to enjoy artistic freedom and pursues aesthetic beauty at a highest level. When the audience realizes that the artist does not defend their artistic

freedom, their reputation deteriorates. Moreover, Laermans (1992) argues that the society demands artists to express their original and personal ideas through an artwork with innovation. He further argues that it is a cultural ideal although artists always encounter external restrictions when they create. The society still appreciates artists who defend their own artistic freedom because it is believed that their artworks can remain original. However, both Zolberg (1990) and Larmans argue that it is difficult to explain the root of artistic creation. People find it hard to tell or quantify the autonomy that artists uphold.

It is not appropriate to make a connection between the artworks and society exclusively because as Bourdieu (1984) argues, artists with autonomy produce artwork with a complete mastery, which is not driven by any other social factors. Zolberg (1990) tries to explain personal motivation of the artist regarding the psychological approach. The psychological approach shows that the previous experience of the artist is highly related to their current artistic production.

Meyer and Even (1998) also explain the process of the creation of the arts. They use a concept of "dyadic threesome" in the situation of the work of art. The three elements involved in the dyadic threesome are the artist, the work of art and the recipient. They argue that it is necessary for artists to take care of their audience, who is the recipient. Meyer and Even (1998) argue that the recipient and the work of art influence each other. They do not neglect the importance of the audience, who can be collectors or gatekeepers. However, Hirschman does not agree with the argument that the market is taken by the artist into consideration. Hirschman (1983) highlights the process of creativity among artists. He argues that the motivation of artists is driven primarily by

themselves. He explains that the first audience of the artist is the self because they create art for self-expression. He believes that the artist needs to firstly satisfy themselves before promoting their works to the market.

From the discussion, we can see that scholars have contradictory opinions about the motivation of creating art. Hirschman (1983) holds the view that the primary goal of artists to create art is to express themselves.

Venkatesch and Meanber (2008) provide various perspectives in explaining aesthetics and the marketing of the arts. They argue that the creation of aesthetic meanings requires the reflection of the daily life. They argue the meaning of aesthetics from the humanistic perspective. The experience from the daily life contributes to the aesthetic experience of producers and even consumers. Venkatesch and Meanber (2008) includes the three parties that are responsible for the production of the arts. They are artists, art managers and consumers. They do not emphasize which parties have a more crucial role in cultural production. It is certain that artists obtain aesthetic experience from their daily life and transform it into symbolic value into their works of art. This argument is also shared by Burger (1984) and Joy & Sherry (2003).

The cultural value also involves in the artistic perspective. Throsby argues the meaning of the cultural value as "emphasizing universal, transcendental, objective and unconditional characteristics of culture." (Throsby, 2000, p.27) It shows that the cultural value is personal and subjective. It varies from different society. Throsby (2000) argues that there are different elements on the cultural value. In this paragraph, only elements related to the creation ideas of the artist are mentioned because the rest of the value is related to the perspective

of consumers and cultural-historical aspect which goes beyond the control of the artist. (Throsby, 2000, p.29) It includes the aesthetic value which emphasizes the aesthetic quality of an artwork. Second is the social value. The social value is explained as the artwork conveying messages about the society and identity to the audience. It is regarded as a response to the society by creating the artwork.

E. The creation of the arts from the market perspective

It is believed that the artist needs to rely on selling artworks for living. The market perspective is studied to explain how the artist can bring better economic benefits to themselves. The aspect of the demand theory is discussed, aiming at exploring how the need and taste of consumers is different from non-cultural goods. In addition, the theory of the art machine is discussed. Following the operation of the art machine helps the artist to have a better result on selling.

The theory of Caves (2003) and Velthuis (2001) explain the operation of the creative industries. He argues that the demand of the consumer on cultural goods is different from non-cultural goods. In terms of the market structure, the art product is vertically different from each other, meaning that every product is heterogenous. In addition, Caves (2003) argues that the artistic product has the characteristic of demand uncertainty. It means that the art dealer and artists cannot predict the taste of the collector. The level of information failure is higher than non-creative, or in Cave's word, humdrum industries. They have no clue on the preferences of the collector. Velthuis (2001, p.37) argues that the art market is for the credence goods. He argues that the price of artworks

cannot be objectively determined but to reply on art experts. Therefore, it is believed that art dealers interrupt with the creation of the artist because they aim at having a better sale.

Ocasio and Thomson (2012) argue that the effectiveness of the art machine contributes to the market success of the artist. They argue that the art machine includes seven stages which allow artists to gain their popularity in the art market. It helps the artist to develop their marketing strategy through the practice of the art machine. Their market value can be enhanced. Paying attention to the operation and the effectiveness of the art machine helps the artist to follow the market logic. Preece and Kerrigan (2015) argue that the artist regards themselves as an entrepreneur focusing on developing the market success. They emphasize that it is necessary for the art dealer or the artist to develop their artistic brand. Similar with the formation of logics, Preece and Kerrigan (2015) argue that the artistic brand is socially constructed. It means that the creation of the brand requires a discussion between the art dealer and the artist. It shows that in order to promote the artistic brand, it appears that the artist might sacrifice their creation autonomy.

As mentioned above, the seven stages contribute to the success in the market approach. The first stage is to graduate from an art school. The reason is that being educated in the art school enables the potential artist to gain expertise. Ronder and Thomson (2012) argue that graduating from a prominent art school is useful obtaining a stardom status of the artist. The collector or the audience feels that they can obtain more values from an artwork created by the artist who is the alumni of the prominent art school. It is believed that the

symbolic value is appreciated.

The second stage is to cooperate with art dealers who operate a gallery. (Ronder & Thomson, 2012) It is an important process because according to Becker (1982), the art dealer is regarded as the tastemaker and the gatekeeper in the contemporary art market. The role of the art dealer is to select artists for exhibitions. Cooperating with the gallery owner is useful in enhancing the exposure of the artist in the later stages. In the fifth and the sixth stage, the artist receives more chances on exhibits because it is related to the deals with collectors in openings and participating in international art events, such as art fairs. It is believed that being exhibited in the gallery and art fairs contributes to the sales of the artwork the most because the collector usually buys artworks in the gallery during the opening or the art fair.

F. The theory of success

In previous chapters, we have discussed that artists encounter the situation of the economic logics meeting the artistic logic. In this chapter, I argue the opinion of scholars on defining success. In the cultural and creative industries, economic success is not the only goal that artists pursue. We need to examine the nature of cultural goods. Bourdieu (1984) argues the key feature of cultural goods carries symbolic meanings. Symbolic meanings are constructed according to the taste of the audience and their social class. The argument of Bourdieu is corresponding to the perspective of cultural economics. Throsby (2001) argues that cultural goods carry value. Value refers to the experience of the audience and their meanings ascribed to the art work. It shows that the

quality of an artwork is not determined by the price but how much symbolic meaning is involved in the artwork. It is also possible to argue that a successful art work gains an artistic legitimation When an artwork is examined by art historians and written in art history, it is still considered as an artistic success.

Baumann (2007) has also provided an argument on artistic success. In the art world success means gaining power and produces everything that artists like. Referring to Joy and Sherry (2003), it takes time for artworks being accepted in society or critics because they are too innovative. Baumann's argument is understood as a successful artist produces the artwork that he wants because whatever he creates is accepted by society or art critics. The successful artist can create artworks which gain legitimacy immediately, meaning that they are dominating the trend of the artworld.

On the other hand success in the economic aspect is still justified. Economic success is easily defined as the amount of money made by the artist by selling artworks.

Many scholars have also studied factors contributing to the economic success. Giuffre (1999) have conducted a research about the influence of network effects and explained the operation of the contemporary artworld. He argues that in the contemporary art world, artists need to rely on gallery owners to promote their artworks, which have a greater chance to success. Giuffre (1999) and Velthuis (2005) argue that a strong connection between artists and gallery owners results in an easier chance to succeed. Velthuis (2005) argues that the non-economic mutual benefit is crucial in the

contemporary art world. He introduces the concept of gift economy. He depicts a situation to explain the operation of gift economy. He emphasizes the importance of morality and trust, referring to the situation that a gallery owner buys certain pieces of art which are higher than the market value from an artist suffering from economic difficulties. And in return, the artist assisted by the gallery owner will also introduce an intangible benefit to the gallery when he becomes famous. From this example, we can see that a skill to gain mutual trust on a personal level is important in the art market because one can bring a symbolic benefit to the other some days. Velthuis (2005) also argues that there are a lot of hidden rules in the art market because the traditional price mechanism does not work in the art world. Velthuis (2005) claims that carrying out relational practices is fundamental among artists and art dealers. In order to be successful in the economic aspect, artists have to maintain a good relationship with art dealers promoting their artworks.

G. The Hong Kong contemporary art world

Researching on the contemporary world, this chapter attempts to explain the consistence of the art world, which also applies to the situation in the Hong Kong art world. According to a Handbook of Cultural Economics edited by Towse (2011), there are three major types of organizations promoting art and making transactions. Velthuis (2011, p.44) distinguishes the difference between market-oriented art and museum-oriented art. It is believed that market oriented art is handled by the art dealer, who aims at generating profits and focusing on economic exchange with the collector. Velthuis (2011) mentions that the art dealer appears in both the first and secondary art market. They use gallery as a platform to do business. On the aspect of

market-oriented art, the responsibility of the art manager is not to make profit but organize project-based exhibitions. According to Colbert (2011), the art manager works at cultural organizations which are non-profit. Colbert mentions that non-profit cultural organizations are to implement its missions, which might be to organize art exhibitions and it is necessary for them to maintain the long-term sustainability of the organization. In the context of Hong Kong, non-profit art organizations include exhibition space at universities and organizations with sponsors from various foundations or public donations. The third type of the cultural organizational is governmental organization, which includes museum. Frenandez-Blanco & Prieto-Rodriguez (2011) argue that the function of the exhibition is to organize exhibitions which provides aesthetic enjoyment to the public and preserve the collections. They also argue that the major financial sources of the museum are admission fees and public grants. In the context of Hong Kong, the department managing governmental organizations is called the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD). Artists are invited by the civil servant from the LCSD when they get the opportunity to exhibit at governmental institutions such as the art museum or Oi!, which is an art space promoting art.

Chapter 3 Methodology

This chapter attempts to explain the methodology of my thesis research. I explain the selection of my sample, the research strategy and the date collection and analysis of the data. I also discuss validity and reliability.

This thesis aims at studying the institutional logics of the Hong Kong artist. The unit of analysis are therefore the artist from Hong Kong.

A.Selection of Cases

In order to draw a more objective and updated research result, there are few criteria to the selected samples. The first criteria is that artists are active in the Hong Kong art world. The definition of an active artist is that they participate in art exhibitions in Hong Kong in the year of 2016 or 2017. It ensures that artists have a connection to the Hong Kong art world. The second criteria is that the selected artists are Hong Kong based or educated in one of the four art schools in Hong Kong. We need to ensure that the sample has a full understanding on Hong Kong and has lived in Hong Kong for a long period of time. Because this thesis aims at exploring relationship between the society, the art market and the process of creating art, the artist who is Hong Kong based realizes the context The third criteria is that they focus on the field of visual arts. The following table shows that the sample is distributed in the types of art organizations evenly. It is believed that the situation of working in a commercial gallery is different from artists focus on non-commercial organizations. Table one shows how the experience of the artist is distributed:

	Experience		
Artist	Commercial	Non-government	Governmental
	Gallery	institution	organization
Α		✓	
В	✓		
С	✓	✓	
D	✓	✓	
Е		✓	✓
F	✓		
G	✓	✓	
Н		✓	✓
1		✓	
J	✓		✓
K	✓	✓	
L	✓		
М	✓	√	

Table 1

B.Research strategy

The research is conducted in a qualitative way, therefore semi-structured interviews are conducted to collect the data. According to Babbie (2008), the advantage of qualitative research is that the researcher can search for a valid and reliable answer from the interviewees. Another advantage highlighted by Babbie (2008) is that in-depth interview allows me to draw a better understanding on how the institutional logics is formed.

C.Data Collection

Semi-structured interviews were conducted. This allowed me to have follow-up questions during the process and we to draw a better understanding on the data provided by the interviewees. 12 artists were invited. The artists were

discovered through the news reporting the art exhibitions that they are participating recently. Moreover, most of the artist have their personal websites and contact information. Because of the far distance between Hong Kong and Rotterdam, where I live currently, all the interviews are conducted through video chat or internet call chat. Because the first language of all the interviewees is Cantonese, all interviews are conducted in Cantonese. In this way, the interviewees can express themselves in the most natural way with their first language. The interviews lasted between 30 minutes to 90 minutes.

The interview is separated into four parts. The first part is to understand the background and also the education¹ of the artist. It is regarded as a process of building mutual trust between each other and understanding on their expectation on creating art. More importantly, it is necessary to understand their artistic career before conducting the interview. Although I selected the sample according to the CV of the artist, it is better for artists themselves to explain their previous and ongoing project.

The second part is to understand the inspiration of the artist to create art. I point out whether some of the major incidents happened in Hong Kong in recent years, for example, the Umbrella Movement² in 2014, and the urban

.

¹ The high education in the arts: The tertiary section in education is divided into two types, private institutions and statuary universities. There are three statuary universities providing bachelor programmes related to visual arts. They are The Chinese University of Hong Kong, the City University of Hong Kong and Hong Kong Baptist University. The only private institution provides bachelor art degree is the Hong Kong art school, which their programme is co-organized by Royal Melbourne Institute of Technology. The statuary university enjoys more popularity then private institutions because the programme is funded by the Hong Kong government and supervised by an independent body called University Grand Committee. The programme by the private institution is self-funded. The admission requirement is more demanding than the private institution, in terms of students' academic results from the public examination.

² The Umbrella Movement is a movement participated by 18-20 percent of the population of Hong

construction project in the communities influence their creation ideas. Besides, I try to understand how their personal experience, or the experience on daily life has influenced their creation ideas. This part of interview attempts to clarify the creation process of the artist in terms of their motivations and creation ideas. The key words of the second part are: inspiration, social changes, creation ideas, experience, personal, daily life, aesthetics, umbrella movement.

The third part is to understand the situation of the artist in cooperating with the three types of organizations, as mentioned in the theoretical framework. This part attempts to further understand how the hierarchy exists in these organizations. Asking for the hierarchy in the Hong Kong art world is useful in analyzing which party involves in the production process and which party has a greater influence. It can also help me to understand how artists deal with these parties when conflicts occur and how artists react to these conflicts. We can realize whether artists choose to conform or work against the actors. We can also analyze the level of autonomy that artists obtain in the Hong Kong art world. The key words of the third part which appear in the interview questions are: art gallery, non-governmental organizations, governmental organizations, art managers, curators, hierarchy, conform, artistic freedom, taste of the audience.

Kong (Cheung, 2016). The people of Hong Kong occupied the main roads in the central area of the city for more than three months to express their discontent on the Chinese and the local government who do not give real democracy to the Hong Kong citizens, fighting for the genuine universal suffrage for the Hong Kong Chief Executive Election in 2017 (Chan, 2016). Chan (2016) argues that the movement carries a strong influence to the people of Hong Kong because it starts a new chapter on social movements. It is regarded as one of the most important movements in the Hong Kong society.

The forth part is to understand the definitions of success and the way that artists can achieve success that they define. It is difficult to draw a clear standard in explaining success and when interviewees find it difficult to answer this question, I provide a guideline on the meaning of cultural success or commercial success. The cultural success carries an idea that the work is recognized because of its aesthetic quality. It focuses on the artistic approach. The economic success means that the number of success depends on their number of sales. The key words of the forth part which appear in the interview questions are: define, success, factors, cultural, commercial.

D.Analysis of the data

The gathered data was read and the process of coding was conducted. The gathered data was coded into five categories. This project attempts to define the institutional logics in the Hong Kong visual art world and the way that the defined logics lead to the success of the artist. The first category is the social logic. The second category is the artistic logic. The third category is the market logic. The forth category is the shared logic. The fifth category is about the way that artists define success. It is believed that the gathered data are not entirely black and white. The way to code the grey area of the logics is to find out the underlying meaning of the artist. When contradictions occur, I analyzed the data in the part on conflicting logics.

E.Quality

Validity

Babbie (2008) argues that when the researcher designs the questionnaire, he

needs to ensure the measurement quality. The first quality is validity. According to Babbie (2008), validity means that the researcher is measuring the real topic that he wants to research. It is necessary for the researcher to ensure that the interviewees are responding to the content or the topic that the researcher asks for. The solution to improve validity is to read between the lines and examine the transcript carefully to ensure that the interviewees respond to the topic that the researcher talks about.

Reliability

Babbie (2008) argues that reliability is the quality which needs to contain in a research. He argues that the researcher needs to pay attention to examine whether a measurement technique will bring the same kind of data independently. A solution to improve the reliability of the research is to design the interview questions in a flexible way. Having done one interview, I will examines my notes and made adjustments when I discovered that some of the collected data were redundant. The process of adjustment allowed me to collect the data in a more comprehensive way. Another advantage to make a flexible set of questions is that every artist has a diverse background and characteristics. The way to raise questions depends also on the character of the artist.

Chapter 4 Research Results

Research Findings

This chapter aims at answering the research questions in the beginning of the thesis:

Which institutional logics can be identified in the Hong Kong art world?

How does the Hong Kong artist define success?

How do institutional logics relate to the success of the Hong Kong artist?

Based on the theoretical framework demonstrating the production theory of the art world in general, this chapters aims at presenting the logics in the Hong Kong art world. The logics are identified by the data gathered from the 12 interviewees who are the active visual artists in Hong Kong. The logics will be discussed in four aspects.

A. The social logic

The social logic is consisted of two aspects. The two aspects show that art is socially constructed. The first aspect is to show the creation idea of the artist is influenced by social changes. We need to understand that the changes in the society influence everyone but not every artist displays these changes through their artwork. They create art because they want to show their discontent with the society. Artist E declares that her artworks include political messages. She says "what is happening in the political world is absurd... and we are suffering from these (political systems)" and she further mentions "my work talks about the society, history of migration... and you can refer to some artworks which are very political". The conversation shows that artist E wants to deliver her

feelings on political or social development through her artworks. Artist M also says that "When some major incidents occur in the society, I will put those incidents into my creation spontaneously. We cannot withdraw the life from our society". Although artist M claims that her artworks do not reflect political feelings directly from the artwork, she still wants to express her feelings of the society because she thinks that daily life and the society is connected to each other.

Influence of the art schools

The second aspect is to shows the formation of the Hong Kong art world. The art school at the Chinese University of Hong Kong is not the only one which has influence to the Hong Kong art world but also the department of creative media at the City University of Hong Kong (CityU). Artist A mentions that "for example, when you are graduated from CityU ... they have more connections to (international) art festivals because teachers have an international background. Some interviewed artists are not represented by commercial galleries, meaning that they rely on participating in art exhibitions to display their artwork. I discover that the opportunity of being exhibited is related to the education background of the artist themselves. Artist G reveals the influence of the art schools in Hong Kong on the chance of joining art exhibitions. Artist G is graduated from the art school at the Chinese University of Hong Kong, which is the one with the longest history in fine arts. She admits that because of her education background, she is given more chances to join exhibitions. She explains that "People from those art schools want to strengthen their networking, not deliberately but spontaneously... People on top positions in the art world are graduated from that art school... and of course they protect

the interests of the students graduated from that art school." On the other hand, artist H mentions that not only the Chinese University of Hong Kong is dominant in the Hong Kong art world, but also Hong Kong Baptist University. He says "now a lot of graduates from HKBU... you graduate from certain art schools, you will have some connections." He also argues that graduating from a local art school must enjoy some advantages, artist H keeps saying that "for example an artist is graduated from CUHK, and they (art managers) have noticed my graduation show, therefore they might introduce my artworks to the exhibition".

Networking

The above discussion shows that the education background influences the exhibition chance of the artist because the popularity of an art school and its graduates represent its social status. On the other hand, the social logic consists of the networking of the artist. Networking is useful to intensify social contacts with other parties. It helps to create mutual trust. Most artists mention that they have their own network. Artist F mentions that every art institution work with the same group of artists constantly. He says that "It is also related to networking. When foreign curators visit Hong Kong, they invite artists (to join an exhibition) through art institutions. It is natural that those institutions introduce artists they know or they cooperated with... We cannot blame them because they can minimize the level of uncertainty". Artist F points out an advantage of working with artists within their network. The advantage is that it spares the time of art managers to find out the information of the artist and thus reduces the level of uncertainty. They would feel secure when they work with artists within their network.

Artist G responds to the networking. She says that every art institutions has their own direction and approach when they organize an art exhibition and therefore they invite artists whose artworks are suitable for their approach. She says that "but the fact is every organization or institution has their own networking and therefore they invite artists who are their friends". And similar to the opinion from artist F, artist G also mentions "it's based on information and certainty." It shows that having a good networking with the art manager helps to minimize their information uncertainty which allows the artist to gain more opportunities to participate in exhibitions. The art manger can spare time on conducting researching about the artist when they invite those who have a cooperation experience before.

The shared logic

This paragraph aims at exploring the shared logic in the Hong Kong art world Artist A and C have shown that they have great expectations on what they make. They aim at sharing their meaning of art to their audience. They think that art is meaningful. Artist C mentions that "I hope that art can enhance one's cultural knowledge and their ways of thinking"... "gradually change their mind and I think that art can put up with the limitation of education". It shows that artist C bears a mission when he creates art. He expects that his audience can get inspired from what he does. He believes that the visual effect from the art is powerful. He thinks that "when some audience see some linear graphics and after that their thought would have changed. Perhaps they feel shocked or comfortable. (from my artwork) In the future I believe that these shock or comfort would change their behavior."

Working within this logic, it shows that the artist wants to communicate with and deliver a message to the audience. The shared logic means that the artist includes some messages that they want to educate the audience.

Apart from education purpose, the work of artist A also carries a big message. He mentions that "I find out my thought is different from the others. Different things... perhaps what I can do is to improve the world. What needs to be changed is ... the way of thinking, morality and attitude".

B. The artistic logic

The artistic logic means that the artist produces art with good quality and fulfills their intrinsic motivation through their creation of the art. The intrinsic motivation means that artists regard the creation process as something personal and are not influenced by external factors. They express their experience from their daily life. The art with good quality is about the aesthetic quality. It is certain that every artist being interviewed wants to create good art, meaning that they pursue for the aesthetic quality.

Intrinsic motivation

When an artist is asked what message he wants to deliver to his audience, he says " I am not sure. But for myself, the most important thing is that painting provides me the meaning of existence... people can work on many things for survive, but the most core thing is to find out the feeling of existence to fulfill myself" It shows that artist A is highly driven by his intrinsic motivation to create art, otherwise he cannot feel that he exists. Artist A shows an extreme intrinsic

motivation to create art because his motivation is to prove his own existence.

<u>Inspirations from daily life and personal experience</u>

Moreover, some artists do not have the same extreme level of intrinsic motivation as artist A. Their creation motivation remains in their daily and personal life. Artist C mentions that "I am kind of a realist so I am inspired by my living environment". He also tells me an example "I like taking buses to see the view (from the bus). The view is moving, therefore the landscape shown in my paintings is very long, from left to right. It is different from what others see from the same view." It shows that Artist C uses his daily experience on taking transport as one of his creation ideas. He argues that showing the daily experience helps him to make good art works.

Exploring the home of the artist themselves is regarded as their personal experience. The creation idea of artist B is from her living place. She mentions that "Home is a very important place to us but we don't understand it that much. Therefore, I start conducting a research about my home. Some objects, for example cooking devices and utensils at the kitchen... represent my identity as an artist, a mother and a housewife. My identity can be shown through these objects (in my artwork)." The project developed by artist B is because she started when quitting her job in 2008. She therefore always stays at home. The conversation shows that exploring her home became her creation ideas. It is also believed that home is one of the most personal and private spaces for human beings. Artists want to develop their artwork based on their personal experience, showing that they follow the artistic logic.

<u>Aesthetics</u>

Creating work with higher aesthetic level is also a creation idea of the artist.

They aim at producing artwork with better quality and with originality. Artist C is a painter and he wants to paintings with better aesthetic quality. He mentions that "when I see artworks from other artists, I think I might add something to compensate what is missing." It shows that artist C wants to enrich the aesthetic ground of the art world.

The above analysis shows that the artistic logic is identified in the Hong Kong art world. The creation ideas of the interviewees remain of the personal level and also the aesthetic level. The artistic logic becomes one of the main components in the institutional logics.

C. The market logic

The market logic is discovered in commercial galleries in Hong Kong. The economic factor is an important component in the market logic because profit maximization is the goal of the commercial gallery. This section presents the situation of artists who work with commercial galleries. Some interviewees had or have experience with working with commercial galleries. They have presented the business model of the commercial gallery and the situation of the art market in Hong Kong. It helps to show the way that market logic exists in Hong Kong.

When they are asked about the situation of the commercial gallery in Hong Kong, both artist C and D respond that the commercial gallery is no difference to normal profit making enterprises. Artist D reveals the two kinds of contract

that artists sign with the gallery. The first type of contract is that artists are invited for participating in exhibitions organized by the gallery and earn the commission when an artwork is sold. Artists can enjoy greater extent of freedom under this type of contract because they are only represented during the period of exhibition. They are free to cooperate with the others.

The second type of the contract is that artists are becoming an employee of the gallery. The artist receives a basic salary and they need to provide certain number of artworks in a period of time. The basic salary can secure the income of the artist but they have greater restrictions in terms of their creation ideas. Artist C mentions that "in the beginning (of the cooperation), they give you autonomy. But as time goes by, they have more requests. You are required to paint what they like" Artist D mentions the pros and cons under working on the economic logic: "They are willing to spend more money on you for example, they rent you a studio and help you to deal with the marketing stuff and the drawback is that you are distracted by these voices from other people." He even mentions a more serious example on the autonomy of the artist is exploited, "after you submit ten artworks to them, they might tell you that we (the gallery) do not like certain artworks… please re-do them".

Working within the market logic is necessary to satisfy the needs of the collector in the Hong Kong art world. The above conversation helps to explain the situation that the gallery restricts the creation ideas of the artist because the artworks need to match the taste of the collector. Artist D mentions the local art market is quite small because there are less than 20 frequent buyers. He thinks that working for the gallery in Hong Kong is so restricted because

they are working for the taste of those collectors. The opinion of artist D is also supported by artist H. When he is asked about the commercial art world, he mentions that "when gallery owners realize that collectors prefer some kinds of artworks, they would therefore promote those artists making relevant artworks. The Hong Kong gallery would not try (to sell) an experimental artwork".

This section shows that when working within the market logic, the choice and level of autonomy is reduced because the goal of the market logic is to attract collectors. In Hong Kong, because the number of collectors is small, the creation ideas of the Hong Kong artist are limited. The contract working in two types is useful in showing the operation of the market logic. However, it is one of the few scenarios when artists cooperate with the gallery in Hong Kong as its entirety will be presented in following sections when the market logic meets the artistic logic. Table 2 shows how the three logics in distributed among the interviewed artists.

	Logics		
Artist	The artistic	The social logic	The market logic
	logic		
Α	√		
В	✓	✓	✓
С	✓	✓	✓
D	✓	✓	
Е	✓	✓	
F	✓	✓	
G	✓	✓	✓
Н	✓	✓	✓
1	✓	✓	
J	✓	✓	
K	✓	✓	
L	✓	✓	✓
M	√	✓	

Table 2

D. How the logics are co-existed?

After presenting the four logics, I will present the situations that all logics are co-existed. They are not contradictory to each other. I will explain how these four logics apply to the artists and the way that the market logic and the artistic logic are regarded as the hybrid logic. I will also explain that some artists include the social ideas in their artistic logic.

When the market logic meets the artistic logic in the gallery

In the section explaining the market logic, the interviewed artists think that the gallery in Hong Kong is profit-oriented because it is the nature of any commercial gallery. However, it does not mean that the gallery in Hong Kong

follows the market logic only and forces artists to make art which results in a good selling. The interviewees who currently cooperate with the gallery claim that they are able to follow the artistic logic during their creation and the gallery owner respects their aesthetic ideas and creativity. They can enjoy the artistic autonomy. The interview shows that the market logic and the artistic logic can co-exist. Artist B says that "I think that my gallery does not demand me to do certain things. They respect the artist. I am not controlled by them because I do not want to follow the commercial track. I would like to say that a good gallery does not control their artists in terms of the creation ideas". Artist B works in a commercial gallery but the above conversation shows that she can enjoy the autonomy during her creation process. It shows that it is not the responsibility of the artist to work on the economic logic. It is the responsibility of the art dealer to sell the artworks and the artist can focus on their creation. Artist F is also currently representing a gallery in Hong Kong. He also agrees that he can enjoy the artistic autonomy during the creation process. He says that "when they invite you, they respect your creation ideas. They do not involve your creation that much. When they understand the creation ideas, they are willing to invest in your works." It shows that the two logics do not contradict with each other and can co-exist.

The two logics can co-exist even though the artist prefers to follow the market logic. Artist C mentions that the artistic logic is related to the market logic. He argues that even though an artist wants to have a better selling in the art market, the artistic logic still dominates his creation ideas. Artist C says that "If your works are on good quality, your works are strong (attractive). When your work is appreciated by the public, then you will have a stronger bargaining

power, thus you can get a greater level of freedom. It means that if the quality of your work is not good enough, you do not have a good bargaining power." It shows that although artist C wants to be further appreciated in the art market, he argues that the quality of the artwork poses a greater importance in the art market. The artist has to follow the artistic logic all the time.

When the artistic logic meets the social logic

This paragraph aims at explaining how the artistic logic and the social logic co-exist. As mentioned in the previous section, the artistic logic focuses on the personal motivation while the social logic focuses on the inspiration from the society. The two logics seem separable to each other but from the perspective of the interviewed artists, some of them follow both logics and think that they are related to each other. Artist G makes use of political incidents as the theme of her work but she says that it is only in the name of those social incidents but I still want to express my personal feelings through the work. She says that "for example, I have a topic about Sun-Yat sen (who was a prominent revolutionary figure in the 20th century who overthrown the Qing Dynasty in China and thus China became the first republic country in Asia)… it is not only about historical issues but also something personal. I explore his private lives, how his girlfriends thought about his revolutionary career. So you can see that it is quite personal and even selfish."

Artist L also follows the combined logics. Her works are inspired by her domestic helper. She says that "it starts from my daily life. at the beginning I deal with the issue with my domestic helper... and it is my personal relationship between me and my domestic helper", and after that she will regard domestic help as a social issue by saying that "how the people from

society thinks about the issue of the domestic helper.

This chapter has presented the existence of various logics in the Hong Kong art world. It is believed that the artist does not work with all the identified logics. The interview discovers that all interviewees work with the artistic logic, because it is regarded as one of the important goal to create art. However, this study discovers that only some of the artist works with the economic logic, because they think that the artistic logic is contradictory to the economic logic, which deteriorates their creation autonomy. Another new discovery is that networking is an important component in the social logic.

E Success

How does the artist define success?

How do the institutional logics relate to the success of the artist?

It is believed that the definition of success is diverse and that the artist has their own opinion on success. This chapter aims at reporting how the artist regards success and in the second section, the relation between the identified institutional logics and success will be examined.

The internal success can be discussed into three aspects. The artist thinks that having artistic freedom is a kind of success. During the process of creation, the artist needs to cooperate with different parties which give suggestions on their art. The result is that some artists are influenced by these comments because they believe that accepting the suggestions from the others might enhance the popularity of their artwork. The artist wants to achieve a condition that they follow their own creation ideas exclusively and be able to leave these comments from the others behind. Artist G says that "success means you have an attitude of don't give a shit" and she refuses to use external factors to define success of the artist. Artist D thinks that "success means that you can do whatever you want and you do not have to care about comments from the others.

In addition to enjoying artistic freedom during the creation process, another indicator of success is that artist as a life-long career which allow them to participate in creation constantly. Artist B says that "I define an artist to see

whether they are successful or not... not only from one piece of artwork but all his artworks throughout his career". Artist B wants to deliver a message that endurance is a crucial quality for an artist because only spending a life-long time provides sufficient opportunity to make improvements. Artist A also mentions that "painting is a lifelong career... an artist needs to uphold their creation ideas and do not change them from time to time... I would say it is a life-long persistence... and they should not change their approach when other people give comments on your artwork". "Artist A and B suggest that creating art is a life-long task and it is important to compare to their own series of artworks rather than with the others. The meaning of success of these two artists is that the artist is required to spend their life time on creating art and make improvements constantly.

The third indicator of success is the artistic quality of the artwork. The artist is concerned with creating art with good quality. Artist B emphasizes that the artist has to be innovative all the time, and she says that "I would see whether they are innovative from time to time. A successful artist can present some changes from each exhibition and add new messages and meanings", while artist F says that "I see some artists who do similar things from time to time, and they want to make changes, but they don't. They have to trust themselves, go further without considering other factors". Artist F shows that creating quality artwork is crucial and at the same time it is necessary to preserve their own creation ideas. From the perspective of Artist F, a successful artist does not create art with good quality but also enjoy artistic freedom.

Showing the above definition of success, the artistic logic is highly related to

the internal success. It is believed that the artistic logic is a catalyst to achieve internal success. There are two characteristics of artistic logics which are highly relevant to the defined internal success.

The first characteristic is the following of intrinsic motivation. Artist says that "(drawing) is a meaning of existence. Drawing proves that I exist." The intrinsic motivation shows that the creation of the arts is driven exclusively by the mentality of the artist themselves but never the others. When the internal success is defined as enjoying the artistic freedom and following the creation ideas of the artist themselves but not the parties that the artist cooperates with, following the intrinsic motivation helps the artist to enjoy the artistic freedom. The intrinsic motivation which is a component of the artistic logic provides a condition of self-fulfillment and self-satisfaction. The condition of self-fulfillment and self-satisfaction allows them to create art themselves without any external disturbance. It is regarded as artistic freedom that the artist can enjoy when they are intrinsically motivated.

Another characteristic of the artistic logic is to work with a higher aesthetic level. Pursuing a higher aesthetic level helps the artist to achieve internal success because one of the elements of internal success is to make art with good quality and be innovative. Being innovative requires a constant creation of the artist and their reflections on their artworks all the time. It does not merely mean that the art is innovative in one show but all shows. Following the artistic logic forces the artist to be innovative all the time because it requires the artist to accelerate the artistic quality constantly.

The second category of success is from the external aspect, meaning that the artist regards being recognized by the audience and the gatekeeper is a kind of success. Another aspect is to enjoy economic success. Obtaining the external success, it is necessary for the artist to work with the three logics. The three logics, the social logic, the artistic logic and the market logic is relevant to having the external success.

The first aspect of the external success is to be recognized by the gatekeeper and the audience. Artist C hopes that his works are sold at auctions. He says that "I want to enter the global art world, to be included in the auction."

Although being promoted to the auction house does not bring a direct economic benefit to the artist, the economic and the symbolic value of the art is enhanced through the promotion in the secondary market. Entering the auction house, the artist needs to be recognized by the art dealer, which is the expert from the auction house and the collector who bids the work. It reflects the market value of the artwork and when the works have a considerable selling record, it leads to the situation that the artist is further recognized.

The second way of being recognized is the artwork appears in the art history. Artist H believes that when his artworks being analyzed and recorded in the art history, it is a kind of success. He says that "I want to be appeared in the art history and being not commercial". The art history emphasizes the importance of the artwork in terms of their artistic, social and economic value. When an artwork appears in the art history, it is believed that the artist is recognized by the audience, the art dealer in an easier way. Appearing in the art history is considered as a kind of success because of its consequences, such as an

increased artistic value given by the art critic and greater possibility to be exhibited in the art museum. It is also believed that the younger generation can recognize the artist when he appears in the art history.

The third kind of external success is economic success. Most of the interviewed artist says that they do not expect to earn huge sum of money from creating or selling art. They regard earning a living by selling art is already a success.

The identified external success is related to the three identified institutional logics in this thesis, and they are the social logic, the economic logic and the artistic logic. The social and artistic logics are related to how the artist is recognized by the audience and the art expert while the market logic is related to how the artist can support their daily life finically.

The social logic allows the artist to gain more opportunities to expand their networking and participate in art exhibitions. As mentioned in the previous chapter, the social logic consists of the effectiveness of networking. Making use of networking allows the art to become more accessible to the gatekeeper, which contributes to the situation that the artworks are more exposed in the art world. Artworks will only be recognized when they are exhibited. According to Caves (2003), the gatekeeper exists in the art world and they are responsible for selecting the artwork to the exhibition. Networking is about the connection between the gatekeeper who organizes art exhibitions and the artist. Strengthening mutual understanding eliminates information uncertainty of the gatekeeper. As discussed in the previous section, it is believed that the

gatekeeper selects artists with less information uncertainty, meaning that when the artist works on the social logic, they have more opportunities to be recognized.

Following the artistic logic is also relevant to the external success because the artistic logic is concerned with the artistic quality. One of the criteria for the gatekeeper or the collector to buy in the art gallery or to bid in the auction is the aesthetic quality of the artwork. As mentioned in the previous section, the aesthetic quality is derived from their artistic logic, meaning that the artist has to follow the artistic logic to create good art. It is believed that only art with good quality can be recognized by the gatekeeper and the art historian.

Following the artistic logic is a way to improve the aesthetic quality of the work.

The market logic is also relevant to the economic success obviously. The market logic contributes to the economic success because following the market logic focuses on the cooperation with the commercial gallery. The commercial gallery is profit-oriented therefore the market logic is relevant to the economic success. The gallery that the artist cooperates with aims at attracting the collector on sales. Therefore, following the market logic is favourable to the economic success.

Table 3 shows how the internal and external success is distributed:

		Success
Artist	Internal success	External success
Α	✓	
В	✓	
С		√
D	✓	
E		
F	✓	✓
G	✓	
Н		✓
1	✓	
J	✓	
K	✓	
L		✓
М	✓	

Table 2

Chapter 5 Discussion

Adopting the concept of institutional logics in this thesis is to explore the practices and the behavior of the artist. I aim at explaining the way that their behavior is influenced by the artist themselves, organizations and society. Scholars, such as Friedland & Alford (1991) and Thornton & Ocasio (2008) have provided the definitions on institutional logics. They explain institutional logics as social norms that individuals follow and they are restricted by the logics from the bigger institutions. However, their theories do not specifically refer to the situations of the Hong Kong art world and therefore interviews are conducted to identity the Hong Kong artists follow the social, artistic and market logics during their creations process.

This thesis also discovered that the artist does not work on one logic but few logics. The results show that all the interviewees work for more than one logics but they reveal that they have preference on one logic and weaker intention to work on the others. In this thesis, the existence of the conflicting logics does not mean that the artist wants to strengthen the logic that he prefers and thus replaces the other. This argument is supported by Rae and Hining (2009) who emphasize the conflicting logics can develop a collaborative relationship. The research result show that the three logics are important to them but some logics are contradictory to each other in nature. In this chapter, I will first discuss how the theories of the production of the arts from the sociological and the artistic perspective corresponded to the research results. The second step is to discuss how the logics co-exist which is contradictory to the conflicting logics.

A.The theory of the sociological perspective.

The research result proves the validity of the theories that the construction of the artworks is not only contributed by the artist themselves but other actors. Baumann (2007) argues the importance of legitimacy in the art world. The meaning is that the artist needs to be accepted before participating in the exhibition. The interview results show that other parties from the society have a strong influence on the construction of the artworks. The interviewed artists say that their graduated art schools influence their career because the art manager tends to select artists based on certain art schools. The theory of DiMaggio (1987) argues that resources contribute to the construction of the legitimacy of the art. The popular art school has both tangible and intangible resources. The interviewees say that people on top positions have strong connection to the art school. They tend to promote artists from certain art schools. It means that graduating from certain art schools can enhance the symbolic value of the artist and allow them to gain legitimacy more easily.

Moreover, Baumann (2007) argues that the artist needs to develop tactics to gain legitimacy. The meaning of legitimacy is that the presented artworks are accepted by the art manager and the audience. They are exhibited to the public. According to the research results, networking, which is a component of the social logic, is a tactic that the artist has to develop because building up a good network with the art manager helps the artist to gain legitimacy of their artwork. As Becker (1974) argues that art is socially constructed and the creation of the arts involves not only the artist but also the art manager or the gallery owner. The research results show that the artist believes in the

effectiveness of networking, meaning that the theory of Baumann about the importance on gaining legitimacy is valid. The artist relies on other actors to gain legitimacy.

The theory of Klamer (2016) argues that the shared value is crucial for the artist during their creation process. It is also regarded as a component of the sociological perspective because Klamer (2016) argues that the audience is also involved in the creation of the artwork. He expects a conversation can be formed between the audience and the artist. Conducting the interview, the argument of Klamer can be proven valid because the artist expects the audience to get inspired from her artwork. The interviewees want to bring messages to their audience and look forward to their reply.

B.The artistic perspective

The theories discussing the artistic logic are diverse. Scholars do not have a shared opinion in how art is produced in the artistic logic. On one hand, scholars such as Hirschman (1983) and Stohs (1992) believe that the production of the arts is driven the personal motivation of the artist. They argue that the production of the arts is to gain self-satisfaction and is not concerned with other external factors. On the other hand, Meyer & Even (1998) explain that the artist takes care of the thought of the recipient during their process of production. It means that the external factors influence the production of the arts from the argument of Meyer & Even. The interview shows that the theory of Hirschman (1983) and Stohs (1992) is more suitable to the opinion of the artist. The interviewed artists say that their creation idea is mainly driven by their personal experience but not the others. The research results show that

the intrinsic motivation involves in their creation idea, meaning that the creation of the art is to gain self-satisfaction.

Another discovery of this research is that the conflicting logics are not completely. The theory of Thornton and Ocasio (2008) argues that some actors want to construct the new logics and want to replace the old ones. The reason is that the actors find the existing logics become the barrier to their changes. They prefer to construct the new logics and replace the old ones which will be favourable to their development and strengthen their status in the industry. In this thesis, the interviewed artists do not choose to construct the news logics but instead they can work with the opposite logics. They show that the conflicting logics can co-exist. The obvious example is that artist B prefects the artistic logic rather than the market logic but she can still cooperate with the commercial gallery in a long term. She admits that the gallery is profit-oriented, supported by Giuffre (1999) arguing that commercial galleries are profit orientated but she is able to maintain her creation ideas which are also respected by the gallery. The situation reflected by the artist does not apply to the conflicting logics from Thornton and Ocasio (2008). It shows that in the Hong Kong art world, both the artistic and the market logic are co-existed even though the artist cooperates with the commercial gallery.

Moreover, the co-existence of the two logics does not prove the validity of the theory of Becker (1974) from the sociological perspective. Becker (1974) argues that artists have to make compromise with the curator or the art manager because they are concerned with the expectation of the audience on the exhibited artworks. But the demonstration on the section of the artistic logic

meets the social logic gives another perspective. Some interviewed artists claim that they can follow their creation during the process and are not concerned with the audience. It shows that they do not make compromise when they create and still enjoy the artistic freedom.

C.Success

The research on the definition of success discovers the unexplored area of the theories of success and at the same time justifies the existing theory.

Baumann (2007) argues that the art becomes successful when it gains legitimacy. Gaining legitimacy means that the artwork needs to be recognized by the art critic or the art historian. Bourdieu (1986) also argues that the key characteristic of cultural goods is it carries symbolic meanings. The symbolic meaning is not given by the artist but the audience. It proves that the definition of success is that the artwork is recognized in the society.

However, the existing theory does not mention the internal success. Through the research, we discovered that the artists define success as something internal, their personal achievement is to compare with the artworks that they create in their career. Moreover, the interviewed artists say that it is necessary to create constantly and persistently when they want to become successful. They regard success as something intrinsic and there is no need to compare to other artists and be recognized. They seek for the ability on a constant improvement.

D.Discussion on the research question

This thesis studies the research question What is the role of institutional logics and success in the arts in Hong Kong. To explore the question in detail, it separates into three sub questions:

- 1. Which institutional logics can be identified in the Hong Kong art world?
- 2. How does the Hong Kong artist define success?
- 3. How do institutional logics relate to the success of the Hong Kong artist?

Answering this question, a semi-qualitative research has been conducted. Focusing on question 1, three logics have been identified in the Hong Kong art world and two combined logics are discovered. The research results show that the artist of Hong Kong follows the five aspects during their creation process. The interview results show that all artists in Hong Kong follow the artistic logic during their creation and all interviewees think that the artistic logic is the most important logic of being an artist. The reason is that the artistic logic emphasizes the aesthetic quality and motives which encourage the artist to create. The social logic is also identified in this research. The interview shows that only part of the interviewed artists follow the social logic. The social logics includes the influence of the social incidents on their creation ideas. Only some of the artists reflect those social and political incidents on their artworks. Asking whether the experience from the daily life or social incidents bring them a stronger influence, most of the artists think that they get inspired from the experience on daily life rather than the social incidents. From this discovery, it shows that the artistic logic is more dominant than the social logic.

The market logic is also identified from the research. The market logic has the

weakest dominance in the creation of the interviewed artist because the artist claims that they do not have much expectation on earning a fabulous amount of money in creating art. Besides, they follow the market logic the least because they do not want to be distinguished as the commercial or lucrative artist, which is harmful to their career and popularity.

However, the combined logics between the artistic logic and the market logic are discovered in the research. Following the market logic is usually the artist who cooperates with the commercial gallery because of their profit oriented nature. The artist is willing to work with both the artistic logic and the market logic. The situation is that they realize what they are create is sold in the art market but they can enjoy the artistic autonomy without the involvement of the galley owner.

The sub-questions 2&3 discuss the definition of success and its relations to the identified institutional logics. A discovery in this thesis is that the interviewed artist find the conventional way of defining success, such as commercial success or being popular less important than the internal success. The internal success is defined as the artist can enjoy artistic freedom during their creation and self-improvements. The result shows that the identified artistic logic is influential to the internal success because the artistic logic emphasizes the pursue of the aesthetic quality which allows the artist to improve their work constantly.

Chapter 6 Conclusion

In conclusion, this thesis has identified the three logics in the arts of Hong Kong. The three logics are the artistic logic, the social logic and the market logic. It does not mean that the three logics carry the same importance. The artistic logic carries a more important role to the artist. When we study how the logics co-exist, it is discovered that the artist regards the artistic logic as the priority. The artistic logic goes first and the other logics follow suit. The market logic is the most neglected one because the artist does not want to be identified as a commercial or lucrative one. The artist does not only follow the single logics but also the combined logics. A discovery from the artist is that in the Hong Kong art world, the artistic and the market logic are co-existed. Their works are sold in the commercial art world but they can still follow the artistic logic in their creation. Another focus of this thesis is to find out how the artist defines success and its relations to the identified institutional logics. The result is that the artist is concerned with the success of themselves rather than comparing to the others or being recognized. In this kind of success, we call it as an internal success. The artist emphasizes the development of their artistic career throughout in a life-long way and requires constant improvement. The artistic logic is highly relevant to the internal success because it requires the development of aesthetical quality. The external success is defined as being recognized by the audience, the art manager, or the art historian. The social logic is more relevant to the external success because it involves other social actors in the production process and they have the power to promote the artist.

The limitation of this thesis

The limitation of this thesis is that I am not able to go back to Hong Kong to conduct interviews with the artist. Although the interview was conducted through video chat or call chat, which a conversation could be formulated, it is believed that face-to-face conversation can enhance the quality of the interview. By having a face-to-face interview, further mutual trust can be made and the artist can provide a more detailed answer. In addition, during the process of inviting the artist, some artists rejected my invitation because I could not do the face-to-face interview. Those invited artists could enrich the variety of the sample which allows me to conduce a more comprehensive analysis. Furthermore, although age was not taken into one of the selection criteria, the age group of the interviewed artist is relatively young. Only 1/3 of the artist is over 40s, meaning that the opinion from mature artists can be broadened by inviting more established artists for the interview.

Recommendation for future research

This thesis is believed to be the first academic paper to use the concept of institutional logics to study the Hong Kong art world. If scholars are interested in the topic, it is possible for them to discover are there other logics existed in the Hong Kong art world. Moreover, it is still possible for them to make use of the identified logics in this thesis to test their validity. The research was conducted in the qualitative way, it is believed that scholars can use the quantitative way to do the research, especially in the topic of success. The research result in success will be different when a quantitative method is used.

Reference

- Alford & Friedland (1991). Brining society back in: Symbols, Practices, and institutional contradictions. The New Institutionalism in Organizational Analysis. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press. Pp.232-266
- Babbie, E. (2008). Introduction to Social Research. Belmont: Wadsworth.
- Baumann, S. (2007). A general theory of artistic legitimation: How art worlds are like social movements. *Poetics*, *35*(1), 47-65. doi:10.1016/j.poetic.2006.06.001
- Becker, H. S. (1974). Art as collective action. *American Sociological Review,* 39(6), 7 67-776. DOI: 10.2307/2094151
- Bettis, R.A. & Prahalad, C.K. (1995). The dominant logic: Retrospective and extension. Strategic Management Journal, Vol.16, No. 1 pp 5-14
- Caves, R. E. (2000). *Creative industries: Contracts between art and commerce*.

 Cambridge, Mass;London;: Harvard University Press.
- Chan, C. (2016). Post-umbrella movement: Localism and radicalness of the Hong Kong student movement. *Contemporary Chinese Political Economy and Strategic Relations*, *2*(2), 885-908.
- Cheng, E. W. (2016). Street politics in a hybrid regime: The diffusion of political activism in post-colonial hong kong. *China Quarterly, 226*(226), 383-406. doi:10.1017/S0305741016000394
- Chloe Preece & Finola Kerrigan (2015) Multi-stakeholder brand narratives: an analysis of the construction of artistic brands, Journal of Marketing Management, 31:11-12,1207-1230, DOI: 10.1080/0267257X.2014.997272
- Colbert, F. (2011). Management of the arts In In R. Towse (Ed.), *A Handbook of Cultural Economics* (pp.261-265). Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited.

- DiMaggio, P. (1987). Classification in art. *American Sociological Review, 52*(6), 440
- DiMaggio, P. (1997). Culture and cognition. *Annual Review of Sociology, 23*(1), 263-287. doi:10.1146/annurev.soc.23.1.263
- Eikhof, D. R., & Haunschild, A. (2007). For art's sake! artistic and economic logics in creative production. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, *28*(5), 523-538. doi:10.1002/job.462
- Frenandez-Blanco, F. & Prieto-Rodriguez, J. (2011) Museums In R. Towse (Ed.), *A Handbook of Cultural Economics* (pp.290-296). Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited
- Giuffre, K. (1999). Sandpiles of opportunity: Success in the art world. *Social Forces*, 77(3), 815-832. doi:10.1093/sf/77.3.815
- Hirschman, E. C. (1983). Aesthetics, ideologies and the limits of the marketing concept. *Journal of Marketing*, *47*(3), 45-55
- Joy, A. (2000). Art, works of art, and the discourse of fine art: Between art worlds and art markets. *Research in consumer behavior*, *9*, 71-102.
- Joy, A., & Sherry, & JOHN F. (2003). Disentangling the paradoxical alliances between art market and art world. *Consumption Markets & Culture, 6*(3), 155-181. doi:10.1080/1025386032000153759
- Klamer, A. (2016) Doing the Right Thing. London: Ubiquity Press
- Meyer, J. A., & Even, R. (1998). Marketing and the fine arts–inventory of a controversial relationship. *Journal of Cultural Economics*, *22*(4), 271-283. doi:10.1023/A:1007483732603
- Preece, C., & Kerrigan, F. (2015). Multi-stakeholder brand narratives: An analysis of the construction of artistic brands. *Journal of Marketing Management*, 31(11-12), 1207-1230.

- Rao, H., Monin, P., & Durand, R. (2003). Institutional change in toque ville:

 Nouvelle cuisine as an identity movement in french gastronomy. *American Journal of Sociology, 108*(4), 795-843. doi:10.1086/367917
- Rodner, V. L., & Thomson, E. (2013). The art machine: Dynamics of a value generating mechanism for contemporary art. *Arts Marketing, 3*(1), 58. doi:10.1108/20442081311327165
- Stohs, J. H. (1992) Intrinsic motivation and sustained art activity among male fine and applied artists, Creativity Research Journal, 5:3, 245-252, DOI: 10.1080/10400419209534438
- Towse, R. (2011) *A Handbook of Cultural Economics*. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited.
- Throsby, C. D. (2001). *Economics and culture*. Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Thornton, P., and Ocasio, W. (2008). "Institutional logics", In The SAGE handbook of organizational institutionalism, R. Greenwood, C. Oliver, R. Suddaby, and K. Sahlin-Andersson, eds., London: Sage Publications Ltd, p.99-129.
- Thornton, P. H. (2002). The rise of the corporation in a craft industry: Conflict and conformity in institutional logics. *The Academy of Management Journal*, *45*(1), 81-101. doi:10.2307/3069286
- Velthuis, O. (2011). Art dealers In R. Towse (Ed.), *A Handbook of Cultural Economics* (pp.28-32). Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited.
- Velthuis, O. (2005). *Talking prices: Symbolic meanings of prices on the market* for contemporary art. Woodstoc: Princeton University Press
- Venkatesh, A., & Meamber, L. A. (2008). The aesthetics of consumption and the consumer as an aesthetic subject. *Consumption Markets & Culture*,

11(1), 45-70. doi:10.1080/10253860701799983

Zolberg, V. L. (1990). Constructing a sociology of the arts. New York:

Cambridge University Press.

Appendix A – Interview Guide

- 1. The background information about an artist
 - Why do you want to become an artist?
 - His/ her opinion on the function of art
 - The purpose of creating art

2. In a social approach

- How do you get inspired when you create?
- Do you think the social changes, for example, political incidents, influence your ideas of creation?
- An experience on daily life and hidden changes on society,
 which factor do you find more important when you create?
- After the outbreak of the umbrella movement, do you think your creation ideas of your artworks have changed?
- Do you think it happens on other local artists?

3. In a market approach

- What kind of hierarchy exists in the hong kong art world?
- Which party dominates the most the hong kong art world?
- Is it necessary to conform when you work with a gallery or an art organization?
- How would you promote your artwork?
- How branding is important to you?

4. About success

- How would you define success?
- In Hong Kong, what are the factors leading to success?
- To you personally, which success do you think is more important?
 Cultural success or commercial success?
- What is the greatest difference between hong kong artists and overseas artists in terms of working environment and opportunity?
- Comparing to other countries, do you think there are sufficient chances to get promoted/become popular?

Appendix B The coding table

Artist A

The artistic logic	The social logic / the market logic	Internal Success
But there is a force to ask me to		painting is a lifelong career an artist
paint. It is not a random practice, but		needs to uphold their creation ideas
a long-term practice.		and do not change them from time to
But for myself, the important thing is		time I would say it is a life-long
that. It is a meaning of existence.		persistence and they should not
Painting proves that I am exist.		change their approach when other
My motivation on painting is very		people give comments on your
simple. I do not think that much. The		artwork
theme starts from the daily life.		
Therefore, everything related to my		
living space and time. I can use		
anything from my life in my painting.		
The reason is everything has a		
meaning to exist. When I draw these		
objects, I justify their significance on		
existence		
 painting is not to express something 		
changing all the time but eternal or		
universal subject		

Artist B

The artistic logic	The social logic	The market logic
I develop artworks which are focus on	And I do not want to follow such a	But gallery. Gallery can help you for
something related to time. The colour	dynamic world. But the postcard	the income They can help you to
of yellow symbolizes the change of	project lasts for a long time. It records	create or promote.
time. I do not use any chemical and	311 earthquake the political incident	
the paper becomes old gradually. It	in Thailand. I ask my friends whether	
talks about the condition of human	they wear red t-shirts or yellow	
beings. They are soo small and its	t-shirts, but I am not critical of it. My	
relation with time. I borrow some	role is to record it. Some artists would	
meanings from the chinese	like to work on something critical.	
philosophy people grow from	It shows that the artist has an	
nothing to everything and therefore	intention to follow the social logic	
they have nothing. I am using a	during her creation process. The 311	
natural way to make these papers.	earthquake refers to the Fukushima	
And I do not fix those images Many	Daiichi nuclear disaster and the	
people create some artworks End is	tsunami occurs in Japan. The yellow	
end. But the creation process of my	and the red colour refers to the two	
works does not end because it	confronting political blocs in Thailand	
changes from time to time. And at last	in 2010s.	
we will see what it is. It's one of the		

biggest concepts of my work. It takes
time to create them. Some people
asked me whether my works fade out
but it does not. It accumulate bit by bit
according to the change of time.

- From 2005 I had nothing to do. I do not know what I am doing but drawing anything at my home. It looks like a visual diary. I work with it for more than 6 months... and I compare the first one to the last one. I saw that because of time, the quality of the paper changes. It is a subtle thing... but I want to know the relationship between human being and time.
- From 2008-2010, I see a lot of images about my home. For example, some figures and the time and object create the dialogue. My topic is still life. It is about life and space and draw a co-relation. The object, kitchen... it represents my identity as an artist, a mother and a housewife. My identity

	can be shown through these objects.
	It shows that the artist make use of
	her personal experience into her
	creation
•	I think that my gallery does not
	demand me to do certain things. They
	respect the artist. I am not controlled
	by them, because I do not want to
	follow the commercial tract. I would
	like to say that a good gallery would
	never control their artists.
	It shows although art gallery is for
	selling, artist B still focuses on her
	creation and she can enjoy her own

	The internal success	The external success
•	I would, I examine their quality see whether I like it or	
	not. It's the life long being. I define an artist to see whether	
	they are successful or not not only from an art work, but	
	also all their artworks. I would like to see from the start I	
	would see whether they are innovative from time to time. A	

autonomy in her creation.

successful artist can present some changes from each exhibition and bring me new messages or meanings. But I would see some artists who have already staying in a good position but they do not have big changes as they want to have a secure position... and I do not think they are successful.

Artist C

The artistic logic The social logic The market logic I pays attention to my living significance is to present myself, my It depends on the offer. If it is good environment, Streets that I pass by, ego and to release my feeling. offer, than I am willing to sign. I am so now I create the painting. Function ... perhaps I hope that art not a complicated person. Chan: for example, the umbrella can influence one's cultural there're two kinds. The first type has movement in 2014, after the outbreak knowledge and their ways of thinking. more freedom. They join the gallery of the umbrella movement, or the That's my personal opinion. It's a and they share the commission. The political changes, does it influence change in additional to education. other is that you have a contract for you? It shows that the artist also follows three years and you are represented Artist C: not much, because I am kind the shared logic during his creation by them. In the beginning, of course process because he wants to bring they look free. But as time goes by, of a realist, referring to my living environment ... um so my artworks they have more requests. You have something to the others and change do not have much political themes, their thought. to paint what they like. but of course my mood is influenced for example, you draw a painting and I think if your works are on good

by it.

- he theme of drawing which is organized systemically. But these systems or logic does not conflict with the influence from my daily life. Until the influence of the daily life is relevant to my drawing and then I will bring it to my work.
 - During the discussion on the social events, artist B thinks that unless those events are relevant to his creation system, he won't include those events from the society to his artwork.
- drawing something is a straight form, the level of brightness and contrast is systemic and has the rule... and also when an object is under the light, what is the changes... and I would make use of these experience to create

Artist C mentions his creation system, showing his aesthetic ideas

- you show them to the public. If your painting is powerful, in terms of its meaning and message that one would like to carry out, people would feel the same meaning as yours. People see the painting, and they change from their behavior or way of thinking, that's what we call change. He intensifies his explanation on the shared logic
- I like talking buses and therefore you show the view. The view is moving. So my artwork is very long, from left to right. so it is different from what I see. So you can realize the details of my paintings.
- My local community. Where I live has constructed a lot of new buildings and the public transport system is not well developed, and the problem of traffic jam influences me a lot.
 It shows that what is occurring in the community really disturbs artist C,

- quality, your works are strong. When your work is appreciated by the public, and then you have stronger bargaining power, thus you can get a greater level of freedom. It means that your quality is not good enough when you do not have a good bargaining power.
- I would do something that I good at, to draw their attention.

on his creation.

 I only think that I have many opinions or thoughts on painting, and when I see the works from other artists, I think that I might add something to compensate what is missing. so I would point them out.

He wants to enrich the field of painting, improving its possibility.

and he wants to reflect them on his artworks.

when some audience see some linear graphics, and then their thought would have changed. and when they see something curvy, and then their thought would have another change. Perhaps they feel shocked or comfortable. In the future I believe these shock or comfort would change their behavior. I don't know. It is certain that visual effect brings us the greatest impact, in addition to knowledge, so I believe it will cause a direct effect to the audience.

Artistic C mentions for the second time that he wants to bring some messages to his audience, even influence their behavior by showing his artworks.

 the utmost importance is that you can tell the audience how do you examine an object.

- They have their own fields of working and networking. Because there is only a small amount of people who can afford to buy art. Therefore they have their connections, but within a tiny group of artists. that's my perception.
 - It shows that networking is crucial in the art market, although artist C does not tell his opinion. It shows that networking is important to the artist.
- When you earn some prices, or you are quite popular, of course they are selected first. For example when you are an professor in the art academy, of course they choose them first. And for me, I am not that popular. of course I am not invited.
- Chan: do you think they find out students from those popular professors first, before coming to you? Well... some artists with

connections with celebrity artists, do	
you think it will be easier to be	
promoted?	
Artist C: of course it's easier otherwise	
artists do not go to opening.	
•	

The internal success	The external success
	I want to enter the global art world, to be included in the
	auction.
	 You would build up some potential competitors, who are
	also painters, and you must pay attention to him. therefore,
	you have to find some ways or make yourself stronger. It
	shows that artist C regards success as a comparative result
	with the others. He wants to be better than other artists.

Artist D

The artistic logic	The social logic	The market logic
Personal experience would give me		there are two type of artists. First is to
more inspirations. I think that the		sign a contract. For example they are
social activities also do give me		representing you. On the other hand,
inspirations because it is not		it's a normal way of cooperation. Of
separable to your life but I do not		course the condition of the two
think that it needs to present it		contracts is totally different. They
directly. But on the other hand		would request for example how
some artists do. Art is not necessary		many artworks you would create
to be presented that directly from		and after you submit ten artworks to
what happens in the society. It can be		them, they might tell you that we do
presented in some other forms		not like certain artworks please
I am given a lot of opportunities to do		re-do them. Of course that's not a
so, but I am not willing to do so.		good thing.
Otherwise my position would be		 They are willing to spend more
much higher. They would ask me, are		money on you, in terms of marketing
you willing to do this or that but i		and promotion. The drawback is that
say no.		you might be distracted by all these
		voices from other people. Their
		opinion might not be position to you,
		meaning that you will spend a lot of
		time to go back to the starting point.

Some galleries have more freedom. You can participate in an exhibition at other galleries. It shows that there are two logics combined in the Hong Kong art world. On one hand they are commercial, but they give freedom to the artist on the other.

- However, it is not possible if you join the gallery which represents you. You will have less freedom. When people realize that when you are cooperating with a gallery with a fixed contract, other galleries will not approach you. It is a commercial decision.
- But in the local market, there are less than 20 collectors who buy artworks constantly. It is not a healthy situation. Hong Kong artists develop some aesthetics but it is contradictory with the taste of the collector. It seems like when artists need to cater to their needs, therefore they are subordinate to those collectors.

	1
	1
	1
	1
	1

The internal success	The external success
 a successful artist has his own theme. Aesthetics They 	
need to have a skill to make reflection rather than earning	
money.	
It's related to their personality	

Artist E

The artistic logic		The social logic	The market logic
when I am not busy, I read	•	What is happening in the political	
newspaper just live like a normal		world and we are suffering from	
person. I would like to explore the		these systems whether artists can	
world. I think that artists are always		survive and arrangement of the	
busy with their creation but neglect		museums, it is all related to the world	
what is happening in the world. But		that we are living in. my work talks	
what is happening in the outside		about the society, history of	
world I do not know. I would		migration and you can refer to	
explore Hong Kong, and go some		some artworks which are very	
places where I am not familiar with.		political.	
And I really enjoy the moment when	•	I had a project last year in Taiwan.	
my house is clean. My house carries		The exhibition venue was 4000	
many things that I miss and I do not		square feet. I lowered the ceiling for	
want to throw away.		1/3 and I occupied the entire	
		exhibition space. But they never had	
		any artist to occupy the entire space.	
		They did not believe in me. The	
		Taiwanese authority worries a lot.	
		and the hong kong authority helps	
		me a lot. would you think to put a	
		meditation tent? they ask me to put	

a lot, but I refuse But I did not
hang all the tentsit shows that the
artist needs to make compromise
with the art manager in some extent.
The exhibition is not created
exclusively by the artist but also other
actors, such as the manager of the
exhibition space.

Artist F

The artistic logic	The social logic	The market logic
 To me, many things happen 	Recently I participate in an	I have heard about them. but we do
because people make it too simple.	exhibition. It combines politics or my	not care. When they invite you, they
They see things in a simple way.	interpersonal relationships and try to	will respect your creation ideas. They
what people reflect on the things or	make them. at the same time, I do	do not involve in your creation that
other issues should not be too	not make it in an explicit way but in	much. When they understand the
simple. And even in a more practical	the exhibition, I would combine	creation ideas, they are willing to
way, you cannot skip some steps to	something and I would get another	invest in your artwork. I have also
create my work. It is necessary to go	feeling. I make them, depending on	heard about it. When being asked
through some processes before	its material and materials which	whether the artist is influenced by the
finishing my works. I can therefore	inspire me the way of making these	gallery, artist F replies that the gallery
reflect on these processes.	art to get the message	still respects the artist, while some of
The situation is that artists would	● it doesn't. There are a lot of ways,	the gallery really dominates their
communicate with curator before	e.g. new reports or newspapers to	creation ideas.
they go into the exhibition. When the	show the categories that you	
curator have some opinion which	mention. It becomes a cliché. Of	
they do not agree, it would be a	course the process is very dark and	
situation that the curator thinks the	not fair. It already creates some	
artist has better artworks that they	tensions and it keeps repeating.	
can provide.	Therefore, do I have to reflect the	
• it is not that tough. When the artist	group which has some needs? It is	
insists, they would always listen to	not my aim. For example there are	

the artist. The greatest obstacle is from themselves.... It is quite common. They have their own struggle... but of course when some people ask them something, they would have their struggle... it is influenced by other factors. It again shows the dilemma between the artistic and the social logics. The artist is respected to their creation but they struggle with the suggestions given by the others. They are concerned about the opinion from other social actors and make adjustment.

some people realizing very bad political conditions. I find it a little bit strange. There are some good and bad aspects of politics. The bad aspect is that it is useless. In the world, you can use many tools. Some people regard art as a tool for communication, but to me, I am not that flexible. When I am not making it as a tool, there's no one to blame me. It shows that Artist F does not follow the social logic that much. He pays attention to politics and social events, but find it reluctant to include those messages in his artworks.

 it is also related to networking. When foreign curators go to Hong Kong, they search for artists through art institutions. and they will only introduce artists that they know. In the institution, of course they will introduce artists that they know or they cooperate with. I am not a personal good at social skills. As an outsider, of course we would think that I am excluded. But it is necessary for us to reflect what is happening.

We cannot blame them. information preference is a norm. What we can do is to create better works of art.

Artist F again shows the importance of networking in the Hong Kong art world, favouring of receiving chance to participate in exhibitions

Some people are just social... of course they can have more attentions.

The internal success	The external success
 serious. They need to develop their own artworks. 	They • Chan: commercial success is more important or cultural
need to make reflections all the time. They have to	go success is more important?
beyond their comfort zone and bring new elements	to what Artist F: both are important. Of course some people do not
they are creating.	like to be too commercialized, but I think that there are
I think what I mention, they can do what they want.	They some audience from the commercial side. the taste is

need to be honest to themselves. I hear some artists who do similar things from time to time, and they want to make some changes. But they do not make such changes. They have to trust themselves, or go further without caring anything.

- different from the culture. I do think they are not that devil. If im allowed to choose, but commercial success is important.
- there are some artworks which are easy to collect... they are not from the opposite. I am quite a special one. I do think there are many people who would like to regard the two things are in contradiction.

Artist G

The artistic logic		The social logic		The market logic
for example personal issues and I	•	My topic includes consumerism. I talk	•	The number of people who can
will talk about social issues relate to		about how people spend their money.		accept different taste of art is not
myself. For example I have a topic		Buying the clothes fulfills your desire.		enough. And they are very secure
about Sun-Yat sen it is not only		My works are related to social issues		and they follow what people are
about historical issues but also		or gender but I make it start from my		doing. They are secure their living,
something personal. For example his		personal feelings. I express myself by		their chances to participate in
history about dating, how did his		using the world news, otherwise it		exhibitions They would listen to
girlfriends think about the		becomes private conversations with		opinion from experienced artists. The
revolutionary actions of Sun. So you		your friends.		perspective of Artist G is that some
can see it is quite personal or even	•	I paid attention to social issues for a		artists want to secure their income
selfish. My works do not express		long time. I do not think that single		and therefore they create artworks
something very big, or my emotions.		incident forces me to change		which are saleable.

- On the other hand, your personal emotions are far more dominant in your mind than what you perceive from the daily news. For example, a breaking up of a relationship is much more serious than Syrian war in terms of my emotions. You would feel it is non-sense... because it is of no importance when you care more about personal relationship
- If you see my artworks, you cannot see my artworks as being personal. But my ideas are emotional. If you see my artworks as a whole, you may feel that I am not talking about personal experience but feminist movements. I expect my anger because I want to fight for something. But actually it's something personal.
- Because I do not want to adopt my own stories as a theme, but instead I borrow some social events which carry symbols. Or I use those social
- because I have been working on this for a long time. For example, 4 June incident, 67 Riots.... Normal demonstrations, small riots have provoked my creation a lot. But I do think the sunflower student movement brings me a stronger influence. And the umbrella movement... I would not directly create them. I record the sunflower movement more than.... I like the feeling of being an outsider. I am not...I like being an outside. But instead the umbrella movement, I am not an outsider. I realize some people do.... But I cannot. I do not want to express my anger explicitly. So I use some smaller incidents to tell my feelings. And provoke discussion. The 4 June incident refers to the Tiananmen Massacre in Beijing in 1989, where the Chinese

government used military force to

 The aim is different of course.
 Commercial galleries aim at earning money but the art institution would ask you to do something that they want events as a metaphor. It shows that although artist G uses a lot of social issues in her artworks but she still sticks to the artistic logics because she expresses her personal feelings.

suppress students without any weapons. The 67 Riot refers to the riot in 1967, where the people of Hong Kong with the background of the Chinese Communist Party showed their discontent to the British colonial rule. They used violence and eventually were suppressed by the Hong Kong Police Force. The sunflower student movement refers to students in Taiwan (the Republic of China) protected the passing of a trade pace with the People's Republic of China. All these shows that Artist G is a social activist in her artworks in appearance.

 People from those art schools would strengthen their networking, not deliberately but gradually. It's more complicated... You know in the Chinese world... the relationship between students and teachers...
 And in Hong Kong.. people know each other. People on the top.. They have that background. And then they formulate their networking. It shows that art is regarded as an networking good. Artist G thinks that the education background of the artist is related to their chance to join exhibitions.

- I am not guessing whether they are being subjective. It's based on information and certainty.
- but the fact is every organization or institution has their own networking and therefore they invite artists who are their friends. I am not the one who is suitable for all the groups.
- I do not have a power to control the discourse. I have a right on my creation but when it comes to an exhibition, I do not have a full right to control everything that I want. There's perhaps 20%, but the rest of the 80% is determined by the others. I do not

have any power on hand. I am not
able to set any rules.

- It is not possible to control everything because of the physical limitation, what do they expect from you when you... it is not controled by yourself.
 Only artworks that I want to do it myself, without any invitation to an exhibition, work with full automony.
 Otherwise I think that only 60-70 % of the artworks are with my full control on the creation ideas. And these artworks cannot sell.
- I want people to listen to me. I want people to pay attention to my artwork.
 I can draw people's attention. It shows that artist G want to share her values on creating art with her audience it is regarded as a shared good.

The internal success	The external success
----------------------	----------------------

do want you want to do. You get the power of creating a discourse 話語權 you have an attitude of don't give a shit. You do not have to care about what others are doing. Many people feel they are neglected, ignored. It is about one's own attitude. It's about an expectation of the artist themselves, rather than external factors. Many people define an artist is successful or not by using external factors but I do not think it is the case.

Artist H

Artist H					
The artistic logic	The social logic	The market logic			
The theme of the creation is quite	 everyone has a different opinion as i 	I think that for example, graduate			
personal. I ask myself what do I want	find out that I think different from the	students make drawing landscapes			
to achieve.	others. Different things perhaps	but with characteristics in the East,			
perhaps I ask myself living is quite	what can I do to improve the world.	and therefore they can attract foreign			
personal. I think that my identity is	But after highschool I do not believe	collectors. When gallery owners			
quite normal, nothing special, and on	that they can change the world. It's	realize that collectors prefer some			
the other hand in terms of	can be more successful than film.	kinds of artworks, they would			
interpersonal relationship, I do not	What needs to be change is the	therefore promote those artists			
have a very broad networking. It	human being.	making the relative artworks.			
seems like in the Hong Kong	 It is about the way of thinking, 	Especially the hong kong gallery			
contemporary art world, I am	morality and attitude. How can my	would not try an experimental			
studying on the edge. So when you	audience change their way of	artwork. It shows that some artists			
compare with the others.	thinking in the world? It shows that	still follow the market logic, making			
My motivation (of making art) is more	artist H wants to share his creation	some artworks which are favourable			
primitive.	ideas with his audience, changing	for sales.			
	their way of thinking.	I would listen to them when I think			
	 On contrary, it is not necessary. 	their opinion is useful. I would think			
	When I think that what happens in the	therefore, I will go back to paintings.			
	Hong Kong society is not prominent	It shows that artist H also follows the			
	enough for me to talk about it then I	market logic when he finds that he			
	would not express them in my	will have a better future.			

artwork.

- It is not that imminent, in terms of political changes, but i think that the greatest social issue is space. But all these issues become crucial, they will gradually appear in my works of art. It shows that artist H still follows the social logic during his creation process because he is patient to wait for an appropriate moment.
- I think it has some influence. For example, when you graduate from the city university of Hong Kong, teachers are very international. They have more connections to festivals.
- It is because hkbu has more than 100 graduates, and their graduates have also strong influence.... And now city
 U. .. also artists study abroad.
- now a lot of graduates from HKBU... but now for example you graduate from certain art schools, you would have some connections.

Artist H shows that the education
background of the artist has a strong
influence to their career.
Furthermore, artist H believes that
different university graduates have
their own network.

The internal success	The external success		
Good quality	Being an international artist		
	I want to be appeared in the art history and being not		
	commercial		

Artist I

The artistic logic		The social logic	The market logic
I think that daily life and any other	•	during the umbrella movement, I	
things are related to myself. For		drew something related to them. I	
example in my daily life, if something		had been going there for a long time.	
does not provoke my feeling that		and I think that generation is a way to	
those things won't be my creation		protect democracy and it is crucial	
ideas. For example when the society		and the freedom that you do not want	
happens something which will trigger		to lose.	
your emotions, and you will put them	•	I feel in vain. I have a lot of paintings	
into your creation.		bringing these political messages. I	
		put the symbol of yellow when I feel	
		that it is necessary. I will put the	
		yellow ribbon but it's quite subtle	
		but I won't project them in an explicit	
		way but rather indirect. It show	
		that the artwork of artist I includes	
		social and political messages, aiming	
		at fighting the democracy of Hong	
		Kong.	
	•	I go to different districts to paint,	
		because the changes in the Hong	
		Kong society is really fast. I think of	

which kind of method that can use to record these changes... and I decide to use the method of painting. I spend time on those places... and I have feelings from those places. Therefore I draw a lot of things on Hong Kong. after that, I draw some illustrations. For example there is a monster. Time will bring changes. Therefore, in the future, I will use those directions. Between time and changes as my creation idea. It again shows that artist I is an artist who follows the social logic a lot. She wants to show the changes in the Hong Kong society, which emphasizes development all the time and the reconstruction project is everywhere and endless.

The internal success	The external success
It's a bit weird. I think that to make use of your life to create.	

For me, personal art practice is more important. And on the	
other hand is that your living.	

Artist J

		Aitist	
The artistic logic		The social logic	The market logic
 My artwork is very simple. And it's 	•	in Hong Kong, I realize that the	Chan: are they controlling your
really colourful. I always use warm		people do not treasure the historical	creation ideas?
colour. So you know what I want to		building and they want to remove	Amy: they are more open and do
bring to the audience.		them. SOme historical buildings that I	not control me that much.
 it's all about life. The object that I 		like them a lot are demolished. I feel	
want to make, I find them from my		really sad.	
life. When I want to make a sculpture,	•	I would I put the best elements into	
I would make a very colourful or		my works. Many buildings are very	
attractive sculpture. Recently I focus		old and you find they are not very	
on making painting.		beautiful But it is not the case.	
		They include a lot of people and	
		stories and how much do we	
		know? Some scholars do not ask for	
		beauty because they are	
		knowledgeable and they show you	
		inner beauty	
	•	I think that it is necessary for the artist	
		to do such things. One of their	
		functions is as you mentioned. To the	
		society It is necessary And I	
		think they will receive less chance to	

do such thing.

- for example many years ago... SARS. The idea was from an artist from the 17th century.. And he drew the naked woman. And her back is to face the mirror. And I want the people of Hong Kong to reflect what is the reason for those bad things occur... and hygienic problem.... And I always reflect the bad things from Hong Kong... and two years ago... there was an earthquake in Japan and I hope that in Japan... I use my way to support them. I want them to be strong again.... And in different aspects... and reflect them in my artwork.
- every period... there are different things occur. And my responsibility is to bring some message... japanese earthquake... the umbrella movement...

The internal success		The external success		
	 as what you mention meaning and beauty. 			

Artist K

The artistic logic		The social logic	The market logic
 personal experience is the first 	•	personal experience is the first	
step but afterwards, you can find		step but afterwards, you can find	
out many steps. And you can relate		out many steps. And you can relate	
them to a lot of issues		them to a lot of issues	
I didn't want to be an artist I want to	•	In 2015, I made And my father	
create I do not regard myself as an		was a hakka and I cannot speak	
artist. It's my way of thinking.		that dialect. I made an audio	
		installation And people are	
		learning the dialect together. This	
		example is about Hakka and me, or	
		the relationship between me and my	
		father. After that, I realize that a lot of	
		people, who are Hakkas but they do	
		not speak the dialect. I reflect on the	
		reason why. It is related to the identity	
		and I think of the reason. And it is	
		about the history of Hong Kong, and	
		the culture of Hong Kong and I	
		reflect those issues indirectly. I think	
		of why why I do not speak that	

language. Now, some people argue that Hakkas needs to be preserved. And some people ask what is the point to learn that dialect... and it is about our identity. Hakkas is a group of people who speak the Hakka language. The term Hakka does not identify the geographical location that the Chinese people live... because they spread into many places in the world. In Hong Kong, there are a lot of people who are Hakkas but many of them, especially the younger generation do not speak the language because the most prevalent language in Hong Kong is Cantonese.

I think to talk about hong kong.
 therefore, I will be related to local issues. I want to involve in something which is not really popular and with less people discussing that issues.

The internal success	The external success
 You can do what you think but it seems that it is the basics. And I think to be honest success means that a thought can be presented in a higher level and thus to transfer them to the audience and I think it is the meaning of success. it is. If you ask me what is the definition of a successful doctor, account it is all internal, and it does not need a comment from the others. It is not external. 	

Artist L

Aitist E					
The artistic logic		The social logic		The market logic	
 it starts from my daily life. at the 	•	first, the goal is to talk about some	•	They give you a lot of topics and	
beginning I deal with the issue with		social issues and through my		criteria, and they ask you to follow.	
my domestic helper and it is my		artwork, I want to make some noise. I		There are a lot of rules to follow and	
personal relationship between me		am looking for the improvement. On		then because of commercial	
and my domestic helper		the other hand I want to entertain		decision they will give you more	
		myself it is a treatment.		rules.	
	•	And I will relate it to the society. How	•	in the beginning, I think it's fine. But	
		the people from society thinks about		during the creation process, they will	
		the issue of the domestic helper. and		remind you to do this and that. I find it	
		I will think of the topic that I am		annoying.	
		interested in which may happen in	•	They (the gallery) will say something	
		the society. I have also created		about it, and you need to follow	
		artworks showing the seriousness of		and sometimes I have no choice.	
		the subdivided units. and my job is			
		related to the housing it is very			
		expensive but small. People are			
		living in a small space			
		It shows that both the artistic logic			
		and the social logic. She starts from			
		her personal relationship with her			
		domestic helper and after that include			

	it in the social issues.		
THe internal success			The external success
		• it can inspire the	audience and I can earn my living.

Artist M

The artistic logic		The social logic	The market logic
However, personal experience posts	•	My inspiration is based on my	
a stronger influence on my artwork.		research on literature, film, and news.	
Art does not have to have a clear		I combine those medium and	
definition, in my opinion I will choose		therefore some those stories give you	
let it be. Many people ask for the		a lot of inspirations.	
function of the arts or its definition,	•	I think that the it is not possible to	
but I think it is not necessary.		change what happens in our society.	
Some artists are good at presenting		It won't change immediately.	
themselves in the social occasions		Therefore, I do not think that every	
but I do not. I only focus on creating		artist should use their own artwork to	
art.		respond to the social movement.	
		From the above two conversations, it	
		shows that artist M follows the social	
		logic during her creation but she has	
		a weaker concern on social	
		movement and the arts. She thinks	
		that it is not necessary to respond	
		those events through the arts.	
	•	Different	

The internal success	The external success
 Knowing youself and creating yourself. 	The conventional way of looking success is different from what I
But what I realize is different. I give you an example. David	define. Normally, in the context of Hong Kong, the
Hockney moved his studio to the countryside because he	characteristics are: artists are willing to go to the opening, good
hates visitors disturbing his creation. Duchamp was not	at social skills, good at English, have a comprehensive
good at social and he has only one collector, but now you	networking, easy to cooperate, produce artworks efficiently, and
can see his works in many museums. Being a successful	their themes are easy to be accepted by international audience.
artist has many ways but you are the only one who realizes	
the way to achieve. It shows that artist M defines success in	
her ways and she also think that it is something personal	
and need not be a conventional definitions mentioned on	
the right hand side of the bloc.	