How Do Contemporary Critics in Hong Kong and Taiwan Incorporate high aesthetics and popular aesthetics When Evaluating Korean Queer Movies?

Student Name: Yi Yin

Student Number: 424544

Supervisor: Daniela Stocco

Arts and Culture Studies

Erasmus School of History, Culture and Communication Erasmus University Rotterdam

Master Thesis

June 11, 2017.

ABSTRACT

Although not all films are art, it is argued that it can be. In the art world of films, there are various cultural intermediaries working for the legitimation of film as an art form. Here, as one of the intermediaries, critics play an important role in disseminating the legitimating ideology of films. In the contemporary context, in recent years, there has been an interesting phenomenon that Korean queer movies have enjoyed growing recognition and popularity across Asia, especially in Hong Kong and Taiwan. However, the study on Korean queer movies has been comparatively small-scaled Therefore, this study is about the film discourse of Korean queer movies in Hong Kong and Taiwan. Specifically, the research is interested in how contemporary criticism in these two discourses incorporate reviewing elements associated with high aesthetics and popular aesthetics. To do this, this study has conducted a content analysis on 40 film reviews on Korean queer movies. These 40 reviews were first separated into three types—reviews with a critical tone, reviews with a popular tone, and reviews with both critical tone and popular tones, the last of which is based on the fact that some Korean queer movies are celebrated both critically and commercially. Then, the study used Baumann (2006)'s theory on how art worlds are like social movements to analyze them. In the research, 13 themes have been generated from the data set and then grouped into the three main concepts from Baumann (2006)— 'Opportunity Space', 'Resources', and 'Framing'. Specifically, the study examined how exactly they have been mobilized by critics to support their claims as well as the differences in terms of their usages across film review types. In a nutshell, the study finds that Baumann (2006)'s three concepts work for all the three types of reviews, however, the ways they have been mobilized by the critics are different, which are closely related to the type of each review. Particularly, the concept 'Framing' is used most frequently by critics to support their claims—be that critical or popular. In terms of reviews that have both critical and popular tones, the research finds that it is more of the incorporation and combination of different themes instead of the dominance of one single theme that help push critics' acclaims on Korean queer movies further.

KEYWORDS: *Korean queer movies, film discourse, criticism, aesthetics systems, Baumann*

Table of Contents

Abstract and keywords

Table of Contents

1.Introduction

Over the past few years, "Korean wave", which refers to the rise of Korean culture in Asia, has spread across Asia where Tokyo and Hollywood have long dominated the cultural scene. South Korean cultural products—including television drama, pop songs and movies, have enjoyed growing popularity in mainland China, Taiwan, Hong Kong and other East and Southeast Asian countries (Shim, 2006).

Particularly, the South Korean movie production has proliferated. According to *Hollywood Reporter,* 'Korea has transformed itself from an embattled cinematic backwater into the hottest film maker in Asia' (Segers, 2000). South Korean cinema now provides a "full service cinema" model which ranges from both commercial and art cinema to independent film making, etc. The diversity of South Korean cinema challenges the hegemonic discourse on the national identity and provides alternative public sphere in which people address the socioeconomic and cultural issues of class, gender, and sexual identity (Choi, 2010).

At the same time, there has been an interesting phenomenon that, in recent years, queer issues in present-day Asian films have become more visible and relatively more radical, compared with their mainstream Western counterparts. The very suddenness of the homosexual positivity in Asian films have been conceivably more astonishing than anywhere else in the world (Grossman, 2000). In general, the past three decades have witnesses the growth of Asian films in terms of the artistic practice of movie-making. This phenomenon, together with the new liberality in queer representations in films produced during the same decades, reasonably contributed to the development of Asian queer movies. Grossman (2000) even argues that many of the best recent gay and lesbian films were produced in Asia.

Among the many queer movies produced in Asia in recent years, Korean queer movies stand out. By definition, queer is a broadly used term as it encompasses cinema in relation to non-straight sexualities (including but not limited to gay and lesbian sexualities). For the purpose of this research, queer movies are characterized not only by personal orientation and/or behavior, but also the social, cultural, and historical factors that define and create the conditions for such orientations and behaviors (Benshoff & Griffin, 2004, p.1). In recent years, Korean queer movies evoke core sentiments and modes of social, cultural, and political expression which have been embraced by the LGBT (lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender) movement in Korea. A distinctive feature of Korean queer movies is that some of them have

features from both commercial and artistic aspects. In Korea, there are directors specializing artistic queer movies such as Leesong Hee-il, Joh Kwang-soo Kim, Kyung-Mook Kim, and directors making commercial films that feature queer stories like Lee Jun-ik, Ha Yu, and Park Chan-wook. In that sense, auteur films and genres films often come hand in hand in the case of Korean queer movies("韩国同志电影漫谈," 2015). Moreover, Korean queer movies are not only well-received at home but have also been found to perform well in other film markets in East Asia—for instance Hong Kong and Taiwan. To illustrate it, back in 2009, when *Frozen Flower (2009)* was released in the cinema of Taiwan, it became the top-grossing movie among all the Korean movies ever released there (Pixnet, 2009). Also, Park Chan-wook's latest work *The Handmaiden* (2016) has generated the highest box-office revenues among all his movies that have been on the cinemas in Taiwan (Catchplay, 2016). Besides, *The Handmaiden* (2016) has been included in 'the 25 best films of 2016 shown in Hong Kong' by South China Morning Post (South China Morning Post, 2016). The popularity of Korean queer movies is an interesting phenomenon because East Asia is not a unified unity but a collective term which consists of groups with divergent social, cultural, economic, and political values, and sometimes these differences are conflicting (Kong & Lau & Li, 2016). Being popular in other distinctive Asian cinemas like Hong Kong and Taiwan suggests that it would be interesting to have a look at the dynamics within these film discourses.

Still, if we compare the Korean queer movies with queer-subject movies produced in Greater China region—particularly Hong Kong and Taiwan (mainland China is excluded from this comparison because Korean queer movies are not allowed to be on the cinema due to film censorship), we can find that they are different from each other. One characteristic that set Korean queer movies apart from its East Asian counterparts is that they have costume dramas that deal with real queer subjects that existed in the history— (e.g., *Frozen Flower (2009)*), while there haven't been any queer movies that explicitly deal with the history in Greater China region ("韩国同志电影漫谈," 2015). Another difference between Korean queer movies and other queer movies from Hong Kong and Taiwan is that while Korea queer movies have been enjoying box-office success, movie producers in Hong Kong and Taiwan must deal with the strict film censorship in mainland China—their largest film market, which in turn limits the possibility of exploring queer-subjects ("韩国同志电影漫谈," 2015).

Additionally, there has long been a need for academic research on queer Asian films (Grossman, 2000). Firstly, there exists this ever-represent need for more scholarly writing

about Asian cinemas in English in general, since the writings devoted particularly to Asian films in general have been too few, compared with their western counterparts, not to mention queer Asian films (Grossman, 2000). Moreover, the early history of Asian queer studies has reflected an overwhelmingly colonial intellectual pattern which focuses on Western queer histories but remained largely unaware of the often parallel and contemporary projects of queer studies in neighboring Asian countries. Until very recently, Asian queer studies privileging intellectual relations among Asian countries rather than between each country and their Western counterparts finally started to emerge (Martin & Jackson & McLelland & Yue, 2010).

In this sense, this study hopes to contribute to the gap caused by a series of parallel but mainly non-inter-communicating nation-level projects through studying the Korean queer movies discourses in Hong Kong and Taiwan. With that said, to have a closer look at the film discourse of Korean queer movies, this study is interested in how critics in Hong Kong and Taiwan evaluate Korean queer movies. Particularly, the study seeks to explore how the contemporary criticism in Hong Kong and Taiwan incorporates reviewing considerations that draw from high aesthetics and popular aesthetics. This research question is inspired by the research finding that contemporary film discourse has been complicated by the incorporation of popular aesthetics elements in the past decades, and the unavoidable influence of cultural globalization (Kersten & Bielby, 2012). Through conducting a content analysis on 40 movie reviews on Korean queer movies from Hong Kong and Taiwan discourse using Baumann's (2006) theory on the analogy of art worlds as like social movements, the study first examined how the themes generated from the movie reviews could be matched with Baumann (2006)'s three main concepts: 'Opportunity space', 'Resources', and 'Framing'. Then, the study analyzed how different themes under the three main concepts have been mobilized by critics to support their claims—be that a review that is considered to have a critical tone, a popular tone, or both. Also, the similarities and differences of how the themes prominent under each concept have been used were addressed as well. In the end, the study finds that the themes generated from movies reviews work for both contemporary film discourses in Hong Kong and Taiwan. However, the way they have been used are different as they could work to support different claims. Again, there exists this blurring of boundaries of aesthetic criteria that critics employ to evaluate films, which suggests the complexity and fluidity of contemporary film discourses of Korean queer movies in the age of cultural globalization.

2. Theory and previous research

2.1. The collective process of arts legitimation

Sociology of art begins when social aspects started to be employed to understand artworks or art production. One of the sociological perspectives to study art is to see it as a collective activity (Becker, 1982). That is, instead of seeing the artist as the only ingenious creator of an art work, Becker (1982) argues that artistic works involve the joint activity of number of people and they make an art work through their cooperation. The creation of an art world is therefore an example of a successful collective action. In other words, apart from the artist himself, the participation of other different collaborators is crucial for art to maintain its status as art (Becker, 1982).

Accordingly, in the art world, cultural gatekeepers and mediators play a crucial role by adding symbolic values to culture products (Bourdieu, 1984). By definition, cultural gatekeepers and mediators—for instance publishers, film studios, gallery owners, critics or reviewers, are people involved in the mediation between the production of cultural goods and the production of consumer tastes (Bourdieu, 1984; Becker, 1982). Whether it is in the production process, the distribution process, or evaluation process, cultural gatekeepers and mediators add symbolic values to culture products. And they do this by the virtue of the symbolic capital or prestige they have acquired as cultural experts. Through the various selective and evaluative activities, cultural gatekeepers and mediators contribute to the 'production of the value of the work or, what amounts to the same thing, of the belief in the value of the work' (Bourdieu, 1996: 229). In this light, cultural products do not necessarily possess inherent characteristics that make them as art. In other words, artistic values of cultural products are not measured according to existing standards but are vested in a cultural product after social consensus allows it. Therefore, value is assigned to a cultural product by various cultural gatekeepers and mediators, rather than assessed (Bourdieu, 1993).

Gradually, through this process of collective action, cultural gatekeepers and mediators contribute to the legitimation of an artwork (Baumann, 2007). Legitimation, as Baumann (2007) puts it, is "a process whereby the new and unaccepted is rendered valid and accepted". Since cultural production, distribution and reception are inherently collective (Becker, 1982), the legitimation of cultural products is always achieved collectively (Baumann, 2007). In the field of arts, the study of legitimation is concerned with how cultural products are re-positioned, both institutionally and intellectually. Through this repositioning process, cultural productions can be redefined, for instance from solely entertainment, commerce or fad, to

something that is legitimately artistic—be that high art or popular art. In addition, for the unaccepted to be made accepted, a consensus is needed. But this consensus is not absolute and exists only at the collective level and not necessarily at individual level (Zelditch, 2001). In the purpose of art, consensus can be measured at various levels within an art world (Becker, 1982). Judgments of value held jointly by members of an art world provide a basis for collective activity premised on those judgments. Works then become valuable through the achievement of consensus and through the application of agreed-on aesthetic principle to specific cases (Becker, 1982).

2.2. Arts criticism and the legitimating ideology of films
Moreover, in the process of cultural legitimation, a key factor is the development of a legitimating ideology that validates claims to artistic value and lends symbolic prestige to a cultural field (Baumann, 2007; Bourdieu, 1984). In any given cultural field, there are many actors that are actively engaged in the competition for symbolic capital. A cultural field will come into being when cultural production starts to be autonomous from other existing fields, once it has accumulated enough capital available to cultural producers. The more capital available to legitimate cultural products of a specific genre, the more autonomous the field is (Bourdieu, 1993). Furthermore, Bourdieu (1984) argues that there are two separate fields of production in the modern world—the field of "restricted" production and the field of "large-scale" production, and these two distinguish themselves from each other by the degree to which they are autonomous of the field of power. The former filed— "restricted field" involves low levels of economic capital and high levels of field-specific symbolic capical, while the latter field of "large-scale" production produces goods for the public at large. Specifically, Bourdieu (1993) illustrates this concept of "restricted" field through a study on the French literary field. That is, the literary field has achieved a relatively high level of autonomy because the prestigious prizes and critical recognitions it offers constitute the symbolic capital, which can serve as an alternative to economic capital for authors (Bourdieu, 1993). In this sense, a field-specific set of aesthetic principles—a legitimating ideology is needed if we are to provide a rationale for the public acceptance of a cultural product as art and to offer analyses for specific products (Baumann, 2001).

Correspondingly, in Baumann's (2001) influential work on the intellectualizing discourse of films in the United States, he argues that the grounding of artistic worth in a legitimating ideology is needed to explain the public acceptance of film as art. Moreover, the involvement of the application of aesthetic standards could help the development of film to

the status of art (Janssen & Verboord, 2015). As is mentioned earlier, values of a cultural product are assigned rather than assessed (Bourdieu, 1993), thus art criticism acts as a central institution in this process of value assignment in cultural fields as well as the intellectualizing discourse of films (Van Rees, 1982; Baumann, 2001). This happens because, very often, artistic value attribution calls for an explanation of why certain cultural objects or genres can be considered as artistically important (Janssen & Verboord, 2015). By utilizing devices, concepts, and vocabularies that traditionally belong to the discourse of high art, critics disseminates this legitimating ideology and help films to climb up to a higher status in the art world (Baumann, 2001). Critics, therefore, serve as an active role in the development and dissemination of such explanations on the artistic values and they thus become the key agents in elevating the status of cultural forms and genres (Baumann, 2007). Consequently, film reviews then become one of the sites for the legitimating ideology to develop. And film reviews available to the public have been proved to support the evolution of an aesthetic in the field of film (Baumann, 2001). Particularly, professional critics' assessments are especially telling in terms of how cultural products are understood and valued in specific cultural surroundings (Kersten, 2014). Although it should be admitted that film reviews are not the only site for the development of the legitimating ideology, they do serve as a visible and influential site in the discourse of films (Baumann, 2001). Therefore, critics' discourse is worth examining as they are influential in the field of films.

In addition, Allen & Lincoln (2004) have shown that in the contemporary discourse of films, three types of institutional agents will have an influence on the recognition a film can claim and they subsequently result in three types of recognitions: professional recognition, which is offered by established agents and institutions; critical recognition, which is granted by other cultural producers, or say, peers; and popular recognition, which is built on public acclaims. Together, these three types of recognitions result in different extent of subsequent critical discourse of films (Allen & Lincoln, 2004). However, although initially Allen and Lincoln (2004) have incorporated Bourdieu (1993)'s ideas on class power when identifying these three types of recognitions, this study is going to approach them more as three different group members in the art world who appreciate the artworks and then assign symbolic values differently (Becker, 1982), than social actors competing for domination and hierarchy (Bourdieu, 1993). Next, to explain the three types of recognitions clearly, firstly, professional recognition usually involves the presentation of honors and awards that recognize the excellence with a field of cultural production. Being awarded or nominated by prestigious organizations in the field promotes the legitimacy of the cultural production. For instance, the

Academy Award in the United States recognizes the excellence in the profession of filmmakers. Second, critical recognition is bestowed on artists and their works by critics and scholars. For instance, films selected by the most prominent newspapers as titles of the year, etc. Thirdly, popular recognition, namely, is a type of recognition that is measured by how many people paid to watch the film after it is released in the theater, and the only reliable measure of audience attendance is the box-office revenue (Allen & Lincoln, 2004). Still, just because the selections by these agents may overlap does not necessarily mean they share the exact same interests. Likewise, it remains unknown whether films that are eventually legitimated by professional, critical, and popular legitimation are evaluated by similar or different criteria (Kersten, 2012).

2.3. A discussion on the ideas of "World" and "Field"
Since the publication of Becker (1982)'s seminal work on the art world has aroused great interests on sociology of art, the idea of 'art world' has been used interchangeably with the idea of Bourdieu (1984)'s 'field' in the sociology of art. However, it is argued that this use of the two concepts may run the risk of minimizing the meanings of both ideas. Therefore, this section is devoted to the clarification of these two concepts and argues that this study is going to use Becker (1982)'s idea of 'art world', instead of Bourdieu (1984)'s 'field'.

On the one hand, what Bourdieu (1984) defined as 'field' refers to more a metaphor than a descriptive term. In this metaphorical space called 'field' where art is made, it is more about a field of forces in physics rather than a lot of people doing something together in an 'art world'. The main entities in the 'field' are forces, spaces, relations, and actors who uses their relative power to formulate strategies based on the power they have available. The relationship between the people who act in a field seem to be exclusively relations of domination based on competition and conflict. On the other hand, the idea of 'world' is very different. It is still a metaphor but this metaphor refers to a world that consists of people who pay attention to each other, take account consciously of each other, and shape what they do in the light of what others do. In this sense, people do not react automatically to external forces that surround them. Instead, they tend to develop their lines of activity slowly, see how other people respond to the things they do, and then adjust what they do next in a way that meshes with what other have done and will probably do next. Chiefly, the metaphor of 'world' is not spatial like the one of 'field'. The idea of 'world' centers on collective activity in which people do things together. In this light, the 'world' is thus an ensemble of people doing things together and is therefore more empirically grounded. It is about things observable—real

people trying to get things done and letting other people do things that will assist them, rather than "forces,"" trajectories,"" inertia", which are comparatively not easily observable in social life.

Above all, as Becker says, the basic question centers on 'world' is: "who is doing what with who that affects the resulting work of art?" While the basic question that centers on 'field' seems to be: "who dominates who, using what strategies and resources, with what results?" They ask different kinds of questions so they are not reducible one to the other. Therefore, in this study, the idea of 'world', instead of 'field' is more suitable for the research because what it deals with is more related to how social actors construct "shared understanding" than "dominance" and "conflicts" in 'field'.

2.4. How art worlds are like social movements

As is mentioned in the previous section that this study is going to employ the concept of "world" instead of "field", this section revolves around the dynamics in the art world. That is, Baumann (2006) has proposed an analogy of art world legitimation and social movements. Just as art worlds are sites of collective activities (Becker, 1982), there is also a consensus that social movements are a collective activity as well (Baumann, 2006). Most importantly, the reason why social movements are similar to art worlds is that social movements' success is a process of legitimation which is parallel to artistic legitimation. Also, one of the many important goals of social movements is to legitimate an idea and make it accepted, which again echoes the idea of arts legitimation. In the case of social movements, to attain legitimacy, there must be consensus among target audience that the movements' ideas and goals are accepted as legitimate. Similarly, in art worlds, since there are many members in the art world who assign values to cultural productions and work to sustain the legitimacy of those assignments (Becker, 1982), critics therefore are one of the many agents who are responsible of "producing belief in the value of goods in question" and thus play an important role in this analogy (Van Rees, and Dorleijn, 2001, p. 332).

Subsequently, Baumann (2006) proposes three main concepts of social movements— 'Opportunity structure', 'Resource mobilization' and 'Framing', and contends that they are equally applicable to art worlds. Firstly, 'Opportunity structure' revolves around the idea that context matters. Once we have a clear idea of what is happening in the wider society, we can then have a better idea of how social movements emerge, develop, and succeed (Baumann, 2006). Within the realm of sociology of arts, it has an analogous idea called 'Opportunity space', meaning "the existence of competitors, commercial substitutes, or publics and patrons

of new wealth (DiMaggio, 1992, p. 44)". These external factors are argued to be relevant in explaining the attainment of legitimacy in the art world (Baumann, 2006). Next, the second concept— 'Resources', derives from the idea that the success of social movements relies on the power gained from accrued resources. Resources are also important to arts legitimation, and they could take the form of both tangible and intangible, which range from physical equipment, money, or assets, to knowledge, experience, and emotional energy, etc. Particularly, for an art world to function effectively, there should be a division of labor. The extent of this division of labor within an art world, which serves as an important non-physical resource, contributes to the internal dynamics of an art world (Baumann, 2006).

The final concept is called 'Framing', which is the focus of this section. By definition, it refers to an explanatory factor in social movements which emphasizes the role of ideas, because social movements need to be 'framed' in order to be accepted as valid (Baumann, 2006). When it comes to art worlds, as it is mentioned earlier that film critics are responsible in disseminating a legitimating ideology of film in the art world, it is necessary to clarify the relationship between 'framing' and 'ideology' here. According to Baumann (2006), the former refers to an activity that aims to convince a target audience about how to derive a proper understanding or meaning from an artwork, while the latter consists of those values and ideas to which framing appeals so that it could be convincing. Also, Ferree and Merrill (2000) add that the relationship between concepts like framing, ideologies, and discourses could be approached as an inverted pyramid. That is, at the top of the inverted pyramid are discourses, because it is the least analytically coherent and most broad concept. One level down, there lie the ideologies, since "ideologies are considerably more coherent than discourses because they are organized around systematic ideas and normative claims" (Ferree and Merrill, 2000). Then, at the lowest level is the concept of 'framing', which is 'a way a talking and thinking about things that link idea elements into packages' (Ferree and Merrill, 2000). Altogether, by applying (sometimes inventing) a frame, the reasoning or values of an ideology will be invoked, which is done through the tools available in the discourse (Baumann, 2006). Additionally, this set of concepts can be reconciled with Becker's work on the role of critics in art worlds. That is, critics apply aesthetic systems to specific art works and arrive at judgments of art works' worth and analyze and explain what grant them worth (Becker, 1982). To apply Becker (1982)'s ideas on the terminology of social movements, critics frame specific works of art through appealing to the theories and values to specific ideologies, they frame film art within the established ideology of art as a form of communication between art works and their audience (Baumann, 2006).

2.5. 'Pure gaze' and 'naïve gaze' on films

Yet, if we posit the discussion on the legitimation of cultural products in the art world of film, we may find that the concept of "film as art" can be intriguing (Baumann, 2001). Although not all films can be considered as art, it is now widely accepted that a film can be appreciated and evaluated as art (Baumann, 2001). Classifying a cultural product as art, rather than mere entertainment implies that the artistic value of this cultural product can be justified based on a set of criteria (Janssen & Verboord, 2015). This, can also be applied to film, as it now has certain recognizable characteristics that justify the honorific title of "art" (Baumann, 2001).

Nonetheless, if we trace back the discussion on distinctive systems of criteria on cultural forms, we can find that the evaluation practices are basically characterized by two aesthetic systems proposed by Bourdieu (1984). That is, he employs the distinction between a "pure gaze" and a "naïve gaze" to describe two distinctive manners on the evaluation of art. On the one hand, a "pure gaze" refers to an aesthetic disposition that allows the audience to truly observe, evaluate, and appreciate a work of art in a detached manner (Bourdieu, 1984). This disposition dismisses "any necessity other than that inscribed in the specific tradition of the artistic discipline in question" (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 3). That is, it refuses things that are considered too common, easy, or immediately accessible—as opposed to distinctive things which 'ordinary' people invest in 'ordinary' lives such as the passions, emotions, and feelings, etc. Instead, it favors the form over function. In this light, this aesthetic disposition celebrates the autonomy of the artist, because to assert this autonomy is to give primacy to that of which the artist is the master, for instance form, manner, and style (Bourdieu, 1986). In this sense, this aesthetic disposition requires decoding the codes that are inherent to art (Prior, 2005). Therefore, this disposition, 'pure gaze', allows the audience to transcend the mundane of everyday life, and the criteria which define the stylistic properties of typical works of this kind are often based on implicit terms (Bourdieu, 1984).

On the other hand, the popular aesthetic, which is regarded as a "naïve gaze", emphasizes to the minimization of the distance between the artwork and the audience. It highlights the continuity of everyday life and art. In contrast with 'pure gaze', 'naïve gaze' embraces things all are common, easy, and immediately accessible—namely, the passions, emotions, and feelings which 'ordinary people' invest in their 'ordinary' lives, starting with everything that reduces the aesthetic animal to pure and simple animality, to palpable pleasure or sensual desire (Bourdieu, 1984). This aesthetic disposition often prefers familiarity and easy identification to formalism, symbolism and ambiguousness, and focuses on function rather

than form (Bourdieu, 1984). Usually, people with this disposition look for participation and interaction with what is being observed by them. They expect image to explicitly perform a function and their appreciation often has an ethical basis (Bourdieu, 1984). In the case of cinema, whereby it is argued that not all films are art but films can be art, the 'popular gaze' may embrace delights in plots that proceed logically and chronologically towards a happy end, and 'identifies' better with simply drawn situations and characters rather than with ambiguous and symbolic figures and actions. Consequently, it sometimes leads to a systematic reduction of the things of art to the things of life. For instance, people with this popular aesthetics may identify the characters' joys and sufferings, worry about their fate, espouse their hopes and ideas and even live their life. Here, this minimization of everyday life and art is induced by 'popular gaze' is not caused by a lack of familiarity, rather, it stems from a deep-rooted demand of participation which formal experiment systematically discourages (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 32). In this light, unlike the distancing that 'pure gaze' embraces, 'naive gaze' is defined in relation to the viewer (Kersten, 2012).

All together, these two distinctive dispositions represent two distinct systems wielded by taste groups that are culturally and socially different (Kersten, 2012). In this light, the criteria of cultural forms—in this case films, can be approached in various manners, since the status of a cultural genre is not static but can change over time if aesthetic mobility allows it (Bourdieu, 1993). Still, it is not easy to describe the 'pure gaze' without also describing the 'native gaze' which it defines itself against, and vice versa. The fact that there is no definite, neutral, impartial description of either of these two opposing visions does not necessarily mean that one should subscribe to aesthetic relativism (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 32). After all, the study is interested to see how 'pure gaze' and 'naïve gaze' are played out, in the eyes of critics, in Korean queer film discourse.

2.6. The contemporary film discourse
With everything said above, it is obvious that the intellectual discourse in the form of texts is important (Baumann, 2001), because quality standards and quality judgments are eventually created within the contexts of discourse (Allen & Lincoln, 2004). In this regard, critics play a crucial role by identifying these cultural schemes and 'frame' the films differently in the discourse. They actively participate in this value assignment process in this art world of films by considering various quality indicators in their selection and assessment of new cultural products (Janssen & Verboord, 2015).

As is mentioned earlier, due to the differences in terms of recognitions, cultural products—in this case of films, may be valued differently by different agents and institutions. So, it is necessary to investigate the discourse of values and see how exactly people apply their assessments to evaluate cultural products. To help with the understanding, Allen and Lincoln (2004) propose that discourses of values can be viewed as cultural schemes. By definition, cultural schemes are "knowledge structures that represent objects or events and provide default assumptions about their characteristics, relationships, and entailments" (DiMaggio, 1997: 267). These cultural schemes then decide which "frames", as argued by Bielby & Bielby (1994), are employed in specific instances of discourse. In other words, the content of the discourse will be organized around widely shared categories and symbols that have meanings to various constituencies (Bielby & Bielby, 1994). To illustrate, one example of the cultural schemes is auteur theory. By definition, auteur theory privileges the role of the director in film production and help attribute artistic merits of films. It encourages critics and scholars to frame the discourse about a film in respect of the contributions of its director (Allen & Lincoln, 2004). Still, the existence of different competing discourses of value may give insights into why certain films that receive popular recognition from the mass audience are not always the same films that receive critical recognition from critics and scholars (Allen & Lincoln, 2004).

Moreover, although Baumann (2001) has found in his work that the intellectualizing discourse of films has increasingly adopted terminology and reviewing techniques associated with high culture, for instance 'art', 'genius', or auteurism, etc., the contemporary discourse has been complicated by the incorporation of popular aesthetic elements in the past decades (Allen & Lincoln, 2004). This is because the large-scale production might have become more differentiated than it has been previously suggested, and the relations of heteronomy and autonomy might sometimes become more fluid and complicated than before (Hesmondhalgh, 2002). even though the overall film discourse has become more intellectual, it remains unclear if this still applies to the wide range of films that critics encounter (Kersten, 2012). In the case of Korean queer movies where the production of art-house movies and commercial movies sometimes go hand by hand("韩国同志电影漫谈," 2015), it then becomes interesting to see how the contemporary discourse has now become.

Additionally, the contemporary film discourse is becoming more and more complicated, and one of the causes is cultural globalization (Janssen & Kuipers & Verboord 2008). Here, cultural globalization refers to the opening of national art fields to international competition

as well as the emergence of transnational fields. In the age of cultural globalization, cultural valorization and artistic recognition are then regarded as stemming from not only within national art fields, but also between art fields in different countries (Janssen & Kuipers & Verboord 2008). Particularly, the effects of cultural globalization are especially obvious in the world of recorded culture, which is usually distributed through mass media (Janssen, 2008). In that sense, the contemporary film discourse, as a form of recorded culture, is complicated by cultural globalization. One possible result of this is that reviewing modes may reflect an incorporation of traits of discourse, rather than a strict dichotomy between the art-house film and the blockbuster (Kersten & Bielby, 2012). But still, the evaluation practices could have variations across nations, as national contexts bear influences on tastes and value assignments (Lamont, M., & Thévenot, L., 2000). What this means is that, despite the fact that we are currently living in a global age, culturally diverse groups across the globe still assign meanings differently (Kersten, 2014). Likewise, there might still be variations in terms of how critics may apply the two aesthetics systems—popular and highbrow aesthetics (Kersten, 2014). It would be interesting to see how both aesthetics systems are played out by the critics, since the exact usage of both aesthetics systems is telling for the qualification of film as a cultural genre: "it illustrates its ambiguity as both art form and commercial commodity" (Barthel-Bouchier, 2011). Thus, the effects of globalization on national evaluations should not be overestimated but require careful further examination instead (Kersten, 2012).

3. Research question and hypothesis

After discussing the roles professional critics play in disseminating cultural schemes in the contemporary discourse of films and the necessity to examine their reviewing considerations, this section now moves on to explain the research question and generate some subsequent hypotheses.

First, because the contemporary discourse has been complicated by the incorporation of popular aesthetic elements in the past decades, this study aims to clarify what are the components that consist of the contemporary film discourse in Hong Kong and Taiwan and how exactly are the reviewing techniques associated with popular aesthetics and highbrow aesthetics incorporated within critics' evaluations. Therefore, the research question is: How do contemporary criticism in Hong Kong and Taiwan incorporate reviewing considerations that are associated with high aesthetics and popular aesthetics into the evaluation on Korean queer movies? With that said, this study aims to clarify the criteria that professional critics in Hong Kong and Taiwan discourses take to evaluate Korean queer movies. And particularly, since Baumann (2006)'s theory has been chosen as the theoretical framework, this study also aims to explore how the contemporary film criticism balances or say, incorporates the terminology and reviewing techniques associated both popular aesthetics and high aesthetics when describing, and thus framing Korean queer movies. To do this, this study will first examine what the essential components are in the reviews produced in Hong Kong and Taiwan discourses and then identify how these reviewing components are related to popular aesthetics as well as highbrow ones. At the same time, this study will also consider what are the regularities and differences that show up in the movie reviews between different reviews as well as between Hong Kong discourse and Taiwan discourse.

Next, several hypotheses regarding this research question will be presented as follows. The first hypothesis is that there will be certain degree of overlap in terms of reviewing elements between three different types of reviews—reviews that have a critical tone, popular tone, or both tones. In other words, it is hypothesized that same reviewing elements will be found in each type of review. The reasons why reviews will be separated into three types are as follows. On the one hand, the categorization of reviews that have a critical tone or popular tone are based on Bourdieu (1984)'s 'pure gaze' and 'naïve gaze'. Basically, evaluation practices have two main aesthetic systems: the "high aesthetics" and the "popular aesthetics" (Bourdieu, 1984). The high aesthetics is usually associated with high art domains and focuses on form over function. Usually, it stresses a distancing and a refusal of emotional

engagement, shows disinterest in content but an admiration for artistic effects. When it is applied to the realm of films, evaluation criteria associated with this highbrow aesthetics often sees the artistic output of a creative individual, it interprets its narrative and assesses its relations with predecessors, contemporaries and its wider societal context (Baumann, 2001). Conversely, the popular aesthetics emphasizes a continuity between art and life and favors functions over forms. It stresses a demand for emotional participation and a close connection between cultural products and everyday life (Bourdieu, 1984). In the realm of films, evaluation criteria associated with this popular aesthetics favor the film's participatory experience, emotional engagement, and some relations to the commercial production, etc (Bielby & Bielby, 2004).

On the other hand, however, although previous research has found that the intellectualizing discourse of film has increasingly adopted terminology and reviewing techniques associated with high culture (Baumann, 2001), the past decades have witnessed the change in the contemporary film discourse. And what recent research has found is that aesthetic elements drawn from both popular aesthetics and high art aesthetics are incorporated in critics' aesthetic systems and their classificatory schemes in the film analysis (Kersten & Bielby, 2012). In this light, this study decides to include the third type of reviews that considered to have both critical tone and popular tone, and see if critics are found to be using the same reviewing elements with the former two types of reviews. Still, in an interesting case where a movie review has both critical and popular tones, it is possible that there is an overlap of reviewing elements in critics' considerations. This hypothesis is built on the grounds of cultural globalization, reviewing modes may reflect the incorporation of traits of discourse, rather than a strict dichotomy between the art house film and the blockbuster (Kersten & Bielby, 2012). Consequently, in recent years, a tendency is that the respective positions on critical and popular ones seem to be increasingly overlapping (Kester & Verboord, 2014). What this tendency implies is that when critical position and popular position overlap, their respective viewing standards and criteria may overlap in this specific case as well. Therefore, it is necessary for this study to include the third type of reviews when classifying reviews and then examine their corresponding reviewing elements.

Following, as the contemporary film discourse has become more and more complicated in the past few years (Kersten & Biebly, 2012), the second hypothesis is that each type of movie reviews—be that reviews that have a critical tone, a popular tone, or both, may emphasize different aspects and therefore mobilize reviewing elements differently. In other words, when the same reviewing elements are adopted by critics, the regularities or the way

they are used may differ in accordance with the respective tone that the film review has. For instance, in a film review that has a popular tone, the critic may shed light on the box-office effect and discuss the popularity of a film as well as the revenues it generates, or discusses the role of the leading actors play in attracting moviegoers). Also, a film review that has a critical tone may also discuss the box-office result and argues that although it is a failure in economic term, it is still a beautiful, well-thought-out movie in terms of its artistic achievements, etc. In addition, it is interesting to know how whether reviews that have both critical and popular tones incorporate reviewing elements in a similar or different manner with the former two types, and how critics frame these reviews afterwards.

In addition, since the study covers Hong Kong and Taiwan two film discourses, this study will shed light on the regularities and differences between the two film discourses in general. So, the final hypothesis is that these two film discourses will show a certain degree of differences. Although cultural globalization has resulted in the opening up of national fields to international markets and standards and an increasingly concentrated cultural power, none of the national fields has complete cultural hegemony (Kuipers, 2011). With that said, global cultural fields are best understood as polycentric systems with multiple competing centers. Here, it should be clarified that due to the sensitivity of the present political status of Taiwan, this study will not see Hong Kong and Taiwan as two separate nations. Rather, this study will see Hong Kong and Taiwan as two active film markets in the Greater China region where Korean queer-subject movies have entered and continue to grow. In the case of Asian film markets, South Korea, Hong Kong, and Taiwan can be regarded as core competing centers that maintain their own standards and taste even when they are confronted with cultural globalization (Kuipers, 2011).

4. Method and data

This section is about a general overview of the research design and data collection process, particularly on how they are related to the research question. But before the general overview, some clarifications should be made here: Firstly, the whole research takes the same amount of time as the master class, and took place in Rotterdam, Netherlands, since the data needed for this study did not demand an exact place to conduct this research. Secondly, the contribution language will be English or Chinese, as English is also the official language of Hong Kong. The researcher, as a native Chinese speaker, was responsible for translating the Chinese content into English whenever necessary, and an appendix of translations of Chinese review excerpts has been added in the end (See *Appendix B*.). Lastly, due to the sensitivities over the political status of Taiwan, this study sees Hong Kong and Taiwan as two active film markets in the Greater China region, instead of two separate 'nations'.

First, the research method of this study is content analysis. By definition, content analysis is a research technique used to make inferences about the content of recorded text. It aims to reveal the underlying meanings by analyzing patterns in elements of the text, such as words or phrases. In other words, content analysis is the systematization of text analysis (Holsti, 1969). The reason why content analysis is chosen is because content analysis of film reviews is well suited to identify the important elements of an ideology of film as art (Baumann, 2001). In this sense, this method fits with the research since the study also aims to examine the reviewing elements in critics' evaluations on Korean queer movies. After deciding the research method, texts are then coded based on researcher's coding system to make inferences about the messages that the texts convey. In this research, since Baumann (2006)'s theory has been chosen as the theoretical framework of this research, the coding system was also built through Baumann (2006)'s theory as well. In addition, as content analysis consists of qualitative and quantitative aspects (Bryman, 2013), this study incorporates both but focus on the qualitative aspect. On the one hand, qualitative research allows the researcher to gain insight into the ways in which Korean queer films are discussed, which is in line with the fact that the focus of the study is words from reviews rather than number of reviews in the presentation of analyses (Bryman, 2015). Nonetheless, although the focus of study is on the qualitative aspect, the study finds it necessary to include the result of regularities and differences between reviewing elements as well as the two film discourses in the end. This will be done in quantitative a manner by counting the number the reviewing elements have been mobilized by critics, as will be explained in the latter part of this section.

Following, the data collection process is provided as follows. First, the units of analysis would be professional reviews on Korean queer movies, and these reviews should be written by professional critics and should have been distributed in Hong Kong and Taiwan media. The reason why this study chooses film reviews to examine film discourse is because film reviews are an ideal source to examine how the art form—in this case movie, is legitimized (Baumann, 2001). That is, film reviews not only document the intellectualizing ideology of films, they also help explain how the aesthetics in the film could be disseminated to the public (Baumann, 2001). In total, the study has collected 40 film reviews, with 20 reviews from Hong Kong discourse and 20 reviews from Taiwan discourse. These reviews have been collected from websites that employ professional film critics, wide-ranging readership, and have been considered be to influential in the present-day discourse in Hong Kong and Taiwan. For instance, websites include *South China Morning Post*, *Asian Movie Impulse*, *yesasia.com*, 苹果日报*(apple.nextmedia. com.)*, 开眼电影网*(atmovies.com.tw),* Cinespot, *movie6.com*, *theinitium.com*, etc. Respectively, in each film discourse, which has a total number of 20 reviews, 10 reviews are from movies that have attained critical recognition and the other 10 reviews are from movies that have attained popular recognition. It should be noted here that according to Allen & Lincoln (2004), there should have been three types of recognitions rather than two—namely critical, professional, and popular recognitions. The reason why professional recognition is excluded here is because the most celebrated movie awards in Hong Kong and Taiwan— Hong Kong Film Awards or Golden Horse Awards, only focuses on awarding Chinese-language films ("Hong Kong Film Awards", 2017 & "Golden Horse Awards", 2017). To illustrate, Hong Kong Films Awards sees itself as Hong Kong's homegrown awards ceremony and focuses on recognizing the best works from the local film industry ("HKFFA", 2017). Namely, Chinese-language film refers to films produced by the Chinese people who live in the Chinese mainland, Taiwan, Hong Kong, Macao and overseas areas. Therefore, only reviews from two types of recognitions—critical and popular, have been collected.

Next, as for the selection of films, the selection criteria of Korean queer movies chosen for this study is that they should be produced and supported by Korean actors and directors, and have been distributed in Hong Kong and Taiwan, no matter in cinemas or film festivals. In terms of movie content, the criteria for Korean queer-subject has a broad coverage. Here, it is necessary to clarify the concept of queer: Queer, as defined by Blackwell Encyclopedia of Sociology Online, is commonly used as an umbrella term for lesbian, gay, bisexual, and

transgender, LGBT, or other non-normative gender and sexual identities (Kong & Lau & Li, 2016). In this light, the definition of the movie content of Korean queer movies has a broad coverage. In total, 16 film titles have been collected for this research (See *Appendix B.* for short storylines of each film). The earliest film *The King and the Clown* was produced in 2006, it was included in the data set because of its status and importance in the development of Korean queer movie. As the first queer movie to become the annual highest-grossing film in Korea that year, it was also quickly spread over Asia and Taiwan was its first cinema destination ("李準基天生是「雙面」人？", 2006). And in Taiwan, it took only two weeks to become the top 3 top-grossing films and the selling speed of its movie ticket was the fastest (pre-sale tickets sold in only 10 minutes) of the year ("《王的男人》火到台湾", 2006). So, it was included in the data and it is still one of the most popular Korean films in Asia. In this light, the time range of films is from 2006 to 2016.

Moreover, as it has been mentioned, only reviews from two types of recognitions—critical and popular, were collected. One the one hand, films that have received critical recognition were collected from the annual recommendation list or top selections by professional critics from Hong Kong media and Taiwan media, for instance *The Handmaiden (2016), The Weight (2012), Doheeya (2014)*, etc. On the other hand, films that represent popular recognition will be collected based on the annual top-ten box-office revenues in Hong Kong and Taiwan, for instance *A Frozen Flower (2008), Antique (2008),* etc. However, several film titles are considered to be celebrated both critically and commercially, for instance *The Handmaiden (2016)* has been the top-grossing film among all of the director Park Chan-wook films that had been on Taiwan cinema. At the same time, it was highly praised by South China Morning Post, one of the most respected professional news agency based on Hong Kong. Additionally, it has to be mentioned that there are overlaps in terms of film titles in the two discourses. That is, each of the four movie titles—*The Handmaiden*, *Night Flight*, *The Bacchus Lady*, and *Frozen Flower* has reviews from Hong Kong discourse and Taiwan discourse—2 reviews from each discourse respectively. The reviews of these specific titles were written by different critics, making the total number of reviews 40 (with each title having 2 different reviews). The very reason why there are overlaps in terms of movie titles is because of their overwhelming success in either kind of recognition across the two discourses is hard to neglect. To illustrate, apart from *The Handmaiden* mentioned earlier, *Night Flight* has been critically and commercially successful in a similar fashion; *Frozen Flower* was the second most commercially successful Korean queer movie in Taiwan,

right after The King and the Clown ("《霜花店：朕的男人》票房好", 2009), and also took top 3 in Hong Kong after one week of release ("香港电影票房榜", 2009); *Bacchus Lady* was listed the screening lists in two of the most important local film festivals—the 40th Hong Kong International Film Festival, 2017 Taipei Film Festival, and as highly praised by local prominent institutions like Hong Kong Film critics Society, etc ("Bacchus Lady, The", 2016; "The Bacchus Lady", 2017). Altogether, with 2 reviews from each movie title, the data collection ended with 40 different reviews, with 20 titles from each discourse (overlaps included).

Furthermore, after the data collection process, the study separated the 40 reviews into three different types of reviews—reviews that have a critical tone, reviews that have a popular tone, and reviews that have both tones, and reviews from Hong Kong discourse and Taiwan discourse are separated respectively. This separation is necessary because professional critics won't necessarily agree with the previous two claims that granted films critical and popular recognitions. Therefore, the 40 reviews have been separated again based on the specific tone that each review has, for instance a review that consider a movie a critical one, a popular one, or both. Moreover, this separation is based on Bourdieu (1984)'s 'pure gaze' and 'naïve gaze'. To illustrate, when a review approves the role of the director, the extent it has delved into significant contemporary issues, and puts a film into a high position in the film world, in that sense, this review is considered to have a critical tone; similarly, when a review emphasizes the box-office success, the visual effects or explicit contents in attracting audience, and the entertaining, light atmosphere in the film, then the review is considered to have a popular tone; finally, when a review features aspects from both kind of reviews above, then it is considered to have both critical and popular tone. Since there are 40 reviews from two film discourses and 20 from each one, the final distribution of the reviews is illustrated in *Table. 1* below.

Film discourse	Number of reviews that have a critical tone	Number of reviews that have a popular tone	Number of reviews that have both critical and popular tones
Hong Kong	10	5	5
Taiwan	11	3	6

Table 1. Number of reviews across three types

Then, after the movies reviews have been separated, the study conducted its initial coding using the qualitative research software Atals.it. The length of each review article ranges from 500 words to 1500 words. Since the coding of the unit of analysis should be conducted by identifying the patterns and common sequences (Holsi, 1969), the initial coding was done by examining each review and then divide each film review into several text segments, or say quotations. A total number of 678 quotations were generated from movie reviews, as well as some recurring themes that many quotations have revolved around. Then, with the aim to reduce redundancies, a second coding was conducted to clarify the overarching themes found among all the views. Example of the prominent themes include the discussion on the role of the director, the extent a film has explore certain important social issue, and the effect of the explicit contents in the film, etc. After that, 13 themes were generated from the second coding process, with each of them having different number of quotations representing the times they have been used by critics to support their claims.

After the 13 themes have been coded, the study then used Baumann's (2006) theory on the analogy between art worlds and social movements to analyze these themes. Baumann (2006) has proposed three important concepts— 'Opportunity space', 'Resources', and 'Framing' and their respective role in social movements as well as in the art worlds. The study then categorized the 13 themes into the three above-mentioned concepts and then provided explanations and elaborations for each theme, as will be seen in the result section. Additionally, as is mentioned at the beginning that this study will cover the regularities and differences between different types of reviews, this comparison also included the number of quotations from each theme to discuss how many times a critic has used a theme to support his claims. For instance, in each review, the number of quotations under each theme is different and therefore the prominence of themes in each type of reviews is also different. Thus, in the end, these regularities and differences, for instance which themes have been mobilized most frequently by critics to push the legitimation further, were added in the finding as well.

5. Results

As mentioned in the theoretical framework, this study intends to investigate how contemporary criticism in Hong Kong and Taiwan incorporates high aesthetics and popular aesthetics. First, the study will identify and discuss the main elements that critics in Hong Kong and Taiwan had employed when they evaluated Korean queer movies. After the main elements have been identified, they will be categorized under the three concepts of Baumann (2006)'s theory on how art worlds are like social movements—namely, "Opportunity space," "Resources," and "Framing" (Baumann, 2006). Then, the study will discuss the reviewing criteria on movies reviews that critics considered critical, popular or both respectively. The study will first consider Hong Kong discourse and then Taiwan discourse. Finally, an overall discussion on the differences and similarities between film discourse in Hong Kong and Taiwan will be presented, as well as the answers to the afore-mentioned hypothesis.

5.1. Critics' reviewing elements

As mentioned in the theoretical framework, this study intends to investigate how contemporary criticism in Hong Kong and Taiwan incorporates high aesthetics and popular ones. Although the central activity of interpretive practitioners like film critics is to disclose implicit meanings underlying movies (Bordwell, 1991), different critics, when dealing with the same textual elements, may assign different meanings or different sorts of meanings (Bordwell, 1991, p.10). In this sense, there is not always a consensus about a film's meanings and meanings are made rather than found (Bordwell, 1991). As is explained in the method design, an inductive content analysis was conducted to analyze the movie reviews on Korean queer movies, and in the end, a total of 13 themes were generated from the data analysis. These themes are (in an alphabetical order): "Actor", "Box office", "Complexity", "Context", "Credibility", "Director", "Film material", "Formal elements", "Interpretation", "Mood", "Peer recognition", "Position in film field", "Sensuality". Each of them consists of different number of quotations and focuses on different aspect on movie review, which will be illustrated later.

Following the discussion on the legitimating ideology of film as art, Baumann (2006) develops a theory which argues that there is an analogy between social movement success and recognition as art. The three main concepts of social movements can be equally applied to art worlds, which are: "Opportunity space", "Resource mobilization", and "Framing" (Baumann, 2006). Nonetheless, he adds that legitimacy is not a dichotomy. Rather, it is a collective action that could be presented in various amounts and among different

constituencies (Baumann, 2006). In this regard, the 13 themes are incorporated with Baumann (2006)'s three concepts. An overview of the categorization of the 13 themes under each concept could be seen from *Table 2.* below, followed by explanations on each concept.

Concepts	Themes
Opportunity Space	'Context'
Resources	'Actor', 'Director', 'Film material', 'Formal elements', and 'Peer recognitions'
Framing	'Box-office', 'Credibility', 'Complexity', 'Interpretation', 'Mood', 'Position in film field', and 'Sensuality'

Table 2. The categorization of the 13 themes among Baumann's (2006) analogies

5.1.1 Opportunity Space

The first concept that has a similar implication in the art world is 'opportunity space', whose core idea is that context matters. That is, by understanding what is going on in the wider society that influence social movements, we can have a better understanding of how social movements emerge, develop, and succeed (Baumann, 2006). In other words, there are certain external factors that can influence the odds of the success of an art world in terms of attaining legitimacy (Baumann, 2006). Accordingly, the theme named 'Context' falls under this concept. Generally, the code 'Context' refers to broad changes in the wider society in which a film is made. For instance, it could be that the film was supported by the government in terms of funding and it is also possible that the film addresses contemporary urgent issues which are not necessarily found in mainstream movies (i.e. homosexuality, closet relationship in Asian context, single parenthood, oppressed minorities, etc.).

5.1.2 Resources

The second concept that follows is 'Resources'. Resources, as Baumann (2006) puts it, could take the form of both tangible and intangible forms. For instance, money, labor, knowledge, experience, network connections and institutionalized relationships, prestige and status, physical equipment or assets, informal traditions, organizational forms, emotional energy, and leadership are all possible forms. All together, these resources play a crucial role in explanations of art world legitimations (Baumann, 2006). To understand how critics in Hong Kong and Taiwan receive Korean queer movies from this perspective, certain themes could

be categorized under this concept of 'resources' as well. These themes are: 'Actor', 'Director', 'Film material', 'Formal elements', and 'Peer recognition'. They are assigned to this category because they echo both physical form and intangible form of resources. In the following paragraph, each of them will be illustrated respectively.

Firstly, the theme 'Actor' covers critics' comments on the actors' overall contribution to the films, for instance how the established status of the actors help attract audience, how they perform in the film, or description of actors' previous works, etc. Secondly, the theme 'Director' revolves around the role that a director plays in filmic practice, for instance the distinctive style of the director, the previous accomplishments and the present status of the director, etc. This theme, together with the theme 'Actor', echoes Becker's (1982) seminal work on the division of labor in the art world. That is, to see art as a collective activity, instead of a sole creation of a creative individual (Becker, 1982). Here, both 'Actor' and 'Director' are considered as possessing both physical and symbolic resources. The reason why they have this dual nature is that they not only work during the film production on or off the set, but also certain prestigious actors or directors could add prestige to the film as well. Next, themes called 'Film material' and 'Formal elements' refer to physical resources. Both themes are related to discussions on the film itself. Yet, the difference is that the former deals with screenwriters, screenplays or adaptations of existing materials, which is usually pointed out by the critic and then followed by how the film material is play out in the film; and the latter considers plot development, camerawork, editing, lighting, costume, background music, etc., which could either contribute to the overall effect of the film or have a negative effect in the minds of the critics. The last theme under this category, which represents symbolic resources, is 'Peer recognition'. This theme deals with critics' consideration on what a film attains from other institutionalized agents such as established festivals or film awards, for instance when evaluating a film, a critic may bring up other institutions to help his account on the prestige or artistic achievement on the film he is going to discuss. By doing this, a critic can also help accomplish the necessary symbolic work, although indirectly, by borrowing opinions from other institutions to defend himself. Altogether, these themes are relevant in that they help create prestige and status for an artistic form—in this case the Korean queer movies, as well (Baumann, 2006). Nonetheless, different art worlds rely on different extent on various kinds of resources (Baumann, 2006), therefore it is necessary to consider how each theme is distributed under each recognition category.

5.1.3 Framing
The last concept is 'Framing', which takes the most part of the result section. This is because 'framing' revolves around the role of ideas (Baumann, 2006), which echoes the core aspect of film criticism and discourse. By definition, 'framing' aims at convincing audience about how to develop a 'correct' understanding or meaning. And it is done by applying (and sometimes inventing) a frame, which invokes the reasoning or values of an ideology, through the tools made available in a discourse. Just as social movements need to be explained, publicized, and packaged in a way that would make a target audience feel convinced, the goals and tactics of social movements need to be 'framed' to be comprehensible, valid, convincing, and acceptable (Baumann, 2006). Most importantly, Baumann (2006) argues that framing is primarily relevant to the success of social movements as well as art worlds because it is an activity that instructs targeted audience on how to perceive and interpret specific issues that films convey. By invoking the ideas and values in ideologies, framing is made convincing and thereby justifies the movement's or art worlds legitimation through building consensus (Baumann, 2006). In this light, it is film critics' responsibility to disseminate ideas that help audience achieve a 'correct' understanding of a film.

   In this sense, the remaining themes 'Box-office', 'Credibility', 'Complexity', 'Interpretation', 'Mood', 'Position in film field', and 'Sensuality' fall under this category. Firstly, 'Box-office' is about critics' attention on the degree of popularity of a movie, both at home and abroad. For instance, how popular it is and why it appeals to the mass audience, for which the box-revenues is often considered as an indicator. Then, 'Credibility/audience', is about whether, in the eyes of the critics, a film is believable or not in terms of how the story is presented but also how the underlying issues can be effectively communicated, as well as how audience would possible respond towards a film. Thirdly, the code 'Complexity/depth', which is concerned with the question on to which extent the filmmaker has explored and thought through the film material and how questions regarding the narrative contradictions, consequences, and complications are raised. Then, in a similar fashion, 'Interpretation', namely, refers to how critics explain the movie, how meanings— in the critics' own opinions, could be derived from the film. By doing this, they frame films as art within the established ideology of art as a form of communication between an artist and an audience (Baumann, 2006). Next, 'Mood', by definition, is concerned with the emotional response that the reviewer has when watching a film. Films are objects that are well constructed to elicit a real emotional response from our already exciting emotion systems. Specifically, cinematic styles as well as cues such as lighting, camera, acting, sound, music, mise-en-scene, character,

narrative, genre conventions, and so on all encourage emotional responses among audience (Smith, 2003). In this light, this theme considers a film's distinguishing feelings and how critics perceive the atmosphere of the film, for instance some films are described as 'heart-breaking', 'moving', 'challenging', and 'absorbing', etc.; The next one— 'Position in film field', refers to the discussion on how the film could be placed within the film genre, industry, or country, for instance the comparison with other films by the same director, or the comparison between other films from overseas or local markets, etc. The last theme 'Sensuality' deals with the explicit content in the film that creates a strong visual effect, such as nudity, violence, bloody scenes, and sex scenes, etc. Also, it considers how these explicit contents influence audience's viewing experience of one movie. For instance, on one end of the see-saw, this might help attract more audience and on the other end, it might cause discomfort among the viewer when watching.

5.2. Hong Kong discourse

As is explained in the beginning, the total 13 themes deal with issues that help convince a target audience about how to derive a 'correct' understanding or meaning from a film (Baumann, 2006). These themes all focus on the aspects pertinent to the integrity of a film's narrative and its creative execution overall (Kersten, 2010), and how meanings could be derived from the viewing experience of the film. Also, since the 20 reviews from Hong Kong discourse has already been separated in terms of whether they are considered by critics as critical, popular, or both (which together made up three categories), this section will be devoted to explaining how exactly critics, under each category, adopted those themes to push the legitimation of Korean queer movies further.

Concepts	Themes	Frequency		
		Reviews that have a critical tone	Reviews that have a popular tone	Reviews that have both tones

Opportunity Space	'Context'	17	2	5
Resources	'Actor'	7	8	7
	'Director'	15	1	9
	'Film material'	5	1	4
	'Formal elements'	27	10	8
	'Peer recognitions'	7	0	2
Framing	'Box-office'	0	2	3
	'Credibility'	6	12	6
	'Complexity'	28	9	13
	'Interpretation'	23	11	10
	'Mood'	12	10	4
	'Position in film field'	19	7	10
	'Sensuality'	12	9	9

Table 3. The frequencies of the 13 themes across three types of films in Hong Kong discourse

5.2.1. reviews that have a critical tone in Hong Kong discourse

The *Table 3.* above illustrates how the 13 themes have been distributed among reviews that critics considered as critical. Although there is difference between each review, they do share some similarities in terms of the prominence of certain themes.

Firstly, in terms of 'Opportunity space', most of the reviews adopt the theme 'Context'. Many of them deals with how these films help portray social issues which are indeed important but are somehow neglected, and few deals with production support. In one of the reviews on *Night Flight*—a film about a struggling relationship between two male classmates, the critic argues how this film succeed in portraying the highly competitive Korean education system which ignores problems raised by bullying, entitlement, and homophobia. He adds that this film is intense in a way that it presents you the fears that LGBT people must face in real life. Similarly, in a review on *The Bacchus Lady*, the critic discusses how this film renders the living conditions of elderly prostitutes in South Korea and how people with mix-raced, transgender people and disable people, etc. have been marginalized. The critic then implies that these marginalized people are in fact among us, but it is us that turned a blind eye to their issues. Another example is from the two reviews on *Doohee Ya*, which is a story about a female police chief who tries to protect a teenage girl

from domestic abuse. To illustrate, one of the reviews on this film mentions how the support from the government helps make its film production possible:

"Dealing with themes of alcoholism, abuse and homosexuality, subjects not often covered in mainstream Korean cinema, A Girl at My Door (2014) was a risky proposition, and indeed the film was funded largely by the Korean Film Council, with its main stars apparently appearing without being paid."

–YesAsia.com

According to the paragraph above, this critic points out that such sensitive issues are not commonly seen in mainstream Korean cinema, therefore the making of this film provides an opportunity for audience both at home and abroad to have a better understanding of the current issue that the filmmakers are exploring. In this sense, the theme— "Context", is adopted by the critics to comment on how films succeed in referring to the broad changes in the wider society and thus attaching a more insightful look to the film.

Secondly, in terms of 'Resources', if we look at the distribution horizontally, what worth mentioning first is the theme 'Director'. Usually, critics use this theme emphasize the director's role in the film and how his style has shaped the film into a more distinctive, artistic work. To illustrate, in a review on *Night Flight*, the critic points out in the beginning that this film was directed by the openly gay director Leesong Hee-il, who specializes in portraying homosexual men living in sexually uptight South Korean, of which this film is no exception. Also, he adds that the intensity that viewers experience when watching the film is typical of Leesong's fashion, just as expected. In this light, the established status, as well as style, of this director helps make this specific film more artistic of its kind. Moreover, the theme 'Formal elements' have been used by critics many times as well, which is often associated with positive comments on technical issues. In a review on *The Handmaiden*, which is a film about how a female pickpocket helps a Korean man to seduce a Japanese heiress lady out of her inheritance, the critic analyzes how an important scene was shot, in which the Japanese lady, who was forced by her uncle, reads pornography to elderly male buyers. He writes that when Hideko, the Japanese lady, reads, not only her facial expressions are filmed, but also the way she breathes and talks was edited deliberately. By focusing on filming Hideko using multiple methods, this film succeeds in showing how she is fully manipulated by her uncle as a porn-reading machine for the men in a patriarchal society. Similarly, on a review on *Rainbow Eyes*, the critic comments that the soundtrack, the shaky camerawork, and fast editing matches with the boldly and striking affair between a homicide

director and his transgendered boyfriend. In this light, critics use 'Formal elements' to prove the artistic aspects of a film from a technical perspective.

Thirdly, in terms of 'Framing', if we look at the frequencies horizontally, "Complexity" and "Interpretation" are the most prominent ones, followed by "Position in film field" and "Mood". The first theme here— "Complexity", is about how a film has managed to explore certain complicated issues and the depths it has achieved. To illustrate, a review on *Love in Between*—a film about a triangular affair between a professor, his lover, and his wife, compares this film with another Finnish film named *Black Ice* which also deals with extramarital affair. He then argues that unlike its Finnish counterpart, this film presents a more reserved side of women when they are dealing with relationships, and adds that this film is more artistic as it properly presents the profoundness of relationship from a slow-paced, oriental perspective. In this light, critics adopt this theme to substantiate their arguments on the depths and complexity of a film. The next theme is "Interpretation", which has been found to be prominent across review types. This theme is mobilized by critics to offer their own understanding of the film and is a way for critics to show their expertise. In reviews of this type, it is very often associated with detailed, in-depths reflection or explanation on the plots or certain scenes. To illustrate, in the just-mentioned review on *Love in Between*, the critic contends that it is up to the viewer to decide whether to approach the triangular affair from a Western perspective or an oriental one. Still, it could be that the lesbian relationship in this film indicates that a Korean way to present a relationship is to present it through psychological analysis and subconscious behavior. Although a person's social behavior might be restricted by social norms, but his own unconsciousness can never be fully controlled. In this light, the way that the film deals with the lesbian relationship in a triangular affair is, though implicit, is very realistic. Next, the theme "Position in film field" is usually used by critics to make a film stand out from its peers in a way that is more artful, complex, and insightful. For instance, a critic comments that although extramarital affair has been a common (sometimes dull) subject in films, *Love In Between* still managed to impress viewers in its own special way.

Additionally, there are two themes from the category of 'Framing' are worth noticing. The first one is the theme 'Box-office', which none of the reviews in this category uses, instead, critics seem to use the remaining themes to support their points. Though the lack of the theme here does not necessarily mean a strict dichotomy between artistic merits and popular merits, what could be inferred here is that, at least in this case, the remaining themes outperform this theme in pushing a film to a more artistic direction. The other theme worth mentioning is

'Sensuality'. Although the frequency of this theme is not prominent, it appears to be used differently between critical reviews and popular reviews (which will be shown in next section). In this section, it is mobilized by critics to support their artistic claims for the films. For instance, in a review on *The Handmaiden*, the critic comments that the explicit contents in certain scenes, for instance the Shunga (a Japanese term for erotic art) paintings, the gasping breath of the Japanese heiress lady, and the buyers' facial expressions when listening pornography, etc., all contribute to the central idea of the film—men take full control in a patriarchal society. In this sense, instead of providing a way of visual pleasure, critics use the theme 'Sensuality' to argue how these explicit contents can in fact support the central ideas of the film, which even in a way that is necessary.

5.2.2. reviews that have a popular tone in Hong Kong discourse

Compared with reviews that have a critical tone in the previous section, several themes, however, are used by critics in a different way, pointing the reviews to a more popular tone. That is, "Actor", "Complexity", "Credibility", "Sensuality", and "Position in film field".

Firstly, in the category of 'Resources', the themes "Actor" and "Formel elements" are the two most prominent themes, and "Actor" has been used in a different way here comparing to critical reviews from the previous section. That is, the theme 'Actor' not only deals with the actors' performance, it also sheds light on the popularity and attractiveness of the leading or supporting actors, and sometimes uses words like "bold" to describe certain explicit performances. For instance, in a review on *Frozen Flower*, the critic writes that the bold performances that the two actors give in the film is "unexpected", because they are popular "idols" in Korean entertainment industry. Still, what is similar to critical reviews is that there are also praises on actors' performances in general and how that adds to the overall effect of a film. In this light, it appears that a good, professional performance given by an actor works both for critical acclaims and popular acclaims.

Secondly, in the category of 'Framing', unlike critical reviews in which "Complexity" is used to prove and discuss the depths of a film, this theme is used here more to question the lack of complexity of a film, or the easy, light nature of the film for viewers to understand, etc. To illustrate, a review on *Like a Virgin*, which is a story about a man who wants to be a woman and picks up Korean wrestling to pay for it, a critic comments that this film presents the identity problems of the man in a funny way, and the easy nature of the film helps it to be a successful comedy. Also, in the very same review, the theme "Credibility" was used by the critic to question the believability of this film, which is in contrast with the positive tone used

in popular reviews. For instance, he finds that some characters are too caricatural, whom he sometimes finds out of place when watching. Next, instead of being used to emphasize the necessity of certain contents, the theme "Sensuality" is also used differently here. In a review on *Frozen Flower*, which is a story about how a male bodyguard of the King, with whom he is romantically involved, ends up falling in love with the King's wife, the critic compares the explicitness of the film with Ang Lee's melodrama in 2007 called *Lust, Caution*, and argues that this film is way more explicit and extreme in this aspect. This explicitness, he argues, contributes to its popularity among views and thus making this film an entertaining one. The last theme is "Position in film field", which is used to comment on a film's status in the film world. And in this case, this theme is often used by critics to point to a more popular tone. An example is the other review on *Frozen Flower*, in which the critic compares the film to *The Plum in the Golden Vases* (a Chinese novel of manner by Lanling Xiaoxiao Sheng in Ming Dynasty which features explicit depiction but is considered as a landmark of Chinese literature), and criticizes that the content in the film is compromised to the so-called story plot and unfortunately ends up as another banal drama.

5.2.3. reviews that have both critical and popular tones in Hong Kong discourse

In general, in reviews that are considered to have both critical and popular tones, it could be found that several themes prominent in the previous two sections are both found in this section, for instance "Context" from the category of "Opportunity Space", "Director" from the category of 'Resources', "Box-office", "Complexity", "Position in film fields" from "Framing", etc. They work in a way that support both critics' critical claims and artistic claims, making a review capable of having a critical tone and a popular tone at the same time. On the one hand, it could be that the theme "Box-office" is mobilized by critics to demonstrate the box-success of a film as well as its popularity in attracting moviegoers, just like the way it has been used in reviews with a popular tone. Or, likewise, it could be that the theme "Sensuality" is mobilized to describe the bold, visually impressive aspects of a film which in a way make a film attractive. On the other hand, reviews belonging to this section still manage to differ themselves from pure popular ones with the other themes "Complexity" and "Director", etc. These themes are used by critics to attribute the depths that a film has explore certain issues and addresses the artistic effort that a film director has put into a film, just like those reviews with a critical tone. Together, the way these themes help attribute both claims is like a scale in which one prevents a the other from sloping to the either end.

5.3. Taiwan discourse

Concepts	Themes	Frequency		
		Reviews that have a critical tone	Reviews that have a popular tone	Reviews that have both tones
Opportunity Space	'Context'	26	1	2
Resources	'Actor'	5	3	6
	'Director'	13	1	5
	'Film material'	5	2	3
	'Formal elements'	22	7	13
	'Peer recognitions'	6	0	1
Framing	'Box-office'	0	2	4
	'Credibility'	3	3	6
	'Complexity'	22	7	12
	'Interpretation'	23	5	10
	'Mood'	8	3	6
	'Position in film field'	23	6	9
	'Sensuality'	11	3	8

Table 4. The frequencies of the 13 themes across three types of films in Taiwan discourse

5. 3.1. Reviews that have a critical tone in Taiwan discourse

From *Table 4*. above, it could be seen that the prominence of the themes used in this section is similar to Hong Kong discourse in that themes like "Context", "Complexity", "Formal elements", "Interpretations" still prevail. In most cases, these themes are mobilized in similar fashion with those critical reviews in Hong Kong discourse, in that they are used to reflect and present contemporary social issues, delve into complex discussions, show professional filming techniques, and offer in-depths opinions from critics. Still, similar to Hong Kong discourse, the frequency of the theme "Box-office" is also missing here, which again

illustrates critics' preferences in mobilizing other themes to support their artistic, critical claims rather than this one.

Yet, there is another theme, "Position in film field", that worth mentioning as it is also stands out in terms of frequency. To illustrate, in a review on the film named *Stateless Things*—a film about the turbulent relationship between a North Korean detractor and a kept boy of a married businessman, a critic starts by arguing that this film reminds him of Wong Kar-wai's *Days of Being Wild*—a Hong Kong film that has a Metacritic score of 96% and has swept across most of the 10th Hong Kong Film Awards in 1991, because both are heavy with atmosphere and share the dark, moody images of statelessness. In the same review, the critic also compares this film with another Vietnamese film named *Lost in Paradise*, as is illustrated from this excerpt of the review, which has been translated from Chinese to English:

> *Both linear and multi-strand narratives have been widely used by filmmakers, the design of the character in Stateless Things reminds me of a Vietnamese film named Lost in Paradise by director Vu Ngoc Dang. Both films contain parallel developments and focus on people who have been rejected or alienated by other people from mainstream culture. Yet, director Kim Kyung-Mook is more ambitious. As the film approaches its end, the name of the film finally appears on the screen, which again shows how considerate the director is.*
>
> *—Shihua Chen*

Similarly, this Vietnamese film that the critic uses to compare is also internationally celebrated and has been considered as "The first Vietnamese film to offer frank accounts of gay life" by *the Vancouver International Film Festival*. What can be seen from here is that by referring this film to other highly established movies—in this review *Lost in Paradise* and *Days of Being Wild*, the critic puts this film in a similar position with its counterparts, which represent a relatively high status in the film field. Among the critical reviews in this section, this way of mobilizing the theme "Position in film field", which involves relating or comparing the specific film under discussion to other established films, allow critics to push their claims on the artistic side of Korean queer movies a step further.

5.3.2. Reviews that have a popular tone in Taiwan discourse

In this section, as only three reviews are categorized under this section, the analysis of this section is limited as there are fewer quotations that indicate frequencies. Among the 13 themes, "Complexity", "Formal elements", and "Position in film field" take up the most

prominent positions. On the one hand, from the category of "Resources", the theme "Formal elements" is also employed to discuss the technical aspects of a film, especially the overall effects that the technical side adds to the film. On the other hand, several themes from the category of "Framing" have been found to be used by the critics in a different manner than what they have been used in critical reviews. Particularly, "Complexity", "Position in film field", and "Mood" are three themes that are mobilized by critics in the most different way, compared with critical reviews. Additionally, similar to those reviews that have a popular tone in Hong Kong discourse, the theme "Context" from the category of "Opportunity Space" is used in a low frequency, which indicates that this theme is used less by critics to support their popular claims here.

Firstly, from the category of "Framing", "Complexity" and "Position in film field" have been adopted in a way that helps divert a review to a popular tone. To illustrate, in a review on *No Regret*—a film about a story between a male prostitute and a closeted man, the critic mobilizes two themes— "Complexity" and "Position in film field" at the same time to criticize this film. In the review, he compares this film with other Asian gay films like Oscar winner Ang Lee's *The Wedding Banquet*, Chen Kaige's *Farewell My Concubine*, etc. However, unlike critical reviews in which critics usually use "Position in film field" to relate the film under discussion to other established films with the aim to elevate the status of a film, this critic uses this theme in a reversed manner. That is, he argues that compare with these two Asian films, he fails to find anything to do with real issues concerning queer people in this film. Besides, he comments that the story plot would still make sense even if the story has been changed into a heterosexual one, since it is just a male-version Cinderella story which has been exploited to attract movie goers. In this light, the theme "Complexity" is also adopted in a reversed manner to account for the lack of depths in a film.

In addition, another theme from the same category, "Mood", is also worth mentioning. What differs this theme from others is that in many cases, this theme is mobilized in company with other themes. In other words, it should be approached as the result of various themes working together. Take a review on *Antique* as an example, the critic describes his feeling when watching this film as 'delighted' and 'cheerful'. This is because this film is starred by four young, good-looking, well-dressed male actors, which are typically found in Korean romance drama. Here, the critic mobilizes the theme "Actor", together with the theme "Mood", to argue that having these four handsome leading actors in one film is enough to attract and please young female moviegoers. In this light, the theme "Mood" is used by critics

to emphasize the popular, attractive, entertaining aspect of a film, which is also an aspect catering to the needs of audience.

5.3.3. Reviews that have both popular and critical tones in Taiwan discourse

Among the reviews that have both popular and critical tones in Taiwan discourse, several themes are found to be employed in a way that is similar to how they have been mobilized in reviews from Hong Kong discourse. Still, themes from the category of "Framing" are mobilized more frequently than themes from other two categories. Also, several themes from "Framing" such as "Complexity", "Credibility", "Sensuality", and "Position in film field" are mobilized by critics in a similar way in that they all help critics address a positive feedback on the artistic side of a film. Yet, the only difference, compared with Hong Kong discourse, is that the theme "Director" is used less frequently than the above-mentioned four themes. As is illustrated in the table, in total, the theme "Director" is used 5 times in this section. Although directors have been found to play an important role in steering a film to a more artistic direction based on the role of the auteur, what this finding infers is that, at least in this case, this theme by itself not the determining, not-to-miss one that dominates the decision on whether a film deserves both claims or not. Rather, the reception of a film is more of the interaction and cooperation of more than two themes which consequently create a combined effect, especially when it comes to reviews that are considered both critical and popular.

Take the film *The King and the Clown* as an example, in which the role of the director is not the focus of the critic's consideration. Alternatively, the critic uses other themes from the category of "Resources" and "Framing" such as "Box-office", "Complexity", "Sensuality", and "Position in film field" to substantiate his claims. The story of this film is set in the 16th century Chosun Dynasty when a pair of male clowns travel to Seoul and try to make a living by mocking the hedonistic king with bawdy humor and gender-bending, for which they are arrested and what happens afterwards. In the review, the critic starts by using the theme "Position in film field" to argue that although this film is very characteristic of Korean costume drama for featuring the variety of colors, the constraint of emotions, political tactics, etc., it is not a superficial erotica film. Rather, it is a play within a play with burning satire and freezing irony. Then, the critic continues with the theme "Sensuality" and argues that some Korean movies, which had been on the cinema in Taiwan in the past, have the tendency to exaggerate erotic topics which instead weakens the overall effects. Yet, the attractiveness of the feminine male clown to the King shown in the film indeed adds to the theatrical effects of the film. Furthermore, with other similar descriptions in terms of "Complexity", he

concludes with "Box-office" by arguing that it is not just its erotic contents that made it a box-office hit, its capability in presenting the culture of common people seamlessly also helps it stand out.

In this light, compared with Hong Kong discourse, the way that themes are mobilized is slightly different here in Taiwan discourse. Still, what is shared between Hong Kong discourse and Taiwan discourse is that themes from the category of "Framing" are mobilized more frequently, compared with themes from the other two categories.

6. Conclusion

Although not all films can be considered as highbrow art, it is argued that it can be art. The legitimating ideology disseminated by contemporary criticism helps advance the status of film in the art world. In recent years, Korean queer movies have been enjoying growing popularity across various film markets in Asia, for instance Hong Kong and Taiwan. At the same time, as quality standards and quality judgments are eventually created within the contexts of discourse, it therefore becomes interesting to examine what are the criteria that constitute the discourse of films (Allen & Lincoln, 2004). To have a closer look at the critics' reviewing criteria on Korean queer movies, this study asks the question of how contemporary critics in Hong Kong and Taiwan incorporate high aesthetics and popular aesthetics when they are evaluating Korean queer movies. To do this, this research has examined the Korean queer movie discourses in Hong Kong and Taiwan through an in-depth content analysis on movies reviews. And in total, a number of 13 themes were generated from movie reviews ("Actor", "Box office", "Complexity", "Context", "Credibility", "Director", "Film material", "Formal elements", "Interpretation", "Mood", "Peer recognition", "Position in film field", "Sensuality"). Then, this study uses Baumann's (2006) theory on how art worlds are analogous with social movements to separate these 13 themes into three groups— 'Opportunity Space', 'Resources', and 'Framing'. Next, since reviews have been separated into three different types –reviews that have a critical tone, reviews that have a popular tone, and reviews that have both tones, the study then examines how these themes have been mobilized differently by critics to support their claims across concepts and across review types.

In general, the study has found that Baumann's (2006) three concepts— 'Opportunity Space', 'Resources', and 'Framing' work for reviews that have a critical tone, a popular tone, and reviews that are considered both. In other words, all the 13 themes are found present in all three types of reviews. However, the way the 13 themes are used is different, and the way they have been used is indeed closely related to review types—whether a review is considered critical, popular, or both. For instance, in a review with a critical tone, several themes such as 'Director', 'Context', and 'Complexity' all work to frame a movie as a work that shows the director's artistic style, presents an eye-opening discussion on social issues, and shines with its thoughtfulness, etc., and thus pushing the legitimation further. The same logic goes for the other two types of reviews. In a nutshell, themes from the category of 'Framing', compared with the other two categories— 'Opportunity Space' and 'Recourses',

have been mobilized the most, especially themes like 'Box-office', 'Credibility', 'Complexity', 'Position in film field', 'and 'Sensuality' have been mobilized multiple times. Moreover, the difference between review types is most apparent between critical reviews and popular reviews, while reviews that are considered both critical and popular remain in a neutral position as they tend to incorporate the ways themes are used in both critical and popular reviews. Additionally, for reviews that are considered both critical and popular, they are more of the result of the interaction and combination of different themes from various categories—especially from the category of "Framing", than a direct consequence of a sole, dominant theme. Altogether, themes under each type of reviews have been mobilized in different manners but they all served to help push critics' legitimation on Korean queer movies a step further.

With that said, the study will end with some suggestions for future research. Firstly, the data scale is relatively small, since there are only 40 reviews acting as data samples from Hong Kong discourse and Taiwan discourse. In this light, although this study has already conducted the content analysis in a comparatively nuanced manner (which results into more than 600 quotations), future research would still benefit from including more data reviews to from more movie titles to answer the subtle differences. Secondly, although it has been mentioned at the very beginning that a distinctive feature of Korean queer movies is that some of them are celebrated commercially as well as critically, the fact is that despite the earliest film that attained both recognition was released as early as 2006, the average annual production of films of this kind is unbalanced and is in fact hard to predict either. Rather, they only become obvious in recent years. What is indicated by this is that, presumably, in upcoming years, the more Korean queer movies of this kind are being produced, the more comprehensive picture of the Korean queer movie discourses in foreign countries would be. In that sense, future study would benefit by including more Korean queer movies that attain both critical and popular recognitions into the research and gain a more nuanced understanding of the reviewing elements that make up their film discourse. Finally, during the data collection process, the researcher has found the existence of vast amount movie reviews from amateur criticism, or say user created criticism on the internet. In this light, the considerable amount of amateur criticism on Korean queer movies should not be neglected and future study could examine further whether amateur criticism has affect the validity of professional criticism on Korean queer movies and whether amateur criticism affect the way Korean queer movies are received, etc.

Reference

Allen, M. P., & Lincoln, A. E. (2004). Critical discourse and the cultural consecration of American films. *Social Forces*, *82*(3), 871-894.

Bacchus Lady, The. (2016). Retrieved from https://40.hkiff.org.hk/en/film/40017/the-bacchus-lady

Barthel-Bouchier, D. (2012). Exportability of films in a globalizing market: The intersection of nation and genre. *Cultural sociology*, *6*(1), 75-91.

Baumann, S. (2001). Intellectualization and art world development: Film in the United States. *American Sociological Review*, 404-426.

Becker, H. S. (1982). *Art worlds*. University of California Press.

Benshoff, H. M., & Griffin, S. (Eds.). (2004). *Queer cinema: The film reader*. Psychology Press.

Bielby, W. T., & Bielby, D. D. (1994). " All Hits Are Flukes": Institutionalized Decision Making and the Rhetoric of Network Prime-Time Program Development. *American Journal of Sociology*, *99*(5), 1287-1313.

Bourdieu, P. (1984). *Distinction: A social critique of the judgement of taste*. Harvard University Press.

Bourdieu, P. (1993). *The field of cultural production: Essays on art and literature* (pp. 1-28). R. Johnson (Ed.). New York: Columbia University Press.

Bordwell, D. (1991). *Making meaning*. Harvard University Press.

Choi, J. (2010). *The South Korean film renaissance: local hitmakers, global provocateurs*. Wesleyan University Press.

DiMaggio, P. (1992). Two Cultural Boundaries and Structural Change: The Extension of the High Culture Model to Theater, Opera, and the Dance, 1900-1940. *Cultivating differences: Symbolic boundaries and the making of inequality*, 21.

DiMaggio, P. (1997). Culture and cognition. *Annual review of sociology*, *23*(1), 263-287.

Downe-Wamboldt, B. (1992). Content analysis: method, applications, and issues. *Health care for women international*, *13*(3), 313-321.

Elo, S., & Kyngäs, H. (2008). The qualitative content analysis process. *Journal of advanced nursing*, *62*(1), 107-115.

Ferree, M. M., & Merrill, D. A. (2000). Hot movements, cold cognition: Thinking about social movements in gendered frames. *Contemporary Sociology*, *29*(3), 454-462.

Grossman, A. (2000). *Queer Asian cinema: Shadows in the shade*. Psychology Press.

Hesmondhalgh, D. (2002). *The Cultural Industries*. London: Sage.

Hicks, A., & Petrova, V. (2006). Auteur discourse and the cultural consecration of American films. *Poetics*, *34*(3), 180-203.

Holbrook, M. B., & Addis, M. (2008). Art versus commerce in the movie industry: A two-path model of motion-picture success. *Journal of Cultural Economics*, *32*(2), 87-107.

Janssen, S., Kuipers, G., & Verboord, M. (2008). Cultural globalization and arts journalism: The international orientation of arts and culture coverage in Dutch, French, German, and US newspapers, 1955 to 2005. *American sociological review*, *73*(5), 719-740.

Janssen, S., & Verboord, M. (2015). Cultural Mediators and Gatekeepers.

Kersten, A. (2014). National cultural repertoires of evaluation in a global age: Film discourse in France, the Netherlands, the United Kingdom, and the United States. *European Sociological Review*, jcu069.

KONG, TRAVIS S.K., SKY H.L. LAU and EVA C.Y. LI. "Sexual Cultures in Asia." The Blackwell Encyclopedia of Sociology. Ritzer, George (ed). Blackwell Publishing, 2007. Blackwell Reference Online. 13 December 2016

http://www.sociologyencyclopedia.com/subscriber/tocnode.html?id=g9781405124331_yr2016_chunk_g978140512433125_ss1-87

Kuipers, G. (2011). Cultural globalization as the emergence of a transnational cultural field: Transnational television and national media landscapes in four European countries. *American Behavioral Scientist*, *55*(5), 541-557.

Lamont, M., & Thévenot, L. (2000). Rethinking comparative cultural sociology: Repertoires of evaluation in France and the United States.

Martin, F., Jackson, P., McLelland, M., & Yue, A. (Eds.). (2010). *AsiaPacifiQueer: rethinking genders and sexualities*. University of Illinois Press.

McDonald, P., & Wasko, J. (Eds.). (2007). *The Contemporary American Film Industry*. Blackwell.

Segers, F. (2000). Korea moves. *Hollywood Reporter*, *362*(34), 14-16.

Shim, D. (2006). Hybridity and the rise of Korean popular culture in Asia. *Media, culture & society*, *28*(1), 25-44.

Smith, G. M. (2003). *Film structure and the emotion system*. Cambridge University Press.

Van Rees, K., & Dorleijn, G. J. (2001). The eighteenth-century literary field in Western Europe: the interdependence of material and symbolic production and consumption. *Poetics*, *28*(5-6), 331-348.

Hong Kong Film Awards[香港电影金像奖]. (2017). Retrieved from http://www.hkfaa.com

《下女的诱惑》满座率高达 9 成 创朴赞郁电影在台纪录－剧情一转再转影迷大呼过瘾 要求加场放映. (2016). [The Handmaiden (2016) broke Park's record in Taiwan and fans have demanded extra screenings]

http://theatrical.catchplay.com/?catalog=News&page=news&id=1726

金马奖介绍[An overview on Taiwan Golden Horse Awards, GHA]. (2017). Retrieved from http://www.goldenhorse.org.tw/awards/about/overview/

《霜花店：朕的男人》票房好－打破近年韓片[The box-office revenue of The Frozen Flower broke the record of Korean films in recent years]. (2008). Retrieved from http://goodfilms.pixnet.net/blog/post/27025691-

韩国同志电影漫谈[A rambling talk on Korean queer movies]. (2015). Retrieved from https://www.douban.com/note/482405919/

10 分钟卖票 2000 张 《王的男人》火到台湾(图) [2000 tickets for *The King and the Clown* sold in 10 minutes—the popularity of this film in Taiwan]. (2006). Retrieved from http://ent.qq.com/a/20060425/000136.htm

《霜花店：朕的男人》票房好 打破近年韓片 最佳成績 [*Frozen Flower* broke the box-office record of Korean films in Taiwan cinema]. (2009). Retrieved from http://goodfilms.pixnet.net/blog/post/27025691-《霜花店：朕的男人》票房好--打破近年韓片

《王的男人》李準基天生是「雙面」人？[Is Lee Jong-gi from *The King and the Clown* a two-faced man?]. (2006). Retrieved from https://news.tvbs.com.tw/other/365385

香港电影票房榜 2009 年 [Hong Kong box-office results in 2009].(2009). Retrieved from http://yule.sohu.com/20090523/n264126354.shtml

Appendix A. Short storylines of films selected

1.The Bacchus Lady (2016)

The Bacchus Lady is about elderly prostitution in South Korean. The protagonist, So-Young, is an elderly lady who provides sex services to the male senior citizens using the pretest of selling Bacchus (an energy drink) to them. One day, when So-Young was visiting a clinic, the doctor was stabbed by his wife. Therefore, she picks up a Korean-Filipino boy who was the son of the couple. Then, she takes care of him while continue trying to make a living through prostitution…

2.No Regret (2007)

This film is about a love story between a male prostitute (Lee Young-Hoon) with a man (Han Lee), the latter of whose family rejects his sexual orientation…

3.The Weight (2012)

The film is about the story of a boy named Jung who was adopted into a family of only a mother and a son. When he grows up, Jung becomes a hunchback man because of scoliosis and works as a live-in mortician taking care of corpses in the weirdest manners. He has a brother who wants to become a woman and a mother who hates both of them…

4.Like a Virgin (2007)

A high school student and die-hard fun of Madonna Oh Dong-ku, who has to work part-time to save money for the sex reassignment surgery she wants. At first, Dong-ku has no interest in taking up sports, but when she changes her mind after finding out that an upcoming ssireum tournament with give her enough money to pay for the surgery…

5.Man on High Heels (2014)

While Yoon Ji-wook has been a hardcore homicide detective because of his undeniable ability to nab violent criminals. Yet, deep inside, he has a secret that she must hide from the world she lives in—the desire to become a woman... At first, Ji-wook decides to hide his feelings but as time goes by, she reaches the point where she can no longer hide who she truly is anymore…

6.Love in Between (2011)

This film is about a triangular affair between a university professor—Yun Ji-seok, his wife So-young, and a student named Su-ji that the professer is having an affair with. At the start, So-young develops an elaborate plan to befriend the woman and then set her up. However, when So-young meets Su-ji, things go out of control because she experiences varying emotions ranging from revenge to sympathy...

7.The Handmaiden (2016)

Set in 1930s Korea, in the period of Japanese occupation, this film is about how a female pickpocket helps a Korean man to seduce a Japanese heiress lady out of her inheritance. However, a romance blossoms between the two women…

8.Night Flight (2014)

a film about a struggling relationship between two male classmates—Yong-ju and Gi-woong, were once best friends in middle school but were estranged from each other once they enter high school. While Gi-woong becomes the best student in the school, Yong-ju becomes one of the strongest fighters in the school and even joins Seong-jin's gang. Yong-ju becomes concerned when he finds out that Seong-jin's gang is mercilessly bullying Gi-taek, another friend of them...

9.A Girl at my Door (2014)

A story about a female police chief who tries to protect a teenage girl from domestic abuse, but during this process a subtle relationship was developed between the two…

10.Frozen Flower (2008)

This is a story about how a male bodyguard of the King, with whom he is romantically involved, ends up falling in love with the King's wife. This is because the King and the Queen do not have any children but they are forced to produced one, so the King sent his male lover to do this for him. However, a romance soon blossoms between the Queen and the bodyguard…

11.Rainbow Eyes (2008)

The film starts with a scene where homicide diectives Kyung-yoon and Eun-ju investigating a crime scene where an affluent entrepreneur was murdered. They were puzzled because the

killer was careful not to leave behind incriminating evidence, but nevertheless, they managed to find a strand of the killer's hair. Afterwards, police are then able to determine that the killer is male and has AB blood type. At the same time, Kyung-woo finds it hard to continue the relationship with his girlfriend because he cannot seem to let go of the past with his favorite high school classmate, who is also a boy…

12.Spa Night (2010)

A closeted Korean-American teenager follows his desires and finds more than he bargains for at a Korean spa…

13.Stateless Things (2012)

The film is about the story between three marginalized people in the brim of Seoul city where they come together in a fresh and provocative manner as well as the consequent problems they face…

14.The King and the Clown (2006)

The story of this film is set in the 16th century Chosun Dynasty when a pair of male clowns travel to Seoul and try to make a living by mocking the hedonistic king with bawdy humor and gender-bending, for which they are arrested and what happens afterwards.

16.Antique (2009)

The film is about a story that happens in a bakery, which is opened by a boy called Keiichiro. However, Keiichiro has trouble dealing with the traumatic memories because he had been kidnapped in his childhood. To deal with the past, he opens this bakery and hires a playboy patisserie, a former boxer, and an absent-minded friend…

Appendix B Short translations of reviews in Chinese

Hong Kong discourse

1. The Handmaiden (2016)

Review 1:

This review argues that the focus of the movie is the power relationship between the uncle and the miss, the miss and the handmaiden, men and women, and women and women. Particularly, the scene of reading pornography which presents the relationship between the reader and the listener leads to the underlying issue of male hegemony, etc.

2. Night Flight (2012)

Review 2:

This review starts from analyzing the film plot and spends several paragraphs interpreting the plot development, then discusses the role of the director—who is already an established filmmaking specializing movies of this kind. The critic praises the contribution of this film because it extends the discussion from gay relationship to serious social issues such as Korean education system, school bullying, domestic education, friendship, intra-generational gap, etc.

3. The Bacchus Lady (2016)

Review 2: The critic starts from discussing the meanings of three different translation of the movie title—prostitutes, nymphs, and goddess of mercy, and argues that the last one, which is also the translation in Hong Kong version, suits best with the underlying messages of the film. Then, the critic discusses the role of women as well as the role of mother in Korean films, and posits the heroine of this film into discussion…

4. Frozen Flower (2008)

Review 1:

This review starts from the eye-catching, controversial, and explicit scenes in the film and compare it with other famous movies which also have explicit contents like this. Then, the critic analyzes the role of the antagonists in the film—the King and his lover, and interprets several famous scenes in the film. In the end, the critic concludes that as a costume drama,

the film still contributes to the scope of discussion on the present situation of male homosexuals…

Review 2:

This review focuses on the relationship between power and desire. Then it borrows from the similarity between Chinese emperors and Korean emperors to discuss the hierarchical society in the film and how that influences the way the King treats his lover and his wife—the Queen, and how that leads to the tragic end of the lover and his wife...

5. Love in Between (2011)

Review 2:

The film starts from introducing the film plot, then it compares this film with another Finnish film which has a similar plot with this one. The difference between these two films is that this film shows the reserved side of women when they are in a relationship and the relationship between the heroine and her husband's lover—a love affair between two women, is also presented in an implicit way…

Taiwan discourse

1. A Girl at My Door (2014)

The review starts from the introduction of the plot and points out how the two heroines—two girls who start to grow reliant on each other, are marginalized in South Korean society due to their sexual orientation, personality, and upbringing, etc. Also, it argues that what the director tries to present is the communication between human beings, what possibilities out there and what would happen at extreme situations, etc.…

2. Frozen Flower (2008)

This review starts from an introduction on the status of Korean movie industry in Asia, then it introduces the success of this film as well as the Korean movie heat in recent years and praises them for their excellence in artistic accomplishments. Then, it argues that the most impressive part of the film is the complicated triangular relationship between the King, the King's lover, and the Queen, and comments that it outperforms Ang Lee's *Lust, Caution (2007).*

3. Night Flight (2012)

Review 1:

This review starts from the discussion on the first Queer film festival in Taiwan to a short retrospective of the queer movie development in Taiwan in recent years. It then compares this film with its other Taiwan counter parts and emphasizes the director's role in shaping this film and how the social issues are expressed in this film…

Review: 2

This review incorporates the plot and the discussion of their underlying meanings in the article. Then it comments on the formal elements of the film such as the shooting, the music, and the screenplay, etc. In the end, it praises this film for its contribution to the urgent issues in the contemporary society…

4. The Bacchus Lady (2016)

Review 1:

This review compares this film with another Korean film which has a similar subject and draws a conclusion that Korean films are distinctive of their sensibility and spontaneity. It also discusses the translation of the film title and points out that the translation neglects the profound aspect of the film, which is about the contemporary history of South Korea, etc. The review ends with a suggest on what Taiwan filmmakers could learn from Korean filmmakers…

Review 2:

This film starts from an introduction from the current social issues in South Korea, which are also reflected in the film, and praises this film for pointing out these pressing social issues. Then, it moves on to discuss how the actor adds to the overall effect of the film and how this film could serve as a kaleidoscope of South Korean society as well as a warning sign for other countries experiencing the same issues…

5. The Handmaiden (2016)

Review 1:

This review introduces the international recognition of this film as well as its original screenplay from *Fingersmith* and how the director adapts this script into a new play. It discusses the explicit scenes in the film and argues that rather than a mere visual stimulation, it is also another form of presentation of the luring relationship between the maiden and her

master. Then, it moves on to relates it to how the director himself has always dealt with this kind explicit contents, his own style, and his future developments, etc.…

Review 2:

This review starts from a discussion on the director's distinguishing style and how that comes naturally in this film as well. The focus of this discussion is on the sense of depression in the film which, according to the critic, is caused by male hegemony and the distorted personality of the uncle. It also discusses the explicit scenes in the film and also points out how the lighting, the setting, and the music contribute to the overall effect of the film.

6. No Regret (2008)

Review 1:

In this review, the critic discusses the difference between Western queer movies and queer movies in the East, and uses this difference as the starting point for his analysis on the film's plot and the relationship between the antagonists. Then, this review goes back to other Chinese queer movies and Korean queer movies and comments on how this film could be posited in the contemporary film world.

Review 2:

This review discusses the plot, the shooting as well as the original sound track and the popularity of this film, etc.…

7. A Girl at My Door (2014)

Review 1:

This review starts from discussing the poster of this film and how the theme of the film is revealed in the picture. It then discusses several themes from the film such as feminism, power relation, and homosexuality, etc. Particularly, it discusses the two actors of this film and their acting contribute to the complexity and depth of the film…

Review 2:

This review focuses on the interpretation and explanation of several important scenes in the film and how the relationship between the two heroines evolved into a mutual salvation. It then compares this film with other South Korean films which share a similar plot, and how it

stands out from other South Korean movies since many of them are characteristic of presenting social issues…

8. Spa Night (2010)

Review 1:

This review starts from discussing the rising popularity of Korean films in recent years and argues that this film is typical of the kind of Asia films that features closeted male homosexuals, and how this self-restriction goes against their own nature. Especially, the critic comments on what the spa symbolizes and how that relates to the theme of the film…

Review 2:

This review starts from comparing this film with other queer-subject films produced in Asia and how this film stand out from other films of this kind…

9. The King and the Clown (2006)

Review 1:

This review starts from characterizing South Korean costume movies and argues that the success of this film lies not only on the stardom of the actor, but also ideas lying in the film. It is not only visually eye-catching, it also shows the inner desire of the emperor as well as the complexity of human nature, etc. It also mentions other famous movies with a similar queer-subject and compare them.

Review 2:

This review mentions the commercial success of this film and adds that it also has its implicit indications and is typical of costume films. It then discusses the bourgeoning of a triangular romance out of a fierce political struggle. This critics comments that this film excels not only in terms of its content but also the ideas in it.

10. Stateless Things (2012)

Review 1:

This review focuses on explaining how this film differs from a much-talked-about Thai film which shares a similar queer-subject and argues that they are two different films at all—not only in the way the story is told but also in terms of the way messages are conveyed. Additionally, this film, as the critic sees it, does its job mostly in an implicit, restricted way…

Review 2:

This review first compares this film with a film from Hong Kong that this film has reminded the author of, and argues that what connects them is the theme they share—how it feels like to be a person with no roots. Then what follows are an extensive analysis on several scenes from the film…

11. Antique (2009)

Review 1:

This review covers the commercial popularity of this film, how it was adapted from a popular Japanese comic series, and how the good-looking actors contribute to the attractiveness of this film. Then, it discusses each main character as well as their actors respectively and comments how their performance contribute to the overall effect of the film.

Review 2:

This review also argues that it is not only commercially celebrated but also has it complexity and depth which make it stand out. It praises the effort of the screenwriter, the author of the original work as well as the artistic style of filmmaking. Then, this review discusses the complicated relationships and the inner struggles of the main characters, etc.