

**Female Orchestral Conductors:
Negotiating Gender And Leadership In The Classical Music World**



Student Name: Jing Zhang

Student No. 450143

Supervisor: Boross, B.

Second Reader: Stocco Ferreira, D.

Master in Arts, Culture and Society

Erasmus School of History, Culture and Communication

Erasmus University Rotterdam

Master Thesis

June 12, 2018

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Writing this thesis was a self-learning journey which was extremely challenging but inspiring. It has evoked a deep, conscious knowledge that as a woman, in terms abilities, we have no differences from men. Society and cultural beliefs have made us believe what is real and what is not. I was taught – and it was my cultural belief – that women are different than men, and women do not have the same abilities as men. The mistaken belief of inferiority is a form of hierarchy which constrains women in many ways – especially when we look at the current movements and changes happening around world which advocate equality and the progress women have made. I am optimistic that the pursuit of “perfect equality” is a noble goal. I truly believe that in order to change the current situation of inequality, we first have to realize it as a problem, then act on it.

I am grateful for having the opportunity to write this thesis, and thankful for getting the all support which I needed to accomplish this intense journey. First, I want to thank Marloes Kouwenberg, the coordinator of the National Master Orchestra program at the Royal Conservatory Den Haag, who provided the contacts to me, so that I was able to find the “idea” interviewees. I am also grateful to all the interviewees who made time for the interviews: thanks for being open, sharing your experience and opinion with me.

I would like to thank Balázs Boross, my supervisor. I heartily appreciate your guidance, your encouragement and helping me realize the potential of this research. I am grateful for the constructive insights you provided. Thanks for being patient and sharing your knowledge with me. I would also like to thank Daniela Stocco Ferreira in advance for providing additional feedback.

Last but not least, I would like to thank a few people gave infinite support during this two-year study. First, my appreciation to my parents, especially to my mother. Although we live far away from each other, I am grateful for the mental support they provided and their constant faith in me. Thanks to my boyfriend Folkwin Emaar for your support, encouragement and patience – and who always cheered me up when I felt downhearted. Thank to my friend Jed Bonniwell for your support, advice, and helping me to get through this bumpy journey.

Jing Zhang, June 2018



ABSTRACT

Men have traditionally dominated the classical music world, where gender dominance is particularly prominent in the role of the orchestral conductor. The conductor is a traditionally male-dominated profession, due to its dual roles of musical leadership and endowed authority, which have been historically legitimated. The stereotypical image of the gender of the conductor has profound influences when women challenge this position. However, due to significant social changes in society, women have gained more access to education and obtained opportunities to compete with their male counterparts. Gender conventions have been challenged, and gender inequality has slowly shifted. As a result, a considerable number of female conductors have emerged in the field. Yet, there is still a vast disparity in professional orchestral conductors' positions held by men versus women. The purpose of this study is to understand how people in the classical music field perceive female leaders when these women take on the leadership role in a highly-demanding and extremely competitive environment, challenging gendered conventions by performing the role of conductor. I am interested in how the perceptions of individuals have influenced female conductors to achieve this particular leadership, and whether these perceptions may shape/reshape the stereotypical role of the conductor

The research aims to answer the core question: "How do insiders perceive female conductors as leaders in the classical music world, and to what extent do the perceptions influence the status of female conductors, thereby reconsidering the gendered leadership role of the music conductor?" A qualitative research method was employed in this study. I have identified five types of "insiders" who work in the classical music field, have had direct or indirect relationships with female conductors, or have worked with female conductors. Because of the limited accessibility into the classical music field, I chose a non-probability snowball sampling strategy to select eleven participants. Eleven semi-structured, in-depth interviews were conducted. Once the interview data was collected, a thematic analysis method was employed to process the data. Based on the theory-driven approach, four main themes/patterns were identified.

As the results show, not all individuals considered the unequal representation of male and female conductors as a sign of gender inequality. This is because the legitimated status of male conductors and rooted gender conventions in the classical music field has caused (unconscious) gender prejudice and bias perception toward female conductors. However, there are traces of changing perceptions, due to the improvement of women's status in society and the higher achievement made by a small number of female conductors. The awareness of gender inequality in the role of the conductor and individual recognition of female conductors contribute to shaping female conductor leadership roles, as well as further deconstructing gender inequality in the classical music world.

KEYWORDS: Gender Inequality, Female Leadership, Female Conductor, Perception, Classical Music

Table of Contents

1	Introduction	1
2	Theory and Literature review	5
2.1	Consecration: traditional conducting path and gendered convention	5
2.1.1	The history of orchestral conducting and gender inequality	6
2.1.2	Social and symbolic boundaries	7
2.2	Gender traits and leadership conventions	8
2.2.1	Glass ceiling	11
2.3	Institutionalized gender inequality	12
2.3.1	Sociocultural influences in cultural institutions	13
2.3.2	Deconstructing gender inequality	13
3	Research Question and Expectations	16
4	Methodology	17
4.1	Qualitative Research Method	18
4.2	Unit of analysis and sampling strategy	18
4.3	Semi-structured interview	20
4.4	Method of data analysis: Thematic analysis	20
4.5	Ethics and Confidentiality	22
5	Results	22
5.1	Cultural consecration and legitimation: the influences of the establishment on the traditional conducting path	23
5.1.1	Conducting convention: gender and leadership	23
5.1.2	Conventions lead to gender prejudice	24
5.1.3	Gender attributes: Feminine versus Masculine	26
5.2	Sociocultural factors of gender inequality	28
5.2.1	Change in women’s status in society	28
5.2.2	Organizational Culture	29
5.2.3	Group dynamic and leadership style	30
5.2.4	Conducting education: selection bias	30
5.3	Individual perception: Subjectivity versus Objectivity	31
5.3.1	Subjectivity of conductor qualifications	31
5.3.2	Positive discrimination	31
5.3.3	Double standard	33
5.4	Recognition of female conductors	34
6	Conclusion and Recommendations	36
	References:	42
	Appendix 1: Interview Consent Form	49
	Appendix 2: Interview Design	50
	Appendix 3: Interview guide	52
	Appendix 4: Interview guide – for female conductors only	56
	Appendix 5: Interviewee information (in chronological order)	57
	Appendix 6: Mind Map	60
	Appendix 7: Table Explaining Themes	61

1 Introduction

A gender-typed occupation is one which encompasses a distinctive stereotypical gender characteristic, either feminine or masculine (Ridgeway, 2011). The role of leadership is commonly associated with masculinity (Scharff, 2008; Wharton, 2012; Ridgeway, 2011). In the classical music world, the music conductor is a traditionally male-dominated position due to its role of musical leadership and endowed authority (Bartleet, 2008). It requires one to have the ability to integrate the orchestra into an entity. Analyzing the problems involved in keeping time and controlling the temporal aspects of performance are the basic interpretive responsibilities of a conductor (Galkin, 1988; Bartleet, 2003). Moreover, a conductor is often perceived as an individual heroic leader who is able inspire the followers to create excellent music performances (Koivunen., Wennes, 2011). Before the 20th century, almost all well-known conductors in history were male (Pendle, 1991). In recent decades, an increasing number of emerging female conductors have challenged this traditionally male-dominated leadership position. This implies a positive change for women pursuing gender equality in classical music world – women were not traditionally entitled to leadership roles and power, and have experienced exclusion from particular roles in society (Scharff, 2015).

In spite of the fact that women make up a high proportion of students in artistic and creative studies, male-dominance is still significant in the cultural industries, and the leadership positions are primarily occupied by men (Scharff, 2018). A study by Scharff (2018), which shows the data on the representation of women, points out that in Germany in 2012, females represented 39.4% of the music industry. Similarly, on a global scale, females make up 32% of the music industry (Pujar, 2016). A research from Rieger (1985) indicates that in the symphonic orchestra field, female musicians have rarely obtained official memberships in the past. It was not until the 20th century that female musicians started to obtain a significant number of places in the traditionally male-dominated symphony orchestra (Pendle, 1991). However, due to the prestigious and authoritative role of the conductor, the unequal disposition of gender in the profession of conducting is even more prominent. Lawson (1984) reviewed 857 orchestras listed by the American Symphony Orchestra in 1980, demonstrating the number of women conductors was only 2.9%. However, a recent figure shows an improvement in the number of female conductors in the United States, with 11% of females holding a conducting position (Groen, 2016). While female musicians make up 43.2% of British orchestras, merely 1.4% of women hold the conducting position (Scharff, 2018).

With the change in social structure and the arising awareness of gender inequality in society (Scharff, 2018), attention has gradually shifted to female leaders in European

orchestras. In 1969, female musicians were rejected from applying for positions in the Berlin Philharmonic Orchestra, with the reasoning that “following the old tradition, the Berlin philharmonic did not accept any women musicians” (Rieger, 1985, p.151). The orchestra started to admit female musicians in 1982 (Bennett, 2008). Austria is often referred to as the most conservative country regarding the prominence of gender inequality in the classical world. The Vienna Philharmonic Orchestra which remained a “boys club” for more than a century, is dominated by male musicians. In 1997, it finally broke the unspoken gender boundary, appointing the first female musician who plays harp¹ as its official member (Service, 2013). Before she was appointed as a full member, she had worked at the orchestra under temporary contracts for several years. (Bennett, 2008). The conservatory of Vienna described the admission of female musicians to orchestras as a “difficult and delicate issue... as if the Pope were going to be a woman” (Eakin, 2003, p.1). However, the milestone of breaking the gender boundary in Austria’s classical music world occurred when the Vienna Radio Symphony Orchestra appointed Marin Alsop² as artistic director in 2018. She became the first woman to take up this leadership role in the Austrian classical music world (Connolly, January 29, 2018); In May 2018, one of the top Dutch orchestras, the Netherlands Radio Philharmonic Orchestra, announced that they have appointed a female conductor as its chief conductor starting in 2019 for a period of five years. It is the first time in Dutch classical music history that a female has been appointed as a chief conductor (Christodoulou, May 9, 2018). Moreover, The BBC Proms³ also introduced gender balancing to its orchestral program, claiming that half of all new commissions will go to women by 2022 (Singh, February 26, 2018).

Given the fact that the status of women in the cultural industries are changing, it is also important to know how individuals perceive women in the cultural and creative industries. As explained by Ridgeway (2008), individual perceptions are influenced by cultural beliefs, in which gender is a significant factor that shapes behavior and social relations in an institutional context. The core of this study focuses on understanding how people in the classical music field perceive women when these women take the leadership role in a highly-demanding and very competitive environment to become a music conductor. Therefore, by providing insights into how insiders perceive female conductors, the research

¹ The research on Gender Differences in Musical Instrument Choice by Hallam, Rogers and Creech (2008) indicate that harp is considered eminently suitable for women, which is typically seen as a female-gendered instrument.

² Marin Alsop is an American female conductor and violinist. Born in 1956.

³ The BBC Proms, more formally known as the Henry Wood Promenade Concerts presented by the BBC, is an eight-week summer season of daily orchestral classical music concerts and other events, held annually, predominantly in the Royal Albert Hall in central London (Retrieved from: <http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/articles/2kSNxH9Cj9PT62ZzTnvWpYZ/the-bbc-proms-whats-it-all-about>).

conducted for this thesis may help us to understand “how” context has shaped women in achieving leadership within the classical music field. Ayman (2004) stresses that the context includes societal values, the culture of organizations, the nature of the task, and the characteristics of followers – all of these factors have influences on the behaviors and effectiveness of the leader (Ayman, 2004). Societal value is a qualification which the individual places on the change she/he experiences in life. There is a relationship between societal values and organizational behavior, indicating that individual perceptions have an important bearing upon organizational perceptions, thus influence culture milieu in the organization (Mills, 1988).

In this research, I use the term “insider” to refer to individuals who work in the classical music world – such as musicians, orchestra board members, professional classical music educators, and students who are devoted to the conducting profession (Bartleet, 2003). They are the perceivers who may be able to shape/reshape the stereotype of the orchestral conductor regarding gender. As will be demonstrated, these perceptions appear to have profound impacts on female conductors when achieving leadership.

In order to investigate the perceptions of insiders towards female conductors, a qualitative research method was considered to be the most suitable approach. Eleven semi-structured interviews were conducted with individuals who work in the classical music field, more importantly, those who have direct/indirect relationships with female conductor(s). Notably, the classical music field is a relatively closed community, therefore gaining access to the community is the key to this research. I adopted a snowball sampling strategy to gain access into the field, finding eligible respondents based on their experience working with female conductors. These interviews were dedicated toward answering the core question: “How do insiders perceive female conductors as leaders in the classical music world, and to what extent do the perceptions influence the status of female conductors, thereby reconsidering the gendered leadership role of the music conductor?” Furthermore, this research revealed how individuals perceive female conductors in terms of performance, charisma, professional competency, and whether/to what extent do gendered conventions in the conducting profession influence women when achieving leadership as an orchestral conductor.

The research is structured as follows: after the introduction, the purpose of the research is expanded upon, along with background information about gender inequality in the creative and cultural industries at large, a discussion about gender representation in classical music world and gender conventions of orchestral conductors. Chapter two presents previous studies on the origins of gender inequality in the role of conductor, and theories of gender theory and leadership. Chapter three gives an explicit explanation of the research question

and expectations. In regards to the research question, chapter four presents the operationalization of this research. As mentioned above, a qualitative research design is employed. Eleven semi-structured and in-depth interviews were conducted using a non-probability sampling strategy. Once the data was collected, a thematic approach was implemented to analyze the interview data. Chapter five demonstrates the research findings and the four thematic patterns that were identified based on the theoretical-driven approach. Ultimately, chapter six demonstrates the conclusion which restates the key outcomes and offers comprehensive insights into the research. Based on research design-related facts, three limitations are noted in the final chapter. Last but not least, the contribution of this study to cultural industries is considered and recommendations for further research is proposed.

2 Theory and Literature review

Classical music institutions have created and reproduced hierarchies of social class, gender, race and ethnicity (Scharff, 2015). However, the primary focus of this study is on gender perspectives in relation to gender stereotypes and leadership. Therefore, other factors will not be elaborated.

This chapter focuses on three theories: in the first part, I demonstrate how gender inequality is historically formed, how the gendered role of music conductors has been legitimated in the classical music world, and the extent to which the legitimization of the status of male musicians influences the classical music world in the present. The second part of the theoretical framework focuses on Eagly's women in leadership theory, and how leadership is gendered and reproduced in general. We then examine Eagly's theory as it applies to the classical music world, and how legitimated gender convention, embodied authority and power relation have formed a common perception of the orchestral conductor, whose image is typically associated with masculine traits, which has resulted in the ignorance of women's abilities and difficulties for women to pursue leadership roles in orchestras. Furthermore, the literature from Bartleet provides rich reference material about female conductors and gender inequality. These works were essential in this research, helping identify the gender conventions in the classical music world. The last part of this chapter focuses on gender sociology, more specifically, how gender inequality is institutionalized and the identification of sociocultural influences on gender inequality.

2.1 Consecration: traditional conducting path and gendered convention

“All creative work is well-known as being the exclusive works of men”

(Naumann, 2013, p.4)

Gender inequality in cultural industries has historical roots which can be linked to certain processes of cultural consecration (Allen., Lincoln, 2004). Cultural consecration identifies and legitimates the cultural producers, and as a result, they are entitled to particular prestige and esteem (Braden, 2009). Moreover, consecration legitimates one's status, thus, it entitles certain groups of people (e.g. male musicians) to have more prestige than those who merely enjoy contemporary prestige and achievement. In other words, cultural consecration can assign power to ascribe social value and privilege (Allen., Lincoln, 2004). In the classical music world, superior status, privilege, power relation and authority have been legitimated and imbedded with inherently “masculine traits” in the role of the conductor. Conducting conventions are established with male attributes (Bartleet, 2008). There is a link between a reverence for the ideology of masculine domination in music and the thoughts of masculine values in musical style, which results in keeping women practitioners in subordinate positions

and remaining dependent on men (Citron, 2000). This inequality has been taken for granted and widely accepted in the classical music world (Wharton, 2005). This type of inequality has also advantaged men in obtaining leadership, as well as enabling them to maintain and reproduce their superior status among men by suppressing women. The following section demonstrates the historical development of conducting profession and the production of gender inequality in the classical music world.

2.1.1 The history of orchestral conducting and gender inequality

Men have had dominated positions throughout western music history, yet the important developments that women have made in music cannot be neglected (Pendle, 1991). In the 17th century, women participated in most major developments of both Baroque and Classical music in Europe. Until the 18th century, however, some countries banned female musicians from performing on the public stage due to political turmoil (e.g. French Revolution) (Pendle, 1991). Consequently, many talented female musicians had to transfer their desire to perform on stage into a private setting, such as salons, private homes. Only well-trained female vocalists were still allowed to perform in public (Pendle, 1991). In the late 18th century to early 19th century, when the Romanticism movement penetrated the art world, it accelerated the unequal treatment between males and females. Although many women were offered and encouraged to pursue a musical education, it was only thought of as a great tool for women to gain social acceptance or to improve marriage possibilities. Nevertheless, talented female musicians were forbidden by their husbands or fathers to appear on the public stage or to publish their musical works under their own name (Pendle, 1991). The advice and support of a man became a necessity for the music career of women, no matter how talented those women were (Pendle, 1991).

Orchestral music first emerged around 1600 in Italy – it was distinguished from other ensemble music in terms of its musical style and structure, including more than one instrument playing the same part of music, which became more sophisticated and complex as it developed (Grout, 1960). In the earlier development of orchestral music, the first violinist, known as the concertmaster, led the performance of the orchestra from his chair. Until the early 19th century, due to the growing scale of orchestras and development of sophisticated musical structures, concertmasters could not be seen or followed by the entire orchestra. Conductor-composers, such as Carl Maria von Weber⁴ and Felix Mendelssohn⁵, began to stand up on the podium and conduct from the front and center as the size of orchestras

⁴ Carl Maria Friedrich Ernst von Weber (1786 – 1826) was a German composer and conductor, he was one of the first significant composers of the Romantic school.

⁵ Felix Mendelssohn (1809-1847) was a German composer, conductor and organist of the early Romantic period.

expanded. The function of conducting in the orchestral music performance was normalized in the middle of 19th century (Galkin, 1988; Bartleet, 2003). In the later 19th century, the orchestra reached the size and proportions we now see in the concert hall (Raynor, 1978; Grout, 1960; Pendle, 1991).

The art of conducting developed in the 19th century. As far as it is known, women of that time were not invited to conduct professional instrumental groups. Furthermore, women were neither admitted to conducting classes, nor welcomed as apprentices. It was to be many years before a woman would be accepted on the podium (Pendle, 1991). As Bartleet (2008) points out, although women had a long lineage in the history of conducting, which can be traced back to the Renaissance era, the voice of women barely penetrated into the prevailing discourses of the profession. Women had been marginalized and their presence had also been limited to a bare minimum (Bartleet, 2008; Pendle, 1991).

In the 1870s, some European conservatories with classes in orchestration and composition began to admit female students, but male and female students received instruction in separate divisions. Since the sexes were separated, it was also doubtful whether the curriculum was equal (Pendle, 1991). The convention was that girls were studying to become performers or educators rather than as composers or conductors (Pendle, 1991). Women of that time were not invited to conduct professional instrumental groups, yet a number of female musicians established and conducted choral groups (Pendle, 1991). Women did not have the possibility to be accepted or have the means to enter into the orchestra as a conductor until the early 20th century (Cheng, 1998). Pendle (1991) explains that there were three reasons why women musicians rarely ventured into the realm of orchestral music: first, symphonies and works for large groups were only considered as masculine forms to be performed in the concert halls; secondly, orchestral works required skills which many female musicians did not have the means or opportunity to learn; thirdly, female composers rarely had access to groups that would rehearse and perform their works. In other words, all music composers, male and female, “needed connections to the men who held power in the musical world” (Pendle, 1991, p. 113). Gender segregation in the study of conducting produced a gap between boys and girls, and limited women’s achievements on conducting profession (Ridgeway, 2008). Gender segregation in classical music at large prevented the growth of women musicians. Hence, a dominant community of male musicians enforced gender stigmas and suppressed the exposure of women (Edwards, 2015).

2.1.2 Social and symbolic boundaries

Gender as a type of hierarchy in classical music is sustained by social boundaries (Schmutz, 2009). Moreover, symbolic boundaries indicate the categorization of music, which

distinguishes the aesthetic category of “serious” music that linked to masculine norms from its lighter counterpart (feminine norms) in order to secure men’s own cultural status. The boundaries camouflage the manner in which music standards originate normatively (Schmutz., Faupel, 2010). The concept of music by the time of the Romantic era was often considered as a connotation of masculinity, based on the dominance of men in the music field (Schmutz., Faupel, 2010). The exclusion of the female within the field of music has had consequences for the gendered distribution of cultural legitimacy and consecration, and limited opportunities for female musicians (Schmutz, 2009; DeNora, 2002). Moreover, reputations of male musicians are socially constructed. The concept of “music as a male dominated world” has penetrated history and continuously (to some extent) influenced contemporary society (Bartleet, 2003). This recognition as a de facto award system consecrated the position of the male in the music world (DeNora, 2002).

To summarize, cultural consecration can be summarized into two complementary characters. First, it concerns a higher accumulation of symbolic capital; and second, it implies a distinction between selected gender groups, each of which is worthy of admiration (Lizé, 2016). However, the consecration of gender in the classical music field has effects, not only on the way that conductors are perceived, but also on the subjective interpretation of their gender and qualifications. The negative influence on perceptions of cultural stereotypes and leadership have consequences for women when achieving gender-specified leader roles, thus it is necessary to understand the how the dispositions of personality and behavior between men and women are socially constructed.

2.2 Gender traits and leadership conventions

Wharton (2005) stresses that women and men are much more similar than different, yet in reality, people tend to believe that men and women are different regarding competencies, personal traits and behaviors. In short, the underlying debates are broader and complex issues of gender inequality (Wharton, 2005). Often, unequal treatment is justified by supposed genetic difference between male and female (Wharton, 2005). Bem (1993) cites the term “androcentrism,” which refers to “a belief that men and masculinity are superior to women and femininity, and that males and masculinity are the standard or the norm” (p.10). The differences between men and women, as scholars (Hollander., Howard, 2000; Wharton, 2005) indicate, are almost never simply differences, but rather reflect an imbalance of power. Equality is best served by having accurately acknowledged the abilities between men and women. However, due to expectations of social roles, the understanding of “male” and “female” is often interconnected with masculine and feminine norms. The internalization of implications of gender and the use of gender meanings to construct an identity consistent with them (Wharton, 2005) has led to a perception bias when traditional gender roles are

being challenged by the opposite sex – thus disabling people to appropriately evaluate the ability of the other. “The belief that what is acceptable or appropriate for females is not acceptable or appropriate for male (and vice versa), anyone who deviates from these standards of appropriate femaleness and maleness is unnatural” (Bem, 1993, p.154). Moreover, the internalization of gendered ideals about women, who are thought to be a natural “caretakers,” and other feminine attributes may constrain abilities for women to see themselves in a position of power, which could further result in a struggle to develop the identity of a leader (Fox-Kirk, 2017).

In general, individuals inclined to believe there is a relationship between characteristics of members of the social group and the requirements of the social roles that the member occupies or pursues – this belief causes prejudice in relation to the role of occupation (Eagly, in press). Gender prejudice is likely to occur when individuals have preconceptions about a certain social group which is incongruent with the attributes thought to be required for success in certain social roles (Eagly, 2002). Hence, when a member of the stereotyped group and an incongruent social role become joined in the mind of the perceiver, this inconsistency would have negative influences on the perspective the individual perceives and how they evaluate that member of the group as an appropriate candidate of the role (Eagly, 2002). Fox-Kirk (2017) names this bias perception as a “false naturalization.” He explains that the form of false naturalization is due to “a lack of interrogation of concepts coupled with repetition by authority figures” (p. 443). In the case of the orchestral conductor, the persistence of the ideal music leader as a male figure is amply demonstrated in a historical context (Fox-Kirk, 2017).

In order to grasp the embedded beliefs and gender conventions of people about the role of women and men, we need to understand the how social roles are socially constructed and gendered. Moreover, leadership is socially constructed through relational activities, such as languages and social interactions (Hosking, 1999). The social role is a widely shared expectation that people who occupy a particular social position belong to a specific category, of which gendered roles are consensual beliefs about the attributes of women and men (Biddle, 1979). Nevertheless, the beliefs of social roles are more than just beliefs about the attributes of women and men: many of these expectations are normative because they describe qualities or behavioral tendencies “believed to be desirable for each sex” (Eagly, 1987, p. 13). The subjective description of social roles, therefore, originates from the correspondence of a perceiver’s inferences from the observed behavior of males and females in relation to the activities that men and women commonly perform in their typical gender roles as personal traits. In other words, gender stereotypes are sustained and fed by bias in the ways individuals observe/perceive others (Eagly, 2002).

In the classical music world, leadership positions and their corresponding power have been granted to men for centuries (Bartleet, 2008). Orchestral conductors are those whom have the power and authority to make music. The leadership convention is associated with masculine traits, such as authority, integrity, power, dominance and tyranny (Bartleet, 2003). The discourse that surrounds the role of the conductor is saturated with masculine values, thus, the masculine-gendered body and its associated behavior are understood as being the convention. Female conductors, however, are typically defined by feminine attributes, which categorize women as “other” on the gendered podium (Bartleet, 2003).

Gender prejudice flows from the definition of leadership in the context of masculinity which disfavors women (Eagly, 2016). Prejudice impedes the path when women pursue leadership roles, which leads to particular challenges for females when they encounter incompatibility with the expectation of female roles (Carli, 1999; Heilman, 2001). Individuals bring certain expectations and preferences for the gender of their leaders (Fox-Kirk, 2017) and perceived stereotypical attributes lead to the impression that women are not capable of guiding the entire orchestra. Research from Phelan, Moss-Racusin and Rudman (2008) demonstrates that stereotypical feminine norms, such as interpersonal sensitivity, results in a negative perception of women, who are considered to have insufficient ability to lead. Whereas when men engaged in stereotypical feminine behavior when performing the leader role, they were positively evaluated (Fox-Kirk, 2017). This unequal judgement limits women’s opportunity for achieving leadership positions. Gender prejudice also impedes the recognition of group members, thus, undervaluing the ability of their female leaders. In other words, bias perception not only limits access for women to achieve leadership roles, it can also influence their effectiveness when executing a leadership position (Eagly., Karau, 2002). As a result, group members may suspect that females are not capable of taking on this gender-specified leader role, and as a consequence, subordinated positions of women become shared recognition. When women do not have equal access to leadership positions, gender prejudice and resistance generate an invisible barrier for women to perform leader roles (Scharff, 2018). Therefore, it is crucial for followers to objectively identify with their leader and perceive the value of their leaders as suitable for the organization (Eagly, 2005).

The treatment of gender prejudice lies in the idea of structural inequality (Gardiner, 2015). The general perceptions of prejudice about gender inequality follow the mismatching between faith in the attributes which are affected by consecration processes, legitimation (the stereotype of masculinity of orchestral conductors) and belief in the attributes that facilitate success in valued social roles (Eagly, 2005). In the case of the conducting profession, male conductors find it easier to gain trust from musicians than female conductors, because the stereotypical attributes of women conductors are thought to impede musical performance and

the appearance of female conductors would distract audiences and musicians (Bartleet, 2003). Moreover, factors as such as a limited number of conducting positions, demanding requirements for professional knowledge, and the controlling influence of the symphony orchestra board of directors has resulted in very few opportunities for individuals to become or be trained as a professional conductor – the criteria is even more critical when the candidate is a female.

The conventional perception implies that women lack certain qualities to become a conductor, such as personal strength and independence (Lawson, 1984). Bartleet (2008) points that female conductors will be accepted only if they adopt a conventional masculine leadership approach. Those who criticize and suspect the eligibility of female conductors for leadership roles often fail or simply neglect to recognize the capacities and activities of women in persuading, directing, the entire orchestra as authentic leaders.

2.2.1 *Glass ceiling*

Welldon (2004) notes that gender inequality in the cultural industry results in the social exclusion of women, and the consequence of unequal acceptance between men and women has led to the denial of talent in women, ignoring their ability. Moreover, by enforcing gender stigmas, the male-dominated cultural industry suppresses the exposure of women, and intentionally remains biased when critiquing them, which accelerates the gender segregation in the cultural industry (Green, 2008). In the past three decades, an upward trend has been seen as a number of women have obtained education which provides them with means to enter and to compete with male competitors in musical fields (Edwards, 2015). In addition, as the evidence shows, the implementation of the “blind audition”⁶ has significantly increased the number of female instrumentalists in the orchestra (Goldin., Rouse, 1997). It indicates that gender discrimination in the orchestral world can be eliminated (Scharff, 2018). Reflecting the lack of women in positions of authority, female conductors still remain a minority in the orchestral world, but this has been changed slowly over time, as more female conductors have broken the “glass ceiling” (Chumaceiro, 2011) in the orchestral world (Green, 2006). Wharton (2005) suggests that the composition of a group’s gender affects group acceptance and interaction. The increasing number of female instrumentalists in orchestras and the high achievements of a small group of female conductors have to some extent eased the conflict between subjectivity and gender in recent years, yet female conductors still experience exclusion, prejudice, and unequal treatment from insiders. At

⁶ The blind audition: an approach of evaluating a candidate’s skills, in which they perform behind a wall or screen. The purpose is to ensure the jury evaluates the person solely on performance, without considering the appearance, name, gender or other visible factors.

present, fewer women than men are among permanent conductors of major orchestras (Eagly, 2005)

The situation when female conductors have the qualifications and try to obtain a higher position, while encountering all kinds of difficulties which are against her from gaining authority and getting a higher position is often referred to as the glass ceiling (Chumaceiro, 2011). The metaphor of the glass ceiling implies an absolute barrier which prevents women from gaining access or opportunities to higher positions (Scharff, 2018). The word ceiling implies that women encounter “an upper limit to higher positions,” whereas glass refers to “the relative subtlety and transparency of this barrier,” which is not necessarily visible to the observer, resulting in the possibility that the observer may not be conscious/aware of the gender inequality (Eagly., Caril, 2007, p.4). The invisible barrier denoted as the glass ceiling can be distinguished from other, more formal or even some more legitimate obstacles to advancement (Barreto, Ryan., Schmitt, 2009; Cotter., Hermsen., Ovadia., Venneman, 2001). In the case of the conductor, the legitimated status of the gendered role of the conductor has encouraged and advanced men to access the conducting profession, while impeding women in pursuing high-level leadership roles as conductors. Women face more challenges and disadvantages when it comes to obtaining a leadership position (Eagly, 2007; Baxter., Wright, 2000; Elliott., Smith, 2004).

Female conductors often need to transform their behavior into a masculine manner, manifesting themselves more in communal behaviors than their male counterparts, and also exuding an aura of extreme confidence (Edwards, 2015). Nevertheless, they also need to be aware of their masculine behaviors, as they will be scrutinized accordingly via different “cultural lenses” (Heilman, 2001).

So far, we have looked how gender inequality in the orchestral world is historically generated, which legitimates the status of men, giving them an advantage to perform the leadership role as a conductor. Due to this special power relation, as well as the authority and leadership function that is part of the conducting profession, the role of the conductor typically takes on a masculine representation. When women challenge the role of the conductor, they need to approach it differently, either adopting the masculine convention, or converting it. Either way, female conductors are perceived differently compared to their male counterparts. These judgments are based on conventional masculine norms, which produce gender prejudice against women in achieving leadership and becoming a conductor.

2.3 Institutionalized gender inequality

Beside gender norms, there are socio-cultural factors that influence female conductors in their profession. In the following section, the focus is on how socio-cultural factors

influence gender inequality, and how gender inequality is socially institutionalized. By understanding how gender inequality is institutionalized, this can help us consciously and objectively recognize how gender inequality is performed and sustained, and hopefully deconstruct it.

2.3.1 Sociocultural influences in cultural institutions

“Cultural institutions ... have been historically developed by men, currently dominated by men, and symbolically interpreted from the standpoint of men in leading positions, both in the present and historically” (Acker, 1992, p. 567).

The principle of male power in the field of music is profoundly ingrained in the mythology and history of music conducting, which can be understood by the historical processes of legitimization of the status of male musicians, which turns the classical music world into a male-dominated sector (Cook., Everist, 2010). Foulkes (2002) points out that the factor of gender has a significant impact on the nature of the task for individuals in the workplace. This does not necessarily imply the same task is more challenging for women compared to men, or men are more capable than women, but that gender prejudice has become a part of organizational culture which has an influence on group dynamics (Foulkes, 2002). Organizational culture consists of two parts. On one hand, there is an individual's perception, which primarily produces gender inequality, as well as the attitudes and expectations of musicians toward the conductor which are the products of his/her educational background, age, gender, and surrounding culture (Atik, 1994); on the other hand, there are collective beliefs, including shared meanings and values, which sustain the belief of gender differences at the group level and these factors are made up of shared symbolic systems that are cumulative products of the mind (Wharton, 2005). Gender could be seen as an accomplishment of social interaction (Ridgeway, 2011), and culture is “a dynamic, symbol-laden context, and a set of functional cognitions or deep, unconscious structures of mind” (Allaire., Firsirotu, 1984, p. 202). The relation between gender and culture suggests the ways that these entrenched, powerful, and taken-for-granted aspects of the social order and gender roles produce and reproduce gender distinction and inequality (Wharton, 2005).

2.3.2 Deconstructing gender inequality

Ridgeway (2011) deems that sociologists have similar views on gender inequality as structuralists, who both consider gender inequality as rooted in broad organizational and institutional structures with strong material bases. Institutions are comprised of social structures and practices, which include symbols and beliefs (Friedland., Alford 1991). They

are the products of retrospective consecration. They are characters of social life that seems regular, ongoing, and permanent because they are often perceived by individuals as the way things are (Wharton, 2005). Gender as a part of social practices is institutionalized by the involvement of individuals that mutually reinforce processes at the institutional level (Acker, 1990; Lorber 1994). Thus, understanding how gender inequality is institutionalized at present is vital for us to be more aware of (unconscious) gender inequality, so as to deconstruct it.

“Institutionalization refers to the processes through which social relationships take on the qualities of an institution” (Wharton, 2005, p. 220). From this perspective, social relationships are more institutionalized than other relationships which are highly institutionalized and seem to almost reproduce themselves (Berger., Luckmann, 1967). They persist without conscious intervention and effort (Wharton, 2005). This statement implies that it is difficult to change something that is highly institutionalized (Wharton, 2005). Social inequality can be institutionalized to a greater or lesser degree. Gender inequality, along with other inequalities, such as race, social class, is long-term, entrenched, and durable. It is embedded in the structure and practice of organization (Tilly, 1998), including cultural organizations – in this case, in orchestras.

The chronic and increasing oppressiveness of “gender systems” (gender as a form of power relation) highlights the importance of gender deconstruction. Inequality reinforces the gender system from a symbolic perspective (Williams, 1989). That is, it reinforces the traditional assumption that the conductor position is a male-dominated role. The gender role of the conductor has been highly institutionalized and legitimated throughout the history. The gender norm has been embodied in the conducting convention and enforced by the classical music world (Scharff, 2018). Historically, institutionalized gender inequality affects members of both the dominant (male group) and the subordinate group (female group). Dominant group members often fail to acknowledge the existence of gender inequality. Subordinate groups also often perceive institutionalized inequalities as “just the way things are” (Jackman, 1994). As a result, the long-term stability of gender identity provides dominant groups with a strong vested interest in maintaining unequal treatment. Meanwhile subordinate groups lack alternatives, meaning that they feel powerless to challenge/change their position. All in all, it shapes the ways both groups make sense of their relationships (Wharton, 2005). As a consequence of institutionalized gender inequality, it becomes depersonalized for both men and women. The ideology of gender inequality emphasizes the differences between men and women but downplays the way in which those differences generate inequality (Ridgeway, 2011). Thus, these processes and ideologies about gender make it difficult to reduce gender inequality.

Nowadays, as society is rapidly changing, women and men are perceived as more similar than different in terms of personal competency. This perception reflects not merely a change in individual perceptions and understanding of gender – it is a direct consequence of closing the gap of gender equality (Wharton, 2005). Undoubtedly, there is still a long way to go to eliminate gender inequality, and longstanding power relation need time to change. There are two insights that we need to consider in order to reduce gender inequality (Wharton, 2005). First, highly-institutionalized social relationships are not immune to social change. Because social change is inevitable and ongoing – especially when we think about the increasing trend of globalization – and it has huge impacts on gender inclusiveness. Nevertheless, we also need to bear in mind that social changes are unplanned, reactive, and incremental. Therefore, there is no certainty about change moving in the direction of “perfect” equality. In addition, the change in gender equality occurs differently in every cultural context, which means all social contexts do not change at the same time and in the same way. Last but not least, gender order is particularly resistant to radical change or any disruption; hence, it takes time to see obvious changes in gender inequality (Wharton, 2005).

Gender difference is often transformed into gender inequality via various social processes. Ridgeway (2011) regards “gender as a form of human variation, which is highly susceptible to cultural generation as a primary category for framing social/power relation” (p.148). In order to promote gender equality, we need to think of gender as a non-influential factor in shaping social life and individual perception – in other words, objectively perceive that women are as competitive and powerful as men (Williams, 1989). Reducing gender inequality is therefore associated with eliminating gender distinction (Wharton, 2005), and the deconstruction of gender allows us to protect individuals by reference to their social role but not their gender (Williams, 1989).

3 Research Question and Expectations

Although the issue of gender inequality in the classical music field is visible in terms of the representation of the number of female conductors, it is still taboo and people render the subject “unspeakable.”(Scharff, 2015). “Unspeakable” indicates that inequality is visible in the music field but is not openly discussed or brought to consciousness (Scharff, 2018). Although general explanations of why particular groups are underrepresented are provided by scholars (Scharff, 2015), no explicit explanations regarding female conductors are given by the insiders who are in the classical music field. Speaking broadly, gender inequality is also prevalent throughout the creative and cultural industries. Women are disadvantaged by boundary crossing and identity making due to social expectations (Conor., Gill., Taylor, 2015). The unspoken nature and unconsciousness of gender inequality makes it more difficult to detect, contest or deconstruct the boundaries of gender inequality, partially due to the subjectivity of individual perceptions of female conductors, conservative attitudes towards the gender of the orchestral conductor, and the traditional hierarchy within the music field (Gill, 2014). Therefore, it is worthwhile to study how these subjective views contribute to gender roles and shape the reception of leadership. The purpose of this research is to understand how insiders perceive women when they perform the leadership role as a conductor, and why gender power relation tend to be silenced and unspoken (Bartleet, 2008; Scharff, 2018). Moreover, how do people perceive the fact that more female conductors are starting to negotiate the ongoing issue of gender inequality? Thus, the main research question is as follows:

“How do insiders perceive female conductors as leaders in the classical music world, and to what extent do the perceptions influence the status of female conductors, thereby reconsidering the gendered leadership role of the music conductor?”

Based on the study of previous literature and theory, three expectations have been formulated for this research. First, the unspeakability of unequal composition of gender in the classical music world may lead to the perpetuation of inequality. Therefore, I would expect that people would commonly agree on (either consciously or unconsciously) abilities and authority and give more trust to a male orchestral conductor, whereas people would be more skeptical about female conductors’ competencies. Secondly, based on role congruity, I expect that – in terms of qualifications and effectiveness in leading the orchestra to perform – people would have different expectations when comparing male and female conductors. Lastly, due to longstanding perceptions and gender conventions of orchestral conductors, I assume that

individuals would not consciously consider gender inequality in the conduction profession, in terms of gender prejudice and unequal judgements.

4 Methodology

This research examines individual perceptions of female conductors regarding conducting conventions, gendered traits and perceived characteristics of female conductors.

By understanding how an individual's gendered perceptions are formed and influenced by social factors and how gender inequality in the classical music world is institutionalized, the outcome may provide suggestions on how gendered perceptions can be changed in order to deconstruct gender inequality in the classical music world.

4.1 Qualitative Research Method

The research question of this paper is: "How do insiders perceive female conductors as leaders in the classical music world, and to what extent do the perceptions influence the status of female conductors, thereby reconsidering the gendered leadership role of the music conductor?" Considering the research question, qualitative research has been determined as the most appropriate method to investigate the perception of insiders. The nature of qualitative research is concerned with the meaning of words rather than nominal numbers. This method enables the researcher to extract in-depth meaning from a natural conversation environment (Bryman, 2012) and allows the researcher to interpret how individuals see themselves positioned in the world (Berg, 2007). Qualitative analysis is an approach "to understand and explain social patterns through a phenomenological lens" (Hesse-Biber., Leavy, 2006). Bryman (2012) further explains that the qualitative research method is "an understanding of [the] social world through an examination of the interpretation of that specific world by its participant, it is conceived via a constructionist viewpoint in which social properties are outcomes of the interactions between individuals" (p. 380). Taking a social constructionist approach to gender, I attempt to address how gender inequality is defined and perceived by individuals, and qualitative research can be enlisted as an aid "to implementing social change" (Bryman, 2012, p. 441).

4.2 Unit of analysis and sampling strategy

The unit of analysis is comprised of five types of insiders who are in the classical music field. I did not intentionally select the nationalities of the respondents, rather the participants were introduced either by friends or other participants. As a result, seven participants are Dutch, while the other four are Chinese, Cuban, American and Canadian. Initially, I planned to interview two or three female conductors. I sent emails to four female conductors, but only one replied and agreed to participate in a formal interview. From the process of searching for female conductors, I realized that the number of female conductors are indeed very few, and they are extremely hard to reach – this may be due to the lack of contact information and limited access to get in touch with female conductors. Also, the limited research period did not allow me to spend more time finding female conductors. However, the purpose of this research is to understand how other people perceive female conductors. Therefore, the final selected eleven interviewees consist of: 1) one conservatory female student who is majoring in orchestral

conducting; 2) one conservatory conducting teacher; 3) four orchestra musicians; 4) one female conductor, and 5) four impresarios. These people have either direct or indirect relationships with music conductors, and they all have had experiences in cooperating with female conductors. Individuals who occupy different positions will form different views on female conductors. This multi-actor approach provided an analytical framework to better understand the collaborative structure (Macharis., Turcksin., Lebeau, 2012) in the classical music world, and helped me grasp complex interactions between individuals, and their subjective views on female conductors and their perceived social roles. In other words, perceptions may be influenced by one's occupation, yet, other factors are also at stake, such as age and sex. With the exception of the female conducting student (who was the youngest interviewee) and the artistic programmer (whose age was 35) – most of the interviewees were above age 45. However, the age factor was not a concern for this research. Eleven semi-structured interviews were conducted during the period of March 20 to April 15. Interview transcriptions were produced for later data analysis. Considering that perceptions may differ between men and women, I intentionally selected a (relatively) equal number of interviewees from both sexes.

This study used the non-probability snowball sampling strategy to select eleven interviewees. It is a sampling technique in which the researcher initially samples a small group of people highly relevant to the research question, and these sampled respondents propose other participants who have the same characteristics relevant to the research. (Bryman. 2012). Noy (2008) indicates that snowball sampling is often presented as a strategy to be used when probability sampling is not feasible. The reason I choose this non-probability sampling strategy is that the “insiders” are a specific group of the population and can be very hard to reach, especially board members of orchestras and music conductors. Thus, by adopting a snowball sampling strategy, it allowed me to gain access into the music field and find the appropriate participants by asking people to introduce other ideal interviewees. Through the process of searching for interview participants, the proportion of referred male participants was larger than female participants. This might also reflect the imbalanced number of male and female musicians who are available in the classical music field. Initially, I contacted the potential participants by email. Surprisingly, most of people I contacted were very enthusiastic about this research topic, and their willingness to share their experience and opinions was something unexpected. Some people, due to unavailability, could not participate in a formal interview, but provided their opinions on this topic via email. In all email replies, people expressed that they do not have any prejudice against female conductors, and that there are simply few (good) female conductors available in the field. This common opinion has been taken into consideration in when analyzing the data. Three

people were not eligible for participating in this research, because they do not have any experience with female conductors. That information brought my first insight into how people perceived the gender issue in the conducting profession.

4.3 Semi-structured interview

Semi-structured interviews allowed me to gain rich insights into how insider perceptions shape the leadership of female conductors. Due to the advantage of a semi-structured interview, a certain flexibility remains, leaving the interviewer considerable freedom in asking questions. In a semi-structured interview, the researcher prepares a list of questions or fairly specific topics, but the interviewee has a great deal of leeway in how to reply (Bryman, 2012). Another feature of semi-structured interviews is that the question may not follow exactly what is outlined in the interview guide, or some of the questions will develop on the spot – all depending on the process of conversation. Questions which are not included in the guide may also be asked as the interviewer notices things said by respondent which are important (Bryman, 2012). As Silverman (2006) notes, the qualitative method allows relative flexibility, and the interviewer will enable a more in-depth examination of the research topic (Silverman, 2006). Eleven interviews were performed. Depending on the availability of interviewees, ten interviews were conducted as face-to-face conversation and one interview was done via Skype. The eleven interviewees consisted of five women and six men. In total, the collection of interviews generated 11 hours and 7 minutes of audio. The longest interview took 90 minutes, and the shortest one was 41 minutes. All participants were interviewed individually.

Explanations were given to (each) question about which issue/aspect I intended to address with each specific question(s)(see Appendix 3). Moreover, an explanation was given for the operation of the interview. Based on the occupations of the interviewees, I designed two interview guides. One was used specifically for the female conductor interviewee (see Appendix 4). It involved some questions about her own experiences as a female conductor, which would not be applicable for asking other interviewees. The general interview guide was used for all other interviews (see Appendix 3).

4.4 Method of data analysis: Thematic analysis

Once interview data was collected, thematic data analysis was adopted to analyze the data. Boyatzis (1998) explains that “a theme is a pattern found in the information that at minimum describes and organizes the possible observation at the manifest level, or at the latent level” (p. 4). As part of thematic analysis, the theory-driven coding approach (Boyatzis, 1998) was based on the theoretic framework, developing codes from the chapter two “Theory

and Literature Review”. Elements of the codes can also be derived from the research expectations (Boyatzis, 1998).

The coding procedure involved careful reading and revisiting all the interview data, in order to obtain accurate results (Fereday., Muir-Cochrane, 2006). All the interviews were coded individually. Three main steps are involved in the code procedure. First, open-coding, by examining and comparing the interview data, is conceptualized and categorized (Straus., Corbin, 1990). Initially, 61 open-codes were generated reflecting on the interview data (see Appendix 6). However, many open-codes were similar or did not reflect the research question. Therefore, I merged these similar codes in the second step. In the second step, axial coding was processed and data was put back together in a new way after open-coding by making connections between categories. Sub-codes were generated at this stage (Straus., Corbin, 1990). The last step in the coding process provided support to obtain a connection between data and conceptualization. In other words, “the phenomenon [was] constantly compared under a certain category.” Therefore, theoretical elaborations of patterns were identified (Bryman, 2015, p.568). Four main themes were finally generated (see Appendix 7 for the explanation of the themes and related codes). The common patterns amongst eleven interviews were found and categorized into the following four themes:

1. **Cultural consecration and legitimation:** The influences of the establishment on the traditional conducting path. As explained in the “Theory and Literature Review” chapter, men traditionally established the path of conducting, and there is a stereotypical image of the conductor rooted in the classical music world. Prejudice is formed by gendered conventions in the conducting profession. This theme provides evidence of how respondents consider the role of the conductor based on the stereotypical gendered role of conductors, and the influences these considerations have on the current status of female conductors.
2. **Sociocultural factors in the present:** This theme demonstrates sociocultural factors in relation to the influences on perception of female conductors. It includes two perspectives. First, there is a macro-sociological perspective indicating that the change of society has great influence on female social status – in this case, more female instrumentalists have taken places in orchestras, yet women with authoritative positions (conductors) in the classical music world are rather rare. Secondly, the micro-sociological perspective suggests there is a considerable influence from organizational culture, group dynamics and individual perceptions that are all reflected in the organizational culture.

3. **Individual perception:** This perception is closely related to individual background (profession), age, and gender. Thus, subjectivity is the key to understanding how individual perception has shaped/influenced gendered conventions. In this theme, I classified interviewees by their occupations, comparing and analyzing their perceptions of female conductors' personal traits and qualifications.
4. **Recognition of female conductors:** Evaluation, recognition, and acceptance are important for women to continuously pursue the conducting profession. The availability of female conductor role models would help to change stereotyped gender conventions of conductors (Bartleet, 2008). In this theme, it reveals how individuals evaluate female conductors who have been active on the international stage. Moreover, this theme also summarizes the importance of recognition of female conductors.

4.5 Ethics and Confidentiality

All the respondents were informed of their rights to withdraw or terminate the interview at any time without any negative impact on their involvement in this research project. The processes of evaluation did not in any way harm the participants. The confidentiality and anonymity were addressed by providing a consent form to respondents. By agreeing to participate, all interviewees signed a consent form. The terms of the consent form were standardized, and the purpose of the consent form was to notify the participants of ethics procedure and confidentiality. I adopted the template of consent form from my previous bachelor thesis "A form of distinction through the musical taste of jazz music with the audience of young people" (2017). Minor adjustments were made according to the present research topic.

5 Results

Based on the interview data, the following section explores four themes concerning gender in relation to the conducting profession from the perspective of five types of insiders. Four main themes are identified, and each theme contains sub-themes (see Appendix 7).

In summary, my aim is to understand the narrative of how individuals perceive female conductors according to their gender, position, their experiences with female conductors, and

identify patterns with broader social, cultural and gender-related issues. The results provide insights into how the perceptions of others influence the gendered leadership role of music conductors.

5.1 Cultural consecration and legitimation: the influences of the establishment on the traditional conducting path

5.1.1 *Conducting convention: gender and leadership*

Orchestral conducting has roughly a 200-year history – the tradition was created and cultivated by men in the music profession, and as a result, the role of the orchestral conductor has been imbued with inherent masculine norms (Bartleet, 2008). The norms include the connotation of the gendered role of the male conductor, leadership conventions, authority and power relation – these are all defined based on male attributes. The influence of gendered conductor stereotypes and the establishment of a traditional conducting path have influences on the perception of the gender of the conductor, especially on those senior musicians who entered the orchestra when it was mainly dominated by male musicians. Respondent A, who has been a trombonist for 40 years, expressed his understanding of the authoritative power of the conductor as follows:

“I’ve often said and I think it is true that an orchestral conductor is the last bastion of absolute I don't want to say tyranny but, if a conductor wiggles his figure, we respond as an orchestral musician.... in that sense, a conductor has all the power.”

The power of the conductor has been historically granted in musical composition, and musical leadership is significantly embodied in male power: “It's a power position, the most powerful person and conductor is that person. It is always a man; it's a clear idea for the world,” Respondent F explained, a female conductor and also a professional double bass in the orchestra.

The status of women conductors has been a minority in the profession of conducting (Lawson, 1984), although it has been improved in last few decades when a few female conductors came on the map. Respondent A recalled the first time he worked with a female conductor: “When I started it, there was none, no female conductors; I think that was 15 years after that I first worked with female conductor.” Nine of eleven respondents have worked in the field for more than 30 years. When they reflected on female conductor status, all respondents said that they have not worked with many female conductors in their music career, because there are very few female conductors. Moreover, they barely found a female conductor who is fully qualified for leading the orchestra. Respondent C, a flutist, mentioned

that in his 31 years career playing in the orchestra “only twice” had he worked with female conductors, and “there were not that many female conductors, and very few of them are really good.”

5.1.2 Conventions lead to gender prejudice

All the respondents emphasized that they do not have any prejudice against females – the qualification of a conductor is the foremost concern. Nevertheless, preconditioned conceptions of gendered conductor stereotypes have profound influences on conducting conventions. Gender prejudice is something people are conscious of, yet unconsciously, individuals have the tendency to perceive and interpret female conductors based on their “prior expectations” (Ridgeway, 2011). Respondent D, a programmer who is responsible for appointing the conductor for the orchestra said: “Although things have been changed, it is harder for female conductors, because there will be always prejudices, even people say, I don't have any prejudices, but you will still have a set of stereotypes in your head.” Therefore, prejudice may be rooted in an individual's subconscious, meaning that they may not always aware of it, or (and) simply deny it.

According to Eagly (2002), there are two types of prejudice toward female leaders. The first type of prejudice stems from the descriptive norms of gender roles, which are demonstrated by less favorable evaluation of women; there is also the perceived potential for leadership because leadership ability is more stereotypical of men than women (Eagly, 2002), and such attributes as masculinity, authority and dominancy, are unlike the qualities expected and desired in a female conductor.

“A woman can become more a part of the group.... a man will be naturally above the group as the leader, and people will accept that automatically, and a woman, because women can be more ... maybe empathetic sometimes, then that can be used against you” (Respondent F).

The second type of prejudice derives from the injunctive norms of gender roles, and the activation of beliefs about how women supposedly behave (Eagly., Karau, 2002). If female leaders violate these prescriptive beliefs by fulfilling “the agentic requirements” of leader roles and failing to exhibit the communal supportive behaviors preferred in women, they can be negatively evaluated for these violations, even while they may also receive some positive evaluation for their fulfillment of the leader role (Eagly., Karau, 2002. p. 574). Six respondents mentioned that some of the female conductors are seen as overcompensating, when they intensified their masculine attributes.

“They are almost compensating for the fact that they're female. They are so on top of everything, so full of energy working until the last minute and ... very demanding. Sometimes I feel ... you can also let it go a little bit and relax a little bit ... They are very much control freaks ... which by the way might have to do with the fact that they are female. I don't know that they want to prove that being female doesn't mean that there are no authority for anything.” (Respondent I)

(Some) female conductors are thought to intensify masculine attributes in order to compensate for their feminine features, and (over)self-awareness sometimes is considered as overcompensation. Seven respondents indicated that women conductors overcompensate in several ways, for instance, their physical appearance: “They tend to look like a man” (Respondent J); physical motion in relation to female’s physical features: “From my point of view, I think physical motion of the female conductor ** [name of female conductor] is too exaggerated.... maybe because she is a woman, and she is not tall, so she has to do it in that way” (Respondent B); Respondent B, a female conducting student, expressed that she has different views on female conductors. She thinks that most of a female conductor’s physical motions are much less powerful than male conductors, and when there is a female conductor who conducts with strength, often it does not look natural. This response is in line with Respondent J, who said the attempt to compensate with other masculine attributes, such as “being tougher” (Respondent J), sometimes has a counter-effect that would be considered as an overreaction.

“I have the feeling that they suffer that they are women, because they feel that they have something to prove as a woman ... because [of] this gender inequality, because it's always been a male-dominated profession and that they feel that they have to fight more than just being a good conductor ... and I mean you also have some other issues so if a woman comes on the stage to conduct and a lot of them look like a man ... as a conductor and that's what I mean for some female conductors I think they try to conform to something” (Respondent G).

Hence, these respondents believe that if a female conductor can embrace her femininity, it could ease some tensions: “I think that for a lot of people who look at women conductors as a strange thing, it is much easier to convince ‘wow... she is a real woman,’ and then ... it is easier for a female conductor” (Respondent K).

The gender convention is an invisible obstruction which has profoundly hindered the path for women. Respondent F said “All professions have a wall for women but conducting is a very last wall that the male conductors keep very strongly.” The use of “wall” is often

referred to as the “glass ceiling” (Hymowitz & Schellhardt, 1986). Eagly and Carli (2007) explain: “The glass ceiling implies an absolute barrier, functioning as a solid roadblock that prevent women access to high-level positions” (Eagly & Carli, 2007).

Although the acceptance of female conducting has improved, the issue of being taken seriously as a female conductor has been slowly eased over time. Society is in constant change and women’s status nowadays is different than before. According to the majority of interviewees, people would not take a female seriously when she challenges this traditionally male-dominated position, due to the social expectations of gender roles and leadership conventions: “I feel it's because ... we don't expect her to be in a role like this. I think this guy will manage better a group of girls and women” (Respondent E). Thus, “finding a way to be taken seriously” (Respondent F) is the major concern of being a female conductor, where “to be good enough” seems to be the solution to eliminate this gender prejudice. Fortunately, there is a change in perception of women conductors, as attention has gradually shifted from gender to qualifications.

“Like 10 years ago, that ... when women [were] conducting, that was much about her sex ‘Aha... look, it is a woman conductor.’ Now much more we can start to talk about ... it’s a person conducting, and what is his or her style, so it is ... it has become less about that she is a female.” (Respondent D, artistic programmer)

5.1.3 Gender attributes: Feminine versus Masculine

“The situation of woman standing on the podium presents a contradictory situation: dominant social patriarchal discourse encourages them to pursue their femininity through their bodies, while dominant conducting conventions suggest that they need to renounce their femininity and adopt a surrogate masculinity” (Bartleet, 2008, p. 40). The dilemma is how female conductors can appropriately adopt “a surrogate masculinity,” since all the gender norms of conducting are based on male attributes. As a conductor, authenticity is crucial to achieve leadership, but a challenge remains for female conductors, due to this longstanding gendered convention of the conducting profession. Respondent F, a female conductor herself, said, “There's a physical barrier that a woman thinks maybe she has to be very strong or very hard... and it is finding the solution to that puzzle for some women: how to conduct strong with strength but without being seen as unnatural... that’s a very difficult thing for female conductor to be authentic, to be reacting, but without a filter.”

Because of the prejudice toward female conductors, female conductors are said to face more obstacles which impede their career path as they may not be able to play all musical repertoires. In relation to music and “typical” female musicality, the general thought expressed by six respondents is that women conductors can play certain repertoires such as

Mozart, or Debussy, which emphasizes balance and elegance, but not Mahler or Bruckner, whose music is characterized by majestic, constant variation, and expansive emotional expression.

“I had a famous conductor and who’s also a famous teacher **, from Finland, who ... many famous conductors are students of his. They believe that female[s] can conduct the piece like Debussy, but not so much Bruckner. So, he thought that ... female conductors would not be as good as ... in big [a] music structure, like Bruckner, and much more ... at home ... let's say.... in a more, well, perfume[d] atmosphere of Debussy.” (Respondent D, artistic programmer)

This thought was also shared by respondent H, a conducting teacher:

“Some repertoire might suit better the female natural qualities. Repertoire such as the lighter one, it may be Mozart, it would fit better.... and Mahler, I think Mahler is such a rich world you need also those moments. I have seen Mahler nine conducted by one of the major female conductors, she’s ... Finnish, she has an orchestra in France; she was conducting a school orchestra, with Mahler No. 9, it was really nothing. She was one the main conductors, but it was just really bad.”

However, people are aware that each conductor has a different leadership style, gender traits regarding their personality, and different ways of understanding music. These could be seen as an advantage for female conductors, as the sensitivity of women can bring different elements to music. Those elements in conducting would also facilitate the development of conducting: “OK, maybe you don't need all those qualities but you have some qualities, and then with some pieces ... sensitive qualities of a woman could bring really different music.” (Respondent H)

“I do think women can bring something different than men in conducting, but ... their ways of conducting are often very male, conventionally male, also for men, actually. So, I think, the professional really deserves to develop, and the female can bring something different in the conducting. So... Yeah, it would help.”
(Respondent K, artistic manager)

In summary, the traditional conducting path and gendered conventions are causes for prejudice against women. Most of the respondents did not admit/conscious of having prejudice, but there were signs of it in their descriptions of female conductors. The status of men is legitimated in a historical context: cultural consecration and legitimation cultivated by the cultural belief that men are natural leaders and the subsequent masculine attributes are

often considered as a set of criteria when evaluating these leaders. The challenge for female conductors is to adopt the gendered attributes in a “natural” manner, whilst keeping feminine attributes without being “too feminine”. It is difficult for a female conductor to achieve leadership, because people would perceive and judge female conductors differently based on the gender convention. However, some individuals are aware of gender inequality and unequal treatment, as well as the capability of female conductors. Whilst others still hold skeptical attitudes, questioning the qualifications of female conductors. Therefore, it is useful to understand how sociocultural factors in the contemporary world have influenced women’s status in classical music, and the status of female conductors..

5.2 Sociocultural factors of gender inequality

Gender inequality is not simply a property of individuals, rather it is the product of a complex set of social forces. Those forces may include an individual’s actions, the social and cultural expectations which guide people’s interactions, the composition of a social group, and the structure and practice of the institutions that individuals move through in everyday life (Wharton, 2005). The sociocultural facts reveal how cultural beliefs and individual attitudes (Allport, 1954) have impacted on female conductors. Thus, this theme focuses on the sociocultural factors of gender inequality from three perspectives: the change of cultural beliefs in society, organizational culture, and individual attributes toward female conductors.

5.2.1 *Change in women’s status in society*

Due to the efforts of civil rights groups, and renewed activities of groups of women (Lawson, 1984), there has been an increasing number of female musicians taking places in the orchestra (Scharff, 2018). Respondent A commented on the social change in female’s status as follows: “I think it goes intendedly to certain extent ... the changes about [the] female role in society. And also these "Me Too"⁷ things going on now is a ... cultural change. That has to happen. That is just one evident, but ... it will lead to that change.” Respondent K, a female artistic manager, who used to be a professional percussionist, said:

“I think it is with everything, I think it is changing, and people just stand up ... and they will all change the way we look at things, just like [the] whole society now, actually. There [is] a lot of stuff going on, for women's rights it is absolutely mad that this world as existing like this all this time, without anyone even realizing.”

⁷ “Me Too” movement: is an international movement against sexual harassment and assault.

All respondents stressed there is an increasing trend of females studying music, resulting in more female musicians in the orchestras; some of these women are able gain a leading position in the orchestra. Hereto, Respondent J, a female violinist, has been a principal in a Dutch professional orchestra. She believes that as society changes, eventually there will be no more bias against women, because qualification will be the only concern. Despite the increasing number of female musicians/students in the classical music world, the gender of conductors remains male dominated, due to the authority and power relation of this peculiar role, which has been historically associated with masculine characters (Scharff, 2018). Nevertheless, respondents believe that a change in the number of female musicians might contribute to gender equality in the conducting profession – but the transition of accepting a conductor’s gender will happen very slowly:

“That was a twenty or thirty years ago; there were no female brass players, so I think you are asking this a bit too early, because I am convinced that in twenty years there would be more female conductors and fifty years after will be even more.” (Respondent C, a male flute instrumentalist)

5.2.2 *Organizational Culture*

The context of the culture of an organization, the nature of the task, and the characteristic of its followers forms a certain tradition that results in people favoring a male conductor (Ayman, 2004). As respondent G said, “I think for some orchestras, for example, the Vienna Philharmonic, [it] is a kind of tradition that they prefer to have a man.” Orchestras are a rather conservative world; this conservative culture is formed by the conventional thoughts of “maestro” figures. Therefore, it is a matter of what you are used to – the sudden change in the orchestra could present a challenge for switching people’s perceptions from male to female conductors. The female artistic manager said (Respondent K):

“The people who were in the orchestra at the time when it was only men, of course it's difficult.... Even more difficult I think ... unless you have people like me, or more open-minded, I can imagine, because I also played a lot with people from Berlin, and Vienna chamber music ... male wind players.... I think it's more difficult, if you were living this situation. Let's say ... maybe it's more difficult to be flexible. So these people are slowly retiring, and you get a new younger orchestra with a little bit more... ‘modern’ I put quotation marks on ‘modern ideas’ and I mean is not modern, it's normal.”

As respondent K suggests, only if the culture of the organization changes, then it would become more open to accepting female conductors. The change indicates the age of

the musicians and their stereotyped image of conductors would have a considerable influence on their perceptions and the number of female conductors.

5.2.3 Group dynamic and leadership style

Eagly (2007) suggests that “the leadership style[s] are relatively consistent patterns of social interaction that typify [a] leader as [an] individual” (p. 2). In regard to organizational culture, leadership style is accepted accordingly, depending on the situation, the culture of the orchestra, and group dynamics. Respondent E explained: “There are differences in approaching, and so different kind[s] of orchestra or the energy that orchestra has, it all matters of what fit[s] the group.” Due to the nature of sensitivity, as Respondent H said, female conductors are more sensitive in group dynamics, and this quality could be an advantage for female conductors:

“I think then the women can be.... They are more sensitive, so they will not abuse the power, they'll try to get everybody on their potential. I think that what you will see leadership in everywhere of women... I think the women will try to see, but how can you bring [it]?”

Although people realize that women have the ability to be a conductor, it will require time for older generations in the orchestra to get used to female conductors:

“Actually you could rely more on female conductors. I think women are the real leader[s], actually. But there [has] to [be] a shift of orchestra culture. It takes time. I think they're better leaders.” (Respondent E, female violinist)

5.2.4 Conducting education: selection bias

According to the respondents, female conducting students may not be favored by teachers. Five respondents explained that because the majority of conducting teachers are male, they would be in favor of and feel more comfortable with teaching male students. This implies either an unconscious or conscious gender bias, which all leads to the inclination toward male students. It may explain why fewer women study conducting, or they may just feel alienated by this profession (Edward, 2015). Respondent F said: “You know men see men, and all the teachers are all men; now they've got to, maybe subconsciously gravitate to the male students, and a man will get up and he'll conduct and it'll just be powerful will be very powerful and that's what may be subconsciously.” Respondent C gave an example which backs up this assumption: “There is this Scandinavian, a very famous conducting teacher; he doesn't believe in women conducting.” A female conducting student was told that it would be more difficult for women to become a conductor: “My very first conducting

teacher, who brought me into the conducting profession, the first thing he told me in the first class was that generally women will encounter much more hardship in the conducting profession.” Nevertheless, it is not always negative to be informed of the difficulties in pursuing a particular profession– as long as there is no bias in querying someone’s ability based on one’s sex. Undoubtedly, teachers play an influential role in female conducting students’ career development, and this has further impact on the number of female conductors.

This theme explains cultural beliefs, organizational culture, group dynamics and individual influences on female conductors. As young people join the orchestra, and senior musicians retire, it will slowly change the “conservative” orchestral culture; that is why it is believed it could take “at least two decades” to see the change really happen. The following theme focuses on individual viewpoints to provide a deep understanding of how different perceptions influence female conductors.

5.3 Individual perception: Subjectivity versus Objectivity

5.3.1 *Subjectivity of conductor qualifications*

The eleven respondents consisted of orchestral musicians, a female conducting student, a female conductor, an artistic programmer and directors, as well as two orchestral conducting teachers. Based on their positions, everyone had different perceptions of female conductors in relation to their age, sex, and experiences with/as female conductor(s).

As all the respondents emphasized that the most important thing for conductors is their qualifications – as a conductor, gender does not matter – it is more important that conductors need to be “good enough.” However, judgements on conductors’ qualifications vary subjectively – the views on qualifications were rather vague. Respondent G said: “For me is the same for the female conductors. Are they good enough? And a problem is the people who are judging.” As fundamental requirements for a conductor, musical intuition, personality, and the ability to conduct are considered to be the most important factors. It is often said that “female conductors can be just as good as male conductors.” This implies the primary standard of viewing a female conductor is still based on male attributes. Moreover, the recognition is also closely related to the reputation of conductors.

5.3.2 *Positive discrimination*

All respondents acknowledged there has been extensive suppression and ignorance in history regarding female musical abilities. Therefore, respondents all said women should be given fair chances and be encouraged. The opinions on how much attention should be given

to female conductors differed by respondent. Some respondents opposed positive discrimination, whereas others believe it can provide female conductors with the chance to prove themselves. However, the bottom line is qualification for the role: “I think it actually is a good thing, because for centuries, women have been put on the disadvantage, so what is wrong with positive discrimination to compensate just a little bit, as long as the quality is accounted for” (Respondent D, artistic programmer). There was agreement from respondents about unequal comparisons in terms of the number of male and female conductors. All the respondents said it would be unfair to evaluate all female and male conductor-based traditional norms and standards, therefore, positive discrimination is needed to provide a platform for female conductors to eventually reach equal status: “For centuries, women have been put [at a] disadvantage, so what is wrong with positive discrimination to compensate just a little bit, as long as the quality is accounted for, so of course we should look at female[s]” (Respondent C, a male musician).

The impresario respondents believe there are many good and potential female conductors, and they deserve to be given more attention in order to raise people’s awareness of female musical capability: “I think it is important to pay a little bit more attention to the arising stars from the female side, because for a century ... they have been completely ignored, so we should also ... give them the chance to prove themselves [for] what they are worth and ... treat them seriously, and I think this is changing, the awareness is changing” (Respondent D, artistic programmer). Impresarios consider artistic excellence, which also concerns the musicians; on the other hand, they also need to consider the marketing (audience) perspective and social impact. Having female conductors could provide a special attraction and draw attention from society. This attention will become an opportunity for promoting female conductors.

“It gets a lot of attention ... one of the newspapers wrote an article because in that same week Marin Alsop was with the Radio Philharmonic, and Xian Zhang was here with the Residential Orchestra, and Mei-Ann was with other [Dutch] orchestra, so somebody said 'Oh woman power in conducting country ... amazing.' Why do you write about it? Because at that time ... it was very special, it was unusual. People said [it was] ‘interesting.’” (Respondent G, artistic director)

From the female conductor interviewee’s perspective, she thinks positive discrimination would be helpful in raising attention and realizing female conductors’ abilities, as they have been historically ignored: “Yeah ... why not? I mean you know everyone who was against positive discrimination, but you know ... if they're good then they

should be there.” Positive discrimination can provide opportunities for women to prove that they can also play the role, yet it does not mean one should be blindly inclined to female conductors. Nevertheless, one musician, the conducting students and conducting teachers do not fully support this “positive discrimination.” As the conducting student said: “If a female conductor is very outstanding, the fact that she is a woman could be a highlight, but it should not be the concern because ... she is a woman.” She does not believe that the positive discrimination would contribute to eliminating gender inequality of female conductors. Because eventually conducting capability is more essential in contributing toward a female conductor’s recognition.

In summary, as stated by the majority of respondents, positive discrimination is just the first step toward evoking consciousness about gender inequality in the conducting profession: “Some certain amount of positive discrimination, excludes them it’s not the professional reality, but that’s of course the beginning of everything,” Respondent C said.

5.3.3 Double standard

Although not everyone agreed on/realized that there is a “double-standard” for female conductors, because of this historically disadvantaged position, women need to prove their ability to the orchestra members and eliminate their prejudice. Eagly and Cali (2003) indicate that women are held to a higher standard due to doubts regarding their leadership abilities. Hence, female conductors need to give clear evidence of superior ability or performance to be considered as competent as their male counterparts (p. 819). The female student said: “From a woman’s perspective, if you want to convince people, to trust you that you have this ability to conduct, you have to be good enough ... because I believe that if a female wants to have [a] career in conducting, it is not easy.” Musicians expressed certain expectations for female conductors, which confirmed there is a double-standard, as Respondent E said: “We have more expectations for women conductors. You have to really prove that you're good enough.” As mentioned before, men establish the conducting conventions, so for female conductors, it is often said: “A woman has to be just as good; like a man.” Therefore, there is a contradiction in how people view female conductors – on one hand, female conductors need to be qualified, but also without loss of female attributes – on the other, they have to be as good as a man. The contradictions verify that perceptions of women and higher expectations of leaders cause prejudice against women’s leadership (Heilman & Eagly, 2008).

The findings demonstrate there are different subjective views and individual perceptions of female conductors. Impresarios (Respondents D, G and I⁸) and the female

⁸ Respondent I is the head of an orchestral conducting department; previously he worked as an artistic director. Therefore, in the analysis, he is considered in a double role: as a conducting teacher and an impresario.

conductor value more of the female conductors' potential and cherish their abilities, believing they deserve to get more attention because of a (historically) disadvantaged social position, whereas musicians (respondent A, C, E & J) are relatively skeptical in admitting female conductors. The conducting teacher (Respondent H) holds a relatively neutral perception.

5.4 Recognition of female conductors

Bartleet (2008) believes that the availability of female role models would help to normalize the gendered convention, contributing to a positive norm for women's behavior on the podium. Therefore, it is important to know how people evaluate female conductors – and how they recognize and accept their accomplishments in the conducting profession. A number of female conductors have managed to gain recognition internationally. Because of social and cultural expectations and conducting conventions, people subconsciously link conducting role models to male figures and masculine attributes. When respondents spoke of their experiences with female conductors, a few female conductors' names were frequently mentioned, such as Marin Alsop and Xian Zhang. Marin Alsop is often considered as the frontrunner of female conductors: "I think it was the last sort of 15, 15 years and Marin Alsop was a little bit.... the first one really coming on the map" (Respondent G). Xian Zhang has great reputation in Dutch orchestras, according to the respondents (D, F, G, I and J) who have worked with her; they all gave her very positive reviews: "Xian Zhang, the Chinese lady, she was one of.... I think the orchestra was one of the first here in the Netherlands to ... invite her on regular basis" (Respondent G). "I had a chance to work with Xian Zhang.... I think for me it was the most fruitful collaboration with any conductor I had so far." Such positive evaluations and statements like "the most fruitful collaboration" given by respondent I, suggests a role model female conductor.

Barbara Hannigan, who is also often mentioned, has a different approach in conducting – as a singer – while she also conducts the orchestra. This way of conducting is often controversial. Some people think "she is wonderful" (Respondent A), whereas Respondent H questioned that assumption:

"That style may not fit with all the orchestras. Barbara.... she's perfectly, in the repertoire when she can sing and conduct, and do this ... stuff. I've also seen her doing orchestral things which are really very mediocre in my opinion. If she would be just not a singer and but just a conductor and goes there to do the standard repertoire she would not survive. I'm sure because the quality is not good enough. Well, it's like she finds a way to combine great singing as she has been always a perfect singer, to do in a good way combined with conducting, with

leading an orchestra. So that's something with a very special identity (Respondent H).

Noticeably, the expression of “a very special identity” implies that there is a possibility for non-conventional conducting. Respondent K further explained:

“What makes Barbara special, it’s that ... she has the ... inside of the music information that she conducts, she knows the music as a singer, and she then steps out of her experience as a singer, but with that information, combine[s] it into a new role as a conductor.”

Based on the descriptions of female conductors, two distinctive conducting identities have been noticed. First, Barbara Hannigan represents this “feminine” and “organic” (Respondent K) way of conducting, called “a new identity” or “new way of approaching conducting.” Hannigan’s conducting style does successfully attract wide attention in the classical music world, which also arouses musical professionals’ awareness from the importance of evolution of classical music, and prospects for alternative approaches to the traditionally male created “identity.” Her success suggests there is an alternative for casting off stereotyped gendered roles of conducting, by creating one’s own music identity, embracing and celebrating the femininity in the conducting profession, although not all the respondents were in favor of her own conducting path, and some criticized her ability in conducting. Other successful female conductors, however, follow the traditional male conducting path. In order to be accepted and be recognized, women conductors often need to adopt certain masculine conventions. These types of conductors are sometimes said to have overcompensated to comply with conventions, but their outstanding musical capability and charismatic power have won the admiration of many musical professionals. Female conductors such as Xian Zhang and Marin Alsop, who stay on the traditional conducting path, ensure their acceptance – albeit the traditional path is bumpier for women, as they will face more “gender-specific challenges” (Scharff, 2018), and need to eliminate gender prejudices to win a place in an orchestra. Women who challenge the role of conductor are considered as “border-crossers” (Bartleet, 2005). As Bartleet (2005) further explains, these female conductors stay within certain conventions, but they also seem to be crossing into different and shifting spaces as they continuously search for their own identity, to redefine certain aspects of the conducting role, creating new dialogue.

All in all, the success of these female conductors forms a new image of the role model of the female conductor, which is vital for eliminating gender prejudice, inspiring many other women who want to pursue the conducting profession but fear gender conventions. The

recognition of female conductors as role models can also neutralize gender norms for the orchestral conductor. Thus, we shall not ignore the importance of recognizing role model female conductors.

6 Conclusion and Recommendations

This research is led by the core question: How do insiders perceive female conductors as leaders in the classical music world, and to what extent do the perceptions influence the status of female conductors, thereby reconsidering the gendered leadership role of the music conductor? In order to answer the research question, it was important for me to step inside each individuals' perspective, and understand how they perceive female conductors based on their experiences, positions, age and sex.

Not all individuals consider the unequal representation of male and female conductors as a sign of gender inequality, but all interviewees were very aware of the topic of gender inequality for female conductors, as all stressed in the beginning of the interview that they do

not have any conscious prejudice against women in the classical music world, the only matter they claim to be concerned about is the expertise of conductor. However, there is perception bias in ways people perceive female conductors. The descriptions based on gender roles (Citron, 2000) indicate that gender prejudice functions as a symbolic boundary influenced by the social expectation and cultural belief in gender-specified roles, meaning that gender factor functions as an indication of particular social roles. Individuals tend to link leadership positions to men – lack of awareness of gender prejudice is the source of gender inequality for the conducting profession, which continues to be oriented toward traditional conducting conventions in the gendered role of conductor.

However, I found there is a general change in people's attitudes toward female conductors as time and organizational culture changes – in the beginning, some people were reluctant to work with a female conductor, neglecting their ability; and then it shifted to skepticism about the qualification and talent of the female conductor, in other words, being unsure if women would be competent at conducting. Then, due to the arising awareness of gender equality in society, the skeptical attitude towards female conductors has slowly shifted to “goodwill” – an attempt at awareness of unequal gender perception, eliminating one's biased perception, and acknowledging female music ability. The increasing awareness of gender inequality of female conductors also made people rethink women's status. Because of long-time oppression, women's abilities have long been overlooked. Some people believe women have equal qualifications and are comparable to men if they have an equal chance (or a greater chance) to present themselves. Thus, giving more attention to talented and qualified female conductors is the means to eliminate the gender inequality. However, the double standard, meaning higher qualifications are needed from female conductors in order to compete with male counterparts, is concealed in the claim of “equal qualification,” demonstrated by the fact that people expect women to be better than men in terms of the ability in conducting.

As mentioned before, perceptions of gender in music have changed over time, but the trace of gender prejudices can be found in the perception bias of how people describe female conductors based on conventional gender norms. Spence and Helmreich (1979) suggest that people identify socially desirable characteristics which distinguish between men and women. Their research demonstrates that femininity includes being emotional, sensitive and being concerned with others – women are often described not only as interpersonally sensitive and concerned with others, but also non-competitive. Whereas the ideal men are typified in masculinity, described as competitive, dominant, active and independent (Spence, Helmreich, 1979). Because of the conventional gendered role of conductors, people judge women differently than men when women violate gender conventions (Bartleet, 2008). This

statement also reflects on the conducting profession. It is often said that femininity represents sensitivity, whereas masculinity symbolizes strength. When women become conductors, they are perceived as either too masculine or too feminine. It is tricky to balance, or to integrate those two adverse gender norms. With the increasing awareness of gender inequality and different leadership styles of conductors, people are starting to reconsider these gender norms embodied in the conducting tradition.

However, sensitivity could also be an advantage in understanding musical messages, thus, interpreting them in a different way. Individuals often emphasized that the classical music world is a very “stiff world” – it has always remained in the same tradition. All interviewees expressed that changes in the classical music world are desired – (some) believe the advent of female conductors can bring new elements in music. Nevertheless, it is also argued that due to the sensitivity and abundant emotions embodied in feminine norms, female conductors are considered having limited capacity in conducting, because they would not be able to conduct the music pieces which are typically characterized by masculine norms. At the same time, because of feminine features, it will have an impact on a female authority in orchestras, where traditional hierarchical culture dominates. Undoubtedly, there are more challenges for women to win a place in the orchestral world – female conductors encounter more obstructions in order to be authentic. Because leadership authenticity of the conductor emerges within a historical context, where the leader role and gender conventions are legitimated (Gardiner, 2015). Due to the absence of women in conducting history, female conductors are disadvantaged in becoming authentic leaders in the orchestra.

“Social mores affect women in the world of conducting in the past more than today” (Chumaceiro, 2004, p. 352). The change in our society has brought about role restructuring and the implication of change in attributes of masculinity and femininity (Spence, Helmreich, 1979). The changes can be understood from two levels: the collective level (organizational culture) and the individual level. All musicians are critical of their conductors of both genders because musicians have to give up certain autonomy and listen to the conductors to tell/guide them what to do. Senior musicians in orchestras are more likely to be conservative, as they are used to “male power”, and not used to following music instruction given by female conductors. The conservatism is part of the “old orchestral culture.” As a result, they would be more reluctant to accept or admit a woman as a conductor. However, when more female instrumentalists and younger generations take their places in the orchestra, they are open to this non-conventional gender role of the conductor. The “old culture” will mingle with the “new culture.” The mixture of new and old cultures in the orchestra would be easier for female conductors when they enter into the orchestra.

At the individual level, it is found that there is no absolute leadership style that would fit all orchestras. Conductors need to adjust their approaches according to different orchestra's cultures. Yet, there is a double standard when women perform the role of conductor. Men and women will be judged differently, even when people try to be more cautious when reviewing the conductors. The gender of the conductor will also be part of the consideration and to some extent influence their judgements.

Due to their "feminine features," female conductors would be more sensible for orchestras, being authoritative but not pushy. Scholars (De la Rey, 2005; Eagly, 2007; Edwards, 2015; Heilman, 2001) point out that there are four qualities that professional orchestra musicians want to have in their conductor: respectful, prepared, comfortable/confident and dedicated. These qualities are specifically identifiable in feminine leadership skills. In this sense, female attributes may be an advantage for female conductors. However, because of the accumulated gendered convention and the conservative orchestral culture, it could require a (long) time before this change in orchestral culture occurs.

Individual's age, gender, position and experience with female conductors will all contribute to the way they perceive female conductors. Individuals with positions in management roles need not only consider the artistic excellence of conductors, but need to take audiences/marketing perspectives into consideration – if they believe that having female conductors would attract more social attention, it could also be a "selling point" for the concerts of such orchestras. Four interviewees are (were)⁹ working in the management part of orchestras, and all expressed that due to the historical oppression of women, they need "positive discrimination" in order to give them more opportunities, such as a platform to be heard and known. Musicians, on the other hand, due to the leader-follower intimate relationship with conductors, consider a conductor's quality as the foremost aspect. When it comes to female conductors, musicians become more cautious, sometimes skeptical or simply neglectful to recognize a female conductor's ability in conducting. In short, due to musicians' intimate relation with conductors, they would be more subjective in terms of reviewing and acknowledging a female conductor, whilst individuals who have position managerial roles would tend to perceive female conductors in a relatively objective way.

Having female role models for new generations has significant influences on casting a new "stereotypical" image of conductors. However, because of perception bias, when perceiving female conductors, people are accustomed to the "male conductor role model." The question is if qualified female conductors can be seen as a "role model." As a matter of fact, there are considerable numbers of influential female conductors within symphonic

⁹ Respondent I is the head of orchestral conducting department, previously he worked as an artistic director. Therefore, in the analysis, he is considered a double role: as a teacher, and also a impresario.

orchestras. Individuals do recognize the talents and qualifications of these female conductors, yet, hesitatingly regard female conductors as role models. The approval of the female conductor as a role model could be a final step to completely accepting women as a conductor in the symphonic orchestra. Objectively recognizing the qualifications and talents of female conductors is just the initial step for eliminating the gender prejudice toward women when they take the leader role as a conductor.

Last but not least, the numbers of emerging female conductors have gradually risen in the classical music field. As a result, music professionals will have more chances to work with female conductors. The perception of the stereotypical role of conductors will be influenced by the increasing number of highly capable female conductors, and it will continually improve the condition of gender inclusiveness in this traditionally male-dominated profession. Although it is difficult to imagine the full-scale dismantling of this institutionalized gender inequality in the short-term, a small range of changes in the status of female conductors will significantly challenge gender norms and order. These types of challenges have already produced changes in the direction of greater gender equality and enable even greater changes to come (Wharton, 2005). The leadership of females in the eyes of beholders will hopefully be normalized – when the issue will not be about gender, but quality will be the only thing that matters.

Contribution

The classical music sector is a part of cultural/creative industries, and the working conditions are similar between artists and creative workers (Scharff, 2018). Hence, the result of the perceptions of how insiders shape/influence women's leadership in classical music could also be applied to comprehend the relationships between gender and leadership in the cultural industry at large. Gender prejudice in the cultural and creative industries is commonly rooted in people's minds – it prevents being aware and even imagining the possibilities of discriminatory practice (Pujar, 2016). Thus, the investigation of this research and the outcome may evoke people's awareness and contribute to a rethinking of gender inequality. Ultimately, the individual may start to question the traditional conventions of social roles and gender equality. After all, in order to eliminate gender prejudice, and to accomplish “gender neutrality” (Williams, 1989) in cultural and creative industries, especially those in authoritative position, we need to consciously acknowledge prejudice, question it, and eventually challenge and rewrite these conventions.

Limitations

Based on the chosen methodology, three limitations can be addressed for the research. First, due to the time limitation of the research, I did not have the time to find professional

female conductors to participate in this research, thereby providing their own personal views on this matter. However, the aim of this research is focusing on insiders, hence, how others perceive female conductors. I have obtained a fruitful outcome regarding individual experience and their perceptions of female conductors. It would also be beneficial to understand the viewpoints of female conductors themselves. It could allow me to gain some well-rounded insights into gender in the classical music world, by understanding and comparing different type of insiders' views of female conductors.

The second limitation of this research is that due to the nature of qualitative research, the subjective views of respondents are not representative of larger populations. Hence, this can be regarded as a "classic sample bias" (Boyatzis, 1998). Also, because I used a snowball sampling strategy, half of the interviewees have similar educational backgrounds, they studied at the same conservatory, and (have) worked in the orchestra. Therefore, they also had the same female conductors in mind when conducting the interviews. Nevertheless, this is also an interesting part of my study: even though they (have) had similar experiences with the conductor, they perceive those conductors differently.

The last limitation relates to my own knowledge of music. Because I do not know the music world very well, and have no prior knowledge of conducting, nor classical music, I sometimes feel I missed out on musicological knowledge and terminology with regard to interviewing the respondents.

Further research

As mentioned in the findings, the majority of conducting teachers are male – and they would have an influential role in a female conductor's career. Some interviewees also pointed out that they think the reason there are few female conductors may be the cause of bias selection in the educational process. Thus, it would be interesting to investigate conducting education in the conservatory and how the selection of conducting candidates are processed in the conservatory. Moreover, it may be beneficial to explore the educational processes in how male conducting teachers deal with female students. Therefore, further research on the conducting education topic is needed.

References:

- Acker, J. (1992). From Sex Role to Gendered institutions. *Contemporary Sociology*. pp. 565-569. <http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/2075528>
- Acker, J.(1990). Hierarchies, jobs, and bodies: A theory of gendered organizations. *Gender & Society*. pp. 139-158. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/089124390004002002>
- Atik, Y. (1994). The Conductor and the Orchestra. *Leadership & Organization Development Journal*. pp. 22-28. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/01437739410050123>
- Allen, P. M., & Lincoln, E, A. (2004). Critical discourse and the cultural consecration of American films. *Social Forces*, 82. pp. 871-894. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.poetic.2006.01.001>
- Allaire, Y., Firsirotu, E. M. (1984). Theories of Organizational Culture. *Organization Studies*. pp. 193-226. <https://doi.org/10.1177/017084068400500301>
- Allport, G. W., Christie, R. (1954). The Nature of Prejudice. *The American Journal of*

Psychology. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1418507>

- Ayman, R. (2004). Situational and contingency approaches to leadership. In J. Antonakis, A. T. Cianciolo, & R. J. Sternberg (Eds.), *The nature of leadership*. pp. 148-170. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Bartleet B, L. (2003). Female conductors: the incarnation of power. *An interdisciplinary Journal of Women's Liberation*. Hecate. pp. 228-234
- Bartleet, L. B. (2005). Reflections on females conducting. In Mackinlay. E., Collins. D ., Owens, S. (Eds.) *Aesthetics and experience in music performance*. pp.235- 241
- Bartleet, B. (2008). Women Conductors on the Orchestral Podium: Pedagogical and Professional Implications. *College Music Symposium*, 48. pp. 31-51. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/25664806>
- Barreto, M., Ryan, M., & Schmitt, M. (2009). The glass ceiling in the 21st century: Understanding barriers to gender equality. American Psychological Association.
- Baxter, J., Wright, E. O. (2000). The glass ceiling hypothesis: A comparative study of the United States, Sweden, and Australia. *Gender & Society*, 14. pp. 275-294.
- Benson, P. (1991). "Autonomy and Oppressive Socialization," *Social Theory and Practice*, 17. pp. 385-408
- Bennett, D. (2008). A gendered study of the working patterns of classical musicians: implications for practice. *International Journal of Music Education*. 26-1. pp.89-100. <http://doi.org/10.1177/0255761407085925>
- Bem, S. L. (1993). *The Lenses of Gender*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press
- Berg, L. B (2007). *Qualitative Research Methods for The Social Sciences*, (6th ed.). Boston, MA: Pearson Education, Inc.
- Berger, P. L., Luckmann, T. (1967). *The Social Construction of Reality*. New York: Anchor Books
- Biddle, B. J. (1979). *Role theory: Expectations, identities, and behaviors*. New York: Academic Press.
- Biernat, M., & Kobrynowicz, D. (1997). Gender- and race-based standards of competence: Lower minimum standards but higher ability standards for devalued groups. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 72. pp.544-557. <https://doi.org/10.1037//0022-3514.72.3.544>
- Boyatzis, R. E. (1998). *Transforming Qualitative information: Thematic Analysis and Code Development*, US, SAGE Publication, Inc.
- Braden, E. L (2009). From the Armory to academia: Careers are reputations of early modern artists in the United State. *Poetics*, 37. pp. 439-455. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.poetic.2009.09.004>

- Bryman, A. (2012). *Social Research Method*, 4th Edition, United states, Oxford University Press.
- Carli, L. L., & Eagly, A. H. (1999). Gender effects on influence and emergent leadership. In G. N. Powell (Ed.), *Handbook of gender & work*. pp. 203-222. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Cook, K., & Everist, M. (2010), *Rethinking music*. UK. Oxford University Press
- Cotter, A. D, Hermsen, M. J, Ovadia, S., Vanneman, R. (2001) The Glass Ceiling Effect, *Social Forces*, Volume 80, Issue 2. pp. 655-681.
<https://doi-org.eur.idm.oclc.org/10.1353/sof.2001.0091>
- Conor, B., Gill, R., Taylor, S. (2015). Gender and Creative Labor. *The Sociological Review*. 63-1. pp. 1-22. <https://doi-org.eur.idm.oclc.org/10.1111/1467-954X.12237>
- Connolly, K (2019 January 29) Marin Alsop appointed first female artistic director of top Vienna orchestra. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from:
<https://www.theguardian.com/music/2018/jan/29/exclusive-marin-alsop-appointed-first-female-artistic-director-of-orf-orchestra>
- Cheng M, N. (1998). Women Conductors: Has the Train Left the Station? *The Symphony Orchestra Institute*. Retrieved from: http://web.esm.rochester.edu/poly/wp-content/uploads/2012/02/Women_Conductors_Cheng.pdf
- Chumaceiro, L. C. (2004). Serendipity and Pseudoserendipity in Career Paths of Successful Women: Orchestra Conductors. *Creativity Research Journal*. pp.345-356.
http://dx.doi.org/10.1207/s15326934crj1602&3_16
- Christodoulou, C. (2019 May 9) Karina Canellakis Chef-dirigent Radio Filharmonisch Orchest. *NOS*. Retrieved from: <https://nos.nl/artikel/2231040-karina-canellakis-chef-dirigent-radio-filharmonisch-orkest.html>
- Citron, J. M. (2000). *Gender and the musical canon*. University of Illinois Press
- DeNora, T. (2002). Music into action: performing gender on the Viennese concert stage, 1790–1810. *Poetics*, 30 (1-2), pp. 19-33. [http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0304-422X\(02\)00005-0](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0304-422X(02)00005-0)
- De la Rey, C. (2005). Gender, women and leadership. *Agenda*,
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10130950.2005.9674614>
- Dowd, T.J., Liddle, K., Lupo, K., Borden, A. (2002). Organizing The Musical Canon: The Repertoires of Major U.S. Symphony Orchestras, 1842 to 1969. *Poetics*. pp.35-61.
[https://doi.org/10.1016/S0304-422X\(02\)00007-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0304-422X(02)00007-4)
- Eakin, H. (2003, 4 June). Women are as scarce as change at Vienna orchestra. *New York Times*. Retrieved from: <https://www.nytimes.com/2003/06/04/arts/women-are-as-scarce-as-change-at-vienna-orchestra.html>

- Eagly, A. H. (1987). *Sex differences in social behavior: A social-role interpretation*. Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc., Publishers
- Eagly, A. H., Karau, S. J., & Makhijani, M. G. (1995). Gender and the effectiveness of leaders: A meta-analysis. *Psychological Bulletin*, 117. pp. 125–145.
- Eagly, A. H., Wood, W., & Diekmann, A. B. (2000). Social role theory of sex differences and similarities: A current appraisal. In T. Eckes & H. M. Trautner (Eds.), *The developmental social psychology of gender*. pp. 123-174. Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum.
- Eagly, A. H., Karau, S. J. (2002). Role Congruity Theory of Prejudice Toward Female Leaders. *Psychological Review*. 109 (3). pp. 573-598
- Eagly, A. H., & Carli, L. L. (January 01, 2003). The female leadership advantage: An evaluation of the evidence. *The Leadership Quarterly*. pp. 807-834.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.leaqua.2003.09.004>
- Eagly, H. A. (2005). Achieving relational authenticity in leadership: Does gender matter? *The Leadership Quarterly*, 16 (3). pp.459-474.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.leaqua.2005.03.007>
- Eagly, A. H. (2007), Female leadership advantage and disadvantage: Resolving the contradictions. *Psychology of Women Quarterly*, 31. pp.1-12.
<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-6402.2007.00326.x>
- Eagly, A. H. (in press). Prejudice: Toward A More Inclusive Understanding. In A. H. Eagly, R. M. Baron, & V. L. Hamilton (Eds.), *The social psychology of group identity and social conflict: Theory, application, and practice*. Washington, DC: APA Books.
- Elliott, J. R., & Smith, R. A. (2004). Race, gender, and workplace power. *American Sociological Review*, 69. pp. 365–386. <https://doi.org/10.1177/000312240406900303>
- Edwards, A. (2015) *Gender and the symphonic Conductor*, University of Washington,
 Retrieved from: <http://hdl.handle.net/1773/33213>
- Foulkes, S. H. (2002). *Therapeutic group analysis*, London. Karnac
- Friedland, R., Alford, R. R. (1991). Bring Society Back In: Symbols, Practice, and Institutional Contradictions. In Walter W. Powell and Paul J. DiMaggio (eds.), *The New Institutionalism in Organizational Analysis*. pp. 232-65. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press,
- Fox-Kirk, W. (2017). Viewing Authentic Leadership Through a Bourdieusian Lens: Understanding Gender and Leadership as Social Action. *Advances in Developing Human Resources*. 19-4. pp.439-453. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/1523422317728939>
- Gardiner A, R. (2015). *Gender, authenticity and leadership: thinking with Arendt*. Palgrave Macmillan. Houndsmills, Basingstoke Hampshire
- Galkin W, E.(1988). *A history of orchestra conducting: in theory and practice*. Pendragon

- Green, L. (2006). Music, gender, education. Cambridge University Press
- Garrido, C. D., Carnicer, G. J., Requena, O. S. (2015) Music and Leadership: The Role of the Conductor. *International Journal of Music and Performing Arts*. <http://dx.doi.org/10.15640/ijmpa.v3n1a8>
- Gardiner, A. R.(2015).Gender, authenticity and leadership: thinking with Arendt. Palgrave Macmillan
- Gill, R. (2014). Unspeakable Inequalities: Post Feminism, Entrepreneurial Subjectivity, and the Repudiation of Sexism among Cultural Workers. *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State & Society* 21(4). pp. 509-528.
- Groen, D. (2016, Dec, 19). Why Are There So Few Female Conductors? For women, the symphony is not so difficult from the boardroom. *The Walrus*. Retrieved from: <https://thewalrus.ca/why-are-there-so-few-female-conductors/>
- Goldin, C., Rouse, C. (1997) Orchestrating Impartiality: The Impact of "Blind" Auditions on Female Musicians. pp.715-741. [http:// dx.doi.org/10.3386/w5903](http://dx.doi.org/10.3386/w5903)
- Hallam , S., Rogers, L., Creech, A. (2008).Gender differences in musical instrument choice. Volume 26, issue 1. pp. 7-19. [http:// dx.doi.org/10.1177/0255761407085646](http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/0255761407085646)
- Heilman, M.E. (2001). Description and Prescription: How Gender Stereotypes Prevent Women's Ascent Up The Organizational Ladder. *Journal of Social Issues*, 57(4). pp. 657-674. [http://dx.doi.org/ 10.1111/0022-4537.00234](http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/0022-4537.00234)
- Heilman, M. E., Eagly, A. H. (2008). Gender stereotypes are alive, well, and busy producing workplace discrimination. *Industrial & Organizational Psychology*, 1(4), pp. 393-398. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1754-9434.2008.00072.x>
- Hesse- Biber, S.N., P. Leavy. (2006). The practice of qualitative research. Thousand Oaks, CA, SAGE.
- Hollanders, J. A., Howard, J.(2000) Social Psychological Theories on Social Inequalities. *Social Psychology Quarterly* 63. pp. 338-351. [http:// dx.doi.org/10.2307/2695844](http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/2695844)
- Hosking, M. D. (1999). Management and organization: relational alternatives to individualism. Avebury
- Järviluoma, H., Moisala. P., Vilkkko, A. (2003). Gender and qualitative methods. Sage Publications
- Koivunen, N., Wennes, G. (2011). Show us the sound! Aesthetic leadership of symphony orchestra conductors. *Leadership*. 7-1. pp.51-71. [https://doi-org.eur.idm.oclc.org/10.1177/1742715010386865](https://doi.org.eur.idm.oclc.org/10.1177/1742715010386865)
- Macharis, C., Turcksin, L., Lebeau, K. (2012). Multi actor multi criteria analysis (MAMCA) as a tool to support sustainable decisions: State of use. *Decision Support Systems*. 54-1. pp.610-620. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dss.2012.08.008>

- McLeod, C. (2002). Self-trust and reproductive autonomy. Massachusetts Institute of Technology. Cambridge, Mass
- Mill, J. A.(1988). Organization, Gender and Culture. *Organization Studies*. 9-3. pp.351-369. <https://doi-org.eur.idm.oclc.org/10.1177/017084068800900304>
- Lawson, K D. (1984). A Women’s place is at the Podium. *Music Educator Journal*, 70. pp. 46-49. <https://doi.org/10.2307/3400741>
- Lorber, J. (1994). *Paradoxes of Gender*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press
- Naumann, E., Ouseley, A. F.(2013). *The History of Music*. Cambridge University.
- Noy, C. (2008). “Sampling Knowledge: The Hermeneutics of Snowball Sampling in Qualitative Research.” *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 11: pp. 327–344.
- Pendle, K. (1991). *Women & music : A history*. Bloomington etc.: Indiana University Press.
- Phelan, J. E., Moss-Racusin, C. A., Rudman, L. A. (2008). Competent yet out in the cold: Shifting criteria for hiring reflect backlash toward agentic women. *Psychology of Women Quarterly*, 32, pp. 406-413. [http:// dx.doi.org/ 10.1111/j.1471-6402.2008.00454.x](http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-6402.2008.00454.x)
- Pujar, S. (2016). Gender Inequality in the Cultural sector. Cultural Action Europe. Retrieved from : <https://cultureactioneurope.org/files/2016/05/Gender-Inequalities-in-the-Cultural-Sector.pdf>
- Raynor, H. (1978). *The orchestra : A history*. New York, N.Y.: Scribner.
- Ridgeway, L.C. (2008). Framed Before We Know it: How gender Shapes Social Relations. *Gender & Society*, 23-2. pp.145-160. <https://doi-org.eur.idm.oclc.org/10.1177/0891243208330313>
- Ridgeway, L.C.(2011). *Framed by gender: how gender inequality persists in the modern world*. Oxford University Press
- Rieger, E. (1985). On the changing role of women in music. In Ecker. G (Ed.) *Feminist Aesthetic*. pp.151-152 . London: Women’s Press.
- Schmutz, V.(2009). Social and symbolic boundaries in newspaper coverage of music, 1955–2005: Gender and genre in the US, France, Germany, and the Netherlands. *Poetics*. pp.298-314. <http://doi.org/10.1016/j.poetic.2009.06.006>
- Scharff, C. (2015). *Equality and diversity in the classical music profession*. King’s College London
- Scharff, C. (2018). *Gender, subjectivity and cultural work: the classical music profession*. Routledge
- Schmutz, C. V., & Faupel, A. (2010) *The Classification and Consecration of popular Music*

- Critical Discourse and Cultural Hierarchies. *Social Forces*, 89 (2). pp.685-707.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1353/sof.2010.0098>
- Silverman, D. (2006). *Interpreting qualitative data* . 3rd Edition. Thousand Oakas, CA: Sage
- Spence, T. J., Helmreich, L.R. (1979). *Masculinity femininity: Their Psychological Dimensions, Correlates, Antecedents*. University of Texas Press
- Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. M. (1990). *Basics of Qualitative Research: Grounded Theory Procedures and Techniques*. Newbury Park, CA: SAGE.
- Service, T. (2013, March, 11th). Vienna Philharmonic's conservatism has exposed it to unsettling truths. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from:
<https://www.theguardian.com/music/2013/mar/11/vienna-philharmonic-history>
- Wellson, V. E. (2004). *Mother, Madonna, whore: the idealization and denigration of motherhood*. London. Karnac.
- Singh, A. (2018, February, 26) BBC Proms to give half of new commissions to women by 2022. *The Telegraph*. Retrieved from:
<https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2018/02/26/bbc-proms-give-half-new-commissions-women-2022/>
- Wharton, S. A. (2005). *The sociology of gender: an introduction to theory and research*. Wiley-Blackwell
- Williams, C. J. (1989). Deconstructing Gender. *Michigan Law Review*. 797. pp.798-845.
Retrieved from: http://repository.uchastings.edu/faculty_scholarship/836

Appendix 1: Interview Consent Form

Thank you for agreeing to be interviewed as part of this research project about female leadership in classical music. This study aims to understand how people in the classical music field perceive women when these women challenge the leader role, becoming a music conductor – more importantly, to understand how the perceptions of others have shaped women in achieve leadership in the music world. The interview will take about 50 minutes. I do not anticipate that there are any risks associated with your participation, but you have the right to stop the interview or withdraw from the research at any time. Ethical procedures for academic research require that interviewees explicitly agree to being interviewed and how the information contained in their interview will be used. This consent form is necessary for the researcher to ensure that you understand that purpose of your involvement and that you agree to the condition of your participation. Hereby, I inform you that:

- The interview will be recorded and a transcript will be produced;
- The transcript will be anonymized and your name will not be mentioned;
- Access to the interview transcript will be limited to the research group working on the thesis project “Female music conductors – Negotiating gender and leadership in the classical music world,” the master thesis supervisor Balázs Boross and the faculty of history, culture and communication of Erasmus University Rotterdam;
- Any summary of the interview content, or direct quotations from the interview, which are made available through academic publication or other academic outlets will not include any information that may reveal your identity, unless you want this yourself.

By signing this form, I (the respondent) agree that:

1. I am voluntarily taking part in this project. I understand that I do not have to take part, and I can stop recording and the interview at any time;
2. I can refuse to answer any question without explaining the reason. The transcribed interview or extracts from it may be used as described above;
3. I do not expect to receive any benefit or payment for my participation;

I have been able to ask any questions I might have, in case of any problems you can contact the course coordinator (give my details) and you can do it anonymously.

The signature of Researcher:

The signature of Participant:

Date of Interview:

Appendix 2: Interview Design

Introduction

A gender-typed occupation is one which encompasses a distinctive stereotypical gender characteristic, either feminine nor masculine (Ridgeway, 2011). The role of leadership is commonly associated with masculinity (Scharff, 2008; Wharton, 2012; Ridgeway, 2011). In the classical music world, the music conductor is a traditionally male-dominated position due to its natural task of musical leadership and endowed authority. It requires that one has the ability to keep an orchestra together, integrating the orchestra into an entity; analyzing the problems involved in keeping time, and controlling the temporal aspects of performance is the basic interpretive responsibility of a conductor (Galkin, 1988; Bartleet, 2003). Before the 20th century, almost all conductors in history were male (Pendle, 1991). In recent decades, there has been an increasing trend of emerging female conductors to challenge this traditionally male-dominated leadership position. This implies a positive change of women pursuing gender equality in the cultural industry. Women were not traditionally entitled to the leadership role and power and have experienced the exclusion from particular roles in society (Scharff, 2015). Scharff demonstrates that although there is a high proportion of students on artistic studies, as well as art educators, compared to men, fewer women are represented in the field with authoritative positions (Scharff, 2018). The issue of gender inequality in the classical music field is visible in terms of the representation of the number of female conductors – it still is a taboo and people render the subject “unspeakable” (Scharff, 2015). The “glass ceiling” is a metaphor which is often used to describe the phenomenon that there are invisible barriers for women to gain authority and achieve leadership in the classical music field (Cotter., Hermsen., Ovadia., Venneman, 2001).

The aim of this study is to understand how people in the classical music field perceive female leaders when these women take the leader role in a highly-demanding and extremely competitive environment, becoming a music conductor. I am interested in how the perception of people have influences on female conductors to achieve this particular leadership, and whether the perceptions may shape/reshape the stereotypical role of conductor.

Theoretical concepts

Cultural consecration, female in musical leadership, symbolic boundary, Sociology of gender

RQ: How do insiders perceive female conductors as leaders in the classical music world, and to what extent do the perceptions influence the status of female conductors, thereby reconsidering the gendered leadership role of the music conductor?

Operationalization

The research question is determined as "How do insiders perceive female conductors as leaders in the classical music field". This study focuses on the perceptions of insiders because they are the ones who know the conventions of the classical music sector and work closely with the conductors. Thus, the perceptions of insiders have considerable influences on the conductors, it may to some extent shape/reshape this stereotypically gendered leadership role of music conductors. Furthermore, this research will also touch on upon audiences' expectation. Due to the preconditioned gender-stereotypical role of conductors, I would assume that audiences have certain expectations on the gender of conductor. This question will be explored by asking respondents how they think of audiences' perception on the gender of conductors.

I've identified five types of insiders in the classical musical orchestra field, as they all have direct or indirect relations with the music conductors. The five types of insiders are: 1) conservatory students who are majoring in conducting; 2) conservatory conducting teachers; 3) orchestra musicians; 4) orchestra conductors and 5) the board of an orchestra. On the other hand, it will also explore how female conductors perceive themselves as a leader in the orchestra, and how they overcome the gender inequality in the classical music field.

Due to the fact that this study focuses on the subjectivity of people, a qualitative research is considered as the most appropriate method to investigate the perception of the insiders. This method enables us to extract in-depth meaning from a natural conversation environment (Bryman, 2012). 12 (or 13) semi-structured interviews will be conducted during the period 20th March to 15th April. 12(or 13) respondents have been selected by using the snowball sampling strategy. The reason I choose this non-probability sampling strategy is that the 'insiders' are a specific group in the population, and can be very hard-to-reach, especially like the board of orchestra, music conductors. Thus, by adopting snowball sampling strategy, it allows me to gain access to the music field and finding the appropriate participants by asking people to introduce other ideal interviewees to me.

Appendix 3: Interview guide

Thank you for participating in this interview about women in leadership. I am hoping to know what you think are the challenges for the role of female conductor. The interview will take approximately 50 minutes.

Part 1: Basic information

1. Could you briefly introduce yourself?
 - Age
 - Educational background
 - Occupation
 - Years of working?
2. How many female conductors have you worked with so far?

Part 2: Perceptions on gender: influences and gender traits

The first three questions will allow me to gain insights into how people think about a conductor, and what are the qualities they believe that a good conductor should have – and as they are all professionals in the classical music world – the opinions are crucial in order to understand how these perceptions may shape the leadership role of conductor in relation to gender. I assume that the given answers may include some gendered description, even though it is very likely that the respondents will express that they don't think gender matters (as I communicated with few musicians already, they all emphasized that gender does not matter) but I am hoping the questions can evoke their unconscious in perceiving female conductors, making them rethink the relationships between the role of conductor and the expected gendered attributes.

1. What are the leadership qualities/characters that you want in your conductor?
[Q for conductors] What are the leadership qualities/characters that you think are essential for a conductor?
Sub: Which conductor(s) you have worked with is (are) the most influential/inspiring maestro? Sub: How was it working with them?
2. *How would audiences think of the gender of conductors?

3. What would be the role models of female conductor(s) in your mind?

All the selected respondents have had experiences working with female conductors, by comparing the experience between working with female conductors and male conductors, it allows me to understand if the experience differs in terms of gender, and whether different experiences are based on accustomed views of gender and expected stereotypical leadership of music conductors.

4. In your professional career, have you ever experienced when the gender of the conductor affected your experience?

[Q for conductor respondents] Have you experienced any particular positive or negative experiences when conducting because of your gender?

The physical appearances and sexuality of female conductors, as Edward (2015) points out will be viewed primarily by the viewers.

5. What will you first notice when you see a female conductor standing on the podium?

[Q for conductors] How do you think of psychological differences between male and female conductors when working in the orchestra? Outfit, the appearance of the conductors (hair, makeup, nails), conducting gestures?

[Q for female conductors] Are you aware of your psychological appearance when conducting?

Symphonic orchestras have long been dominated by male musicians. In recent decades, it has opened up its doors to female musicians. As a result, there has been an increasing number of emerging female conductors, but still it is very rare to see a female conductor perform on the stage. By asking this question, I am hoping to understand how and what people think about the reasons why there are few female conductors.

6. Do you know any female conductor(s) who is(are) not as much appreciated/accepted as males?

7. In what ways has there been a (positive) change in the acceptance of women conductors in the classical music world, despite the fact that there is still under-representation of them on the public stage?

The personality and conducting techniques are equally important for a music conductor to lead an orchestra: the personality can form a natural authority, which naturally engages the musicians (conversation), building up a sense of trust with the musicians, etc. The ways, manners and style of leading can vary widely, especially for music conductors, and it all contributes to the effectiveness of a conducting an orchestra.

8. In terms of effective conducting, are there particular gestures, conducting styles, rehearsal techniques that you find work well for some conductors regarding their gender?

9. Could you describe some particular personalities of female conductors who you have worked with? (communicating style, way of approaching people, way of dealing issues)

Sub: How do these particular personalities of female conductors differ from male conductors according to your experience working with them?

The lead role of music conductor is a traditionally male-dominated position, and the recognition of male conductors is socially constructed. Boys are more likely encouraged to become a music conductor, because it matches with their gender role convention. However, In an interview, Marin Alsop mentioned how the teacher discouraged her when she expressed the wish that she wanted to be a music conductor at a very young age. The preconditioned gender-stereotypical role of conductors is often preconceptualized in our mind as to how to perceive and what to judge accordingly.

10. A conductor is traditionally thought to be a male figure, and what we commonly see is a male conductor performing on the podium. So what would be the consequences of this gender dominancy for the gender equality of conductors?

Sub: Can it be changed? How?

The lack of opportunities to practice being a conductor in the orchestra, and the lack of encouragement and support from parents, family, teachers or friends will have considerable effects on a woman in pursuing and achieving the leadership role as a music conductor. Therefore, this question aims to explore what respondents think would be the barriers/obstacles for a female conductor to achieving leadership.

11. What do you think would be the obstacles for females to gain leadership in the classical music world?

In an interview, Marin Alsop says: “Conducting in an orchestra is leadership distilled, it is a manifestation of leadership, because through the gesture, I have to convince 100 experts to do what I want, and that requires some kind of leadership.”

12. Why do you think a female takes the leader role in the symphonic orchestra?

Sub: what are the advantages and disadvantages for a woman to become a conductor/to lead an orchestra?

13. Do you have any other comments that you would like share?

That’s the end of the interview. Thank you very much! If you have additional questions regarding this research, please feel free to contact me.

Appendix 4: Interview guide – for female conductors only

Thank you for participating in this interview about women in leadership. I am hoping to know what you think about female challenges in the role of conductor. The interview will take approximately 50 minutes.

Part 1: Basic information

1. Could you briefly introduce yourself?
 - Age
 - Educational background
 - Occupation
 - Years of working?
2. How many female conductors have you worked with so far?

Part 2: Perceptions on gender: influences and gender traits

1. What are the leadership qualities/characteristics that you think are essential for a conductor?
2. How would audiences think of the gender of conductors?
3. What are the characteristics of the role models of female conductor(s) that you have in your mind?
4. Have you experienced any particular positive or negative experiences when conducting because of your gender?
5. What do you think of psychological differences between male and female conductors when working in the orchestra? Outfit, the appearance of the conductors (hair, makeup, nails), conducting gesture?
Sub: Are you aware of your psychological appearance when conducting?
6. In your professional career, have you experienced things due to your gender, therefore you were not as much appreciated or accepted as male conductors?
7. In what ways has there been a (positive) change in the acceptance of women conductors in the classical music world, despite the fact that there is still under-representation of them on the public stage?
8. In terms of effective conducting, are there particular gestures, conducting styles, or rehearsal techniques that are typically used by female conductors?
9. Could you describe some particular personalities of yourself when conducting, such as communicating style, way of approaching people, way of dealing issues?

-Sub: How do these particular personalities of female conductors differ from male conductors according to your own experience?

10. What do you think about the fact of gender diversity in the classical music world?

-Sub: Is gender diversity important for the role of conductors?

11. A conductor is traditionally thought to be a male figure, and what we commonly see is a male conductor performing on the podium. So, what would be the consequences of this gender stereotyped image for the gender equality of conductors?

Sub: Can it be changed? How?

12. What would be the obstacles for females to gain leadership and authority in the orchestras?

Sub: Should women be given more chances and opportunities to become a conductor?

13. What are the advantages and disadvantages for a woman to become a conductor and to lead an orchestra?

14. What do you think about women's position as the leader in the orchestra?

15. Do you have any other comments that you would like share?

That's the end of the interview. Thank you very much! If you have additional questions regarding this research, please feel free to contact me.

Appendix 5: Interviewee information (in chronological order)

Respondent A: **Pete Saunders**, male, American, 65-year-old, trombonist, is teaching at the Den Haag Royal Conservatoire. Has worked with around approximately 10 female conductors. Date of interview: 20th March, 2018. Interview duration: 44 minutes. Interview Location: the Den Haag Royal conservatoire.

Respondent B: **Yuanyuan Cui**, female, Chinese 28-year-old, conducting student at the Central Conservatoire China. Studying orchestral conducting when she was 18. She has a background as a pianist. Date of interview: 24th March, 2018. Interview duration: 64 minutes. Skype interview.

Respondent C: **Thies Roorda**, male, Dutch, 64-year-old, flute player, teaching at the Den Haag Royal Conservatoire. Has worked with 2 female conductors. Date of interview: 24th March, 2018. Interview duration: 73 minutes. Interview Location: Respondent' home.

Respondent D: **Floris Don**, male, Dutch, 35-year-old, Programmer of the Rotterdam Philharmonic orchestra. Has worked with 3 female conductors. Date of interview: 27th March, 2018. Interview duration: 41 minutes. Interview Location: De Doelen, Rotterdam.

Respondent E: **Marielle Ponsen**, Dutch, female, 45-year-old, violinist. She used to play at the National Ballet/Opera orchestra. Has worked with 3 female conductors. Date of interview: 29th March, 2018. Interview duration: 57 minutes. Interview Location: Respondent's home.

Respondent F: **Libia Hernandez**, female, Cuban, Double bass player and semi-professional orchestral conductor. Has worked with 1 female conductor. Date of interview: 31st March, 2018. Interview duration 85 minutes. Interview Location: Respondent's home.

Respondent G: **Sven Arne Tepl**, male, Dutch, 52-year-old. Artistic director at the Residential Orchestra, also teaching viola at the Den Haag Royal Conservatoire. Has worked with 6 female conductors. Date of interview: 4th April (Morning), 2018. Interview duration 79 minutes. Interview Location: The Zuiderstrandtheater.

Respondent H: **Hans Leedense**, male, Dutch, 47-year-old. Orchestra conductor, teaching at Codoart Conservatoire Rotterdam, used to be percussionist in the Rotterdam Philharmonic orchestra. Has worked with very few female conductors. Date of interview: 4th April (Afternoon), Interview duration 90 minutes. Interview Location: at the café Doppio Espresso, Rotterdam.

Respondent I: Wim Vos, male, Dutch, 61-year-old, the head of the classical department of the Den Haag Royal conservatoire, orchestral conducting teacher, used to be a percussionist. Formal artistic director at Residential orchestra has worked with few female conductor, but only worked closely with 4 female conductors. Date of interview: 6th April, Interview duration 65 minutes. Interview Location: the Den Haag Royal conservatoire.

Respondent J: Jannet Krause, female, Canadian, principal violinist at The Den Haag Philharmonic orchestra, also teaching violin at The Den Haag Royal conservatoire. Has worked with few female conductors. Date of interview: 10th April, Interview duration: 51 minutes. Interview Location: the Den Haag Royal conservatoire.

Respondent K: Pippie Wiersma, female, Dutch, 56-year-old, artistic manager of Ludwig group. Used to be a professional percussionist. Has worked with 4 female conductors. Date of interview: 11th April, Interview duration: 57 minutes. Interview Location: Lloyd Hotel, Amsterdam

Total number of respondents: 11 respondents, 5 female and 6 male.

Total interview length: 11 hour and 8 minutes.

Appendix 7: Table Explaining Themes

Themes (Axial codes)	Topic it covers(Memo)	Main Codes
The influences of traditional conducting path	Conducting is traditionally established by males, therefore the stereotyped image of conductor is rooted in the classical music world. This theme provides evidence for how respondents consider the role of the conductor and how this stereotypical gendered role influences the status of female conductors.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -conducting convention: gender and leadership -acceptance of women in the classical musical world -two type of prejudices -feminine vs. masculine
Sociocultural influences	Sociocultural influences include two perspectives: macrosociology and microsociology. The macrosociology perspective indicates that the change of society has great influence on female social status, in this case, women have gained more accesses to music world, as well as authoritative positions (conductor); Microsociology perspective suggesting the influence of organizational culture, individual perceptions reflected on the organizational culture. It will be changed as the old culture is gradually replaced by the new generations.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -female's role has changed in society -organizational culture -group dynamic and leadership style
Perceptions differ from the role of insiders	The perception is closely related to people' background (professions), age, and sex. Subjectivity is the key to how the perception has shaped the gendered convention.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -subjectivity to conductors' qualification -positive discrimination -Double standards
Recognition of female conductors	Demonstrating the most frequently mentioned female conductors, why those women are well-recognized. Understanding how respondents review female conductors, concluding why those female conductors are successful and recognizable for respondents.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -female role model -non-conventional conducting style -conventional conducting style