International Institute of Social Studies

Ezafung

Punk is in the Heart
The role of religion in the evolving punk identity in Makassar punk scene

A Research Paper presented by:

Ahmad Tarikhul Haq
(Indonesia)

in partial fulfillment of the requirements for obtaining the degree of
MASTER OF ARTS IN DEVELOPMENT STUDIES

Major:

Human Rights, Gender, and Conflict Studies: Social Justice Perspectives
(SJP)

Members of the Examining Committee:

Roy Huijsmans
Shyamika Jayasundara

The Hague, The Netherlands
December 2018

Disclaimer:

This document represents part of the author's study programme while at the International Institute of Social Studies. The views stated therein are those of the author and not necessarily those of the Institute.

Contents

List of Tables

List of Figures

List of Acronyms

DIY   Do It Yourself

Acknowledgement

This paper is has become a precious journey in my life in finding the meaning of music and religion. Music and religion have always been around me since my childhood and they grew to influence my academic interest in writing this paper. this paper not only illustrates the experience of punk member in Makassar music scene but also my experience in positioning myself towards music and religion.

First of all, I want to give my utmost thanks for punk member in Makassar that share their stories and introduce me to their circle. It opens me to new site and people that I have never met before in the Makassar music scene. I cannot express how much gratitude I have for them to trust me and tell their personal stories.

Second, to my supervisor, Dr. Roy Huijsmans, this paper has become interesting process for me because the guidance and trust that you gave to me throughout this research. Thank you for always giving me a fresh idea, among them is the title for this research that I really fond and proud of.

Third, to my second reader, Dr. Shyamika Jayasundara, thank you for accepting my idea on researching punk and religion. Among other, suggestion, dividing punk identity into becoming, being, and unbecoming has become core structure that helps in writing this paper. I also feel gratitude for your help when I was attending your course and always found my research interesting.

Fourth, to my dearest friend back home and in ISS, thank you for the comfort, support and encouragement you always give me. Special mention to Masrad, Masnir, and Juang that always help me in the fieldwork. Without them, I will be lost in finding punk member in Makassar.

Fifth, to STUNED and Nuffic Neso, thank you for giving me scholarship. This opportunity that they have given me has been a great influence to my personal development.

I dedicated this paper to my mother who always support me and remind me to always be grateful. Without her, I wouldn't even recognize what religion and music in my life. Thank you for always be there for me when I was having trouble and for your love that you always give me.

Lastly, the most important one, my thanks to Allah Swt. I am truly grateful for Your blessing and Your love.

Abstract

Punk and religion are often seen as antagonistic. Yet in the Makassar context (Indonesia) in which religion is omnipresent members of the punk scene need to negotiate the role of religion in their everyday ways of being punk. Punk is constantly evolving through its interaction to the changing social and political context. Punk members experience such evolution throughout their life course thus give impacts to their perception of their punk identity in each stage of their life. In each stage of their life, religion comes into contact with their punk identity through various means and institutions. As a response, they projected the interaction by giving meaning to their religiosity and punk identity. The projection then differs in its relation to generation that embedded in specific historical and social temporal location in the punk scene. They began to internalize these projection overtime and making a different interpretation on their punk identity and religion both in individual and collective practices. This marks the negotiation in self to accommodate the feeling, thought, and behaviour that attached to punk and religion in each moment of change in their life course. Thus, the changes are located on the process of becoming, being, and unbecoming punk to clearly locate what role religion has in their punk identity processes.

This paper is the result of an ethnography research complemented by life history approach in Makassar, South Sulawesi, Indonesia punk group. This paper illustrated the complexities of a small circle of punk group in experiencing changes in giving meaning to religion as they grew older in Makassar punk scene. The changes happen due to the social trajectories that they enter throughout their life course that is embedded in their social and cultural context. In response, some of the punk view religion and punk as separate practices, some contemplates practices related to their age and role in their social circle, and other began to leave the scene to pursue religion. the different responses are expression of internalization to his self by negotiating the meaning of religion and punk in the development of their identity.

Relevance to Development Studies

This research about religion and punk relationship offers a contribution to the alternative development literature which moves away from a preoccupation with the economy instead focuses on some of the socio-cultural and spiritual dimensions of change. Earlier development that rises up from secular context has seen religion as obstruction to development is presently shifting because of the influence of human development open the space for viewing religion as something that is not against development but included in development. Punk that has its own practices and values was also seen as offering an alternative development similar to religion. This research about the becoming, being, and unbecoming punk insert itself in the intersection of these two alternatives of development speak to each other in constructing people identity and practices in a secular state.

Keywords

Punk, scene, religion, identity, popular culture, youth, becoming, being, unbecoming, Indonesia, Makassar

Chapter 1 **Intro**

1.1 Evolving punk and its relationship to religion

Punk entered Indonesia in the 1980s and has flourished in the underground music scene ever since. Indonesia has one of the most robust and varied punk scenes in the most populous Muslim country in the world. Therefore, in the Indonesian context interaction between punk and religion will be something that is inevitable in the everyday life of Indonesian punk scene.

Punk scene has to be understood as something that is not static instead it constantly mutates and evolves (Stewart 2014, 51). This constant evolution is caused by the engagement between punk and its social-political situation of places they are in. In each evolution, meaning to practices and values in punk becomes situated in the social and political aspect within punk. Consequently, the situated meaning through evolving is responded differently by punk members in the scene.

The different responses by punk members create internal dynamics and variety within the punk scene. As an example, straight edge punk[1] which rises in the west that inserting the value of not drinking, not doing drugs, no casual sex into their everyday life and of course also in their musical sense. The values of straight edge punk become a critique of another punk subgenre which has spread in California and Washington D.C that express themselves violently with drugs and alcohol played an essential role in this scene (Luhr 2010, 446). The critique depicts that within the punk scene, the variation is being contested one another.

Variation in punk subgenre also manifests in their relationship with religion. Majority of punk engagements with religion in the west are oppositional and antagonistic where Church as the leading actor that is being antagonized and religion itself remains uninterested in punk (Donaghey 2015, 29). In Russia, Pussy Riot band surging a protest in contestation of Russian Orthodox Church that permeates gender stereotypes. However, this relation does not necessarily reject the religion itself but rather than rejecting the idea of religion as an instrument for control and domination (Willems 2014, 411). The extreme rejection of religion by a punk group is seen in Poland where Church is seen on the same level of the mafia which can be considered as hostile sentiment toward religion (Donaghey 2015, 31).

 Other forms of engagement between punk and religion are Christian Hardcore and Taqwacore punk[2] that rises in the United States. The difference between both bands is former is the dominant community, and the latter is a marginal community in their place. These bands create their scene to facilitate youth punk that doesn't fit in with the American society and their punk counterpart (McDowell 2014, 256). Another different encounter of punk and religion is the Khrisnacore which one of Straight edge punk band that incorporates a Khrisna-related theme into their music which shows the incorporation of Buddhism into punk. These various engagements display the dynamics of punk relationships with their specific religion within their place.

Indonesian punk came to flourish in the era of New Order under Soeharto presidency in the early 90s which they voiced anti-repressive established authority. This era becomes the

---

[1] Straight edge punk is one of the subgenre of hardcore punk that later become a subculture. Straight edge punk cames about as a clean-living style of punk that is far away from drugs, alcohol, and violence (Luhr 2010, 446)

[2] Christian Hardcore is another type of punk subgenre that extend the church belief of evangelical spiritual war of End Times which they perceive this is a righteous mission to do while Taqwacore is another subgenre that wants to embrace the alienated muslim youth that alienated from traditional Islam and American Society (McDowell 2014, 256)

perfect situation for punk to flourish because of the Presidency during those time are repressive toward its opposition (Munn 2014). Since then many punk musicians voicing their concern of the repressive authority. Hence, It shows that Indonesian punk is having engagement with the social and political aspect of Indonesia.

Religion is one of the prominent social and political aspects of Indonesia. The state of Indonesia recognizes six religions which Islam has the most followers. Religious identity plays a vital role in everyday life in its society. In the identity card of each citizen, it contains information about which religion that they follow. Other than these six religions would not be recognized as a citizen. Since childhood, the exposure of religion has been frequent in the interaction of everyday life in Indonesia. In every region, there will be an Islamic boarding school or school that is affiliated with a particular religion. Not only Islamic boarding school, in every school since elementary until high school there will be religion as subject to be taught and compulsory to be attended. In another word, religion is subjected as an inseparable aspect in constructing Indonesian citizen activities.

Religion and religious institutions are often seen as contributing in making alternative development which challenges the mainstream idea of development (Jones and Petersen 2011, 1299). Not only religion but also popular culture including punk are challenging those mainstream idea of development. As Rakodi suggest "ideas about what constitutes development and how to achieve it has changed in the light of experience and response to challenges to dominant ideas and sets of policies." (Rakodi 2012, 638). Religion is dominant in everyday life of Indonesian and affects how the dynamism of punk with the interaction of religion informs how development context is being perceived. Religious institutions itself also shows many faces in addressing Indonesian everyday life.

Punk and religion have its own story related to specific place in different areas in Indonesia. One of the relations is punk is seen as a social disease, an offense to Islam by the religious authority or Islamic fundamentalist groups because of its relation to anarchism (Donaghey 2015, 39). Another relationship between punk and Islam also give birth to Muslim punk that besides playing music they also do sermons and proselytizing in the street (Saefullah 2018). However, it is undoubtedly affected by the area where different parts in Indonesia have their dynamics between punk and religion especially Islam. Punk is seen as unfit into their society because of the strict Sharia Law in Aceh while Muslim Punk exists as a combination of punk and religion in Jakarta, Bandung, and Surabaya.

Besides the two stories of the Indonesian punk above, different punk members recognized themselves as Muslim or they have religion despites many lacks in practicing it in the same place. The difference is coming from the differentiation of individual identity and identity in the collectivities within the punk scene by separating both practices. They are making religion as something individual as they separate it from religious institutions. Total Anarchy band from Bekasi, West Java views that religion is something distant in punk and Aceh punks also share similar views (Donaghey 2015, 42). This pictures that they view religion as not part of their identity as individual among collectivities of the punk scene. They self-identified themselves as punk whenever it is related to the practice of punk. They refer themselves as Muslim outside the scene. It reflects on the separation of practices between being punk and being religious. Donaghey also emphasizes the pervasive influence of religion which some of the punk members as they grew older, they succumb into religion different when they are still young (Donaghey 2015, 44). Thus, religion in the life course of punk life has a different meaning in their young and older part of life.

The stories of punk relation and religion also exist in Makassar, South Sulawesi. Punk in Makassar has its dynamics although it does not have significant exposure compare with their other punk counterpart in Aceh and big cities in Java island. Makassar itself has deep historical relation with religion especially Islam. Islamic values shape cultural practices in Makassar

to some extent. Makassar that has strong ritualistic tradition and strong Islamic identities (Alimi 2017, 124). Islam values deeply entrenched in the cultural perform and tradition in everyday life of Makassar citizens. Although not as extreme as Aceh, Sharia value has been interpreted and contested in the Muslim societies in South Sulawesi (Alimi 2017, 128-130). Consequently, religion influences the construction of South Sulawesi social practice especially in Makassar and impacts its punk scene. In particular, religion influences the experience of punk members in Makassar punk scene throughout their life course as young people. To be exact, the process of their becoming, being, and punk related to the social trajectories they are in are influenced by religion. I argue that investigating punk Makassar scene with their relation towards religion is also important in contributing the explanation of punk and religion studies in Indonesia which mostly concentrated on the extremities such Aceh or Java-centric studies of punk.

1.2 Research Question

To understand the process of punk identity formation in Makassar punk scene through their story and where religion sits in experiencing punk, this research mainly asks the question:

How does religion influence the process of being, becoming, and unbecoming among members of Makassar punk scene?

In order to clearly answer the question, these are the sub-questions:

a. How do punk members in Makassar punk scene conceptualize punk in Makassar context?

b. How do Makassar punk members experiences in becoming punk and the relation to their religious identity?

c. How do punk members in Makassar punk scene practicing being punk in the scene and where religion sits in these practices?

d. Do punk member in Makassar punk scene perceive tensions between religion and punk ideals and practices? If not, why not and if so, how they resolve them?

1.3 Guiding concepts

I am using generation, life course, scene, and identity concepts to help me answering my question and analyzing data that I have. Furthermore, the concepts also crucial in choosing methodologies to generate data, later it also guides me in the fieldwork.

The process of being, becoming, and unbecoming are phases in the life of punk which they experience in their life. These moments of their life is also connected to specific historical moments in their society. Making them share experiences and have shared history that they reflect together that defines a generation (Mannheim 2000/1963 in Narvanen and Nasman 2004, 77). Generation then becomes important concept in defining and grouping member of punk groups in my research and also in interpreting their stories related to the historical moment in their society related to their perception of their punk life including their ideas on establishments, religion, and their other practices. These phases of becoming, being, and unbecoming maps out the life course of punk members in Makassar punk scene as they entered punk in their youth. The experience of phases of becoming, being, and unbecoming are located in specific social trajectories of each punk member in Makassar punk scene. Those social trajectories refer to the pathways of individual and groups concerning their education, work, and family that are elements of their life course (Elder 1998, 1). Each trajectories of a life course has attached a specific role that an individual expected to behave according to the

role, for example, being a student or a husband. The role also gave different meanings to religion in their life. The role informs their identity practices in the phases of becoming, being, and unbecoming punk and differences in perceiving religion. Thus, life course is essential to bring in as a concept to guide me in my methodology and analysis in studying the intersection between punk and religion in different points over their life course.

Another essential part of Mannheim conceptualization of generation is the location where groups belong to the same cultural and historical region (Narvanen and Nasman 2004, 78). Location as space evokes the concept of scene that guides me in my spatial analysis in my writing. As Martin-Iverson suggests "The scene concept has also been usefully employed within popular music studies to highlight the spatial dimension of musical production and associated social practices" (Martin-Iverson 2014, 533). Using this concept, the punk scene can be understood as space where it is associated with DIY (Do it Yourself) practices of musical production and their voice against dominant and repressive institutions that constitute a punk scene. As I mentioned before, the repressive institution is varied among scene and related to the place that they are in. Furthermore, not only the repressive institution but also religious values in the physical landscape that the scene is located influence the values and practices of the scene.

The idea of a scene has its similarities with Appadurai ideas of scapes as means of understanding the changing relationship between social and physical landscapes which are changing by the imagined worlds that are constituted historically situated in imaginations of persons and around the globe (Appadurai 1990, 296–7 in Bennet 2002, 88-89). Values from punk around the globe interacted with the values in the local including religion values into influencing values in the scene. The interacting values manifest in the practices in the scene which time matters in the structuring the practices in the place. This brings the idea of apprehension of time become vital in my analysis as the practices comprise of this timing sense. Further, it brings the idea of temporality which is the apprehension of time that being influenced by the cultural context (Iparraguirre 2016, 617). Concepts of temporality which time and place related to the values in the punk scene is vital in analyzing the factoring influences in the practices of punk in Makassar scene.

The concepts of generation, scene, and life course then weave into the identity of punk members in Makassar punk scene. The analysis in this research base itself in Stuart Hall conception of identity in sociological conception that identity is formed between the interaction of self (inside) and society (outside) that is formed and modified according to continuous dialogue between cultural world and identities that they offer (Stuart Hall 1996, 597). Meaning and values from the outside are internalized in the making of subjective feeling with the places that a person occupy in the social and cultural world as it is historically situated (Stuart Hall 1996, 598). It is also important to recognize that identity is dynamic and a social product that is resulted from interaction which guided by different principles based on culture and those principles are changing over time (Hauge 2007, 46). At times individual identifies themselves socially as a punk in their social interaction while individually religious by practicing their religiosity. Internalization of identity by Stuart Hall and the dynamic factor in identity-based on Hauge making identity is fluid and changing where at times an individual can be punk but also be religious.

Generation, life course, scene, and identity are interrelated in this research as these concepts guide me to understand processes in the life of punk in Makassar punk scene. Generation made me understand characteristics among punk member based on their common historical situation and region. Later on, I can pinpoint the historical moment throughout the life course of punk members in Makassar punk scene and when and where religion influences them. As practices of identity in punk mainly done in the space it is essential to use scene

related to the conception of place for my spatial analysis then reflects on temporality. Temporality as a conception of apprehension of time based on cultural context made me understand where to locate the influence of religion in punk practices in their scene. Lastly, identity concept made me understand the process of becoming, being, and unbecoming as part of the phases in identity where religion interplay with those processes differently.

1.4 Methodology

Generating data from experiences in the form of stories from punk members in the Makassar punk scene is vital to generate answers to questions about the processes of becoming, being, and unbecoming punk. As Hammersley and Atkinson (2007) see that investigating some aspect in people lives requires how these people are finding out how they perceive themselves and the situations they face (Hammersley & Atkinson 2007, 3). Therefore, the ethnographic approach is employed in this research paper to gather information on experiences and emotions that derived from the punk member as they act in everyday life from experiencing personally religion that constructs them as individuals. Thus, subjective experiences as local knowledge and part of localities that interact with the bigger picture in the broader debate between religion and punk. The experience came from the point of historical moments in their life course which I interpret as insights to enlighten the puzzle in my research. As Cerwonka states, ethnographic methods as means in making theoretical insight from the complexities of local specificities that making a critical vantage point to understand the dominant political logic of nationalism and globalization (Cerwonka 2007, 14-15). As this research also tries to gather local specificities that symbolizes the interaction of both religion and punk in the punk musician everyday life.

The specific localities and ethics within the punk scene also inform my methodology including how I do not use formal methods such as survey interview, structured interview, and focus group discussions. Using formal methods would be inappropriate in engaging with punk as the scene. In formal methods, there is a clear distinction between the researcher (who asks the questions) and the respondents (who answer). Most members in the punk scene would refuse the power differential that this implies. To avoid this problem, I use another approach such as semi-structured interview and informal interviewing. These methods make researching less formal and allow developing higher levels of trust.

Recognizing identities and practices are constructed by many factors and the factors intersect in a complex nexus of individual identities, the research will focus on the how individuals are making meaning to their identities as punk, their religion, and religious institution in their surroundings. I also recognize that talking about self-religiosity in everyday life to people something that is uncommon in Makassar society. The uncommon factors of talking religion also inform me the attitude to talk with my key informant and punk members that I met during my fieldwork.

Religion itself sensitive in the everyday life of Indonesian thus it makes me reflect on how much of my informants' information that should be included in this research. Although all of them has given me their consent on putting their names and band names, I feel that due to the sensitivity of religion in Indonesia using real names might harm them. Specifically, for people that separate their religiosity from punk. Based on that reason, I use pseudonyms for people's names and their bands. I use real names for places as I see that it would not directly trace people that have told me their story on religion. Because this place is not solely affiliated to punk but for indie scene in Makassar.

Bringing my identity as a fellow musician has little impact in gaining trust from punk musicians. Therefore, I gained help from friends that I know before coming to the fieldwork to help me engage with punk musician. It is not enough to reach all the punk musician as I

have received several rejections from groups of punk. Seeing me as an outsider, making them wary of my presence. For this, I reach several friends and they connect me to several people and places which acceptance level of outsiders is high. They connected me to punk musician such as Arun, a member of Streets Water Band, Fauzi, a member of The Matraman. Also, my friends refer me to Rockfort and Prolog Art Building as places to observe. By using these connections, I employ methodologies to have information that is divided into primary data and secondary data.

1.4.1 Primary Data

Participant observation

Participant observation involves immersing yourself in a culture and learning to remove yourself every day from that immersion in order to intellectualize what you have seen and heard" (Bernard 2011, 258). Bernard conception of participant observation inspires me to employ this strategic method in the research to obtain data where I immerse myself to the environment of being punk then record their action and stories in the punk scene. In the immersion process, I can get richer information about punk practices directly and their engagement with religion. I used one and a half month to observe places and get in touch with punk communities in Makassar. During my observation, I attend four gigs of punk, one live recording session, and I spent time in two hang out places in Makassar punk scene. This observation enables me to obtain information about their lifestyle, organizing gigs and concert, and their process in making music. Through this observation, I met with older and newer punk generation and had a brief talk with them. Through the talk, I found out that punk in the Makassar scene is divided into several groups and hang out in different places throughout Makassar. The different groups are later reflecting the different conception of punk in the next chapter.

Accessing the several groups is proving to be harder than I initially thought even after with the help of my friend that knows people inside the groups. I met a member of a pop-punk band in one of the gigs that I know long before I went to study in Netherland. He mentions several places that punk groups usually hang out and mention that those groups are particularly doesn't welcome people outsider to hang out with them. It is because they don't want to share information related to the activities within their groups which is at times conflicted with outsider values, for example, drinking alcohol. To some group information on where to acquire alcohol drink and places to hang out is relevant to kept secret. The secrecy is related to how authority sometimes disturb their activities if the public knows. He mentions that sometimes he also feels alienated when comes to different groups that most of the members doesn't recognize him. He advises me to go to other groups and mentioning Rockfort café as places where mostly punk member that has been in the scene longer than him usually hang out. Which coincidentally there will be a gig about supporting fights against Kulon Progo resident displacement there in the next week I talk with him. From there, I started meeting with other member punk that is different from groups that he mentions that rejects outsider in their circle.

The other place that I spent my observation time is Prolog Art Building which is a creative space where musician and some punk member hang out and record their song. Prolog Art Building located in the mall complex near a lake. There used to be gigs and concert held in the Prolog Art Building complex. But due to the one gig where the crowds become uncontrollable and violently damage the area, the owner of the complex become reluctant to accept punk and hardcore band by increasing the money to rent the place for holding gigs. In most gigs and concert, I put myself in the role of participant observer where I participate

as one of the people who join and sometimes helps them with organizing the place. Throughout the observation, I also elicit some information by talking with punk members that I met when I was hanging out in Rockfort café and Prolog Art Building through informal interviewing. Feri, Fahrul, Ayyub, and Mail (they are in their twenties and some are in their thirties) are punk members that I frequently met in both places. Feri and Fahrul are bandmates in Poison of Society that has a live recording session in Prolog Art Building. I also obtain information about gigs and how punk members organize their gigs, especially in the Feri and Fahrul group. Aside from punk member, I also have interaction with the staffs of Prolog Art Building that explain punk activities in there.

Table 1 is the list of punk members that I met and their band names also their relation to both places that I observe. Although I am using pseudonyms, this table will make it easier to identify people who involve in this research. However, more information will be explored in the following chapter.

Table 1 List of informants

Names	Band	Meeting Site	Activity on the site	Approximate age
Feri	Poison of Society	Prolog Art Building	Recording live	Mid twenties
Fahrul	Poison of Society	Prolog Art Building	Recording live	Early twenties
Mail	The Sandals	Prolog Art Building	Hanging out	Late twenties
Ayyub	The Terrace	Prolog Art Building	Hanging out	Mid thirties
Arun	The Street Water	Prolog Art Building and Rockfort café	Hanging out	Late twenties
Fauzi	The Matraman	Rockfort café	Hanging out	Early forties
Efri	The Greencore	Prolog Art Building	Hanging out	Early thirties

Source: informant interview.

The information that I got from observation, I expressed in field notes. The field notes in my research have two purposes not only generating data but also a reflection to choose which person that my friend has a connection with and have the potential to be my key informant. Mostly, I write my field notes after having conversations after they have left the place or me leaving the place. I write them in the paper in my notebook then later arrange them using Microsoft Word program. I realize that using my memory in writing field notes is different from recording which means it is selective memory. But recording while having a light conversation will ruin the mood of people around me as they might be uncomfortable and not as open as I normally talk without any instrument near us.

My observation that is situated in Makassar punk scene reflects differences in the level of acceptance to outsiders. The level of acceptance influences the data that I generated which only a part in a broader context in Makassar punk scene. Having two sites, of course, limits the amount of information on the various punk groups in Makassar. Spending more time in these two places makes have a more profound understanding of the site and the particular groups of punk. Based on the two places that I observe, the places that they hang out are near public places or open spaces where other people outside punk member circulated near the area. The two places also meant to be places where making music is a regular activity. Punk member and people in the places that I met has open perspective on music genre which means not only they know about punk but also about other genres in the Makassar underground scene.

Using participant observation help me understand the relationship between being punk and its relation to the concept of places where religion sits in influencing both. Observing directly helps me understand the spatial structure in the practice of being punk as it is also has meaning to the practices.

Semi-structured interview on life histories approach

I conducted semi-structured interviews with punk members using life histories approach. As I need to have information about their life course that related to moments in the trajectories of their life, interview using life histories approach is the most suitable ones for this research. Life histories approach itself a methodology that is used to understand the experience of other humans in relation to its social contexts where they negotiate their identities overtimes (Cole and Knowles 2011, 11 in Wahl-Jorgensen 2018, 3). The purpose of life histories connects me to the concepts of life course where I can pinpoint the social trajectories of punk members in their life course as young people.

My key informants are Arun is male in his early thirties and Fauzi is male in his early forties. However, they are not the only informants that I have, I also met with other punk members that inform me about their story. They are punk members that I mention in the previous section in my participant observation. The difference is I focused more of my interview with Fauzi and Arun. I don't mention their specific age because in my conversations with them they always refer themselves as early thirties and late forties. I never ask their specific age because it can be quite rude in Makassar culture and can make the atmosphere of conversation awkward. The specific number of age is not essential in my research, but the range of their age is the crucial part so that I can locate the historical situation surrounding them and the life trajectories in their phases of life.

The reason for Arun and Fauzi to be my key informants is because they are punk members that have been musicians in the scene since early generation. Meaning they have been experiencing many processes and changes within the scene. Another reason is every punk member that I met refer me to these two people when talking about they told me about the punk scene in Makassar. During these interviews, I get information on the history of punk and the conceptualization of punk according to them. The most important part is their life stories about religion intersection in their process of them becoming punk and being punk. They also told me not only on their story but the story of their friends who have experienced religious activity in the scene and leaving the scene.

Having Arun and Fauzi as key informants has its limitation. As they are in their thirties and forties means that I rely mostly on their memories to generate data. It shows that I don't experience things that happens in the story. Hence, making it different from observing and experiencing the situation directly. This also means that the stories are being told are selective and a recollection of past memories. Furthermore, it means there might be a phenomenon in the actuality of the past excluded in this process of telling stories. It shows the partiality and the situated experience in having this methodology.

I arrange the interview in a situation that is comfortable for my key informants to tell their experience. The arrangement includes who is present in the interview. Masrad[3], my friend who is also a close friend of Arun and Fauzi also present in most of the interview sessions. Most of the time, there is someone close to Arun and Fauzi present in the interview. For Arun, her girlfriend always with him in my interview sessions with him. While in my interview session with Fauzi, Masrad is always with me. I found that including these close person makes my interview less awkward and they began to accept me to their circle. I recognize that some people talking about your life course to a stranger is not comfortable in a particular situation. I depend on this comfortability because I want them to be open as much as possible, so I can hear more of their story in being punk.

---

[3] Masrad is a friend of mine who is also musician in the underground scene. he also a member of many underground band in the past and present that makes him have a wide network and friend in the punk scene.

Interviewing punk member using life histories approach helps me gather information about their life course of becoming, being, and unbecoming punk related to the historical situation includes what part of the religious dimension they interact with. This method I found to be the most suitable ones because it relates me to the experience of the particular moments in my key informant life. These particular moments picture the relationship between social and cultural context where religion is taking part constructing these and where and when they are in their becoming, being, and unbecoming punk.

1.4.2 Secondary Data

Lyrics

During my observation and talking with several punk members, they refer me to their lyrics and songs. The lyrics of songs that I read is from Kelahi Punk and The Matraman. These lyrics show me that each band has a particular theme during their performance and thought process when musical production. The lyrics also serve as a reference when I did my interview in the punk community especially with Fauzi as a member of The Matraman. In this research, I don't put their lyrics as it would give away their identity connected with ethical issues that I mentioned before. I only describe the meaning behind the lyrics that they gave as it is the vital part that this research needs.

When I try to understand their lyrics, I found their understanding of punk through their lyrics which complement my observation and interview. It helps me pictures the situation and the historical feature that punk member reflects in the lyrics. Through the lyrics I also found a specific issue to be talked about with my key informant and punk member of these bands. The lyrics help me understand the situated condition of their practices of being punk and also reference to the manifestation of their practices of being punk that later helps me answer practices of being punk.

1.5 Challenges and limitation of the research

1.5.1 On being a researcher in the punk scene

I have several friends that have been in the Makassar underground scene for quite some time and some of them have relatives in the scene. This poses an advantage in searching for informants and getting in the scene. However, even with the help of my friend, I couldn't reach or having a connection with a wide spread of people in the scene. Several groups don't want to have contact with an outsider or to be included in the research. The reason is mostly that of the nature of punk that they understood making them suspicious of outsiders and are trying to secure their environment. My informant and my friend also told me that several groups are anti-media and known to not having open to researcher and media. Which then limit my reach in the scene and particular places that I can come in contact with. Although my research initially doesn't represent the whole punk scene in Makassar but having communication with many people can broaden the scope of information that I can get on the actuality in the scene. Having many places to be in the scene can open more information on the relation of places, religion, and punk. After contemplating on this problem, I found that I need to focus on only several places that are open for me and concentrate on making the element of the places to maximize and optimize my fieldwork.

I also found that my identity as research that studies abroad pose a challenge toward making contact with other. As some punk member that I contact with rejects me because of the burden of sharing information that makes them feel inferior. They understood that punk

member that I need to interview is the one who is more knowledgeable than them in the scene. Every punk member that I met mention Arun and Fauzi in their list of names that can help me according to them. I share the list of the names with my friend Masrad. He also mentions names of his friend in the punk scene which Arun and Fauzi also in the name list. He offers to introduce me to Arun and Fauzi as a start because both of them he knows are welcome to other people. I have to rely on Masrad in order to not be rejected again either the reason for me as an outsider or being a researcher.

Later, I found out that Arun and Fauzi are punk members that had been frequently visited by outsiders such as me to talk about punk in Makassar scene. By outsider, I refer to people outside punk member such as media, researcher, and other members in the underground scene. The little amount of time that I have in the fieldwork also influence my decision to focus on interviewing Arun and Fauzi using life history approach. Consequently, making the stories in this research situated in the knowledge influenced by interactions between the social and cultural context that Arun and Fauzi experience. The knowledge that I got from them later I interpret using my knowledge that is partial and situated shaped by my experience as a student that doing research, Muslim, and musician in indie scene of Makassar.

1.5.2 Methodological dilemma

Due to the constraint of time in the research, I have a limited amount of time to build rapport to various punk groups in Makassar punk scene. It limits my scope of reach by which affects the data variation. Moreover, the dilemmatic problem is on memory which both of my informant and I have during this research. I am aware that in this research relying on field notes which came from recollecting memory which selective and throughout the process it doesn't represent the whole events but in those partial memory makes the data and my interpretation become my interpretation through the lens of me as a researcher.

I am aware that the key informants that I have relatively in their thirtieth and fortieth. Their story is a recollection of memory from their process of becoming punk which is again selective and affected by the particular historical moment which is entirely different from the memory of youth punk in the present that I met during my research. Making them further removed on the knowledge of becoming punk as their memory of becoming punk located relatively in their distant past. On the other side, it is rather close to the process of unbecoming punk as they grew older. They have experienced major changes throughout their life related to the influence of religion as they are aging in the scene.

To sum up this chapter, I hope reader enjoys reading this paper as it tries to explain how religion has role the evolving ways of being punk in Makassar punk scene. Specifically, how they experience religion in the process of becoming, being, and unbecoming punk. Chapter 1 has set the stage on filling the general introduction the evolving punk in general and its relationship to religion in punk life. In Chapter 2, the reader will find the history of punk in Makasar and the conceptualization of punk by punk member in Makassar punk scene where religion although everywhere is excluded. In Chapter 3, it tells how punk member encounter punk in their early youth and practices of punk in that period of time where religion is avoidable. Chapter 4 explains religion and its influence in the practices of being punk in Makassar punk scene. In Chapter 5, punk member began to rethink the position of punk and religion and as a process they began excluding themselves to the practices in the scene. Religion overtime has different position in each moment of punk member therefore each chapter in paper looks at religion role in the specific moment of becoming, being, and unbecoming punk.

Chapter 2 **History of Makassar Punk and Religion in early punk life**

This chapter explains the context of Makassar punk scene and the term of punk in my observation and also captures the process of identifying punk where the member of punk in their early stages of recognizing what punk is and what is entitled to. This chapter attends to both time and space aspect where during a specific moment of punk history in Makassar scene, religion is something far from punk.

2.1 The early sites of Makassar punk: 90s and the absence of religion

Sitedness is very important in defining historical features of Makassar punk. Sitedness represent space aspect while historical feature represents time that both are central features of this section to explain punk and religion relation during the 90s. This is illustrated by how the punk tells their history when they first came into contact with punk and sites where they encounter punk. Punk in Makassar began in the early 90s, although there is no concrete evidence when and who brought punk in Makassar music scene. I found that there are many claims on who brought and where did it start. When I am talking with one punk member who looks like in his early 20s in Prolog Building, he stated that punk entered Makassar in early 90s while other also claims that it entered around mid-90s. The difference generally about the different time and which part of Makassar punk enter for the first time. However, the general talk about the history of early punk started in two different sites. The sites are named after the street that these two punk groups always hang out. Those streets are Hamzy street and Sungai Saddang street. Hamzy located near Hasanuddin university and few kilometers from the borders of Makassar city while Sungai Saddang located near the center of Makassar city.

In 1994, Kelahi Punk formed and later become one of the oldest punk band in Makassar, punk music wasn't well known in the early 90s compared to other genres such as Rock n Roll and Metal. One of the band members said that they took Kelahi Punk as a band name because it makes them easy to be remembered and can be easily identified. For Kelahi Punk member, they found comfort expressing themselves through punk music. Punk music makes them feel free. Wearing a bra and even being naked are among of the many things that they have done in the stage. There is a norm of dressing in public according to Islamic teaching which called *aurat*[4], which signals friction between punk and religion. However, Arun said that no one has express discontent in the punk community at the time. I found that religion is not a consideration factor in their punk practice within punk community in the early 90s. Arun told me that punk band in the early 90s focused on their closed environment religion is not taking a huge part in shaping this environment. He said that he never heard story about punk clashing with Islamic community in the early 90s because the focus of the punk society at the time is the repressive authority by President Soeharto.

Kelahi Punk band is band from Hamzy punk group, they identified themselves as punk kampung which has the literal meaning of suburban. They relate themselves to the characteristics of the suburban lifestyle and language in Makassar. Kelahi Punk lyrics and theme

---

[4] This term is a conception in Islam about parts of the body that cannot be shown to other opposite sex, although there is some exception such as wife and parents. It is different for male and female. It is different in different branches of Islam.

characterized by their suburban realities. Makassar and Bugis Makassar local words were incorporated into their words and reflecting their surrounding realities including songs about Bugis Makassar ancestors who were sailors. Hamzy as a place becomes a source of inspiration for Kelahi Punk for their lyrics and music.

Another punk group in the early 90s is Sungai Saddang. Sungai Saddang group particularly enticed by the sound of punk rock music. Their music was fundamentally influenced not only by foreign bands such as Sex Pistol, Ramones, and NOFX but also by local Indonesian band. In my conversation with a newer punk who is in his mid-twenties, he said that The Matraman band from Sungai Saddang group although not using local language, they are reflecting the social condition of Makassar using everyday Indonesian national language.

Sungai Saddang group and Hamzy street group music scene has to be understood as space which localities and other localities interact in some way to constructs, either in the local, trans-local, or virtual as Tironi suggests (Tironi 2012, 188-189). Which means what they called local value is not constructed only by the local but also influenced by other in making the scene. Through the influence of outside the band, they began to form the scene that influenced by social realities around them. Continuing from Tironi perspective, punk ideas and values traveled to Makassar experienced saturation in each site in Makassar punk scene. The prominent example is Sex punk with their Punk kampung. Ideas and values within identities are mirrored and influenced by the time and place factors which transform and reform the identity (Said 1983, 226 in Saxena and Sharma 2018, 4-6).

In a broader context, the early 90s is period that President Soeharto still in power and uses repressive force to limit freedom of expression. The repressive and limiting freedom makes punk flourished, but in Makassar it confines punk members to perform in limited spaces. The usually performed in a closed building and confine Makassar punk only to certain site to perform. Making contact with outside values other than punk is far removed from them because they confine themselves into only their punk values. Hence, religion as part of outside value from punk is far from them when they perform their identity as punk. Only after the fall of the regime in the late 90s, punk site increase and outside value other than punk began absorbed by the punk member.

The repressive political condition in the early 90s limits site and freedom of expression which become most of the theme of early punk band in Indonesia. Focusing on the repressive authority has made religion less relevant to Punk groups in this period of time. Consequently, affecting the punk perception of religion as distant with their punk practices and values. The social and political condition in specific places and time influence early scene and practices within them.

2.2 Finding and conceptualizing punk

Containing punk into a single conception is an impossible task because of its evolving nature. Each of punk members that I met has their own conception on what punk is. Arun, one of my key informants, conceptualize punk as not only fight against establishments but also tries to open to many activities for them to be known including using press media. While for Feri who is a member of Poison of Society band, punk fights against establishments and getting famous is not an essential factor in punk. Feri also said the important part in punk is active in the music production and fight for equality. Both Arun and Feri have a different conceptualization of punk related to should a punk band be known or not while having similar opinion on establishments. Although, the establishment in their explanation is somewhat

vague as they don't refer to a particular establishment such as government or religious establishment.

To punk members that I met, their common enemy is establishment that is repressive which most of the time the establishment refer to government or private corporation. This shows that unless religious institution becomes aggressive or repressive towards their activity or shows injustice action, religion is not relevant in the practices of punk member. It is illustrated by Makassar punk member's march protesting against punk members in Aceh that is captured by Aceh religious authority. Arun told me that he joins the march as it shows injustice by the repressive authority to fellow punk members.

Fauzi, my key informant, told me at one moment in his life, he and his two friends were arguing on political issue and its relation to punk, suddenly one of his friends said that I just came here to make music. Fauzi and two of his friends told his friend to go away. The conceptualization of punk for Fauzi and his two friends is punk go beyond musical production. Punk has to have a stance in the social and political surround them which they put into their punk practices including in musical production. Although they have a different political view, they were together on the part of being political in making music. To them, entering punk means to be political in every practice. It also means that political condition shapes the theme of practices in the punk scene.

In the process finding punk conceptualization, I found that punk members' primary source of discourse in conceptualizing and practicing punk are learning, reading zine, and dialogue between them. They learn from each other and read different zine from other community about other scene then gave birth to different views about taking action in the punk community. Arun told me sometimes he will receive zine from foreign country such as from a punk group zine from Germany. I found that some members of Makassar punk scene also regularly in the past receive such zine in the late 90s and early 2000s. It shows that knowledge on other scene also influence the difference conception in punk member in Makassar.

Another similarity that I found in punk member conception of punk is Do It Yourself (DIY) practices. This conception of DIY spread into how they manage to make their own alcohol drink, supporting their everyday life by printing clothes, selling their band badge. This is also reflected into their musical production as making music for them is to be independent from big corporation and establishment. DIY practices is one of their form of practices that related to being political. The distribution of their music also implements DIY practices. This is illustrated when Kelahi Punk spread their album by going into the street and giving their album to people. They distribute their products by themselves rather than using other distributors. DIY has been the central theme in every punk practice across various punk groups in Makassar scene.

To conclude this chapter, in a specific time in punk history, religion is separated from the site of punk in practices realm shown in the earlier history of punk and in the realm of conceptualization religion is removed. There is friction between punk practices and religious value, but there is no problematization coming from the punk member as they see religion as values outside their reflection of realities. In the realm of conceptualization, I found that religion is not directly mentioned and discussed.

Chapter 3 **Beginning: Understanding Becoming Punk**

This chapter is the story of punk members which they first encounter and learning how to be punk and its dynamics with religion. As the exposure of religion comes first in the family, school, and their surrounding before meeting punk where in this stage most of them are in their early youth which is around their junior and high school student. In this process, religion becomes avoidable or can be ignored in their experience of becoming punk.

3.1 Meeting punk: reminiscing the first encounter and becoming punk in the early 2000s

Music punk is central to punk practice scene as it is not only serve as expression of their social and political views but also how punk members encounter punk for the first time. In the early 2000s, there are many invitations from the high school student association from for punk bands in Makassar to perform in their school. Arun and Fauzi are among punk members that experience this period of time as punk. Fauzi already finished studying in university while Arun still in high school in the early 2000s. In many stories that my informants told me and punk members that I met during my observation, they encounter punk in school festival where punk bands are invited to perform. In early 2000s, school allows punk bands to perform because punk was seen only as music, not its values and what does it conceptualize for and the fashion it brings which I will talk later on the next part in this chapter.

In the early 2000s, Arun told me that punk bands are widely known among teen which regularly exposed to other genre either by media or radio. Arun told me that punk is not the first music that he hears but it is pop bands that frequently appear on television. Later through his classmate, he began listening to punk music. His first impression punk music is the music brings a different sensation compared to other music he previously heard. It sparks curiosity in him to find and search on punk. Later on, he began to search for punk groups through following band performance and meeting them outside the school.

For punk members that I met, their first time entering punk activities are spent doing punk leisure activities. The leisure activities usually are busking in the street, hanging out in abandoned buildings, attending punk gigs and festivals, and drinking alcohol. For Arun, he remembers that he enjoys the activities when he first enters a punk group. Arun told me that Feri, a friend of his age in his punk group has a similar experience in their early process of becoming punk. Arun and Feri who are still in high school in the early 2000s have contact with religion in the form of education subject in their school. Meaning that they already know that drinking alcohol is strictly forbidden in Islamic teaching as Arun himself is a Muslim. In his social trajectories as a student, school as a place influenced by religion offers him religious identity that has boundaries created by religious values. He chose to cross those boundaries in enjoying leisure activities. The process of becoming punk happen to my informant in their early age where they put aside the concept of being religious in the individual level while enjoying the leisure activities of punk that contradicts with the rules in their religion. Resulting, religion is something that is avoidable in their younger days where they are in the process of becoming punk.

Arun in this specific moment of life starts recognizing himself as punk, he began internalizing punk practices that he sees into his sense of self by aligning his perception of being in his early youth as time to enjoy and experience leisure activity. At the same time, the religion that is located in the cultural context that comprises his social interaction in school through teacher is left out in the process of internalization of his being in this particular

moment of his life. Religion and punk identity during this specific time and space are two conflicting factors that make him chose to embrace one at a time.

3.2 Fashion does it matter? Identifying punk

Punk fashion is distinguishable compared to the other subculture in the underground scene of Makassar. Nails, denim jacket, mohawk hairstyle, band badge attached to clothes, and tattoos on the body characterize punk fashion. For some punk, this is important for them to identify themselves. This is mainly true for punk in the early era in the late 90s and early 2000s. Identifying yourself with what you are wearing is important as there is a conflict between genre in the underground scene, the conflict is between punk and metal groups. From the statement of Mail and Ayyub[5] who are punk musicians that started in the early 2000s, you can distinguish yourself by what you are wearing related to what music genre you are affiliated with. Denim jacket, piercing, tattoos, and emblem of punk band are common fashion style for punk member. Fashion in the early era of punk become main important part to identify self as punk.

During the early 2000s, the fashion of being a punk is significant because it symbolizes each punk group compared to today punk fashion. Arun told me that Hamzy groups fashion is different with Sungai Saddang group. It is based on how they are made and from where they buy the accessories. Sungai Saddang group fashion is made from merchandise outlet from other punk clothing outlet which came from other cities while Hamzy punk group made their fashion by themselves. Hamzy group as Arun stated made their piercing accessories from nails and band emblem by themselves. The origin material and who made the accessories also served as characteristics to both groups to identify themselves.

The difference between Sungai Saddang and Hamzy groups also exist when they performed. For Kelahi Punk, extremities in fashion is one of their main identifiers. Kelahi Punk even wear bra in one of their performance and even naked in the stage during their performance. The basis for this is they want to be remembered and satisfy their audience as they want to establish an identity that reflects outside the norm of Makassar fashion. For Kelahi Punk in this early era of Makassar punk attention from audiences is what keeping them alive as a band that they express not only through their lyrical part but also through their fashion during performances. This brought another dimension in viewing the importance of fashion not only as identifying affiliation of punk but also as an expression.

The other part of fashion in punk is tattoo, though it is not exclusive to punk subculture. Several people that I met during concerts in my observation have tattoos. For most of them, they have tattoos around their neck and arms which can be seen normally by other. For them, tattoo symbolizes freedom of their body and also a form of rebellion against the establishment which tries to dictate the fashion in Indonesian life which for the most part influenced by religion. I also recognize that tattoo in Indonesian tradition especially in Makassar is uncommon and to some extent through the process of stigmatization, tattoo refers to criminal and delinquent.

Tattoo as punk fashion made friction with religion as having a tattoo in the body is strictly forbidden as it is hindering the process of the cleansing body in Islamic religious ritual practices in everyday life. The friction manifest in the contestation between 'who owns the body'. As I mentioned before, for punk it symbolizes freedom towards their body meanwhile religion puts restriction towards self-action to body. It illustrated by Fauzi experience in his early youth when he has fight with his parent when having a tattoo. He has to leave his home

---

[5] Mail is a member of a punk band and he is in his late twenties. Ayyub is a member of different punk band who looks like in his mid-thirties. See table 1

for a while in order to avoid a larger fight with his parent. He sees that his father who is a lecturer in one of Islamic university has ties with a religious institution which shows that there is certain upbringing that he has to adhere in the family. Fauzi experience the fact that in order to become punk he has to confront religion through his lecturer and parent which made conflicted pathways. This part of Fauzi's life shows that religion in the process of becoming punk has conflicted dimension in the part of fashion style. There is no sign of comfort between punk and religion during this particular time in the environment where Fauzi lives. Another friction illustrated when Fauzi was a university student, he argues with his lecturer when he colored his hair purple as part of his punk style. Although the argument is not religiously driven, but Fauzi lecturer start arguing as a result of influence by religion. The lecturer sees his hair is an aberration of what is common in Makassar tradition. Coloring hair is not part of Makassar tradition and it is uncommon for people to change his hair color to some extent even parents will not allow it as a branch of Islam doesn't allow self-alteration in bodies including hair.

I acknowledged that Islam as religion is not unitary concerning ruling and restriction there as many variations in Islam as many as punk has variation in its subgenre. Particular Islamic teaching has influenced Fauzi's parent and lecrurer. Hence, Fauzi experience in his early youth has shown that religion has entrenched in the everyday life and integrated into culture of Makassar. There are many contested dimensions between Islam and punk where both are always pushing boundaries to each other (Fiscella 2012, 259). Fauzi's punk generation did not have enough room for comfort or negotiation in the fashion style in his early youth of becoming punk. Religion in Fauzi case has penetrated the fashion ideal of being a student and a son.

To conclude this chapter, internalization of identity is affected by the social context and their perception of their role of identity. Punk members in this chapter began to internalize their new identity of punk, religion in their early youth. Punk and religion as part of their social context create boundaries in each practice during part of their life course. The process of internalization is signaling the process of becoming in their early youth. During this moment they have attached a role of being a student where both punk and religious practices are conflicted. They gave meaning towards their role as a student in their youth as having freedom and enjoying life. Punk offers both meanings to them, and they began entering punk, in effect crossing the boundaries made by his religious identity. Religious and punk identity during this time is not fluid or either combined. Only one identity practice can be done in this process. In their early youth, they perceive religion as something unimportant to construct their punk practices.

Chapter 4 **Being Punk, Intersection with Religion**

This chapter captures process being punk in Makassar punk scene. Being punk attributes the practices of punk as well as the spatial and temporal of places of the practices. The practices in this chapter are practices in their social life as punk including their performance and musical production processes. During these practices, they interact with religion in individual and collective level in the scene. Not only interaction with religion but they also grew older in the punk scene. It further opens a discussion of age related to being punk and religious. Focusing on the practices dimension of being punk reveals specific values in religion that impact how they position themselves in their social sphere. Henceforth, I analyze the interplay of punk and religion in the individual through religious practices, searching for salvation and in the collectivity's practices such as gigs and concert.

4.1 Drifting through religious practices and being punk

Performing religious practices are everyday life activities in Makassar. The numbers of Mosque and church can be found everywhere in every street even in a small residential complex. Although religion is everywhere, the practices to some are excluded in social practices of a group specifically to some member of a punk group. Practicing religious for some punk members are seen as separate activities from performing punk. Separating religious practices and confine it within personal space is what some of Makassar punk members that I met do. They perceive that punk and religion religious world cannot be placed within one sphere of activities.

Punk members that I met perform their punk identity through making music, performing in concerts, organizing gigs, and making zines. For Arun, practicing punk doesn't have any relation to your religious affiliation. In his early thirties, he said that religion is personal and is to be kept in personal sphere when socializing in the punk community. Arun statement shows that some punk members differentiate between punk and religious practices. The separation of practices of punk and religion remarks the separation of identity between being punk and being a Muslim while acknowledging that they have these two identities. The separation is illustrated in Arun and Efri activities where they went to the mosque as part of their identity as Muslim and never talks about religion when socializing with other punk in the scene. Hence, some punk members are drifting between punk and religion spheres in their life.

The thinking of separating punk sphere and religion is stemmed from the perception of religion as a personal and private located in Makassar culture. People are afraid to talk openly about people religiosity as it may give birth to prejudice and some extent lead to conflict. This originated in a history where there is a religious conflict in Indonesia happen in the late 90s and early 2000s and the conflicts affects citizens including Makassar citizens. The consequences is heavy and today even having a dialogue between religion is uncommon and people tend to avoid this conversation. Comparing one religion to other religion is considered an action that could bring harm to the harmony of the community.

Talking and opposing religion becomes primary factor in hindering people to judge other or making religion integrated into punk. Religion for some people is in the domain of personal space. Arun in his late thirties, in my observation and conversation, shows that he changes his identity practices related to the community that he socializes with. Whenever he is alone or with his girlfriend, he performed his religious obligation to pray. In one of my

conversation with Arun in a regular café where punk doesn't hang out, his girlfriend commented that at least he goes to the mosque to do Friday prayer[6]. Arun replies on his girlfriend statement that he is still in the learning process of becoming religious while laughing lightly. I found that he talks openly about his religion when we have this conversation in another place aside from Rockfort café. It shows that he doesn't feel comfortable on talking about his religiosity in punk associated place such as Rockfort café. It further adds places into the separation of those practices. He further excludes religion not only in the practices of being punk but also in space that associated with punk.

Another punk member that I met in Prolog Art Building is Efri. Efri looks like in his early thirties, and he came with his other friend that looks like has the same age as him. He asked to Prolog staff where is the nearest place to pray and went there to pray when I was talking with several other punk members. There is no invitation coming from Efri to the other to pray, which he only asks the place to pray which is different from what my friend Masnir who is not a punk, he invites me to pray. The fact that there is no invitation from Efri is portraying the sense of individual sphere similar to Arun's perception of punk and religion. After he prays, he comes back to us and joins the conversation. His friend beside him is drinking alcohol while talking with him. I don't see Efri criticizes drinking nor he expresses discomfort. Again, when he is in the punk community talking with other punk members, there is no talk about religion and even talk about practicing religion with other.

The fluidity of identity in Arun and Efri are based on the place he is in and what practices he does. As Hauge suggest, the social identity that belong to certain groups making people produce a specific group behavior (Hauge 2007, 47). In this case, Arun and Efri recognize his social identity as punk, and they individually practice their Muslim identity.

When punk members are socializing with each other in the punk scene, they rarely talk about their religiosity to each other. Subsequently, when they do a religious activity, they distance themselves from punk socialization. During my observation in Prolog Art building and Rockfort café, there is no invitation to do religious activities together from punk members. Although in both places, mosque is easy to access in term of distance and even in Prolog Art vicinity there is small space made for praying that staff uses regularly.

Religion present in the individual level where they are trying to reconcile the incompatibility of both practices of being punk and being a Muslim by making them separate. They are not mixing practices in the social interaction with other punk members. Arun and Efri choose to remain in the scene which characterize their being as punk and as they practice religion, they distance themselves from the socialization. There is also no sense of problematization projected made by them in the social life of being punk amidst the number of leisure activities of their friend that is forbidden in Islam.

4.2 Searching for Salvation and Being Punk

In the stories of my informants, there are moments or action in their life of being punk that they reflect. The factors to reflect in their life is many and among them is religion. In Fauzi course of life, he told me that in his 40s, he began to see his early days of punk contradicts an ideals Muslim. In the process of making amends, he still finds himself belong to punk as he still practicing his punk identity through making music and perform in gigs.

One of the lyrics that Fauzi wrote in 2005 reflects his early days of being punk. The lyric is an interpretation of his discontent on the aggressive militant group that reaches Makassar in the early 2000s. The militia group rises in the post-1997 crisis in Indonesia and using

---

[6] Friday prayer is obligatory for male Muslim to do together at Friday noon.

Islamic cause in their aggression (Heryanto 2011, 61). The lyric reflects how he positioned his political stance towards the aggressive power of religion that creates discontent in the social and political sphere in his environment. As a result, he antagonizes religion and reflects them towards lyrics that invites people to stop hoping on religion.

Fauzi stated that the lyrics of his song that he wrote in his early days are inviting his listener to stop practicing one important religious practice. After the statement, he reflects on the concept of *dosa jariyah*[7] in Islam which as a result, his lyrics can be considered as a great sin in Islam. To make amends, he began his quest by reading and listening to Islamic teaching to search for a way to salvation in his late thirties. During my conversation with Fauzi, several religious stories are commonly told by my teacher in my childhood that related to the theme of salvation that he searches on Islam. One of them is the stories of a prostitute that get salvation through feeding a hungry cat in the street. The stories fascinate Fauzi, and he sees that this is the only way of salvation that he can do by making an act of kindness toward others. He told me his story of helping people in the disaster area by representing his working place as his way of practicing his religiosity.

In Fauzi stories, religion finds its way to influence Fauzi's contemplation at a later age through the action and lyric of a song that he made in the past contradicts with the notion of being a good Muslim. Therefore, it has moral consequences, and the only way to resolve this is through religion. Fauzi was a student that has experienced being taught about religion since childhood until university. In his late teens and early twenties, he disregards the teaching of Islam but in his later thirties and late forties his perception towards religion change. He even related to the concept of the average lifespan of a person to Muhammad, a prophet in Islam. Which Muhammad dies in the age of sixty-one. He contemplates that he already spent two third of his life. He said to me that the remaining time he has affects how important salvation in this little time he has left in this world. I also found this sentiment when I was talking with Arun. He said that he is already in his thirties now which means he is halfway from the range of age and he stated that he is slowly learning religious practices this includes his attempt to do Friday pray.

In Fauzi and Arun's life course as a student, they gave meaning to religion as supplementary and avoidable. They rarely mention any religious practices that he did in his early age in my conversation with them. Later as they grew older, the meaning changes as they reflect on his age using religious values. The religion that was avoidable become an important factor in their self-reflection at a later period of their life.

Religion becomes a source of contemplation through the concept of ages and penance shown by Fauzi and Arun reflection on their past action and present perception of their religiosity. I Found that it is different with younger generation such as Fahrul and Feri which started being punk after 2005. In the meeting that I have with them the concept of religion is far from the discussion. The theme of our discussion is the theme of social discontent and DIY practices that they uphold in their group. There is no reflections theme using religious value in their story. This shows the difference in both generations in perceiving religion in the present context. Religion is still less relevant in Fahrul and Feri's life as they are in their early twenties compares to Fauzi and Arun. Thus, age becomes one of the factors that influence the perception of both religion and punk practices. Aging in the scene gives birth to a cumulative identity, which gave form to personal experience (Kaufmann 2000, 103 in Davis 2006, 63).

---

[7] Dosa jariyah is a type of sin in Islam that is continuing until present and later in afterlife because of doing an action that has lingering effect.

Ubiquitous influence of religion is apparent in Indonesia and older age generation is likely to fall into this process (Donaghey 2015, 44). Thus, illustrating a unique relation between religion, age, and being punk that interwoven and accumulates into a reflection towards past self and act of response.

4.3 Places, religion, and punk

Makassar can be illustrated as a crux of modern societies and traditions that is imbued by Islamic values. Hence, punk groups in Makassar also experience the combination in the scene. The scenes were influenced by their surrounding environment where it is influencing the events taking place ((Leung and Kier 2008; Moore and Roberts 2009; Williams 2007; Zobl 2004) in Glass 2012, 697). In accordance, Makassar values and tradition affects how punk organize a concert, gigs, and recording session. I focused more on the physical space configuration of the place where values and institution are interacting with people in the scene which they expressed in temporal manners.

The conceptualization of scapes by Appadurai as scene[8] brings my analysis into the spatial aspect of the scene. It is an interaction of imagined world by people around the globe and localities shaped a scene or landscapes that Appadurai mentioned. The interaction between imagined global and localities then evokes a relation between space and place. Hence, it is essential to conceptualize scene as space that has become place as they imbued with social and cultural meaning ((Larson and Pearson 2012, 245; Calvard 2015, 655; Thomas Gieryn 2000, 465) in Grey and O'Toole 2018, 3). The meaning is coming "through human action, through dwelling, through emotional attachments, through events, and through memories attached to them" (Cresswell 2004 in Nairn and Kraftl 2006, 5). Punk Makassar scene is influenced by changing punk in the global and its members' culture and tradition that attached to their social-political aspect. Therefore, their scene also influenced by the spatiality aspects of the place.

There is a sense of co-existence between punk and religion within the place where they perform their identity. The actions of co-existence are mostly expressed through temporality. Temporality is the apprehension of time in a cultural context which time become one if the subject in the idea of becoming (Iparraguirre 2016, 616). The idea of Iparraguire of temporalities making the notion of time in the concept of Islam in religion expressed in the event where gigs are having a break on praying time.

In my observation in several gigs and concert near that held in residence area, they stop and have a break when there is a sound of Mosque near praying time. Gigs for Kulon Progo advocacy in Rockfort café is an event that portrait this phenomenon. The organizers are from punk members, one of them is Feri from Poison of Society that I met previously in Prolog Art Building. Across Rockfort café, Big mosque can be seen and it sound can be heard clearly from Rockfort café. When I was in the events while the crew of the events prepared the music instrument and banner, the sound of Quran recital from the Mosque can be heard clearly because the Mosque turns on their loudspeaker near the praying time. None of the crew mind or being disturbed the sound as if there is already comfort with the sound itself.

The gigs start with speech and poet reading by people who attend the concert in order to voice their support for Kulon Progo advocacy. I was sitting at the left corner near the stage where Arun and his girlfriend are preparing his clothing printing booth and across me there is a table that can be rearranged so it fits punk fashion merchandise. This merchandise made by the punk members and there are alcoholic drinks that are made by punk members.

---

[8] See chapter 1 section guiding concepts on Appadurai conceptualization of scapes related to scene

This reflects DIY practices that happen within the events where all the stuff that are sold are made by the members to support the events. There are no outsiders that become the merchant or selling merchandise from known corporation. They are practicing their punk activities through the idea of DIY while trying to have a subsistent environment. The area soon filled with people from the punk community which includes musician and fans.

In the middle of preparing the stages, Feri and his friend are collecting money to buy the homemade alcohols that are sold in Kulon Progo gig. This particular moment makes me remember, Arun experience in his early days, where drinking alcohol become leisure activities within the scene. However, there is a difference in drinking that Arun mentions when he talks about his drinking habits in his early days compare to drinking in the gig. He mentions a brand of alcohol that he drinks in his early days in my conversation with him. While in my observation in the gigs, alcohol that they drink is self-made. It shows the evolving practices of punk where DIY practices are more deeply incorporated.

In between the poet reading, the crew announced that they are going to start the music after Isya[9] Prayer. Everyone in the events didn't show any objection toward the announcement. It shows that the punk community holds respect to the practices of religion in their environment. In the performing their identity practices in the community, the structure of the place becomes a consideration. They try to arrange their practices in order not to disturb the religious practices near them. Punk members are trying to co-exist with the religious instrument that is part of the place they perform their identity. It is expressed by starting the music after Isya prayer time which shows the apprehension of Isya praying time as time where having sound is inappropriate.

The act of co-existence is not only happened once in the Kulon Progo events or gigs. In the live recording session of Poison of Society in Prolog Art Building. I was sitting beside the operator of the studio who is the owner of Prolog Art Building, Garis[10]. When it is near the Maghrib[11] praying time, Garis told the band to stop because it is Maghrib praying time. As we have a break, I don't see any punk members goes to pray including Garis. I found that this reflects another influential aspect of religion in the place. There is no objection again in this process as it is normal to have a break in Maghrib praying time even though they are not going to pray at that time. Religion is deeply entrenched in the memory of the people during this process which creates a sense of respect towards religion.

The actions of co-existence are expressed through temporal aspect where they apprehend that religious practices time is important for the religious followers. They resolve this matter by having a break in a specific time based on the time of religious practice. Thus, the sense of time from religion has effect in structuring time of their practices. Religion found its way to influence punk activities in places by making a specific meaning to certain time. The temporal sense by punk members in their practice is not an action to incorporate religion into their identity as punk or perform based on religion. But instead, religion has been an element in the place which has power to influence human action.

There are boundaries and compromising action between being punk and religion in both drinking alcohol and respecting religious institution by limiting the sound of the music. All of my informants mention that the punk scene has problem in finding space to hold gigs and festival. Consequently, protecting their spaces is important and to do this, they try to co-exist with the establishing values and tradition in spaces that they have which includes places within their places such as mosque.

---

[9] Isya prayer is one of five times Muslim obligatory pray for Muslim. It usually starts around 7.30 pm in Indonesia.

[10] Garis is a member of a post-rock band in Makassar underground and indie scene.

[11] Maghrib is one of the five times Muslim pray every day. It usually starts around 6pm in Indonesia.

Figure 1 Makassar Harcore Fest 2018 poster

Source: Masnir (sent through messaging app)

The picture shows a gig held in one of the Christian private university building in Makassar. This portraits punk and places that affiliated with religion tries to co-exist in the manner of accepting and providing places for punk. As shown in the picture, there is a break on Maghrib praying time even though it is not in Muslim environment place. There is a unique relation of religion that even in the place that is not picturing Islam punk still consider the practices of Islam. Religious practices related to time in this case having a break in 17.50 until 18.30 even though it is not in Muslim environment making that sense of timing has become a cultural subject influenced by Islamic cultural context. Although in different religion affiliation place, the perception of time through Islamic values still exist in the punk practice.

To sum up this chapter, punk members gave different meanings to religion through their practices compared to when they still in the process of becoming. As they age in the scene, so does their perception of practices in being punk and religious aged and changes. They began to recognize the existence of religion in various practices that depend on whether the practice is in individual or collective sphere. In the individual sphere, some punk members in the scene began to accept religion as part of them and they began to reflect on its practice related to how they position themselves between punk social life and individual life. In another reflection, religion found its way to an individual through the concept of age that consequently makes them reflect on their present and past practices of being punk. In collective practices of being punk, they began to recognize religion as part of the place they are in. The action then expresses in their perception of religious practices time. Specific time in

religion affects how they structure their practices accordingly as an act of co-existing. Religion in this process of being is recognizable in the individual and collective practices.

Chapter 5 **Unbecoming Punk**

This chapter tells the stories of people who are in their later part of their punk identity. In this moment, they began to have experienced a new social trajectory in their life that influences their perception of punk and religion. Therefore, punk member begins to tune themselves to the dynamics related to the scene and religion.

5.1 Leaving the scene, Unbecoming Punk

Religion in Makassar is near impossible to avoid as the atmosphere and the social world is filled with religion in the form of surrounding sound in everyday life through the mosque, church activities, political talk, news, and obligation toward society, to some extent, invasion of a religious group. Experiencing this atmosphere, punk members began to perceive religion has become more important in defining themselves compare to their earlier life. Thus, affecting how they began the process of leaving the punk scene.

5.1.1 Rejecting Punk Music, Pursuing Religion

In a music scene, it is not uncommon to find people leaving the scene because they prioritize religion over music. Hijrah is a well-known term for leaving music scene that musician to pursue religion. In my conversation with Arun, there is a considerable number of punk musicians that chose to Hijrah since 2011. According to his story, the main actor who has a significant role in this is the movement of Jamaah Tabligh[12] group that invite people to listen to a sermon.

The member of the Jamaah Tabligh group come to the public area to invite people to join their sermon and religious practices. They invite people personally by wearing a turban and long dresses which depicted an ideal male Muslim clothing. Sometimes also they will sit down and talk with people they met in the street or public places. This movement has successfully recruited many musicians in Makassar according to my informants. Majority of punk members as a result of Hijrah leave the scene for good and never listen to punk music again.

Arun and Fahrul told me stories of their friend, Basrul who leave Makassar punk scene a few years ago. Basrul leaves music to pursue religion by attending mosque and sermon in pursuing the ideal conception of being a Muslim. Basrul found that music is not picturing Islamic values and practices which makes it forbidden to listen in his pursuit of religion. Thus, He leaves the scene as part of their obligation to religion. Then, he engages more in a different social circle where in the circle, the members see punk music is not part of Islam. This particular religious social circle becomes a new process of internalization into Basrul self-identity. In his earlier days of becoming punk, he chose to do leisure activities in the punk with Arun and Fahrul. After meeting religion again at a later age through the invitation from Jamaah Tabligh, he chooses to embrace religion and leaving his punk identities.

Through experiencing different social circle, Basrul began gave a different meaning to practicing punk as opposite practices to religion. This means that his self-accumulation of their past punk life began to interact with the new social circle in the process of finding his self-identity. The more he interacts with the religious specific social circle, the more he walks away from his punk identity because religion has change the meaning of punk for Basrul.

---

[12] Jamah Tabligh is an Islamic groups that targets grassroots in proselytizing and spreading Islamic teaching.

5.1.2 Leaving the Scene, being an adult and religious

There are many stories of punk members who are growing punk and ended leaving the scene either as the society is pressuring them through being adult and having responsibilities. There is another story on leaving the scene as a result of having a new role in the society. The story told the relation between being an adult in the punk scene and the responsibilities lies in the concept of adult religious man. Arun and Masrad told me that they have a friend name Isra left the scene when he was still in the same band with Masrad. According to Arun and Masrad, one of the reasons for Isra left the scene is because there are responsibilities that he carried when he married which makes him pursue religion.

I found that through the lens of Arun and Masrad, there are responsibilities attached in being a husband. As Masrad said that Isra leaves the scene and pursues religion after he got married and Arun also nod in agreement after hearing it. I found that there is an influence of religion in the conception of a husband in the family related to the notion of being an adult after married. In Islamic values, the husband is the one who leads family especially in leading religious practices in the family. I am coming back to the reflection of religion in Fauzi stories but in another aspect. Instead of age-related, it is in the social trajectories of marriage. As he began to have a new role as a husband, his perception of religion changes. He gave new meaning to punk and religion based on this new role compared to his past self. He began to reflect his being a husband as part of adulthood into the internalization of his identity.

Adulthood itself carries a problematized term that being contested but to understand the process of Isra, it is imperative to understand that adulthood is "influenced by the processes of construction, transformation, negotiation and recognition of the sense being an adult" (Woodman and Wynn 2014 in Pitti 2017, 1226). He recognizes himself as an adult related to the social construction of his surrounding in Makassar. This then attributes him to specific norms and values that the society expected him to behave ((Mayer 2004; Van de Velde 2015) in Pitti 2017, 1225). Furthermore, being an adult here then intertwined with the idea of being a husband in Islam and its expected behavior.

The intertwined conception of husband Isra's adulthood and expectation it is entitled to brings me to reflect on the concept of role identity. Role identity itself is a process of giving meaning to a certain status that linked to the expectation coming from others ((McCall and Simmons 1978; Stryker and Burke 2000) in Carter and Bruene 2018, 5). He is expected to lead the family religiously as part of his role as a husband through its linkage to the expectation that is made from his social context. Religion influenced his imagined view of his role identity. Hence, he decides to move from punk to religious environment making him embrace his religious identity practices and leaving his punk identities as part of his.

5.2 Punk is in the Heart

I was sitting in front of Prolog Building near the lake with Garis and Masnir when Mail came to approach us, a person that influence the name of this research. Garis and Masnir told me that Mail also a member of an older punk band. Mail told me that punk today is different compared to punk in the past in the middle of his story about his experience performing with his band. From his statement, it shows that as he grew older in the punk scene, he experiences the changes in the scene. He criticizes punk member that only cares about fashion and musical aspect of being punk. We were talking about punk nowadays that filled with teen fans that love the violence in the scene related to the incident that happens in Prolog Building.

As I mentioned in chapter three, fashion in the process of becoming punk is an important identifier in the early 2000s, in the present this conception changes. He told me that fashion no longer an important part in identifying punk identity. The meaning of fashion in punk has changed because of the changes in social context overtime. To some punk that I met in my fieldwork, their fashion is different with punk fashion they used to describe themselves with. They used to have mohawks and piercing while wearing a denim jacket and badges but now I found sometimes they wear casual fashion when I was in Rockfort café and Prolog Art Building. The changes in perceiving fashion are not necessarily them leaving the scene or try to separate themselves with their identity as punk but rather an accumulation of experience which entangled with other factors outside punk. Thus, creates a new meaning in practicing being punk.

As my conversation continues with Mail and Ayyub, Mail said "punk is in the heart" as he concludes his story of being punk and sitting beside him Ayyub nod in agreement. Ayyub nodding shows that they are experiencing a similar situation as part of the same generation. The quotes related to his conclusion about the importance of fashion in punk has changed in the present context. Mail and Ayyub also mentions several bands that said they are active, but they are no longer producing music, nor they are performing in the gigs and concert. However, they say they still a punk when someone ask them about their feeling about punk. The meaning of being punk has changed to these punk members in the story. Practices that used to be important in identifying themselves as punk began to be excluded by giving a different meaning to punk. To them being punk, is not about the practices or being active in the scene but they recognize themselves as punk while actively conceptualize punk ideas and values. They leave the practices in the scene while still recognize punk

In another conversation that I have with Masrad and Arun, they told me about one person that always attend punk community gigs and concert. Although he has Hijrah, he cannot be separate himself with the punk ideas and music. Masrad and Arun said, whenever he attends punk, he wears a denim jacket with punk band badges with while still wearing a turban and Muslim clothing underneath the denim jacket. He is not participating actively in the music and hangs out with his punk friends beside attending gigs and concert, but in his process of unbecoming punk by Hijrah, he still found himself connected with punk. In another story, Arun also had a conversation with his other friend that used to be in Masrad's band. His *ustadz* [13] told him to stop listening to music, but he replies that he cannot stop listen to them as it is an essential activity in his life.

Punk in the stories of Arun and Masrad's friends is entrenched into minds through music and fashion that they have to negotiate in their social life. They began to negotiate the values in his religious identity to accommodate his attachment to punk. I found that this story represents reverse form punk influencing his religious practices. In this process of unbecoming punk, punk came as reflection toward his practices of religion.

To conclude this chapter, I am coming back to Mail statement on punk is in the heart. It shows the evolving conceptualization of punk overtime made by each punk member as they grew older. In the process of making sense of themselves, religion projected its meaning of punk practices which influence the sense of self by punk members. The evolution captures in the unbecoming are on the level of exclusion and negotiation in the practical level of religion as punk values and ideas are deeply integrated into the punk member habits.

---

[13] This term refers to someone who is knowledgeable in Islam and teach Islamic values to other.

Chapter 6 **Outro: Conclusion**

On the surface it seems that the relationship between punk and religion is often antagonistic. Yet in Makassar in which Islam is omnipresent, it is at the level of everyday that things need to be negotiated. In the everyday, they are constantly changing as they have interaction with their social and cultural context. Within this constant change individual members began to give a different meaning to their identity as they grew older in the scene.

Identity is a process which accumulated throughout time that in this research is divided into becoming, being, and unbecoming that different punk member experiences. The experiences of the punk identity intertwined with the religious theme creating dynamics in their life course. Conceptualizing punk and religion complexity in these dynamics becomes a considerable challenge through where many dimensions incorporated into the discussion of in their interaction. Nevertheless, from my interaction with punk members in Makassar punk scene, punk has two core elements that often comes up. Those cores are their fights against establishments and DIY practices. I found that religion only presents into the practices when they are part of the repressive establishment. The focus then shifts into the realm of practices in the scene of punk where punk members in Makassar experienced through their action that characterize their perception of punk and religion as they grew older in the scene.

In a broader perspective, this paper illustrates an interaction between identity in the process of meaning making in everyday life. It shown one tiny part in the bigger complexities in the narrative of being in development discourse. The particularities of punk relationship with religion in Makassar punk scene has helped to understand that identity is fluid and negotiable. The fluidity and negotiation depend on which space and time in individual life that constitutes the meaning of both identities. The dependence of space and time has resulting on several ways in negotiating punk and religion in internalizing their sense of self. Furthermore, to shed lights of a sense of being that evolves in the development course shows that it is important to locate the changes in an individual historical moment in their life.

In my ethnographic inquiry, I observe and talk with many punk members although it is only one small circle of the vast circle of the punk community. Meaning the knowledge in this research does not represent the whole punk community and it also excludes other punk member groups in the process. The small circle represents the location of the partiality that is shaped by specific relation to the social condition of the small circle experienced. Especially in the life course of each punk member that I met as they experience different places that shaped their stories and memory. Hence, the knowledge that is produced in this writing based on those partialities of the small circle and also my experience and knowledge that is partial in interpreting their experience. I recognize that my knowledge is situated from my experience before having this research including knowledge about religion especially Islam and it is also influenced my position as a student.

In the process of becoming punk, most punk members are a student in their social trajectories in their life course. In engaging more into punk activities, they were gradually leaving their religious identity by crossing boundaries made by religion. Punk and religious identity in the late 90s and early 2000s in Arun and Fauzi experience is rigid and not fluid when they were a student. Friction comes from the practices of becoming punk that Arun and Fauzi exposed of. They make sense of what punk is through looking at other punk member leisure activities, even though the practices cross boundaries of their religious identity. They had to choose one identity practices in internalizing punk identity that crosses other. Hence, in order to have a new identity, there is part of the previous identity that they have to leave behind.

In the practices of being punk, religion comes as part of reflection that comes in two ways. First one affects them in spatial manners where they express it in the temporal manners. Structure of the place including its spatial configuration especially if there are mosques or other religious building affects their punk practices. The second one affects them through concept of age where they are becomes susceptible to the influence of religion as they grew older. They reflect on the past and their identities in the present which often, they separate both punk and religious practices as a result. In the period of being punk, they have understood punk broadly compare to the becoming punk. During this process, they began to accept religion as part of their life. It shows that religious and punk identity although not merge into one new identity but exist at the same time making punk and religious identity co-exist. Their conception of punk identity also changes throughout time because they continuously internalize the social and cultural context of being punk in Makassar scene. It shows the relationship between punk and religious identity changes as the process continuously happen. Hence, shows identity is fluid, one can be punk but also religious at the same time.

Fauzi and Arun show that religion becomes a source of reference for goodness and being ideals, they are striving to pursue religion while still being punk while others left the scene. Punk member who left the scene gone through the process of unbecoming punk as the last process that this research talk about. Not only they internalize punk but also, they internalize religion into their identity. The internalization is resulting in a different outcome where they are coming back seeing that religion and punk are conflicted. This time, they chose to leave behind punk identity and embrace religious identity. The decision is affected by particular social trajectories in their life course. Arun and Masrad's friend that enters marriage is reevaluating his punk identity and his religiosity as a consequence of entering this social trajectory. Of course, the social trajectory is influenced by the social and cultural context. In this context, the religious institutions such as Jamaah tabligh member and ustadz in certain branches of Islam created new boundaries that Arun and Masrad's friend has to follow. Hence, it shows that again religion and punk becomes rigid which during in this process they leave punk practices.

Experiencing the process of becoming, being, and unbecoming punk reveals different connections between punk and religion. Social trajectories in the three processes in youth punk course life are affecting their perception of punk and religion. As they grew older in the scene, they gave a different meaning to their punk identity and religious identity. The difference is a result of dialogues between their position in social life and their internalization of identity.

Coming back to Mail statement of punk is in the heart, my interpretation of this the realm of practicing identity within punk is continuously change as it is evolving and mutating, but ideas and values of Punk remain same. For some punk members, friction located in the interpretation of those values through practices of both religion and punk. They resolve the friction by choosing either one as their identity. While other interpretation creates an opportunity to co-exist. I come back to Stuart Hall conception of identity to make sense of this relation. Interpretation of value on punk and religion changes in the place that they occupy as a result of continues changing of the social context in punk members life. As they internalize those changes, they began giving meaning towards punk and religion through practicing both in a co-existing manner or conflicting manner.

Punk members in Makassar punk scene are finetuning their sense of practices to negotiate their feeling toward religion and punk. The feeling is not constant over their life course but rather it changes because they social context in each moment of their life influence the feeling. Religion becomes a rhythmic that flows into their punk life to make sense in navigating their sense of punk identity.

References

Alimi, M.Y. (2017) 'Rethinking Anthropology of Shari'a: Contestation Over the Meanings and Uses of Shari'a in South Sulawesi, Indonesia', *Contemporary Islam* : 1-29.

Bennett, A. (2002) 'Music, Media and Urban Mythscapes: A Study of the 'Canterbury Sound'', *Media, Culture & Society* 24(1): 87-100.

Carter, M.J. and S. Bruene (2018) 'Examining the Relationship between Self-Perceptions of Person, Role, and Social Identity Change and Self-Concept Clarity', *Imagination, Cognition and Personality* : 0276236618792267.

Cerwonka, A. (2007) 'Nervous Conditions: The Stakes in Interdisciplinary Research', *Improvising theory: Process and temporality in ethnographic fieldwork* : 1-40.

Davis, J.R. (2006) 'Growing Up Punk: Negotiating Aging Identity in a Local Music Scene', *Symbolic Interaction* 29(1): 63-69.

Donaghey, J. (2015) ''Shariah don't Like it...?'Punk and Religion in Indonesia', *Punk & Post Punk* 4(1): 29-52.

Elder Jr, G.H. (1998) 'The Life Course as Developmental Theory', *Child development* 69(1): 1-12.

Fiscella, A.T. (2012) 'From Muslim Punks to Taqwacore: An Incomplete History of Punk Islam', *Contemporary Islam* 6(3): 255-281.

Glass, P.G. (2012) 'Doing Scene: Identity, Space, and the Interactional Accomplishment of Youth Culture', *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography* 41(6): 695-716.

Grey, C. and M. O'Toole (2018) 'The Placing of Identity and the Identification of Place:"Place-Identity" in Community Lifeboating', *Journal of Management Inquiry* : 1056492618768696.

Grey, C. and M. O'Toole (2018) 'The Placing of Identity and the Identification of Place:"Place-Identity" in Community Lifeboating', *Journal of Management Inquiry* : 1056492618768696.

Hall, S. (1996) 'The Question of Cultural Identity', in S. Hall (ed.) *Modernity: An Introduction to Modern Societies,* pp. 596-632. Blackwell Publishing.

Hammersley, M. and P. Atkinson (2007) 'What is Ethnography?', 'What is Ethnography?', *Ethnography: Principles in Practice (Third Edition),* (third edn). pp. 1-19. London, New York: Routledge.

Heryanto, A. (2011) 'Upgraded Piety and Pleasure: The New Middle Class and Islam in Indonesian Popular Culture', in A.N. Weintraub (ed.) *Islam and Popular Culture in Indonesia and Malaysia,* pp. 76-98. Routledge.

Iparraguirre, G. (2016) 'Time, Temporality and Cultural Rhythmics: An Anthropological Case Study', *Time & Society* 25(3): 613-633.

Jones, B. and M.J. Petersen (2011) 'Instrumental, Narrow, Normative? Reviewing Recent Work on Religion and Development', *Third World Quarterly* 32(7): 1291-1306.

Luhr, E. (2010) 'Punk, Metal and American Religions', *Religion Compass* 4(7): 443-451.

McDowell, A. (2014) 'Warriors and Terrorists: Antagonism as Strategy in Christian Hardcore and Muslim "Taqwacore" Punk Rock', *Qualitative sociology* 37(3): 255-276.

McDowell, A.D. (2017) 'Aggressive and Loving Men: Gender Hegemony in Christian Hardcore Punk', *Gender & Society* 31(2): 223-244.

Munn, K. (Last updated 2014) 'Indonesia's Radical Underground Punk Scene' (a webpage of ABC). Accessed june 12 2018 <https://www.abc.net.au/radionational/programs/360/indonesias-radical-underground-punk-scene/5919506>.

Nairn, K. and P. Kraftl (2016) 'Introduction to Children and Young People, Space, Place, and Environment', *Space, Place, and Environment* : 1-24.

Närvänen, A. and E. Näsman (2004) 'Childhood as Generation Or Life Phase?', *Young* 12(1): 71-91.

Pitti, I. (2017) 'What does being an Adult Mean? Comparing Young people's and Adults' Representations of Adulthood', *Journal of Youth Studies* 20(9): 1225-1241.

Rakodi, C. (2012) 'A Framework for Analysing the Links between Religion and Development', *Development in Practice* 22(5-6): 634-650.

Saefullah, H. (Last updated 2018) 'Punks are Not Dead in Indonesia, they've Turned to Islam' (a webpage of the conversation). Accessed April 22 2018 <http://theconversation.com/punks-are-not-dead-in-indonesia-theyve-turned-to-islam-93136>.

Saxena, S. and D. Sharma (2018) 'Transformation of Identity as a Travelling Concept: A Case Study', *Interventions* : 1-16.

Stewart, F. (2014) 'Straight Edge Punk-Religious Mutation Or Over-Reaching?', *Diskus* 16(1): 49-67.

Tironi, M. (2012) 'Enacting Music Scenes: Mobility, Locality and Cultural Production', *Mobilities* 7(2): 185-210.

Willems, J. (2014) 'Why 'punk'? Religion, Anarchism and Feminism in Pussy Riot's Punk Prayer', *Religion, State & Society* 42(4): 403-419.