

**International  
Institute of  
Social Studies**



**Rural Youth Out-Migration in Kurram Agency,  
Pakistan: De-peasantization or Cyclical  
Migration?**

A Research Paper presented by:

***Sibth-Ul-Hassan***

(Pakistan)

in partial fulfilment of the requirements for obtaining the degree of  
MASTER OF ARTS IN DEVELOPMENT STUDIES

Major:

**Agrarian Food and Environmental Studies**

(AFES)

Members of the Examining Committee:

Dr Tsegaye Moreda

Dr Christina Sathyamala

The Hague, The Netherlands

March 2018

***Disclaimer:***

This document represents part of the author's study programme while at the Institute of Social Studies. The views stated therein are those of the author and not necessarily those of the Institute.

***Inquiries:***

**Postal address:**

Institute of Social Studies  
P.O. Box 29776  
2502 LT The Hague  
The Netherlands

**Location:**

Kortenaerkade 12  
2518 AX The Hague  
The Netherlands

Telephone: +31 70 426 0460

Fax: +31 70 426 0799

# Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>List of Maps</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>List of Appendices</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>List of Acronyms</i>	<i>vi</i>
<i>Abstract</i>	<i>vi</i>
<b>Chapter 1: Introduction: Contextualizing Rural Youth in Post War</b>	
<b>Kurram Agency</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1. Contextual Background and Problematic	1
1.2 Research Question	3
1.3. Study Area	3
1.5. Structure of the Paper	4
<b>Chapter 2: Theorizing Rural Youth in Farming</b>	<b>5</b>
2.1. Agrarian Question and Conflict	5
<b>Chapter 3: Research Methodology</b>	<b>7</b>
3.1. Methodology	7
3.1.1. Ethnographic Orientation	7
3.1.2. Developing Ethnographic Research	8
3.2.1.1 Positionality	8
3.2.1.2. Household Survey	10
3.2.1.3. Semi structured Interview	12
3.3. Secondary Data	12
3.4.1. Limitations and Ethical Dilemmas	12
<b>Chapter 4: Setting Context</b>	<b>14</b>
4.1. Before Cold war on Era	14
4.2. Cold War Era	14
4.3. War on Terror	15
<b>Chapter 5: Factors Keeping Youth tied to Farming</b>	<b>17</b>
5.1 Early Age Engagement in Farming	17
5.2. Who is Farmer?	20
5.3. Pashtun Tribal Structure and Farming	21

Chapter 6: Factors Pushing Youth Outward	24
6.1. Job Aspiration	24
6.2. Conflict	25
6.3. Types of Migration	26
6.3 Ecological Change	27
Chapter 7: Connections between Off-Farm Work and Farm Work	28
7.1. Remittances	28
7.2. Possibility of Youth Returning (rotation with in Family)	29
7.2.1. Scenario 1	30
7.2.2. Scenario 2	30
7.2.3. Scenario 3	31
7.3. The Left behind Elders, Women and Children in Village	32
<b>Chapter 8 Conclusion</b>	<b>34</b>
<i>References</i>	36
Appendices	40
Appendix 1	40
Appendix 2	62

## List of Tables

Table 1: Interviews (Respondents Ages) Involvement in Farming	18
Table 2: Household Survey (Respondents Ages) Involvement in Farming	19
Table 3: Current and Future Careers of Respondents from interviews	25
Table 4: Major Sources of Income of Respondents from Household Survey	28
Table 5: Major Sources of Income of Households from Interviews	29

## List of Maps

Map 1: Kurram Agency Pakistan	2
-------------------------------	---

## List of Figures

Picture 1: Farmers working in Canal	9
-------------------------------------	---

## List of Appendices

Appendix 1: Interviews	43
Appendix 2: Household Survey and Interview Format	66

## List of Acronyms

FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
ISS	Institute of Social Studies
FCR	Frontier Crime Regulation
FATA	Federally Administrated Tribal Areas
US	United States
UNDESA	United Nation Department for Economic and Social Affairs

## **Abstract**

The last two decades has been the most violent in the history of Pakistan generally and more specifically tribal areas in the North West Pakistan on border with Afghanistan. The continuous unrest in the region has transformed and is transforming livelihoods of the people living there. Agriculture is the major source of income but insecurity, low earning, labour shortage and aspirations for better living out village is creating disinterest among rural youth. This research paper studies contestations of rural youth migration, stay in the context of conflict in Kurram. For that purpose, research focuses on three aspects of rural youth involvement in farming in context of war in a small village in Kurram Agency, FATA. The study explores various factors pushing youth from farming and tying it to rural area. The paper argues that there are various forms of livelihood strategies been carried out by combining farm and non-farm activities. Which indicates that people are leaving farming but at the same time they are also staying in farming. It is evident that youth has no interest in farming and even those who are farming are in term of wretchedness, where youth shift roles inside household, cropping patterns are being changed to decrease drudgery but despite of all these strategies and transformation for the moment rural youth in Bilyamin, Kurram are maintaining farming as only alternative.

## **Relevance to Development Studies**

Youth population is increasing in rural areas of developing countries and most of youth is unemployed. Where recent boom in resource rush and aspiration for mobility is pushing rural youth into urban areas, where they remain unemployed and wonders around. This study focuses on that section of rural youth which stays in rural area continuing farming in order to understand their motivation behind staying, which could be useful for future youth and agrarian studies.

## **Keywords**

Generation, Agrarian Change, Migration, FATA,

# Chapter 1 Introduction: Contextualising Rural Youth in Post War Kurram Agency.

## 1.1. Contextual background and problematique

I was led to this investigative work by my own personal life experiences, having grown up in a rural village in Pakistan and having left the village to study and pursue professional opportunities outside of farm work. In 2011, when I was doing my first Master's degree from University of Agriculture, Peshawar, Pakistan, I noticed that most of my senior batch friends from Kurram who had completed their degree from the same university were leaving Pakistan, instead of looking for jobs in our own country. While I did not wish to leave Pakistan, I also did not intend to go back to the village for farming, as was the case of many other young men from my village of origin. After graduation, I was unemployed for a long time and I started to wonder on the reasons behind this strong wave of migration of youth of rural origin to cities in Pakistan or to other countries, such as Australia. The context of the war also had a strong influence on our lives and helped drive me to the International Institute of Social Studies (ISS).

While the issue of youth migration out of rural areas and youth unemployment in Pakistan is embedded in its own context, it is also reflective of global trends. The issue has been a central point of many studies done by institutions of global governance such as the FAO and the World Bank. For example, FAO (2014) quoting UNDESA (2011:3) report indicates that world population of youth is going to reach 1.3 billion in 2050. Most of them are living in rural areas of developing countries with no formal employment opportunities. Similarly, White (2012:8) also indicates the uncertain directions for youth around the world by sharing a 2006 World Bank report claiming that half of the unemployed population comprises of youth. While in some countries, such as Pakistan, international migration in search of jobs has become a trend, there are also young men there and in other countries that remain unemployed in the cities and continue dependent on their parents, waiting for opportunities to emerge, which has led authors in the last years to describe this contingent with terms such as "timepass generation" (Jeffery 2010:1) or "waithood generation" (Assad, Ramadhan 2008). There is a question that precedes, however, the issue of urban unemployment or underemployment: we must ask why youth are leaving rural areas and farming activities in the first place, and whether this is a continuous trend, or might be a cyclical phenomenon.

### **Will youth leave farming?**

We should be careful with generalizations or narratives of modernization that assume and naturalize that youth in countries in the South wish to leave farming activities and move to urban centres. Certain authors have identified cultural factors and aspirations for social mobility influencing the outmigration of youth. Leavy and Smith (2010:3), for instance, point to the derision of youth against continuing farming as a relevant factor. However, different authors have also pointed that youth might wish to stay in farming, but may be facing eco-

conomic difficulties or intergenerational conflicts in the access to land and to sufficient means to farm (Lucchesi and Proctor 2012:4, White 2012). The issue of exodus of Pakistani rural youth leaving farming activities and moving to cities and to other countries in pursuit of employment needs to be contextualized within the larger issues of directions of peasant farming under capitalism.

This ties back to classical debates on the Agrarian Question, tying back to debates of Lenin and Kautsky on whether capital penetration in the countryside inevitably leads to dissolution of the peasantry in favour of capitalist farming (Akram-Lodhi, Kay 2010). Lenin saw a tendency for dissolution of the peasantry, although with different possible trajectories, being pushed from below as a trend for social differentiation due to competition, or pushed from above through dispossession by force by landlord classes (Bernstein 2010). In this sense, nowadays, both orthodox Marxists and Neo-classical economists conceive that the intervention of capital in rural areas causes social differentiation, creating a class of landless people who depend on wages, who either migrate to urban areas or become wage workers in larger farms.

### **Will youth stay in farming?**

On the other hand, other streams of Marxism and agrarian populism see the possibility for continuation or renewal of peasant farming. Among contemporary views, we can see that this argument in the populist tradition has been further developed by Van der Ploeg (2009) who argues that this contrasts to the early days of the peasantry, where their social reproduction occurred by shifting from self-subsistence to self-provision. He considers “pluriactivity” as important process where peasants engage in labour markets to continue social reproduction. Using empirical evidence from China he suggests that, migration is cyclical, there is an emergence of new farmers coming from the cities into rural areas and that’s not all rural youth migrate to cities, some stay in their farms. He contends that a new way of farming is emerging in response to crisis developed by large scale industrial farming (Van der Ploeg et al. 2014). Different streams recognize that, in the last decades, the agrarian crisis has intensified in the countries in the South (Akram-Lodhi, Kay 2010), with several forces contributing to outmigration of peasants in general and rural youth more specifically, but with different interpretations on the possibility of reversing this trend and possibility of youth re-engagement in farming.

In the case of Kurram Agency, simple narratives or generalizations cannot account for the mobility of rural youth and it is still difficult to identify the long-term trends. On the one hand, many young men are leaving villages to seek employment in cities or in other countries, apparently confirming a trend of de-peasantization. However, looking closer, one can see that these young men often remain connected to the farms but at the same time they are aspiring for lives outside rural area they are waiting for their turn to leave— retaining the possibility to return after some years accumulating income in other places, and with their wives, children and elders still in the villages. Also, the reasons for leaving farm work in Kurram Agency do not only include economic strangulation, but have been closely connected to the impact of war and conflict on rural livelihoods. The case of rural youth leaving the villages in Kurram Agency offers an interesting case in which many different factors are pushing youth simultaneously to



leave but to stay connected to farmland, posing interesting nuances to the debates on de-peasantization and possibilities for continuation of peasant farming in a society that maintains tribal customs, but is also connected to external markets and the global economy.

## **1.2. Research Question**

In this sense, the main question I wish to ask is:

Is there a general trend of youth leaving farming in Kurram Agency, as part of a tendency of de-peasantization?

In order to answer the question above, I pose the following sub-questions.

1. Which are the main factors pushing youth to leave farming in Kurram Agency and migrate outwards?
2. Which are the main factors that keep youth connected to farmland?
3. How do these factors connect to each other? Are forces pushing to leave and forces directing to stay necessarily contradictory or are off-farm and farm work and livelihoods connected?
4. Can we see a clear tendency of youth to leave permanently and for the rural community in question over time as part of a larger movement of de-peasantization?

## **1.3. The Study Area**

Kurram Agency is one of the seven agencies of FATA (Federally Administered Tribal Areas) in the North-West Pakistan. The region is still governed through bifurcated legal system called Frontier Crime Regulation (FCR) and customary laws codified by British at the beginning of twentieth century to suppress Pashtun resistance in FATA. Pakistan after independence, is still governing FATA through same colonial law. Constitution of Pakistan accepts FATA as part of country but at the same time obliterates it to be governed by its own constitution. People of FATA have no access to the Supreme Court and even their representatives in legislative assembly can't legislate for their own areas.

Administratively Kurram Agency is divided into three sub areas, (1) Upper Kurram (2) Lower Kurram and (3) Central Kurram. According to Pakistan Bureau of Statistics (2017) report current population of Kurram Agency is 619,553 comparing to 448,310 in 1998 census. According to Pakistan Bureau of Statistics (1998) 58 % of the population was Suni Muslims and remaining 42 % was Shia Muslims. Kurram is inhabited by many different tribes, among which prominent are Turi, Bangash, Zaimusht, Mangal, Muqbal, Masuzai and Parachamkani. Turi and Bangash tribes follow Shia Islam, whereas all other tribes follow Suni Islam.

The total area of Kurram is 338,052 hectares, in which 19110 hectares is cultivatable. Turi tribe has control over most of the cultivatable land and two other major tribe Bangash and Zaimusht have access to land entitlements in Upper and Lower Kurram Agency while other tribes cannot buy and own land in Upper and Lower Kurram. Overall, literacy rate of Kurram Agency is 34.8%,

which is second highest in FATA. Wheat, rice and Soya are major crops of the area but along with that farmers also cultivate vegetables as cash crops especially tomato. Every household owns two or three cow and sheep.

**Map 1: of Research location Kurram Agency**



Source: Pakistan Bureau of Statistics 2017.

#### **1.4. Structure of the Paper**

This research paper is composed of eight chapters. First chapter is introduction. The second chapter provides an overview of the theoretical framework which is the ‘Agrarian Question and Conflict’ in order to explain rural youth involvement in farming in Kurram Agency. The third chapter discusses the methodology. The fourth chapter deals with the context of the area. Chapter five, six and seven provides a discussion on factors pushing and connecting youth to farming and chapter eight presents conclusions.

## Chapter 2: Theorizing Rural Youth in Farming

### 2.1. Agrarian Question and Conflict

The exposition of agrarian question, which I will use as my theoretical framework, has its roots in Marxist analysis of the process of primitive accumulation in the English countryside (Marx 1876). However, the agrarian question as distinct field emerged within political economy after the publication of three foundational texts, *The Peasant Question in France and Germany* (Engels 1894), *The Agrarian Question* (Karl Kautsky 1899) and *Development of Capitalism in Russia* (Lenin 1899). Engle's agrarian question deals with the political dimension of the social change, whereas Kautsky and Lenin's agrarian questions deal with capital intervention in the countryside (Akram-Lodhi and Kay, 2010).

Marxist scholars' like Engels, Kautsky and Lenin proposed disappearance thesis, which states that capital intervention in countryside leads to dissolution of peasantry by emergence of wage labor and capitalist farmer (Araghi 1995). He further explains that there are many variants inside disappearance thesis. Byres' (1986) reformulation on three problematics provide many paths for dissolution of peasantry. This reformulation was recent intervention in agrarian question debate in contemporary history and context. While progressing Marxist disappearance thesis Bernstein (2009:73) argues that globalization is causing major changes in agrarian relations. Many of small peasants make, what he calls, labor class emphasis (semi proletarianized farmers). These farmers are not completely dispossessed from their means of reproduction, nor they can reproduce themselves. Therefore, this labor class reproduce itself through off-farm activities.

On other hand permanence thesis argues that peasant societies work on their own logic, which resist capital expansion. For example, Chayanov saw peasant production as in itself resisting capitalist expansion (Araghi 1995). The populist tradition has been further developed by Van der Ploeg (2010) who argues for continuation and re-emergence of new peasantry. Contrarily, Araghi (1995) contradicts both school of thoughts and propose his own thesis. He calls it dispossession by displacement. According to which semi-proletarianized peasants in global south migrate to developed countries in the North.

In most part of the world households in the countryside are spending money on children education and migration for long term labor perspectives. However, we see that the youth who are migrating to cities are facing un-employment and under employment and at the same time disinterest in farming (Leavy and Smith 2010:3). Despite being unemployed in the cities rural youth avoid going back to their village, which Jeffery (2010:1) refers to as "Timepass generation", and Assad and Ramadhan (2008) "waithood generation".

Proctor and Luchessi (2012) points out different push and pull factors behind rural youth migration, such as conflict, no proper source of income and political instability and pull factors such as region of destination, wages and demand for workers. Along with that there is section of young farmers who are creating new identity by combining rurality with modernity (Bossenbroeck et al.

2015) and Van der Ploeg (2014) claims that people migrate to cities for accumulation but return back. Similarly, Huijsman (2014) contends that most of youth are aspired to migrate out of the village but there is still a chunk of youth who stay in villages, who are often ignored by research.

Rural youth migration is a central question in agrarian transformation. The farmers diversify their livelihoods as Richards and Peter (2011) has shown in Sierra Leone indicated. They found out that main reason behind conflict in Sierra Leone was embedded in agrarian tensions. Where rural youth had no access to land. Cramer et al. (2011) also contends that agrarian transition is a violent “process of capital intervention there is rapid social change, where terms of accumulation, wealth distribution and the institution that establish the terms are contested”. He further contends that international factors may fan these violent conflicts.

In order to grasp agrarian transformation in context of Kurram, we need to contextualize effects of conflict in agrarian question. Some scholars, (Siddique 2014, Zahab 2004, Rieck 2015:298, Taj 2017) focus on conflict in Kurram Agency with identity lens. Whereas in contrast, I see conflict in Kurram as agrarian conflict while building on Taj (2017).

In order to understand the confluence of external factors in shape of conflict which has shaped and reshaping the political economy of the area in terms of accumulation in farming and non-farming sector, labor mobilization and role of the state. Thomson (2011) argues that “Agrarian conflict as part of agrarian transition as lens focuses on land and on the division of labor in cultivation (including struggles over the technologies through which labor is applied to land).” Studying the agrarian dimensions of violent conflicts helps understand various processes like, youth migration or stay in rural areas, how access to and control of land and labor, as well as financial capital, are shaped by social structures and relations, including class, gender and generation, may lead to conflict or are shaped by conflict

## **Chapter 3: Research Methodology**

### **3.1. Methodology**

This chapter deals with methodology of research conducted in Lower Kurram Agency. The main objective of the study was to find if there is a pattern of rural youth's interest in farming. The focus of the study was the youth which is still in village and involved in farming. I started my field work by conducting household surveys, which Huijsman (2014) indicates that research focusing on outmigration of youth prefer household survey as methodological tool. Whereas, qualitative research focuses on youth is best tool to understand youth perspectives on either staying or leaving the village. For that reason, I combined both methods to understand youth and their parents' perspective on their involvement in farming.

In order to understand process of staying or leaving farming in long term agrarian change it is better to use both quantitative and qualitative methods. Oya (2007) argues that quantitative data do not show detailed picture. In order to understand long term agrarian change process. It is better to juxtapose quantitative and qualitative data. Similarly, household as undifferentiated entity has been also problematized by feminist scholars. Where children and parents have different goals and interests, where they use their agency to influence a decision making process inside household (Huijsman 2014).

Along with these considerations, the research area, Kurram Agency, FATA, is ignored in national data collection and studies. There are no available statistics on the study area, I carried out small household survey of forty households along with eighteen interviews of youth and their parents to understand rural youth involvement in farming. Household data provided valuable information of no of households, their landholding, no of household member migrated and area of cultivation, which provided good background to carry out detail conversation by following them in qualitative interview. I carry out household survey first and then followed it with qualitative interviews. Those respondents in qualitative interviews, which were not selected in household surveys, were asked all those relevant question asked in household survey such as landholding, no of household, no of migrants from household. Both techniques filled gaps in individual technique. It is important to point it out here that this study does not deal with landless farmers as a part of one family which is sharecropper and have land in Afghanistan, all respondents owned land in Bilyamin village.

#### **3.1.1. Ethnographic orientation**

Ethnographic orientation was used as a research technique in order to contextualize my (native researcher) positionality and self-reflection in the research process and to get inside perspective of young farmers toward farming. Here, I build upon the critique of Narayan (1993:676) who critiques the dichotomy of native and foreign anthropologist on the basis of cultural homogeneity. On the one hand she argues that 'a native researcher might have access to valuable information on the basis of his belonging but his professional identity might be a hindrance in his research.' While on other hand Huong (2007:23) argues that research in native area is emotional process which carries the limitation of bias

based on researcher identity and possibly the research might be skewed due to preconceived ideas.

My identity as native researcher and my identity as son of farmer come head into head. While researching a topic which is deeply embedded with my personal life, it was necessary to keep my positionality in check. I used an ethnographic approach by employing participant observation while interacting with rural youth and their parents in different places, location and time of year. They were interviewed during tomato sorting and rice plantation period when prices of tomatoes were low and there was sense of insecurity in the area due to continuous bomb blasts. In this research, researcher sees participants as social actors rather than object of research.

### **3.1.2. Developing Ethnographic research.**

Bilyamin is small village inhabited by two different tribes includes Turi (Shia Muslims) and Bangash (Sunni Muslims). After the war in 2008 the Bangash tribe was swiped out of the village which now constitutes less than a hundred households while before war there were more than two hundred houses. All families in the village come from Turi tribe and are related to each other through kin relations. There are only few schools, and colleges, so most of the boys and girls have studied from the same schools. This village was the most affected village during the war as it was inhabited equally by both tribes before the war.

In my field work, I observed rich discussions inside my home, with my relatives, and friends. I memorize the information and then wrote in my diary later. I only made field notes and participant observation of my interaction with young farmers and their parents in my visit to the farm, in social gathering places, football ground, at a canal de-siltation and in nights sitting with boys at the village ground.

One of my cousin is the head of the canal de-siltation committee. Every night he used to share the full story of their day, while mobilizing farmers for de-siltation of the canal. During my research I did not select consciously any location for my interviews but half of my interviews were in confidential places, meaning on one to one interactions and half were in the presence of other members of the community. As it has been pointed out by Huijsman (2010:61) that confidential places give more space for young respondents to open-up. Something which I experienced when two interviews were interrupted by respondents' elder family members or older more experienced farmer.

### **3.1.3. Positionality**

It is pertinent in terms of the selection of my research topic to reflect upon my positionality as a native researcher. As an active member of a student organization and a political party, I always wanted to understand politics of my region after the war. During my studies in (ISS) an understanding of my region took shape of my research paper topic. Given that I carry different identities as Pash-tun from tribal area, following to Shia Muslim sect belonging to (Turi) tribe, living in between Islamabad and Kurram as an unemployed youth, with particular socialist political inclination, and son of farmer with small landholding, I have preconceived notions and biases toward engaging in farming.

Since, my school days I was raised and warned by my mother to focus on studies, otherwise I will be farming and we do not have much land. Throughout my life studies became my only motivation. Being the only male child in the family for a long period of time, I was not involved in hard farming activities from my childhood except in a few activities associated as children's work like grazing cows, rice plantation, onion plantation, storing grain. Now after completing my first master's degree, my family does not allow me to graze our cows, which I like to do but instead they expect and ask for help in threshing wheat, rice and soya bean crop at the time when I am in the village.

**Picture No 1: Farmers are busy in desiltation of canal (July,2017)**



I left my village for the first time, when I got admitted in the Agricultural University Peshawar. It was the year (2007) when the war started in Kurram. Kurram remained in siege of the Taliban for 4 years. I used to stay in a hostel and visited Kurram, via Afghanistan, when there was peace. After completing my masters, I shifted to Islamabad to search for a job. I got a job for six months but after that I was unemployed. During this period, nearly every family in Kurram sent at least one member abroad. No one went from our family and instead they focused on farming. While other families experienced upward social mobility we experienced the opposite. Which is one of the reasons that make me biased toward farming. Even when I was unemployed in the city, I stayed there instead of going back to the village and work with my family in farming.

During my stay in Peshawar and Islamabad and working with a student organization, civil society, Awami workers party and social media interaction with journalists from Pakistan and Afghanistan, I made considerable social capital, which I couldn't use for my employment but it afforded me prestige back in my

hometown where I acted for many researchers and journalists as gatekeeper to my region, helping them do research in my hometown.

Almost every household in Kurram has at least one member either in Europe, Australia or the Gulf region. So my identity as someone who is studying in Europe was seen as sign of distinction but it was not a new thing for them. My family background in comparison to my fellow respondents mattered more but I do not accentuate that my identity as someone studying in Europe was important, but all I want to say is that Europe was no more alien to them. For example in one of my interviews with a boy, his uncle started interviewing me instead, asking whether I will be able to complete my degree from Europe.

During my field work, I experienced that normally when I was not studying in Europe people in the village would have asked me to help them in their work in the farm but now they were not asking. I personally was also feeling a bit strange, when I went to the canal desiltation, my uncle was working over there and I was standing with camera and taking pictures and talking to people. I heard him, he proudly was explaining to other farmers about my research and the nature of my stay in Europe. However, I felt bad because according to tradition, it is disrespectful for your elders to work in the presence of adult family members. Mainly because research is not considered as work. At the same time I noticed that in many interviews and informal interactions most of my respondents would say, "Hassan you know of that" a phrase in confirmation of what they are saying, which indicated I am not considered as an outsider.

On a different note, I was not able to interview women farmers despite being an insider to the tribe and village. I only interviewed one female farmer, whose sons are abroad, one in Germany and other in Dubai, while the third one is studying in Islamabad. She does farming herself, grazing cows along with other elderly women. Pashtun society is very conservative and I was feeling uneasy to approach any elder woman, as I thought people in the village might think that I have forgotten my values in a period of one year. This is why I avoided interviewing women farmers but informally I interacted with women at home and with relatives.

Furthermore, I noticed that the particular time of my research would also affect my findings. Rice cultivation and canal desiltation are considered heavy work for times when there is shortage of labor. This year vegetable prices and more specifically tomato prices were low. So I thought most of the responses against farming might be because of that and because of the general security situation in Kurram, given that this year there were seven bomb blasts hitting a major town Parachinar, along with two US drone strikes affecting peace and business activities in major towns.

### **3.2. Household Survey**

The sampling procedure used was based on the particular nature of research focusing on young farmers and the structure of Bilyamin village. The village Bilyamin is stretched over a vast area. It is sub divided into small cluster of houses referred as villages and named after the main chief of the kin inside Bilyamin village. Families of the same kin live together at some distance from other kin village. I will refer to villages inside Bilyamin as sub-villages. All sub-villages have different population size, the number of youth and socio-economic status of the



households vary from sub-village to sub-village. For that purpose, I selected purposive sampling method to cover responses of youth from different socio-economic backgrounds, different landholding sizes and the terms of involvement in farming. Another reason for using purposive sampling was that, I was familiar with locality. I selected purposive sampling for my survey as Marshall (1996:523) argues that this kind of sampling is used when the researcher has good knowledge about the study area and select sample on the basis of his research requirements.

Purposive sampling helps to generate valuable rich information based on small sample, argues Patton (1990:171). I employed Patton (1990:171) intensity type of purposive sampling, which is useful in examining major outcomes with less extremes. For that reason, I selected households from all sub-villages in Bilyamin. As being native from the region, I had good knowledge about the region and it helped me to select different farmers living in different sub-villages in village bilyamin. And second reason for selecting purposive sampling was to collect valuable information at limited time, where I spend only one month during my field work.

I will elaborate here the reason for selecting samples from different sub villages. I started the surveys from my sub-village in Bilyamin, which is the starting sub-village. Here, most of the land belongs to one feudal family. Their lands were before cultivated by Afghan tenants and most of our village population was comprised by Afghan tenants who repatriated to Afghanistan. Therefore, the families which are now living there are not their tenants except one or two families. Even those tenants' families have young boys, who are not farming. I selected few respondents from our village e.g landlord and hairdresser.

In contrast, most of other sub-villages in Bilyamin did not had many Afghan tenants before conflict. The reason for that is that most of the families have smaller landholding in these sub-villages. But recently many of the young boys from these sub-villages have migrated to the Gulf region and Australia where they are earning good incomes. These sub villages are more now populated than our sub-village. The war had different effects on households from different sub-villages. Different households from various sub villages are incorporating different strategies to continue farming. Moreover, youth participation in farming varies on the basis of their socio-economic conditions and landholding, which is why I chose purposive sampling to cover different respondents in different sub-villages. I did not go door to door because of conservative structure of Pashtun society and being native I chose to survey my respondents in (Jama) village congregation place or in the mosque or football ground. I used to interview any family member present at that time but most of the time I ended up interviewing youth from the family present at that time during my visit. These farmers are active in farming, they have basic understanding of farming and participate in household decisions.

Household surveys were carried out to enrich my qualitative data. Surveys were conducted in Bilyamin village starting from 14 of July 2017 and finished in two weeks, covering 40 out of 94 households. In my research, I was able to interview only one sharecropping farmer, who does not own land in the village. My survey does not deal with landless farmers due to particular nature of farming after Afghan migration and war in Kurram. The survey was designed in English but I translated those questions into Pashto language and wrote the responses in English and all of my respondents were male. The survey questions were

asked from young boys and adults of the village. The survey addressed following questions (1) demographic and socioeconomic profile of households, (2) access to the land, (3) types of crops grown, and (4) start of farming. The majority of the interviews were recorded and permission was given before recording. Notes were taken too.

### **3.3. Semi-structured interviews**

Semi-structured interviews were used as the main tool for collecting data. The research focused on young farmers' involvement in farming. For that purpose I wanted to focus on young farmers, their parents, knowledgeable elders, government officer, NGO worker and daily wage worker, views and involvement in farming with diverse socio-economic conditions, landholding, level of education, time of involvement in farming and government support for farming.

I used purposive sampling technique, which is normally used when researcher has rich information about research area and limited time. Since, my familiarity with research area and limited time, I selected different young farmers with different landholding, socio-economic conditions and different combination off-farm and farm practices.

I conducted 18 interviews. Out of 18, 10 were young male farmer or their fathers were selected from household survey. Remaining 8 comprised of 1 Agriculture extension officer, 1 NGO worker, who is also PhD student of horticulture and still involved in farming, one sharecropper who has no land in the village, one daily wage worker who along with group young friends come across the nearby village. Other four respondents were either male young farmers or their fathers not selected from survey and one female farmer. Most of the village households were not interviewed during household survey due to time constraint but because my familiarity of the area and usefulness of the cases, I interviewed respondents which were not covered in household survey. So, that I can incorporate diverse practice of different farmers which are not covered by household survey.

### **3.4. Secondary Data**

I used significant amount of secondary data for my research ranging from academic journals, books, Pakistani newspapers sources like Dawn, The News and online magazines Friday Times, Daily Times, Tanqeed and Ghandara RFE/RL (Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty) International and local NGO reports, and census report.

Pakistan conducted census in 2017, which reports are not online yet and last time census was conducted in 1998. There have been no household surveys so far in FATA so far, except one in 2014.

### **3.5. Limitation and Ethical dilemmas**

As the research was conducted in my own village I found it easy to arrange an interview with my male respondents' youth, their parents. I used to describe my research topic and ask for their permission to record their interviews. On other hand I found it extremely difficult to conduct interviews with women. At the time, when I reached my home, I disclosed my topic to women in my house

and I got responses from them but it was more in an informal way. Pashtun society is conservative, where women are considered to be working inside house, where they are supposed to interact only with their close relatives but generally in villages you can find older and young ladies helping their families in farming but it is not accepted to talk to women who is not your relative and even I had no guts to ask people to arrange interview with women, which I could have but I was myself also feeling uneasy with it, which I think being a native researcher a shortcoming. I was able to interview only one woman who was my relative, who is actively engaged in farming.

Though, I would disclose myself as student, still few respondents who were young asked that if this questionnaire is for some NGO program as after war many NGOs have visited our village so people were confusing me with NGO worker as before many boys and girls from our village has worked with NGO and used fill survey form from people in the village. I had similar experience with my interview with Agricultural extension officer. When I introduced myself and my purpose of visit to agricultural extension officer, he warmly welcomed me and provided information about project they have been working on in Lower Kurram but at the end of interview he asked me that if I get any information about free visas to Netherlands then I should let him know or if have any information about who to travel to Netherlands.

I think my Household survey questionnaire was not detailed enough which could have been valuable tool in generating good data. One reason for developing it properly was my limited stay in my village. I had no access to internet in my village and similarly had load shedding problem, where I could not use my laptop all the time. Since, I was using purposive sampling technique, it helped me to overcome my interview with one woman, who is herself farmer and beside that I also used my participant observation and my interaction with my family women to understand their point of view about farming. Whereas, qualitative interview helped me to collect valuable data which filled the gap in house hold survey. I explained to my respondent that these forms are related to my research and has nothing to do with any NGO's. I assured agriculture extension worker that I will reach out to him, if I have any information. I normally used to avoid to interview during work or after the day, where they did not get good prices. So normally I used to interview them in the afternoon, when they would be resting on riverside.

Most of the people used ask that how my research will help them, which I would explain that as there is strong movement going of reforms in FATA, if it happens and they are going to make policies, so recommendations in my paper might help them in solving problem. One of the major limitation of my study was lack of information regarding FATA. FATA is governed through separate colonial and because of more than two decades of insecurity, it is always ignored in data collection surveys. Even in recent 2017 census in Pakistan there has been huge resentment against census in FATA. As many people have been displaced by war into other districts, so current census counted those displaced people from FATA as resident of those districts instead of FATA.

## **Chapter 4: Setting the context**

### **4.1. Before Cold War**

Kurram Agency is agrarian society and most of the people living there are involved in farming. Historically, Turi tribe settled in Kurram in early 18<sup>th</sup> century as the aristocrat tribe and all other tribes were its vassals. It was nomad tribe but once it settled in fertile lands of Lower Kurram. Due some historical changes the tribe lost access to grazing grounds and lands to Bangash and Zaimusht tribes, since then these tribes are no more vassal tribes. They are the only two tribes which share land entitlements with Turi tribe. Land is only sold inside tribe or to only landed tribes.

To secure themselves from raids of rival tribes Turis allowed Mangal and Muqbal tribes as buffer. Since, their status was vassal they could not purchase land, cut wood from forest but in reality they did. Ali (1996) writes that with passage of time, when land did not remain the only factor of production and Mangal and Muqbal tribes started getting wealthier by selling timber and earning from cross border business with Afghanistan, their position changed from vassal and they started encroaching over Turi tribe lands. Eventually other tribes started stopping Turi tribe from using water and forests, which led to struggles between Turi and other tribes and since they have no land entitlements rights according to customary law, this created conflict between Turi and other tribes argues Taj (2017).

People in Kurram are not only divided on basis of tribes but there is also sectarian (Shia/Suni) cleavages. Most of the time, it happens that weaker tribe make alliance with same faith tribe against rival tribe, which has escalated these fights over resources into sectarian fights. That is where Vellema et al. (2011) also tells us that conflict in Mindanao, Philippine is not a religious conflict between Muslims and christens but it has its roots in social transformation of local economy. He locates conflict in uneven state making, control over labor and land.

Kurram Gazetteer (1944) indicates that most of the people in lower Kurram grow rice, maize, wheat and vegetables, though meat makes of the diet of the people. According to document pulses has recently been introduced but people do not like it. It also states that there is decrease in rice production. Most of people incorporates family labor but there is presence of Afghan tenants, who have their land in Afghanistan. People use plough carts. In the peak stage of farming, Afghan workers cross over to Kurram. There is no proper market, demand and supply of crop depends on amount that is produced during the season. According to Gazetteer (1944) apart from farming the surplus population join arm forces and work as construction work around the area.

### **4.2. Cold War Era**

During cold war era when Russia invaded Afghanistan, Pakistan was assisted US by training Afghan Mujahideens and providing safe heavens to them in FATA. There were four Afghan Mujahideen training camps in Kurram at the time of Russian invasion. During the war, thousands of Afghans migrated to Pakistan. Marwat (2005:20) writes that out of 96 refugee camps in FATA, 34

were constructed in Kurram, hosting 347936 refugees outnumbering local people. Taj (2017) in her book *The Real Pashtun Question* points out that Pakistani dictator Zia Ul Haq deliberately stationed Afghan refugees in Kurram Agency in order to outnumber Turi shia tribesmen by Suni Afghan refugees to curtail separate province demand of Shias after Islamic revolution in Iran. This social engineering later culminated in torching and evacuation of Turi tribe from suni majority areas. That is the reason that scholars like Rieck (2015:298) in Post-cold war era see conflict in Kurram with sectarian lens (identity conflict) in connection to conflict in Afghanistan.

Which Thomson (2011) indicates that this shift in depicting violent conflict as identity conflict started trending in Post-cold war era and has lost focus on class and agrarian basis of the conflicts. USAID (1991) report on socio-economic indicates that remittances from gulf countries and farming are the major sources of income. This document says that different markets have been established due to influx of Afghan refugees.

Arrival of Afghan refugees and construction of refugee camps created job opportunities, provided cheap labor as daily wage and also as tenants. Most of Afghans living in Kurram were tenants of local people. Local people dependent more on the work of refugees now. Refugees' influx has ruined grazing lands and forest and has pushed local shia population into minority further exacerbating sectarian divide. This is the reason that Taj (2017) term the phenomenon as forced sunification of area as state policy against shias in home and against Russians in Afghanistan. The report further indicates that there is shift in crop patterns, rice and maize cultivation is decreasing. Whereas people are producing more vegetables and pulses and these products are transported to markets in the country and there is limited use of fertilizers and pesticides.

#### **4.3. War on Terror**

US invaded Afghanistan after 9/11 in 2001. Most of the Al-Qaida and Taliban fighters took refuge in FATA, Pakistan. Taliban reorganized itself by making a sister organization, Tehreek e Taliban Pakistan (TTP) and started attacks inside Pakistan and on US forces in Afghanistan. In 2007, when Taliban made inroad into Kurram, Shia tribes opposed Taliban movement through their villages, which prompted Taliban in recruiting Suni tribesmen against their Shia rival tribe. Taliban capitalized on land disputes among tribes in Kurram and mobilized Suni tribes against shia tribes.

The war between Taliban supported by local Sunnis with Shia tribes started in 2007 and periodically continued until 2011. During this time Shia tribes were in siege by Taliban and suni tribes. More than 60 villages were torched displacing more than 10,400 families and during the siege Shia tribes could not continue farming and changed their livelihood, similarly Suni tribes land remained uncultivated. It is this time period where violence in the region is framed under ethno-sectarian lens. Siddique (2014) frame violence in ethnic Pashtun land from historical period from British colonial adventures to recent war on terror as suffering of ethnic Pashtuns but differentiate conflict in Kurram as sectarian conflict.

Whereas, Taj (2017) do explains extensively various land disputes among suni shia tribes in the Kurram but she concurs that land disputes along with Pakistani state policies in the region is amplifying sectarian differences and frame

the conflict as sectarian conflict. Taj (2017) framing leads her to very childish recommendation, where she advise to not look upon shia fertile lands. In contrast Zahab (2004: 123) refers to it as agrarian conflict. Which seems to be realistic as has been very well explained by Akram-Lodhi (2016) that for Pashtuns adhering to Pashtun code of living Pashtunwali, access to land is important factor.

He says, that Pashtun want to be independent and in order to be independent he has to own a piece of land. That is why he contends that violence in Pashtun society is structural and every brother and cousin fights with each other over land. I argue that this perpetual violence which starts from family extends into clan and then tribes, where different tribes than fight over land and the process they make alliances with clan and tribes with some familiarity. Where in the case of Kurram, sect as wider identity do provide a common ground but in actuality conflict in Kurram is agrarian conflict. Which get escalated due to international politics in the region.

After series of military operations by Pakistani Army and the region for being in siege for four year, followed by increase in migration of youth due to continuous violence in the region and Afghan migrants repatriation to Afghanistan has created severe shortage of labor, which is changed political economy of the region. So in this context, based on my field work, I am trying to understand agrarian question in the region.

## Chapter 5: Factors Keeping Youth tied to Farming

This and following three chapters deal with result of the paper and is structured as follow. The four sub-questions of the research will be answered, one in each chapter, through household surveys and semi structured interviews (Data has been presented and discussed separately). I started my field work with household surveys. My respondents were young and middle aged. Majority of them 15 to 35 years old. All of them are land owners. Farming is carried out as mutual household activity, where all active participants take part in decision making. I term the age group (15-35) as youth—*anyone who has still enough energy to involve in productive activities*. Which is based on local understanding of youth in the area. In Pashto “zanrai” word is used for youth. Which means anyone, who is actively engaged in work or having enough of energy to engage actively in work. This understanding of youth does not adhere to a fixed definition based on age. In this line White (2012) suggests that to understand youth we need to know how youth is constructed and how they imagine themselves. For that purpose, youth has to be framed in larger structure with relational approach, where youth as condition of being stays long. White (2012) further argues that in some countries youth age is stretched to 40 years of age.

In my interviews, I purposively selected male young boys. Because of social norms of the area interviewing female respondents is nearly impossible. Despite of that I was able to interview one actively involved woman in farming. Second, in Kurram agricultural work is mainly done by male members of household. Thus, my target respondents were members of household who are actively engaged in farming and/or they help their elders in farming. The youth, which I interviewed know farming and have all the information about farm. For example, yields, size of land, and production cost etc. My research which deals with young farmer’s involvement in farming and my easy interaction with was the foremost reason for selecting young male who are involved in farming.

Tribal family structures is based on joint family system headed by the male elder. One household consists of grandfather, grandmother, father, mother, sons their wives and children. I conducted my surveys with respondents aged 20 to 35 years. The reason behind that was that mostly youth was available for surveys at the time of my visit to villages. I was comfortable in interviewing youth compared to elders. So, I interviewed mostly youth in my household surveys but in my qualitative interviews, I interviewed youth and their parent (father). The questions asked in surveys were basic and every household had basic information to answer those questions and they did not require household elders to be interviewed. According to my survey, majority of the household are land owners. There are very few households involved in sharecropping thus, this research is not representative of sharecroppers. Only one sharecropper was interviewed. In this chapter I will focus on those factors which are keeping youth engaged in farming. During my field work multiple factors which were contributing to involve youth in farming, which would be explained below.

### 5.1. Early Age Engagement in Farming

To understand the entrance of rural youth into farming, a question was asked in both household surveys and interviews that “when did you start farming?” The age group of household survey respondents was 20 to 35 years. Whereas, the interviews comprised of boys of 18 year of age and their parents (fathers), most of them above 50 years who were interviewed about their children involvement in farming. Beside that I also interviewed one representative from NGO and one agriculture extension worker. In my research, I found out that majority of the respondent answered that question in Pashto as “*Che kala na pe khe bado poi yo*” which loosely translates to “since they could distinguish between good and evil,” they are involved in farming. Which means that they were involved in farming at very early age.

#### **Results from Household Survey:**

Household survey data reveals that families dependent on farming as source of income, engage their children in farming at early age comparing to household with other sources of income. For example, hairdresser community who do not farm and farmers who have more property in major towns and sources of income other than farming. The reason for late entry into farming for farmers whom source of income is from rent, used to have tenants before conflict. After conflict and migration of Afghan migrants, most of the people have to farm on their own. That's why those households with larger landholding are entering farming at later stage comparing to farmers with other sources of income.

White (2018) explain this process in his research in Java. He argues, that large landholders in Java are very few. They invest in non-farming activities and have good jobs through which they control village economy. In my research, out of 40 household surveys, 28 respondents said that they are doing farming since childhood, whereas other 12 respondents mentioned the age when they started farming. Among those 12 respondents, the average age of 8 respondents was 23.1 years and 4 respondents average age was 17 years.

#### **Results from Interviews:**

Similarly, in my interviews data revealed that out of 18 respondents, 16 respondents said they are doing farming from very young age. Which they referred to as ‘since they have gained consciousness. While other two respondents mentioned joined farming when they were above 20 years. Youth in Kurram get Involve in farming at very early age. Children accompany their elders on the farm. When their elders are busy in work children help with drinking water, tea and food or farming tools. Children graze cattle and cut wood for firewood. In one of my interview my respondent (age 34), responding to question of children involvement in farming, he replied that “*in our village Kotkai, the day child is born, he is given spade in his hand and Further he narrated story of his nephew that*” *when his nephew was all day he used to play with spade.*”



**Table 1: Age of Involvement in Farming (Interviews).**

No of Respondents	Age of involvement in farming
16	Below 10
2	Above 20
18	Total

**Table 2: Age of Involvement in Farming (Household Survey).**

No of Respondents	Age of involvement in farming
28	Below 10
7	15-20
5	Above 20

One example of children involvement in farming is use of farming tools by children. Children learn driving wheelbarrow at very early age and helps family in taking vegetables from the farm or fodder for cattle from the farm. There are particular activities where help from children is expected. In winter season children help is used in cultivation of onions, they also help in weeding. The work among children is divided on basis of gender. Where boys help in grazing and rice plantation. Girls usually do cleaning of barn, and they bring vegetables from farm. At very early age girls learn how to milk cows. After conflict and Afghan migration, children involvement has increased in farming. As in one interview a respondent, (age 34) told that *“before in canal de-siltation children were not allowed as it is very tough work but now you can see children are working in de-siltation.”*

Youth in Kurram is engaged in farming from very early age and have basic skills of farming which is considered important by scholars like White (2012:11) who describes deskilling of rural youth as one of the reason behind rural youth disinterest in farming. similarly, Katz(2004:31) also describes in her research by showing, school going children, who are not well prepared neither in farming and nor in other sector. However, in the case of Kurram, I found out that despite of having basic skills, youth has disinterest in farming. The reason for disinterest among farmers is due to shortage of labour after conflict in Kurram. After conflict household put more burden on youth by giving more responsibilities in farming. During my interviews a respondent (age 33), indicated that *“now more young people are farming than before.”*

Which has been also explained by Ye (2016) indicating that children in rural area are used as complementary labour due to shortage of labour. While responding to my question during interview that, what do you call yourself respondent (age 29) replied that *“people call me farmer I have no other designation and I have been farming for last 12 year, so I am farmer”*. My this question was followed by follow up question that where do you see your career in 5 years? He said that *“I have no interest in farming, I want to leave the country, as we have less than 1 hectare of land and I can't sit my entire life for 1 hectare land.”* While inquiring my household survey and interview respondents about their engagement in farming in their childhood. Almost all the respondent agreed that they have been involved in one or two farming activities in childhood but in order to understand their distinction between farming and their childhood work or later involvement in farming, I asked question from respondents in my interview that when he/she decided to become

a farmer (but allow for answers if this is still to be decided), and what drove the decision?

After this question respondent would start mentioning a point from where they considered themselves involvement in farming. This question cleared the ambiguity in case of my interview respondents. For two of my respondents (age 33, 32) from my interviews, it was, when their parent got old since then they started farming. Two respondents (age 31, age 36) from my interviews started farming after the war, when there were no tenants. One respondent from interview (age 20) started farming when his father could not support his studies in city, one respondent (age 29) from my interview said that *"I started farming when we separated from joint family."* These answer lead me to conclude that in case of Kurram external factors like conflict in Kurram along with internal factors plays more important role in agrarian transition. Which is also described by Van der Ploeg (2017) who see it as combination of micro and macro factors affecting development of an area. In the case of Kurram, I found out that confluence of both internal and external factors contributing in creating disinterest in farming. On one hand conflict is pushing rural youth away from farming aspiring for better livelihood in the cities at the same time shortage of labour force created by conflict is also forcing youth into farming. Whereas, their engagement in farming is creating disinterest in farming in long-term.

#### 5.1.1. Who is a Farmer?

During my field work, when I posed the question regarding their age of involvement in farming? I realized that definition of farming was subjective and varied respondent to respondent. Which in retrospect determined answers to the question of their involvement in farming. The response to involvement in farming from both hose hold survey and interviews was mixed. For example, most of the respondents who at least daily engage in one or two farming activities do not see themselves as farmers. In my 18 interviews one of the respondent (aged 29), quoting another respondent, responded to my question that do you call yourself farmer? He said that *"even respondent with (age 32) consider himself as farmer, he puddled his farm without ploughing it first, and can we call him farmer?"* There were many young boys who work on farm with their families but do not call themselves farmer. Respondents during survey and interviews defined farmer as, *"one who participates in every farming activity and has all skills of farming."*

Another respondent (age 28) from my interview said a farmer is one who has all the information about when to plough, cultivate crop, takes care of his farm, irrigate farm on time and has technical knowledge about every aspect of farming. Similarly, another respondent (age 34) from my interview, who was a cab driver in Dubai and now for the last three year he has been involved in farming but yet he do not call himself a farmer. When I asked him that why you do not call yourself farmer. He replied *"I am always dressed in clean, white suit. A real farmer is one whose dress is always stained with mud and always busy in his farm."* According to him farmer is one who is always busy on his farm and his clothes are covered with mud (means hardworking) and have knowhow about farming.

Another respondent from my interview (aged 33), viewed farming as *"like bike chain, you eat and then it goes to waste and the waste is then used as fertilizer in farm. Organic fertilizer keeps fertile farm for four years, whereas synthetic fertilizer only for a month. Those who used simple fertilizer or employ traditional techniques is farmer."* There

were different definitions of farmer by youth in my interviews. In my field work youth from different social background and in current mode of transformation defined farmer on their understanding and few of them despite of full engagement in farming did not call themselves farmers. Which, I concur that different definitions describes presence of different types of farming strategies which is being defined by different respondents based on their socio-economic background and understanding of farming. This variation in definition in definition is also explained by Edelman (2013:2) who argues, that history of peasant definition is very contumacious. He contends, that “normative definitions like above appear to fix object in a timeless way, in practice definitions always change over time and manifest varying degrees of strictness.” He says peasantry is defined differently by historian, anthropologists, activists and normative definition by civil society and other groups.

My research data indicates that the youth is not homogenous based on their landholding and their major sources of income. Which in the process is influencing their understanding of farming and their migration trajectories and future aspiration. Leavy and Smith (2010) also argues in similar line, where they attribute disinterest among educated youth in farming to their socio-economic background and class. In case of Kurram conflict and insecurity, lead youth to migration from the Kurram at the same time it is forced younger generation to join farming with no choice at hand. Which in the process creates disinterest among youth in farming in course of time. Which can be even seen in their way of defining farmer.

## **5.2. Role of Pashtun Tribal Structure and Farming**

Akram- Lodhi (2016:175) argues that it is important to understand Pashtun social structure to understand agrarian transition from subsistence to commoditized economy which in the retrospect has changed social order of the Pashtun society. While explaining Pashtun social structure Akram-Lodhi (2016) argues that “Pashtun society is largest existing tribal society in the world where each individual associate himself to a common ancestor. Pashtun follow code of behaviour which is called Pashtunwali, Which comprises of, hospitality, honour, revenge and refuge.” He argues, that everyone follows this code to earn respect not only for himself but also his family and tribe. Community is valued more over individual. The key to earn respectability and honour is to be independent and self-reliant that’s why farming as occupation valued over other occupations. Those who doesn’t own land is not seen as Pashtun (respectable) by community).

Every tribe in FATA has its own set of traditional laws based on main tenants of Pashtunwali. Most of these laws are oral but in case of Turi tribe it is compiled into a small book called Turizona. Women in FATA are not given share in property but women in itself is considered to be a man’s property and is associated with honour of the family. Cousin rivalry which is prevailing phenomenon emerges from inter family feuds over property are also settled by women in marriage without consent of girl in order to solve the dispute. Women movement is limited to their houses Naseer (2015).

Women are sold as bride prices and it changes with status of women, married, virgin and widow. And then their procedure of punishment if women of different statuses elopes or caught or accused in sexual activity. Tribal council

(Jirga) is the main institution which resolves all socio-economic, judicial conflicts all male and have congregation in male spaces without any women participation. Women are limited to their houses but are taken to farm for help and ignored in share when crop is sold. Similarly, state implemented colonial law in FATA does not discuss women except only one article 30 deals with adultery discuss women but not in providing justice but to give punishment (Ali 2017).

Akram-Lodhi (2016) contends that Pashtuns wants to remain independent and they way to remain independent is to have land or recruit in army. He further states that most of the conflicts in Pashtuns are structural over land disputes. One respectability and power is attached to land. Since women is also considered as property, women can give respect and shame at same time. I argue, that one of the reason to analyse conflict in Kurram from agrarian conflict is that it helps to understand this structural violence in Pashtun areas which connected to land. Which could not be grasped while analysing it from identity conflict lens.

We also see that agrarian transition is also changing gender relations in the area. In my research, I found out that before conflict when Afghans were living in Lower Kurram villages, only aged women used to help families in farming activities like bringing forage for cows, bringing vegetables from farm and cleaning wheat and rice in house. Young girls were not allowed to go outside house. Now since, villages are empty, and there is shortage of labour so, most of the old ladies are now can be seen grazing cows in the village. Young girls now help in tomato crop sorting and plucking.

Women did use to farm before arrival of Afghan refugee before cold war era but they stopped. Now some woman do farming. In one of my interview with woman (age 48), who call herself farmer is widow and mother of three sons and two daughters. Her one son is driver in Dubai and her second son who had shop in village is on asylum in Germany, while her third son is in school in Islamabad. Since her son departure for Germany, she has been doing farming and taking care of family. She told me that, she learned and is learning farming skills from the farmers. One could not expect a woman farming before war.

Where most of marriages are intra family, clan, tribe, and sect but after the conflict girls and parents were favouring those boys who migrated to Australia and or were on jobs in the cities. Those boys, who are unemployed or farming with families had difficulty in getting married. The prospects changed soon when many boys in Australia were struggling to get permanent residence ship, so they could not take their wives with themselves. Now, girls more look forward to marry someone who had good job in the city. On one hand where we see more exploitation of women labour on other hand we see women asserting itself by breaking tribal structures by getting of house boundary and have more power in marriage decisions and getting more economically free compared to before.

During my interviews all of the respondents stated that they have no interest in farming and similarly, all the parents of young farmers interviewed also said they do not want their kids become farmers. Respondents interviewed in my interviews, had different future career goals. Though most of them have been farming for more than eight to ten years, still they considered farming as transitory period or waiting period for proper time to arrive and leave farming.

Almost all of the respondents from my interviews held the view, that when you are living in village you are supposed to do farming. It is our culture, it is (Pakhto) when your family members are working in farm and you are not helping them, you are considered as “lofar”, lazy, irresponsible. So, most young boys, who are unemployed and are living in village or visit village frequently are under social pressure, where they feel they are judged by society for not helping their family in farming.

My respondent from interview, who is (age 32) returned from Dubai, as his younger brother could continue his studies in the city, said *“we cannot leave farming as it is over culture. We cannot abandon our lands.”* He further added that *“if you are living in village and not farming, people notice you and tells you that you are always wearing clean cloths and wondering in village, why do not you help your family in farming ?. Apart from society, your family also put pressure on you to get involve in farming, if any boy do not join farming, he is ignored by his family and society also see him as disobedient and the person lose his social status and brings bad name to family. Those farmers whom land is fallowed, people make fun of them that they are unable to cultivate their land and their land has turned into jungle.”*

Those households which are not dependent totally on farming, they do not grow rice, wheat and soya bean but they do grow vegetables for their own consumption. If someone does not grow their own vegetables, other farmers do not share their vegetables with that household. There is a lot of social pressure around, so in order to preserve honour and self-respect of the family one have to farm.

My respondent (age 31) from interview, who is a young farmer told me during interview that *“most of our land is fallow. After Afghan migration, and war which created labour shortage and unavailability of water, most of our land is fallow and has turned into jungle, every year I plough the land to remove thorny bushes as people in the village make fun of me that your land has turned into jungle. We are not growing anything there but still we have to plough it because of social pressure and also to save the land from further deterioration.”*

During my field work I noticed that major issue in the village was desiltation of canal. Before, every farmer used to have a tenant which used to go for desiltation now since, there have no tenants and they themselves have to desilt canal. The politically and economically influential families who also own more landholding normally they try to make their fellow farmers dependent on themselves which creates a lot of fights inside community. During desiltation farmers with less landholding resist farmers with big land holding social power by not going for desiltation. Farmers with small landholding switched to crops which do not need much water. Farmer with bigger landholding normally hire labour for desiltation and do not go himself.

Oya (2007) also contends that there has been literature about relation of culture and tradition and capitalist relations. While quoting Cousins et al (1992) Oya (2004) indicates that “lineage structures, gender, generational cycles along with capitalist development are important in assessing social differentiation.” Here in case of my research Pashtun tribal structure built on kinship relationship plays vital role in maintain farming. I agree with Leavy and Smith (2010:3) in their proposition that custom and tradition play its due role in some places in curtailing rural youth involvement in farming and in some places they forces them to get involved in farming for example in case of Zambia young men perform bride services. Which coincides with my findings over here. Where youth

is involved in farming because of norm, tradition and culture of the region. Where farming is considered a part of livelihood still prevails.

## Chapter 6: Factors Pushing Youth Outward

### 6.1. Job Aspirations

During my interviews, I inquired my respondents and their parents (father) regarding their future career and results of the study are described in the table below. It was found out that apart from one respondent (age 54) from my interview all other respondents or their fathers want their children to get good education and get good jobs in the cities or migrate to other countries. The respondent (age 54) from my interview said that “*I want to educate my children and want them to become good farmers.*” Though he tried to send his son to Dubai, while his elder son is already in Iran and one of his nephew in Australia.

FATA Secretariat (2013) indicates, that literacy rate in the district has improved from 19.78 percent in 1998 to 25 percent in 2013. During interviews it was found that youth is comparatively more educated in comparison to their parents. One could notice that there are two major themes of aspiration which are pushing rural youth from farming. First, jobs in the cities and second, migration out of country. These different aspirations arises by different factors, which Leavy and Smith (2014) also suggest that aspiration are subjective and are shaped by person interaction with his surroundings. During my interviews, it was found that some respondents wanted to pursue their future careers based on their studies, while other were just waiting to complete secondary school education so that they are eligible for migration to Gulf countries.

In order to understand factors responsible for aspiration of better livelihood, Leavy and Smith (2014) points out, that peers, socio-economic conditions and broader societal changes like financial crisis e.g. 2008 financial crisis and conflict can also play its role in setting particular aspiration. Which was noticeable during my interviews, where recent migration to Australia set examples for youth to leave for Europe. Though, most of the prioritised jobs in Pakistan which, Sumberg et al. (2015) also indicates in their findings that youth is more interested in looking for jobs which is closer to their studies background and forms negative attitude toward farming. This phenomenon is also indicated by Morarji (2014:178-179) in her research in Northern India, where youth through schools and inside home built aspiration for life out of village and sources of income other than farming.

Although, we see that there is growing aspiration among rural youth for better lives outside village but A. Agarwal and B. Agarwal (2017:15) in their recent research in India by analysing government survey, argues that rural youth, especially the educated one, are more dissatisfied comparing to older generation and youth belonging to those households which are better off have less interest in farming comparing to rest. So, we see that comparatively less educated youth is less inclined toward leaving the village compared to more educated.

I noticed during my research that after 2005 shorter boom in telecommunication sector there is considerable increase in unemployment which in 2017 reached 6 percent in Pakistan. Whereas according to (FATA Secretariat, 2013) report unemployment ratio in the area is 7.8 percent. Kurram Agency has highest share of members of households working abroad, which is 25.1 percent compared to other districts of FATA. This is one of the major reason behind youth change in aspirations from seeking jobs to migration. Unemployed youth from

the countryside is frustrated after not finding jobs are shifting to migration. And another major reason is conflict which mentioned below.

**Table 3: Current and Future Careers of Respondents from Interview**

<b>Ages Of Interview Respondents</b>	<b>Landholding</b>	<b>Current Career</b>	<b>Future Career</b>
28	one hectare	Farmer	Wants to go to Dubai
32	2.4 hectares	Teacher	He wants to migrate to Europe
50	2 hectares	Farmer	He wanted to educate all his 5 sons, so they can get good jobs.
19	2 hectares	Student/Farming	Wants to become an Engineer
15	2 hectares	Student	Wants to become an Engineer
19	one hectare	Student/Farming	Wants to go to Dubai
48	3 hectares	Farmer	Her one son is in Dubai, one in Germany and third one wants to become engineer.
35	2 hectares	Farmer	He wants that his sons study and get good job
33	3 hectares	Farmer/Driver	He is driver in Dubai
50	2 hectares	Farmer	His one son in Iraq and another one wants to go to Dubai.
54	Above 4 hectares	Farmer	He wants his sons get good education and become good farmers.
33	Sharecropper	Farmer	He is farmer and wants his children study and get good jobs.
24	3 hectares	Farmer	He wants to have an NGO job
21	3 hectares	Farmer	He wants to go to Dubai
36	3 hectares	Farmer	He wants that his son get good education and get good job.
31	Above 4 hectares	Farming	He is Forest Guard and wants have good living outside village
31	3 hectares	Works at an NGO	He wants to become Professor

## 6.2. Conflict

Conflict along with unemployment is major factor in pushing rural youth from farming in Kurram agency. I have described the context of Kurram in relation to conflict in chapter 4. During and after conflicts farmers were not able to cultivate all of their lands as there was shortage of labour force and farmers could not supply their products to the market and also could not buy farming inputs. When I asked my respondent from my interview (age 54) that do your children have interest in farming? His response was that *“They used to have interest in farming, before conflict when we used receive good output from farming, as they would also receive their share but after conflict now we are not getting good income from farming, so they have also lost interest in farming.”*

Due to continuous unrest, farmers are unable to supply their production to the markets. There is also shortage of labour which has induced drudgery on youth who are active in farming. Other than that, recently Government of Pakistan has imposed ban on selling urea on the pretext that terrorist use urea in making bombs. Which is also one of the reason for low productivity. Due to



insecurity, youth is stopped from participating in entertainment activities which is one of the main reason behind youth leaving the area. Similarly, living in tribal areas, youth is celebrated as brave and responsible for protection of the family during war. Youth is imagined to guard his family during and after war. Decade of conflict has burned out youth being involved in farming and conflict. Which is pushing rural youth away from rural areas by pursuing various types of migration depending upon their household socio-economic conditions. Following are some most prominent types migration in which rural youth in Kurram is involved.

### 6.3. Types of Migration

The confluence of conflict in Afghanistan with agrarian transition has created different sets of migration patterns in the region. Where, we see that that many people migrate to gulf. The new generation is more educated comparatively to their parents. The emerging trend among educated youth after conflict is that they are more interested in migration to Australia, Europe compared to Gulf countries. Those, who are less educated and could not afford to migrate to Gulf, Europe and Australia they are migrating to Iran and Iraq. In one of my interview one respondent (age 19), told me that *"I am continuing my studies, as now a days in Gulf they require taxi driver to have at least high secondary level education."* Since Gulf countries do not give permanent citizenship to people from other places so all these workers return after retirement similarly in case of Iran and Iraq they return when their visa gets expire. Which could be seen as the process explained by Van der Ploeg (2014) in his research in China as cyclical migration. Where older generation returns by sending their young ones to cities.

Whereas, investing in children migration for future accumulation is well noted phenomenon explained by Oya (2007:483) in his research in rural Senegal and considered to be successful long term investment. In case of Kurram these new destination (Australia and Europe) appeared after starting of conflict in the Kurram. Where, people from Kurram started different sets of migration. In current context White (2012:8) reminds us that according to (World Bank, 2006) report half of the unemployed population of world comprises of youth and most of them come from rural areas. This bulge of youth having no source of income in rural areas starts moving to urban areas for better livelihood.

In the case of Kurram, unemployed youth in rural areas, due to decades of conflict has involved in a new wave of migration. Which I refer to one such pattern here as migratory fighters. Where, unemployed youth radicalized after decades of conflict (war on terror) has been recruited by Irani government using shia mythology and giving good salary. They are sent to Syria to fight along with Assad forces against ISIS (Islamic State of Iraq and Levant) and other pro-independence groups (Express Tribune, 2015). We see that local conflict on land dispute in Kurram with confluence of external conflicts e.g war on terror in Afghanistan is affecting labour mobilization patterns by creating migratory fighters. Who fight for money in other countries. This is the reason Cramer and Richards (2011) argues that identity conflict or international conflict undermines agrarian roots of these conflicts. The conflict in Kurram which is pushing unemployed youth on one hand from conflict ridden area to other conflict areas as recruited soldier.

Whereas, many young people during and after conflict migrated from Kurram to different countries. One of the successful destination is Australia. Where many youth from Kurram got asylum. Those who have got asylum have taken their spouses and visit their homes in village frequently but those who are still waiting for asylum, they can't visit village. So in that scenario still it is too early to say anything about youth return to villages or permanent stay in Australia but in fact the money they sent from Australia is sustaining farming as livelihood in village.

Here, we could bring both de-peasantization and re-peasantization debates to describe above migration patterns. Where, Van der Ploeg (2017) would argue by criticising Leninist analysis claiming that "commoditization and accumulation is causing differentiation which creates eventually two antagonistic classes, which then leads to disappearance of small holder farmers." Then he brings his argument by stating that the differentiation is cyclical where internal and external factors both play vital role in development of an area. In the case of Kurram, we saw that external factor like conflict along with internal factors both are playing their roles in shaping various migration patterns. In that sense we can argue that in Kurram both trends exist side by side which is also shown by White (2018) in his research in Java. Where he states that in order to understand existence of small holder farmers we need to see both centripetal and centrifugal forces and simultaneous occurring of both opposite traditions e.g Marxist and Chayanovian.

#### 6.4. Ecological change

After Afghan repatriation and local Sunis displacement, Lower Kurram population is facing new problem in shape of wild boars destruction of crops. Wild boars which people had hardly seen throughout their lives before conflict are destroying crops. People have stopped growing groundnuts and do not grow particular crops like rice or other bean near river bank and near mountains. Almost all respondents considered it as the most emergent problem they are facing after conflict.

It was also noted that after displacement of local Sunnis population, their lands remained fallow. These lands were covered by weeds, which then also affected nearby farms of people who are staying in village. These weeds are decreasing productivity of the crops and farmers require a lot of labour and resources to eliminate weeds in their farms.

Apart from that, respondents in interviews were inquired about regarding ecological changes occurring in Kurram agency. Some of the interview respondents shared their experiences. One of my respondent from my interview (age 31), who works in NGO hails from Lower Kurram and doing Phd in Horticulture and also calls himself farmer told me that climate is changing in our region due to global warming he said that "*before people would have planted rice before extreme summer at June but now people are still busy in rice plantation in July, which was not the case before. He said that old people used say that if you cultivate rice in extreme summer, you will not get good production.*" Similarly, is the case with tomato crop, which normally people plant in March but in March rains starts and stretches tomato crop plantation in at start of April which affects the market as normally Kurram would supply tomato early than other regions but now due to unexpected rains their crop reach market at the same time with other region.

One respondent from my interview (age 33) told me that “*this year in the in winter my tomato nursery was destroyed by chill frost which delayed tomato for 20 days and similarly in summer tomato burned due to extreme hot weather.*” Which was also mentioned by two other respondents that their peas crop were destroyed by unexpected chill frost at the end of winter. One respondent (age 28) from my interview told me that “*in early days people used to harvest soya and it would be followed by rice crop but now due to unexpected rains rice crop is harvested before soya and soy crop destroys in farm.*”

## Chapter 7: Connections between Off-Farm Work and Farm Work

### 7.1. Remittances

While responding to my household survey, 19 respondents, out of 40, said that remittances is major source of their income. It was followed by farming where, 16 respondents out of 40 household surveys said that their major source of income is farming. Similarly, 3 respondents said that their major source of income is from government employment e.g teaching. There is only one household whose major source of income is from the rent received from their shops in market. There is also one household whose income comes from the services by doing hair cutting of whole village and cooking in weddings and funerals. While data from interviews, where respondents were selected purposively. Out of 18 respondents, 7 respondents major source of income was from farming. Whereas, 5 respondents said that their major source of income is from remittances and 5 said their major source of income is from jobs. Only 1 farmer said that his major source of income is from rent he gets from his property in the city.

**Table 4: Major Sources of Income of Respondents (Household Survey).**

Landhold- ing in Hec- tares	Respondents with farming as major source In- come	Respondents Remittances as major source of Income	Respondents Salary as Major source of In- come	Respondents Hairdressing as Source of Income	Respondents as Major Source of Income From Rent	Total
Below 1 Hectare	3	3	1	1		8
(1-2) Hectares	6	8				14
(3-4) Hectares	5	7	2			14
Above 4 Hectares	2	1			1	4
	16	19	3	1	1	40

It is to clarify that almost all the families living in the village Bilyamin are involved in farming. Families still live in joint family structure. Where every household contribute its share, so household income is not limited only to one source of income. There is combination of farming, remittances, salary, rents and cross border trade with Afghanistan. But, in my household survey respondents' priorities one source of income as the major source over other sources of incomes.

Historically, people living in the Kurram were involved in non-farming activities for self-provision such as cross border trade, migration to other countries and recruitment in army. It was never the case that families in Kurram were totally dependent on farming. Farmers combination of farm and off-farm activities is considered is new phenomenon by Van der Ploeg (2010) who argues that it is new process, where farmers to reproduce themselves shift from self-con-

sumption to self-provision. He terms this process as pulri-activity. Farmers cannot survive on one source of income, so they combine farming with non-farming activities. Data from the household survey and interviews reveals, that majority of the respondents dependent on non-farm income sources. In particular dependence on remittances compared to other sources of income is increasing. Oya (2007) found similar patterns in rural Senegal. He explains this phenomenon that farmers switch from non-productive to more productive sites of accumulations.

**Table 5: Major Sources of Income of Respondents (Interviews).**

Landholding (Hectares)	No of Respondents	Respondents Sources of Income			
		Farming	Remittances	Salary	Rent
(1-2) Hectares	5	2	2	1	
(3-4) Hectares	9	2	3	4	
Above 4 hectares	2	1	-	-	1
Share cropper	1	1	-	-	
Daily wage worker	1	-	-	1	
Total	18	6	5	6	1

Diversification of income sources is a viable and realistic strategy to survive in current era of globalization, while farmers are facing double squeeze. On one hand young farmers are migrating from their village from, on the other hand they can't earn their livelihood in prevailing informal economy. To survive they must invent new ways of living, which they are doing as stated above. The household survey data reveals that most of the households have two to three persons abroad read (male members of the family), particularly in Gulf countries. Most of these migrants are young boys as cultural norms in the country discourage migration of female members. Furthermore, female migration solely for economic reasons is also discouraged by government of Pakistan as Hassan and Raza (2009) has argued.

Out migration is one of the successful strategy in the area for the farmers to reproduce themselves through the remittances. Households which are dependent more on remittances are reproducing themselves better than other households, which are more dependent on farming. There has been different migration strategies, which will be explained below.

## **7.2. Possibility of youth returning (rotation within family)**

Kurram Gazetteer (1908) mentions that most of the people in Kurram at that period most of the locals were involved in family farming and along with that they also joined army as source of income. Most of the families used to employ family labour in farming except peak stages of farming. These patterns changed which is indicated by USAID (1991) report indicating that after arrival of Afghan refugees due to Russian invasion of Afghanistan and construction of refugee camps in the Kurram provided jobs to local people. New markets were

constructed and many local people started migration to Gulf countries at that time. During 80's and 90's, each household have at least one person in gulf countries. The responses from the interviews (all) indicated that most of the people from Kurram Agency have migrated to Gulf countries starting from early 80's till early 2000.

Each household in Kurram now have two to three young left behind to take care of family and land. According to FATA Secretariat (2013) report Kurram Agency leads in migration abroad which is 25.1 percent. According to gulf countries law an individual no matter how long he or she lives in gulf, they do not give citizenship, so those migrants from Kurram, who are working in gulf countries do return back to their village after retirement. In my interviews and house hold surveys, I found out that family members rotate their responsibilities as survival strategy. One or two brothers stay in village working on the farm while his other siblings are out of the village for work or studies. When one of them returns than the one who is staying behind leave to pursue his long term career goal. In my interviews with three boys, one who is actively engaged in farming and other one came three years ago from Dubai, and the third one came from city and planning to leave and support his family.

These changes have been explained by Huijsman (2014) in his work in South East Asia. He argues, that migration is important manifestation of house holding and it never operates in isolation to other aspects of house holding. He presents while house holding as influx shows two moves behind it. First, Chayanovian concept of household in development and second one internal concept of house hold in local context affected by external dimension. In the case of Kuram it is conflict and unemployment in the region effecting households.

### 7.2.1 Scenario 1

Respondent of my interview (age 28), is the youngest among three brothers and he has two sisters. His father for the last 20 years has been in Gulf and work as driver. When, I asked respondent (age 28) that when did you start farming? He told me that "*when we got separated from joint family.*" When the respondent's elder brother left for college into city, respondent of my interview and his second brother were involved in farming. With course of two years his second brother also left for city to continue his college, now respondent of my interview was doing farming on his own while continuing his studies in village. But when his elder brother completed his studies and return to village. Respondent of my interview, left for the city and his second brother also came back to village and started farming. Now currently, respondent of my interview's elder brother is lecturer and teaching at college out of town, but when he visit his village he assist respondent. Whereas his second brother has again left for the city for further studies. The respondent has returned to farming once again.

### 7.2.2 Scenario 2

Similarly, my second respondent (age 36), who came from Dubai and is now doing farming. He is the elder among 6 brothers. His father migrated to Dubai but later he brought him as he is elder and later his another brother and his father went back to Pakistan. They own a house in Peshawar. Their half family lives in village and half in the Peshawar. His younger two brother lives in

Peshawar, where one just completed his higher secondary education and now he is looking for job or might started for business as according to respondent of my interview *"my brother is not interested in going to Gulf, he only wants to go to either Europe or Australia."* While his other three brothers are drivers in gulf just like respondent himself. Respondent of my interview brought his brother, who has completed his studies from Peshawar to help him in rice plantation season. Similarly one of his brother from Dubai was coming to village on vacations, where now he will stay in village and respondent of my interview has already planned leaving next month.

Interviews and survey data also indicates that although many households are dependent on farming they have not left farming but still engaged in farming and spend a huge amount earned from remittances on farming. All respondents during the interviews indicated that if one compares the amount which farmers spent on farming to the price of food at the market, the prices at market are comparatively lower than food produced by farmers.

### 7.2.3 Scenario 3

Respondent of my interview (age 21), who was studying in city but he could not afford his fee. So, he return back to village and enrolled in village school. His father owns 16 sheep and 5 cows. He told me that *"before war we had only 4 sheep. There was no place for grazing before they could not keep more sheep."* Respondent of my interview family also sell butter, Ghee and eggs. He further told me that every year they sell 3, 4 sheep and one sheep cost between 30 to 35 thousand Pakistan rupees which is equal to 28.47 to 32.51 US \$. Now there is demand for meat in Afghanistan, which provide good prospects for famers where they sell their livestock at very high rate. He added that *"I am waiting to complete my school, than I will leave for Dubai."*

While, providing three different examples of survival strategies in post conflict Kurram, we see that families are combining different off farm and farm strategies to survive. We see that youth is aspiring to leave the village but at same time they also want to farm though they are not interested in farming. From literature on youth interest in farming e.g White (2015:332) argues that youth which leaves villages for period of time, do return back when they earn money and along with that Berckmose and White (2014:200) also indicates that in case of post war Burundi that youth have interest in farming.

In contrast, in this study we see that in post conflict Kurram the youth being involved in farming is fed up with farming and planning to leave. The previous generation of migrants who migrated to Gulf countries are coming back and getting involved in farming but in contrast the recent migration to Europe and Australia, we do not know if they will return as unlike gulf, where they do not get citizenship, in Europe and Australia they are getting permanent residence.

This process has been debated among scholars such as Bernstein (2009) terms it agrarian question of semi proletariat labour which he calls labour class. Where capital is unable to accommodate labour. So he frames his agrarian question as of labour. Similarly, Araghi (1995) refers to it as dispossession by displacement, where labour migrates to other places without disposed from his land. Whereas, Van der Ploeg (2014) describe it as cyclical migration of youth

from rural areas. We see that different sets of labour regime are prevalent in the same region. Where on one hand some respondents are employing family farming to bring the prices down on other hand some farmers are hire more labour and also tenancy structures are changing which do indicates that capitalist relations are intensifying creating further differentiation among farmers, forcing various classes of farmers to pursue different strategies to survive.

White (2018) also suggest that pluriactivity varies across the farmers and it is related to various factors as land access, income, education and gender. He argues for occurrence of both trends de-peasantization and re-peasantization are at same time. Whereas, as has been mentioned above farmers still use combination of farming and non-farming activities to reproduce themselves so in this context we can say that forces directing to push and forces trying to tie are complicated some are contradictory e.g. job aspiration and some are not e.g. conflict. Whereas off-farm and farms livelihoods are connected.

### **7.3. The Left behind Elder, Women and Children in the Village.**

Ye et al. (2016) contends that “research into rural–urban migration in developing countries has been mainly concerned with its effects on urban economies and agricultural and non-agricultural development in rural areas through the investment of remittances. Considerably less attention has been paid to the social effects of a split family life.” As has been explained above that every family leaves behind two three men, who rotate their responsibilities in order to take care of their elders, women and children in Kurram. During my interviews when I inquired my respondents that who does more work, men or women? All the respondents replied that especially after conflict, women has been doing more work than men. Many elder women now graze cows, help their families in sorting tomatoes which they did not do before conflict. In one of my interview with a woman (age 48) who calls herself a farmer since his two sons are abroad and younger one studying in city, she farms herself. She started farming after conflict before they had tenant. While responding to my question regarding her regarding girls’ preferences for marriage. She told me that few years back most of the girls were preferred boys who have migrated to Australia or have jobs in cities but since most of the boys can’t take their wives along with themselves now girl prefer boys who have jobs in city. She said she prefer someone who lives in village along with his family.

Ye (2016) contends, that there could be positive and negative effects of migration on left behind women, which depends upon location and other processes. Such as that migration of male youth can increase rural youth agency in controlling household while other contends that feminization of agriculture increase further burden for women. They not only work in their houses but also in the farms and go through separation from their spouse where many husbands in the cities cheat on them which leads to psychological trauma. Since, there is shortage of labor so most the left behind elders are engaged in farming which than also incorporate left behind children in labor force such Pagara/working party in rice plantation is considered as children work. Children are pushed into working party to solve labor shortage problem which is increasing burden on children which is why this old traditional practice is finishing as children are avoiding it now.



In Kurram many young boys in FATA in general and Kurram specific need mental therapy. Most of the young boys fought for 4 years when Kurram was in siege they have to perform duties all night in the trenches. Followed by sporadic bomb attacks and selective attacks by Taliban on villages and Turi tribe bound cars on the way to the city have created very insecure environment. Villages are empty after displacement and repatriation of Afghans and there are now entertainment activities for people. Year ago government halted mobile internet and region is facing through sever load shedding. Two years ago suicide attack on football match was foiled by forces. Since than boys are not allowed to play football and cricket in the villages. Which is one reason now children and youth avoid visiting villages.

Ye et al. (2016) concludes that separation of adults and elders put burden on elders in daily chores, there is emotional, social isolation and lack of care with elders. In one of my interview (age 78) argued *“that now most of the children and adults avoid sitting with us. Children or adults are either busy with their phones or have made separate spaces for themselves.”* Insecurity followed by local people displacement and Afghan refugees’ repatriation has pushed villages into silence. Where villages are empty, environment is stressed.

## Chapter 8: Conclusion

Scholars like Bernstein (2004) frames as capital's struggle to accommodate surplus labour it has produced. Neo-populists scholars like Van der Ploeg (2014) concedes migration from rural areas, as cyclical and demographic. Farmers migrate to cities in order to sustain their households in rural areas and return back to their villages after spending some time in cities.

In context of above classical agrarian political economy debate, I asked question that, is there a process of de-peasantization in post-conflict Kurram Agency, Pakistan? There are three major factors that are pushing people away from farming. These factors are prevailing insecurity, aspiration of social mobility and ecological factors. On other hand I found factors, such as Pashtun tribal structures, one of the main factor which is involving rural youth in farming. Farming is considered as part of local tradition.

In my research I found that despite of having interest, youth is not interested in farming because after conflict, shortage of labour is putting extra burden on youth. Which is leading in creating disinterest among youth in Kurram Agency. The different farming patterns, where some people are leaving and other returning, indicates that both re-peasantization and de-peasantization trends exist at the same time in Kurram Agency. Which is why, it is too early to say that whether in long term process this will lead to de-peasantization.

This research has wide social, political and policy implications. This research shows that overall trend of youth is of out migration. That is resulting migration of able-bodied people from the area. And, if this trend carries on soon there will be no young people in the area leaving elderly, women and children behind. Which will not only affect the way people farm but also what people farm. In extreme case this can mean death of tradition to put children into farming. Further, the trend of out migration has gender implications as well. For example, women participation in farming has increased after conflict. Now more women are involved in farming comparing to before conflict. Moreover, work load on women has also increased.

Policy wise this research indicates that Pakistani state's current policies are having net negative effect on FATA. For example, war on terrorism, armed conflicts and low returns on agricultural investment are not friendly to promote farming. Rather, these policies are pushing people out of the centuries long culture and tradition. Moreover, the youth that moves out to cities lives in precarious condition. This youth is like surplus energy that if not used in productive way may pose political threat.

Future prospect of this research opens paths to check these trends in other parts of the country. That can further our understanding of agrarian change and migration in the country. But, also will help to explore other causes and reasons of migration. Additionally, to what extent conflict, aspirations of social mobility and ecological factors affect household decisions on migration.

## References

- Agarwal, B. and A. Agrawal (2017) 'Do Farmers really Like Farming? Indian Farmers in 'Transition'', *Oxford Development Studies* : 1-19. Accessed 08 August <<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/13600818.2017.1283010?nedAccess=true>>
- Akram-Lodhi, A.H. (2016) 'One Stone is enough to Drive Away a Hundred Birds': Peasants, Land and Resistance in Contemporary Afghanistan', *Journal of agrarian change* 16(1): 168-179. Accessed 11 November 2017 <<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/joac.12134/full>>.
- Akram-Lodhi, A.H. and C. Kay (2010) 'Surveying the Agrarian Question (Part 2): Current Debates and Beyond', *The Journal of Peasant Studies* 37(2): 255-284.
- Ali, M (1996) 'Politics and Administration of Tribal Areas: Case Study of Kurram and Khyber.' Unpublished PhD dissertation, University of Peshawar, Peshawar.
- Araghi, F. (1995) 'Global Depeasantization, 1945–1990', *The Sociological Quarterly* 36(2): 337-368.
- Assaad, R. and M. Ramadan (2008) 'Did Housing Policy Reforms Curb the Delay in Marriage among Young Men in Egypt', *Middle East Youth Initiative Policy Outlook* 1: 1-8.
- Berckmoes, L.H. and B. White (2014) 'Youth, Farming, and Precarity in Rural Burundi', *The European Journal of Development Research* 26(2): 291-312. Accessed 08 August <<https://link.springer.com/article/10.1057/ejdr.2013.53>>.
- Bernstein, H. (2004) 'Changing before our very Eyes': Agrarian Questions and the Politics of Land in Capitalism Today', *Journal of Agrarian Change* 4(1-2): 190-225.
- Bernstein, H. (2009) '10 Agrarian Questions from Transition to Globalization', *Peasants and globalization: Political economy, rural transformation and the agrarian question* 2: 239.
- Bernstein, H. (2010) *Class Dynamics of Agrarian Change*. Vol. 1. Sterling, VA: Kumarian Press.
- Bossenbroek, L., van der Ploeg, and M. Zwarteveen (2015) 'Broken Dreams? Youth Experiences of Agrarian Change in Morocco's Saïss Region', *Cahiers Agricultures* 24(6): 342-348.
- Bureau of Statistics FATA Secretariat (2015) 'FATA Development Indicator Household Survey', FATA Development Indicator Household survey, (No. 1), 11-22. Peshawar: FATA Secretariat.
- Byres, T.J. (1986) 'The Agrarian Question, Forms of Capitalist Agrarian Transition and the State: An Essay with Reference to Asia', *Social Scientist*: 3-67.
- Cramer, C. and P. Richards. (2011) 'Violence and War in Agrarian Perspective', *Journal of Agrarian Change* 11(3): 277-297.
- Charmaz, K. and L. Belgrave (eds) (2012) *Qualitative Interviewing and Grounded Theory Analysis*. (2 edn) Vol. 2. Los Angeles: Sage London. Google Books. Accessed 11 November 2017.

Desa, U. (2012) 'World Urbanization Prospects, the 2011 Revision', *UNDESA*. Accessed 12 November 2017.

<[http://www.un.org/en/development/desa/population/publications/pdf/urbanization/WUP2011\\_Report.pdf](http://www.un.org/en/development/desa/population/publications/pdf/urbanization/WUP2011_Report.pdf)>.

Edelman, M. (2013) 'What is a Peasant? what are Peasantries? A Briefing Paper on Issues of Definition', *first session of the Intergovernmental Working Group on a United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Peasants and Other People Working in Rural Areas, Geneva, July* : 15-19.

FAO, C. 'IFAD (2014) Youth and Agriculture: Key Challenges and Concrete Solutions', *Food and Agriculture Organization Publications, Rome*.

Hasan, A. and M. Raza (2009) 'Migration and Small Towns in Pakistan', No. 15, pp. 1-134 IIED.

Huijsman, R (2010) *Migrating Children, Households, and the Post-Socialist State: An ethnographic study of migration and non-migration by children and youth in an ethnic Lao village, Laos*. PhD dissertation, Durham University, Durham.

Huijsmans, R., S. George, R. Gigengack and S.J. Evers. (2014). 'Theorising Age and Generation in Development: A Relational Approach', *The European Journal of Development Research* 26(2): 163-174. 08 August <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1057/ejdr.2013.65>.

Huijsmans, R. (2014) 'Becoming a Young Migrant Or Stayer seen through the Lens of 'householding': Households 'in flux' and the Intersection of Relations of Gender and Seniority', *Geoforum* 51: 294-304.

Huijsmans, R. (2016) 'Generationing Development: Palgrave macmillan. Accessed 08 August < [https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1057/978-1-137-55623-3\\_1](https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1057/978-1-137-55623-3_1)>.

Jeffrey, C. (2010) 'Timepass: 'Youth, Class, and the Politics of Waiting in India, The Journal of American *Ethnological Society*, ' 37(3): 465-481. Accessed 16 June 2017 <<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1548-1425.2010.01266.x/epdf>>.

Leavy, J. and S. Smith (2010) 'Future Farmers: Youth Aspirations, Expectations and Life Choices', *Future Agricultures Discussion Paper 013*. Brighton: Institute of Development Studies.

Marshall, Martin (1996) 'Sampling for Qualitative Research', *Family practice* 13(6): 522-526. Accessed 11 November 2017

<<https://academic.oup.com/fampra/article/13/6/522/496701>>.

Morarji, K. (2014) 'Subjects of Development: Teachers, Parents and Youth Negotiating Education in Rural North India', *The European Journal of Development Research* 26(2): 175-189. Accessed 11 November 2017

<<https://link.springer.com/article/10.1057/ejdr.2013.55>>.

Narayan, Kirin. (1993) 'How Native is a "native" Anthropologist?', *American anthropologist* 95(3): 671-686. Accessed November 11 2017

<<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1525/aa.1993.95.3.02a00070/full>>.

Naseer, N. (2015) 'Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA): Impacts of Militarization and War Crimes on Tribal Women and Children', *Pakistan Journal of Criminology* 7(4): 129. Accessed 11 November 2017

<<https://search.proquest.com/openview/11327441445bd0b425171019e59a63a0/1?pq-origsite=gscholar&cbl=2034993>>.

Nguyen, Houg. (2007) 'Anthropology 'At Home'Through the Lens of Inter-subjectivity: Counter Transference while Interviewing A 'Vulnerable'Vietnamese Woman', *Medische Antropologie* 19(1): 23-38. Accessed November 11 2017

<<https://lup.lub.lu.se/search/publication/5148314>>.

Oya, C. (2004) 'The Empirical Investigation of Rural Class Formation: Methodological Issues in a Study of Large-and Mid-Scale Farmers in Senegal', *Historical Materialism* 12(4): 289-326.

Oya, C. (2007) 'Stories of Rural Accumulation in Africa: Trajectories and Transitions among Rural Capitalists in Senegal', *Journal of Agrarian Change* 7(4): 453-493.

Patton, M. (1990) *Qualitative Evaluation and Research Methods*. California: SAGE Publications, inc.

Peters, K. and P. Richards (2011) 'Rebellion and Agrarian Tensions in Sierra Leone', *Journal of Agrarian Change* 11(3): 377-395.

Proctor, F. and V. Lucchesi (2012) *Small-Scale Farming and Youth in an Era of Rapid Rural Change*. London: Knowledge Programme Small Producer Agency in the Globalised Market.

Rieck, A. (2016) *The Shias of Pakistan: An Assertive and Beleaguered Minority*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Scholberg, H. (1908) *The Kurram District Gazetteers of British India: A Bibliography*. Vol. 5. [Poststr. 4,] Inter Documentation.

Siddique, A. (2014) *The Pashtun Question: The Unresolved Key to the Future of Pakistan and Afghanistan*. London: Hurst & Company Limited.

Sumberg et al (2015) 'Perspectives on Jobs and Farming: Findings from a Q Study with Young People, Parents and Development Workers in Rural

*The Express Tribune* (2015) 'Iran Recruits Pakistani Shias for Combat in Syria', 11 December, p. 6.

Thomson, F. (2011) 'The Agrarian Question and Violence in Colombia: Conflict and Development', *Journal of Agrarian Change* 11(3): 321-356.

USAID (1991) *Socio-Economic Profile of Kurram Agency Peshawar*. United States Aid for International Development.

van der Ploeg, J. D, H. Renting (2004) 'Behind the 'redux': A Rejoinder to David Goodman', *Sociologia Ruralis* 44(2): 234-242. Accessed 11 November 2017.

<<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1467-9523.2004.00272.x/full>>.

van der Ploeg, J. D. (2009) *The New Peasantries: Struggles for Autonomy and Sustainability in an Era of Empire and Globalization*. London: Routledge. Accessed 11 November 2017.

<<https://books.google.nl/books?hl=en&lr=&id=yU5DDgg9askC&oi=fnd&pg=PR3&dq=+the+new+peasantries&ots=GDV5IY9Ir7&sig=p->

[p9IzqRNQyXhzVaEiW0V0bk1ps#v=onepage&q=the%20new%20peasant-ries&f=false](#)

van der Ploeg, J. D., Ye and L. Pan (2014) 'Peasants, Time and the Land: The Social Organization of Farming in China', *Journal of Rural Studies* 36: 172-181.

van der Ploeg, J. D. 2017. "Differentiation: Old Controversies, New Insights." *Journal of Peasant Studies* 45(3): 489-524.

White, B (2012) 'Who Will Own the Countryside?: Dispossession, Rural Youth and the Future of Farming', *IDS Bulletin* 43 (6): 9-19.

White, B (2015) 'Generational Dynamics in Agriculture: Reflections on Rural Youth and Farming Futures', *Cahiers Agricultures* 24(6): 330-334.

White, B. (2018) 'Marx and Chayanov at the Margins: Understanding Agrarian Change in Java', *The Journal of Peasant Studies* : 1-19.

Ye, J., H. Wu, J. Rao, B. Ding and K. Zhang (2016) 'Left-Behind Women: Gender Exclusion and Inequality in Rural-Urban Migration in China', *The Journal of Peasant Studies* 43(4): 910-941

## Appendices

### Appendix 1: Interviews

#### Interview 1

Its been year and half that ive left my education. I was studying in Islamabad. I had no interest in farming that's why I left. I was good in studies in Islamabad, after double shah I couldn't afford there so I came back. We have no one abroad. We earn from farming but mostly earn from selling our sheeps, I year sometime we earn one lack fifty thousand, sometime one lac twenty thousand. And our family is totally dependent on farming.

In year we sell 3 or 4 sheeps. We also sell ghee, eggs. One sheep cost 35 thousands.

I started farming after returning from Islamabad. At early ages, when father would not be here so I used to do work. I used to accompany him to farm. I want to go to army. I ve left studies in coming time im looking forward to go to UAE.

I spent 16 months in Islamabad. I learned more things in Islamabad. I used to miss my village.

In village, I don't like farming as one cant earn anything from farming. I don't like even to graz cattles. Ive interst in drving tractor.

I also do daily wage worker. 16 sheeps, 5 cows. After war our sheeps have increased. We used have 3 to 4 sheeps as there were no places to take it for grazing, we used to grow crops for it and had no space to keep them. People are earning from cattles. In comparision to other work I enjoy farming.

Now after war women are doing more work than men.

A good farm has all equipments and have techniques of farming. We have savings and we use it for farming.

I want to leave for UAE. Farming is not taking me anywhere. Our livelihood depends on sheeps.

NGOs give inputs to influential persons.

## Interview 2

There are two types of organisations working in the area (1) They focus on awareness of community to ask for their needs from govt. (2) second type is one which link people with govt and help govt to make writ by providing livelihood. Due to recent wave of talibanization many people were recruited by terrorists in order to provide them livelihood.

The second type of organization works under FATA secretariat which distributes and livelihood schemes through govt administration e.g FDMA, FDPGC and FLADP (SRSP subsidiary).

They strengthen community by awareness through government.

FDPGC (4 to 5 projects on potato, Tomato and Okra growing farmers 3 days training and inputs distribution.) after war to bring two sect people and increase writ of govt. They don't need noc and work under FATA secretariat. PA gave them schemes they go for survey and what is in their budget they go for that projects. They do it through contractor. I distributed wheat seeds, inputs and did trainings in rainfed and water channel irrigated areas separately.

And SRSP do projects through community.

FLADP they did spur project, construction of irrigation channels and training.

In SRSP they have launched small scale generation employment schemes. (Most of the time they send students for trainings in cities, but instead of learning they leave village and don't come back). The schemes were cloth houses, general stores. There are success stories.

Here IN SRSP I work on economic growth. I trained 170 farmers of central Kurram in maize and beans, distributed inputs. Funded by KFW, German bank. Now I've 106 farmers, 19 committees and I will vaccinate and give medicine to their livestock (central Kurram), 1100, TDPs project.

In employment generation scheme I will train 5 boys in light engineering skills until September. (4 months on job work, two months training and two months job) he will be given honorary and then he will be employed by that institute if he is skilled enough.

In heavy machinery I will train 20 farmers. Excavators, loader trainings for farmers. Than those who are involved in farming than we gave training in farming, I gave trainings on value chain of walnut. 40 farmers are being trained by me. I teach them value addition techniques. We are distributing both local and hybrid seeds.

Before these people used to cultivate Hash and Poppy which has been banned by govt. most of these projects are emergency based projects which were started just after military operation in that area.

In Lower Kurram also from those areas which were affected by war, inputs were distributed in those areas. We ran skill development programs for both men and women funded by UNDP (SRSP). Schools were destroyed in those villages have been rehabilitated and many skill development projects were implemented for



training people in masonry and carpentry in those schools near to community and also women embroidery skills and distribution of machines.

In my recent project in central areas, criteria for inclusion in project was to have basic agriculture related understanding.

#### His Interview as Farmer

Most of the farming was done by Afghan and even used to bring wood from hill for us. Our grandfather used to supervise them. They only used to grow maize. We are now facing labor shortage. Now rates of labor also went up. Now our more than 120 jiribs of land of our village is unfarmed.

Most people are fed up with farming due to many reasons, either due to natural disasters or soil born diseases or pest attacks, or seeds are not viable or they don't produce as much.

People don't have awareness. These days due to global warming there are climatic changes. People still doing farming on old practices. "Before rice plantation would finish before start of hot weather but these there are still areas where there is plantation going on."

So people need new technology to cope with climatic change and new seeds for specific changes. New seeds should be planted and we should not do away with our old seeds.

People are poor they don't have storage facilities. Rice will be harvested and sold at that time as people don't have spaces in their houses. (it is the case with every crop).

Govt should make cold storages. They buy seeds from other places as they don't have cold storages. Govt should spend on training in products made from these products. Those who are studying are also involved in farming today in the morning I irrigated my rice crop.

They have good prospects in orchards but they have no awareness regarding that. The only reason for my involvement in farming is that I don't want that the amount of land which I have doesn't become unfarmed that's why I'm doing farming. Due to culture reason we are farming if my cousin is farming why I can't?

People are more interested in early return that's why they have lost interest in farming though there are crops which one gets production in a two month period but still people can't wait. That's why people are going for other source of income.

In lower region you can't farm at late and early hours. There are mines.

### **Interview 3**

Studies in class 6<sup>th</sup>. Before we were in joint family, when I was kid our elders used to farm.

Asif is 19 years old boy. His elder brother went to Germany few years ago as refugee now he is the one who takes care of his family. His father died when he was very young.

I used to go along with family to farm. Now I do almost everything. 2014 was the year I started farming, when we separated from our family and even when my brother was here, still I used to do farming.

I want to become engineer but ive interest in sports.

Main hurdle in education is that there is no one here to take care of family and that's why I cant study outside town. We are all dependent on remittances.

I have interest in farming because I don't want to make my field unfallowed. (Majbori).

I call myself student not farmer.

During interview two villagers came and sit near us and got shy.

Farming has affected after war and I started farming after war.

I don't like anything in village except football, there is nothing overhere.

Before war women used to do lots of work, just like mother got hurt and now she can do more work.

### **Interview 3**

Studied upto 3<sup>rd</sup> year failed a paper in fourth year.

I've started proper farming after death of my father, which was an year ago. I used to assist my uncle when we were in joint family since we broke with uncle from than ive started farming. I was also studying and doing farming.

My uncle used to ask for help and we would work with them.

I was interest in job in govt or ngo. Im doing preparation to pass my paper.

I was taking care of father that was the only hurdle in continuing my studies.

Exactly at this point his uncle joined us and Akbar told him that representative of water channel committee is sitting over there. He asked what im doing ? I explained my research to him ?

He replied people are doing farming out of no choice, no one has any interest in farming.

His uncle ordered him to clean the water channel and also give water to vegetable.

When I asked Akbar who used to help you in your studies. His uncle intervened that it is just research and nothing else(you are not offering anything ?)

I didn't reply to him. So again he asked, do you know about any schemes for farmers, I said no don't know of any. He said that you guys should focus on studies. When I told him im been student.

Akbar told me that he was doing every work but after getting separated from uncle now he has got more responsibility on his shoulder (driving tractor etc.) His uncle intervened that will you get your degree. I replied im hopefull. He started intervening me about my studies and I told him that im studying farming. He said that's good, there is no one around here who has studied agriculture.

Than started asking question related his son application for Canda. I told him I don't know anything about it.

When I asked Akbar what kind of activities you are doing now, he started counting and in the middle he was intervend by his uncle saying "our tenant is our landlord, we their tenants." "You have tell him everything about things, do this and that, otherwise he doesn't."

We have tenant, he does everything but sometime he needs help so rather than hiring labor we work with them. I work along with our tenant. A labor takes 600 daily. Ive no interest in farming due to nessecity I work with our tenant.

Heis uncle said that im the one how grow vegetable, pointing toward vegetable farm. He said I als work on tractor, I earn my pocket money through it or my cousin give it to me other than that I also do work as daily wager.

His uncle started asking about my father and emphasized about getting education.

Ive interest in farming compared to other activities.

Women do more work than farming.

When I asked Akbar about effects of war on agriculture?

His uncle responded that before a labor used to charge 200 rupees now they charge 700 after war. He divided whole day work in hours that workers hardly do 6hours aday. Weed has grown in all fields. Wild boars has increased. These

boys should be studying but we have involved in farming. A maund of wheat falls for 1200 in farm.

Youth is unemployed. They come but than don't work in village. Schools and teachers are not that good. Most of them are themselves farmer don't come to schools for teaching or take students for work. Before I used get labor just 400 for rice nursery now I paid 1800.

Most of the land is unfallowed before people would approach us for land before war. No one is farming everyone is leaving for UAE and Australia. Everyday we have to give penalties as everyday one has to send a person to cleaning of water channel. Each family has one member either we will do farming or do cleaning of cannal.

Before we used to grow groundnuts, mung bean, corn. It just like buying your own crop in your own farm. Wild boars are destroying crops. Before everyone used to have many cattles now we cant as there are no labor to graze cows.

Farmer use to take loans and pay after cultivation of their crop.

I can get land if I want to grow something.

If you know someone than you will get inputs otherwise you will not get anything.

There was another young boy of his age was standing when I asked him what you don't like about village, he replied "Not irrigating our farm." But instead go for playing games.

Now new generation doesn't listen to old generation, we are telling them not to play games but still they are playing. Than the other young boy replied, they don't allow us to catch fish in dam and not allow to play games so than what should we do ?

They had bitter argument.

I went for 6 months diploma and im planning to go for another diploma.

Govt should give fertilizer, inputs and make water channels and provide employments.

#### Interview 4

Young generation organization: while growing up in village we don't had any tution centres and Quran centre after noticing many other organizations we decided to make one such organization. It started work from opening Quran centers in all villages. While second step was opening tution centers in that quran centres until matric.

They used to help in weddings and funerals, coordination among whole tribe, becoming power of elders and to decrease gap between elders and youngsters. Also to increase coordination with other organization and other villages and NGOs and govt institutions.

Generation gap created rift among tribe. Older generation had their own way of thinking. There used to be elders committee which function was arrangement of muharram. There was another committee which purpose was to solve internal rifts in tribe and defence of the tribe.

This committee vanished YGO idea came from that committee. The idea was young generation should take responsibility rather than depending on elder generation.

The main tussel between two comittees emerged because of elders saying that in presence of elders why you are meddling. And they would not pursue the issue and would not let us do it.

YGO took responsibility of construction of imam bargah. All young person took responsibility but not as ygo, they went into this other committee as community members. That's why elder were uneasy with it and they had their own crockery. Elders unsecure, they were solving problems. Why are they listening to you. So instead it created more gap between two generation.

At one point elders took responsibility of imambargah from ygo. It is not working by its name but still they are working.

The main rift among ygo emerged in election. We decided to get benefits from both candidates. We had meeting, don't raise on ygo level. You cant vote as individual. People srated campaigns for different candidates. So many members left. They decreased their activites. Also many people went to UAE.

From maingak to Jalamai ygo started unity among shias tribes and started focus on education and quran centers. It didn't last for long. Now ygo is still here but not work under its number. We still have fund under its banner and we still meet regularly as we are in contact. It has become more informal. There is no formal structure now but still we work together. We don't belive in designation. We also organize programs on eid ghadeer and 13 muharam, now we celebrate youm e shuhada under ygo banner.

It also give scholarship to talented students and those whos partents are dead. We also planning to spend on highereducation not only in our own village we are also giving scholarship to people outside our village.

After war many when govt was distributing food among student many par-ents got their children out from private school who were funded by us to public school. Elder generation was involved in that too to finish school ran privately started by our organization in village.

We wanted to start this school from our organization banner but couldn't afford it. So we asked anyone from organization who wants to voulanteer can do it. Hurdles were created that it has no registration.

We also constituted (20 guna) to solve internal issues and remove internal rifts. To increase coordination rather speaking behind and creating rifts. So we made some rules to discuss these issues. There used to be many issue where one party used to present their proofs but still issue is not solved so that's why we took responsibility, we also give authority to it, to solve issue on basis of equality.

And also I proposed to write all those issue which have been solved and we should compile it. E.g separation of family.

#### Interview 5

There is shortage of labor. now pay 6 persons penalty before we didn't used to do it.

Before we had light, there is also insecurity. And also one have to do everything on labor.

Boys were unemployed they all left and now villages are empty.

Before. afghans people were doing farming on their own. Now mundane come and do everything last year they did everything in rice season for 30000 rupees.

Afghans also used to do pagars, and friends used to help us. Afghans made most of the land cultivatable.

"whenever they would fight with someone in Khost province they used to tell them that ill kill you and seek refuge in Kass."

Many people got jobs when new markets were started and also many people were employed in afghan jihad organisations to kill people.

Before we used to grow red rice than sar ghotay now we grow kolay. People didn't like srary rice and sarghoty didn't grow well. They used to get fungus. We later started seeds were brought from swat. Similarly soya. Animals are destorying crops.

Most of the people went to cities and not interest in coming back due to security and even we cant get drivers for tractors.

Social structures are eruding as no one listins to jirgas, narrating story of our village issue with another village over water.

Boys are unemployed that's why you also went outside as people are not getting enough that's why people are going out, leaving outside. If you get loan you will not able to pay it back.

Pakistan spent money came for Waziristan on arms.

## Interview 6

I've done MA in IR. I want to join army. So I got ill so couldn't focus on studies. Then I was also good at cricket but as I said couldn't continue due to my sickness, also I was the only child so I have to do farming along with studying so that's why I couldn't continue.

When I was 15 years old after coming from school I used to help my family in farming. I used to work as I liked it. I used to hide from extra or boring work. I didn't enjoy when I used to be forced.

We didn't usually used to have extra work. I enjoyed used to work for refreshment but if it was forced then I didn't like it. While growing you yourself realize which activities you can perform, so then you perform those activities.

I used to cultivate farms which had good access of water and were small.

I am also owner of school and a shop. I also teach at school. I'm looking for jobs. I earn 10000 per month from school.

Women do more work than their male counterparts.

I get happy with teacher, when somebody calls me teacher.

Farmer is one who ploughs at proper time and takes responsibility of his farm.

I have not made any experiments in farming. I do employ labor during plantation and harvesting.

I do have interest in getting information but there is no such knowledge available.

(If I tell you reality that we hate farming, while laughing) there is no fertilizer.

No many people learn from people in their village.

We didn't get any assistance from govt and ngos. Recently sometime ngos distribute seeds of vegetables and crops. We use old seeds that's why we don't have good production.

He was laughing that his nephew since childhood used to play with spade in village. In our village the child is born he is given spade in his hand though now it has changed. The foremost reason is that people started to notice that they are not getting much from farming they started migration or spending on their children education. I think good strategy is to leave one person for farming and send other family member abroad for education.

The reason for not having good production is increase in prices of inputs that farmers can't afford and then when we sell our products they are very cheap. Those boys who are intelligent they are allowed to study, those who are not sharp than they are forced into farming.

And most of the boys studying outside district themselves get involved in farming.

He was laughing narrating his story of once plantation of chilies he didn't put dry mud over it, when his cousin saw that they made fun of him, that was because he didn't consult with anyone, so he said we should consult with parents and elders.

Many parents give and allow them to grow whatever they want to grow in village.

Women are not given any land. Now we get more production because of new inputs.

Old way of farming is going to end.

People get loan from other people in village. I've not taken loan from anyone.

One gets fresh food, everything is good except facilities of health and education.

Young boys need employment, internet, health and education facilities.

After war due to bombings destroyed our crops. Many boys couldn't continue their education due to closing of schools and they started smoking hash. People couldn't move due to insecurity many people died and many people left village. Even those who couldn't were also wishing to leave their houses.

People don't get education for employment but learn character but it also provides also employment opportunity. And support their families here.

I'm seeking permanent job and can continue farming in village and educate my children.

I don't want that my son becomes a farmer. I want that my child gets good education.

#### Interview 7

I am matriculate. We used to have more land before now we have 3 jirbs of land.

Since very early age I used to do farming.

I used to go to farm on my consent but also family used to force us. I used to do every thing with interest like growing peas, tomatoes, but had no interest in wheat, rice and other major crops but I used to be involved in it but with no interest, like harvesting and plantation of rice.

I had no interest, since we were poor and had no choice that's why I was farming. I wanted to go to UAE but I could not go.

Biggest hurdle in study was poverty.

My contribution in farming is whatever I grow. As I along with my father take care of family.

I have also cultivated melons as experiment.



His father used to keep cattles. Cattles are doing good than farming as people graze more cattles. And people have not to buy hay that's why people are keeping more cattles. We have more cattles than we used to have before.

Now people spend more on farming and earn less. And no one is earning. Before people used to work themselves now one have to employ labour so one cant earn more. And also new generation has lost interest in farming. Also they have also understood that since we are also didn't earn anything from farming what can our soon do, so they are investing in their education.

War has huge impact on farming, almost half of impact is due to war. Water cannals, water channels and fileds are unfallowed also a lot of weeds.

Ive only seen ngos for one time. There is farmer commity but I don't know much about it.

Who is good farmer ?

One who iirigated farm and plant it on time.

Impacts of climate ?

I don't know much about it.

No, I don't want that my son become farmer.

In afghan era labor was available, that why farming was good at that time. Im happy that people have more awareness toward education (allhamudlillah) every parnets want them to study and not get involved in farming.

Who people see those leave village ?

They cant do anything they just do new haircuts that's it. No one likes those who are unemployed in village.

Elders are responsible as they should be take care, that's why they got bad habits (doing haircuts) as assumed all of them are bad.

No matter there so many issues but still I love village life. There is no comfort e.g security situation in our hometown, we don't want to leave our village but life is very hard over here.

I want to make my children get good education that is my goal.

We demand that govt do something for water channels and do something for wild boars.

### Interview 8

Uneducated. In jalamai we had 450 jirb of land. When I got matured I started working as farmer.

My son used to go with me to farm though they were studying. Along with our cousins we have 3000 jrib of land after war Taliban have taken everything destroyed water chanel. Now that land is unfallowed.

Still now we cant go to our village. Before war many people were in villages, later many people started leaving country. Afghans migration also affected.

Before after war they used to farm now most of them have left.

I left country for fun to see out world and it was not for money. Outside I was wage laborer and here I used to employ labor. now we live other people land. Akhter my son is in Iraq and earning supporting family.

Haider also works with other people as wage labor.

Bad thing about village is insecurity. Here I cultivate 3.5 jrib.

Before production was less now production has increased. Water is foremost hurdle, availability of fertilizer and also most farmers are poor and unavailability of tractor.

Before war we had many cattles now after we have to start from scratches.

Young boys have no interest in farming they are mentally ill and help us in farming. Everyone is in tension and working for majbori.

If they will not study than ofcourse they have no option instead of farming.

Govt has not doing anything for us.

A good farmer is have good inputs and work and plant on proper time.

“Farming was just like hereditary factory” I planned that my children will study but after war they couldn’t.

After war in our region man are doing more work.

## Interview 9

Jammal a good farmer is one who keeps good inputs (seeds, fertilizer etc). he give water and plough farm on time. This year we had very good crops but cant get hold of fertilizer. It has affecte our production.

A good farmer is one irrespective of landholding, we understand farming very well but the more you spend on it the more you will get out of it. Farmer should have basic education as some time we don't know expiry date of the pesdticide.

When I asked him do you want that your son become a farmer, he said no want him to get good education and become engineer, doctor and something else.

In central areas they are not educated and there is propaganda, that since it is English we don't want to get education they are stupid they don't want to educate their females.

What are the effects of climate on farming ?

Before we used to cultivate local seeds and we used to get tomatoes very late till winter. These new seeds are warm and they burn very fast. Than they started having conversation that we don't do soil test.

Before winter weather was limited to January and February now it has extended to march and delayed our tomato plantations. And also this winter a chil frost destroyed our peas crop.

Why people don't do new experiments. Because people eat it from fruits garden and also pest attacks.

Live stock is good business but people are reluctant as mostly people have no resouces and awareness otherwise it is good source of livelihood.

We are dommed because of farming, we have no choice because than weed will grow and it will become jungle. And it is (PAKHTO). (context bad prices of tomatoes). If we had jobs than we could leave the village but we have no skills otherwise we might have left.

He is constantly quoting VOA programs and pointing out intervention by govt for provision of inputs

Govt org sells bag of wheat for 3000 and we cant sell for 1500.

"In our time sitting in village gathering in charpai we couldn't shake our leg, our elders used to rebuke us." Now when you come the younger boys sitting there don't make space for you to sit over there.

After war people consuming tablets. Doing suicides it was not so before war.

### Interview 10

I started farming at very early age. I might be 14 years old. At that time everyone in house used to had some kind of work to do. Since childhood I was responsible and active so I used involved in different kind of activities. When my father left for Qatar, since than im involved in farming.

Ive studied till 6<sup>th</sup> grade.

The difference between old farming and new farming is that in old day one have to work by hand through bulls but now we have technology. Now though our lands have been divided but still now we produce more than before, It has not effected on our livelihood. Now people spend more on farming compared to old days. We are not spending much as we work hard so we earn more compared to other people. Due to industrialization of farming we are not earning nothing.

“Giving example of fellow farmer, wajid ali, he is just wasting his time.”

Ive no interest in farming even before I was stupid that I gave my full life to farming. Than he contradicts himself that ive interest in farming as do everything to buy pesticides, fertilizers and other input to do farming properly. If I was not interested than my farms would be devastated.

My all sons studies but when they are home they do work with me in farm. Even my younger son brings tea for me. If I had any other source of income I would not have involved them in farming but since I have no choice, so I take their help. I have interest in farming. Not only I work in my own farm but I also work with Ghayoor in his farm.

My both sons have just visiting home for vacation. They both do pagar at morning and afternoon they plant rice on contract with other farmers. When I asked do they have interest in farming. He said since they are doing it, they might have and then he mumbled “Well what kind of hobby farming would be ?”

They learn techniques from me. I supervise them. Im one of the best farmer in the area. “They call me you are engineer in farming.” The prodigy !!!

I went illegally to Qatar, UAE and Iran. I was caught in both places and sent back home. My father didn't support me , I went by my own. I was not hoping to come back because there is no khair in farming.

Apart from farming I don't anything as I don't have any time to do anything else.

Before we used to cultivate sugar cane, banspati rice and tobacco but we stopped growing that now. Even at that time farmers used to grow tomatoes but

not by everyone now everyone is growing it. Since there was a lot of hard work involved in those crops that's why people stopped growing it.

I also grow tree nursery and I earn good money from it. I've decided to limit my farming from this year as my sons are not with me and we can afford labors. In early days you would not see anyone free. Everyone was farming. It was only source of income and people had interest in it. Now no one has interest in farming.

When war started in, I was thinking that I will die of hunger as our three brothers had no other source of income. But during and after war people limited their farming and I increased it so I'm earning more compared to other people. War has created disinterest among farmers before no one used to leave their farm unfallowed. People have no respect for land now.

Young generation is better than us "while in home I start cursing s.

### **Interview 11**

I started farming after war. Growing vegetables. Before war I used to do naal.

In school I was interested in cricket.

Biggest hurdle in education was war.

After war I have been doing everything. He is forest guard.

Everything is available outside village. Here one can only do farming. I did diploma in city but my father brought me back.

Now, due to security situation even fertilizer is not available.

Before our tenants used to do farming now we are also doing farming.

I have more interesting job than farming.

I don't call myself farmer.

One who works with spade is true farmer. We just do orders.

80 muands production of rice is we have. Wheat production was less this year.

We experimented with fruit trees but it didn't succeed. Now also we have given injection to a cattle.

Cattle are doing better than before. Before our production is less as our lands are unfallowed.

No one has interest in farming but everything is expensive.

Farming has become family business before everyone used to have tenants.

NGOs come and distribute seeds of wheat and vegetables.

I like every thing in village.

I don't like security situation, harassing by govt.

I don't my kid to become farmer.

I dislike harvesting season. Kom saut magha maslat.

No one leaves you for farming.

### **Interview 12**

We have been doing everything in helping our families in farming since we were very young.

Ali who studying in Peshawar: I love playing games in vllage which we cant do in city but I hate work (farming) over here. There is always too much work to do.

Zeeshan: No one like to become farmer, everyone wants to become something else. There is nothing I farming.

Ali: In village you live with your family. You have to be on your own. In city you live comfortable life.

Zeeshan: My Father is telling me that finish your studies than we will send you to Gulf.

### **Kabir Hussain Interview**

Its been my third year since ive returned from UAE. Its third year im doing farming. There are no other sources of income that's why we are doing farming and since (Kalay, watan dy). Since one lives in village, one is supposed to do farming. My two brothers are living in our house in Peshawar and three are in UAE, so there is was no one back home that's why I came back.

I have done matric. I have spent 14 years in UAE.

Both farming and driving taxi in Dubai are hard jobs. You are away from your family but at the same time farming is also very hard, it is not easy.

In school at those govt schools were not that good and people didn't used to focus that much on education and they didn't used to teach anything about farming.

When we were kids, our father was in Dubai. We used to do work on the farm but not that much as we had tenants, they would do all work but still we would do different things like plantation of rice, haversting, bringing it back to village, onion plantation, grazing cows, threshing rice and wheat. Though we had tenants but still one person was needed for supervision or do pagara.

I used to go to farm, "coz it is culture, its Pashto" if you don't go people don't see you with respect and you had no choice." Family members used to force to farm and would say " What are you doing, wasting your time in house, lets work with us."

And after work, we used to get rewards. Pointing to his brother, who busy in rice nursery farm. " He is currently studying in Peshawar, since there is no one

to take care of land in village, I ve forced him to come back to village and work in farm. When they come back for vacations they work in farms. It is culture, if you don't than people say bad things about you.

Before I was working but it was not that much work since we used to have tenants(Afghans) but I have more responsibility and its not easy to work. My brother has just finished his high secondary education and now we are doing farming on our own.

When my father was abroad, I used to do supervision of our tenants. When he cancelled his visa, I went to Dubai. I used to cultivate tomatoes for pocket money. I had interest in it also coz of competition as everyone was cultivating so I also used to do so.

I went to UAE at the age of 19. I had interest and also there was no employment opportunities over here that why I left. As I didn't see any future in farming. There is nothing left in farming, I order to secure my future, I went to UAE.

I used to support my family. But then I sent three brothers to UAE, now they are earning. As we have two houses so it is not easy and also one have to invest a lot of money in farming these days.

As im elder, I took responsibility and came back. It was my decision as my other brothers were studying in Peshawar the seat was empty for me, so I came back. As living in village you have to have one person to stay connected to people in village and taking care of family.

In village even if there are lot of work and unrest at day time but still night is refreshing and comfortable. I dubai you are always in tension though you are earning money.

War has huge impact on farming. Before there were no wild boars, one only used to work at daytime but now you have to guard your farm at night. Now govt has imposed ban on fertilizer and production has went down. Production was far more better before war, when afghans were here, they were more hard working then us.

Now people spend more on farming but still don't earn anything. Govt is also neglecting farmers. Before in a village there would one or two young farmers as most of people had tenants now every young boy is farmer. Though they have no interest in farming but forced by their families and Pashtunwali. " If you wear white clothes and your farms are unfallowed everyone talks behind you that he cant farm his land though he is young and can do work."

Now adays most of the youth are educated they don't respect their elder. Those boys who leaves for education to cities lose interest in studies if no one is taking care of them. We have few cases over here. They don't study than spend money on other things.

Education make people delicate and even their families don't want them to involved in farming. They become delicate, they wonder around but don't do farming. We have brother, he doesn't do any work, whenever asked he says im not doing anything.

Im forcefully involving them in farming as it is our culture. Those who are educated, they don't involve their children in farming. Those whom elders are

educated they don't involve their children in farming. They leave behind one member of family for farming.

Those who are farmers they know how much work is involved in farming and money invested in farming. If you do statistics, its same one can buy but atleast you get fresh products.

Before our these fields used to produce 80 muands, now it produce 20 maunds. I don't know wether it is because of weather, seeds, wild boar or what but still money from abroads is spent in huge amount but still we are not earning anything from farms.

"A poor person cant farm." The price of dap is 3000 to 4000 and poor farmer cant afford it and also cant afford to hire a labor. there is difference between those families in village who are doing well, they can invest in farming compared to those who are poor. They cant get production as they cant hire labor at time.

If there was good production, then people will develop interest. Last year prices were good, so this year we planted tomatoes but couldn't get good price. While working in UAE, though we also work hard but we get money at hand. In farming you don't know, you work hard, sometime it rains, or there.

Now some people cultivate selected crops which don't need much water as water channel is also big issue. Rains and hailstorm, wild boars all are affecting farming. You don't get water at proper time.

Why people don't cultivate ? before elders used to have Jirga and would make decisions and than they will fulfill it now adays they sit but don't fulfill it. So, some people don't go for water channel. You cant kill some one for water, or stop water supply for him. People compete with one one and another. If someone has issue, other person also don't go sayong if he is not going I will also don't go.

We 3 person from our family go. If there is water than these villages exists other wise there is no life over here. Many people who are fighting over other issue bring their fight into farming.

I learned many things from our elders in village. Many people are now cultivating melons now. Its new experiment. Most of people refrain from farming due to other people taking fruits from their farm or animals.

There is no light and internet.

Govt and NGO are not doing anything, after they came to clean channels after that we haven't seen them.

As I said, there is no income from farm that why we have no choice to leave our village.

My another brother is coming from UAE and I will leave. We do like this, as it is not easy to survive without farming, since living in village.

My this brother(who was sitting in rice farm) has no interest in farming, nor wants to visit UAE. He wants to go to Europe or Australia and he is also looking for job or will start his own business but since you are living in village and unemployed you are supposed to do farming.

I wear white cloths (clean) im not farmer. Real farmer is who is dirty, have spade on his shoulder and you don't see him ever in clean clothes that's real



farmer and always tired. Their farms and productions are far ore better than us and they never employ labor they do their own work. He only gets satisfied by his own work not labor work. His whole life revolves around farming. Though now they are doing well still they are involved in farming. Farming has become their profession.

I don't want my son to become farmer. My brother after completing education was not interested in farming left for uAE, similarly my another brother who had interest in farming, we sent him to UAE, this brother who was raised in city has also no interest in farming. After education completion he is not that good in studies. In our days parents didn't used to focus that much on studies but now more people wants their children study as there is nothing left in farming.

As most farmers are poor they cant spend on their kids education, so their kids cant do education as one has to spend lots of money on farming.

Women work depends on area. In our area women didn't used to come out but now they do more work than men.

### **Interview 13**

Itizaz, since he got 14 years old and all of them when they would come from school they would start work with me on farm (He address them as ghariban).

They wanted to get good education and accomplish their dreams which was not accomplished as we don't 20% of what we invest our hardwork in our farming due to numerous crisis. I also wanted that they study but after 2008 war, they couldn't continue their studies.

In the farm I didn't used to involve them in heavy work when they were young e.g bring axe, spade or dragging piece of wood. I used to give them money or other gifts in exchange. Since 2008 they are doing all the work, before half of the work was performed by them and by me, now I just supervise their work.

They have no interest right now in farming after taking over responsibility as we only produce which is enough for our own subsistence, before when our production was more they had interest in it as they would get good clothes and money, now since we don't produce enough so they themselves don't get enough.

Now as I have transferred responsibility to them, they themselves cultivate vegetable for themselves, they don't have to ask me and I do give them money as daily they need money for mobile credit.

Itizaz went to UAE for work, I sent him because, we were struggling with farming and were not able to sustain our livelihood that was the reason I sent him to UAE. He didn't spend that much time over there as he was ill.

He doesn't do any work apart from farming.

#### Interview 14

I started farming when I was very young, I was not capable of doing farming but I started as my father was not feeling well, so took responsibility and started farming. He couldn't do farming at that time. I didn't thought of leaving village as I thought by pursuing farming as profession I will be able to stay with my family.

Since, childhood I had interest in farming. I enjoyed every farm work but I had more interest in tomatoes crop. When I was 13 I started working on farm, even when I was unable to do work, I used to accompany my father, like helping in taking spade other material from home to farm, or simply visit him, when he was busy in farm. I would play in farm.

He would buy me something or give me money. It was same for all of our brothers.

In the new experiment, I cultivated cucumber in greenhouse for the first time in the village and I had good production. It was successful experiment.

After taking responsibility, burden increased over me. Now, ive to go to desiltation of canal, cleaning of water channel. Make ridges of the farm, which I didn't used to do before. Puddleing , giving fertilizer to farm, sowing seeds, everything and paying money for services.

I used to get separate land for my pocket money, where I used to grow vegetable.

I spend one year in Karachi and I was working at factory. Comparing work in the city with farming, farming is more difficult as compared to work in city. "One month of work in city is equal to one day of work in village." I was earning 10 to 15 thousands per month, which was not enough for me , so that's why I came back. I went to Karachi and I used to send money back home, and decision was not only mine but it was discussed in home. I was not able to support my family back home as rent was high and when I would come back my family would have taken loan for farm.

The difference between rural life and city life is that, life in village is good but very tiresome. I love everything about village, fresh fruits, vegetables, own wheat and rice. The only thing I hate about village is that one is tired (farming) every time.

Now farming is degrading, we are spending more than what we produce. Price of one muand is 1200 rupees if you buy It here but when we calculate the amount which we spend on wheat it is something around 2000 rupees. There is nothing left in farming. We spend more and get less production.

It was not like this before after war, due to shortage of labor, rates of labor are high as compared to it used to when afghans were around. Diesel price went up so not tractor drivers take more money for ploughing and bringing crop to village. One cant find labor, there is 6 term increase in labor from 10.

Work has increased after war, one of the most big problem is wild boars, they are destroy crops, farmers have to sit all day and night and guard their farms.

There has 50% change in farming. In our father generation farming was better than now. People used to use organic fertilizers. People were spending less and producing more. No one was dependent on govt supplied fertilizer. And overall production was more.

In old days we used to cultivate different crops. We used to cultivate Bengal rice (Pulav) and I remember, when we used to heat them in the ground. Production was also very good. People left cultivating it because it required a lot of work. Also we didn't had machinery which could save our grains from breaking. We used to cultivate 80, 90 maunds of potatoes. We also used to cultivate groundnuts, beans, and corn. There are two reasons why now they are not cultivate (1) There no insecticides as insect eats it and (2) wild boars, porcupines and jackals destroy crops.

Comparing to upper Kurram in lower kurram these crops are not giving good production because most of the land is unfallowed and most of the weeds and insect are there. Anything that have flower doesn't grow well due to mosquitoes. Because of war.

Climate had immense impacts on farming. Before tomato crop would stand for three months, this year (oraye/Rabi) crops got late for 20 days due to cold wave and frost bite destroyed tomato crop and other vegetables. Now suddenly temperature have soared up and destroyed all tomatoes crop.

Now, especially after war elders have become young and young elders. Now youth don't respect their elders. Before fathers used to be more authoritarian but now they don't care about sons, sons don't care about them and brothers don't care about each other. Everyone is on its own.

I do work apart from farming, when there is work around. I like farming but now, I drive tractor, before I used to have another farmer with me, I also do farming, so so many thing at hand that's why as there are no fixed prices for crops, so we don't earn that much from farming in contrast to other activities. Private middle man earn a lot and farmer is left with nothing and govt doesn't ask or devise any policy regarding it.

Govt do come over here, in 100, 10 farmers get inputs, while others are left behind. So far I haven't got anything. They bring fertilizer, seeds and pesticides, which are important inputs for farmers. Only those who have relations with them get inputs. Farmers have not raised voice against them so far. No one listens to poor farmer, wealthy don't care about it. A tenant like me can't do anything. We can't raise voice against elders.

Corn was major crop but now people are not cultivating it anymore, which farmers used to earn a lot from it. Similarly he showed me a farm, he said it no more produce rice. The plough doesn't go deep then one foot. Water supply through water channel is also big issue. Since 10 to 15 years we been ploughing this land, so now it doesn't produce rice anymore. The land has become hot, we need to cultivate rice on it, since there is no water, we couldn't cultivate rice for few years that's why it is not producing rice.

I grow nursery since childhood. Even if don't grow it for myself, I work in other peoples nursery. I know all the techniques. I don't grow coz I cant sustain the expenditure. For example seeds of potato cost 3 to 4 thousand which I cant buy myself.

Ngos one program was food for work. Farmers were provided with ration for cleaning water channel. Once an ngo brought seeds of okra, after cultivation they get very tall and had only one okra at top and had spines on it. Than I harvest it.

Before war one could keep 2 to 5 cows now you can keep more than 20. Since most of land is unfallowed so cattle production is getting good. They give more milk, they don't get ill. Give birth on time.

No it is not an issue, normally there is a lot unfallowed land so, one easily get land. Before it was an issue, you have to obey the farmer.

On the relation between farmers and tenants. Before we were two farmers now im alone. Now I do double work but don't earn as much I use to before. Since, there is shortage of labor and also we cant supply fertilizer and other inputs so most land remains unfallowed.

I do expriments, before people used to cultivate 3 maund rice for (2 pao) farm now I cultivate 2 maund for 1 pao. People used to cultivate 2 jribs from one maund, I do 6 jribs. There is 4 jribs difference. I used to work with other that who I learned or I used to ask other farmers.

Similarly I also help other farmers. If I get some messge through phone than I try to use them.

Many things have changed from old generations. But still we are devoid of that echnology. I still remember that they used to put a big wood after tractor called chapar for threshing and still somewhere in village. It was used for wheat. In rice it is same technology. There is technology for rice but not for small farms. We can make that technology but don't have that much money for that.

When I need money for work, first I do work and earn money. Than I invest it farm. Sometime I take loan from shop and pay them back when I sell my products. Middleman also give loans but they see your crop first than they give loans.

Govt should give more importance to us just like they give to farmers in Punjab. We need govt assistance. Subsidies for inputs. They should point out a store house, fixed proper rates. Last year we sold soya 2600 rs per maund, this year we sold it for 1500.

Farming is deteriorating with passage of time. Foremost reason is shortage of people after war, lands are unfallowed. For upcoming years im hopefull that it would get better. I have not done anything outside farming, so I will continue farming as when I was young I didn't do anything so in coming future im not looking forward anything else.

In vegetables now people are cultivating more hybrid seeds. So our production has increased. This year I tried to cultivate previous year hybrid seeds, it went well but cucumber were bitter.

Farming is just like bike chain. You eat and than it goes to wast and the waste is than used as fertilizer in farm. Organic fertilizer keeps fertile farm for four years,, where synthetic fertilizer only for a month. Those who used simple fertilizer or employ traditional techniques is farmer.

I want my son become farmer but he also get education. Without education you cant do farming properly. I will urge him to first to study than do farming.

People love farming but due to soo many hurdle and hard work farmers have disinterest in farming. People are looking for cultivating .

New trend is emerging people are cultivating fruits more now on their good land.

Before dap price 1600 2000 now we don't have fertilizer.

Women do more work than men. Still due to advancement in farming still women do more work. They are farming more than men. Before they couldn't come out now since after war same tribe people are around they come out.

## Appendix 2: Semi structured Interview

### Becoming a young farmer: Indonesia: IN-DEPTH INTERVIEW GUIDE

#### *In-depth interviews*

In-depth interviews will be the main method to collect primary data. The following interview guide lists the information we hope to obtain in these in-depth interviews, but it should not be used like a survey questionnaire. Questions need not be asked in the same precise sequence and the interaction should take the form of a relaxed conversation.

This guideline has 8 parts:

- A: the interview guide for young farmers (50 respondents in each location = 100 per country)
- B: for parents of young farmers (maximally 10)
- C: For young people under 18 (who are involved and not involved in farming in the village)
- D. Village government
- E. NGOs (Depends on what specific NGOs are active – detail TBD)
- F. Agricultural vocational high school (SMK / Sekolah Tinggi Pertanian), if there is one in the area
- G. Department of Agriculture
- H. Innovative/eco-friendly young farmers

#### **A. Young Farmers :**

To get information of the whole process of becoming a young farmer, we will use a life-history approach, using the overall working experiences of the respondents as an entry point.

The interview guide is organised around themes, and under each theme a number of suggested questions is listed. However, just see what is the most appropriate way to approach the theme, and by all means add additional questions where and if necessary.

Important: when the “young farmer” is married, **we will treat the couple as our “case”, starting from the assumption that both partners are “becoming a young farmer”** and try wherever possible to direct our questions to

the female partner. At some points it makes sense to ask the same question to both wife and husband (when it refers not to their farm, but to their individual activities, experiences, perceptions and aspirations)

### **Basic pathway into farming**

Use life-history approach to draw a simple timeline of the young farmers' career (including earlier points such as first helping parents, migration, etc), indicating key moments and the young farmer's age at these moments. If possible you can ask the young farmer to draw this up (or do it together).

Ask: for farming, what were the important turning points (including challenges, such as harvests lost, etc)? And why were they important in furthering your career?

Indicate when he/she decided to become a farmer (but allow for answers if this is still to be decided), and what drove the decision.

### **Main themes:**

#### **School and beyond**

(we already know the educational attainment from the survey part)

Did you have any dreams or goals when you were at school? What were they?

Have you achieved these goals since leaving school?

If you achieved your goals. What/who helped you achieve your goals?

If you haven't achieved your goals, what/who has stopped you from achieving these goals?

What have been the biggest challenges for you to stay/finish your education?

What/who has helped you to overcome those challenges?

Did you gain any knowledge or learn certain skills in school that are useful in your farm work now? If so, what are these?

#### **When you were young did you help your parents on the farm (and if not from a farming family, check whether he/she contributed as child/youth to other people's farm)?**

Here, discuss (a) young farmer's working history and (b) parent occupation, any relation between a and b

If so, give details, focusing when he/she first started working on the farm: At what age did you first start helping on the farm? In what tasks? Were you told to help, or was this your own decision? Did you like this work, or did you try to avoid it (and why)? Did you get any reward for the work you did? [a gift, pocket money, a wage, a share of the crop?] Is the above the same for your brothers/sisters? If not, what was different for them? And why (probe gender/birth order/schooling)?

**How did your contribution to your parents farm change as you grew up?** Ask: as you grew older did you start doing more/other activities on your parents' farm? What tasks (and at what age)? Why (probe: because told, because interested)? How did you like these new activities? Did the mode of reward change as you grew older? Did your parents begin to give you more/new responsibilities on the farm (i.e. not just 'helping/doing what they tell you to do', but getting involved in decision-making?) Probe also about possible 'independent farming' (maybe working a small piece of land him/herself, owning some crops, etc). Is the above the same for your brothers/sisters? If not, what was different for them? And why (probe gender/birth order/schooling)?

### **Child/youth migration**

If the respondent is a [former] migrant, ask for details: why he/she decided to migrate, and how was the decision made? Who proposed the migration (yourself, or parents?) How was this discussed with parents, did they agree? Did they help? (e.g. by financing the migration)? Did you send or bring money or gifts to your parents? Did your migration help younger siblings (e.g. paying for education, clothes, motorbike etc. ?)

When and why did you decide to come back to the village, and was this linked to becoming a farmer? Was it your own preference to return, or because your parents wanted you to come back?

How do you compare your life when away from the village with your life in the village, and why? (PROBE: how he/she might have looked at this differently between the time of migration and at presence)

If the young farmer has not migrated: Why have you stayed here? Was it because you had to stay or because you wanted to stay, and why?

### **Farm and Non-farm activities**

In addition to farming, what other sources of income do you have? (If not fully clear from the survey question, ask about the relative contribution of the various activities to his/her total income.) How do you compare the different activities you are involved in (especially in reference to farming)? Which one do you like most and why?

Who is doing most of the housework in your household (think of cooking, cleaning, childcare, going to the market, etc)? What housework is the young farmer doing him/herself?

Do you now identify as a farmer (probe if also involved in other activities if he/she perhaps rather identifies with one of the other occupations). Who is a farmer, in your view?

## **THE FARM AND ITS OPERATION**

What main crops do you grow ? (in order of importance)

What animals do you have? (livestock, poultry)

Fishpond?

In recent years,

- what crops/animals have you introduced (or expanded)
- what crops/animals have you dropped (or decreased)

How would you describe your style of farming:

- conventional (using chemical fertilizers and pesticides)
- eco-friendly (not certified)
- certified organic

Do you use any hired labour? For which activities?

### **Learning farming skills**

What are the most important things you need to know for the farming that you now practice?

How did you learn these farming skills? What was the role and relative importance of (for example): your parents/grandparents; other older farmers; your peers (young farmers); things that you learned in school, in courses/training programmes; the farmers' group; radio/TV, social media? (try to probe for specific examples!)

If you have a question or problem related to your farm work, where do you look for answers? (e.g. other young people, older people, organisations, online,etc) (again: probe for specific examples)

Does he or she ever get field explanation or inputs from government/others programs? Does she or he know any government program related to agriculture in the area (re check with local informant – village activist and local government Dinas) – how important are these for acquiring knowledge about farming?

### **Tools**

What tools do you need for your farm work? Do you own these tools, or do you borrow/rent (if so from whom, and what is the arrangement?)

If the young farmer owns some tools:

Did you take over agricultural tools/machines from your parents? Or did you have to buy these yourself? When did you first come to own a farming tool (can even be a small tool like a knife) and how did you come to acquire it?

### **Land**

How did he/she get access to their land? If his/her parents have/had land, were there discussions between parents and the children about: (for example): which of the children wants to be a farmer? Inheritance ? (How was/ will the land be divided? If one child receives more than another, how was/is this arranged between the brothers/sisters/birth order? Etc etc)

How does he/she views the prospects of coming to own land? How will this influence his prospect of fully establishing him/herself as farmer?

How do other young people in your village get their land? What he/she think about village land market (do they understand the fluctuation, the main constraints/squeezes); any different condition between man and women in accessing or inherit their land (check his/her family and neighbour) – why?

### **Generational changes and innovation**



In your view, how has farming changed between now, and when your parents' generation were young farmers? What's your opinion on traditional ways of farming?

(If the parents were farmers): Are you using the same farming style and techniques compared to your parents or traditional techniques, or are you using different practise? Explain. If you are using new techniques, inputs or practices, where did you get the idea for these changes?

Have you explored any new channels for sale of your produce?

Do you own a mobile phone (and if no personal ownership check if he/she uses someone else's phone)

Do you make any use of your mobile phone, internet and/or social media play in learning and sharing information ?

Do you follow news or current affairs related to farming (and if so, how: online/radio/TV/paper, other)?

### **Organisations/support networks**

Are you involved in the local (official) farmer's group (Poktan)? Does it provide any benefits or useful information?

Are you involved in any other (unofficial) farmer's group or network?

Is it useful to interact with the agricultural extension officer?

Are there government programmes to support young farmers like yourself? Have you participated in / benefited from any of these pgorammes?

Is finance an important problem or constraint ?What about lending money to finance your farming activity? Have you ever taken a loan? From a bank? From private lenders ?

Do you help other young people in your village with farming related issues? If so, what/whom/why?

Are you involved regularly in community groups, including youth groups? If yes, follow up on the level of involvement and whether this has any linkage with farming.

Are you involved in planning or decision making for community projects?

Are involved in existing farmer unions, associations and/ or political parties, and/or in dedicated young-farmer organisations, and new modes of networking among young farmers (with particular attention here to social media)? Explain their activities and the role of the young farmer in these networks?

If any, are they able to get what they want? Explain

What, in your view, can these organisations do to support young farmers?

### **Being young in the village**

What are the best things about village life for people of your age who are living here, and why?

In your view, what resources/support do people your age need most in this village?

Do you feel positive or negative about your future in this village? Ask why/why not?

**And finally: back to the ‘pathway’**

In five years from now, how do you see your farm, and your career ?

Can a young farmer like yourself become a successful farmer? Who do you think of as a successful farmer?

Do you have a plan to acquire more land?

What needs to happen to realise this? What sort of help/support would you need to achieve this (and from whom)?

What is it that you like most about farming and rural life? And what do you dislike most about it?

Would you like (one or more of) your children to become farmers? How do you see their futures?

**B. Parents of young farmers (we are aiming for 10 interviews in each site)**

Using same questions as above, always then referring to the relation with his/her child production. Some additional questions:

1. When you were young, did you have ideas/aspirations outside agriculture? Did you imagine yourself in another occupation?
2. (to the mother: did you hope/expect to marry a farmer, or did you hope/expect to marry someone with another occupation?)
3. Before you took over responsibility for the farm, did you work in other occupation[s], inside or outside the village? [> try to get a ‘life-course occupational biography’ of both father and mother)
4. How old were you when you took over the main responsibility for your farm (i.e. no longer just ‘helping on your parents’ farm’ )
5. When your child[ren] helped you in farm work, did you pay them? (please give details)
6. Have you transferred any land already to your children? If so, can you please explain how this transfer was arranged? Was the subject discussed with the (receiving) child and with the other children? Please give details: how much land, to which child[ren], and when ? Was the transfer a free gift (hibah), or do they have to pay you (instalments; share of the crop; continued help on the parent’s land, etc.).
7. What your opinion of your child’s decision on occupations (used some key important occupation changes of the child)
8. How the extended families support the family livelihood and how task and benefit being distributed within the family.

**C. Young people under 18 years old (who are involved and not involved in farming in the village)**

1. Are they are involved not involved in farming process? How and Why?

2. Described the commodity and production process

If involved:

3. In which process, what income/share you got, how do you used?
4. What do you plan for your future? Why? How you persue what you plan?

#### **D. Village government**

1. Occupation data in the village, main village production/income (check, if village main income is from remittances most probably is not stated by the government) and main agriculture production, the average farming size
2. Who are the richest group and the poorest group; describe their occupation characteristic
3. Describe the land market in the past and present (check with camat and land middle man); if the land price increase rather steeply; asked is there any village initiatives to preserve land for the poor and the young? How ADD and DD (village grant fund) being used in this 3 years? Why (if it related or not related to agriculture support)
4. Is there any agriculture program from central, province or local government? How it is work? Who get benefit?

#### **E. NGOs**

**Depend on what specific NGOs – detail TBD.**

What is the situation regarding young farmers and their future in this region?

What programmes or policies are geared towards attracting young people to farming?

What are the main challenges young (would-be) farmers face?

What can be done to make rural life and farming more attractive to young people?

#### **F. Vocational School**

How many students enter each year? How many complete each year? (male & female)

What is the typical background of the students? (parents' occupation).

What influences their choice for vocational school?

How do you recruit the students? Do you have (a) more applications than you can accept, (b) as many applications as you can accept (c) less applications than the numbers you could accept ?

What kinds of disciplines (*jurusan*) do you offer? Which are more and less popular, among boys and among girls?

What kinds of help (if any) do you give to students who want to become successful farmers?

What kinds of internships/practicum do they do?

Where the student goes after graduating? Which percentage goes to farming? (girls, boys)

Is farming seen as promising carrier? If not, what are the reasons? Are there concrete evidences/rational to support that?

For those students who hope to become farmers, do most of them have access to land? If land were available, do you think more students would want to become farmers?

**G. Department of Agriculture**

1. What is the main intervention to rural areas in the past 5 years? How it is work? How the result of that policy? What has been learned and the future main policy?  
– Check with reality on the ground.
2. What is the concrete policy to increase productivity of land? To increase employment opportunity? The youth income opportunity in agriculture? Rural ordinary people income? Rural inequality? – check with reality on the ground.
3. Do you have any programmes or other activities directed at young farmers / future farmers?
4. Do you have any programmes directed at women farmers (in general) or young women farmers?  
(if so, please give details: when, what, where, who were the participants/recipients, etc.)
5. How do you see the future for small farmers in this region? What kinds of support do you think most necessary to increase productivity, to improve small-farmer incomes, and to make smallholder farming attractive to the next generation?

**H. Eco friendly / innovative farmers**

1. History of farming and when there is a important change in occupation history explore the reason to change
2. How to get land and production system
3. Eco farming system
4. Detail market development
5. What their challenge in eco farming (as a youth for Irwansyah)
6. Do they have eco friendly network; how they used it
7. What their suggestion for productive intervention.

## Household Survey

**Becoming a young farmer**  
**Pre-interview structured questionnaire**  
**University of Guelph and [name of local institution]**

Survey Number					Region	MP <input type="checkbox"/>	Tamil N <input type="checkbox"/>
---------------	--	--	--	--	--------	-----------------------------	----------------------------------

Informed Consent (put ✓ mark once done)	
---	--

Village			
Name of Interviewer			
Date	...../...../2017		
Time started inter- view	.....:..... am/pm	Time finished inter- view	.....:..... am/pm
Keyed on	...../...../ 2017		

**Becoming a young farmer**  
**Pre-interview structured questionnaire**

1. Household and family members

Household: Include members who live together in this house (and eat from the same kitchen).

Family members: Include parents, siblings, and if married, include spouse, children and husband/ wife's siblings whether or not living in the same household (begin with the main respondent)

S .No.	Rela- tion to respond- ent	Ge nder	A ge	Ma rital status	Edu- cation	Occu- pation	Residence (in/out of the vil- lage)

2. Region:

3. Caste (only for India):

4. Does your household own land? 1) Yes 2) No

If yes, how many hectares of land does your household own? [Note: while local unit varies, please provide information in hectares to compare data across countries]

5. Details of land access [Note: while local unit varies, please provide information in hectares to compare data across countries]

S No. from Q1	Ownership	Cultivate don't own	but Any other, specify

<i>(begin with the respondent)</i>	<b>Own and cultivate</b>	<b>Own and don't cultivate</b>			Share d-in	Leased-in	
		Shared-out	Leased-out	Fallow			
			Go to Q6	Go to Q7			

6. If land is leased out, why do you lease out land?

- 1) No one to cultivate land
  - 2) Can't afford it financially
  - 3) Don't have knowledge/ skills
  - 4) Don't know
  - 5) No reason
- Any other, specify

7. If land is left fallow, why do leave land fallow?

- 1) No one to cultivate land
  - 2) Can't afford it financially
  - 3) Don't have knowledge/ skills
  - 4) It's good for the land/ soil
  - 5) Don't know
  - 6) No reason
- Any other, specify

8. What crops are cultivated?

S.No. from Q1	Season 1	Season 2	Season 3

9. What type of farming do you practise? (Check more than 1. If more than 1, indicate share of each type of farming)

	Share
Certified organic	
Ecological/ natural (not certified)	
Conventional with chemical pesticides and fertilizers	

10. Type of irrigation: Rain-fed/ canal/ tank/ground water/ tube well (check all that you use)

11. What are the sources of income for your household?

12. What is the share of income from agriculture (as % of HH income)?

13. How much do you contribute to the household income? (as % of HH income)?

14. Are your parents farmers? 1) Yes 2) No

15. At which age did you begin farming?