

PORNOGRAPHIC INDUSTRIES AS DIGITAL CREATIVE INDUSTRIES

**THE CASE OF ETHICAL
PORNOGRAPHY AS A CREATIVE
NICHE MARKET**

**EVGENIA PONTIKOU
STUDENT NUMBER 500797**

MASTER THESIS

**MA CULTURAL ECONOMICS AND
ENTREPRENEURSHIP
ERASMUS SCHOOL OF HISTORY, CULTURE AND
COMMUNICATION
ERASMUS UNIVERSITY OF ROTTERDAM**

Supervisor: dr. Anna Mignosa
11.6.19

Abstract

The main aim of this research is to contribute to the acknowledgement of pornographic industries as digital creative industries and furthermore, to define the role of ethical pornography as a niche creative market that takes place on the Internet. Focusing on both cultural economic and social and feminist studies is important, since the investigation of pornographic industries as creative industries through the lens of Economics, also highlights a social and feminist framework. The Foucauldian analysis of power relations is discussed next to economic theories regarding the effects of digitalization, in order to demonstrate the democratized environment of digital pornographic space as both an entrepreneurial utopia, and an arena for self-representation and self-determination.

Thus, this research provides an insight business perspective of the industry, through qualitative interviews methodology based on exclusively producers of ethical pornography. The integration of the literature review with the primary data of the interviews, shows that stigmatization has been an obstacle in the academic and social acknowledgement of pornographic industry as a creative industry. Also according to the interviews, the values that ethical pornography carries represent a human-friendly counterexample in the mainstream pornographic production and distribution. Another aspect of the notion of ethical pornography raised by both literature and interviews and requiring special consideration, is the advantages and disadvantages of the term as a brand. Finally, further research on that topic is recommended, as it would be extremely beneficial not only because it paves the way to the destigmatization of pornographic industry but also because it bridges the gap between social and feminist studies with traditional business and economic studies.

Key words: Creative Industries, Creative Economy, Niche Markets, Qualitative Research, Online Pornographic Industry, Netporn, Ethical pornography, Branding Strategies

Acknowledgements

This work signifies the end of an intense but amazing academic year. My participation in the Master program of Cultural Economics and Entrepreneurship, along with my living in The Netherlands, offered me a unique life experience as they had a great impact on me not only academically, but emotionally as well. I would first like to thank the Department of Culture, History and Communication of giving me the opportunity to explore the academic field of cultural economics and challenge myself in something new. Particularly, I would like to thank my supervising professor Dr. Anna Mignosa, for supporting my work and provided me with the right amount of information and guidance.

Special thanks are going to the participants of this work for their contribution not only to my academic work but also for the contribution of their work in the LGBTQI+ movement. This work, as any academic work, illustrate the needs of people and so, I dedicate it to the memory of Zackie Oh and to all the individuals who fight for their rights and never give up.

Of course I couldn't miss out my friends and my family for their love and support as this work could not be succeed without their contribution and trust. My parents, George Pontikos and Nadia Kokkali along with my siblings Vasilis Pontikos and Orestis Karachalios who greatly supported me this whole year. Also I would like to mention, my beloved friends, Panagiotis Vasiliadis, Eirini Mourkakou, Pescalía Divari and Alkyoni Divari for their support at the intense nights and days. Beside my friends back in Greece, I would like also to acknowledge all of the people I met here for their support and especially, Anna Pitti and Vicki Triantafylloudi for being more than just friends to me. Special thanks are going to Evangelos Darousos and his family for their constant support and encouragement and specifically to my anchor "B.Z." for its patience, as it was here all the time even when it was not around.

CONTENTS

- Chapter 1: Introduction 5
- Chapter 2: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK 8
- 2.1 THE PORNOGRAPHIC DIGITAL CREATIVE INDUSTRY 8
 - 2.1.1 Creative Industries 8
 - 2.1.2 Definitions of pornography 12
 - 2.1.3 A brief history of the evolution of audio-visual pornography 14
 - 2.1.4 Pornography as a creative industry 17
- 2.2 PORNOGRAPHIC Niche Markets 20
 - 2.2.1 Niche markets and Long Tail 20
 - 2.2.2 The new pornographies 22
- Chapter 3: Research Methodology 26
 - 3.1 Research Questions 26
 - 3.2. Research Method 27
 - 3.2.1 Semi-Structured Interviews 28
 - 3.2.2 Design of Interview: Topic Guide 28
 - 3.3 Sampling 29
 - 3.4 Data 30
 - 3.5 Conclusion 31
- Chapter 4: Results 33
 - 4.1: "Pornographic industries as creative industries" 33
 - 4.1.1. The Exogenous Stigmatization of Pornographic Industry 33
 - 4.1.2. The endogenous perception of pornographic industries as creative industries 37
 - 4.2 "Ethical pornography as a niche market" 40
 - 4.2.1. "The differences in the production and the presentation, between ethical and mainstream pornography." 40
 - 4.2.2. "The long tail of ethical pornography" 43
 - 4.3 Conclusion Remarks 46
- Chapter 5: Conclusion 47
 - 5.1 General Conclusion 47
 - 5.2 Limitations and Further Research 48
- References 51
- Appendix-A: 57
- APPENDIX- B 58
- APPENDIX-C 60

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

*“Pornography, meaning revolt; despair, dark and witchcraft
Pornography, which deeply means
A record of our times.”*

Aris Davarakis, “Pornography”¹

Among many other past researchers, Howkins (2001) describes the evolution of global economy from post-industrial to knowledge-based as a shift that draws the attention from commodities to intellectual capital and he suggests that creative economy is included in the wider notion of knowledge-based economy. In addition, Drucker (2002) highlights the distinction between “*typical worker*” and “*knowledge worker*” to show how the latter works in the production of ideas and knowledge. Since knowledge-based economy is a wider concept, this work focuses on the creative economy that includes the following characteristics: income-generation, job creation social inclusion and cultural diversity economic, cultural and social aspects interrelating with technology and intellectual property (UNCTAD, 2008). A very important part of creative economy are the creative industries. Caves (2000) describes creative industries as those involved in the creative sector of the economy, and produce cultural goods and services. A more detailed definition of creative industries will be given in the theoretical framework.

The impact of digitalization in the creative industries is dual, since from one side it facilitates their process and distribution while from the other side it creates negative externalities. Even though this work focuses on the Internet as a medium of democratization, its “dark-side” has not been overlooked. Among many other elements of digitalization, the low entry barriers, zero search costs and anonymity, create a more democratized space for creative industries in addition to traditional markets. Anderson (2004) based on the aforementioned characteristics of Internet, suggests the Long Tail theory, where the exploitation of new digital tools and distributors offer a chance for a greater visibility to niche products and services. In addition to the Long Tail theory, some researchers agree that the Internet functioning as a traditional market of cultural goods, is a winner-takes-it all market which promotes the “superstars”. In any case, both of these theories have to be examined in specific examples in order to be verified.

The pornographic industry has always been stigmatized academically and socially. This stigmatization seems to be reflected also on an economic level and particularly in regards to the aforementioned discussion of digital creative industries. Even though there have been many studies

¹ Set to music by composer Manos Hadjidakis, for the purposes of a homonymous Greek theatrical play presented in Athens, Greece in 1982.

concerning digital creative industries, pornographic industry has been undertheorized. Despite the interest by feminist and gender studies, pornographic industry has not been examined as to its business aspects. Taking this into consideration, this work aims to examine why pornographic industries are not acknowledged as digital creative industries, even though they share common characteristics. The economic discussion of pornographic industries as digital creative industries, is underlined by a social and feminist framework.

Pornography has been a really controversial subject in both academia and society. The stigmatization of pornography based on its explicit content and the impact that it has, are the main concerns of this work. Initially, Feminist and Gender Studies had analyzed pornography as an exploitative action and a phallogocentric perception of sexuality. Only after the 1990's, the emergence of the movement of the "Third Wave Feminism" introduced a reexamination of basic terms like: sexuality, gender, prostitution. Focusing on intersectionality, this new movement, approached women not as victims but as active and power individuals which can determine their bodies and their sexuality as they want. Another very interesting aspect of "Third Wave Feminism" is the perception of prostitution as a labor "sex-working" and not only as a form of depicting women through a male-gaze. A core characteristic of the movement is the reclaim of spaces that have been associated with masculinity. Based on the aforementioned characteristics, the new feminists not only preserve pornography as labor but simultaneously seek to gain the attention and the space they reserve by taking active participation not only as consumers but also as entrepreneurs.

Digitalization had played a pivotal role in the involvement of feminist entrepreneurs in the means of pornographic production. Among many other characteristics, inherent to the notion of Internet, the low entry barriers, the zero search cost and the anonymity had create a democratized environment where everyone could upload and share his/her content. Unsurprisingly, the emergence of Internet facilitated the involvement of individuals who were underrepresented and overlooked in the traditional markets. This shift in online pornographic industries is described as "*Netporn*" and includes ethical and aesthetical characteristics as a counterexample in the mainstream online production. The aforementioned social changes in conjunction with the exploitation of technological innovations, generated ethical pornography. Having discussed the similarities of pornographic industries with other creative industries and the reasons that lie behind the lack of acknowledgment, the current work aims to answer, the role of ethical pornography as a niche digital creative market.

In order to explore the above issues, the dissertation is structured as follows, in accordance with the research questions and Thematic Network Analysis. Specifically, the theoretical framework in Chapter 2, is divided in two parts in order to answer both research questions. The subchapter 2.1 provides the general theoretical framework of knowledge- based economy and gives the definitions of creative industries and pornographic industries highlighting the common similarities between them, in order to support the

argument of pornographic industries as digital creative industries and also to present the reason that the former is not included in the creative sector. The subchapter 2.2 refers to the second research question and so it gives the theoretical background of digital niche markets and more specifically introduces the notion of Netporn and ethical pornography as a result of exploitation of technological innovations and as a result of power relations, following the Foucauldian analysis of power relations. Chapter 3, provides information about the chosen methodology; how the research has been conducted and explains why qualitative research based semi-structured interviews with a single respondent has been selected as the most appropriate in order to answer to the research questions. Furthermore, it explains how the data from the interviews have been coded and analyzed base on the Thematic Network Analysis. Similar to the second chapter, the fourth Chapter of this work, is divided in two subcategories based on the Global Themes that emerged through Thematic Network Analysis. The subchapter 4.1 presents the findings of the interviews integrated and verified with the literature review referring to the first research question. Following the same example, subchapter 4.2 discusses the findings with the literature review to answer the second research question of this work. Finally, Chapter 5 offers a reflection of the findings, drawing implications and putting the limitations of the work while simultaneously suggests the importance for further research.

CHAPTER 2: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

2.1 THE PORNOGRAPHIC DIGITAL CREATIVE INDUSTRY

The main aim of this thesis is to critically address the view that pornographic industries should be acknowledged as creative industries. In order to achieve that, it is highly important to refer to the definitions of both creative industries and pornography as well as to the evolution of pornographic industry. The elements of creativity and adoption of technology as the main ingredients of creative industries will be examined within the context of pornographic industry and will be set as supportive arguments to the research question.

2.1.1 CREATIVE INDUSTRIES.

Digital and creative industries have been in the centre of the attention in the last decades. The significant rise of those industries has changed the traditional scene by changing not only the way that the cultural products or services have been produced, but also the way that are distributed. Since the main aim of this research is to examine digital pornographic industries as creative industries taking place in the digital world, it is necessary to clarify the notion of digital and creative industries.

Even though it is hard to differentiate cultural and creative industries, Moore (2014) suggests that creative industries are the descendant of cultural industries. She supports her argument based on the socio-political context of industrial revolution and the role of avant-garde, as a critical perspective to mass-production of culture. For example, the notion was first introduced by Theodor Adorno in the 1940s, when he used the term “cultural industries” to criticize the way that these industries produce the modern cultural identity, arguing that culture is made from top down managerial force and not spontaneously from the masses (Horkheimer & Adorno, 2002). The difference between cultural and creative industries came later in order as a broader term. Even though the Frankfurt School’s approach is extremely interesting from a socio-political and cultural perspective, the notion of creative industries has started been discussed again in the 1990s from a more economic perspective, in order to highlight their importance for global economic growth by generating jobs and engaging culture, human intelligence and intellectual properties (Moore, 2014). Even though it is often said that the notion of creative industries started in the 1990s under Tony Blair’s UK government as a consequence of an overall development in Information and Communication Technologies (ICT), it was actually Australia which first introduced the notion in its cultural policies document “Creative Nation” in 1994, in order to exploit the information technologies at that time (Moore, 2014).

There are many definitions of creative industries that need to be considered in order to broadly understand both the variety of those industries and their importance for global economy. Regarding the latter, Cunningham and Potts (2015) argue that creative industries link the information and Communication Technology (ICT) with Research and Development (R&D) sectors with cultural and social identity by facilitating new ideas in the socioeconomic and cultural system. It is also really important to observe that there are a lot of different terms related to creative industries, like “creative class” introduced by Richard Florida, that describes the aggregation of artists and scientists, a professional social community (Florida, 2002). As already mentioned, one of the first definitions and the most acknowledged has been given by UK government and specifically the Department of Culture, Media and Sports that describes creative industries as those “who have their origin in individual creativity, skill and talent and which have a potential of wealth and job creation through the generation and exploitation of intellectual property” (DCMS, 1998). According to that mapping document, creative industries include: Advertisement, Architecture, Arts& Antiques, Computer games and leisure software, Design and Crafts, Fashion, Film and Video, Music, Performing arts, Publishing, Television and Radio (Cunningham & Potts, 2015). The early examples of Australia and UK but also the growth of creative industries in many countries, even in cities with turbulent political environment, show how governments support and trust creative industries as an example of new business and reconstruction of the modern urbanization.

Creativity as a production process but also as an element of the product itself, is a common place in any definition of creative industries. For example, the European Commission argues that “creative industries comprise activities, related to the creation production or distribution of creative goods and services as well with the integration of creative elements into wider process and other sectors” (EC, 2012). As it is clear from the definitions, creativity as a factor is really important and characterizes all of the industries including: Printing – Publishing, Advertising, Film and Television, Creative Arts and Entertainment, Architecture, Design, Photography (GMCA, 2016). According to Jones, Lorenzen and Sapsed, “creativity is the process of generating something new by combining elements that already exist and hinged upon individuals’ and organizations’ capability and willingness to engage in non-routine and experimental activities” (2015:2). The factor of intellectual property is also highly important in creative industries and it is present in other definitions that highlight the copy-right aspects. Indicatively, WIPO suggests that creative industries are “copyright-based industries: activities or industries that copyright plays an identifiable role (...) and are engaged in creation, production, manufacture, performance, broadcast, communication, exhibition and distribution and sales of works and other types of protected subject matter” (WIPO, 2006).

To understand what may be defined as a creative industry, it is important to understand which industries belong in this sector. Caves (2000) describes creative industries as those who are involved in the

creative sector of the economy and produce cultural goods and services namely goods and services associated with artistic, cultural or entertainment value. Throsby (2001) defines cultural goods as those who require experience, display aspects of public goods that have symbolic messages, hold intellectual property and are products of human creativity. So, as it is obvious the definition of cultural goods is pretty similar to those of creative industries. Throsby (2001) describes creative industries as concentric circles that together construct the notion of creative economy. In the centre of those concentric circles are “the core creative arts” such as literature, music, visual and performing arts, the second circle consists of other “core creative industries” like film, museums, photography. In the third circle are “wider cultural industries” like heritage services, publishing, media, sound and video recording, computer games. The last circle consists of “related industries” like advertising, architecture, fashion and design.

The high growth of creative industries and their contribution to the wider market leads to the creation of a new economic theory in order to analyse and explain “creative economy” and to discuss in depth the effects of the organization of labour with creative means. As Howkins (2001) argues, creative economy is embedded in the wider notion of “knowledge-based economy”. To define knowledge-based economy, Drucker (2002) made the distinction between the typical laborer and the knowledge worker who work for the production of knowledge and ideas, and in general based upon “intellectual capital”. Creative economy emerged during a period where creativity has started to be recognized as something crucial that need become part of the industrial sector and eventually became an alternative type of growth in post-industrial world (Olma, 2018; Vesela & Klimova, 2014). According to the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (2008), “Creative Economy” is defined by certain characteristics: Firstly, it can foster income-generation and job creation while offering and promoting social inclusion and cultural diversity. Secondly, it holds economic, cultural and social aspects interrelating with technology and intellectual property, and thirdly it is an aggregate of knowledge-based economic activities. Of course, the way that each creative industry operates has to do with government policies about creative industries and public policies as copyright laws. As it will be discussed further in more depth, the copyright system is highly important especially in the creative industries of digital space -because of the internet piracy- as it allows the collection of revenues, marginalizes individual and influences the creative production (Jones, Lorenzen, & Sapsed, 2015).

As already mentioned, creative industries are strongly associated with the new technologies and digital culture and are responsible for the business of information society. The emergence of the Internet has changed the way that creative industries operate but also the way that products and services are distributed, exchanged and consumed. The positive effects of digitalization, such as low entry barriers, zero transaction costs, paved the way to a more democratized environment for a bigger and more diverse supply

of agents, as an endless number of entrepreneurs could use Internet as an “infinite-shelf-space” to engage audience that might had not the chance to be reached in traditional markets (Anderson, 2004; Bustamante, 2005). Likewise, the existence and growth of creative industries gave birth to creative economy, the emergence of new technologies and digital industries created “digital economy”. Among many other definitions of digital economy analogous to what is mentioned above, Barbrook (1999) suggested that the digital economy is characterized by both the emergence of new technologies but also by the emergence of new type of workers “digital artisans” that take advantage of the accessibility and democratization of the Internet in order to create communities and to be socially represented. That definition of digital industries is really useful in order to describe both the niche markets that rise on the Internet. These new markets through technological innovations, aim to develop new practices and a more specific and customized content in order to identify and engage consumers.

As it is mentioned above, in the given definitions of creative industries the notion of copyright protection is highly important, especially for the majority of creative industries that take place in the digital world where the free-riders problem known in public goods exist in the form of piracy, where the easement of digital copying along with the protection given by they anonymity, perpetuate piracy and rationalize stealing (Rayna, 2008). Internet piracy is one of the major issues of digitalization, where through new technologies, new mediums have been shaped in order to copy original works without the digital product losing its information and quality. Most of the studies have examined the behaviour of piracy-users trying to differentiate them in high and low value consumers, according to their willingness to pay. Piracy users are heterogeneous “with respect to the value of the original relative to the copy” (Peitz & Waelbroeck, 2003). Beside the fact of the heterogeneous valuation, there are also ethical issues of internet piracy lying in the fact that not everyone understands the consequences of piracy as an illegal action (Varian, 2005).

Similarly to other digital creative industries, pornography has to find innovative solutions to overcome piracy. Internet piracy is a very controversial issue since the effects can be seen in the short and long term, and can also be positive and negative depending on how they interact with the network effects (Banerjee, 2013). Since digital cultural goods are information goods that need to be experienced in order to understand and value their utility, piracy can have a positive impact, working both as a medium of advertisement that increases knowledge (adverse selection) about the product, and as a medium of the social prestige of the legal owner by being signal of high quality (Peitz & Waelbroeck, 2003). Furthermore, it can also push competition by expecting from markets to foster innovation strategies and increase the R&D investment (Banerjee, 2013). On the other side, in the long term piracy can have a serious negative impact on an industry by reducing a firm’s profits and block the development of creative industries to provide quality products and services (Peitz & Waelbroeck, 2003). According to Peitz and Waelbroeck (2003), since

internet piracy is a phenomenon of digitalization that cannot be eliminated, industries can react in three ways. First, in the case that piracy is beneficial, industries do not react at all. Secondly they can reduce the prices so the consumers prefer the original than the copied version and third, industries can differentiate their content by focusing on high value and sophisticated users willing to pay. That means that the heterogeneity of the copying costs can be replaced by the heterogeneity with respect to the utility of the product (Peitz & Waelbroeck, 2003). In the third case, piracy works as a driver for innovation to creative industries to change their business model and engage with a new audience. As it will be discussed in the chapter on niche markets but also in the example of the pornographic industries, creative industries are characterized by their flexibility to be creative and innovative adapting digital technologies and opportunities to produce innovative, customer-oriented products in order to remain sustainable in the competitive environments (Rieple & Pisano, 2015)

2.1.2 DEFINITIONS OF PORNOGRAPHY

The term pornography derives from the Greek word pornographos and is a combination of the words porno (prostitute or prostitution) and graphein (writing), that describes the person who writes about prostitution or prostitutes. The first appearance of the word occurred in 1857 in an English medical dictionary to define the action of prostitution as a public issue and as a matter of public hygiene (Lane III, 2000). Later definitions do not make any distinctions between pornography and art erotica often seen in ancient civilizations from the murals of Pompeii to the ancient text of Kama Sutra (Lane III, 2000). Pornography has also been confused with obscenity, the first Amendment of USA, argues that there is a distinction between obscene and pornographic content, and to the former case belongs any material that has not artistic, scientific or political value. So first Amendment of USA protects any pornography that does not have the aforementioned characteristics of obscenity (David & Hudson, n.d.). The debate about the definition of pornography shows that the notion of pornography is linked to socio-political discussions and anxieties that have to do more with its ontology and with institutional power that exist through societies and how those are perceived in different historical moments in different geographical areas (Grebowicz, 2013). Beside the technological changes that affect pornography, in the last decades the definition of pornography has not changed, a general definition refers to pornography as “a graphic depiction of sexually explicit acts made available for public consumption on media platforms” (Sullivan & McKee, 2015:4).

Another interesting aspect of pornography, is that it has been stigmatized by both the dominant heterosexual and heteronormative discourse and feminists. In the former case, pornography has been stigmatized because of the sexual bodies, pleasures and fantasies that are included in pornographic works

and “are constituted into a specific field of biopolitical regulations that are submitted to specific techniques of scrutiny and normalization” (Foucault & Hurley, 1990:55). From the other side, feminists criticize it, as a representation of stereotypical and patriarchal visions that objectify and exploit women sexuality. Even though anti-porn feminism argumentation it might be quite argumentative since it ignores the notion of self-determination, the arguments are not mistaken especially in the case of mainstream pornography where pornographies are promoted mainly to male audiences (Voros, 2014). The aforementioned arguments against pornography, can also be used as supportive arguments to the stigmatization of pornography and consequently are obstacles to the legitimation of pornography as a creative industry (McKee, *Pornography as a creative industry: Challenging the exceptional approach to pornography*, 2016). Even though the given definition of Sullivan and McKee (2015) is useful to set pornography as a media category, this work explores pornography also as a sociological phenomenon that depicts but also deconstructs aspects of life such as gender, sexuality, race, class, beauty. The understanding of pornography as a social phenomenon along with the fact that it is an act of human intelligence describe pornography as a cultural product from the most mainstream to the most resistant form it can get (Voss, 2012).

In the last decades, pornography has gained the academic interest in multiple directions. The development of feminist movement has shifted its old perspective of pornography as a form of exploitation to the acknowledgement of porn as gender representation (Attwood, *Reading Porn: The Paradigm Shift in Pornographic Research*, 2002). According to Stuttgen “post pornography lays claims to a critical revolutionary potential within the regime of sexual representation through performative excessiveness” (Stuttgen, 2010:45). Inspired by the Foucauldian discourse of power knowledge and sexuality, contemporary pornographic researchers, describe pornography as a “biopolitical device of control and representation” that operates through a wider economic system of values and manages the desires, the body and pleasures (Williams, 2004 & Stuttgen, 2010; Preciado, 2010). Theoretical perspectives of pornography have been studying it within cultural studies, as a form of cultural expression of contemporary national culture where sexual tastes are theorized as forms of cultural preferences and distinctions under different historical eras (Kipnis, 1996). Williams (1992) argues that there is not a single pornography but a plurality of pornographies as a complex aggregation of phenomena that require a combination of cultural, economic, media and political studies. This interdisciplinary approach, highlights the complexity of the pornographic industry and the importance of the pornographic industry as a fast-growing and innovative industry while also paving the way to a wider discussion of pornography as a creative industry.

2.1.3 A BRIEF HISTORY OF THE EVOLUTION OF AUDIO-VISUAL PORNOGRAPHY.

The pornographic industry has a long history associated with changes in legal decisions, technology development and economics (Tarrant , 2016). The development of pornography is strongly attached to the development of technology in order to provide accessibility, diversity and privacy, but most importantly to “bring the experience of the represented events closer to the real experience” (Kedrick, 1996:248). The relationship of the pornographic industry with technology is characterized by an interaction between new technological investments and the pornographic production, contribution and distribution while simultaneously pornography is considered as a driver of communication technologies (Coopersmith, 2000 & Johnson, 1996). The relationship of pornography and technology also has an economic aspect since pornographic demand is limitless because people will always desire and be open to buy the latest and more premium products or services in order to fully experience pleasure but also to protect their privacy (Coopersmith , 2000). The limitless demand of pornographic content not only creates high profits, but also creates incentives that foster the industry in order to be more creative engaging with new technologies. Also as it will be discussed further, the evolution of pornography from the “The Golden Era of porn” until its digitalization and the emergence of niche markets can show how different media can affect customers’ relationship with the same content (Jenkins, 2007).

The starting point of pornography is vague likewise its definition, the beginning of porn history can go back to ancient civilizations but that can lead also to anachronisms since those depictions of nudity and sexuality are not necessarily pornographic in the sense of contemporary definition of pornography. In order to avoid any confusion, this work examines the audio- visual evolution of pornographic industry in the West after the invention of pornography in 1839 where pornography in form of sexual actions between a couples was one of the first themes portrayed in daguerreotypes (Tarrant , 2016). In 1895, only one year after Lumiere brothers improved cinematograph, the first pornographic movie was released by Eugene Pirou and Albert Kirchner (Tarrant , 2016). “Stag films” launched in 1910 under illegal distribution in the United States were basically “silent, black and white, twelve minutes long films aimed at male homosocial groups who watched those films together in brothels” (Tarrant , 2016). After 1960 the legislation of porn in the majority of European countries and the first Amendment changed cultural attitudes towards sex (Simpson, 2009). The era between 1960 and 1979 had been described as the “Golden Age of Porn” or “Porn Chic”, at that time pornographic movies were distributed in adult movie theatres that had just opened and movies like “Deep Throat” (1972) and “The Devil in Miss Jones” (1973) received mainstream popularity and high profits. Due to the mainstream attention of pornographic films during that period, pornographic industries had

strengthen and established their power especially regarding to legal issues with the State. The introduction of video cassettes and video recording in 1979 replaced the traditional film production and made the production and distribution of pornography easier, cheaper and created a bigger potential market, where not only men but also women could purchase pornography (Coopersmith, 2000 & Lane III, 2000).

According to Lane (2000), despite the popularity and the high profits that pornographic movies received during the “golden age of porn”, the legal fights continued. The technology of the video and the advantage of privacy, saved the pornographic industry from continuously legal restrictions. The coming of videos did not only affect the increase of demand but also the supply side, which started to become bigger, this means that the introduction of movie cameras, that were more affordable and portable, allowed anyone to create pornography. That accessibility paved the way to the emergence of producers willing to differentiate their content from the mainstream products (Coopersmit, 2000). Although that does not imply a democratized pornographic industry, since the growth of porn productions was still a “from men to men” job, only after the emergence of digitalization and Internet the scene has been more democratized.

The evolution of pornography from analogue to digital, shows how effectively the pornographic industry has exploited technological innovations in order to establish itself and maximize its profits. Likewise any technological development, the introduction of the Internet has changed the production, distribution and consumption of pornography as it has changed the relationship between producers and consumers (Kibby & Costello, 2001) . The accessibility, affordability and anonymity of Internet along with low entry barriers and zero transaction costs, provide a democratized, decentralized market in terms of “a transnational community by net users” (Jacobs, 2004:2). Those communities have an important radical and strategic role within the Internet and especially in the landscape of pornography as they re-examine the notion of power, speech and representation. Beside the economic opportunities of Internet, the emergence of new pornographic communities, can be analyzed based on the Foucaudian Discourse Analysis (Foucault & Hurley , 1990). In his book, “The History of Sexuality”(1990), Foucault explain the notion of power relations to examine power not only as an oppressive medium of institutions to powerless individuals but also as something that occurs in daily interactions between individuals and institutions. Specifically, Foucault analyse power as resistance of the individuals that had been oppressed rather than an oppressive possession per se. As it will be discussed in the following chapters, this theory can be verified in the case of online pornography through the emergence of alternative pornographies and communities as a counter example in the mainstream pornography.

According to Grebowicz (2013) the Internet affects pornography in two ways. First in terms of social meaning, transforming it into limitless information, and secondly politically making that information accessible. The web has transformed the landscape of pornography not only because it simplifies access but

also because it normalizes practises that used to be stigmatized and generates a new community where people with less public visibility and power can actively express, explore and reclaim their sexuality (Grebowicz, 2013). The anonymity and privacy of Internet affects the pornographic demand as it creates “a positive sum market by converting shy citizens to eager online consumers” (Cronin & Davenport, 2001:39). Perdue’s (2004) argument “sex shaped the Internet” lies behind the fact that pornographic industries in order to fulfill the desires of a potential audience but also to offer them easier and private access, adapt and support each new technology. So in most of the cases every technological investment that has to do with Internet, has been first tested in pornographic sites and then in mainstream platforms (Coopersmith , 2000). From the supply’s side, online pornography allows more producers to create more explicit content based on their sexual desires and also facilitates the distribution to a wide proportion of audience (Mazzeres, Trachman, Cointet, Coulmont , & Prieur, 2014). The contribution of the Internet in a shift to a more diverse and representative pornography will be discussed in the last chapter.

2.1.4 PORNOGRAPHY AS A CREATIVE INDUSTRY

As the main purpose of the current work is to examine pornographic industry as a creative industry, the given chapter discusses the common characteristics of pornographic industries with other creative industries, related to entertainment sector, following Caves's (2000) definition of creative industries as those which are involved in the creative sector of the economy and produce cultural goods and services. Among many other researchers who examine the pornographic industry, Sullivan (2015) McKee (2012, 2016) and Voss (2012) highlight that the reason that pornography is not considered as a creative industry is not because of its process but because of the symbolic message of its content. Discussions around pornography take into consideration, the symbolic message of its content to examine its morality under specific social and historical moments (Sullivan & McKee, 2015; McKee, 2012 & 2016; Voss 2012). According to Jiz Lee and Rebecca Sullivan (2016) the stigmatization of pornography occur because pornography is not considered as a labour. Based on that, the anti-porn discourse, argues that the people involved in pornography are not capable to be or to feel security. Voss (2015) argues that the industry carries stigma from the beginning because of the social puritanism and especially because the role of church in the creation of public speech. The financial challenges of that stigmatization can be seen in funding platforms like Kickstarter that do not allow porn-based projects, but also in payment services like Amazon Payments, Google Wallet and Paypal that do not let their users to buy adult products (Tarrant , 2016)

Placing the pornographic industry in the context of the creative industries permits us to examine the process of production and distribution of pornography next to other cultural productions (McKee,2012). McKee (2012) defines pornography as a fundamentally audio-centred entertainment industry arguing that entertainment has always been pornified and pornography has always been entertainized (pg 542). The definition of entertainment in McKee's work takes into consideration the evolution of entertainment in the Western culture in comparison to art and its establishment in the nineteenth century as an aesthetic system of vulgarity. In order to support his argument, he analyzed the elements of entertainment: story telling, seriality and adaptation, happy endings, interactivity, spectacular, emotion, fun, audio- centericity in order to find similarities. According to McKee (2012), the story is a really important element of entertainment in music forms and in mainstream film industry but story telling is also important in pornography that genuinely is a story about sex that want to create fun and pleasure. Story builds the context of the film that each consumer want to interact with, and structures a continuity of events that eventually lead to a happy-ending "the money-shot".

Even though the social legislation of pornographic industry as entertainment is really important since it paves the way for a wider discussion of pornography as a creative industry, the stigmatization of the

industry has led to a lack of knowledge of the business aspects of the industry such as its dynamics, strategy and structure in the literature on information society and economy. The present work not only aims to define pornographic industry as a creative industry, but also to approach the topic from a business oriented perspective in order to show the significance of pornographic industry to the global market.

Following the work of Agustin (2005), McKee in his latest work (2016) presents the similarities of pornographic industries and other creative industries and he argues that in order to understand the pornographic industry as a creative industry it is required to separate contemporary pornography from the context of its “golden age”². He suggests that distinction because he argues that not only the characteristics of pornographic industries but especially the challenges that has to face, are similar to those of creative industries. Firstly he suggests that the majority of discussions around pornographic industries are focused on the people in front of the camera while in fact pornographic industry is formed by a large crew of “non-sexual employees” who share the same experience as those who work in mainstream creative industries. Secondly he argues that although performers of pornographic movies carry the legacy of “porn star” actually there is a small proportion of the people who can be described as stars. Discriminations occur in pornography as well in any other job and those who actually earn the high profits are the producers (Abbott, 2010; Simonton & Smith, 2004). The same example can be seen in other creative industries where the myth of creative industry as a dream job, described also as a “Creative hype” in reality is characterized by great job insecurity, minimum participation in the creative process and low salaries (Ross, 2009; McKee, 2016). Thirdly, he suggests that digitalization had affected pornography as is the case for every creative industry, changing its traditional business model and revenues. The changes had not only occurred from the aforementioned advantages of Internet, which have created an oversupply of pornographic content, but also from the zero costs and the easiness of digital reproduction and copy of original works and internet piracy. Internet piracy is a really controversial phenomenon since its effects can be criticized as either negative or positive in the short and in the long term. Internet piracy has challenged the status of “old – style pornocrats” (Economist, 2011). The introduction of Internet augured the end of the “golden age of porn”, eventually the big companies have given their place to aggregate sites, the digital copies have taken the place of VHS cassettes, and original works have given their place to pirated copies.

Piracy impacts all creative industries, however in the case of pornography it is more complicated because of the stigmatization of the industry as not a normal job. Pirates usually tend to rationalize their action and since there is a lack of knowledge about the impact of piracy on porn industry, the action is

² The term “Golden Age of Porn” refers to the period around 1964-1984 where pornographic movies received positive attention from the mainstream media. After the introduction of video cassettes and private viewing, some of the most profitable studios ran out of business

considered less unethical than it is considered in other creative industries (Brown, 2014). Piracy affects the production of pornographic industry in the same way that it affects the film industry. The existence of free, streaming sites drives down the actual revenues of the industry, creates less incentives to people who consume pornography to pay for it and hence fewer money goes to the production and the people who actually contribute. From another side, many others consider piracy as an inevitable phenomenon and aim to benefit from it by using it as an advertising tool. Although that practice has tried to monetize piracy, it has come to a bitter end since tube sites make more money than the copyright holders (Tarrant , 2016).

Likewise any creative industry, pornography seeks ways to face the challenges of internet piracy using lawsuits and digital fingerprinting technology. The most common antipiracy organization in online pornography is the Porn Guardian which sends Digital Millenium Copyright Act (DMCA) notices to pirates users or tube sites to inform them that they have violated the law (Tarrant, 2016; Brown, 2014) The International Foundation for Online Responsibility has published a guide for the protection of intellectual property of online pornography (IFFOR, 2012). According to that guide, copyright holders of pornographic work should register the copyrights of their content and watermark their content and also engage with the Digital Millenium Copyright Act. Digital Millenium Copyright Act (DMCA) is a USA copyright law enacted in 1998 and its main purpose is to protect the intellectual property of digital material, even though it applies only in United States, Worlds International Property Organization (WIPO) protects copyright in approximately two hundred countries.

Beside the business strategies, lawsuits and antipiracy notices through organizations, in 2012 porn creators and performers started an Internet campaign called “#payforyourporn”, that argue that free access is killing the pornographic industry. According to the campaign, illegal downloading results in a loss of jobs, lower wages, higher unemployment and higher taxes (Pay for your Porn, n.d.). Taking into consideration that pornography is a stigmatized industry and porn piracy is not valued as an illegal action in the same way that it does in the mainstream film, the campaign aims to inform the audience about piracy’s consequences. The campaign also argues that paying for pornography, ensures that it has a high quality and it is better produced (Why Pay For Your Porn?, 2017).

According to McKee (2016) all of the creative industies face internet piracy, hence there are two strategies that pornographic industries and mainstream creative industries should follow in order to survive and remain profitable. The first strategy is to lower the price of the content and make it available through manifold distribution plattforms for advertismnt in aggregate sites “network sites that are a combination of user-generated content, creator- uploader professional content and pirated professional content” (Sullivan & McKee, 2015:60). Even though many creators follow this strategy it is not clear if it is actually beneficial, since it decreases the profit margins of the industry (Sullivan & McKee, 2015) The second strategy

that pornographic industries can follow, is to provide high quality productions as part of their branding, in order to engage high value internet users. Regarding the last strategy, McKee (2016) suggests to creative industries in general, to target niche markets, niche markets as a branding strategy will be discussed further in the following section.

2.2 PORNOGRAPHIC NICHE MARKETS.

As it has been mentioned above, the introduction of the Internet has changed not only the way that pornography is conceived but also the production and contribution of pornography, making it one of the most profitable industries globally. In the previous section it was discussed how Internet piracy has challenged the status and power of pornographic industries. This section discusses another aspect of digitalization that affects pornographic industry, niche markets. Even though there are a lot of online niche pornographies, this essay aims to highlight the difference between niche marketing and “exclusionary politics” (Sullivan & McKee, 2015:29). The low entry barriers of the digital market affect the product itself, by facilitating the entrance of another type of pornography opposing to the standards of mainstream pornographic culture (Lane III, 2000). The indie or alternative pornography exploits the elements of Internet and offer greater visibility, representation to an audience that has been previously underrepresented by the dominant heteronormative mainstream pornography (Attwood,2010).

2.2.1 NICHE MARKETS AND LONG TAIL

Having in mind that the existence of niche markets is not a contemporary phenomenon, this work explores the dynamics of niche markets in the digital area as both economic and political action of social representation. From an economic perspective a general definition of niche markets can describe them as small but growth markets with no real competitors that serve customer-oriented products or services to a small and specific target audience (Dalgic & Leeuw, 1994). Following Calacanis and Shani’s (1992) approach of niche markets as a creative process (“nichemanship”), the current thesis explores the emergence of new creative industries in forms of niche markets in order to fulfil a gap in the market. According to that theory “niche marketing is a bottom-up approach where the market starts from the needs of few customers and gradually builds up a larger customer base” (Chalasanani & Shani, 1992:35). Even though Chalasanani and Shani did not consider the digital market when they referred to niche marketing as a bottom-up approach, the advantages of the digital space offers that chance for user generated and democratized environment where niche markets will be allowed to use technological innovations in order to serve specialized services and products to their specific audience.

As already mentioned, niche markets attempt to differentiate products that do not exist in the established markets for the needs of their target audience. This customer-oriented strategy creates a friendly environment between the supplier and the consumer that is inherent in the process of marketing and product branding consequently (Dalgic & Leeuw, 1994). The shift in digital production and distribution along with the zero search costs and the absence of entry barriers and intermediaries offered to people what Cooper (1998) describes as “Triple A”, (accessibility, affordability and anonymity) but also a stage for diversity and recasting of sexual interests while offers greater variety of innovative products and services to a wider potential audience. The economic theory that describes better that situation is called Long Tail theory and was introduced by Anderson (2004). According to Anderson the new digital tools and distributors have an impact on supply but also on the demand for niche products through personalized recommendation tools that offer a chance to niche markets and especially to cultural goods for a greater visibility. Niche markets are characterized by high customer-oriented strategy, Anderson argues that Internet foster that process and highlights that “the Long Tail business can treat customers as individuals, offering mass customization as an alternative to mass market fare. They make everything available, pull customers down the tail with lower prices and help customers to explore and find out what they need” (Anderson, 2004). In that case, based on the arguments of Anderson the centre of niche branding is not the product itself but the relationship with the customers and the recognition of them as individuals and not as passive consumers. Andrei and Dumea (2010) argue that the Long Tail, niche markets share common ground with brand-lead business, namely businesses which prioritize value in the branding of the product and are passionate to serve customers by building a healthy and human relationship and by treating them as individuals.

The long tail theory describes the shift from traditional to digital markets where the unlimited storage space and low or even zero distribution costs offer a wider variety of niche products while in the traditional market they would be overshadowed by best-sellers. Sales concentration of best-selling products characterized by Pareto’s principle of 80/20 where a small popular products’ proportion of 20%, engenders a larger proportion of sales 80% (Andrei & Dumea, 2010). The Long Tail theory contradicts Pareto’s principle in the digital markets, and suggests that the low search costs of Internet facilitate an increase in not easily accessible products that consequently lead to a longer tail (Brynjolfsson, Hu, & Simester, 2011). However, the Long Tail has create conflict discussion, as on the one side there are those who agree about the application of Long Tail theory in the digital markets while on the other side there are those who believe that at the end leads to “superstar effect” (Rosen, 1981). Even though Brynjolfsson et al (2011) who supported Anderson’s theory suggesting that due to the digital market the sales will be less concentrated, in their latest study (Brynjolfsson & McAfee, 2014) argue that the technologies that were supposed to enable mass entrepreneurship, eventually tend to support the “winner-take-all markets”. In addition, Keen (2015)

regarding to cultural- creative industries, he criticize Long Tail theory as “a nostalgic guff on the cottage industry of middle class cultural producers all making all making a reasonable living from the digital economy” (p.143). So both of the aforementioned critics to Long Tail theory, perceive it as utopic due to the fact that the “infinite-shelf-space” requires attention which is basically a very scarce resource (Olma, 2018). In their study Kendall and Tsui (2011) aimed to show that in information technology either case (long tail or superstar effect) depend on the impact that new technologies have on the structure of the producer’s cost and on the subjective preferences. Therefore for the purpose of long tail effect, the low entry costs encourage the entry of niche markets with “horizontal differentiation” while the same reduction that technological innovations offer in “vertical differentiated” industries leads to superstar effect (Kendall & Tsui, 2011:26).

To conclude, based on the previous discussion it is clear that the market of creative industries and especially the majority of those that take place in the digital market, is a really vague and controversial issue. The Internet is not a utopia and the actions and reactions in capitalism that take place in physical place, occur in the digital world as well. In any case, the effects of digitalization and its democratized environment through the accessibility, availability and anonymity have given space to a variety of products and niche markets to engage the audience. The economic theories and practises of long tail theory and superstar effect depend on the unique idiosyncrasy of each industry and to the extent that technology affects the cost structure. In the following section, long tail theory and superstar effect will be discussed in more depth, adopted in the example of pornographic industries.

2.2.2 THE NEW PORNOGRAPHIES.

The solutions that pornographic industry, as a creative industry, has to take in order to face the challenges of digitalization, are niche marketing and branding. Considering that, contemporary audio-visual pornography seems to transform its business model following the example of other creative industries. Exploiting the latest technological investments, contemporary pornography aims to reconstruct its tradition and identity by differentiating itself from the mainstream pornography focusing both on authenticity and in the aspects of the production process (Biasin & Zecca, 2009). This work, examines the new type of pornography “Netporn” as a niche markets and gives special attention to the individuals that producing it. Taking Schumpeter’s definition (Schumpeter, 1934) of entrepreneurs, as the people who realize and carry innovative combinations aiming to deconstruct the status quo of an old model, Netporn’s producers, as it will be discussed bellow, are certainly try to achieve that.

There are two strategies that contemporary creative industries follow to remain profitable, “to become dominant global players or to become specialized niche markets” (Biasin & Zecca, 2009:136), in the case of online pornography. Given the threat of piracy, this latter strategy seems more feasible. According

to Biasin and Zecca (2009) the online niche pornographies aim to exploit economic, aesthetic and human resources in order to offer to their audience a variety of products. Biasin and Zecca (2009) suggest three types of strategies that niche pornographic industries have to follow in order to place their cultural valued product as a brand in the online market competition. The first strategy is “author brand”, where the product carries the author’s signature as a sign of its quality. This branding strategy is usually seen in mainstream film industry, in addition the pornographic industry follows the “actors branding strategy” that focuses on the famous performers or on not yet known and amateurs as a sign of diversity and quality that aims to fulfill the needs of a specific audience. The second branding strategy focuses on the genre of pornography in terms of product differentiation. As in the first case, that branding strategy aims to engage the audience providing a customer oriented and sophisticated explicit content. The last branding strategy of a niche market is the “high concept brand”, regarding technological investments and high quality productions. According to that branding strategy, new pornographies intend to become highly specialized niche players, promoting cultural values such as “involving the audiences in the creative process not as a multimarket consumers but as mediators in the play of narrative signification” (Biasin & Zecca, 2009:139).

Taking into consideration that the oversupply of niche online pornographies is not only a result of an impulsive willing but rather a business strategy by the industry itself (Johnson J. , 2011), this work is focused on the more politically involved part of the industry that adopts these branding strategies in order to propose a different model of production and distribution. That model of feminist and queer producers and activists, capitalizes aesthetic, political and cultural aspects of representation in order to provide a ethical business model and a sophisticated work of cultural value. According to Lee and Sullivan (2016) this type of pornography which is based on ethics, creates a content that itself is part of genre or brand and does not objectify the performers. In addition, it reveals the labour negotiations.

There are plenty of terms that describe the landscape of new pornographies, in general terms, they are described as “alternative pornographies” that aim to “redefine themselves through a variety of oppositions to mainstream porn culture” (Attwood, 2007: 449) Both the notions of Netporn and alternative pornography describe the new pornographic phenomenon, the only difference is that the former term is Internet exclusive. In regard to readers convenience, this work will use the term, Netporn, in order to describe its counter aesthetic, political (involving female and queer displays), ethical (not oppressive working conditions), economical (not only about profits) and technological elements, contrary to mainstream culture, along with the shifts in the production, distribution and consumption of pornography (Paasonen, 2010;2014). All of the above elements of Netporn interact with each other, as it has been mentioned as an advantage of digitalization and Internet, the cheap technologies and the low entry barriers democratize pornographic landscape by facilitating the process of production and distribution. Based on that fact, new

communities referring to alternative sex and queer cultures, have the opportunity to reclaim their desires and reflect their images and express their sexuality and tastes against the conventional representations (Smith C. , 2014; Jacobs,2014). Because of the political background of feminist theories, Netporn is usually considered as a softer pornographic version only for women. The latter hypothesis is completely mistaken since the only difference in the content and in the aesthetics of Netporn is that it serves higher quality and high production values, respects the humanity, and presents authenticity.

Taking Foucauldian analysis of power relations, Netporn, has to be understood based on its political context, as “a vehicle of power”(Foucault, 1980). Foucault’s meaning of power includes the following elements: First “the relationality of power”, based on that, power is dependent on the relations between people and secondly he suggests the multidirectional direction of power, to show that power comes from below (Foucault, 1995) Specifically, based on Foucault’s approach, Netporn can be characterized as an action of resistance by individuals that are tired to consider themselves as objects of heteronormative patriarchal dominant power, that aim to exceed and challenge mainstream porn (Biasin, Maina, & Zecca, 2014). Therefore, Netporn is the “locus” where power is understood as a productive factor that generates new behaviours and resistance (Biasin, Maina, & Zecca, Introduction, 2014; Foucault & Hurley , 1990).

As it has been indicated in the definitions of niche markets, the new pornographies suggest a different business model based on ethical agreements between the producers, performers and consumers of pornography. These ethical agreements do not only refer to the content and the representation of diversity but also to financial aspects. In addition to mainstream pornography that has been characterized by payment discrimination among performers, ethical production suggests a flat rate irrespective of gender, sexuality, body type, experience and action (Tarrant , 2016). The ethical agreements are part of a wide definition of ethical pornography that understands ethical as “an alternative economic structure of alternative economies and aesthetics of the alternative pornographies” (Wilkinson, 2017:3). Taormino defines ethical porn as the one that pays good and treats with respect performers (Breslaw, 2013). Also, Nichi Hodgson, head of the Ethical Porn Partnership (EEP), suggests that ethical pornography offers high quality content, while ensuring the welfare of the people involved on it. Considering that, ethical porn is not necessarily feminist or queer because of its content but because it aims to “create unique content that has the potential to elevate careers, provide income and give birth to new production studios with new, inspired filmmakers” (Lee, 2014). For example, the emergence of big ventures like PinkLabel, Erica Lust along with smaller sites, aim to build a business model of pornography based on feminist ethics and also to communicate those principles to their customers.

These new ventures, are either subscription, aggregate or community user sites (Sullivan & McKee, 2015). In the first case, the platforms offer their services after a subscription, this model is usually seen in

pornographic production websites and it permits a wider variety of pornographic production and hence engagement but also allows the creators to control their work and profit from it. Aggregate sites “combine user-generated content, creator- uploaded professional content and pirated professional content” (Sullivan & McKee, 2015:60). The first two examples of pornographic sites usually focus on the production and distribution of mainstream pornography, specifically the case of aggregate sites is debatable since the piracy content seems to have taken most of the place. Community user websites do not focus on the profits but they aim to achieve artistic and political goals. As Attwood (2007) argues, the membership in Netporn sites and especially in community user websites engage the consumers with a wider pro-sex cultural community based on the formulation of sexual sensitivity and recasting of sexual interests. In those communities, the economic and cultural production formed under certain aesthetics in the form of ethics (Attwood, 2007). Even though their radical manifestation against Western capitalism comes in contradiction to the subscription model, the creators of those sites, understand pornography as a labour, as a job that needs to be paid in order to survive. The small- scale economies based on the direct interaction between producers and consumers pave the way to a new theory of sexual politics. Based on that politics and #PayforyouPorn action, pornography is appreciated as creative work where piracy, low wages and “precarious employment” can be solved by paying the people that are involved in the cultural and creative labour.

CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

In the previous chapter, theoretical concepts and definitions of creative industries and pornographic industries have been discussed to present arguments about the legitimacy of the latter within the wider notion of creative industries. In addition, it has been discussed the emergence of alternative pornographies and their role as niche markets in the digital space. As it was revealed by the given literature review, pornographic industry share more similarities than differences with the other industries that are defined as creative industries. Unfortunately, the social stigma handicap social legislation of pornographic industries as labour and consequently as a creative labour. The main aim of this chapter is to explain the methodological approach that has been used to answer the research questions, outlined in the introduction and discussed in more depth. This chapter also analyze how the qualitative research has been conducted based on interviews and how the sampling has been selected.

3.1 RESEARCH QUESTIONS

As it has been indicated from the literature review, pornographic industry causes many debates because of the social stigma it carries due to its symbolic content. This work aims to answer two research questions through a combination of literature research and qualitative research. Firstly, this thesis intend to draw the similarities between pornographic and other creative industries and also to explore the reasons that it is not acknowledged as one of those. Therefore, the first research question is:

- Why pornographic industry is not acknowledged as a creative industry?

Also the thesis is focused on the emergence of ethical pornography as a niche creative market, which seeks to differentiate itself from the mainstream pornography in order to overcome the stigma and give stage to underrepresented individuals. Hence, the second research question is:

- What is the role of ethical pornography as a niche market?

More specifically, both the aforementioned research questions aim to explore pornographic industries as part of the creative sector but also as it will be discussed further, special attention has been given in the transformation of pornography into a more creative process. This shift, mostly happened as a result of feminist activist producers and performers, intends not only to offer a counter example but also to change the way that people perceive pornography.

3.2. RESEARCH METHOD

The thesis is conducted using a qualitative approach. According to Bryman (2016) and Denzin (2010) qualitative research is focused on interpretivist epistemology and in micro-scale of social reality, where the world is examined as it has been experienced and interpreted by the participants of the research. As it will be mentioned in the section on “Sampling” (3.3), the author of the research wanted to let the people involved in pornographic industries to introduce and speak for themselves and express their ideas and beliefs about the main topics of the thesis. In fact, qualitative research is based on subjectivity and its purpose is to describe what participant say in relation to discipline based concepts and to explain their opinion about a specific theory (Cropley, 2019)

According to Bryman (2016) there are many important elements of qualitative research. For the purposes of this work it seems more efficient to refer only to those that were important in the selection of qualitative methodology anent to this research such as: the emphasis on the context, flexibility and deductive approach. In the former case, emphasis is given to the context because it is analyzed as the place where individuals’ behaviors take place. Flexibility is strongly related with subjectivism and the lack of structure. Based on that, the author has used a semi-structured data collection instrument using general questions in order to reveal participants’ perspective.

Even though qualitative research is usually associated with the inductive approach, the difference between the deductive and inductive approach are not based on “easy and fast distinctions” (Bryman, 2016:24). According to Patton (1990) a deductive approach can be followed in both qualitative and quantitative studies. The current thesis, is characterized by a deductive reasoning approach as it aims to test a general theory to a specific case. Specifically, the main aim is to interpret pornographic industries as creative industries and verify assumptions based on existing literature using semi-structured interviews.

As it has been discussed in the literature review, pornography is a really sensitive topic and requires trust and an elegant approach (Fahie, 2014). Taking into consideration feminist theory and approach to understand pornography as a labor, qualitative research was the most compatible research method because of its focus on subjectivity and interpretivism, it engages women’s’ experiences to be heard (Scott, 2010) and also avoid any possibility of exploitation since participants are the subjects and not the objects of the research (Mies, 1993). The role of feminism in the research will be discussed further in the following chapter (3.2.1), in relation with the way the semi-structured interviews have been constructed.

3.2.1 SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEWS

Interviews have been the most common method of data collection in qualitative research. As it has been discussed, qualitative research is focused on subjectivity and the relational and contextual aspects of the subject that has been studied, therefore quality interviewing not only generates a significant variety of detailed data but also offers the interviewee's perspectives about what is discussed (Bryman, 2016; Newton, 2010; Adams, 2015). As it has been outlined above, qualitative research and hence qualitative interviewing is common in feminist studies that seek for the representation of underrepresented individuals (Oakley, 1998; Mies, 1993). Therefore, this study, following a feminist framework, has conducted semi-structured interviews based on a non-hierarchical relationship and on the mutual respect between interviewer and interviewees (Bryman, 2016)

A total of eight web-based semi-structured interviews with a single respondent – approximately 60-90 minutes duration each – were conducted between February and March of 2019, through video-calls via Skype. As the majority of the respondents does not live in Europe, Skype has been used in order to overcome the problem of distance and conduct the interviews. According to Berg (2007) there are two areas where web-based-in-depth interviews take place: “the asynchronous environment”, that usually include the use of email and “the synchronous environment” that include real time similar to face-to-face interview experience as in the case of this work. The author preferred video-call rather than a call, in order to build trust and intimacy with the respondents (Sullivan, 2012). Even though there were some difficulties with image quality, Skype has been also a useful tool, since it gives the opportunity of recording the video-calls which facilitated both the interview and the transcription.

3.2.2 DESIGN OF INTERVIEW: TOPIC GUIDE

As in most of the cases, the semi-structured interviews followed an interview guide (Patton, 1990) where even in a tentative order, topics and aims of the research are planned thematically and in continuity following a smooth sequence (Copley, 2019). Even though semi-structured interviews follow a certain order, the interview guide is not to limit their flexibility, the interview should be understood as a work in progress where the interviewer will be flexible to reorder the topics without missing any important part (Bryman, 2016).

The interview topic guide, designed for the interview to last at least one hour, included questions focused on the business side of the pornographic industry, and was divided into four main sections. The first section has to do with the introduction of the participant, his/her background, experience and motivation. In the second section, participants were asked to give the definitions of the main terms like ethical pornography and creative industries. The third section discusses the business aspects of the pornographic

industry and the case of ethical pornography as a branding strategy. The last section examines the effects of digitalization on the pornographic industry. Even though the aforementioned structure seems quite strict, during the interviews, the order has changed as parts of the conversation seemed to gain more attention than others. Following Bryman's (2016) ethic code for qualitative interviewing, at the beginning of an interview some introductory comments about the purpose of the research, the request for record permission and an anonymity notice³ took place. The end of the interview includes a statement and expectation about the future of pornographic industry, along with a thankful statement and demographic data about the respondent.

3.3 SAMPLING

According to Bernard (2002), data gathering is very important in a research as it is meant to contribute to a better understanding of the literature. To gather data, I chose to use the purposive sampling method where the researcher does not seek his/her sample randomly but it is based on the research goals (Bryman, 2016). According to Patton (1990) "Purposeful sampling lies in selecting information-rich cases"⁴ (p.169). In purposive sampling, the researcher actively decides what is to be known and who is the most suitable – based on his-her knowledge and experience – to provide him/her with information (Bernard, 2002).

Moreover, the majority of the studies that examine pornography focused on the viewers, this thesis aims to offer the business perspective of the pornographic industry and especially ethical pornography as a creative niche market. Therefore the most appropriate sampling considers the people that are working behind the camera in alternative and ethical pornographic sites that use a subscription model of payment⁵. Hence, there were two requirements, first the participants had to be not only familiar with the notion of ethical pornography, but also to express his/her work through the values of the ethical production and second to distribute online ethical pornography in their sites or in other distribution channels based on a subscription model of payment. Based on the aforementioned requirements, the purpose sampling approach undertaken is criterion sampling, that involves the recruitment of individuals that meet a certain criterion, specifically, all of the participants are individuals involved in the production of ethical pornography (Bryman, 2016; Patton, 1990)

³ It is important to mention that the respondents had no problem to use their name for the purpose of this essay.

⁴ Patton used the term "formation-rich cases" to describe the cases from which someone can earn a great deal of information about important issues for the purpose of the research.

⁵ Both of the terms, "alternative" and "ethical" have already been discussed in the literature. See chapter : 2.2 "The New Pornographies"

In order to recruit the sample for the semi-structured interviews, the author based on the aforementioned requirements, searched the Internet, using the phrase “ethical pornography”, where she found guides for feminist and ethical pornographic sites and then she sent the latter an email explaining the purpose of the thesis and asking for participation in the research. The author had received twenty positive answers, but based on interviews on the academic magazine “Porn Studies”, which has been really an important guide and has contributed to the theoretical framework of this research, she excluded some pornographic sites that claim to be ethical where in fact are not. Twitter has also been a really useful medium to collect and ensure the validity of the sampling, since many of the ethical pornographic industries seemed to care about posting articles about ethical pornography and some political actions, in addition to mainstream pornographic industries that claim to be ethical.

The study’s final sample is composed by eight participants, two men and six women, age between 31-58, who produce ethical pornography mainly outside Europe while only two out of eight respondents live and work in Europe. More specifically: a) Five out of eight respondents are owners and producers of ethical pornographic sites, b) one respondent self-produce and directs her own ethical pornographic movies, c) two respondent work as self-employed directors and producers of online ethical pornography.

3.4 DATA

After the data have been collected and transcribed they were coded and analysed based on the Thematic Network Analysis (Attride- Stirling , 2001). Coding is the initial and very important part of the analysis as it creates the themes that will be eventually interpreted with the literature. So, after reading the initial transcripts of the interviews, the first step was to write comments and observations, afterwards codes were created using Atlas.ti, a computer program that facilitates and accelerates the process of coding. An interesting aspect of the coding process was that in some cases more than one code has been used for the same segment of text. The codes that emerged through the process, aggregate the main units of interest which will be eventually structure the “Global Themes” of the research (Bryman, 2016).

The second step of data analysis is Thematic Network Analysis that basically is “a way of organizing a thematic analysis for qualitative data” (Attride-Stirling, 2001 p. 387). Thematic Network Analysis not only seeks to discover the themes that are prominent in the text but also to simplify the process of structuring them. According to Attride-Stirling (2001), the process of the Thematic Network Analysis begins with the extraction of the lowest-order theme “Basic Themes” that later, are organized in middle-order themes “Organizing Themes”. The latter categorization, provides the main assumptions of the “basic themes” and reveals what is discussed in the text. The final classification of the analysis is the emergence of super-ordinate themes “Global Themes” that are constituted by “organizing themes”. They provide the main

argumentation about the issue that has been discussed. “Global Themes” are the core of Thematic Network Analysis as they describe the data within the context of a given analysis. Specifically, for the purpose of this work, the following steps based on the Thematic Network Analysis have been followed. Therefore, after the transcription of the interviews, the first step was to develop a coded framework based on the aims of the research question. The development of a coding framework was based on the theoretical interests based on research question and on salient issues that were revealed from the text. As it has already been mentioned, using Atlas.ti, the codes were applied to relevant segments of the text. The second step, includes the identification of the themes. To achieve that, the researcher had to extract from each code the salient and common themes. Then the themes had to be improved in order to be distinct enough but at the same time broad and abstract to summarize the text segments.

Afterwards, the network started to be constructed into “Basic themes”, “Organizing Themes”, and “Global Themes”, following the aforementioned process (Attride- Stirling , 2001). Once the themes had been classified into categories, the thematic networks had been generated through the two “Global Themes”: a) Pornographic industries as creative industries, b) Ethical Pornography as a niche market. The verification of the networks it is also a very important process, in order to ensure not only that the themes represent the data but also that the data support the themes. Also the thematic networks should be described and explored. According to Attride-Stirling (2001) this process is vital since it offers a deeper understanding of the meanings of the text. The last process of the Thematic Network Analysis aims to interpret the key findings with the research questions and the theoretical background of the thesis.

The Thematic Network Analysis that has been used for the purpose of the thesis was selected as the most accurate due to its systemic character to collect and categorize the common and important themes. Also the non-hierarchical structure that has been followed, provides a periphery examination of the aims of the thesis, that in association with the given literature review and the context of the interviews, has efficiently explored the deepest meaning of the issue.

3.5 CONCLUSION

The general purpose of this chapter was to explain how the current research had been conducted. Qualitative method had been selected as the most appropriate and efficient in order to answer to the main research questions and along with the semi-structured interviews offer a deeper understanding of the essence of pornographic sector. As ethical pornography is a new and unexplored field, the in depth discussion with the interviewees and the intimacy that had been built through the conversations was more than enough for the purpose of my work. Of course, there were some obstacles such as the sampling and the geographical distance. In the former case, as it has already been mentioned, the sample has been

selected in two stages in order to distinguish the frauds of the actual ethic pornographers. Even though that had complicate the research, from the other side it gave me a greater understanding of the threat of co-optation of the term that had also been mentioned in both literature and interviews.

Regarding to interview's data, Thematic Network Analysis had been selected in order to categorize the codes that emerged through coding process, in bigger and wider categories, themes. The "Global Themes" that had been generated as a result of "Basic Themes" and "Organizing Themes", aggregate the common and core issues of the interviews and in conjunction with the aforementioned literature, aim to answer to the research questions. The next chapter, will present the findings of the research categorized based on Thematic Network Analysis.

CHAPTER 4: RESULTS

In the following sections the two “Global Issues” (Attride- Stirling , 2001):“Pornographic industries as creative industries” and Ethical pornography as a niche market”, will be presented in order to answer the research questions of the thesis. Each one will be supplemented by several “Organized” and “Basic” Themes as it has been suggested by the Thematic Network Analysis. In this section, the information obtained through the interviews will be presented and interpreted in light of the literature illustrated in chapter.

4.1: “PORNOGRAPHIC INDUSTRIES AS CREATIVE INDUSTRIES”

This part aims to answer the first research question “Why pornographic industries are not acknowledged as creative industries?”, as it will be presented by the following data there are two different perspectives. The first is an exogenous perspective and has to do with the stigma that pornography carries because of its explicit content, and the second is more endogenous and it examines how people involved in the industry, evaluate it. Specifically, the latter perspective has to do with how people involved in alternative pornographies differentiate themselves from the mainstream pornographic market.

4.1.1. The Exogenous Stigmatization of Pornographic Industry

The stigmatization of pornography is an exogenous action that has to do with how individuals not involved in the production of pornography characterize it as “not a normal business”. The stigmatization is a social phenomenon with a long tradition and with multiple implications in the legitimation of pornography and especially in the case of online pornography.

a. *“The Stigmatized Labor”*

Pornography, as it has been mentioned in the aforementioned definitions it is a really controversial topic because it is most of the times discussed based on moral issues. In line with some of the authors seen in the literature review (Sullivan & McKee, 2015; McKee, 2012; 2016; Voss, 2012; Lee & Sullivan, 2016; Voss, 2015), the social stigmatization of pornographic industry blocks the approach of the industry as a creative industry. All of the respondents answered that they share the feeling of stigmatization. As one respondent, Hornie Hunters, mentioned “Stigma of someone who does porn is displaced, people do not understand that we are just people and there is nothing wrong with us we are not inherently damaged because we choose to do this job”.

A part of the stigmatization of the industry, is the fact that, it has been related to serious issues of exploitation and abuse: child abuse and human trafficking (Lane, 2000; Attwood, 2010). These factors along

with one part of the feminist movement, anti-porn discourse have led to the perception of pornography as something completely wrong and exploitative (Lee & Sullivan, 2016; Jacobs, 2014; Smith, 2014, Trouble, 2016; Preciado, 2010). Jennifer Lyon Bell, owner of a pornographic industry “Blueartichoke Films”, located in Amsterdam also refers to pornographic industry as stigmatized and highlights that the “dark history” of pornographic industry has led to the stigmatization and the suspicion of people involved as bad. Of course, as it will be seen in a following section the respondents do not connive at the “dark side” of pornography, actually their main aim is to fight the stigmatization by opening the discussion around pornography, revealing the mistakes of the industry and differentiate themselves from the mainstream pornography.

According to Voss (2015), in order to overcome the stigma, the pornographic industry has used “Playboy Method” and “Hustler Method”. The former strategy aims to create “a cross-breeding of softcore sexuality and mainstream lifestyle branding” (Trouble, 2016:197), while the latter strategy aims to create brands based on libertarian approach of free-speech presenting patriarchal depictions of role models. Although these strategies have been beneficial for the established pornographic industries, it does not mean that have been beneficial for small and alternative pornographies as well (Attwood, 2006; Wilkinson, 2009). Tarrant (2016) in her work, also mention how the stigmatization of porn industry has been an obstacle for financial issues. Even though online pornography has been the first that tested technological developments and online payments (Coopersmith, 1998; 2000; Johnson, 1996) some payment services do not allow the purchase of adult content. Garion Hall, owner and producer of the pornographic site “abbywinters.com”, located in Australia, confirms that, for example by saying:

“It is enormously frustrating for me running this business because it seems like anyone else who run any other business in the world would have no problem like simple things e.g. open a bank account, not even borrow money, we never done that because no bank could ever loan us money because of the industry, but just a simple bank account in order to collect our income and pay our employees and our business expenses. And that is not only with banks, we tried to buy a car before, for the business and they said that they do not feel comfortable to sell us a car. Or we tried to make donations to charities before and they were some who refused our donations” (Garion Hall).

b. “Censorship”

As it has been mentioned above, the stigmatization of pornographic industry has multiple impacts like online censorship. Censorship is also a very serious problem for pornography and specifically online pornography. As it is stated in the literature (Coopersmith, 1998; Cronin & Davenport, 2001; Parviainen, Tihinen, Kääriäinen, & Teppola, 2017), the low entry barriers of the Internet offer the opportunity to anyone to enter in the industry without any content control. In order to attenuate that, online censorship has applied very strict rules not only about sexual content but also about nudity. The issue of online pornographic censorship

remains really controversial since, from one side it regulates the content and protects the audience, but from the other side as Hornie Hunters mentions, it does not take into consideration the producers. Kate Sinclair, owner of the pornographic site “Cherrysystems” criticizes regulation like “SESTA”, which aims to detect human trafficking, as harmful for the industry. In fact, all of the respondents (eight) are critical to the online regulation of pornography and argue that actually the restrictions support the stigmatization of the industry .

According to Evans (2018) social media’s regulations and policies are not a new phenomenon, but a new version of a regulation that has occurred for many centuries intimately related to the history of pornography and especially in the evolution of audio-visual pornography. The majority of the respondents argued that online censorship is the biggest challenge that online pornography has to face. Jennifer Lyon Bell among others, suggests that since the Internet does not distinguish obscenity from pornography it is harder to distinguish their work “erotica” from the mainstream pornography. Hence, it is difficult for them to distribute their work on distribution channels and social media. For example Richard, owner of the pornographic sites “Beautifulagony” and “Ishotmyself” said “So none of these marketing tools on the Internet will allow us to put our content. The one exception is Twitter, a part of Twitter, Facebook, Instagram, Hotmail, and Gmail, none of them let you promote adult website and they do not distinguish between ethical and mainstream porn, it’s just all porn”.

Social media like Facebook and Tumblr follow certain regulations such as “Community Standards Policy” in order to stop the consumption of pornographic content and to prevent child pornography or “revenge porn”⁶ (McGlynn & Houghton, 2017). Although these regulations, promise to regulate pornographic consumption, in fact they lead pornography to marginalization without make any distinction based on the content (Evans, 2018). For example, Maria Beatty owner of the pornographic site MariaBeatty.com, describes herself as an artist and argues that social media’s regulations has affected the distribution of her work since she has been banned from Facebook more than eight times. Also it is important to mention that Internet has been a democratized environment and has been used from many minorities and under- represented identities for representation (Jacobs, 2004; Smith, 2014). Hence the respondents of the research, as individuals who create ethical pornography with respect to diversity, feel hemed in the stereotypical representation of sexuality presented by the established markets which always find the way to overcome challenges like that in addition to niche markets. Richard for example argues that is not easy for niche pornographic producers to promote themselves on social media, specifically, he said:

⁶ According to Cambridge dictionary (n.d.), the term “reverse pornography” refers to the sexual images of videos of a person uploaded on the Internet by a former partner of that person in order to harm them.

“So we cannot reach people there is no way, we can only market ourselves though porn industry by advertising in other porn sites, that’s the only possibility. So we cannot easily reach people outside the circle of people who consume mainstream porn”(Richard).

c. “Exchange Value”

The stigmatization of the pornographic industry and the lack of acknowledgement of the pornographic industry as a creative industry, lies in the fact that pornography is not considered as labour because of its subject (Coopersmith, 1998). All of the respondents mentioned that people have to pay for their pornography exactly as they pay for any other service or product they receive, specifically Garion Hall and Hornie Hunters draw a parallel between pornography and other cultural products like music and movies that the customers support by paying platforms like Spotify and Netflix.

Consider to online pornography, payment has become more unrealistic through piracy or streaming platforms where people can find or download anything for free (Voss, 2012). Porn consumers tend to rationalize their actions, expecting a free copy because they do not consider pornography as a “normal job”. In addition, due to the lack of information on piracy’s negative externalities on pornographic industry, porn piracy is considered an overlooked phenomenon (Brown, 2014). From the other side, the respondents argue that the production has a budget that needs to be reached. Otherwise as Richard mentions, producers go broke and performers suffer. A significant number of respondents also mention that the payment motivates producers to make pornography and sometimes better pornography. Also, all of them seem to know and support the action #PayForYourPorn that takes place on the Internet in order to inform people about the necessity to support pornography (Why Pay For Your Porn?, 2017). Based on that, Jessie Josh freelancer director of pornographic content argues that”:

“So I think it’s nice to put your money where your tastes and ethics are, so to put money there will improve the industry. So by paying you support and you pay for the thing you want to exist. Paying allows companies to do more work and spread the message further.”(Jessie Josh)

d. “Payment is not necessarily a valid measurement of ethical pornography”

One of the biggest problems of online pornography, is that it does not gett the money it deserves because of the free content that is uploaded in streaming platforms, so basically the cost of the production is never compensated (Brown, 2014). Actions like #PayForYourPorn want to inform and raise people’s awareness about the necessity to pay for pornography. Even though, ethical pornography is strongly related with these

actions since it perceives pornography as a job that needs to be paid in order to survive (Pink & White Productions ,2017; Lee, 2015) as Richard argues, the rest of the respondents do not think that payment ensures ethical production and treatment, for example Jennifer Lyon Bell argues that:

“I think that for me personally I would find it more philosophically and economically useful to make a distinction between the means of production, the manner in which films are consumed, because for example if you say ethical porn, is porn you pay for, I don't think for me because that terminology belong to issues of productions and issue of consumption and for me that implies that any porn can be ethical if it is paid for and I don't think that is the case, so I think its worth for the production of pornography and what it means to be ethical versus what it means to be an ethical consumer of pornography that is another big discussion” (Jennifer Lyon Bell)

The majority of the respondents share Bell's opinion since they think that not only there is a lot of pornography out there, which claims that it is ethical but it is certainly not. As Kate Sinclair and Jessie Josh mention, there is one more aspect that is important to highlight in a discussion about ethical pornography, and that is the people that are making it. The notion of ethical pornography as part of alternative pornographies aim to create a safer space where all the sexualities can be involved and represented, hence that incentive is bigger than the profit (Attwood, 2007), as Jessie Josh mention, “The nature of people who are involved in ethical pornography I mean there are punks, queers and in generally alternative people there are some practises like DIY which tries to go outside the capitalism”.

From the other side Jiz Lee (2015) mentions that paying for pornography is the most direct way to ensure that the work is produced under ethical standards and values. Richard also seems to agree with that as he supports that in order to watch good pornography you have to pay for it. So, paying as a criterion of ethical productions can be really controversial especially in alternative pornographies that support anti-capitalistic ideas (Smith C. , 2014). In addition, Jacobs (2007) argue that the ethical pornography, through small-scale economies and the interaction between consumer and producer, enables sexual and political coalitions that are really important in an era where creative industries are threatened by insecurity.

4.1.2. The endogenous perception of pornographic industries as creative industries

The main aim of the thesis is to compare pornographic industries with other creative industries. Although as it has been stated previously the exogenous stigmatization hamper the legitimation of pornography as “a normal job” and consequently as creative industry, the endogenous perception of people involved in pornographic industry also criticize whether it should or not be considered as a creative industry. In this part

it is discussed how the producers position themselves inside the industry and what actually they believe about the notion of pornography as a creative industry.

a. *“The lack of creativity in the production of mainstream pornography”*

As it has been stated in the literature, there is significant number of researchers who argue that pornographic industries belong to the broader sphere of creative industries (Sullivan & McKee, 2015; McKee, 2012; 2016; Voss, 2012). According to the work of the aforementioned researchers and to the definition of creative industries, as the industries involved in the creative sector of the economy producing cultural goods and services (Caves, 2000) that have a potential for job creation, wealth and exploitation of intellectual property (DCMS, 1998), pornography has been compared with other creative industries. A significant proportion of respondents (five out of eight) seem to agree with that, since they understand that there are similarities, for example Jennifer Lyon Bell, said:

So, yes I absolutely believe that I am creating intellectual property. I make a great deal of creative decisions everything from shot choices, my casting and my choices are very important for me, the way that I work with my actors and whether I choose to choreograph or not, the music, the post-production all of that are very creative and I work closely with other creative experts many of whom have never done any sexually explicit film of any kind before and (umm) so from that perspective it seems really much to me that the kind of pornography that I make is absolutely a creative industry”.
(Jennifer Lyon Bell)

Even though, the aforementioned literature does not support any distinction based on creative standards of industry in order to describe it as a creative, the rest of the respondents (three out of eight) argued that because of the lack of creative standards of mainstream pornography, they do not consider it as a creative industry. For example, Garion Hall argued that it depends on the creative elements of porn production. The notion of creativity has broadly been discussed in both psychological and business studies and it is a really important element of creative industries. The majority of definitions describe creativity as a process that seek to originality, effectiveness and novelty (Runco & Jaeger, 2012) hence, elements related to creative industries.

As it has been already mentioned, the respondents of the research when they were to answer if they agree that pornography should be considered as creative industry, they focused on the lack of creativity. Although it should be mentioned that in regard to other creative industries like music or film, the lack of creativity as we see in mainstream pop culture does not have an impact in the recognition of them as creative industries (Tschmuck, 2003). Following psychological theories, Tschmuck (2003), approaches creativity as a mental process inherent in a creative person. Specifically he argues that the environment as a dependent

variable should be considered as creative in order to name a product or a person creative. Specifically one of the respondents, Richard, mentioned that in order to put pornography in the sphere of creative industries, it is required to be more specific to which pornography we refer as he does not consider that mainstream pornography offers any creativity and hence originality since it shows only the basic level of pornography. So, as they judge mainstream pornography as not creative they try to differentiate themselves from it. To achieve that, all of the respondents describe their work "erotica", Nordal Nord for example said:

"They remind me that second class film, its trash basically but the way that they show the orgasms and the masturbation is like they don't take it seriously. So that to be creative and aesthetic? No way. Now erotica, erotica is aesthetic, beautiful, slow and I think that a lot of the porn that I am also contributing with and other new producers are taking into consideration to make it more creative"(Nordal Nord).

"Erotica", "ethical erotica", "art erotica" are some of the terms that the respondents use in order to differentiate themselves from mainstream pornography. As they noted, this differentiation makes their work creative and so a part of the creative industries. For the respondents the element of creativity is extremely important as stated by Attwood (2010) their main aim is to 'offer new relationships between creativity, commerce and sex as both work and leisure' (pg.89). The respondents analyze what they are doing as something original and novel as they do not picture just sexual action but as Hornie Hunters mentioned, they create a whole experience. Also based on what it has been discussed during the interviews and as it has been stated in the literature those individuals aim to reclaim the representation of sexuality from the mainstream porn culture (Biasin & Zecca, 2009; Attwood, 2007)

4.2 “ETHICAL PORNOGRAPHY AS A NICHE MARKET”

This section discusses the emergence of new pornographies as they suggest counter aesthetic, political, ethical, economical and technological elements to mainstream culture. Specifically this thesis and hence this part discusses the ethical pornography which creates a content that is itself part of a genre or brand and does not objectify the performers (Lee & Sullivan, *Porn and Labour: The Labour of Porn Studies*, 2016). In order to answer the second research question of this thesis , the results are divided in two organizing themes (Attride- Stirling , 2001): “The differences in the production and the presentation, between ethical and mainstream pornography.” and “The long tail of ethical pornography”.

4.2.1. “The differences in the production and the presentation, between ethical and mainstream pornography.”

According to the literature, ethical pornography describes a shift in the pornography market and a special attention to the health and safety of the performers, as well as general ethics in the pornographic production, distribution and consumption (Tarrant , 2016). This change has come from politically active niche porn sites that produce and distribute pornography and focus on the representation of diversity and equality. This part discusses how ethical pornography has been transformed from just a business model of alternative pornography to a branding and marketing strategy and how the term has been co-opted by mainstream pornography.

a. Ethical pornography regulates working conditions

The new pornographic markets that emerged due to the availability and affordability of Internet, suggested a different genre of pornography focusing on authenticity, diversity and production processes. The new pornographies that take place in the Internet, are better called “Netporn” and proceed as specialized niche markets in order to differentiate themselves from mainstream pornography, proposing an ethical business model and a sophisticated work of cultural value. In order to achieve that, they capitalize aesthetic, political and cultural aspects of representation. Even though every aspect of Netporn is important, this thesis focuses on the element of the ethical production and distribution as an alternative economic structure of alternative economies and aesthetics of the alternative pornographies” (Wilkinson, 2017:3).

According to the literature ethical pornography has to do more with the working conditions of the people involved in pornography and specifically, as Tristan Taormino suggests, as a process

of “fair-trade pornography” through which performers are treated with respect and there is not any inequality in payment paid (Breslaw, 2013). All the respondents agreed on the given definition of ethical pornography, emphasizing the existence of certain ethical standards, for example Joshie Josh refers to those ethical standards as those which define ethical pornography as a “system of regulations”. Jennifer Lyon Bell gave a very interesting definition of ethical pornography and named the ethical standards that are required in order to define what is ethical pornography, for example she said:

“One is that it is the pornography in which performers are fairly compensated which could be money, could be labour trade but where all of the parties, performers and producers feel that it is a fair agreement. Another one is that in ethical pornography the sexual acts of the film is thoughtfully and consciously negotiated by the performers and director together so that everyone is feeling comfortable with each other’s boundaries and that will include an agreement for safer sex protocol where everybody’s wishes and limits are coming up with a plan and people feel comfortable and then (umm). For me making it part of ethical is creating an onset experience where performers can step back anytime if they change their minds.” (Jennifer Lyon Bell)

The attention on the production process and the manifestation of the importance of ethical standards highlight a new perception of pornography, that does not want to be itself and seeks further interests: aesthetic, sociological, political to justify its existence (Biasin & Zecca, *Contemporary Audio Visual Pornography: Branding Strategy and Gonzo Film Style*, 2009). According to the respondents, ethical pornography is mostly a series of regulations and working agreements that protect the individuals and can or should be applied in mainstream pornography. For example, according to Jennifer Lyon Bell, Jessie Joss and Nordal Nord ethical production does not necessarily mean ethical content since ethics and sexual desires can be a really controversial notion. According to Sullivan and McKee (2015) ethical pornography is not necessarily feminist hence it is possible to illustrate content similar to mainstream pornography “male-gaze porn” following the aforementioned ethical standards of production.

However, there are some other respondents that disagree with the later argument as they strongly support that ethical pornography does not only has to do with payment and the working conditions but also with the content. Maria Beatty for example, in her definition of ethical pornography explains that it has to do with a pro-feminist angle that shows the pleasure and joy of the performers and does not objectify women’s body. Richard also agrees that ethical pornography is not only about the production itself but also has to do with the content, since there are certain values that are expressed through the work and are closely related to the notion of ethical pornography. Based on these arguments, the working negotiations that take place between the performer and the producer have an impact on the film itself (Biasin & Zecca, *Contemporary Audio Visual Pornography: Branding Strategy and Gonzo Film Style*, 2009). Also Nordal Nord,

even though she supports that mainstream pornography can be ethical as well, points out that what distinguishes mainstream from ethical pornography is that the latter focuses more on the representation and the diversity and let all the voices to be heard in addition to the former.

Given all that, it makes it difficult to understand whether ethical pornography as a series of regulations of working conditions has an impact on the content itself. The issue of ethic is highly controversial, especially in combination with sexuality (Lane, 2000), as Kate Sinclair mentioned “Something that is ethical to me, is not ethical to someone else”. In any case ethical pornography as a niche market has play a pivotal role, first because it has created a space where people feel more safe to enter, but also because it has pushed the mainstream pornographic industry to another direction (Pink & White Productions, 2017; Cronin & Davenport, 2001)

b. “Ethical Pornography as a Branding Strategy”

As it has been mentioned, the Internet opened the market for many producers to create, distribute and engage their target audience. Those new pornographers, started to criticize the traditional monopoly of pornographic industries by exploiting the latest technological investments and differentiating their product. As ethical pornography’s main features are: the transparency, the equality and the diversity, as a niche market, is focused on the production of a cultural products according to that values. These products are based on a combination of strategies, aiming to create a specific genre that will offer a safer environment for both performers and consumers but also to produce a high quality brand (Biasin & Zecca, Contemporary Audio Visual Pornography: Branding Strategy and Gonzo Film Style, 2009). The creation of a brand is extremely important in digital world where the oversupply of products and services requires the differentiation between the products. Beyond the fact that, the notion of ethical pornography includes the characteristics that have been given in the literature review and on the interviews, the label ethical pornography has also been used as a sign of the production process and the quality of the works (Mazzières, Trachman, Cointet, Coulmont , & Prieur, 2014). Kate Sinclair and Jessie Josh mention that what is now happening with the label of ethical pornography is exactly the same with the label of “organic foods”, giving this example they wanted to highlight the importance it has been given in the last decades to the production of services and products, but as well the power of the label. Of course, as it came out from both the literature and the interviews, labels can also be co-opted by others that do not share the same values, in order to gain more traffic.

All of the respondents argued that it is fair for companies that are actually doing ethical pornography

to use it as a label in order to communicate its values to a wider audience that they wish to engage. A significant number of respondents argues that the notion of ethical pornography has been used as an umbrella to capture a whole movement that takes place lately in feminist and pro-sex circles. According to the research of Mazzieres Et al. (2014), in online pornography it is clear that the labels “tags” are highly important for a niche industry to survive, for example Jessie Josh said that “ So I think obviously it’s a marketing tagging. If you want to work in the system we have to get people’s attention, I actually don’t have any problem, you have to use all of the tools that are out there”.

Five respondents stated that because there is nobody to control whether these labels are actually true, there are many industries that inappropriately are using the notion of ethical porn in order to steal audience. Since there is not any control and plenty of space for frogs, as Kate Sinclair mention, producers like Garion Hall decide to take the control of the situation, sending ten statements to pornographic industries that claim that they work under ethical working conditions. Another respondent, Richard, is working on the creation of a site called “ethicalporn.com” that will inform people, of what is actually ethical pornography and why it is important to support it and hopefully will raise the awareness of people around ethical production. Also, as it will be discussed further in the following section (3.3.2), the creation of alternative distribution channels aim to solve the problem of co-option by selecting and present the sites that are actually ethical.

4.2.2. “The long tail of ethical pornography”

The oversupply of pornographic content on the Internet has been broadly discussed. According to pornographic sector, the oversupply and the emergence of new alternative pornographies paved the way to specialized niche markets. Following the literature on the Long Tail theory and according to the discussion with the interviewees, this part discusses if Internet makes it easier for niche markets like, ethical pornography, to be distributed.

a. *Visibility*

Among other researches, Cooper in his work (1998) suggested that the anonymity accessibility, affordability that Internet offers, open the market to niche industries. According to the Long-Tail theory, introduced by Anderson (2004), Internet’s unlimited space provides an alternative market for niche brands and also, through its distribution channels, offers a wider variety of products that would be lost in the traditional market. In few words, the Long-Tail theory suggests that Internet facilitates the visibility of niche products

and limits mass-production and consumerism (Brynjolfsson, Hu, & Simester, Goodbye Pareto Principle, Hello Long Tail : The Effect of Search Costs on the Concentration of Product Sales , 2011). Six of the respondents agree with Anderson's theory, as they believe that there are opportunities for niche markets to create quality material and also plenty of distribution channels that can facilitate the distribution, as Hornie Hunters said, "Now we have a lot of websites where you can upload your content, and to choose what kind of style you have I think that definitely has reached the pornographic industry as well".

From another side, there are some other respondents that seem to disagree with the effectiveness of Internet in the development of niche market, for example Maria Beatty argues that the limitless space of the Internet lead to a sub division where niche pornographies are pushed more underground and have less visibility and eventually they get lost in the vast land of stuff. Richard also argues that there are not the same opportunities for everyone in the Internet as he suggests that:

"So everybody thought that the Internet will be a great equalizer (...) but big business found their way through portals like Facebook and Instagram to keep people in the circle and kicked everybody else out. In the porn industry that happens in another way. Like the Canadian page, that runs tube sites like Porntube, Xhamster, Pornhub and so on. They organize porn market, in the same way that Ebay creates a huge online shop. So this is the biggest challenge we face because as you know you can go to any of these sites and take everything you want for free, the quality is not really good but you can spend hours and hours finding something different every five seconds. And it's not a subscription model it is an advertising model so free is really difficult for us because we are not that big. You know the thing with the advertising creates a big mess, they can make a lot of money selling advertising with websites with so many visitors. We do not"(Richard).

Beatty and Richard's statement is supported by the research of Mazzieres, Et al. (2014). According to their work "a large proportion of items are covered by a very small number of almost universal categories, while a long tail of more specific categories still gather a large variety of content" (Mazzieres, Trachman, Cointet, Coulmont , & Prieur, 2014:82). Hence, although there might be a variety of content on the Internet, only few sites are likely to become popular. In few words, their research shows how the mainstream culture dominates the Internet and how difficult it is for niche markets to stay on the surface.

b. "The distribution in Mainstream Platforms"

Internet pornography is usually distributed through aggregate sites, that run as "a combination of user-generated content, creator-uploaded professional content and pirated professional content" (Sullivan & McKee, 2015). These sites mainly attract mainstream audience or audience that is interested in nothing other than the "money-shot" (Attwood, 2007). Even though these sites attract big traffic, all of the ethical, feminist, queer entrepreneurs seem not to prefer it as a marketing tool, as Jennifer Lyon Bell mentioned:

“I have chosen not to do that because one reason is that I don’t think that the frequent pornhub consumer is my target audience, there are some who are but the vast majority are not. So it’s not a good investment for me. I am also very distressed by that unethical business practices that I have experience so far engaged with those industries and tube sites that had pirated my work. So I do not wish to be part of that” (Jennifer Lyon Bell)

All of the respondents argued negatively about the use of these platforms. As ethical pornography is many more things than just a conventional representation of sex, created and consumed by men, they cannot imagine their work next to advertisements with misogynistic content. Actually Richard characterizes the voluntarily existence of ethical sites in aggregate sites, as a great conflict that needs to be solved.

Garion Hall argues that in the beginning these sites have been perceived as a great opportunity for exposure but that turned out wrong. As the research of Mazzieres et al (2014) has shown, the mainstream culture dominates the internet and the ethics and values of pornographic works either receive small attention or are ignored. Hornie Hunters also mentions that ethical pornography does not mean only high production values but a symbiotic relationship between production and consumption, based on that there is nothing ethical in the distribution of a pirated work where the performer earn much less than actually deserves. Also all of the respondents argue that beyond the fact that they do not agree with the content that is hosted in those sites. Another reason that they do not distribute their work in these sites, is the lack of control since they only who gets paid is the owner of the main site.

c. *“ Distribution in Alternative Platforms “*

Part of the empowerment movement and the actions of reclaiming sexuality from mainstream online pornography is not only the production but also the distribution of pornography. Beside the fact that consumers of ethical pornography can purchase the material directly from the producers, the creation of new ventures like: PinkLabel (Pink and White Production), EricaLust.com, has changed the landscape of traditional distribution. The main aim of these new ventures, is to create an online community of people that wish to actively consume and to fulfill artistic, political and educational needs (Sullivan & McKee, 2015). Except Richard, Garion Hall, and Hornie Hunters who sell their work directly on their sites, the rest of the respondents also use “community user websites” to promote their work as they believe that it helps them to engage their target audience. Another important element that lies behind their choice to put their work in these venues, is trust and common beliefs (Sullivan & McKee, 2015), as Maria Beatty said “I go in few who distribute ethical and fair trade porn and are feminists like Erica lust or Pink and White Label rather than big empires”.

4.3 CONCLUSION REMARKS.

This chapter presents the findings of a qualitative research based on semi-structured interviews with a single respondent. The sample of the research has been selected in order to fulfill certain criteria that would facilitate the answer to the main research questions from a business perspective. It is also important to mention that respondents agreed to use their names for the purpose of this work. This, along with the intimacy that has been built during the interviews, shows the transparency as the core value of ethical pornography.

Regarding the first global theme, “Pornographic Industries as Creative Industries” the all of the respondents replied that they share the same feeling of stigmatization and they highlighted Internet’s censorship as one of the biggest threats of the industry. In addition, a very interesting aspect was their endogenous perspective of pornography as creative industry. Only a small proportion of the respondents argued that mainstream pornography should not be consider a creative industry since the lack of creativity.

As for the second global theme, “Ethical Pornography as a Niche Market”, the respondents seemed to agree with the given literature review. They recognized that features of Internet had played an important role in the generation of alternative pornographies, such as ethical pornography, but they also highlighted the political goal of ethical pornography as a counter example in mainstream pornography. For the majority of the respondents ethical pornography means a confirmation of fair-trade working conditions that does not have an impact on the context. However, not all of the respondent agree with that, as they believe that in that case it is difficult to ensure whether pornography is ethical or just the term ethical is used as a brand to engage audience.

In any case, they all agreed that is not wrong, when people –who are actually doing ethical pornography- use it in order to label themselves. As it has already been highlighted in the literature review and brought out during the interviews, it is hard to tell whether Long Tail theory or superstar effect apply in ethical pornography, as the producers of the latter expressed that they do not consider it effective to distribute their work via mainstream pornographic distributors, instead preferring alternative distributors that they share the same values.

CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSION

5.1 GENERAL CONCLUSION

As suggested above, the primary aim of this research is to contribute to the academic discussion for the acknowledgment of pornographic industries as creative industries. Furthermore, the second aim is to investigate the role of ethical pornography as a niche digital market. Past literature, along with the findings of the interviews, feature a common ground between the two main aims of the research highlighting the role of ethical pornography as a medium of reexamination the notion of pornography.

Regarding to the first research question, “Why pornographic industry is not acknowledged as a creative industry?” the respondents of the research agreed with the given literature suggesting that the main reason is the social stigma, that pornography carries because of its explicit content. Among many other researchers, Foucault (1990) argued that the sexual stigmatization takes place into a field of biopolitical regulation aiming to control the populations based on techniques of normalization. Hence pornography is not considered as a “normal job” since it exposes the private including sexual phantasies and activities. As it has been mentioned in the literature review the history of pornography has been associated with censorship. The producers involved in online ethical pornography criticize online censorship as inefficient and they argue that instead of protecting, it actually maintains stigmatization and poses an obstacle to the acknowledgment of pornography as a creative industry. Another interesting aspect that emerged through the discussion was that the producers of ethical pornography censure mainstream pornography for not being creative and hence not part of the creative industries. The latter argument paves the way for a wider discussion about the role of ethical pornography as a creative industry and introduces the second research question.

As for the second research question, “What is the role of ethical pornography as a niche market?” the discussion is much more broad and can be analysed by both economic and political perspective. As it is discussed in the literature review, niche digital markets emerged as small but growth and customer-oriented markets with a specific target audience. This work agrees with Calacanis and Shani’s (1992) approach of niche markets as a creative process (“*nichemanship*”) that creative industries should follow in order to remain sustainable. Based on this approach and according to the interviews, the current work had explored the emergence of new pornographic industries in forms of niche markets that fulfil a gap in the creative market.

Focusing on the economic perspective of the emergence of ethical pornography as a niche market, other important issues arise, like the importance of branding strategy and to what extent, niche markets can

challenge the high-end products. The Long Tail theory has been discussed in both literature and interviews, remains debatable and especially in the case of niche pornographies. Even though digitalization has given some space for the representation and involvement, there are still some aspects like censorship or big aggregate sites that block the visibility of niche products. Beside its political symbolism, ethical pornography suggests a different business model based on ethical agreements between producers, performers, distributors and customers. Based on the literature review and the respondents of the research, it can be concluded that ethical pornography by adapting its values on the business model of digital niche and creative markets, faces the challenges of online pornographic industries. In addition, ethical pornography aims to establish itself by reshaping the Internet while it creates a target audience based on communities that could freely express themselves both as producers and consumers.

As it came out by both literature and the interviews, pornographic market has been a male-gaze for decades, and suffers from a lack of creativity and representation. Taking into consideration the features of digitalization as mediums of democratization, producers of ethical pornography, seek to reclaim the way that sexuality is depicted, but also they seek to overcome the stigma of pornography focusing on its core values of production and distribution. As it has been indicated by both literature and interviews ethical pornography, is a counterexample in the mainstream pornographic industry. Following Foucauldian analysis of power relations (Foucault, 1995), the emergence of ethical pornography has to be understood also as a result of constant claims and acts of resistance by individuals against the dominant heteronormative power. The values of ethical pornography do not only suggest better working conditions but also seek to destigmatize pornography and they include pornography as part of the creative sector.

In conclusion, it can be seen that both the political and the economic reasoning that lies behind the emergence of ethical pornography, is very crucial to be further analyzed. Likewise physical world, digital space is also consisted of power relations “designed” by individuals that resist to dominant power. The democratized environment that digital space inherits, via its economic features, facilitates the representation of previously underrepresented individuals and communities. In addition, the transparency as a core value of ethical pornography, paves the way to the destigmatization of the industry and the acknowledgement as part of the creative sector. Based on these arguments, the emergence of “Netporn” and specifically the emergence of ethical pornography introduces a new era of pornographic industry, less stigmatized and more diverse and respectful.

5.2 LIMITATIONS AND FURTHER RESEARCH

As it has been deeply discussed, the stigmatization of pornographic industry is an obstacle for the analysis of pornography as a creative sector. Even though gender studies have been in the centre of academic

discussion there are still some topics like pornography that are still controversial. However during the last decades, pornography has been destigmatized in feminist studies and has started to gain the attention it reserves. Unfortunately, we cannot assume the same for business studies, where pornographic industries have been studied based on an exceptionalist approach. My initial concern was to find valid and sufficient literature to frame the theory. Luckily, there was enough academic work who was critical to the way that not only business studies but society as well, approach pornographic industry.

The main concern was to find a suitable sample of people willing to contribute to my academic work. As one of the requirements was to interview people involved in the production of ethical pornography, I was worried about the size of the sample. Even though in the beginning there were more than twenty people willing to contribute, a further investigation in their work and their values had as a result the abatement of the sample. Although, this realization decreased my sample, simultaneously made my research more valid and accurate to its aims. In addition, it gave me a deeper understanding to what the respondents usually refer to as the “ethically unethical porn”, this term has been used in order to describe the freeds of the industry, an issue that has been closely discussed in the role of ethical pornography as a branding strategy.

One might argue that examining niche markets and discussing the efficiency of Long Tail theory, requires at least some quantitative data. I recognize that some parts might need a different approach in order to be more supported, however it was extremely difficult, not to mention impossible to gain data of online pornographic sales, since even the site owners, honestly admit that have no control over their content and its sales because of the piracy and aggregate sites. Even though I tried to approach big distribution channels, they were negative. However, inspired by the feminist research methodology, the qualitative research offered the chance not only to meet interesting and inspired people but also to hear their stories and contribute to the destigmatization of the industry.

Although, in the last decades, pornography has started to be discussed as a high-profitable industry despite its explicit content, the aforementioned limitations are still there and challenge the academic researches aiming to examine pornography from a business perspective, as Voss strongly argues (2012). Ethical pornography is a new and unexplored field that requires further academic research in order to be deeply understood. A further analysis would be extremely beneficial in order to examine both the business model of ethical pornography as a niche market and the impact of that shift in the mainstream production and distribution in a long- term. Furthermore, as it has been stated above, a quantitative research would also be really important since it could extend my research and could change the traditional idea which supports that feminist and sensitive topics are associated with qualitative research. Further academic research in the field of pornographic studies is more necessary than ever, since we are living in an era where everything is sacrificed for the sake of spectacle, and nothing is taken for granted. It is a duty of the academia

to share knowledge without discriminations and taboos, in order to protect every individual and minority and to offer the greatest mediums for representation.

REFERENCES

- Abbott, S. A. (2010). Motivations of Pursuing a Career in Pornography. In R. Weitzer, *Sex for Sale: Prostitution, Pornography and Sex Industry* (pp. 47-66). New York: Routledge.
- Ackman, D. (2001, May 25). *How Big Is Porn?* Retrieved February 15, 2019, from Forbes: <https://www.forbes.com/2001/05/25/0524porn.html#3464710a7984>
- Adams, W. C. (2015). Conducting Semi-Structured Interviews. In K. E. Newcomer, H. P. Hatry, & J. S. Wholey, *Handbook of Practical Problem Evaluation* (pp. 492-505). San Francisco : Jossey Bass.
- Agustin, L. (2005). New Research Directions: The Cultural Study of Commercial Sex. *Sexualities*, 8(5), 618-631.
- Anderson, C. (2004, October). *The Long Tail*. Retrieved February 3, 2019, from The Wired: <https://www.wired.com/2004/10/tail/>
- Andrei , A. G., & Dumea , A. (2010). Economics of Long Tail. A Challenge of Branding . *The Annals of The "Ștefan cel Mare" University of Suceava. Fascicle of The Faculty of Economics and Public Administration*, 210-216.
- Attride- Stirling , J. (2001). Thematic Networks: An Analytic Tool for Qualitative Research. *Qualitative Research*, 1(3), 384-405.
- Attwood, F. (2002). Reading Porn: The Paradigm Shift in Pornographic Research. *Sexualities*, 5(1), 91-105.
- Attwood, F. (2007). No Money Shot? Commerce, Pornography and New Sex Taste Cultures. *Sexualities*, 10(4), 441-456.
- Attwood, F. (2010). *Porn.Com: Making sense of Online Pornography* . New York : Peter Lang.
- Banerjee, D. (2013). Effect of piracy on innovation in the presence of network externalities. *Economic Modelling*, 33, 526-532.
- Barbrook, R. (1999). The High-Tech Gift Economy. In B. Josephine, *Readme! Filtered by Nettime: ASCII Culture and the Revenge of Knowledge*, (pp. 132-138). Brooklyn : Autonomedia.
- Berg, B. (2007). *Qualitative research methods for the social sciences*. Boston: MA: Pearsons Education, Inc.
- Bernard, H. R. (2002). *Research Methods in Anthropology: Qualitative and quantitative methods*. California: AltaMira Press ,Walnut Creek,.
- Biasin, E., & Zecca, F. (2009). Contemporary Audio Visual Pornography: Branding Strategy and Gonzo Film Style. *International Film Studies Journal*, 9(12), 133-147.
- Biasin, E., Maina, G., & Zecca, F. (2014). Introduction. In E. Biasin, G. Maina, & F. Zecca, *Porn After Porn: Contemporary Alternative Pornographies* (pp. 15-20). Mimesis.
- Breslaw, A. (2013, November 6). *So What is Feminist Porn? Find Out from a Woman Who Makes It*. Retrieved April 17, 2019, from Cosmopolitan: <https://www.cosmopolitan.com/sex-love/news/a16343/tristan-taormino-feminist-porn-interview/>

- Brown, S. C. (2014). Porn Piracy: An Overlooked Phenomenon in Need of Academic Investigation. *Porn Studies*, 1(3), 342-346.
- Bryman, A. (2016). *Social Research Methods*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Brynjolfsson, E., & McAfee, A. (2014). *The Second Machine Age: Work, Progress, and Prosperity in a Time of Brilliant Technologies*. New York: W.W. Norton & Company.
- Brynjolfsson, E., Hu, Y. J., & Simester, D. (2011). Goodbye Pareto Principle, Hello Long Tail : The Effect of Search Costs on the Concentration of Product Sales . *Management Science* .
- Bustamante, E. (2005). Cultural Industries in the Digital Age: some provisional conclusions. *Media, Culture & Society*, 26(6), 803-820.
- Caves , R. E. (2000). *Creative industries: Contacts between art and commerce* . Cambridge : Mass: Harvard University Press.
- Chalasani, S., & Shani, D. (1992). Exploiting Niches Using Relationship Marketing. *The Journal of Consumer Marketing*, 9(3), 33-42.
- Cooper, A. (1998). Sexuality and the Internet: Surfing into the new millenium. *CyberPhycology & Behavior*, 187-193.
- Coopersmith , J. (2000). Pornography, Videotape and the Internet . *IEEE: Technology and Society Magazine* , 27-34.
- Cronin , B., & Davenport, E. (2001). E-Rogenous Zones: Positioning Pornography in the Digital Economy. *The Infotmation Society: An International Journal*, 17(1), 33-48.
- Cropley, A. (2019 2nd updated, revised, unpublished edition). *Qualitative Research Methods: A Practise- Oriented Introduction for Students of Psychology and Education*. Riga, Latvia. Retrieved May 22, 2019, from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/285471178_Introduction_to_Qualitative_Research_Methods
- Cunningham, S., & Potts, J. (2015). Creative Industries and the Wider Economy. In C. Jones, M. Lorenzen, & J. Sapsed, *The Oxford Handbook of Creative Industrues* (pp. 387-404). Oxford University Press.
- Dalgic , T., & Leeuw, M. (1994). Niche Marketing Revised: Concept, Applications and some European Cases. *European Journal of Marketing*, 28(4), 39-55.
- David, L., & Hudson , J. (n.d.). *Obscenity and Pornography*. Retrieved May 5, 2019, from The First Amendment Encyclopedia: Presented by the Free Speach Center and the John Seigenthaler Chair of Excellence in First Amendment Studies: <https://www.mtsu.edu/first-amendment/article/1004/obscenity-and-pornography>
- DCMS. (1998). *A new cultural Framework* . London : HMSO.
- Denzin, N. K. (2010). On Elephants and gold standards. *Qualitative Research*, 10(2), 269-272.
- Development, U. N. (2008). *Creative Economy: The Challenge of assesing the Creative Economy: towards Informed Policy-making*. United Nations.
- Drucker, P. F. (2002). *The Effective Executive*. New York: HarperBusiness Essentials.
- EC. (2012). *Communication from the Commision to the European Parliament, the Council, the European Economical Social Commitee of the Regions- Promoting Cultural and Creative sectors for growth in jobs in the EU*. Brussels.

- Retrieved April 8, 2019, from https://ec.europa.eu/culture/%20our-policy-development/documents/com537_en.pdf;
- Economist. (2011). *At a XXX-roads: The Changing Adult Business*. Retrieved March 13, 2019, from The Economist: <https://www.economist.com/international/2011/10/01/at-a-xxx-roads>
- Fahie, D. (2014). Doing Sensitive Research Sensitively: Ethical and Methodological Issues in Researching Workplace Bullying. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 19-36.
- Florida, R. (2002). *The Rise of the Creative Class and how its transforming work, leisure, community and everyday life*. New York: Basic Books.
- Foucault, M. (1980). *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972–1977*. London: Harvester Press.
- Foucault, M. (1995). *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*. New York : Vintage Books.
- Foucault, M., & Hurley , R. G. (1990). *The History of Sexuality*. New York: Vintage.
- GMCA. (2016). *Deep Dive: 04. Digital and Creative Industries* . Manchester : New Economy.
- Grebowicz, M. (2013). *Why Internet Pornography Matters*. California : Stanford Briefs: Stanford University Press,.
- Horkheimer, M., & Adorno, T. (2002). *Dialectic of Enlightenment: Philosophical Fragments* . Stanford, California : Stanford University Press.
- Howkins , J. (2001). *The Creative Economy: How People Make Money from Ideas*. London : Penguin Books .
- IFFOR. (2012). *Protecting Intellectual Property and Combating Piracy in the Online Adult Entertainment Industry* .
- Jacobs, K. (2004). Pornography in Small Places and Other Places. *Cultural Studies* .
- Jacobs, K. (2014). Netporn: The Promise of Radical Obscenities. In E. Biasin, G. Maina, & F. Zecca, *Porn after Porn: Contemporary Alternative Pornographies* (pp. 121-145). Mimesis International.
- Jenkins, H. (2007, October 14). *Porn 2.0*. Retrieved January 16, 2019, from http://henryjenkins.org/blog/2007/10/porn_20.html
- Johnson, J. (2011). Mapping the Feminist Political Economy of the Online Commercial Pornography: A Network Approach. *International Journal of Media and Cultural Politics*, 7(2), 189-208.
- Johnson, P. (1996). Pornography drives Technology: Why not to censor the Internet? *Federal Communications Law Journal*, 49, 217-226.
- Jones, C., Lorenzen, M., & Sapsed, J. (2015). Creative Industries: A Typology of Change. In C. Jones, M. Lorenzen, & J. Sapsed, *Oxford Handbook of Creative Industries* . Oxford University Press.
- Karlsson- Brown, S. (2014). Porn Piracy an overlooked phenomenon in need of academic investigation. *Porn Studies*, 342-346.
- Kedrick, W. (1996). *The Secret Museum: Pornography in Modern Culture*. Berkeley, LA & London : University of California Press.
- Keen, A. (2015). *The Internet Is Not the Answer*. London: Atlantic Books.

- Kendall, T. D., & Tsui, K. (2011). The economics of the Long Tail. *The B.E Journal of Economic Analysis and Policy*, 11(1), article 76.
- Kibby, M., & Costello, B. (2001). Between the Image and the Act: Interactive Sex Entertainment on the Internet. *Sexualities*, 4(3), 353-369.
- Kipnis, L. (1996). *Bound and Gagged: Pornography and the Power of Fantasy in America*. New York : Grove Press.
- Lane III, F. S. (2000). *Obscene Profits: The Entrepreneurs of Pornography in the Cyber Age*. New York : Routledge.
- Lee, J. (2014). *Tricks of the Trade: Porn's "best practises" for Content Trades and Shares*. Retrieved April 13, 2019, from PinkLabel-TV: <https://www.pinklabel.tv/on-demand/tricks-of-the-trade-porns-best-practices-for-content-trades-and-shares/>
- Lee, J., & Sullivan, R. (2016). Porn and Labour: The Labour of Porn Studies. *Porn Studies*, 3(2), 104-106.
- Mazzeres, A., Trachman, M., Cointet, J. P., Coulmont, B., & Prieur, C. (2014). Deep tags: toward a quantitative analysis of online pornography. *Porn Studies*, 1(1), 80-95.
- McGlynn, C., & Houghton, R. A. (2017). Beyond 'Revenge Porn': The Continuum of Image-Based Sexual Abuse. *Feminist Legal Studies*, 25(3), 25-46.
- McKee, A. (2012). Pornography as entertainment. *Continuum: Journal of Media & Cultural Studies*, 541-552.
- McKee, A. (2016). Pornography as a creative industry: Challenging the exceptional approach to pornography. *Porn Studies*, 107-119.
- Mies, M. (1993). Towards a Methodology for Feminist Research. In M. Hammersley, *Social Research: Philosophy, Politics and Practise* (pp. 63-82). London: Sage .
- Moore, I. (2014, May 8-10). Exploring the Concept of Cultural and Creative Industries. *New Challenges of Economic and Bussiness Development*, 262-275.
- Newton, N. (2010). *The use of semi-structured interviews in qualitative research: strengths and weaknesses*. Bristol: University of Bristol.
- Oakley, A. (1998). Gender, Methodology and People's Ways of Knowing: Some Problems with Feminism and the Paradigm. *Sociology*, 32, 707-31.
- Olma, S. (2018). *Art and Automy: Past, Present, Future* . Amsterdam : V2_.
- Osgerby, B. (2014). Porn to be Wild: Identity and the Aesthetics of " Otherness" in Subcultural Erotica. In E. Biasin, G. Maina, & F. Zecca, *Porn after Porn: Contemporary Alternative Pornographies* (pp. 37-55). Mimesis International.
- Paasonen, S. (2010). Labors of Love: Netporn, Web 2.0 and the meanings of Amateurism. *New Media and Society*, 12(8), 1297-1312.
- Paasonen, S. (2014). Things to do with the Alternative Fragmentation and Distrinction in Online Porn. In E. Biasin, G. Maina, & F. Zecca, *Porn After Porn: Contemporary Alternative Pornographies* (pp. 21-35). Mimesis International.

- Patton, M. Q. (1990). *Qualitative Research and Evaluation Methods: Integrating Theory and Practice*. Los Angeles: SAGE.
- Pay for your Porn*. (n.d.). Retrieved November 16, 2018, from <http://www.payforyourporn.org/>
- Peitz, M., & Waelbroeck, P. (2003). *Piracy of Digital products: A critical review of economic literature*.
- Preciado, B. (2010). The architecture of Porn. In S. Tim, *Post/Porn/ Politics: Symposium/reader ; Queer-feminist Perspective on the Politics of Porn Performance and Sex-work as Culture Production* (pp. 23-33). B-Books.
- Rayna, T. (2008). Understanding the Challenges of the Digital Economy: The Nature of Digital Goods. *Communication and Strategies*, 71, 13-17.
- Rieple, A., & Pisano, P. (2015). Business model in a New Digital Culture. The open Long Tail model. *Symphonya. Emerging Issues in Management*, 75-88.
- Rosen, S. (1981). The Economics of Superstars. *American Economic Review*, 71(5), 845-858.
- Ross, A. (2009). *Nice Work If You Can Get It: Life and Labour in Precarious Times*. New York: New York University Press.
- Runco, M. A., & Jaeger, G. (2012). The Standard Definition of Creativity. *Creativity Research Journal*, 92-96.
- Schumpeter, J. A. (1934). *Theory of Economic Development: An Inquiry into Profits, Capital, Credit, Interest, and the Business Cycle*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Scott, J. (2010). Quantitative Methods and Gender Inequality. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 3, 223-36.
- Simonton, A., & Smith, C. (2004). Who are Women in Pornography. In C. Stark, & R. Whisnant, *In Not for Sale: Feminists Resisting Prostitution and Pornography* (pp. 352-361). Melbourne: Spinifex.
- Simpson, N. J. (2009). *The Money Shot: How the Porn Business resurrected the Studio System*. Canada: Master Thesis. University of Alberta.
- Smith, C. (2014). Its Important that you don't Smell a Suit on this Stuff: Aesthetics and Politics in Alt Porn. In E. Biasin, G. Maina, & F. Zecca, *Porn after Porn: Contemporary Alternative Pornographies* (pp. 81-59). Mimesis International.
- Smith, M. D., & Telang, R. (2009). Competing with Free: The Impact of Movie Broadcasts on DVD Sales and Internet Piracy. *Mis Quarterly*, 33(2), 321-338.
- Stuttgen, T. (2010). *Post Porn Politics: Symposium/reader ; Queer-feminist Perspective on the Politics of Porn Performance and Sex-work as Culture Production*. B-Books.
- Sullivan, R., & McKee, A. (2015). *Pornography*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Sullivan, J. R. (2012). Skype: An Appropriate Method of Data Collection for Qualitative Interviews? *The Hilltop Review*, 6(1), 54-60.
- Tarrant, S. (2016). *The Pornography Industry: What everyone needs to know*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Throsby, D. (2001). *Economics of Culture*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- Tschmuck, P. (2003). How Creative Are the Creative Industries? A Case of the Music Industry. *The Journal of Arts Management Law and Society*, 33(2), 127-141.
- Varian, H. R. (2005). Copying and Copyright. *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 19, 121-138.
- Vesela, D., & Klimova, K. (2014). Knowledge-Based Economy VS Creative Economy. *Procedia. Social and Behavioral Studies*, 141, 413-417.
- Voros, F. (2014). Domesticated Porn: Gendered Embodiment in Audience Reception, Practises of Pornography. In E. Biasin, G. Maina, & F. Zecca, *Porn After Porn: Contemporary Alternative Pornographies* (pp. 241-255). Mimesis International.
- Voss, G. (2012). Treating it as a normal business: Researching the pornograhny industry. *Sexualities*, 15(3), 391-410.
- Why Pay For Your Porn?* (2017, January 1). Retrieved November 13, 2018, from Ethical Porn: <https://ethical.porn/why-pay-for-your-porn/>
- Wilkinson, E. (2017). The Diverse Economies of Online Pornography: From Paranoid Reading to Post-Capitalist Futures. *Sexualities*, 20(8), 981-998.
- Williams, L. (1992). Pornographies On/Scene. In L. Segal, & M. McIntosh, *Sex Exposed: Sexuality and the Pornography Debate*. London: Virago.
- Williams, L. (2004). *Porn Studies*. Durcham: Duke University Press.
- WIPO. (2006). *National Studies on assesing the economic contribution of Copyright -based Industries*. Geneva: WIPO.

APPENDIX-A:

Overview of the respondents

	Age	Gender	Occupation	Education	Ethnicity
<i>Richard</i>	58	Male	Film-producer and owner of the sites: "IShotMySelf.com" and "Beautiful Agony.com"	BSc in Engineering	Australia
<i>Kate Sinclair</i>	34	Female	Film-producer and owner of the sites "Cherrysystems.com" and "Mskatesinclaire.com"	BSc in Sociology and in Philosophy Studies	Canada
<i>Nordal Nord</i>	31	Female	Primary School teacher and self-employed director	-	Denmark
<i>Hornie Hunters</i>	29	Female	Sex-educator, Sex-worker and self-employed film producer in "HornieHuntersClips.com"	BSc in Arts and Psychology and Minor Diploma in Journalism	Mexico
<i>Jennifer Lyon Bell</i>	49	Female	Film-producer and Owner of the site: "Blueartichoke Films.com"	BSc in Sociology from the University of Harvard and a MA in Film Studies from the University of Amsterdam	United States of America
<i>Garion Hall</i>	57	Male	Film-producer and Owner of the site: "abbywinters.com"		Australia
<i>Maria Beatty</i>	-	Female	Artist, Film-producer and owner of the site "BlueProductions.com"	Bachelor in Arts	Venezuela
<i>Jessie Josh</i>	29	Female	Self-employed film director at site "Permission4Pleasure.com"	Master in Film Making	Australia

APPENDIX- B

SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEW WITH A SINGLE RESPONDENT- TOPIC GUIDE

Date & Time:

Duration:

Place:

Introduction and consent forms: Introduce myself, provide the respondent with some basic information of the study, process of the interview, anonymity and confidentiality reminder.

Pornographic industry as a digital creative industry & the case of ethic pornography.

Warm-up Questions, Self-position and Motivation

- 1) Pleasetellmeaboutyourself. How many years have you been working in the pornographic industry?
- 2) Before you get interested in ethic pornography did you had any experience to mainstream pornography? If you had, what made you change?

Meanings

- 3) Do you think that pornographic industry has gain the attention it reserves as a business? If not, why do you think this happens?
- 4) Are you familiar with the notion of creative industries?
- 5) Doyouthinkthat,pornographicindustrycanbedescribedasadigitalcreativeindustry?
- 6) According to you what is ethical pornography? What are the main characteristics which differentiate it from mainstream pornography?
- 7) Why is it important to pay for porn?
- 8) Do you think it is a feature typical of ethic pornography?

Business aspects

- 9) Do you think that the notion of ethic pornography can be used as a branding strategy in order to face the challenges that characterize the digital market? In terms of audience engagement, content and distribution?
- 10) Areyouconcernedaboutthesizeofpotentialtargetaudience?Whydoyouthinkpeopleare willing to

see ethic pornography?

- 11) Can you explain your business model?
- 12) And how do you promote your products?

Issues related to digitalization

- 13) Did digitalization, affect your decision to enter in the industry?
- 14) Do you think that in digital pornography, niche markets have the same opportunities as established markets?
- 15) What is the biggest threat to a digital pornographic industry?
- 16) What is your opinion about internet piracy? To what extent does piracy affect ethic pornographic and how do you manage to “resist”?

Cooling Down Questions

17) How much do you agree with this statement?: “when people support the work of porn producers who prioritize the physical, emotional and financial health of performer they work with, they make it more viable for other producers to do the same”

18) What are your expectations/ plans concerning ethic pornography in the future?

Summation: Summarize everything that it has been said, in order to make sure that there is anything that needs further clarification.

Demographic Data: Age, Gender, Ethnicity, Occupation, Education

APPENDIX-C

Thematic network analysis

RQ1: Why pornographic industry is not acknowledged as a creative industry?

Global Theme: Pornographic industries as creative industries

Organizing Theme: The exogenous stigmatization of pornographic industry

Basic Themes: a) The stigmatization b) Censorship c) Exchange value d) Payment is not a necessarily valid measurement of ethical pornography

Organizing theme: The endogenous perception of pornographic industries as creative industries

Basic Theme: The lack of creativity in the production of mainstream pornography

RQ2: What is the role of ethical pornography as a niche market?

Global Theme: Ethical Pornography as a niche market

Organizing Theme: The differences in the production and the presentation, between ethical and mainstream pornography.

Basic Themes: a) Ethical pornography regulates working conditions b) Ethical pornography as a branding strategy

Organizing Theme: The long tail of ethical pornography

Basic Themes: a) Visibility b) The distribution in mainstream channels c) The distribution in alternative sites