

**REVOLUTIONARY ROAD:
ONE PERSPECTIVE**

Student Name: Nita Qahili

Student Number: 478518

Supervisor: Laura Braden

Coordinator: Michaël Berghman

Master of Arts, Culture and Society

Erasmus School of History, Culture and Communication

Erasmus University Rotterdam

Date: 14 June 2019

Table of Contents

Abstract

1. Introduction	5
2. Literature Review	7
2.1. Globalization and the world system theory: a cultural perspective	7
2.2. Dynamics of artistic careers from former Yugoslavia to the present	8
2.3. Art history of Kosovo during and after Yugoslavia: cultural movements	9
3. Research question, sub questions and expectations or hypotheses	11
4. Methods	13
4.1. General Overview	13
4.2. Data gathering: Database and Interviews	13
4.3. Data Analysis	15
4.4. Operationalization	17
4.5. Research period and location	18
5. Results	19
5.1. Overview	19
5.1. Revolution and development of artistic careers in Kosovo	20
5.1.1. <i>Pre-90s period</i>	20
5.2. Dynamics of artists careers in Kosovo	25
5.2.1. The 90s period	25
5.2.2. Post-90s Period	29
5.3. Dedication and determination - Behaviour of artists in Kosovo	34

5.4. Artists communicating their perceptions	40
6. Discussion and Conclusion	45
7. References	49
8. Appendices	51
Appendix 1 - Details of the respondents	
Appendix 2 – Interview Guide	
Appendix 3 – Code Book	

REVOLUTIONARY ROAD:

ONE PERSPECTIVE

ABSTRACT

Several factors need to be taken into account in order to understand and conceptualize an artistic career. Education, geographical positioning, cultural capital as well as social capital play a significant role in one's artistic career. Artistic careers in Kosovo begin with the development of art in Kosovo which starts with the foundation of the three main art institutions in Kosovo, High school of Art in Peja in 1945, Academy of Arts in 1974 and National Art Gallery in 1979. As of this period, artistic careers in Kosovo grow rapidly. Therefore, this research is focused on artistic careers of artists from Kosovo as of former Yugoslavia to the present time; their views on the differences of the establishment of an artistic career; the way they behave and communicate it through art. This paper is based on mixed research methods, that of qualitative and quantitative. Database of Kosovar Artists has been created and data entry was done for 352 artists. It was followed by twelve interviews, five art critics and seven artists. The findings show that not only the development of art played a significant role in the artistic career of artists from Kosovo but also the conflict that kept on going for decades. However, it is important to state that the empirical findings show that the behaviours of artists have changed in less than a century. A shift in behaviour regarding studying in one of the three main mediums is present.

KEYWORDS: Artistic Careers, Art in Kosovo, Art Worlds, Behaviours of Artists from Kosovo, Revolution of Art in Kosovo

1. Introduction

In this research, I want to explore the differences between dynamics of artistic careers of artists from Kosovo during the former Yugoslavia compared to the present time; their views on differences of the establishment of an artistic career and the way they behave and communicate it through art.

Yugoslavia was a centralized communist union of states, though more liberal compared to the other communist countries. Art in this union of states was an important pillar, therefore its development was reinforced (Volčič, 2007). Yugoslavia was the first socialist country to open the Museum of Contemporary Art after WWII in Belgrade. This helped Yugoslavia to be part of the art world, by bringing one of the most important travelling exhibitions from MoMA entitled “Modern Art in the United States: Selections from the collection of the Museum of Modern Art, New York” in 1956. It was succeeded by opening the first art institute, the art gallery of naïve art in Zagreb (Shirley, 1978). So, they pushed the boundaries by developing art, thus interference in this development was apparent. Due to communist ideologies, the country itself aimed at fulfilling its goals. Specific rules and regulations were followed. However, there were problems, as there was an unequal presentation of ethnicities. In addition, inequality was perceived even in regard to law reinforcement and development of some provinces as well as cities. Consequently, the development of art was more prominent in big cities (Allcock, 2002). Being part of a smaller ethnicity limited access to various fields was present. Yugoslavia itself created some barriers, thus, it was rather difficult to be an established artist if coming from a province or a smaller city. According to Pasquinelli & Sjöholm (2015) one of the main factors for an artist to have an artistic career is the place they come from, geographically speaking. In this sense, the geographical aspect plays a significant role in the process of recognition, creating good networking and developing rich communication with other societal groups. Further, it depends on the artists’ activities and finally the impact of the media. The latter influences how society perceives art, thus they help artists to establish their own careers (Becker, 1982).

Until now, there has been quite a lot of research done about artistic careers from various perspectives, coming from all over the world. In this case, there is little to no research and knowledge of the development of careers of artists coming from Kosovo. Hence, there is a gap in the literature regarding this field. It is interesting to see the development of art in this area after

Kosovo had been under various regimes. Conflicts that persisted in Kosovo created implications for all fields especially that of art. Despite Kosovo having received autonomy in 1974 by the Yugoslavian constitution, it was revoked in 1990 by the Serbians (Defreese, 2009). Yugoslavia was capable of keeping several nations together for decades; it was one of the strongest and longest regimes in the Balkans. Within, it embodied various policies. Besides, it was just in the former Yugoslavian period when the art started to develop on a greater scale, by opening art institutions. Therefore, this thesis aims at filling in the gap in the scholarly literature about artists coming from Kosovo and their journeys regarding the establishment of their artistic careers, starting from former Yugoslavian period to the present time. It will be giving a clearer understanding of the journey artists undertook once they decided to become artists and how this regime has affected them. It will provide an estimated number of artists who studied in Belgrade, Zagreb or Ljubljana, that means the pre-90s period, during the 90s and post 90s, their preferences in the medium; and their perceptions on this development, including limitations and opportunities.

2. Literature Review

2.1. Globalization and the world system theory: a cultural perspective

Globalization in Yugoslavia has had paradoxical effects as it affected the fragmentation of the Republic itself. Globalization as a phenomenon in Yugoslavia resembles the world system theory, that was developed based on the imbalance between the central and peripheral countries. Central countries, in this case, bigger cities experienced development compared to the peripheral ones, which faced constraints of various levels. It represents the hierarchy within a country (Chase-Dunn & Grimes, 1995; Braden & Oosterman, 2018). Along these lines, former Yugoslavia as a union of countries, a state-centric developed union of countries slowed down the democratization process, consequently, fostered nationality within the communities which lead to a reproduction of instability and insecurity (Kurze, 2009). According to Janssen's findings, a country being a state-centric offers an understanding of cross-national differences. Competition between ethnicities was present, a detail that puts emphasis on the elements of industrialization but also encouraged ethnic intolerance (Hodson, Sekulic, & Massey, 1994). Since globalization had unfair, unequal development as there were "centrifugal forces of regionalism, nationalism and separatism", fear and uncertainty prevailed (Kavanagh, 1998). Globalization as a very important aspect besides embodying change, it also represents an exchange of consumption and production. In this sense, the geographical situation plays a significant role and is also a predicate for cultural exchange (Janssen, Kuipers, & Verboord, 2008). Thus, cultural globalization is one of the main aspects of globalization itself, the visual arts have always been oriented towards the international level, though the close connection with national institutions was always present.

So, in Yugoslavia, there was globalization within its own countries and with the rest of the world. This form of globalization led to hybridization of cultures. The communist regime had its own ideologies, therefore its own style of painting, socialist realism. This immediately created a hybridization between nations, more specifically artists. This also influenced the styles and techniques artists used, which resembled a lot to one-another. One example is Vlada Radovic, who was a Montenegrin artist, and his artworks were influenced by the Albanian style (Muharremi, 2000). To some artists, the system was narrow-minded and inflexible due to specific approaches used for the development of art and culture. Artists could not create explicit artworks, as one of

the main preferences of the system was realism. In case when artists refused that style, they were perceived as enemies of the regime (Subotić, 1993).

Yugoslavia demarcated from the Stalinist dogmatism, which marked the second phase of Yugoslavia itself. Therefore, in the mid-50s the approach changed and was even more free towards artistic creation (Stojanovich, 1966). Though it was a communist state of unions, it was more liberal compared to the other communist regimes. Yugoslavia's leadership offered an exchange of knowledge and helped to fulfil the cultural gaps, which was something unique for the age of globalism. This was preceded by the first art institution to be opened in Zagreb, Croatia that displayed naïve art (Shirley, 1978). Additionally, one of the biggest exhibitions that travelled across countries in Europe came also to Yugoslavia. The exhibition "Modern Art in the United States: Selections from the collection of the Museum of Modern Art, New York" in 1956, included painting, sculpture, architecture, prints and photography. Part of this exhibition were four main directions of American Art over a period of about 40 years (MoMA, 1956). This exhibition was also used as a form of promoting the western consumerism, as well as stimulating respect and cultural understanding between nations, which was controversy to the USSR industrial policies (The Museum of Modern Art, 2018). This exhibition was presented at the Museum of Contemporary Art (Muzej Savremene Umetnosti) in Belgrade, which was the first socialist country after the WWII to open a museum of modern art (Jakovljević, 2016). Though there seem to have been cultural dysfunctions, as in Yugoslav societies culture was a contested space thus struggles were evident (Pauker, 2006), westernization of cultures was present which was a sign of globalisation (Bobinac, 2014). With the fall of Yugoslavia, the system changed. At the present time, each country has its own cultural institutions, embodying cultural policies that helped in the development of art and culture, as well as the promotion of artists.

2.2. Dynamics of artistic careers from former Yugoslavia to the present

An artistic career is the growth of symbolic capital, including cultural values and institutional recognition at the beginning of the career that later on is converted into economic capital succeeded by professional success (Rodner & Thomson, 2013; Vander Gucht, 1991; Velthuis, 2005 as cited in Komarova, 2018). These artists represent universal and permanent values; thus, they extend the boundaries of experiences. However, an artist must embody several features for a fruitful career.

These features, besides their own identity (Bain, 2005), are education, hierarchy, organization and geography, which sometimes are considered career boundaries (Bendassolli & Wood, 2012). Whereas in Yugoslavia, ethnicity and nationality were an extra feature that played a significant role (Myers, 2016). As more attention was given to bigger cities, dominated by Slavic ethnicities, the dynamics in the development of art was even stronger. This was due to lack of presentation of minor ethnicities thus nationalities. The hierarchy was present, and art itself helped it. In high-class arts attain a high status among the identity-defining conversational currencies (DiMaggio, 1987). Whereas, when it comes to education, academies of fine arts tend to hold a strong artistic monopolism, that controls the artistic path. Additionally, this affects artists' career as well as the evaluation of the artworks (Vander Gucht, 1988). Consequently, it determines the role of the artist in society, though it entails the artists' past behaviour and future expectations. Firstly, it embodies the way that the artist is perceived by the mass and second the expectation regarding the artists' production by society (Delmestri, Montanari, & Usai, 2005). Linking it to the art in Yugoslavia, there was non-mutual development of certain public and provinces, thus inequalities prevailed in laws of development and subordination (Spadijter, 1977). With the fall of Yugoslavia, the dynamics in the artistic communities changed, hence its development went on different directions. This allowed artists to adopt new approaches of creation, styles and artistic identities that helped their career.

2.3. Art history of Kosovo during and after Yugoslavia: cultural movements

The historical background regarding the establishment of art and culture in Kosovo is of great importance for this thesis. It will give clearer views from a broader context and understand the basis of its development as well as its movements. Yugoslavia looked at art from a broader context of modernism, meaning that they saw it as an important pillar of development of a country. Looking at it from a political point of view, the art world was perceived as a self-legitimated approach (Dedic, N.D.). Following self-legitimation, the community of artists of Kosovo often ended up in crossroads because of that concept. Hence, they were constantly encouraged subsequently dedicated to developing their own language of art despite the difficulties. They did take chances and balanced their own identity as there were artists that studied in the Academy of Fine Arts in Belgrade, which was by far the most developed city in former Yugoslavia, along with

Zagreb and Ljubljana. This helped them to look further for artistic development. This form of expression was pushed forward by the Yugoslav Constitution in 1974, Kosovo became an autonomous province within Serbia. Though in 1990 this was revoked immediately (Defreese, 2009). According to Hiso (2007), Kosovo is vital for people, as “The cradle of Serbia. The cradle of Albania. The lost heart of the Balkans”.

Kosovar artists were living in a complex society. It was surrounded by states that were developed, had a division of labour and with a population. The art development was of unique dimensions. However, numerous Kosovar artists had the chance to be educated in those areas. Thus, hybridization has been noticed in the works of some artists, also from the ones from Kosovo as well as from artists of other countries of former Yugoslavia. This came as a result of globalisation within Yugoslavia, and a “mutual understanding” and exchanging of cultural values.

According to Kadare (2000), art from Kosovo faced a lack of freedom, though artists were creating valuable works of art. Therefore, during the 50s art from Kosovo, especially fine arts, started receiving recognition, which included occasional reviews and critics, professional publications, and other related articles that dealt with status and acknowledgement (Muharremi, 2000). The first art school to be found in Kosovo was in Peja in 1945. The foundation of this school offered great opportunities for the younger generation to follow the artistic career. Though in the first five years the academic staff were dominated by Serb-Montenegrin professors. The art movement in Kosovo was followed by the opening of the Academy of Arts in 1974, proceeded by the Kosovo Art Gallery, which nowadays is the National Art Gallery of Kosovo (Muharremi, 2000). Until now, a lot of changes and developments of art and culture in Kosovo has happened. A greater number of artists are exhibiting abroad, they are working overseas but also representing other countries including in The Venice Biennale, one of the most important art events of the art world.

3. Research question, sub questions and expectations or hypotheses

Yugoslavia was a centralized communist union of states. As it was a communist country, specific regulations had to be followed in order to fulfil the ideologies of the regime. One of the elements that made this regime stand out was the freedom it gave to artists, in comparison to other communist regimes. In Yugoslavia, globalisation happened, within the union of states but also outside. They brought art from abroad but also send art abroad. However, when it comes to development, the advantage was given to bigger cities, which led to the unequal presentation of ethnicities. This brought light to the nationalism which prevails even nowadays in the Balkans. Due to unequal development between cities and provinces, there was lack of opportunities towards various societal groups. Despite inequalities, as of 1945 art in Kosovo started its development. However, there is little to no research on the process of development of art or artists perceptions regarding the change in dynamics, and neither in their artistic careers.

Taking this into consideration, the main research question of the thesis is *what are the differences between dynamics of artistic careers of artists from Kosovo during the former Yugoslavia compared to the present time; what limitations and opportunities they faced in regard to having a reputation; how do artists communicate the differences in the establishment of an artistic career starting from the 40s and how they behave towards it?*

The first question “*What are the differences between dynamics of artistic careers of artists from Kosovo during the former Yugoslavia compared to the present time?*” will estimate the number of artists who graduated in one of the main cities of former Yugoslavia, mediums they studied and how much it has affected their approach in art creation. This data will allow to make a comparison to the present. In addition, it will make clear if there was lack of inequality of the ethnic group of Albanians from Kosovo. The second question “*What limitations and opportunities they faced in regard to having a reputation?*” it will be evaluated based on artists point of view but also look at the opportunities they were offered regarding international participation and publications. Whereas the third question “*How do artists communicate the differences in the establishment of an artistic career starting from the 40s*”, will look at the perceptions of artists and what they thought of all the events that occurred from the former Yugoslavian period to now. And the final question “*How artists from Kosovo behave regarding artistic creation*”, will shed

light in understanding artists motives and dedication in creating art, that directly influences the career of an artist.

Answering these questions separately will help shed light to the understanding of how it has affected artists from Kosovo, and to what extent the presentation of artists from Yugoslavia to now differs. Thus, it will make clear the development of artistic careers of artists from Kosovo and its trajectory.

Following the theory, first, it is expected that artists from Kosovo during the former Yugoslavian period had fewer opportunities to have an artistic career compared to now. It was way more difficult for them to be accepted at the Art Academies in main cities of the former Yugoslavia. Second, it is expected that because of terrible conditions artists did not try hard enough to have an artistic career. Third, comparing the Yugoslavian period, with that of Serbian period, education wise, the number of graduated artists was not high, as they did not have a lot of opportunities. Fourth, the post-90s period offered great new opportunities to artists as once Kosovo was free, it was easier for artists to delve into the art world.

4. Methods and data

4.1. General Overview

The aim of the research was to understand the differences in artistic careers of artists from Kosovo during the former Yugoslavian period compared to the present time, limitations they faced and opportunities that were given to them regarding their careers, how they communicate the differences that are established as of the 40s and finally what is their behaviour towards creation. This research employed mixed methods of research, qualitative and quantitative. With the use of both research methods, the research strategy focused on the number of artists that graduated during the former Yugoslavia and after its fall, gaining insights regarding the revolution in art development in Kosovo, through the perceptions of artists from Kosovo, and reflection on artistic creation. Both of these methods helped in finding particular elements that made the development of art in Kosovo interesting, which will be further explained in the results section. In addition, these methods helped in finding patterns created within the artistic community during the former Yugoslavia and see how they have changed now. Furthermore, qualitative research methods assisted in gaining in-depth knowledge, a deeper meaning thus opinions of artists regarding the art world in Kosovo. Consequently, the sample for this research were visual artists.

One of the biggest limitations for this study was the data, meaning that there was no database of artists nor research done on this field. Thus, in order to make clarifications regarding the education and career starting as of the 40s, the database had to be created. In regard to this, the collection of data began.

4.2. Data gathering: Database and Interviews

The first phase started with the process of building the database of artists from Kosovo, starting from the 40s. The sampling for the database were visual artists who had a degree in the art field. Despite being a long process and time consuming it was interesting to see the development of art just by going through artists biographies and adding them in the Excel format that was already created. Accessibility of information was easy as I already had networking, as I run one of the first private art galleries in Prishtina, Kosovo, Galeria Qahili, and grew up with art, as my father is an

artist. Due to the reliability of the information, especially for the artists that are no longer alive, the main source was three monographs that were published by the National Art Gallery of Kosovo and one published by Luciano Benetton foundation. To make it more complete a source of information were also exhibition catalogues of the National Art Gallery and of the gallery of the Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sports. And the final source was the University of Prishtina, Faculty of Arts where lecturers and professor's biographies are accessible online. Hundreds of catalogues of personal and collective exhibitions were looked at, scrutinized in order to find biographies of artists. If the catalogues were of collective/group exhibitions it was more difficult to find artists' biographies. In that case, the artist was contacted in person or Goggled in order to find the biography. If their biographies were not in English, they were translated from Albanian to English, due to the feasibility of the upcoming processes, especially that of conducting analysis.

The database was built on several variables, though it initially started with six, that of date of birth, gender, education, exhibitions, awards and publications. However, while doing data entry the number of variables grew, and the final variables are - date of birth, date of death, gender, country of origin, education, department, city of education, year of education, level of degree, their tutor - supervisor, first time exhibiting, number of personal exhibitions, number of collective exhibitions, prizes, residencies, publications, medium they work on, ethnicity, if they are part of any association, work, where they live, and interesting facts. The aim was to add for each artist their exhibitions separately based on the year they exhibited. However, due to the short time that was not possible to be completed. As a result, the 22 variables in the database represents artist evolution, starting from the education to the current occupation. Within a period of two - three months of collecting data for the Kosovar Artists Database, 352 artists were added with 85% of the information.

The second phase of data collection was conducting the interviews. The sampling was the same with the quantitative data, Visual Artists. However, as it was of interest to understand the atmosphere and try to make a comparison between the former Yugoslavian period to now and look at it from a more critical point of view, art critics were added to the sample. As a result, there are five art critics and seven artists. Three artists overlap regarding their occupation, as they tend to be artists, art critics, poets and/or art historians. Thus, purposive sampling technique was used as there was a specific target group with particular characteristics that were of interest for the research

from the beginning (Bryman, 2012). Even though the art critics and artists were selected based on networking they were picked up randomly. In total twelve interviews were conducted. The age of sampling ranges from 27 to 81 (*See Appendix 1, for more details*). Putting emphasis on the age, is important as it encompasses artists of the first generation of artists in Kosovo, which were the founding fathers of the Academy of Arts, National Art Gallery, and so on.

Prior to interviews, the interview guide with six semi-structured open questions was created. The open questions are related to the topics derived from the theories addressed in the literature review. The questions are semi-structured as they were not asked in the same order to each respondent (Bryman, 2012). Due to the fact that there were two samplings, two interview guides were created (*See Appendix 2, for more details*). Some questions overlap with one another whereas some do not. As the interview guide contained semi-structured open questions, several follow up questions were asked while conducting the interview. Though the follow-up questions have not been the same as they depended on the answer's respondents gave. Interviews lasted between 30 to 58 min; in total it was 510:27 minutes or 8.5 hours of interviewing time. One small change happened with one of the interviewees, as he was old, 81 years old, he only answered 2 questions and then gave me one of his most recent interviews he gave for a newspaper in Albania. Due to higher reliability, the interviews were recorded with the interviewees' consent. Due to feasibility and comfort, all the interviews were conducted in Albanian, in various places in Prishtina, such as the Academy of Arts and Science, at Galeria Qahili and other local cafes. The interviews were conducted in a period of 10 days. Three out of twelve interviews were conducted on the same day.

4.3. Data Analysis

With the data analysis begins one of the final phases of the research. Two types of data had to be analysed that of quantitative and qualitative. Both of these data when combined support each other, and the results are richer.

The database contains 352 artists who started their career as of the beginning of the former Yugoslavian period to now. As the Kosovar Artists Database was built in Excel Office, it was, therefore, an acceptable version in SPSS. The database contains rich information that numerous

other researches can be conducted. However, in this research descriptive data analysis and correlation matrix was done. Description data analysis was used in order to summarise the features of the collection of the data (Bryman, 2012). Whereas correlation matrix was used in order to see the correlation between a set of variables. This allowed to see which pair have the highest correlation (Bryman, 2012). The set of variables that were used for the correlation matrix are mediums – painting, sculpture, printmaking, gender – female, male, periods – pre-90s period, 90s period, and post-90s period.

Whereas for the qualitative methods, there were twelve respondents. In order to have mixed data and perceptions regarding artistic careers and development of art in Kosovo, artists and art critics were interviewed. Five of them were art critics and the seven other respondents were artists. As the interviews were recorded, all of them were transcribed verbatim. All the interviews are in Albanian language. Therefore, all quotes used in the data were translated in English from Albanian. While transcribing a sense of analysing and coding was better apprehended. This facilitated the process of becoming familiar with the data as it allowed to see the connection between interviews. The method of open coding was used in order to find codes and categories that help in answering the research question (Bryman, 2012). Consequently, categories were developed, and concepts were labelled. The interviews were coded once the codebook was created (*See Appendix 3, for the codebook*). Through the coding process connection between interviews was made, and overarching topics were depicted.

While doing the research, it has been depicted a difference in the development of art depending on the period. Therefore, the development of art has been divided into three periods, pre-90s period, 90s period and post-90s period. This separation comes as a result of three various systems ruling in Kosovo which influenced art development directly. However, they overlap with one another, therefore it is rather impossible to say that there are clear cuts between periods. Therefore, attention was given to the period when artists graduated, whether pre-90s, the 90s, or post-90s. In addition, the medium was important as once the Academy of Arts was established it only had three mediums, that of painting, sculpture and printmaking.

4.4. Operationalization

The research question is demarcated in order to examine each concept. The aim of the interviews was to give a deeper understanding and perception of an artistic career in former Yugoslavian compared to now, including its limitations and opportunities offered. Whereas the aim of the database was to have an estimate number of artists, mediums they studied, period that they graduated and see the correlation between various sets of variables.

The term *dynamics of artistic careers* refers to the education of the artists, where they come from and where they studied. Taking into consideration that the database has been built, it will help determine the number of artists who studied in one of the big cities of former Yugoslavia, such as Belgrade, Ljubljana and Zagreb. It will also give an estimate of which medium they mostly graduated from. Using a mixed method will allow understanding the reasons for those specific mediums. In addition, it will shed light to the movements in art by giving space in elaborating further on three main developments in Kosovo, opening the high school of art in Peja in 1945, the Faculty of Arts in Prishtina in 1974 and last but not least the National Art Gallery of Kosovo in 1979. Thus, this is closely related to the term *limitations and opportunities* given to artists in Kosovo regarding their career. This explains artists struggle, motivation and dedication towards an artistic career, taking into account the historical background that in the 90s they were banned off the University spaces, the National Gallery was taken by the Serbian regime, and they did not have much left. On the contrary, despite the limitations, they continued their career and continued studying arts. Thus, an estimated number of artists graduating during the 90s period will be present.

The term *professional behaviour* refers to artists motivation and dedication to creating art. It explores individuals will to be educated and their effort to have a career.

The final concept is that of *reflection* which is defined based on the interviewees' point of view regarding the establishment of an artistic career. In addition, it tells of how they speak about artistic careers. It shows their preferences and dislikes regarding the educational system, and its approach to artists having a career.

4.5. Research period and location

The research was executed between the period of March and the beginning of May 2019. The database was built within two-three months working 2 to 3 hours per day. The database was built using secondary data, such as monographs and catalogues. However, only publishing with the latest issues were used by the National Art Gallery of Kosovo, Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sports as they have most of the relevant data needed for the database. A publishing by Luciano Benetton foundation was also used as it has lately been published and includes a younger generation of artists, who have not yet exhibited on a wider scale. Whereas the interviews were conducted during April, within a 10-day period. The time and location sometimes depended on the interviewee. Three out twelve interviews were conducted at the Academy of Arts and Science, one at Galeria Qahili, one at Monet Café Gallery, one at the Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sports and the rest in various cafes in the city. Details for each interview can be found in the interview transcripts.

5. Results

5.1. Overview

This research employed mixed research methods. Perceptions of established, emerging and new artists, as well as art critics, played significant importance in order to understand the process of the development in art in Kosovo along with artistic careers of artists from Kosovo. Through their lenses, a greater knowledge was underpinned regarding the arts and culture as well as their own careers from the former Yugoslavian period to the present time. Whereas with the creation of the database of artists from Kosovo descriptive statistics gave a clearer idea on the number of artists that studied starting from the former Yugoslavian period to now. In addition, it gave clear numbers on the medium artists graduated the most. The quantitative and qualitative data support each other.

Hence the results are divided into several chapters that will carry on discussing important and relevant issues that help to answer the research question. For a better demarcation and understanding the development of art in Kosovo as of former Yugoslavia, three main periods have been depicted, the pre-90s period, 90s period and the post-90s period. During the pre-90s period Kosovo was part of former Yugoslavia, the 90s period Kosovo was under the Serbian regime, and post-90s period Kosovo was a new independent state. As the boundaries are not completely demarcated and the transition between the period is fluid these dates are to be seen as approximate periods. Consequently, there are no clear cuts between the three periods as there are no clear dates when one period of one system begins or ends, as to some extent there is a merging of systems. In each of these three periods, artists expressed themselves in different ways because they lived in different economic and social conditions. Finally, to sum up, the first generation of artists the ones that have established the Academy of Arts, that later on was called the Faculty of Arts due to bureaucratic procedures, are still alive, they have taught the second generation of artists, who experienced and grew artistically during the 90s-period, and the second generation taught the third generation of artists, the post-90s period.

The database of artists from Kosovo examined 352 artists. 19,8% of artists are female whereas the rest, 80.2% are male.

<i>Gender F</i>	
Mean	0.198300283
Standard Error	0.021251824
Median	0
Mode	0
Standard Deviation	0.399285513
Sample Variance	0.159428921
Kurtosis	0.311551564
Skewness	1.519808726
Range	1
Minimum	0
Maximum	1
Sum	70
Count	352
Confidence Level (95.0%)	0.041796519

Table 1. Female Artists

<i>Gender M</i>	
Mean	0.801136364
Standard Error	0.021304795
Median	1
Mode	1
Standard Deviation	0.399713378
Sample Variance	0.159770785
Kurtosis	0.298011867
Skewness	-1.51537156
Range	1
Minimum	0
Maximum	1
Sum	282
Count	352
Confidence Level (95.0%)	0.04190111

Table 2. Male Artists

A number of artists, female and male, have not only built an artistic career but also helped in the elevation of art scene in Kosovo. Thus, it is important to start from the beginning, the first few steps that were undertaken in order to recreate an identity as well as start a revolution that reflects on their own journey and at the same time the development of art in Kosovo. This will go along as in 1945 is the time when the proper development of art started. The following chapter will shed light into these issues as well as the route it went through in order to have the current art scene in Kosovo.

5.1. Revolution and development of artistic careers in Kosovo

5.1.1. Pre-90s period

Art and culture have always been part of the people of Kosovo. However, artists started to receive an education in Art Academies in the beginning of the 20th century. Up to that moment, everything that has been created and at the present time is part of Albanian cultural heritage has been treated as an artisan. The proper development of art, the starting point of art in Kosovo began as of 1945, once the High School of Art in Peja was found. During that period Kosovo was part of the former Yugoslavia. This school created a revolution among young artists or the golden generation that studied there. This revolution entails the *first phase* of the development of art in Kosovo, consequently its first pillar. According to Rexhep Ferri, one of the founding members of the Academy of Arts in Kosovo, Belgrade had the artistic potential, the aesthetic power that has been reflected throughout Europe for ages. Opening the high school of art in Peja created a new monopolism that pushed boundaries of art in Kosovo.

“In Peja, the high school of art opened which once was one of the most acknowledged art schools in Yugoslavia.”- R.F

According to him, besides the fact that the high school of art grew the potential it also brought that sort of charm and glow in Kosovo which was missing. In this school, the first generation got their basis of arts from professors of Belgrade who have been educated in various Academies throughout Europe. Along these lines, through this school there was a reformation of identity, that made artists create a character of their own with an indirect influence. As the only school of art in Kosovo, Shyqyri Nimani, the first director of the National Art Gallery, claims that this school was well-prepared, the staff was well educated, with other words they were high-brow people.

“...it was a 50year school, it was pretty long. It was a professional school, professors, the teaching staff were educated. All those professors that gave lectures in the school, studied in Art Academies; it was of a really high level. “– Sh.N

This school was so well structured, that artists who went there to finish their high school not only had intensive studies, but also grew their cultural capital. This accumulation of knowledge helped them to collectively use it for good in every aspect of their life in their future upbringings. Taking into consideration their hectic schedule they basically grew up in the high school of art in Peja. They had numerous hours of practical work on their main courses that of drawing and painting, whereas the rest of the subjects was secondary. These courses were taught in Serbo-Croatian, and only Albanian Literature was taught in their native language. By combining both forms of education, the practical and the theoretical, they created their own individuality and style in work. They became knowledgeable, though they experienced a lot. Needless to say, that not only the first generation but a lot of generations that studied at the high school of art grabbed the opportunity and always carried within the dedication and motivation towards having a career and helping the developments of this field in Kosovo.

According to Rexhep Ferri, finishing the high school in Peja was beneficial and important as besides the facts that it was a good education, due to their excellent drawing and artistic skills they had no difficulties in being admitted at the Academy of Arts in Belgrade. They would stand out from the crowd which was valuable for them as they belonged to the second group of ethnicities, that of Albanian, which represents the ranking of ethnicities in former Yugoslavia.

“And when we went to Belgrade from Kosovo, we excelled in the entrance examination” - RF

They were well prepared. This generation built and established their own careers once they were admitted at this Academy. They had experiences, had the chance to exhibit and explore the art world in one of the main cities of the former Yugoslavia. For example, Shyqyri Nimani created visual designs for the Ballet and the Theatre of Belgrade. This not only helped him in developing his own artistic skills but also grow his networking which turned out to be beneficial in the future. Accordingly, also other artists embraced other opportunities that were beneficial for their own artistic careers.

The second phase of art in Kosovo began once the first generation of artists finished their studies in Belgrade, the period when Muslim Mulliqi, Rexhep Ferri, Tahir Emra and Agim Çavdarbasha finished their studies, had already established their own careers and were devoted to continuing their artistic careers and journey in Kosovo. With all their knowledge gained and expertise built so far, they initiated one of the most important phases of the revolution regarding the development of art in Kosovo. They found the Academy of Arts in 1974, which was part of the University of Prishtina. At first, the Academy of Arts had three departments, that of Painting, Sculpture and Printmaking. And later on, Shyqyri Nimani established the department of Graphic Design. In order for a better education they brought professors from outside to teach periodically. With the Academy of Arts, they created a shift in the monopolism of art, and from Peja they brought it to Prishtina, which now is the capital city of Kosovo. The charm and glow moved across cities. As of this period they started creating those world system theories, the centrifugal forces that have influenced the trajectory of the development of art in Kosovo.

By most of the interviewees, the first generation were called the golden generation, as they created the norm and the basis for greater art development. Needless to say, they offered a greater opportunity for students who had financial instability – was difficult for them (students) to go somewhere else to study outside of Prishtina, Kosovo. According to Eqrem Basha, artists motivation, dedication and will to continue working in the art field helped the growth of the Academy of Arts. They were the lucky generation as they got to be the ones that found one of the most important institutions in regard to art. With the opening of the Academy of Arts, the second phase of development of art was promising. According to Genc Rezniki the biggest push of the second phase of art was also the autonomy Kosovo received from the Yugoslav Constitution in 1974. It created a new atmosphere. New artists were to come out of that Academy, new careers and new changes in art. They created a new movement, a new aura, and new energy in the city in Prishtina, in Kosovo. Rexhep Ferri calls this movement as a full rebirth:

“And the opening of the high school of art - what I said in the beginning, was the beginning of a renaissance or a national renaissance for Albanians of Kosovo. Then the opening of the faculty of arts, happens, it supported that national rebirth, that spiritual revival, from where a number of artists – creators came from.” – RF

This generation taught a great number of artists. Depending on the department, in the beginning, they would graduate to one of the founders of the Academy. Out of 352 artists examined, 37.2% of them graduated pre-90s period, and only 17.9% of artists studied in one of the former Yugoslavian states, Belgrade, Zagreb and Ljubljana, excluding Prishtina. This was the beginning of the revolutionary development of the art field in Kosovo.

<i>Pre 90s</i>	
Mean	0.372159091
Standard Error	0.025800942
Median	0
Mode	0
Standard Deviation	0.48406858
Sample Variance	0.234322391
Kurtosis	-1.727663011
Skewness	0.531211625
Range	1
Minimum	0
Maximum	1
Sum	131
Count	352
Confidence Level (95.0%)	0.050743888

Table 3. Studied pre-90s period

<i>Studied in Yugoslavia - pre 90s period</i>	
Mean	0.178977273
Standard Error	0.020460817
Median	0
Mode	0
Standard Deviation	0.383878957
Sample Variance	0.147363054
Kurtosis	0.834092715
Skewness	1.682077837
Range	1
Minimum	0
Maximum	1
Sum	63
Count	352
Confidence Level (95.0%)	0.040241221

*Table 4. Studied in former Yugoslavia –
Pre-90s period*

The rest of the artists studied in Kosovo, with a few exceptions. Eqrem Basha states that with the Academy of Arts new prospects for a rich cultural life prevailed among various communities, among the people of Kosovo. The opening of the Academy results in a large number of new artists who were students of this generation. As a result, he states that:

*"To this day we have world famous artists that come from a small country.
I mean, these embryos are worth mentioning. " – EB*

Up to 1979 artists exhibited in various spaces though not proper ones for exhibiting thus influencing artistic development. But, in a way it helped artists to keep their hopes up and challenge themselves. *The third phase* of the first period started with the opening of the National Art Gallery in Kosovo in 1979. The first director of the gallery was Shyqyri Nimani. He belongs to the first generation of artists who helped in the further development of art in Kosovo. He came back in Kosovo as he had to contribute in his own field, due to the fact that he received a scholarship by the Newspaper Rilindja, a phenomenon that was positive for creating staff and educate people. With a group of people, the National Art Gallery of Kosovo opened and helped in the establishment of intercultural communication between neighbouring countries. The National Art Gallery brought a number of important exhibitions in Prishtina. This initiated movements within Kosovo and various artistic communities. Thus, people of various societal groups had the chance to see new art, new movements as well as innovative approaches that elevated art in Kosovo. One of the biggest challenges Shyqyri Nimani faced was creating proper cultural diplomacy that would help Kosovo have almost the same importance as the other countries of Yugoslavia within Yugoslav society. Hence Shyqyri Nimani states:

"They did not want it. Kosovo is closed. They did not like to bring the outside world, because international would come, the diplomats and what was interesting is that I was a member of the federal council for relations with the outside world. We were 8 directors of art galleries, 2 of the Provinces, and 6 of the Republics. Everything that has gone out of the former Yugoslavia, what we wanted to send, we have decided, us 8 people, the federal body in Belgrade. " - ShN

He played a significant role not only in the development of art in Kosovo but also in cultural diplomacy as well as the increase of cultural capital throughout the population of Kosovo. Most importantly he helped artists gain a different experience and establish their own artistic careers on a different level. Therefore, the Academy of Arts in Prishtina created new dynamics in life. It

created new prospects thus opportunities. The National Art Gallery puts even greater emphasis on the dynamics of art in Kosovo. Due to this, a lot of artists carried on despite the struggles that will be explored in the following chapters.

5.2. Dynamics of artists careers in Kosovo

5.2.1. The 90s period

As in the 80s, a lot of non-conformities became part of everyone's life, especially to artists. The end of the 80s, beginning of the 90s, was the most critical period in Kosovo, not only in the art world but in every other area. This also notes the fall of Yugoslavia. Once Kosovo was stuck as part of Serbia, life commodities changed to a different level. This puts emphasis on the fact that it was the period when institutions were occupied by the Serbian regime, leading to students and staff being removed. They would study in basements or in other people's houses. One of the post-90s interviewees, Yll Xhaferi, a new artist, was shocked once he found out about this phenomenon.

"...and I said you must have extra will and power to continue studying in those conditions." - YXh

Given the breadth of stories, he states that his respect grew for those generations that despite everything they still continued studying. In spite of the subject matter, the difficulties and bad life conditions, they still found their own mantra and continued working even more. Taking into account the parallel system in Kosovo, which was a paradoxical situation for every aspect of life, it has influenced the educational process in the 90s. The number of graduates is considerably smaller compared to the pre 90s period. During the 90s, only 12.5% of 352 artists examined graduated at the Faculty of Arts.

<i>the 90s</i>	
Mean	0.125
Standard Error	0.01765247
Median	0
Mode	0
Standard Deviation	0.331189688
Sample Variance	0.10968661
Kurtosis	3.205202035
Skewness	2.27750362
Range	1
Minimum	0
Maximum	1
Sum	44
Count	352
Confidence Level (95.0%)	0.034717916

Table 5. Studied 90s period

According to the descriptive data, the number of graduates during the 90s period being smaller can be as a result of the parallel system. This subject matter had huge impact on the lives of people, as there were times when coping with the system was difficult. Repression was one of the biggest struggles among others. In order to better understand the system in Kosovo during the 90s, one needs to know that a parallel system existed in this period. With the parallel system it is represented the dissatisfaction of Albanians with the Serbian governance since they exerted direct and indirect violence and caused difficult living situations. This included lack of study materials in their mother tongue (Albanian Language), changing schedules and syllabuses as the regime felt like and so on, in order to assimilate and remove the sense of identity. This form of governance affected art as well. Artists' community was not contented with it. They were organizing exhibitions in various places in Kosovo, excluding the National Art Gallery. In a way they started boycotting the National Art Gallery because they did not agree on how it was functioning. One of the biggest issues was that the director of the National Art Gallery in Kosovo was just announced by the governance/regime without any prior notification. Vesta Nura explains as follows:

“We Albanians were boycotting as there was a logical separation. They fired us/removed us from our jobs, they brought extreme measures.” - VN

Therefore, as the Serbian regime was harsh, huge disagreements between ethnicities and lack of promises prevailed. Consequently, Albanian artists did not exhibit at the gallery until after the war in Kosovo. They boycotted it. This period was paradoxical. Though, in order to fill the gap and create a fruitful and promising cultural life, numerous initiatives took place. A number of private galleries opened. Café Gallery Koha, “Hani i Dy Robertëve”, Dodona Gallery, Europa gallery created opportunities for artists to continue exhibiting their art and express their ideas. Skender Boshnjaku explains as follows:

“To tell you the truth, it has been a very intensive continuation, and it was developed café gallery Koha directed by Ramiz Bala ...

There have been many visual arts activities at that gallery. There were also activities at the Europa Café Gallery in Peja, directed by Fehmi Kurrhasani. ...

That was it, there has been the further development where the spirit of Kosovo – artists breathed, there was poetry, music, visual art. It was a very intense life. There has been a dynamic life. “– SB

There was a high intensity of work, which integrated the artistic community and helped them to fuel their artistic fulfilment thus create authentic styles. Shkëlzen Maliqi, an art critic tells about his experience and the process of opening the Dodona Gallery. This gallery was managed by his wife Alisa. Dodona gallery kept functioning and organizing activities for a period of time. This gallery was funded by SOROS, a non-governmental organization, with head offices in Belgrade. Just like Dodona theatre that helped the Faculty of Arts, department of dramaturgy, this gallery not only helped young artists - students to exhibit their work but also assisted in promoting art from Kosovo. In this gallery, the first generation of master’s degree in the 90s period opened their final exhibition that was also considered as a form of graduation.

For over a decade, artistic life during the 90s period had huge dynamics. This was as a result of artists persistence and motivation. It integrated a community that tried to make a change through art and various movements, starting from the self-initiatives. Up to '99 everything was, to some extent an experiment with the aim of surviving. Therefore, if the whole story of the evolution of art in Kosovo is seen slowly, one can understand the anguish, agony and torment this generation faced. This is not only based on their artistic creation but also on their approach towards life. They lived and survived the most critical period of the history of Kosovo, that derived from the former Yugoslavian period. They lived in a vacuum which made it quite difficult for them to start a new form, movement in Kosovo. They are the inbetweeners. The generation of the 90s period belongs to the contemporary and the modern. One of the respondents, Genc Rezniki perceives this period as the most struggled one. They did have a lot of experiences that made artists' life interesting. In addition, they did have the potential, thus did not stop. The expectations and goals continued. The new private art galleries created prospects with regard to art development and artists careers. A significant number of respondents, when talking about this period, going through their memories their behaviour and communication were not completely negative. They reflected its negative sides, the life struggles, yet they shared the energy and dedication people had in order to continue with the artistic activities. They reflect on it as a rather important period that it did not allow the system to overcome their dreams and goals. They endured. Excitement prevailed among students, emerging and established artists as they had the chance to share their own unique character and individuality through those exhibitions. Accordingly, this allowed artists careers to evolve and not pause.

5.2.2. Post-90s Period

The last period, the post-90s period starts after the war in Kosovo. After 1999 Kosovo was free of the Serbian regime, the system was free. There was no regime, no parallel system. Therefore, everyone could study and establish their own artistic career. Everyone could exhibit if they were accepted. Artists could express themselves without any worry or preoccupation that something bad might happen. When it comes to the number of artists educated in this period, it is slightly lower than that of the pre-90s period (37.2%). Of 352 artists examined, only 30.2% of them graduated at the Faculty of Arts.

<i>Post 90s</i>	
Mean	0.301994302
Standard Error	0.024541146
Median	0
Mode	0
Standard Deviation	0.45977822
Sample Variance	0.211396011
Kurtosis	-1.256812781
Skewness	0.866245475
Range	1
Minimum	0
Maximum	1
Sum	106
Count	352
Confidence Level (95.0%)	0.048266667

Table 6. Studied post-90s period

However, this is post-90s period, thus the number of artists will grow yearly. As of this period, artists are free to do more than they could have previously imagined. This growth and change in the development of art in Kosovo, has been pushed by the National Art Gallery that started functioning again, with the initiative of a few people. Luan Mulliqi, as the first director of the National Art Gallery of Kosovo after its reopening, resumed its function. He claims that it was a difficult time, as a lot was going on not only at this institution itself but everywhere in the country. However, a group of people gathered, mobilized and were ready to take action. They started working hard and were diligent in what they wanted to do. Luan Mulliqi tells:

“Us, like any other citizen after the war, received donations - help, oil and sugar. But under such circumstances it has been developed. We are fortunate enough with our work at the time, after the war we have created a fondness from the internationals. It was for about 1 month or 2 months for a specialization in art management, in art fairs to see how exhibitions are organized and for things of this kind. Of course, for years we have survived the donations we have received. Later on, we have established many friendships with a lot of personalities, who have also helped us to affirm our art

especially in the outside world. Since UNMIK functioned - administrated in the state of Kosovo, we did not have a Government or Ministry of Foreign Affairs. Therefore, as a gallery, we had the task of presenting our culture not only visual arts, but all cultures.”- LM

Despite the fact that there was no government only administration bodies they started workin right after the war in Kosovo. The team at the National Art Gallery, aimed at changing the perceptions of international regarding the Albanian culture as well as art. The diplomacy done by the Serbian was intense, aggressive. Luan Mulliqi further explains that people of Kosovo were perceived as wild and the Albanian culture and art as not authentic. Hence, he states that:

“So, we took it as an obligation/task and created a group for cultural diplomacy.”
– LM

They created a new diplomacy in order to change the internationals’ perceptions of art from Kosovo. In the eyes of the international Albanians were wild and aggressive people. In order to prove this wrong, the team of the National Art Gallery created that form of atmosphere so that people - internationals would grasp and understand the traditions as well as culture and see that in Kosovo there is something more, besides Churches and Orthodox Monasteries - two religious institutions that supposedly represent non-authenticity of Albanians. In this region, in this land there is this authentic art that has been developed for some decades, artists were educated and created magnificent art. The National Art Gallery through this diplomacy, firstly created the educational program and then they welcomed important international figures at various opening receptions of exhibitions or follow up visits.



Picture 1. Visit of Michael Steiner - head of the United Nations Mission in Kosovo at the National Art Gallery during Eshref Qahili's exhibition



Picture 2. Visit of Søren Jessen-Petersen - Special Representative of the United Nations Secretary-General – Head of UNMIK at the National Art Gallery during Eshref Qahili's award at Gjon Mili's prize – exhibition (2005)



Picture 3. Visit of Kofi Annan - Secretary-General of the United Nation at the National Art Gallery during Eshref Qahili's exhibition

To support this diplomacy, the exhibitions that were organized were of high quality. There was a process of selection not only for artists for individual exhibitions but also for group exhibitions, so that proper artistic values would be represented and highlight the quality, especially when it came to Albanian – Kosovar art. With determination, they managed to excel in presentation of art, especially that of Kosovo. Thus, with amities they managed to alter the way international thought regarding art in Kosovo. They invited ambassadors, representatives in order to understand the place they are working, and see that there is art, there is culture, there is tradition, and it exceeds their expectations. They further created yearly exhibitions that were the main activities that can be perceived as pillars of the National Art Galleries. In some sense, they created a pattern on how cultural values should be promoted in and outside the country. In addition, they sent Kosovar art abroad, and artists' experiences when exhibiting abroad were interesting, positive despite the fact that there was a lack of facilities and equipment. One of the biggest exhibitions that was organized by the National Art Gallery and highlighted by the director and a participating artist was the group exhibition in Khala Ghoda – National Art Gallery, where artists presented their art, but also Kosovar Art. This showed the potential artists have and they could easily be part of a bigger community in the art world.

However, regarding the other galleries that were active during the 90s period, were no longer functioning as they were closed, besides “Hani i 2 Robertëve” which continues functioning periodically. With time other art galleries and art spaces opened. Some function more and some less, though they all offer new opportunities to artists and development of art. One of the main approaches directly and indirectly is that of intercultural communication and further development of art. To some respondents it is important to have more and more art galleries as the current number is low. Having more spaces to exhibit offers greater challenges and the impact in society would be greater. They highlight the importance of having a Museum of Contemporary Art which is one of the institutions that is still missing in the country. Up to know everything is situated in the big cities, which in some cases can be seen as problematic. The self-initiative of entrepreneurs and artists or other communities to grow in order for every city in Kosovo to have cultural spaces where cultural capital will grow. In addition, this would also help and influence artists about their artistic careers. However, even though the lack of art institutions is evident which would directly

help in greater development of artistic career, there is still belief that within a short of period of time, this will not be an issue. All of the respondent put great emphasis on the free movement which is one of the biggest issues at the present time in the country. They stated that one of the only issues and most significant thing that is keeping art back is the limitation of free movement. The only limitation that keeps persisting is the VISA issue. Once this has been fixed and Kosovo is VISA free the opportunities given to artists would change drastically. They would not have to worry of going through a procedure that the majority of countries in Europe do not face it.

5.3. Dedication and determination - Behaviour of artists in Kosovo

The first generation of artists that studied painting, sculpture and printmaking were also the founding fathers of the Academy of Arts. In this Academy of Arts, Painting, Printmaking and Sculpture were the first three departments that created the base of education in arts in Kosovo. Artists were prolific at this time. However, due to financial struggles, if an artist wanted to study sculpture, they would need better conditions in their studios or spaces they used to create art. According to Luan Mulliqi, because a sculpture artist uses different materials, they also need a bigger space. Accordingly, starting from the beginning of former Yugoslavia, almost half of the artists (46.3%) graduated in painting, with the bachelor and master as the highest level of degree, whereas the others, 13.9% of artists had a degree in printmaking and 11.3% in sculpture. The rest of the artists graduated in other art departments.

<i>Medium - Painting</i>	
Mean	0.463068182
Standard Error	0.026615123
Median	0
Mode	0
Standard Deviation	0.499343975
Sample Variance	0.249344406
Kurtosis	-1.989203344
Skewness	0.148766618
Range	1
Minimum	0
Maximum	1
Sum	163
Count	352
Confidence Level (95.0%)	0.052345176

Table 7. Graduated in Painting

<i>Medium - Sculpture</i>	
Mean	0.113636364
Standard Error	0.016939909
Median	0
Mode	0
Standard Deviation	0.317820863
Sample Variance	0.101010101
Kurtosis	4.001820712
Skewness	2.445222915
Range	1
Minimum	0
Maximum	1
Sum	40
Count	352
Confidence Level (95.0%)	0.033316491

Table 8. Graduated in Sculpture

<i>Medium - Printmaking</i>	
Mean	0.139204545
Standard Error	0.018476646
Median	0
Mode	0
Standard Deviation	0.346652602
Sample Variance	0.120168026
Kurtosis	2.396289911
Skewness	2.093491529
Range	1
Minimum	0
Maximum	1
Sum	49
Count	352
Confidence Level (95.0%)	0.036338861

Table 9. Graduated in Printmaking

However, additional findings show that females are negatively correlated with taking up sculpture on a significant level of 0.01. There is also a negative correlation (-0.236) between women and studying during the per-90s period on a significant level of 0.01. This means that women are more likely to be painters but very unlikely to go into sculpture, whereas males are negatively correlated with taking up painting on a significant level of 0.05. This shows that men are more likely to be sculptures. In addition, this is followed with a negative correlation (-0.277) in studying post-90s period, but a positive correlation in studying pre-90s period. Further, artists were more likely to study painting pre-90s period with a positive correlation of 0.157 at a significant level of 0.01. However, during the 90s period, they were more likely to study sculpture with a positive correlation of 0.108, whereas post-90s period a positive correlation with printmaking (correlation - 0.081) followed by painting (positive correlation – 0.038). This means that the behaviour of artists between periods changed, and there was a shift in behaviour regarding studying in one of the three main mediums.

Correlations

		Gender F	Medium - Painting	Medium - Sculpture	Medium - Printmaking	Pre 1990	during the 1990s	Post 1990	Gender M
Gender F	Pearson Correlation	1	.137*	-.156**	-0.011	-.236**	0.070	.277**	-.1000**
	Sig. (2-tailed)		0.010	0.003	0.832	0.000	0.190	0.000	0.000
	N	353	352	352	352	352	352	351	352
Medium - Painting	Pearson Correlation	.137*	1	-.279**	-.336**	.157**	-0.024	0.038	-.137*
	Sig. (2-tailed)	0.010		0.000	0.000	0.003	0.658	0.474	0.010
	N	352	352	352	352	352	352	351	352
Medium - Sculpture	Pearson Correlation	-.156**	-.279**	1	-.142**	0.039	.108*	-0.080	.156**
	Sig. (2-tailed)	0.003	0.000		0.008	0.464	0.042	0.136	0.003
	N	352	352	352	352	352	352	351	352
Medium - Printmaking	Pearson Correlation	-0.011	-.336**	-.142**	1	0.071	0.000	0.081	0.011
	Sig. (2-tailed)	0.832	0.000	0.008		0.185	1.000	0.128	0.832
	N	352	352	352	352	352	352	351	352
Pre 1990	Pearson Correlation	-.236**	.157**	0.039	0.071	1	-0.042	-.453**	.236**
	Sig. (2-tailed)	0.000	0.003	0.464	0.185		0.430	0.000	0.000
	N	352	352	352	352	352	352	351	352
during the 1990s	Pearson Correlation	0.070	-0.024	.108*	0.000	-.0042	1	0.013	-0.070
	Sig. (2-tailed)	0.190	0.658	0.042	1.000	0.430		0.803	0.190
	N	352	352	352	352	352	352	351	352
Post 1990	Pearson Correlation	.277**	0.038	-0.080	0.081	-.453**	0.013	1	-.277**
	Sig. (2-tailed)	0.000	0.474	0.136	0.128	0.000	0.803		0.000
	N	351	351	351	351	351	351	351	351
Gender M	Pearson Correlation	-.1000**	-.137*	.156**	0.011	.236**	-0.070	-.277**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	0.000	0.010	0.003	0.832	0.000	0.190	0.000	
	N	352	352	352	352	352	352	351	352

*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Table 10. Correlation Matrix with multiple variables

Despite of what each artist studied; each artist had their own way of creation. Different artistic individualities were depicted; therefore, this is perceived as an integral part of their own legitimacy. Respondents who were artists spoke of various forms and behaviours of their creation. No matter of which period they belonged to, pre-90s period, 90s period or post 90s period, they found their own way of expression, which helped them find their style and technique their preferred. In spite of struggles - political, economic or even social, each artist had the willpower to continue growing their artistic careers that made it easier for them to be part of the art world in Kosovo or Balkans, and in some cases even broader. For instance, during the former Yugoslavian period, they were free to create almost whatever they wanted. The system itself allowed the development of art, however, there were some limitations. They could create art as long as they did not represent any nationalistic motives. As former Yugoslavia was an entity of states, multiple nations were living in a way together, sharing the same laws and having the same president. This was one of the reasons that nationalistic motives were not well-welcomed by the state itself. Therefore, in order for Kosovar artists to avoid the quarrel with the state they expressed their dissatisfaction if they had any, they created abstract art. Through these abstract artworks it was rather difficult to read what was behind it, unless they told about it or titled the artwork that reflected on what the artist intended with the artwork. Both, Vesta Nura and Skender Boshnjaku share the same opinion:

“ And people did no express something about the system, because in terms of artistic expression and that you were a little bit of a camouflage it was not a problem, for example in Albania this was completely different “ - VN

“It was free, abstraction, figuration, and expressionism, there was no communism here that said that one artist is doing something against socialist realism. There wasn't any. All Kosovo artists have been free. They have also been supportive. From the moment Kosovo received autonomy. Then there were cultural weeks in Slovenia, the Slovenian culture week in Kosovo. All these exhibitions that have been in Kosovo, I wrote about them.” – SB

In addition to Skender Boshnjaku, the extent that the system was free, did not give the communist vibe. Therefore, figuration or expressionism was acceptable in contrary to Albania,

which was intolerable. A significant number of artists reflected on various life events, especially struggles and shared their anguish through art. In one way or another, all artists used these events to create art. This form of expression followed artists even in the 90s period. Eshref Qahili, as one of them, states that at the beginning of his career, in his art he would use school bags, pens in order to show the 90s period when they were banned from school; or people moving abroad in the 90s in order to find better living conditions; in some cases he would even represent raping of women which was and still is a really delicate subject matter. He presented the forbidden in an art form. Eshref Qahili reflected on those issues, he presented the prohibited using the abstract, and refreshing with the use of various colours. But they never looked negative. He has his own creativity, style and approach. He explains as following:

“This is probably the effect of my works, usually the negative things, or thing that worried me, I presented those situations, the earlier ones; at first glance and in analysis if you do not speak or explain the story of the painting it cannot be understood. So, it's hidden. I see something bright, considering the contrasts of colours, the lines I use in painting, which to this day I continue using them.

...

Perhaps my idea has always been that any event occurring should represent a calmness or be calm itself. I am talking of a breakthrough, a vision, a good thing for the future...” - EQ

Just like Eshref Qahili that through his art shows that there is a lot to reflect on and create, Yll Xhaferi, a young artist claimed that there are a lot of things an artist can observe. The artist is like an alien. In addition, according to him an artist is just like everyone else, though there is this specific time that he/she distances from everyone and starts creating. He uses life details and transforms them into art. When it comes to his artistic creation, what his artworks carry within, he says:

“There have been chaos, comedy, serious moments a lot of things that are happening at the same time in a state, these identity crises that I tend to use often, this idea we

*are European, we are communists, no we are Albanians, talking with a local mindset,
I want to give a comic sense to these things, turn them, reinterpret them through work
and to present those situation in an ironic way." - YXh*

Whereas, Alban Muja, an artist who represented Kosovo at the Venice Biennale in 2019 does not represent the comic sense. He uses a different approach in his artworks. He narrated the story of a couple of families during the war in Kosovo in 1999. It is a conceptual work that is presented through people's narratives. Up to this moment, Alban Muja tried to distance himself from the past, he reflected consequences of the events in the past. In a way he waited for the moment to take a stand and present a very touching story and event for Kosovar people. Therefore, according to him the above-mentioned project is a humanistic project that does not hurt anyone but just tells the truth, no hatred or anger.

To conclude, each artist living in each period, pre-90s period, 90s period and post-90s period has a different approach of creation, which from afar looks the same. As their behaviour and determination in life changes from generation to generation their artistic creation evolves. Hence, during each of the three periods, artists from Kosovo created art based on the events that they lived. Needless to say, that up to a certain point each of them had a unique use of abstraction, colour as well as medium. To them the concept was important, yet coding and transmitting was essential.

5.4. Artists communicating their perceptions

Out of twelve interviews, five of them were art critics and the seven other respondents were artists. Each individual uses a different form of communication when it comes to their perception of creation. An interesting result from all the respondents is that they see education as an important pillar of one's career. According to them, education is important not just because an artist will have an academic background, but because it directs them and to some extent positions them in the artworld. In this sense, it leads and gives them instructions on techniques and art movements. It is the features of each period that artists perceive – steal and as a result diversifying their knowledge helps them to take further initiatives. For greater development, redefinition and artistic

creation, everything depends on the artists' dedication to continue exploring and seizing opportunities that come along. It is important for artists to understand what their putting themselves into as art is a full-time profession. Art plays a significant role in society, but it is usually crucial on how people perceive it and embrace it. But when it comes to how artists perceive each step of themselves having a career, they communicate it and reflect on it quite similarly. Alban Muja claimed that he did learn a lot about techniques as well as art in general. Yet, there was the initiative and motivation missing. Consequently, he added that he was keen on doing more thus with a group of artists, who at the same time were friends, started doing activities in the first five years of the new millennial.

“We have been a group of artists, I must mention their names, Lulzim Zeqiri, Driton Hajredini, Jakup Ferri, we also spent time together, from time to time Dren and with time some of us were more part of the art scene and other times the rest. There was a time when I was more present, or Jakup, Driton, or Lul, or someone. We stayed together and discussed ideas, depending on that discussion, we decided to react. Reaction in the form of work creation – we would help each other. There were moments, being very frank, I discussed ideas with much more scepticism with them as you received more criticism, than when discussing ideas with people who you spend less time. This was something, this was the scene and the community appreciated it. This had been, I am putting emphasis on this, achieved a lot, that group and others tried continuing with this rhythm, some more, some less, but this was the starting point.” - AM

To him as well as to his peers this was an interesting experiment as it helped them grow artistically. They challenged themselves though at time they were each other's competition. Within this group they built their own originality and did not follow the conventions of art, did not follow the traditional. Whereas Yll Xhaferi explains how going to University helps artists for their future careers by being better prepared for new endeavours. It builds artists' up and helps them create the character. Thus, he explains it as following:

"... when you are about to finish the faculty, you start creating a shape – a style, artistic character, you find an approach, then you start to show interest and the activities you participate in and want to become part of others, I think you reflect the colour and nuances of the whole world that you have begun to create." – YXh

When the Academy of Arts was opened in 1974 according to the respondents had proper conditions. It was its beginning, and everything was in its place. But this has changed with time. A comment that has been put emphasis on throughout all the respondents was that the educational system at the present time, the quality of the Faculty of Arts is not at its best. The conditions, lack of equipment and basic materials are what are missing at the Faculty of Arts among others. In the last decade, graduate students are just a number besides being a large number of students accepted at the Faculty. According to some of the respondents, they rarely embrace any cultural values. One of the respondents, Veli Blakcori claims that the number of students being admitted has grown considerably during the post-90s period, compared to the time when he graduated in 1978. Back then in the whole Academy of Arts were less than 50 students. Students that graduated had potential and studied there because they wanted to and had plans for their future career. Whereas, according to Luan Mulliqi it is rather difficult to distinguish good artists nowadays, consequently, it is hard to pick artworks to put them in the collection of the National Art Gallery.

If we go back to the Faculty of Arts itself, there are professors who actually try to teach students a way of working, expressing their ideas and practice themselves, not that they should necessarily follow it for the rest of their career. Eshref Qahili, as a professor of drawing, asks students to do multiple sketches before they do the final painting and/or drawing. In this way they learn from their own work because they keep on searching for something that one may think it is missing. According to him, with this rhythm they learn the composition, the contrast and other figurative elements. In a sense, this also pushes one's artistic approach further and helps in their future career. A significant number of respondents shared the same opinion regarding the development of an artist that would help in one's career. Accordingly, they said that a good artist needs to see, visit and explore in his own style in order to be satisfied with the results. One needs to feed the soul in order to have what it takes to create. The more an artist visits, communicates and exchanges ideas the higher the potential to build a promising future regarding the artistic

career. Rexhep Ferri, calls art as a process that brings the inner soul into the surface. It is a spiritual process; it explores and reflects the powerful events that are part of one's life. Therefore, it is important for an artist to have capital as it elevates their work and the artist himself is vocal in his artistic expression.

However, the approach of art creation has changed, and it is not the same as it used to be decades ago. According to Luan Mulliqi one of the reasons for this shift in artistic creation is technology. Its affects are quite big as one way or another each artist incorporates technology. He does not undermine the current art creation but just claims that it is rather difficult to make comparisons, as each generation, each period has its own shine. Integration of art with technology grew rapidly therefore, somehow it was unforeseen. In addition to technology artists have more opportunities in accessing a wider audience. This comes as a result of not having the need to be present in person, only virtually. Whereas, Eshref Qahili states as following:

"The competition is higher, it is true, however, I think that nowadays it is way easier."

- EQ

That is true indeed, because one can see more. Accordingly, communication and accessibility are easier. Taking into consideration this whole approach of communication regarding their perceptions of an artist having a career, one can agree with Genc Rezniki, that Kosovo is an exotic place. It is a place where even though is small compared to other countries, it entails a lot. It is easier to grasp both sides of everything, especially art and its values. Despite the fact that is a place that represent a vacuum, that is about to explode, it is excitedly waiting for free movement – VISA free, it also shows a power and a drive to build and create something constantly. In this sense, the respondents share a lot of mutual opinions; thus, they express it differently. This makes it even more intriguing as it can also be closely linked to one's artistic individuality, unique style and approach on thematic as well as conceptual thinking.

Kosovo is not big, but a lot goes on. It is a place where a lot of different things are going on at the same. One can tell the difference between the three periods. The way that artists functioned comparing two periods that of pre-90s and 90s with post 90s period, can be perceived

on their way of communication. This tells a lot of the circumstances they were living, which in a way creates a paradoxical situation as back then, during the pre-90s and 90s period artists, besides trying to have an artistic career, what preoccupied them the most was survival, which was part of every individual in the whole population, whereas now, the main concern is freedom. Not the classical form of freedom but moving free without needing a VISA. Yet, according to Eqrem Basha, there are a lot of great artists, who have managed and found the way to be part of the art world, outside of Kosovo. It is their knowledge, education as well as connections that made them as artists accessible in a bigger art community.

6. Discussion and Conclusion

This paper looks at the artistic careers of Kosovar artists from the beginning of the former Yugoslavia to the present time, their views on differences of the establishment of an artistic career and the way they behave and reflect on it. Yet, in order to understand this trajectory, one must look at the development of art in Kosovo, education of artists as well as their interests. Firstly, the Kosovar Artists Database was created, and it consists of 352 artists. In addition to this, twelve interviews were conducted, seven out of twelve were artists and the rest were art critics. This paper shows that despite every struggle and in spite of the fact that they were living and are still living in an isolated country, individuality, spirit, dedication, novelty, values, aesthetics, community, and amity are the concepts that artists in Kosovo embrace. However, the conflicts in Kosovo created implications for various fields especially that of art.

It is important to state that there are three main periods, pre-90s, the 90s and post 90s, of the development of art in Kosovo, though each period contains several other initiatives - phases within. Needless to say, no clear cuts exist between these periods. This is a result of transitions between systems and the boundaries are not clearly demarcated between each other. The identity of art in Kosovo begins in the pre-90s period with the initiative of establishing the three main art institutions that helped in the further development of art and culture. The High School of Art in Peja (1945), followed by the Academy of Arts (1974) and the National Art Gallery (1979) are the three institutions that created the basis for greater development in an isolated country. All of these three institutions were opened within a period of 25 years. Thus, this allowed the development and establishment of artists' careers on a different scale. During the pre-90s period, 37.2% of 352 artists examined graduated scoring the highest number of graduates compared to the 90s period (12.5%) and that of the post-90s period (30.2%). It is important to note that in the post-90s period there are still students who are graduating that may be added in the database. The empirical findings show that there is a shift of behaviour regarding studying in one of the three main mediums – painting, sculpture, printmaking. During the 90s period, artists were more likely to study sculpture compared to the post-90s period where they tend to study printmaking or painting.

Firstly, each period had different dynamics when it comes to art and culture which influenced artists careers immensely. The period when the High School of Art in Peja opened in 1945 also notes the time when former Yugoslavia started to make some sort of demarcation from

the Stalinist dogmatism (Stojanovich, 1966) until it separated completely. Artists from Kosovo got their first knowledge from professors who got their degrees in other countries of Europe. They were part of a dynamic art world in former Yugoslavia (Vander Gucht, 1988), taking into account that the first generation studied in one of the main cities of former Yugoslavia. The first generation consumed culture and exchanged knowledge not only with their peers but also with other artists. They managed to create art and be part of a bigger art world, especially that of former Yugoslavia, as during that period the art world in Kosovo barely existed. This gave more opportunities to artists of the first generation as they were residents in those cities were geographically speaking were important (Jansen, Kuipers & Verboord, 2008). They had the potential and continued creating a career of their own. Following the literature, even though they were part of globalisation within Yugoslavia, and to some extent faced insecurities (Kurze, 2009) they were part of - belonged to the group that brought globalization in Kosovo by bringing change (Jansen, Kuipers & Verboord, 2008). The second phase began once the golden generation initiated the opening of the Academy of Arts in Prishtina. It was a huge challenge and a big step. Needless to say, that by that time they had already created their own individual artistic character and style. Neither of them was perfect as they were still in their early careers, but they were the first generation, the golden one that helped and spread their artistic knowledge. Along these lines, they pushed the art development further by creating new opportunities for the upcoming generations. By this time, the first generation of artists and the new ones faced and were part of cultural exchange (Janssen, Kuipers, & Verboord, 2008) which helped them challenge themselves even more, by creating and expanding the art scene in Kosovo to a greater extent. The 90s period generation had everything yet nothing. They graduated when Kosovo was under the Serbian regime. They studied on unpleasant conditions, though, on the contrary, they managed to keep the artistic life alive, by opening exhibitions in various small private art galleries that were self-initiatives of various groups of people who supported art or were artists themselves. In a way, it was rather difficult for the Faculty of Arts to hold the monopolism and lead artists towards a fruitful career which Vander Gucht (1988) explains it as an important process regarding an artistic career. As a result, this affected artists' role in society and created insecurities regarding their future expectations. The post-90s period is the opposite of the first two periods. This period belongs to the post-war period. Each institution started functioning again. They did not need to establish each institution from the bottom, but they could continue working in the existing one, only by making adjustments. Artists did not have to be afraid of the way they

would express themselves or create art. Overall, artistic careers in Kosovo grew rapidly taking into consideration that everything started as of 1945. It was a journey that was challenging to the artistic community but helped them create something authentic and one of a kind. During these three periods, pre-90s period, 90s period, and post-90s period, artists faced limitations of different kinds, but they were not limited to it. This was a result of trying to find something to fight for, which in this case were their artistic careers, goals and future expectations.

Secondly, the findings of this paper show that respondents share the same views regarding an artist's career. They see one's career as someone who is active in the art world, but also someone who has a lot of knowledge and interest in art and culture. In this case, globalization plays a significant role, due to the fact that an artist needs to travel, see and communicate thus create networking with others in order to grow their capital. This not only forces them to be part of a wider artistic community on the international level (Jansen, Kuipers & Verboord, 2008) but also exchange cultural consumption as well as production. The greater their interests are the greater networking is thus easier access in the bigger scope. However, until the present time, this has also been affected by the period they graduated and tried to be active. They note the differences in an artists' career depending on the period. Being part of various exhibitions was rather difficult at the beginning of the development of art in Kosovo. However, they were not limited to it, instead, they tried and challenged themselves. Comparing the pre-90s period to the post-90s period now is much easier, the competition is higher that is true, but accessibility is easier. However, just like during the pre-90s period that the imbalance of development of a field between cities existed (Chase-Dunn & Grimes, 1995; Braden & Oosterman, 2018), even in the post-90s period this phenomenon persists. This comes as a result of monopolism and that the majority of events and institutions are situated in the big cities of Kosovo. Therefore, this influences further development only in these bigger cities. To some extent, this presents and shows that the potential of the world system theory to grow its existence in Kosovo, even though is an independent country now, is high. But, due to technology, it is easier for an artist to access everywhere around the world. The 90s period was the period that struggled the most, as they were limited to a lot of things, including education and exhibiting. However, the will, motivation and dedication of artists as well as of art lover and entrepreneurs made it possible to emerging and young artists are on the radar. Not to quit their dreams and continue fulfilling their goals.

Thirdly, further empirical findings show that each artist has a different approach to art creation. For a period of 70 years up to now, 43.6% of 352 artists examined the studied painting, and the rest studied other mediums. When it comes to creation, values and aesthetics each of them has a different style. Though there may be some sort of influence by each generation as they were each other's professors. However, when it comes to the themes, they explore the known, the current events. They reflect on what they feel. It is their own journey, where their soul and peace are presented symbolically and artistically in their artworks, despite the torments. They would most likely pick important events in Kosovo, especially the impact it had on their lives. The first generations during the pre-90s could create art to express everything as long as it did not go against the system. It may have been against it, but the abstractionism used did not allow it to be seen. Whereas during the 90s would present the recent events and narrate the story, not through realism but abstractionism or later in the 90s through installation. The post-90s is the period where artists are free to share various stories, without any limitation. As a result, even if looking at art there is no clear demarcation of periods to when, who and/or what created with what style, as the themes and concepts played a significant role.

There are a number of limitations to this research paper. First, it was difficult to create a bigger database with every detail of each artist. However, there is the possibility of continuing and working on it more in the future, that would give more opportunities to further research regarding each period, medium, or place of exhibiting. Second, artists did speak of the former Yugoslavian period but did not elaborate that much. Thirdly, it was rather hard to build a base regarding the background literature, as there is a lack of research. However, taking into consideration that there is a lack of research of art in Kosovo, this paper contributes to literature from a sociological and historical point of view. It can be a start for future research about art in Kosovo. As there is a great need for further research of the arts and culture in Kosovo, it would be interesting to look at the period 1945, or 1974 once the two main art institutions were found; second it would be interesting to look at the first 10 years of the National Art Gallery and how this institution helped in the development of art and culture in Kosovo; third, suggestion is looking at the development of art in Kosovo during the 90s period.

7. References

- Allcock, J. B. (2002). Rural-urban differences and the break-up of Yugoslavia. *Balkanologie*, 6(1-2), 101-125.
- Bain, A. (2005). Constructing an artistic identity. *Work, Employment and Society*, 19(1), 25-46.
doi:10.1177/0950017005051280
- Becker, H. (1982). *Art Worlds*. London: University of California Press.
- Bendassolli, P. F., & Wood, T. J. (2012). Careers Boundaries in the Arts in Brazil: An Exploratory Study. *The Qualitative Report*, 17(43), 1-27.
- Bobinac, U. (2014). (The Disintegration of Yugoslavia - An Analysis of Globalization Effects on Union and Disintegration of Yugoslavia. *International ResearchScape Journal: An Undergraduate Student Journal*, 1.
- Bryman, A. (2012). *Social Research Method* (4th ed.). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Dedic, N. (N.D.). *Kulturni Centar Panceva*. Retrieved from Art in Peripheral Capitalism:
<http://www.kulturnicentarpanceva.rs/en/component/k2/item/655-nikola-dedic-art-in-peripheral-capitalism>
- Defreese, M. (2009). Kosovo: Cultural Heritage in Conflict. *Journal of Conflict Archaeology*, 5(1), 257–269. doi:10.1163/157407709x1263458064061
- Delmestri, G., Montanari, F., & Usai, A. (2005). Reputation and Strength of Ties in Predicting Commercial Success and Artistic Merit of Independents in the Italian Feature Film Industry. *Journal of Management Studies*, 42(5).
- DiMaggio, P. (1987). Classification in Art. *American Sociological Review*, 52(4), 440-455.
doi:10.2307/2095290
- Hiso, S. (2007). *For An Albanian Kosovo: Overview of Diplomatic History*. Publishing House GEER: Tirana
- Heinich, N. (1991). Can One Speak of Artistic Careers? A Brief History of Forms of Artistic Success. *Cahiers De Recherche Sociologique*, 16, 43-54.
- Hodson, R., Sekulic, D., & Massey, G. (1994). National Tolerance in the Former Yugoslavia. *American Journal of Sociology*, 99(6), 1534 - 1558. Retrieved from www.jstor.org/stable/2782583
- Jakovljević, B. (2016). *Alienation Effects: Performance and Self-Management in Yugoslavia, 1945 - 1991*. University of Michigan Press.
- Janssen, S., Kuipers, G., & Verboord, M. (2008). Cultural globalization and arts journalism: The international orientation of arts and culture coverage in Dutch, French, German, and US newspapers, 1955 to 2005. *American Sociological Review*, 73(5), 719 - 740.
- Kavanagh, A. (1998). Postmodernity, Globalisation and Nationalist Conflict in the Former Yugoslavia – pdf ne downloads. *Geopolitics and International Boundaries*, 3(3), 34-52.

- Komarova, N. (2018). Between the market and noncommercial art institutions: Early career strategies of contemporary artists in emerging art scenes. *Poetics*, 71, 33-42. doi:10.1016/j.poetic.2018.11.004
- Kurze, A. (2009). State, Society, and Globalization in the Balkans: Problems of Democratic Consolidation in Bosnia and Herzegovina, Kosovo, the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, and Serbia. *Working Papers in Global Studies*, 4. doi:1943-3905
- Muharremi, H. (2000). Contemporary Visual Art in Kosovo 1945 - 2000. In H. Muharremi, I. Kadare, & A. Bassin, *Contemporary Art of Kosova: Painting, Sculpture, The Graphic Art*. Kosovo: Biblioteka ARS .
- Myers, A. M. (2016). Performing Identity After Yugoslavia: Contemporary Art Beyond and Through the Ethno-National. *Art History Theses & Dissertations*, 32, 1-147. Retrieved from scholar.colorado.edu/arth_gradetds/32
- Pauker, I. (2006). Reconciliation and Popular Culture: A Promising Development in Former Yugoslavia? *Local-Global: Identity, Security, Community*, 2(2006), 72 - 83.
- Shirley, D. (1978, March 26). A Rare Look At Yugoslav Art. *Long Island Weekly*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/1978/03/26/archives/long-island-weekly-a-rare-look-at-yugoslav-art-art-originality-from.html>
- Spadijter, B. (1977). Federalism and National Question in Socialist Yugoslavia. *The Indian Journal of Political Science*, 38(4), 521 - 533.
- Stojanovich, S. (1966). Contemporary Yugoslavian Philosophy. *Ethics*, 76(4), 297-301.
- Subotić, I. (1993). Concerning Art and Politics in Yugoslavia during the 1930s. *Art Journal*, 52(1), 69-71. doi:10.2307/777304
- The Museum of Modern Art, M. (2018). *Toward a Concrete Utopia Architecture in Yugoslavia 1948 - 1980*. New York: The Museum of Modern Art.
- The Museum of Modern Art (1956, June 18). *Museum of Modern Art to Exhibit American Art in Belgrade* [Press Release] Retrieved from MoMA 2019
- Vander Gucht, D. (1988). The Academy and the Socialization of the Artist: Elements for a Sociology of Art. *Revue De l'Institut De Sociologie*(1-2), 209-233.
- Volčič, Z. (2007). Yugo-Nostalgia: Cultural Memory and Media in the Former Yugoslavia. *Critical Studies in Media Communication*, 24(1), 21-38. doi:10.1080/07393180701214496

Appendices

Appendix 1

Details of the respondents

No	Name	Age	Gender	Generation	Occupation	Fact	Studies
1	Eshref Qahili	58	M	First Generation of Master in Kosovo	Artist – Painter Professor of Drawing at the Faculty of Arts	Founder of the one of the first private art galleries, Galeria Qahili, in Prishtina, Kosovo	Prishtina
2	Rexhep Ferri	81	M	First Generation	Artist - Painter Professor of Painting at the Faculty of Arts Art Critic	One of the founding members of the Academy of Arts, now called Faculty of Arts	Belgrade
3	Alban Muja		M	Artist of the Younger Generation	Conceptual Artist Professor at UBT	Represents Kosovo at the Venice Biennale this year	Prishtina
4	Yll Xhaferi	28	M	Artist of the Younger Generation	Artist – Painter, Conceptual	Emerging Artist	Prishtina
5	Eqrem Basha		M		Art Critic		
6	Vesta Nura		F		Art Critic Coordinator at the gallery of Ministry of Culture Youth and Sports	Worked at Rilindja (newspaper) for 20 yeras	Belgrade
7	Shkelzen Maliqi		M		Art Critic	Chief and Editor at Fjala (newspaper) in the late 80s	Belgrade
8	Shyqri Nimani	77	M	First generation Graphic Designer	Graphic Designer Professor of Graphic Design at the Faculty of Arts Art Critic	Founder of the National Art Gallery of Kosovo Founder of the department of Graphic Design	Belgrade
9	Skender Boshnjaku		M		Art Critic	Writer at Rilindja Psychiatrist with profession	Belgrade

10	Genç Reznîqî	28	M	Artist of the Younger Generation	Young Art Critic, Young Researcher Lecturer at the Faculty of Arts		Prishtina
11	Veli Blakçori		M	First generation of students of the Faculty of Arts (1974)	Artist – Painter, Sculpture, Caricaturist		Prishtina
12	Luan Mulliqi		M		Sculpturer	First director of the National Art Gallery after the war in Kosovo	Prishtina, Belgrade

Appendix 2

Interview Guide

General questions (to Art Critics and Artists)

1. Can you please tell me something about yourself (profession, education, current place of residence)?

Follow up question: (to artists who studied in Belgrade) was it difficult to be accepted at the Academy of Fine Arts in Yugoslavian main cities (Belgrade, Zagreb) and reasons why they studied there?

Where did you finish your studies?

Where do you work?

Tell me something about your art...

Where do you reside?

To Art Critics

1. What do you think of the development of art during the former Yugoslavian period?

Follow up question: In what ways do you think this development has affected art in Kosovo?

Follow up question: How have artists embraced this?

Follow up question: When it comes to studying, how difficult was for future artists to get accepted to the Academy of Arts in Belgrade?

Follow up question: The high school of art in Peja opened in 1949, even though it was rather late, did it affect the development of art in Kosovo?

2. How did artists from Kosovo have benefited from the former Yugoslavian period?

3. Do you think there is a difference on the development of art from former Yugoslavian period to the present?

4. What role have the artistic associations played during and after the Yugoslavian regime?

5. What is your opinion regarding the development of an artistic career, where were artists positioned?

Follow up question: To what extent could they have a stable and a successful career?

6. What do you think is the difference between art nowadays to before?

Follow up question: Its characteristics?

Follow up question: What about the values and beliefs of the Albanian culture?

To Artists – older generation

1. How would you consider your career as an artist during the former Yugoslavian period?

Explanation: Where were you positioned in the art world during the Yugoslavian period; how did your career evolve; what opportunities were offered to you?

2. To what extent has the regime affected your art?

Examples: The struggles? Life commodities?

3. To what extent your plans as an artist were fulfilled during the former Yugoslavian period?

4. Do you think there is a difference on the development of art from former Yugoslavian period to the present?

Follow up question: How and Why?

5. What kind of experiences do you have as an artist?

Follow up question: Where has your art travelled?

Follow up question: How have these experiences helped you grow as an artist? Or not grow as an artist?

Follow up question: Which was the most important exhibition that you have been part of so far?

Follow up question: What about prizes?

Follow up question: Have you been part of any residency?

6. What do you think is the difference between art nowadays to before?

Follow up question: Its characteristics?

Follow up question: What about the values and beliefs of the Albanian culture?

To Artists – newer generation

1. How do you perceive the development of art from the moment you were involved in the art world?

Follow up question: As you are surrounded and stay with artists of older generations, how do you think this development has affected their art?

2. From your own knowledge regarding the development of art in Kosovo, do you think it is easier to have an artistic career now or before *(during the former Yugoslavian period)*?

Follow up question: Can you elaborate?

3. To what extent have you been influenced by artists of older generation?

4. What kind of experiences do you have as an artist?

Follow up question: Where has your art travelled?

Follow up question: How have these experiences helped you grow as an artist? Or not grow as an artist?

Follow up question: Which was the most important exhibition that you have been part of so far?

Follow up question: What about prizes?

Follow up question: Have you been part of any residency?

5. During the former Yugoslavian period, artist could travel freely, they had their own privileges when it came to travel, Nowadays, in Kosovo, you have to apply for Visa in order to travel anywhere you want. To what extent has this effected your career as an artist?

Follow up question: Can you elaborate? Share one of your own experiences?

6. What do you think is the difference between art nowadays to before?

Follow up question: Its characteristics?

Appendix 3

Code Book

Revolution – Change in perception of the development of art

Movement and moving Abroad – did they have the chance to travel abroad

Education – the foundation of an artist

Evaluation of an artist – based on experience

The golden era – generation of artist

Important movements of the arts – which movements do they consider important

Activities in and outside the country – what are they perceptions regarding activities they were part of

Creativity and values – what do these concepts mean according to them

Original and independent career motivation – to what extent are they affected by others

Dedication and determination – what did they face, what made them continue

Career decisions and behaviours – if they were in crossroads, survival, how did they behave in certain moments