Student Name: Penelope Peta Frances Goemans

Student Number: 584276

Supervisor: Dr. Erik Hitters

Master Media Studies - Media & Business

Erasmus School of History, Culture and Communication

Erasmus University Rotterdam

Master's Thesis

June 2021

Value Creation in Online Bedroom Pop Scenes

ABSTRACT

Three artists were selcted as case studies for this examination of the creation of value in online 'bedroom pop' scenes. Using the Instagram accounts of these three artists, namely, Still

Woozy, The Marias and Orion, it is possible to examine how fans interact with each other as well as the artists themselves. Bedroom pop is an internet based genre of music whose creators write, produce and distribute their music from the comfort of their own homes, aided by the development of high quality home production software and equipment. This study will use pervious research on scenes to examine how 'bedroom pop' differs from traditional music genres. Specifically, this will examine online scenes which are the primary space for scene creation rather than suplimentary to the space specific scene, as this is what is unique about bedroom pop. Instagram comments and captions were scraped from 57 total posts. A thematic analysis was conducted on the comments and captions in order to answer the research question; '*How is value created in emerging online "bedroom pop" scenes?'*. Findings showed a lack of interaction between fans and the artists, as well as bridging between fans, and an emphasis on social capital. Moreover, the artists used the space to create a narrative of authenticity in oder to utailise indie underground aethetics to connect to fans.

KEYWORDS: *bedroom pop, scene creation, value production, online scenes, Instagram*

Table of Contents

1. Chapter 1: Introduction

As home technology has improved and internet speeds become faster, the opportunities to work and create music from home have broadened. (Toulson, 2008). While home music creation has been a long-standing tradition within indie music scenes, these new systems allow the creators more control over the production than ever before. In recent years a new form of indie music creator has emerged. These creators have the opportunities and means to create high quality music and share them onto the internet to massive potential followings, all from the comfort of their own homes and the all for the cost of a stable internet connection and a decent quality laptop. This is unique to the contemporary usage of the internet which allows the creators to bypass the traditional industry (McLeod, 2005).

The term 'bedroom pop' was first introduced in the mid 2010's as an attempt to conceptualise the new phenomenon of young artists recording and releasing music from their 'bedrooms', without the help of a Label or any sophisticated music software (Barna, 2019). The movement is an embodiment of the Do-it-yourself (DIY) approach to music that has been a key marker of indie music (Bennet and Guerra, 2019). The beginning of the genre was marked by the creation of the Spotify official 'bedroom pop' playlist in 2018 which now has more than seven hundred thousand followers (Spotify.com). Artists like Billie Eilish and Clairo began their music careers posting their lo-fi home recorded music online and managed to achieve success and move to bigger projects and reach larger audiences from this home start. However, not all bedroom pop artists choose to let go of the 'bedroom' label and instead remain the sole creator and producer of their subsequent music releases.

These creators become the singer- songwriter- producer and also promoter of their own music. This phenomenon seems at odds with the traditional capitalist market production, as circumventing the traditional music industry is what allows the genre to flourish (Kruse, 2010). Therefore, from a market perspective 'bedroom pop artists' pose an interesting problem for value production. Hitherto, research on value creation in DIY online scenes is limited (Barna, 2017; Bennett & Guerra, 2019; Tofalvy, 2020).

In promoting their music on social media platforms, the artists manage to gain a strong and dedicated audience (Baym, 2010). So much so that their online presence not only encourages online scenes but can facilitate and create them as well. This could be compared to the traditional scenes of local music genres, where fans interact with each other and the artists to form a sense of community (Bennett, 2004). Specific studys on bedroom pop scenes have been conducted by Barna, 2017 and Barna 2014, but not much else has been investigated. Furthermore, research has been done on online scenes but not to the extent of value production or the role of social media in the creation of scenes. With the emergence of these artists and the new online musical scenes, facilitated by streaming platforms, we need to better understand how community is created and how monetary and societal

value is created therein. In light of this, the research question asks: *how is value created in emerging online "bedroom pop" scenes?* Three artists were selected, and their Instagram contents and comments analysed. The three artists that have been analysed are Orion Sun, Still Woozy and The Marias. These artist represent a range of this broad category of bedroom pop, being examples of both smaller creators (Orion Sun) and larger ones (The Marias and Still Woozy), as well as group ventures (the Marias) and solo projects (Orion Sun and Still Woozy). Sub questions will focus on three aspects of this question, the first being value creation: (1a) how is value perceived by fans in these online scenes, (1b) how is value perceived by artists in these online scenes, (1c) how is this value captured and monetised? Secondly the questions will concern fan and artist interaction with the questions: (2a) how does the interaction between the artists and fans assist in the value creation of online scenes, (2b) what trends can be observed in the fan interactions in online scenes? Finally, in order to compare the different artists the sub question will ask: (3) when comparing artists what patterns emerge in the creation of value in emerging online scenes?

This research will add to the academic literature of scene, which already has a strong academic tradition, whilst filling the gap in internet scene research. This will focus on the study of internet musicians and scene production online which has been neglected in scene research which tends to focus on live music or earlier internet usage, such as the early 2000s. Moreover, this research can show how the musicians usitalise these platforms. Socially, this research will show the impact of social media on the construction of identity within musical scenes.

This study will use a combined approach of netnography and case study methods in order to investigate the Research Question.

This paper aims firstly to discuss the theoretical framework by elaborating on traditional and online scenes, value in music, fan and artist interaction, and DIY and Indie aesthetics. These topics will cover the previous and current relevant research for this paper. Following this, the methodology will be described, including the sampling process, the method of analysis and the reliability and validity. The results of the analysis will be discussed followed by the conclusion and discussion.

2. Chapter 2: Theory and Previous research

This chapter will outline the relevant theory and concepts for this study. Firstly, scenes and the shift to online scenes will be discussed. Thereafter, value in terms of online music scenes is explained, followed by the discussion of fan and artist interactions within a scene. Finally, DIY culture and Bedroom Pop will be discussed. This section addresses the related research and shows the links between these concepts.

2.1 Traditional scenes and How It Relates to Online Spaces

It is not uncommon for communities and subcultures to evolve around a particular place or a particular genre. When looking at scene research a few key points emerge (Straw, 1991; Cohen, 1991; Barna, 2019; Bennett, 2004). Firstly, scenes are local, secondly, scenes revolve around a particular genre and thirdly, scenes rely on close interaction between the artists and the fans. As Straw (1991) discusses in his seminal work 'Systems of articulation, logics of change', the key identifier of a scene is clearly outlined by the expectation of interaction amongst its members. Straw (1991) discusses the role of geographical location on the emergence of musical and cultural communities. His argument is that these localised communities based around music create a flow of creation and the cross- pollination of ideas. This adds to the occurrence of musical boundary building, making a scene more than a static established place but a space of shared meaning making, where members work together to build and create new social bonds. Scenes, therefore, embody a collaborative approach to meaning making and community building. Furthermore, the idea of connoisseurship is tied to scene building as fans highlight the significance of favoured artists in the scene.

To clarify the link between scene and place, some relevant studies will be discussed. Early scene studies revolved around specific genre scenes in cities (Cohen, 1991). Moreover, the link to the local communities is shown by Skandalis, Bannister and Byrom (2020), as they discuss Indie music in Manchester and find a significant link between the concept of space and the fans proximity to the scene. The subjects of the study highlighted the relationships that developed between the musicians they loved and the city of Manchester, with one drawing attention to the idea of existing in the same spaces as their icons. This place-dependent social capital emphasises the importance of being a part of the scene in the specific place.

The collaborative processes of scenes assists in the meaning making processes of these communities. Scenes operate within a network of actors as described by van der Hoeven et al. (2020). This network of actors assist in the creation of these spaces by working collaborateively to create a community around a particular genre of music. This therefore assists in the creation of for boundary development (Lamont & Molnar, 2002; Lamont et al., 2001), as well as in-group and out-group self-expression (Pitts, 2014). Lamont and Molnar describe boundary development as the way people identify themselves within society. Social boundaries relate to the access to of opportunity

and resources, in this case the music and the musicians, as well as fellow fans. As described by Pitts (2014), fans within a scene are able to identify their part within the group because they are aware of the shared background and similarities of the members.

Scenes have developed to encompass online locations as well, where the shift to online allows for consumers to find their niche regardless of physical location (Lange, & Bürkner, 2013, Barna 2019; Bennett, 2004). Therefore, this creates a space for a global- local form of scene creation (Lange & Bürkner, 2013). Thus, scenes online share many characteristics with traditional scenes, but differ with regards to membership. These scenes emerge as members throughout the world can interact more closely than ever before (Lange & Bürkner, 2013; Tofalvy, 2020a). Tofalvy discusses how the change in technology has allowed music to exist outside of the physical, and move into a new delocalised sphere. These new technologies have created a space for music where anyone can produce music so long as they have access to the internet. Therefore it is possible to examine scenes online as these discussions and interactions can be localised to a single website or profile in order to create a community. Lee and Peterson (2004) furthermore show how online scenes allow for a variety of people to interact in the scene which goes beyond the usual homogenous groups which are found in traditional local scenes. Lee and Peterson's study found that the members of the virtual scene varied in age, gender, sexuality and relationship status which is contrasted with the physical scene which usually is limited in the diversity of people who take part.

Some research has already been done into modern online scenes. Gu, Domer and O'Conner (2021) discuss how the transition from underground venues due to the coronavirus crisis has led to an increased participation online, which has not only changed the expectation of indie music, but also the widened the audience beyond the small cluster of "in-the-know" fans. Bennett (2004) highlights how virtual scenes can facilitate 'ongoing communication and collectivity' for bands that do not, or no longer tour (p231). This is also beneficial due to the current state of the music industry because of the pandemic. Therefore, we can see the emergence of new scene building traditions, one that takes place online, one that is extended beyond the limits of traditional expectations of fans and one that relies on the internet for value creation and economic success. Barna (2014) also discuss the emergence of a lo-fi scene in Budapest, although in this case the online scene was still geographically local, as it specifically relied on artists from Budapest. However, it did show how the online scene supplemented the offline events and provided a space for displaying visible associations within the community.

In conclusion, online scenes can be compared to offline scenes with the same expectation of interaction and group meaning making. Moreover, in both cases, the scenes are limited to specific spaces, either online or to specific geography. The link to the site of the scene shows the importance of perceived closeness to the artists and their music. For online scenes, because of the perceived familiarity that Instagram allows, it is worthwhile seeing how scenes developed in these online spaces as there is the possibility of close interactions between the artist and the fans. Online spaces

may facilitate similar interactions, and meaningful experiences. Moreover, because of the reliance of bedroom pop artists on the internet in order to promote and share their music, it is important to see whether there is an opportunity for meaningful scene building in these online spaces as well.

2.2 Value in Music

Having looked at how traditional scene are construsted and how this is applied to online scenes, it is now possible to look at how value to created within the bounds of these scenes. Value in music can refer to multiple ideas. Value can be linked to the intrinsic value such as societal, and cultural value, while also referring to the economic and market value. For fans, value can be created through socialising, interactions, investments, cultural, and intrinsic value associated with music and enjoyment (O'Reilly et al., 2014). The symbolic value of music as described by O'Reilly et al. refers to its greater meaning, beyond the actual music itself but rather how the consumers identify with the music. This, consequently, assists with the process of meaning making, and how fans view their place in society, as described in the creation of scenes. Therefore, value is derived from the way fans perceive themselves as members of the in-group. So, the act of consumption of a particular music genre becomes a way to create and signify identity (O'Reilly et al). For producers, value can come from economic success, cultural capital, social elevation and symbolic value (Hibbett, 2005). Moreover, there are also the intrinsic values of music, such as the experience of listening, and cultural benefits, however Behr et al (2016) argue that the intrinsic value cannot be separated from the 'instrumental' (economic) value and that these two concepts work hand in hand to create the overall sense of value. However, they also argue for this value to be looked at beyond the money making (Behr et al, 2016).

For indie listeners, especially, there is a dichotomy between the general expectation of success in the mainstream music industry and the expectation of success from the point of view of the fans. The mainstream understanding of success includes large audiences and therefore, assumptions of economic success, versus the indie expectation having a smaller audience, and consequently, a smaller economic value. When remaining loyal to the indie fans there is the value of being 'underground', high-art and good taste and therefore not 'selling out' to appeal to the masses (Hibbett, 2005). As a result, authenticity appears to come at the expense of economic success. Hibbett goes on to argue that the symbolic value of indie music is tied to ideas of the fans being the bastions of 'good taste' and the fact the music is niche and unknown, to them, means that it is superior to popular music. Therefore, the value is tied to the idea of being opposed to the mainstream. Barna (2014) shows how the expectation of obscurity and loyalty to underground scenes is starting to shift. Due to the internet, the traditional gatekeepers within the scene no longer hold the power to exclude members of the group. Therefore, the scene is not homogeneous and as such, is accepting of a wider audience.

Compared to traditional scenes, online scenes use different markers of success and value. Constantini (2020) describes how digitalization blurs the line between professional and amateur artists while allowing the market to broaden to accommodate the larger pool of musicians. This relies on the idea of online popularity which uses likes, follows and views as relational metrics of fame. The internet has therefore changed the way that musicians are able to become successful as well as the way that they are able to signify success. Visibility, therefore, becomes a proponent of success as new and established artists share the online spaces in order built sustainable careers. Nevertheless, Tofalvy (2020b) argues that while the internet has broadened the possibility of visibility and given a space for equal opportunity for fame, the concept of underground remains the same. Tofalvy argues that underground or indie refers to the point in time when fans listen to it. By finding music before it achieves mainstream popularity, the fans are able to achieve underground cultural capital as those who are one of the trailblazers of new trends.

Moreover, an article by Kruse argues that online independent music production means that artists are able to save money by avoiding the Label contracts that usually take a share of the profits. Kruse (2010) also claims that peer to peer sharing helps sales by providing exposure to obscure groups. Digitalisation has had a large impact on the way artists interact with their fans which, in turn, has changed the way that they make money.

Furthermore, the promotion of merchandise can also be done online. Artists may choose to create their own vinyl records or clothing for their fans to purchase. Skandalis et al. (2020) discuss the dematerialisation of music through online consumption, and Maguadda (2011) argues that while music has moved to the digital sphere, the attachment to physical iterations of musical marchandise has not changed. Therefore, we can see that economic value may still be found in digital scenes, beyond the traditional sales of records and concert tickets. While value might be economically defined, the value of music goes beyond that and can have social, symbolic and personal implications (O'Reilly et al., 2014). With the introduction of online streaming services, physical record and cd sales began to shrink, and the way people consume music has drastically changed. Maguadda argues that fans still want to have physical attachment to the objects that link them to their music (2011). This means that while music may have moved to streaming, the possibility for economic value from physical objects is still there. While most listeners will choose to stream online, passionate fans may choose to buy vinyl in order to create a connection between themselves and the artists.

As a result, both intrinsic value and economic value can be derived from online scenes. Intrinsic value can refer to the underground cultural capital of knowing the band before they are popular, as well as the creation of success through visibility. However, these two concepts of value are too entangled to separate one from the other. For example, the intrinsic value of listening to underground music and finding authentic independent music is tied to the economic value for artists who do not have contracts with labels. Therefore, these two concepts of value can be investigated together.

2.3 Fan and Artist Interaction Within Scenes

For both scene and value creation, fan and musician interactions are crucial as scenes rely on the co-creation of meaning (Straw, 1991). The interactions between consumer and producer are what often times creates value, specifically with live music, this leads to the interesting question of how this interaction affects internet scenes. In addition to the fan and artist interaction, there is also fan to fan interaction. This fan interaction plays a large role in the creation of in-group identity which is necessary of the creation of scene (Kruse, 2010). There are various types of interactions that occur in scenes.

Another way to look at the interactions of fans is by examining the ideas of bonding and bridging which refer to the social value of music scenes (Putnam, 2000). Bonding refers to how homogenous groups increase their internal social community ties, for example when a group of friends all interact with a scene and become closer because of it. In contrast, bridging refers to bringing together non-homogenous groups, such as making new connections because of a shared interest (Norris, 2002). Wilks (2011) argues that live music facilitates bonding social capital, but based on the heterogenous nature of online communities, it is very likely that online scenes will facilitate bridging. The internet allows people from all aspects of life to become involved in the scene. This supports the idea of a global scene, as it is accessible throughout the world, so active members of the scene do not have to come from the same place and the bridging concept means that global fans can unit in support of their favourite artists despite vast differences in background.

Online scenes provide an ideal space for Indie music producers as this allows for the close interaction between artists and fans without the need for live events. Furthermore, indie music relies on the premise of authenticity (Kruse, 2010). This authenticity is, now, in some ways tied to lo-fi music production and the technology that allows direct communication between artist and fan that circumvents the conventional music industry (Kruse, 2010). Using social media and online platforms, artists are able to continuously interact with their audience as well as give a look into the behind-the-scenes production which creates an aura of authenticity as it does not come from the highly filtered and produced music industry. Van Poecke (2017) discusses the re-emergence of authenticity due to the social media. Authenticity, according to van Poecke, is an aesthetic choice which highlights simplicity and 'real life'. By choosing to promote their music through Social Media platforms, bedroom pop artists are making a commitment to the authentic aesthetic, as the expectations of these media it that it is not a polished glossy finished product but rather a comfortable work in progress designed to be shared with friends and acquaintances. Therefore, fans feel as though they are getting an insider look into the lives of their favourite musicians and celebrities, regardless of the truth behind the scenes.

Online scenes allow fans to keep in touch with each other, so that they may articulate their fandom in a public manner (Bennet, 2004). Lee and Peterson found that internet scenes can serve a

similar purpose as local scenes and will have generally the same make up of dedicated fans spreading to various levels of less involved members (2004). Therefore, evaluating online fan interactions can lead to understanding of the scene as a whole, and accordingly, how its value is perceived. In summary, there a few key reasons for fans to interact on online scenes; 1.) to create their identity, 2.) to show others that they are part of a group, 3.) to find likeminded fans, 4.) to interact with the bands and artists they support. Instagram may allow for this kind of interaction, specifically because the algrorithm uses user's current likes in order to suggest new accounts to follow. Therefore, a user need only find a few key accounts before they can be recommended musicians who suit their aesthetic. Moreover, producers themselves can benefit from these algorithms by supporting fellow likeminded artists and then allowing the algorithm to bring fans to them.

2.4 DIY and Bedroom Pop

Bedroom Pop production follows many of the same concepts as DIY (Do-it-yourself) culture (Barna, 2017). Bedroom pop emerged from the necessity of making music on a budget and also exploiting the new technology which allows this to happen. DIY culture also focusses on the creativity of the artist in order to use non-traditional methods to make new sounds. Van Poecke argues that the DIY culture ties into the culture of authenticity because it is intrinsically unique (2017).

Moreover, Bennett (2018) discusses the link between youth and music, as well as the role of DIY in youth music career building. Bennett argues that the DIY culture of today is rooted in the changing notion of what it means to have a career. As part time and piece work has become the norm for today's youth, they are left with time and the freedom to pursue music careers outside of traditional work. Paired with the relative ease of technology and production, musicians are able to make music alongside other work. As Bennet argues, the goal with this type of music production is about making this career sustainable whilst spending as little time and money on it as possible.

Building on this, Bennett and Guerra (2019) discuss DIY as a lifestyle, specifically as a distancing from the institutional ideals, and class boundaries. This ties in with the work of Bennett (2018) as it is shown how youth built their own careers and expectations of economic success by pairing piecework with creative pursuits. This means that DIY has a greater impact on the musicians than simply the way that they make and produce their music. While Bennett (2018) and Bennett and Guerra (2019) specifically discussed punk aesthetics and Van Poecke (2017) discussed Indie Folk it is still possible to tie these concepts to Bedroom Pop music production, as DIY is very much a part of this movement.

Bedroom pop represents an exciting era of musicians taking advantage of every benefit that modern technology has generated. It therefore becomes necessary to study how these artists build careers and large following using the tools that are available. It is not just necessary to see how they

are able to monetise there offering but also how they are able to garner a dedicated and loyal following who solely support them online and perhaps may never see the artist perform live.

Bedroom Pop artists are not only comfortable with modern technologies but also with the use of social media. Barna first discusses the role of the website Tumblr in bedroom pop scenes in Budapest in a 2014 article, where she describes the online scene as a supplementary space of fandom to the physical scene. In a subsequent 2019 article Barna describes the process of artists uploading their music online and being able to share their music for free. One artist interviewed by Barna described how the success felt as though she had 'cheated' the system (p51). Moreover there are references to the process being somewhat accidental, from the discussion to upload the songs online to the success that follows. This highlights the ease to online production and distributions that the artists themselves seem surprised by. Therefore, it is just as important that these artists are able to produce at home as it is for them to be able to promote their music from their homes, and have full control over the process themselves.

Therefore, Bedroom Pop has emerged as a movement that ties together the use of DIY culture as well as pairing part time work with creative endeavours. With the emergence of new technology, creating online becomes relatively simple, whilst sharing online is supported by new media platforms such as Instagram, TikTok, Youtube and Spotify (Barna, 2019; Barna, 2014). These various platforms allow producers to gain visibility across the various configurations of internet usages. Specifically Instagram allows for interactions between users and the musicians by the way that Instagram encourages posting and commenting, and by rewarding those who have more interactions, with more visibility.

3. Chapter 3: Methodology

This chapter will discuss the methodological design, beginning with the choice of method, before discussing the samplin processs, followed by the analysis, the operationalisation and the validity and reliability.

3.1 Choice of method:

Using netnography and case study design allows for a strong and in -depth analysis of these particular instances of bedroom pop artists to be examined. Netnography is an adaptation of ethnography for the internet (Kozinets, 2002). The benefit of netnography is that researchers are able to process large amounts of data, it is suitable for qualitative methods and it is designed specifically for online research. Due to the large amount of data that are available on Instagram, this method is ideal. Netnography therefore allows for an examination of the creation of scenes within the Instagram accounts of these artists. By investigating how fans interact with, and comment on the posts of these artists is it possible to understand the value that these artists embody for the fans. Furthermore, it is possible to examine how the artists present themselves and their work directly to their fans, and as such, how they promote and create a value proposal for their fans. Using qualitative methods allows for an interpretation of the words used and sentiments expressed in a deep and meaningful way (Clarke & Braun, 2014).

Moreover, Instagram is a worthwhile platform for inspection because of the perceived closeness between the fan and artists, therefore blurring the lines between the fandom and collaboration. Instagram is a platform which allows its users to share photos and videos with captions, and allows followers to comment and like these offerings, therefore facilitating interactions between users. Instagram has also incorporated a 'verified' category which allows users to find and interact with the authentic celebrities, which therefore creates a level of personalization and familiarity between well-known cultural figures and fans (Gaber et al., 2021). By using the Instagram accounts of these artists, it is possible to analyse the interactions between fans and the artist as well as the interactions between the fans themselves. Moreover, Instagram stands out from YouTube and TikTok, which although similar, do not have the same level of closeness that Instagram facilitates. YouTube tends to be one sided as the musicians post without expectation of interaction and those fans who comment do not expect to be heard by the artists themselves. TikTok is a newer platform, but due to the algorithms constant attempt to create new viral content it does not necessarily foster closeness or a dedicated following, as what is popular today may have lost its appeal in a few days. Instagram, by contrast, tends to cultivate a dedicated following as users only want to see posts that are relevant to them on their feed.

A deeper level of analysis of these artistic communities was achieved by integrating the netnography method with case study analysis as described by Yin (2003). Case studies are suitable for research into contemporary phenomena within real-life situations (Yin, 2003) and therefore

suitable for this study. A multiple case-study design provides the opportunity to create a comparative study of these artist scenes. As Bryman (2016) argues comparing meaningful cases allows us to understand social phenomena better. This contrast of cases allows for the differences in cases to be observed (Bryman, 2016). Moreover, with multiple-cases it is possible to examine 'operation of generative causal mechanisms in contrasting or similar contexts' (Bryman, 2016, p.74). For both case studies and netnography the selection of specific and key samples is vital (Kozinets, 2002; Yin, 2003). Therefore, for the selection of suitable online communities, purposeful sampling was used to find the artists. Purposeful sampling is not only necessary in order to ensure that these represent key examples of bedroom pop but also the represent current global local virtual scene (Palinkas et al., 2015). Purposeful sampling relies on the knowledge and discernment of the researcher to make the correct and suitable choices of these cases. Therefore, selecting specific and worthwhile cases, (such as those of Still woozy, Orion Sun and The Marias) enables a comparative discussion of these scenes at various points in their journey to success. The specific criteria for these choices will be discussed in the 'sampling and data gathering' section of this chapter. As Bedroom Pop relies heavily on many elements of DIY, the way that these artists create scenes and promote their music is as unique as the artists themselves. This means that multiple cases are necessary to get a broader picture of the conventions and trends within this genre.

Based on the usage of netnography and case study design, it would therefore be suitable to use thematic analysis for the analysis of the comments. Thematic analysis has been used for Netnography in many studies and is thus established as an appropriate approach (Whalen, 2018). As Braun and Clarke (2006) describe it thematic analysis can report the experiences, meanings and the reality of the data. This means that it will be possible to examine the co-creation of meaning between fans and musicians which is necessary for scene production (Straw, 1991). Thematic analysis is guided by sensitising concepts, such as the various interpretations of value as presented in the theoretical chapter, whilst still allowing for a freer analysis that is guided by the data. Therefor, making it possible to delve deeply into the overall themes that present themselves in the comments and captions of the Instagram posts.

Using the combined method of netnography and case study research allows for a clear and in-depth analysis of the phenomenon of scene building in online spaces. Moreover, this design serves to answer the research question and sub-questions and they will be discussed in the following sections of this chapter. Using netnography allows for the study of value and fan artist interactions and case study design allows for a comparison between the various scenes of these artists.

3.2 Sampling and data collection:

As discussed before, purposeful sampling was used to select the cases for this study. In order to fully answer the research question, suitable bedroom pop artists had to be chosen. These artists have to embody the bedroom pop aesthetic and ethos, while also be worthwhile to study as separate

cases of this phenomenon. The three key criteria are; (1) the artists must write and produce their own music, (2) they should be emerging, and (3) they should have a strong international or trans-national fan base. These criteria allow for a selection of artists who primarily develop their fanbase online, as opposed to through live concerts and gigs, and are actively trying to gain a larger following in order to sustain their music career. Moreover, this will ensure that these artists are not simply 'bedroom pop' artists, but bedroom pop artists who are exploring the possibilities of online promotion. Emergence was operationalized through the upward trajectory of Instagram likes, based on general trends, and strong fan base through the number of followers and Spotify monthly listens. Analysis of the followers was done using a platform called Upfluence which gives insight into Instagram pages followers' ages, cities and gender as well as the engagement rate of the profile. Based on this, three artists were selected. These are Still Woozy, Orion Sun and The Marias.

Still Woozy is the stage name for Sven Gramsky, an American bedroom pop artist. Gramsky has 231k followers on his Instagram (@still_woozy) and nearly 5 million monthly listeners on spotify. Gramsky's spotify bio reads "Hii [sic] my name is Sven. Still Woozy is my solo project, and I record all parts in my garage/studio". Furthermore, from his Spotify, it is shown that his listeners come from Los Angeles, Chicago, London, Sydney and Dallas. Moreover an analysis on the Instagram followers shows that the majority of his followers comes from the USA (79%) however the cities that have the largest fan base are Los Angeles (15 percent), Asheville, Berlin, Breckenridge and Chicago (8% each). Therefore, Still Woozy fulfils the criteria of having an international fan base, although heavily focused on the USA, he still has a broad fan base from multiple countries.

Orion Sun is the stage name for Tiffany Majette, who is a 23 year old musician from Philadelphia, USA. Majette has 33.9k followers on her Instagram (@cloudgem) account and almost nine hundred thousand monthly listeners on Spotify. Her Instagram bio reads only 'musician' and her Spotify bio states 'becoming through music'. The Instagram account features snippets of self-recorded videos of Majette performing her songs. Spotify shows her listeners to be from Los Angeles, Chicago, New York City, Brooklyn and London. An analysis of her Instagram followers shows a majority following from the USA (85%) and smaller followings from the United Kingdom, Canada, Nirgeria, and Argentina. This shows an international following and a transnational American community.

The Marias are a band made up of the primary members, Maria Zargoya and Josh Conway, who write and produce the music, while the rest of the band is made up of Jesse Perlman and Edward James for their live performances. The Marias have 291k followers on Instagram and 2 million monthly listeners on Spotify. Their Spotify bio states '… Josh and Maria write, record and produce within the walls of their own home with their dog, Lucy.' Spotify shows their listeners to be from Los Angeles, Mexico City, Chicago, Houston and Dallas. Moreover, analysis of the followers show a majority from USA with followers from Mexico, Indonesia, Brazil and the UK.

The data collection process took place between the 1st and 14th of May 2021. Comments and captions were manually scraped from Instagram. 24 post were scraped from Orion Sun, whilst 15 were scraped from Still Woozy and 18 from The Marias. Due to the great number of comments on Still Woozy and The Marias less posts were needed in order to get a suitable number of comments compared to Orion Sun. These posts were scraped from the most recent at the time of data gathering onwards. Therefore, no posts after the 30th of April were included. Some posts were excluded due to the nature of the photograph or caption which made it irrelevant to the production and consumption of music, meaning that the comments were not relevant for creation of value in these online scenes. An initial "grand tour" of the data is necessary in order to accommodate for the nature of internet interactions (Kozinets, 2002). As discussed by Kozinets:

> *"Tourists* lack strong social ties and deep interest in the activity (they often post casual questions). *Minglers* have strong social ties but minimal interest in the consumption activity. *Devotees* have strong consumption interests but few attachments to the online group. Finally, *insiders* have strong ties to the online group and to the consumption activity and tend to be long-standing and frequently referenced members". (p64)

Therefore, as we are focussing on scene development and interaction, it is necessary to reduce the data in order to find the key incites from *devotees* and *insiders*. This is interpreted as followers who comments significant information, rather than simple emojis or comments such as 'I love you' or 'wow', which bare no strong ties to the post or artists. Therefore, these comments were excluded from the analysis.

3.3 Method of Analysis

A thematic analysis of the instagram comments and captions was conducted using the qualitative analysis software ATLAS.ti. This method allows for the discovery of key themes within the data (Braun & Clarke, 2006). This, in turn, allows the researcher to answer the research question and sub-questions. Following the cleaning of the data according to the standards set by Kozinets (2002), it was uploaded onto ATLAS.ti in order for the codes and themes to be created.

Atlas.ti allows for easy navigation and code making, however this must be used in combination with manual analysis as netnography relies on close interaction with the data. Based on Kozinets (2002) ideas of data interpretation, a combination of approaches are needed for analysis. Due to this, like counts were also paid attention to within the comments as an indication of interaction or to signify what the fans found to be important or amusing. In addition, although the instagram photo posts weren't analysed themselves, it is important to keep them in mind in the context of the captions and comments in order to get a holistic understanding of the data.

The analysis followed the method as laid out by Williams and Moser (2019) as well as Clarke and Braun (2014). The analysis began with familiarization with the data, by reading and rereading the comments and captions. This was followed by open coding where the data is examined

and briefly coded and labelled. The open coding was guided by the sensitising concepts as defined by Bowen (2019). According to Bowen (2019) sensitising concepts are the 'analytical lens or interpretive mechanism' for the analysis. The sensitising concept for this research came from the previous research as described in Chapter 2, and therefore, focussed on interaction, value and indie aethestics. This method used a combination of inductive and deductive coding (Fereday & Muir-Cochrane, 2006), which allows for the use of the sensitising concepts but does not rule out the possibility of open coding in order to discover new themes. Following this the open codes were grouped into axial codes. Finally, the overall themes were defined, and the axial codes were grouped under these themes. Once the themes had been defined, the final results could be reported, using examples from the text and open codes to answer the research questions.

3.4 Operationalisation:

The central idea of this research is the creation of value within the online scenes, therefore the comments of fans were scraped from Instagram accounts of the artists. These comments allow for the analysis of the role that the artists play in the fans lives, as well as the expectations of the artists for their fans. The first set of sub-questions deal with the perception of value, these being; *a) how is value perceived by fans in these online scenes, (b) how is value perceived by artists in these online scenes, (c) how is this value captured and monetised?*'. Therefore, this value could be assessed by the theory as either monetary value or intrinsic value, based on the previous literature and research done on the value of live music (O'Reilly et al. 2014; Hibbett, 2005; Behr et al., 2016)). This focusses on the role of music in the fan's lives as well as the ability of the artists to create a sustainable career from the production of their own music as argued by Kruse (2010). When coding, the concept of intrinsic value was found through mentions of wellbeing or general life improvement from the music, therefore references to enjoyment or implicit need were considered makers of value, as well as references to social promotion from the music due to being an 'in-the-know' fan (Barna, 2014). Economic Value was examined through references to merchandise or opportunities to buy vinyl as well as tickets to live shows. References to streaming could also be considered references to economic value, especially when in reference to the context of Spotify or Apple Music which do pay their artist per stream. Hesmondhalgh (2019 has argued that it is possible for artists to make a living from these platforms, if enough streams are generated. However, dependent on the context, calls for streaming could also be a reference to growing popularity.

The second set of sub-questions discusses the role of the fan and artist interactions within these scenes. These questions are; *'(a) how does the interaction between the artists and fans assist in the value creation of online scenes, (b) what trends can be observed in the fan interactions on online scenes?'*. Because scenes rely so heavily on the interaction between fans and artists, it is important to see how this is translated online (Straw, 1991). The dynamic between the artists and fans can shed light on the way that value is created. This is assessed by seeing the way the artists respond to the fan

comments, as well as how the fans reply to each other in the comment sections of these Instagram posts.

The final sub-question is *' when comparing artists what patterns emerge in the creation of value in emerging online scenes?'*. This question stives to understand the differences between the various artists and their Instagram communities. This refers specifically to the case study design and the unique way each of these operate.

3.5 Validity and Reliability

Validity and reliability must be taken into account when considering the research design, in order to ensure the academic rigor of the study. As qualitative research relies so heavily on the researcher interpretation it is important to take into account the researcher position. As consistency is important for reliability the same researcher conducted all the coding and analysis which ensures reliability and consistency throughout the analysis (Golafshani, 2003)

The sampling process can often cause issues for validity as this is dependent on the researcher's selection (Golafshani, 2003). In order to mitigate any error here, a set of criteria were described. It must be noted that the results may differ if different cases were selected. It is important to reflect on the role of the researcher in the process of sampling and analysis. However, in order to ensure that the effect of any biases may be minimal, having rich and detailed descriptions will allow the readers to assess transferability (Creswell & Miller, 2000).

Moreover, the analysis was guided by the theoretical analysis method as described by William and Moser (2019) and Clarke and Braun (2014), which follows specific steps in order to ensure academic rigor. Following a standardised methodological process helps ensure replicability (Creswell & Miller, 2000).

4. Chapter 4: Results

This chapter will discuss the results from the thematic analysis that was conducted on the Instagram posts and comments sections from three bedroom pop artists, Orion Sun, Still Woozy, and The Marias. These three artists represent different points of success with Still Woozy being the most established and Orion Sun being the smallest of the three. While Still Woozy and Orion Sun are individual artists, The Marias are a group consisting of two main members and two additional members for live performances. Based on the coding and analysis, the results with be presented below. First the main findings will be presented, followed by the a discussion of the themes and subthemes. Four main themes were discovered and eight sub themes.

Overall there have been a few significant findings. The most important being the lack of interaction which is something that affects all other themes. As interaction is a key part of scene production, this was noticeably lacking in the Instagram scenes, specifically interactions between the fans themselves. Moreover it was found that fans use these spaces to reaffirm their support for the artists and insert themselves into the space of the artist's scene. Furthermore it was found that artists utilise these spaces to create an authentic online presence in order to promote their music. Finally, it was found that bedroom pop artists monetise their projects through the exploitation of indie ethics that rely on underground and niche spaces.

4.1 Fans in the comments

The first major theme revolves around the fans in the comments. This theme can fall under the umbrella of the way that the fans and artists interact with each other. The theme of fans has been divided into three axial themes, being 'the real fan', the analytical fan and the celebrity fan. With the exception of the celebrity fan, these fan categories do not seem to lead to interaction but are rather an expression of fandom. As Tofalvy (2020b) argues, new technologies are at odds with the idea of underground space. The technologies allow for a larger audience for niche music genres, and thus increased visibility due to the removal of gatekeeping. Therefore, fans are constantly looking for ways to separate themselves from the herd. The emphasis is therefore, more on the commenters than the musicians or the music, and therefore the commenters are centring themselves and their experiences in their comments. Relating to the concept of value it is possible to see that the value here is intrinsic value that hinges on cultural capital, identity creation and social elevation (O'Reilly et al, 2014; Hibbett, 2005)

4.1.1 The "real fans"

As discussed in the theory chapter, underground cultural capital refers to the indie concept of having discovered the work of an artist before they became popular. This phenomenen can be seen in the data that has been analysed. This category was named "the 'real' fans" as it captures the paradoxical and self-aggrandising tone of the commenters. These commenters will place themselves

as an authority on the artist by highlighting the length of time that they have listened to the artist, and the role that they have played in creating the success of the artist. The characteristics of this theme include stressing the year that they started listening, the fact that they consistently listen and know all of the music, as well as drawing attention to the journey of the artist which they have been 'watching'.

This gives the fan a patron-like role in the artist career, as they insist that they have been supporting them from the beginning. The commenters will pay attention to the year that they began listening as proof of their amplified fanhood. This is often in combination with comments regarding the 'journey' or watching the artist grow, as one key quote [SW p2 #258] states 'been a fan since 2018 and it's been a treat to watch you grow as an artist'. This indicates the relationship that the fan has developed with the artist and their music. As such it is an indication of the value and the importance of the music in the life of the fan. Therefore, the value of the music has an intrinsic quality, as the music has had a prolonged impact in the fan's life. The underground capital does not just refer to the knowledge of the artist before they were more successful but also that the lengthened relationship is somehow a sign that they have key insights into the artist because they know and have loved the music longer than the new fans. Comments such as [TM p2 #53] 'I remember when they only had two songs on Spotify and maybe 3 on YouTube...so happy to watch their beautiful, sexy, amazing music journey' encapsulates the idea of the fan having supported from the earliest days of the artists careers and therefore have a deeper relationship with the artist. There is also a sense of nostalgia with these comments such as this user saying, 'I remember when you were still doing guitar covers (I have some of the videos saved)'[OS p8 #27], which shows a deepened respect for the artist because of their humble beginnings. While there are no references to 'new' or 'fake' fans, there is an undercurrent of comparison. If these commenters have been listening from the beginning, and have loved every song, then what have the others done? If this is what real fans look like, then what are the others? This suggests that fanhood is dependent on the prolonged evidence of support rather than the depth of the enjoyment of the music or love for the artist. As Baym argues it is the continuous presence in the fans life which ensures a relationship between the musician and their fans (2018). In comparison, of the two more successful artists, Orion Sun comments often feature those predicting her success, with comments saying that they were there before she was famous or predicting the upcoming success whilst cementing themselves in the history of her career, rather than the comment for Still Woozy and The Marias, which seem to have more of a congratulatory tone, whilst also simultaneously placing weight on their own role in this.

Moreover, there is some evidence of the mystique of having found or discovered the artists. This mystique plays into the ideal of the 'real' fan who knew that the artist would be successful before everyone else did and did not let the lack of popularity affect their ability to see the 'talent' of the artist. This mystique of the 'discovered/found artist', places the fan in the active role as they have been the ones to uncover the skill and talent of the artist. This idea does go hand in hand with

the previously discussed idea of using the years of fandom as a measure of how much of a fan one is. This idea of discovery places the commenter at the centre of this story. In this active role, the fan can ensure that their version of this story is the correct or accurate one, be it the song that they first listened to, or Spotify album that first featured the music, which then become central and sacred as key entry points of artist. While this idea of discovery is not uncommon to music theory (Riom, 2020), it is important to emphasize the role of this in the genesis of internet musicians. More so, with the vast amount of music online, the idea of discovery becomes more importants so that artists can stand out from the masses (Kjus, 2016 ; Prey, 2018). It is important to see that this story is as interesting to fans as the similar discovery at live music events and physical scene theory. Whilst luck is part of this category, there is also an idea of serendipity, and the music being something that the fans needed and therefore found. This cosmic necessity, therefore, links the fan to the artist in a way that is larger than the simply the relationship between an 'ordinary' fan and the artist.

As with the ideas of having discovered and having had a long term bond with the musician, 'the 'real' fans' seem intent on proving their fanhood. Here the fans used their listening habits to indicate their enthusiasm for the music. Here the fans commented about 'current listening' or having the songs on 'repeat'. This gives a glimpse into the physical reality of the practice of listening outside the context of Instagram. This places importance on the active listening habits, suggesting it is not just acceptable to be a fan, but one must continuously be incorporating the music into your daily life. The suggestion that the fan is currently listening is not so much a declaration of chance or luck as with the previous concept, but rather an insistence that the fan has been listening before they saw the post and will continue to after they have commented. This act of providing proof once again centres the fan within the rhetoric of the idea of the 'real' fan, because they are the ones who are actively engaging with the music. Moreover this separates the 'real' fans from the 'others' by hinting at a contrast between these types of fans. The question is again raised of, if this is what a real fan looks like, then what are the others doing?

4.1.2 The Analytical fans

The next Sub -theme is that of the Analytical Fan. As with the previous sub-theme, this is a way of creating a sense of familiarity between the fan and the artist, however, this is by presenting a deep understanding of the artist and the genre as a whole. These fans will write comments to provide insight into the kind of music that the artist creates as well as their own interpretation of this music. This ties in with the concept of connoisseurship which presents the idea that the fans are 'in-the-know' and therefore can create links between the different musicians in overall scene of bedroom pop artists. This can be seen through the links to other indie artist's sounds, the expectation of the brilliance of the music, as well as requests for collaborations with other such artists. Gu, Domer and O'Connor (2021) suggested that online scenes can break the pattern of exclusivity that is often a feature of live scenes. However, we see that even in online scenes, the fans attempt to create a system

of differentiation between themselves as those who are in- the- know and those who are not so deeply situated in the scene.

Many of these types of commenters will draw parallels between the works of the artists and other key figures from the past, such as making reference to the Beatles' Sergeant Pepper album, Harry Nilsson or the Cranberries, all of whom hold a place of cultural significance for indie fans. By doing this the commenters not only draw attention to their own understanding of the work but the larger cultural significance of the genre and scene as well. By making these appeals to higher authorities, they are not only justifying their own right to be a fan of the artist, but they are linking the success of these artists to the success of the cultural icons that came before them. They are also giving themselves an air of an expert as they have enough knowledge to understand the cultural significance of these works. Connoisseurship plays a role here as this refers to the way that community is constructed by creating the borders between which artists deserve to fit within the scene, whilst others do not. Therefore, these works are acceptable as parts of the larger context within this scene. Moreover, it places the commenter firmly in the in-group, as they are making references to things that only the those who are a part of the community would know.

Another feature of this theme is those commenters who ask for or suggest collaborations with other musicians. As has previously been stated, this allows the commenters to situate themselves within the greater context of the scene as they are able to express their knowledge of this by indicating pairings which would work well. Moreover this gives a sense of superiority as it suggests that the artist would not have thought of this themselves, and therefor any future pairing will be within the context of these commenters suggestions. This is linked to a sense of urgency, as thoough the artist is missing out on a great opportunity by not interacting with musicians that they consider worthy of this artists work. This urgency might be linked to earlier concepts of underground cultural capital, as these fans would like to see these collaborations before either group become too famous and therefore does not interact in the indie community.

The final characteristic of this theme is purely analytical comments. These might be an example of the fans trying to access an idea of perceived closeness between themselves and the artist. This closeness could come from the fact that they have a deeper understanding of the artists intended meaning. For example one commenter askes [SW p2 #132]: 'Is this song about co-dependency Sven? Your music is beautiful, it's been years since someone's music has hit me like yours does'. This suggest that the song has a meaning that the fan can relate to which therefore suggests an emotional closeness between them. These comments revolve around the interpretations of the songs by the commenters. Another comment states 'this is exactly the feeling of depression', which suggests that the commenter has had depression and based on this, there is that assumption that Still Woozy has as well, as he has captured the sentiment perfectly, according to the fan. Constanini (2020) has stated, the lines between professional and amateur are not as obvious online and therefore,

these fans take it upon themselves to highlight the musicians which they consider 'professional'. Therefore, this act of analysis by the fans simultaneous justified their listening to the artist.

Moreover, these interpretations could either be about the meaning of the song or the 'vibe' of the song. For example, these commenters might ask what the meaning of the song is. However, this would be done through the affirmative questions where the artist would only agree or disagree with the fan. These kinds of questions center the user as the expert who understands the meaning of the song, while others might not fully grasp it. Furthermore, when commenting on the "vibe" of the song, the commenters once again draw boundaries as they create an expectation of the ideal type of listener. For example, comments will make reference to the music being 'skate music' or 'smoking music' which creates an idea of the listener as the skating smoking kind of person. Moreover, by understanding the community surrounding the music the commenter places themselves within the in-group (O'Reilly et al, 2014)

4.1.3 Celebrity fan/You Like them too?

This next sub-theme draws on the large amount of celebrity comments that are mixed in with those from the fans. These comments tend to create excitement and foster engagement from the fans and even draws the artists themselves into the comments. This creates a sense of community and brings together many of the fans through the excitement for the both of the artists and celebrities, and reaffirms the support for each of these artists, as they support each other, thereby cementing their place in the scene. These comments also contain encouragement from the celebrities' fans and therefore they show support for the artist. The name of this theme comes for a response under a comment by a TikTok celebrity. The comment was 'you like Still Woozy TOO?????', which captures the excited nature of these comments.

The first thing that can be seen with the celebrity fans is the reaction that it ignites within the fan community. A single small comment from a celebrity fan which can be as small as a emoji or a single word can result in hundreds (or at least multiples) of likes and a few comments in response, which is uncommon in the rest of the data. While this may not trigger a large amount of interaction within the comments, it is still more than the comments from fan users. This response is often related to excitement that these artists are interacting with each other and that these users are not isolated but rather exist within the same larger artist context. Within this context it is possible to see this as a way of community building by creating links between the musicians who create similar music and adhere to similar principles of production therefore supporting each other in order to make a cohesive understanding of the genre. As with live scenes, this creates the expectation of shared understanding of the genre. Therefore these relationships become important markers of the community. It is not simply about liking the music of one artist, but the larger context as well. Moreover, these relationship reinforce the success of the artists as the support of one successful artist means that this artist should be successful too. The responding comments from fans are mostly filled

this awe at the idea of their two favourite artists interacting with each other. An example is when fellow internet artist Pouya commented on Still Woozy's post. Pouya's comment consisted only of one sentence but this did not stop fans from being excited.

@pouya, Verified:

this song is great

79 likes

Replies:

1. You're great too King. *1 like*
2. @pouya you and woozy would make a banger *2 likes*
3. @pouya I fw this crossover *1 like*
4. @pouya still waiting for the collab no one expected between you both *2 likes*
5. @pouya pouya likes still woozy! Fire *3 likes*

Additionally, when singer-songwriter, Sabrina Claudio, commented on the Maria's post this too resulted in excitement from the fans.

@sabrinaclaudio, Verified:

Exciting!!!! This is so dreamy 🎧❓

254 likes

Replies:

1. @sabrinaclaudio you better be in the album with her *1 like*
2. @sabrinaclaudio Omg collab????👯 🤍 🤍 *1 like*
3. @sabrinaclaudio Omg Sabrina ♡♡♡ I love you
4. @sabrinaclaudio what about you sis !!!!!!
5. @sabrinaclaudio COLLAB COLLAB AAAAAAAAAAAAAAKKKKKKK

While these interactions are minimal, it shows that this support from fellow artists reinforces fans excitement for the music and the artists.
These comments show

As discussed in the theory chapter, traditional scenes usually developed around a specific genre. This is confirmed for online scenes, as those artists who comment on the posts are usually also bedroom pop artists, or at least indie pop musicians. Therefore, this reinforces the idea of genre being important for the creation of a scene. Moreover, the fact that the fan are also excited by these interactions is because they ensure that the fan has found themselves in the 'right' online space. They

therefore become more invested in the scene because they see the support of the greater scene in the artists specific one. Therefore, this allows the fans to find their niche within the online world.

4.2 Community

The second important theme, is that of community. This draws on concepts of interaction as well as social value with in the scene. Community and interaction are vitally important concepts for the creation of a scene and moreover, they assist in the creation of value and meaning making amongst the members of a scene. In this theme, several sub themes were developed, these being 'the tag along', the 'world outside of Instagram', the fan and artist interactions. The emphasis of this theme is on the way that the fans and users bring other members of their circle into the scene.

4.2.1 The Tag Along

A large part of the online comments were those that were related to peer to peer sharing. Kruse (2010) discussed how music shared is aided by peer-to-peer sharing with regards to actual digital music however this idea of friends sharing music with each other can be seen in these online scenes. This occurred when friends would tag other friends in the post with the aim of getting them to see and interact with the post. These interactions could be incredibly brief, sometimes simple a tag in the comments with no accompanying text. This would often get no reaction besides a like from the intended recipient. Whilst others could illicit brief multi- comment conversations between the two in the discussion. In these cases it was possible to gain some understanding from the responds with some significant words being used by either party. The peer to peer interactions are important as they prove that online scenes bare some of the same characteristics as traditional scenes. It is worth mentioning that these interactions, though reasonably common were nothing compared to the slew of comments that went unreacted to.

As with traditional scenes interaction between members of the scene is very important for collaborative meaning making. Here we see fans sharing in the joy of new music, by ensuring that their friends hear it to. Specifically with the Marias and Still Woozy who had just released music and announced it on Instagram, there was a large amount of these kinds of comments so that the users could share the information with their friends. This ties in with the idea of bonding as we see people who already know each other creating shared experiences through the experience of listening to the new music (Putnam 2000). This was not an expected result; due to the heterogenous nature of online spaces it was expected that bridging would be more common, however this was not the case, as the online comments resembles live events where people choose it interact with their friends and acquaintances over strangers. The users are therefore bringing their friends into scene by drawing their attention to the new music or specific art of the post that related to their friendship.

This kind of interaction facilitates bonding as creates shared experiences between those who are already friends or acquaintances. These comments draw on shared experiences between the users

and therefore are not particularly explanatory as the assumption is that the tagged friend will understand the context. One example show a user tagging a friend with the words 'this artist' to which the tagged friend commented 'too perfect'. In this short exchange, it is possible to see the that there was most likely a conversation that happened offline which made illusions to this work and now the friends are sharing in this experience online. Another example has a user commenting 'something good out of this boring day after all', (in relation to a new song being released0 to which there friend replied 'soooooo [sic] good'. Again, this references to a shared experience – 'the boring day'- and therefore the interaction acts as a bonding tool, based on their previous interactions. A final example has a tagged friend responding with 'was this randomly playing in the background?', making direct references to the physical location of the pair as they interact online.

This is also the only significant theme which has much interaction. This shows that users are not particularly comfortable with commenting on strangers posts and rather stick to their own spheres. Moreover, despite there being a suggestion of it comments sections not being homogenous due to users highlighting there distance from the artists by explaining where they come from, the comments remain in the homogenous spaces as interactions between friends. Meaning making in the scene therefore occurs between friends rather than through interactions with strangers.

The comments are usually very brief, if at all, as suggest more of a reminder to view the post rather than the start of an interaction. This suggest that there is more discussion happening offline, as it suggests a familiarity with the music and therefore a relationship surrounding this music in reality. Therefore, it suggests that online communication is not a substitute for actual interactions, and perhaps that people are creating their own circle which can appreciate the music together, despite the artists primarily producing and sharing their music online without being bound to a physical location.

This may also be an example of underground cultural capital in the making, as fans establish themselves as the dominant in the know individual who has the insider information to share with others who may not be so clued in. There even may be some tension between the fans as they establish themselves as members of the community, an example being when a tagged friends responded with 'I saw', showing that they are capable of accessing the content themselves.

4.2.2 Real Life Community – The World Outside of Instagram

As suggested in the previous section, there is a constant need to bring the discussion about the music to the physical space. This can be seen in this sub theme, as this is yet another way to link instagram to the real world experiences of the fans. In this sub-theme shows how users engage with the music in the realities of their lives. Comments from this them will include references to friends, co-workers or family. Is either linked to their current listening habits, their sharing of the music beyond the in-group as well as the way in which they first discovered the music. This represents a very social aspect of the music listening practices. This refers directly to the idea of cultural capital, where the user may feel that they have incurred some place of importance by being the one who

introduced new fans to the music. It is worth considering that while the majority of bedroom pop artist choose to promote and create communities online, this still does not fulfil the role live music scene might.

Many of these references indicate a community of those who have physical proximity to the fans. However, with is juxtaposed with the idea that the bedroom pop music exists online and it becomes a unique experience for those outside of the scene to know or experience the music. Examples show have fans relate their experience to the music with the people around them. One fan comment says 'My husband is whistling this in the other room. Meta moment.' This comment makes reference to the social aspect of music listening, and perhaps a need to engage with a community in order to enjoy the music. Furthermore, the idea of a 'meta moment' could suggest the oddity of having the music which has only existed online, suddenly be heard in a space that is not dedicated to the music. Moreover, this could be an example of the fan emphasising their fanship because they have played a part in getting more people to listen to the music. Another fan comments 'I love your music so much, i started listening to it when I first started dating my boyfriend and now your songs remind me of him'. This shows the importance of music as an aspect of community. Here the fan is showing how the music is essentially part of their relationship and this implies a closeness between the artist and the fan.

Another key part of this sub-theme is the reference to emotions with regards to the music. Fans reference 'crying' or being in 'tears' at the prospect of hearing new music or relating to the new music. Moreover, there are many references to 'needing' the music. This implies an emotional closeness between the fans and the artist despite the space caused by the internet.

4.3 Value Proposition

This next section will discuss the value proposition as presented by the artists through their Instagram posts. The artist present three important factors in their captions. These captions tend to refer to three iterations of value. Firstly, visibility and support, secondly promotion and finallycommunity references. It is important to look at all of these concepts through the lens of Authenticity. As was excepted, Instagram allows for casual and authentic interactions between the fans and the artists. The artists definitely push this idea by ensuring that their captions have a friendly tone and are directly aimed at their fans. The captions become a conversation opener in a way, with calls to action for their fans.

4.3.1 Authenticity

Authenticity can be considered an aesthetic choice (van Poecke, 2017) and it can be seen through the choice of captions and posts made by the artists. These captions draw attention to the process and the unfinished and unfiltered aspects of the music production process. Moreover, there are also links to the struggles that the artists have faced, such as emotional issues such as anxiety or

depression or cultural ones, such as Maria from the Marias discussing the difficulties of fitting in to society as a Latina woman in America. By discussing the deeper underlying issues rather than simply the glossy finished product, the fans can feel as though they are getting to know an authentic version of these artists (Kruse, 2010) In addition, there are also references made to the ideas of playing around or experimenting with the music.

In order to create a sense of authenticity and reality in their posts, the artists choose to discuss the good and the bad of their lives and careers. This is especially relevant to Orion Sun, who makes references to her anxiety and struggling to stay positive. These captions, such as '2021, the year I learn to accept all of me, especially the things I have no control over. Taking each day as it comes. Trying the best I can everyday. Some days are easier than others' show that the artist is a real person with real struggles. Moreover, this has implications for her music making as the fans with be more likely to relate to the music if they feel that it is authentically done. Maria from the Marias uses the platform to describe her struggles growing up, as the fears she felt over creating music is Spanish, as she felt that there would be no audience for this in America. In response the comments were filled with fans regaling their own stories about language barriers as well as expressing pride in the work that Maria had created. In honest and authentic, The Marias and Orion Sun were able to create a space where their fans could relate to them on a personal level.

Secondly, there is are many references to playing or experimenting with music which gives the followers an insider look at what the artists are creating. These include covers of other songs, their home set ups and performances of their music. Both Orion Sun and Still Woozy share cover songs and various versions of their songs whilst also making reference to the homemade aspect, such as Still Woozy posting 'a stripped back Rocky version. I set up some phones and filmed a take!'. This highlights spontaneity.Orion Sun shows a version of her song where she performs to her cat. These light heartedness and unpolished version of songs allow the audience to see the raw talent of the artists.

Finally, the way that the artists address their fans though their captions can be seen as a part of this authenticity. The artists themselves frequently make references to the community of followers as a cohesive group. The artists expressed gratitude for the support and well as attempt to incite interaction with calls to action to comment on the posts or stream the songs. These comments often use a casual tone of voice and refer directly to the fans. The use of words such as 'guys' and 'y'all' when refering to the fans creates a familiarity and closeness between the fans and the artists. This is often pairs with requests for the fans to do something for the artists, be it comment or stream a question on instagram.

4.3.2 Promotion

A second interesting finding was the emphasis on promotion through the captions. A majority of the posts were in relation to new music or new albums coming out. More so, this seemed

28

to be the expectation from the fans, who constantly requested new music in the comments. this means that Instagram functions as a primary promotional space and the fans expect to hear about new releases through these pages. The artists choose to slowly hint at new releases before setting concrete dates and times for the releases. The captions of the posts refer to new music, new albums and new music videos being release as well as appeals for the fans to listen by following the links they provide.

Even when the artists have not released or announced the impending release of music, there are still references to this. Veiled hints of 'something special on the way'[OS post 9] or 'I have so much music ready for next year it's crazy, no more dry spells' [SW post 14] which draws the fan to their page over and over with requests for new music or questions regarding the releases of their new albums. This ensures that fans remain excited in the comments sections of the posts and is proven by the masses of comments which simply say 'album?' or 'we need new music' or even questions regarding whether the posts are sneak peaks into the new album covers.

As the Instagram pages seems to function as a promotional space, at least from the producers point of view, it make sense that regardless of the posts released by the artists, there will be references to music in the comments of all of them. This suggests that the followers understand and utilize the Instagram accounts as a space to monitor the artists new music. This indicates that there is an understanding between the fans and the artists about the purpose of these spaces. This understanding shows how Instagram is being utilized as a space for updates perhaps instead of but definitely in combination with the access to the artists. While there may be no direct interaction in this space, there is at least an assumption of dialogue whereby the captions are directed at the fans and the fan responses are directed to the artist, as if expecting an answer.

The hints to new music, create an idea that the fans are in the know or that they are privy to a secret that the artists are not open to sharing with the rest of the fans. This is suggested by the use of language which is directed to the fans creating a circle of trust between the artist and the fans. We see that the artist is promising access prior to others by following the instagra. Not only because of the constant reminders but also by the pattern that suggests this is where the music will be shown first. in the same stroke the artists are promoting their music whilst also creating a secretive tone so that the dedicated fans feel like their continued support is justified as they will be offered a 'here from the beginning moment' with each post that releases the music.

Part of this promotion was increaed interaction in the comments. In most cases the artist would not respond to comments from their fans as can be seen from this set of comments from Orion Sun's comment section. Despite most of these comments being directed at Orion Sun, there is no response or likes, neither from the fellow fans or the artists.

> OSp8 #12 hi I just found your music and I am so in love thank you for the good vibes!!
> OSp8 #13 sun finally beaming down🐨 🤍 clear skies are important
> OSp8 #14 Continue having that balance sis 😌🤍✨

OSp8 #15 Hi I am responsible for the zillions of streams on Mango (freestyle/process)

OSp8 #16 i just discovered your music. it's fuckin incredible 👏👏👏

OSp8 #17 take your time always lovely human 🥰

OSp8 #18 And also all of Hold Space For Me

OSp8 #19 ♡ 😎 Ahhh!! Where have you been??? I think IG shadow banned you from my timeline (or maybe I want scrolling enough? 😂) anyway, so happy to see you alive, well and thriving!!! I remember when you were still doing guitar covers (I have some of the videos saved) you're amazing. Keep shining Queen 👑

OSp8 #20 Was just listening to Antidote ♡

Or this collection from the Marias comments section;

TMp5 #123 If there isn't a "Swan song" with a Swan on vocals, I might cry. 🤍 super excited tho 😇🦢🦢

TMp5 #124 Already called dibs on a copy at my local record store 📷 (But please repress Superclean too 😭😭😭)

TMp5 #125 Will you guys be restocking the panther tee? I've been dying to buy it and noticed today that it was sold out! ♡♡

TMp5 #126 Swoon, swan, song... was so great having you in our studio

TMp5 #127 [@**Tagged User**] they're finally releasing an album 😇🦢 *1 like*

> *Reply from* ***[Tagged User]***:
>
> [@**#127**] bruh 😂 it's about time *1 like*

TMp5 #128 Who shot this ? Beautiful 😎

TMp5 #129 Will you guys be restocking the panther tee? I've been dying to buy it and noticed today that it was sold out! ♡♡

There is one instance of the 'tag along' but besides this, despite the direction of these comments they remain un-interacted with. This is contrasted with the instances where the artists are promoting new music. In these cases, it is possible to see the artists interacting with fans. When Still woozy announced the release of his new music video (SW Post 2) he responded in the comments 12 times as opposed the once or twice in the other posts.

SWp2 # might be my favorite one so far, can't wait for the album 📷 *41 likes*

> *replies*
>
> 1. still_woozy Verified @[**Original Commenter**]I can't wait for you guys to hear the album *72 likes*
> 2. [Original Commenter] @still_woozy this comment alone made my entire year 🤍 also when we getting more merch 👀 *9 likes*

SWp2 # how was the process of writing the song?? it's a bop *29 likes*

Reply from *still_woozy* *Verified:*

1. **[@Original commenter]** there's always an initial idea with a feeling attached and you try to keep that alive till the song is fully written *32 likes*

These examples of show how just the small response or comment from the artist can impact the interaction of a post. In both these cases the fan comment got significant amount of likes because of Still Woozy's responses. As a tool for promotion this may encourage fans to comment as they feel as though there is a possibility that the artists might respond. The musicians are therefore use the fan and artist interaction as a tool in order to create engagement with their social media platform (Kruse, 2010).

4.4.Economic Value

An important aspect of the bedroom pop artists business is the question of how they monetize their music without going through the traditional channels. A second important question is how they stay true to the indie identity which relies on underground. In these comments there is a massive emphasize on merchandise. Specifically, with fans requesting new shirts or vinyl to be created so that they can buy them. Furthermore, there is also strong emphasis on wanting to see the artists live and in concert. However, it should be noted that there we very few explisit mentions of money or purchase intentions, rather focussing on the opportunity to own the merchandise.

Moreover, the artist create a sense of scarsnessity of these items in order to that draws the fans in. While both Still Woozy and The Marias have released and made reference to merchandise on their Instagrams. The Marias release a limmited amount of signed vinyls while still woozy launched a competition to give away limitted stock of T-shirt. The Marias wrote in their caption [TM post 16] 'first 200 superclean vinyl order will be signed', which encouraged the fans to buy as quickly as possible and ignited a slew of commenters to lament missing out on the oportunity. Many of the comments refer to missing out on the merch and hoping for restocks. Still Woozy did a similar thing on his Instagram, by claiming to pick random commenters to receive a free t-shirt. This prompted one of Still Woozy's most commented on posts, with fans camboring to draw Still Woozy's attention to their posts by highlighting how much they love the music and the artist.

It can be argued that this satisfies the indie identity as it is not possible for everyone to own a piece if merch or a signed vinyl therefor making these items more valuable. As was mentioned in the theory chapter, there is a dichotomy between indie fans wanting to support their artists but also wanting to ensure that they remain underground and therefore interesting and good (Hibbett, 2005). The economic value is therefore tied to ideas of scarcity and the need to be a part of the in-group in-the-know fans who have access and cultural capital beyond the others. The artists can therefor monetize their indie identity.

31

Specifically, the interest in vinyl represents and interesting phenomena, as vinyl are not the most practical means of music consumption, it becomes apparent that this is more about a perceived proximity to the artists than a superior music sound. Maguadda (2011) had argued that the fans develop attachment to physical means of listening to music, such as MP3 and vinyl, which therefore explains to draw towards this kind of merchandise. Moreover Bartmanski and Woodward (2018) the idea of an object that is in itself unique and finite gives the vinyl an artistic aura. As bedroom pop artists share their music online and do not come up through a series of live performances, fans are looking for a way to capture a unique experience of the music.

5. Chapter 5: Discussion and Conclusion

5.1 Discussion

The aim of this research was to explore how value is created in online bedroom pop scenes. Within these scenes the artists aim to build a rapport with their fans in order to bring attention to their present and upcoming projects. These spaces allow for a perceived sense of intimacy between the fans and the artists, due to the nature of the platforms that facilitate them, which in this case is Instagram. Bedroom pop artists are responsible for their own marketing and promotion online and thus it is interesting to examine the way in which value is created and perceived as these artists build their fan base in these scenes. In light of this, the research question was articulated to ask, '*How is value created in emerging online "bedroom pop" scenes?*'. The results of the theoretical analysis and multiple case studies were used to answer the research question. Three artists were analysed based on their Instagram comments sections in order to evaluate how value is perceived by the fans and the artists, how that value is monetised, how fans interact with the artists as well as amongst themselves and finally, how is this value perception dealt with within each individual artist's scene. Using the sub-questions, it is possible to unravel the main findings of this study.

With regards to the sub-question of *How is value perceived by fans in these online scenes* it is possible to see how fans express their point of view in terms of value in these scenes. Fans chose to express their love for these artists by centring themselves in these spaces. This means that the fans value the role that the music plays in their life as equal to and over and above the love of the music . In this way, it is the relationship to the music that the fans choose to highlight over and over again. Therefore, as was discussed in the theme of the 'Real' fan, the fans align themselves with the artists over a period of time and use this as a way to construct their identity. This is in line with the research of O'Reilly et al. (2014), which stated that fans use their music consumption to signify that they are members of a particular 'in-group'. Moreover, as is shown through the desire to share and show music to their peers it is possible to assume that attaining cultural capital plays a role in the value of these scenes, as fans are able to place themselves in a superior space as the 'in the know' fans. This is similar to the theory of Hibbett (2005) who argued that cultural capital comes from being an insider and therefore those who present as such are seen as socially or intellectually superior. This also applies to the theme of the 'tag along' whereby fans introduce their friends to these artists. Indeed, this ties into an idea of underground cultural capital which refers to timing on the internet, specifically who is the first to share and interact with the music before it becomes mainstream. Here we can see the act of tagging as an indication to one's peers they have been the first to see and appreciate this content.

Furthermore, it is also important to see how the artists perceive value. The sub-question asks, '*how is value perceived by artists in these online scenes?'.* For the artists, it is observed that emphasis is placed on the promotion of their music, and this informs their interactions on Instagram

and with the fans. Even through the presentation of authenticity, the aim seems to be to draw the audiences in, in order to promote the music. All three of the artists use their Instagram post captions to convey closeness to their fans by creating a sense of familiarity as well as by presenting an openness by discussing their music making process and emotional state. This, in turn, allows the fans to support the artists knowing that they represent the unfiltered reality of work and quality and stands in contrast to the rest of the traditional artists.

Moreover, in terms of monetisation, this value is captured through a persistence to indie ideals. As discussed by Hibbett (2005) there is a dichotomy in indie music between commercial success and remaining authentic and therefore, underground. Within bedroom pop it seems that though fans want the artists to remain authentic, they are still willing to spend money to support their favourite artists. Vinyl records become a meeting point of these ideals. This is especially requested, along with other kinds of merchandise, by fans. This attachment to the music through vinyl, is in line with the theory of Maguadda (2011) who argued that despite digitalisation, fans still want a physical connection to their music, through access to a physical object with which to listen to music. Additionally, scarcity is used create a sense that these artists are still present in the underground as only a few members of the fan base can have access to the limited stock of merchandise. In a sense this is not in accordance with Barna (2014) who argued that ideals of obscurity were no longer as important within online indie scenes because of the destruction of the gatekeeping system of traditional scenes. Rather, this shows that there is some value placed on being part of the niche which has access to the merchandise. The gatekeeping exists because fans have to be the amongst the first to see these products in order to have access, and this is reliant on being a dedicated fan, or simply, luck.

With regard to fan and artist interaction, this research does not align with research such as Straw (1991) suggesting that fan and artist interaction is one of the most important features in value and meaning making. The sub- question asked, '*how does the interaction between the artists and fans assist in the value creation of online scenes?'.* This research observed that there is not a lot of interaction between the fans and artists. However, due to the nature of social media, there was an assumption of interaction, meaning that the fan comments were directed at the artists, and the artists directed their captions towards the fans. This creates an implication that the fans and artists are collaborating to create meaning, even if the artists rarely respond to the fans.

Furthermore, the interaction between fans was not as was expected. Wilks (2011) and Bennett (2004) suggested that online scenes would allow fans to meet and interact with likeminded fans despite having no previous connection to them. However, this did not occur, as fans only interacted with those who were already known to them outside of the scene. This was observed in the 'Tag Along' theme, as fans tagged their friends in these comments and did not interact with the strangers in these spaces.

The final question refers to the comparison between the artists and the subsequent patterns that emerge in the creation of value in emerging online scenes. These three artists are; Orion Sun (@cloudgem), Still Woozy (@still_woozy) and The Marias (@themarias). As Orion Sun is a smaller creator, her content revolves around her music making progress. This shows how she is improving over time. Moreover, she connects with her fans through discussing her emotions and expressing herself authentically. Her fans, in return, create an encouraging atmosphere by supporting her as a beginner creator. The Marias and Still Woozy, having bigger fanbases, tend to focus on promotion of new music and merchandise on their Instagram pages. However, they all still focus on authenticity, either through sharing their emotions or sharing the unfiltered aspects of their creative process.

This study aimed to explore the creation of value in bedroom pop online scenes. The results showed a lack of interaction despite expectations of the opposite due to the ease of communication on social media. Moreover, the theoretical analysis found that the main theme of the data, was of fan expression their fandom through the creation of the 'real' fan persona, the analytical fan and the celebrity fan, by engendering a bonding community experience specifically through tagging friends in posts and referring to the community that exists outside the online scene. In addition, the theme the value proposition was found, which showed the artists being authenticity and promotional and finally the economic value which focussed on maintaining indie ethics whilst selling merchandise.

As has been described, online scenes do not function exactly like live scenes. The lack of interaction being large difference between the two, and one has to wonder how can meaning making occur if this there is not this interaction which the previous research claimed scenes relied on (Straw, 1991; Bennett, 2004; Kruse, 2010; Wilks, 2011). However, despite this it is still possible to observe emphasis placed on underground social capital as well as the importance of boundary making as fans position themselves within the 'in-group' by establishing their status as a 'real' fan. While references to monetary value were not explicitly mentioned, there were references to the way that the fans could support the artists by buying merchandise and vinyl records as well as requesting the artist go on tour or perform live. This suggest that online scene may not fully replace live scenes as fans are not willing to have all of their interactions with the artists online.

5.3 Limitations and Future research

There were a number of limitations of this study. These will be discussed in this section, along with the suggestions for further research.

This study aimed to explore and analyse scene creation in online bedroom pop scenes. Based on this, three artists were selected in order to gauge a wide number of experiences within the bedroom pop category. However, only the Instagram comments sections were analysed from these cases, rather than a variety of sources from the social media of these artists. Yin and Davis (2007) argues that in order to get a rounded perspective of these cases multiple avenues of investigation should be inspected. However, due to the constraints of social media it can be impossible to access

some of this data, because of the company policies for privacy. Moreover, despite the large amount of data available, much of this is not useful for analysis and therefore cleaning the data can be too time consuming. Furthermore, this research could be limited by the selection of cases. Case studies require key cases in order to garner accurate results (Yin, 2009) While the cases were selected to be the best example of emerging bedroom pop artists, this is ultimately subjective and therefore cases may be different depending on the researcher's biases and methodology. Therefore, the results of the study could be different depending on the selection of bedroom pop artists. Moreover, study was limited by the available data because the researcher cannot ask for clarification about the comments, unlike interviews or focus studies where the interviewer has access to the subjects in order to ask their opinions and ideas. This study can only rely on what the fan has written in the comments. However, this could also be a benefit as the subjects do not know they are being observed and therefore their actions will not be affected by this.

Based on these limitations, future research could do an in-depth analysis of a single case and gather data from multiple sources, such a YouTube comments and TikTok comments. This would enable the researcher to see the overall interactions between fans and artists across all these channels. In addition, further research could analyse other bedroom pop artists as these cases could give different results. Finally, future research could engage directly with fans who comment and interact in these scenes and conduct interviews in order to garner their interpretations of value and their expectations from scene interaction.

6. References

Barna, E. (2014). Birth of an Underground Music Scene? In A. Bennett & P. Guerra (Eds.), *DIY Cultures and Underground Music Scenes*. (pp. 171 – 181). Routledge.

Barna, E. (2017). A Translocal Music Room of One's own. In E. Barna & T.Tofalvy (Eds.), *Made in Hungary, Studies in Popular Music*. (pp. 47 – 57). Routledge.

Bartmanski, D., & Woodward, I. (2018). Vinyl record: a cultural icon. Consumption Markets & Culture, 21(2), 171-177.

Baym, N. K. (2018). Playing to the crowd: Musicians, audiences, and the intimate work of connection (Vol. 14). NYU Press.

Behr, A., Brennan, M., & Cloonan, M. (2016). Cultural Value and Cultural Policy: Some Evidence from the World of Live Music. *International Journal of Cultural Policy*, *22*(3), 403-418.

Bennett, A. (2004). Consolidating the Music Scenes Perspective. *Poetics*, *32*(3-4), 223-234.

Bennett, A. (2018). Conceptualising the Relationship between Youth, Music and DIY Careers. *Cultural Sociology, 12 (2),* 140-155. https://doi-org.eur.idm.oclc.org/10.1177/1749975517750760

Bennett, A. & Guerra, P. (2019). Rethinking DIY Culture in a Post-industrial and Global Context. In A. Bennet & P. Guerra (Eds), *DIY Cultures and Underground Music Scenes*. (pp. 7– 18). Routledge.

Bowen, G. A. (2019). *Sensitizing concepts*. SAGE Publications Limited.

Braun, V. & Clarke, V. (2006). Using Thematic Analysis in Psychology. *Qualitative Research In Psychology, 3,* pp77-101. http://dx.doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa.

Bryman, A. (2016). *Social research methods*. Oxford university press.

Clarke, V., & Braun, V. (2014). Thematic analysis. In *Encyclopedia of critical psychology* (pp. 1947-1952). Springer, New York, NY.

Cohen, S. (1991). Rock culture in Liverpool: Popular music in the making. Oxford University Press on Demand.

Constantini, S. (2020). From Music Scenes To Musicalized Networks; A Critical Perspective on Digitalization. In Tofalvy, T., & Barna, E. (Eds.), *Popular Music, Technology, and the Changing Media Ecosystem: From Cassettes to Stream*. Palgrave Macmillan.

Creswell, J. W., & Miller, D. L. (2000). Determining validity in qualitative inquiry. Theory into practice, 39(3), 124-130.

Fereday, J., & Muir-Cochrane, E. (2006). Demonstrating rigor using thematic analysis: A hybrid approach of inductive and deductive coding and theme development. *International journal of qualitative methods*, *5*(1), 80-92.

Gaber, H. R., Elsamadicy, A., & Wright, L.T., (2021) Do Instagram Fan Pages Develop Consumer–

Brand Relationships? Evidence from the Telecommunications Industry, *Cogent Business & Management, 8*(1) https://doi.org/10.1080/23311975.2021.1884344

Golafshani, N. (2003). Understanding reliability and validity in qualitative research. The qualitative report, 8(4), 597-607.

Gu, X., Domer, N., & O'Connor, J. (2020). The Next Normal: Chinese Indie Music in a Post COVID China. *Cultural Trends*, 1-12.

Hesmondhalgh, D. (2020). Is music streaming bad for musicians? Problems of evidence and argument. *new media & society*, 1461444820953541.

Hibbett, R. (2005). What is Indie Rock? *Popular Music And Society, 28*(1), 55-77.

Kjus, Y. (2016). Musical exploration via streaming services: The Norwegian experience. Popular Communication, 14(3), 127-136.

Kozinets, R. V. (2002). The Field Behind the Screen: Using Netnography for Marketing Research in Online Communities. *Journal of Marketing Research*, *39*(1), 61-72.

Kruse, H. (2010). Local Identity and Independent Music Scenes, Online and Off, *Popular Music and Society*, *33* (5), 625-639. DOI: 10.1080/03007760903302145

Lamont, M., & Molnár, V. (2002). The Study of Boundaries in the Social Sciences. *Annual Review of Sociology, 28*(1), 167-195.

Lamont, M., Pendergrass, S., & Pachucki, M. (2001). Symbolic Boundaries. *International Encyclopedia of the Social and Behavioral Sciences, 23*(15) 341-47

Lange, B., & Bürkner, H. J. (2013). Value Creation in Scene-Based Music Production: The Case of Electronic Club Music in Germany. *Economic Geography*, *89*(2), 149-169.

Lee, S. S., & Peterson, R. A., (2004). Internet-based Virtual Music Scenes: The Case of P2 in Alt. Country Music. In A. Bennett & R. A. Peterson (Eds), *Music Scenes: Local, Translocal, and Virtual.* (pp. 187 – 204). Vanderbilt University Press.

Magaudda, P. (2011). When Materiality 'Bites Back': Digital Music Consumption Practices in the Age of Dematerialization. *Journal of Consumer Culture, 11*(1), 15-36.

McLeod, K. (2005) MP3s Are Killing Home Taping: The Rise of Internet Distribution and Its Challenge to the Major Label Music. Monopoly , Popular Music and Society, 28:4, 521-531, DOI: 10.1080/03007760500159062

Norris, P. (2002). The Bridging and Bonding Role of Online Communities. *Harvard International Journal of Press/Politics*. *7*(3):3-13. doi:10.1177/1081180X0200700301

O'Reilly, D., Larsen, G., & Kubacki, K. (2014). Marketing Live Music. In K. Burland & S. Pitts (Eds.), *Coughing and Clapping: Investigating Audience Experience.* (pp. 7 – 20). Routledge

Open.spotify.com (2021). Bedroom Pop. *Spotify web player.*
https://open.spotify.com/playlist/37i9dQZF1DXcxvFzl58uP7

Palinkas, L. A., Horwitz, S. M., Green, C. A., Wisdom, J. P., Duan, N., & Hoagwood, K. (2015).

Purposeful Sampling for Qualitative Data Collection and Analysis in Mixed Method Implementation Research. *Administration and Policy in Mental Health and Mental Health Services Research*, *42*(5), 533-544

Pitts, S. E. (2014). Musical, Social and Moral Dilemmas: Investigating Audience Motivations to Attend Concerts. In K. Burland & S. Pitts (Eds), *Coughing and Clapping: Investigating Audience Experience*. (pp. 21 – 34). Routledge

Prey, R. (2018). Nothing personal: Algorithmic individuation on music streaming platforms. Media, Culture & Society, 40(7), 1086-1100.

Putnam, R. D. (2000). Bowling alone: America's declining social capital. In *Culture and politics* (pp. 223-234). Palgrave Macmillan, New York.

Riom, L. (2020). Discovering Music at Sofar Sounds: Surprise, Attachment, and the Fan–Artist Relationship. In Popular Music, Technology, and the Changing Media Ecosystem (pp. 201-216). Palgrave Macmillan, Cham.

Skandalis, A., Banister, E., & Byrom, J. (2020). Musical Taste and the Creation of Place-Dependent Capital: Manchester and the Indie Music Field. *Sociology, 54*(1), 124-141.

Straw, W. (1991) Systems Of Articulation, Logics of Change: Communities and Scenes in Popular Music. *Cultural Studies*, *5*(3), 368-388, https://doi.org/10.1080/09502389100490311

Tofalvy, T. (2020a). Continuity and Change in the Relationship Between Popular Music, Culture, and Technology: An Introduction. In Tofalvy, T., & Barna, E. (Eds.), *Popular Music, Technology, and the Changing Media Ecosystem:From Cassettes to Stream*. Palgrave Macmillan. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-44659-8_1

Tofalvy, T. (2020b). Niche Underground; Media, Technology And The Reproduction Of The Underground Cultural Capital. In Tofalvy, T., & Barna, E. (Eds.), *Popular Music, Technology, and the Changing Media Ecosystem:From Cassettes to Stream*. Palgrave Macmillan. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-44659-8_4

Toulson, E. R. (2008, April). Managing widening participation in music and music production. In *Audio Engineering Society Conference: UK 23rd Conference: Music Everywhere*. Audio Engineering Society.

van der Hoeven, A., Hitters, E., Mulder, M., Everts, R., & Berkers, P. (2020). Theorising the Production and Consumption of Live Music: A Critical Review. In E. Mazierska, L. Gillon, T. Rigg (Eds.), *The Future of Live Music.* Bloomsbury.

van Poecke, N. (2017). *Authenticity Revisited; The Production, Distribution And Consumption Of Independent Folk Music In The Netherlands (1993- present)*. [Doctoral thesis, Erasmus University Rotterdam]. Repub.eur.nl

Whalen, E. A. (2018). Understanding a Shifting Methodology: A Content Analysis of the Use of Netnography in Hospitality and Tourism Research. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, *30*(11), 3423-3441.

Wilks, L. (2011). Bridging and Bonding: Social Capital at Music Festivals. *Journal of Policy Research in Tourism, Leisure and Events*, *3*(3), 281-297.

Williams, M., & Moser, T. (2019). The art of coding and thematic exploration in qualitative research. *International Management Review*, *15*(1), 45-55.

Yin, R. K. (2003). Design and Methods. *Case Study Research*, *3*(9.2).

Yin, R. K., & Davis, D. (2007). Adding new dimensions to case study evaluations: The case of evaluating comprehensive reforms. *New directions for evaluation*, 2007(113), 75-93.

Yin, R. K. (2009). How to do better case studies. *The SAGE handbook of applied social research methods*, 2, 254-282

Appendix A

Code book

Listening for years:	The 'Real' Fan	Fans
Watching the journey	Proving what great fans they	Comments that relate only to
Since the beginning	are through their comments	the commenters relationship to
Acknowledgement of how far the artist has come		the artists.
Currently listening		
On repeat		
Coincidence of listening		
Favourite song of the year		
Loved every Song		
Always good		
Better than anyone else		
Loved all songs		
Need for music		
Emotional need		
Music helps with suffering		
Need because of no new music		
Relates to artist		
Similarities between artists and fan		
Deeper understanding due to shared experience		
Personal Connection		
Intrinsic Value		
Value of music based on skill of artists		
Value due to connection with artist		
Underground capital		
Nostalgia to earlier years of artists career		
Predicting success		
Evidence of support over time		

Parallels to other artists with indie capital	Analytical fan Presents themselves as experts on the scene and artist	
Suggesting collaborations		
Knowing the scene		
Dissecting lyrics		
Asking technical questions		
Expectation of critical acclaim		
Creating social borders		
Analysis of types of listeners		
Analysis of how to listen to music		
Noticing samples in music		
Interacting with Instagram post		
Interacting with Instagram caption		
Fan interaction	Celebrity fan/ you know them too	
Celebrity giving support		
Excitement over celebrity liking artist		
Request for collaborations		
Excitement over celebrity separate from artist		
Fan support for celebrity		
increased comments		
increased likes		
Artist responding in comments		
Fellow musician		
Other celebrity		
Only tag, no interaction	The tag along Friend tagging each other in comment section	Community Community building or references to community by fans
Interaction		
Reference to sharing music together		
Bonding		

Introducing each other to the music	43	
Have you seen this? Reference to shared love of artist		
Excitement		
Social capital – being the in the know friend		
Reference to previous live concert or event with specific music		
Reference to introducing friend to music	Real life community References to the community outside of Instagram, with whom they share music	
Shared experience with significant other due to music		
Music reminds them of significant other		
Reference to current listening environment		
Sharing music because someone overheard music and liked it		
Building community with music		
Branching out of online community		
Emotional physical response to music		
Crying/ in tears		
Happy/ smiling because of music		
New music coming out	Promotion Artist promoting music though instagram posts	Value proposition How the artists create value through captions and posts
New music video		
Interaction due to new music/video		
Hints to new music		

Increased interaction		
Reference to fan support		
Gratitude for fans		
Specific time and date for new music		
Merchandise release announcement		
Request to watch/ stream		
Link in bio		
Fan interaction because of new music		
Directly aimed at fans		
Emotional availability	Authenticity Artists presenting unfiltered version of themselves	
Reference to process		
Reference to progress		
Covers of songs		
Posts related to artists normal life		
References to fans as though they are close friends		
Experimenting with music		
Excitement over new music (CAPS, exclamation marks, making captions seem personal)		
Written in First person		
Reference to insecuritys		
Asking fans questions		
Jokey tone		
Reference to struggling		
Reference to Vinyl	Economic Value Merchandise, tours, tickets and streaming	Economic value
Reference to album		
Asking for merchandise restock		
Limited available merchandise		

Missing out on merchandise	45	
Asking about tours		
Asking for live shows		
Small restock		
Fans asking for specific merch to be made		
Artists asking fans to stream music		
Competition for merchandise		
Signed merchandise		
Questions about logistics		